

# The Perception of Hotel Employees on the Benefits of Tourism Competency Certification in Hospitality in Bandung

Vindy Alvionita  
Resort and Leisure Management  
Indonesia University of Education  
Bandung, Indonesia  
vindyalvionita53@gmail.com

A. H. Galih Kusumah  
Resort and Leisure Management  
Indonesia University of Education  
Bandung, Indonesia  
galih@upi.edu

**Abstract**—Tourism Competency Certification is a policy formulated by the government to increase the qualification of Indonesian labors in the hospitality industry. All previous researches showed that Tourism Competency Certification does not work well. This research focuses on the perception of hotel employees on the benefits of Tourism Competency Certification in the hospitality industry. The purpose of this research is to identify and analyze employees' perception on the benefits of Tourism Competency Certification. It is expected that this research can help give advice and provide evaluation materials to the government in order to improve Tourism Competency Certification. The Employees' perception also underlies the difference character of each employees whether they are beneficial for Tourism Competency Certification to their work life. Qualitative method has been chosen for this research applying content analysis as proposed by Harold D. Lasswell. Interviewees consist of 21 employees on different positions and work areas. The result of this research indicates two characteristics of employees implying that Tourism Competency Certification is beneficial for their work life but not beneficial based on three levels, namely experience, scope, and linearity. Another the result of this research is the lack of benefits of Tourism Competency Certification perceived by employees for career path, employees performance, and the competition with the other labors.

**Keywords**—*tourism competency certification; perception of hotel employees; benefits of tourism competency certification.*

## I. INTRODUCTION

Certification is a procedure that involves a third party as a provider of written guarantees that a product or service meets certain standards based on an audit carried out with agreed procedures. Tourism Competency Certification is a procedure that required for all hotel employees, but not a least because it is a label indicating the feasibility of the capabilities and skills of hotel employees and signifies as Human Resources or qualified workforce. Every hotel employee who has been certified has a great opportunity to compete in the hospitality industry. This study aims to identify and analyze hotel employees' perceptions of the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification, where the policy must be implemented by all hotel employees in accordance with the Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 52 of 2012

stipulating Competency Certification and Business Certification in Tourism. This research is expected to be one of the recommendations and inputs as evaluation material for the government or related institutions to be able to improve things that are still absent and must be addressed in the implementation of Tourism Competency Certification based on perceptions given by hotel employees. Future research on Competency Certification will continue because it involves improving employee performance and company success, and increasing operational standards. Therefore, the policy makers will always improve Competency Certification rules based on the findings of research to improve labor's quality.

## II. LITERATURE REVIEW

### A. Definition of Perception

According to [1], the notion of perception is an individual process in interpreting, organizing and giving meaning to a stimulus that comes from the environment in which the individual is located which is the result of the learning process and experience. [2] suggests there are factors which influence a person's perception, including internal factors and external factors. Internal factors include feelings, attitudes and personality of individuals, prejudices, desires or expectations, attention (focus), the learning process, physical condition, psychiatric disorders, values and needs as well as interests, and motivation. External factors include family background, information obtained, knowledge and needs of the surrounding, intensity, size, resistance, repetition of motion, new things and familiar or unfamiliar objects.

### B. The Employees Performance

According to [3], performance is a result of work achieved by a person in carrying out tasks assigned to them, which is based on initiative skills, experience, and sincerity as well as time. Whereas, employees are physical and spiritual human workers who always has need and therefore becomes one of the principal capital in a collaborative effort to achieve certain goals, whether they are achieved in a private body or government institutions [4]. Employee is a valuable asset for the company because they are one factor in the success of the company's performance. as stated by [5], in which a service

company can win the competition by consistently delivering higher quality services than competitors and exceeding customer expectations. Employee performance can also determine their career path to the future. One of the functions of the tourism competency certification is to improve employees' performance and their career path. [6] suggests that the benefits for certified employees include better career paths and promotion, increased access to develop in their profession, and recognition of competencies. Therefore, Tourism Competency Certification becomes a media in improving employees performance and developing their career path. In addition, Tourism Competency Certification can also provide benefits for job seekers who have been certified, including credibility and self-confidence, which will be increasing, have evidence of recognized competency, increase sales value in recruitment of workers, greater career opportunities, and clearer parameters of the expertise and knowledge possessed [6]. That statement is in line with the work implementation, where hiring teams look for experienced candidates or at least being certified.

### *C. Tourism Competency Certification*

According to the Law No. 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism, certification is the process of giving certificates to businesses and tourism workers to support the improvement of the quality of tourism products, tourism services and management. Based on Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No. 52 of 2012 concerning on Competency Certification and Business Certification in the Field of Tourism, Competency Certification in the Field of Tourism is the process of providing competency certificates in the field of tourism carried out systematically and objectively through competency tests in accordance with Indonesian National Work Competency Standards, international standards and / or special standards. A Competency Certificate in Tourism is a written evidence issued by a licensed professional certification body which explains that a person has mastered certain work competencies in accordance with the Indonesian National Work Competency Standards (SKKNI) in tourism, international standards and / or special standards. The certificates are valid for three years. Benefits of Competency Certification Tourism in the field of tourism for workers is as follows:

1. Helping professional staff to convince their organization / industry / clients that they are competent in working or producing products or services;
2. Helping professional staff in planning their careers;
3. Helping professional personnel in meeting regulatory requirements;
4. Helping competency recognition across sectors and countries;
5. Helping professional personnel in the promotion of their profession in the labor market.

Competency Certification in the Field of Tourism aims to provide recognition of the competencies possessed by workers, and improve the quality and competitiveness of workers.

### *D. Tourism Competency Certification Policy*

The Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 52 of 2012 concerning Competency Certification and Business Certification in Tourism regulates Competency Certification which must be followed by all workers working in the field of tourism, both domestic and foreign workers. In Article 11 paragraph (1) it is stipulated that the Competency Certification in the Field of Tourism is mandatory. The Competency Certificate is valid for 3 (three) years and if the certificate has exceeded the validity period, then the relevant workforce can extend the certificate through Tourism LSP. In the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism Article 53 paragraph (1) to (3) it is written that:

- (1) Workers in the tourism sector have competency standards.
- (2) Competency standards as referred to in paragraph (1) are carried out through competency certification.
- (3) Competency certification is carried out by professional certification institutions that have obtained licenses in accordance with the provisions of the legislation.

The contents in the article are written that every worker in the tourism sector has competency standards that can be taken through competency certification, so it is a requirement that must be followed and fulfilled by every worker in the tourism sector. Therefore, all tourism entrepreneurs must employ workers who already have a Competency Certificate. In addition, there are also regulations governing expert workers for foreign nationals. In article 56 paragraph (1) and (2) it is written that tourism entrepreneurs can employ skilled foreign nationals in accordance with statutory provisions. The skilled foreign workers must first get a recommendation from the organization of tourism professional associations. Based on the regulation, therefore, all tourism entrepreneurs must employ workers who already have competency certificates in the field of tourism according to their respective occupational specialties.

## III. METHOD

This research is a descriptive study with a qualitative approach. Through qualitative methods, researchers can get more information than merely utilizing quantitative methods. This research is very much in need of a lot of explanation and elaboration from the speakers regarding their perceptions of the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification in the hospitality sector because the results of this study include perceptions, views, and opinions given by hotel employees. Qualitative methods will greatly help researchers gather as much information as possible, both explanations, opinions, suggestions, and input from hotel employees, so that from the obtained information researchers can draw results and conclusions in more detail.

Determination of the subject of the study was carried out using a purposive sampling technique. The research sampling criteria are hotel employees, both those who are certified and

not certified, have become permanent employees and at least have worked in the hospitality industry for a year. Data collection techniques in this study were observation, in-depth interviews and documentation. The interview instruments used in conducting this research are as follows:

TABLE I. INTERVIEW INSTRUMENT

No	Variable	Interview Question
1.	The Perception Of Hotel Employees On The Benefits Of Tourism Competency Certification In Hospitality Bandung	How important is the Tourism Competency Certification for you?
		What is the role and impact of Tourism Competency Certification in supporting your career?
		What is the role of Tourism Competency Certification in facing challenges with foreign workers?
		What is the role of Tourism Competency Certification on the performance of employees in your hotel?

Source: Data Results, 2018

The data analysis technique in this study is content analysis with a model framework of Harold D. Lasswell, which uses symbol coding in analyzing data. Symbol coding technique is to record symbols or messages systematically, and they are then given an interpretation [7].

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The findings of this study consisted of two parts, namely the perception of hotel employees on the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification for career paths, employee performance and competition with other workers and the characteristics of hotel employees based on the perceptions expressed. Hotel employees' perceptions of the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification and hotel employee characteristics are presented in the following explanation.

A. The Perception of Hotel Employees

Based on the results of data analysis, Tourism Competence Certification has not been felt by all hotel employees. Tourism Competency Certification has not been able to provide maximum benefits in accordance with the government's goal of creating a certification policy. Therefore, hotel employees' perceptions of the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification are important to find out things that must be improved to make the certification policy better in the future. The following is the perception of hotel employees on the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification for career paths, employee performance and competition with other workers,

B. Career Path

Career is the development of employees individually in the position/rank that can be achieved during the period of work in an organization or company [8]. The benefits of the career path referred to in this study illustrate how hotel employees perceive

the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification for their career paths. Based on the results of interviews with 21 interviewees, there were 10 people or 47.62% who argued that participating in Tourism Competence Certification could influence and benefit their career paths and 11 people or 52.38% argued otherwise. Perceptions that state that certification is useful for career paths can be seen through the following conversation pieces:

*“Definitely to develop ourselves.”* Resource: Informant 18

Tourism Competence Certification is a medium to develop the employees because it is a benchmark for each individual towards the achievements that have been obtained, so as to encourage each individual to develop herself/himself to become better and deepen their insight into standards and procedures in general. Employee perceptions are in accordance with the statement stated by [9] that one's expertise is reflected by how well a person performs a specific activity, such as operating an equipment, communicating effectively or implementing a business strategy. Other perceptions can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*“...because the supervisor's requirements actually have to have certification, supervisor requirements, manager requirements.”* Resource: Informant 13

The certificate of Tourism Competence Certification can be taken into consideration by the hotel because it is a proof that the certificate owner has measurable and feasible skills to work in accordance with the field stated in the certificate, so that it becomes one of the requirements to increase the level of office position of the hotel employee. Other perceptions can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*“...it could be a plus if you want to apply to work in hotels.”* Resource: Informant 19

The certificate is recognized by the state so that it can be a plus point when the holder applies for a job. The perception of hotel employees who say that Tourism Competence Certification can influence their career path is in line with the statement stated by [6], indicating that benefits for employees in a certified workplace include better career and promotion levels, increased access to growth in his profession, and the recognition of the competence possessed. Meanwhile, the perception of hotel employees stating that certification is not beneficial to career paths can be seen through the following snippet of conversation:

*“...so far, what I see is not because the previous people who have been certified before were also not seen from previous years, but who saw their flight hours, working hours.”* Resource: Informant 19

Certification does not play a role as a tool to get a job or raise the level of a hotel employee's position. The position they obtain is currently influenced by several factors such as

performance, performance and their work experience, and not because of certification. This was revealed by the majority of hotel employees who were both certified and uncertified. Therefore, the success of an employee's career path is very sustainable with the performance of the employee itself. Performance or work performance is the result of work achieved by an employee in carrying out tasks in accordance with the responsibilities given to him [10]. The career path achieved by each person is influenced by factors according to what was stated by [10] stating that the factors influencing performance are ability and motivation factors.

### C. Employee Performance

Performance is a result of work achieved by someone in carrying out the tasks assigned to him based on skills, initiative, experience, and sincerity, as well as time [3]. In the tourism industry context, especially hospitality, employees' performance can be considered good if the operational implementation of the hotel runs well. [5] suggests that a service company can win the competition by consistently delivering higher quality services than competitors and higher than customer expectations.

Researchers conduct research on the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification on employee performance. The benefits of employee performance referred to in this study illustrate how the perception of hotel employees regarding the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification on employee performance and certification provides a significant influence or not on improving employee performance.

Based on the results of interviews with 21 informants, 8 people or 38.10% said Tourism Competence Certification had an effect on employee performance for the better and 13 people or 61.90% had the opposite perception. Broadly speaking, the perception of hotel employees regarding the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification on employee performance is divided into two, namely useful and not useful. Hotel employee perceptions stating that certification is beneficial to employee performance can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*"The difference is that people who have taken certification are more experienced."* Resource: Informant 9

Certification will provide additional experience for hotel employees because in its implementation the certification will review the basic procedures, service standards, and job descriptions that must be mastered by every hotel employee in the chosen field. Through this process, certified workers will be more helpful in operational work. Other perceptions can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*"Yes, the effect is certification in improving the quality of human resources, right, you really have to have skills in accordance with their fields. So the importance of the certification role is important."* Resource: Informant 21

Tourism Competency Certification is one of the policies made by the government to improve the quality of human resources and certification is a process to equalize procedures and service standards provided by employees throughout the hotel. Through certification, therefore, hotel employees will experience increased quality of work and can provide better performance for hotels where they work. This supports the statement stated by [6], that the benefits of certification for companies or workplaces include productivity increases, reduced work errors, commitment to quality, facilitating employee acceptance, and having employees who are competitive, skilled and motivated. Meanwhile, the perception of hotel employees who state that certification is not beneficial to employee performance can be seen through the following conversation pieces:

*"Actually, for the implementation of work for certified people or not, it depends on the person. When he is not even certified, if his performance is already good, he will be stable in good condition. So it doesn't guarantee that certified people will be superior, don't guarantee."*

Resource: Informant 10

This perception states that good or bad performance of hotel employees depends on the individual employee itself. The performance of hotel employees can be influenced by many factors, such as work experience, employee habits, work ethic, and company's behavior. This is in line with Sunarcaya's statement [11] indicating that one of the factors used to improve employee performance are leadership, organizational communication and a comfortable work environment. In addition, performance appraisal is measured by several indicators such as responsibility and discipline. This is reinforced by Prawirosentono [12], which implies that performance can be assessed or measured by several indicators, namely effectiveness, responsibility, discipline, and initiative. Employees' performance is also influenced more by internal training conducted by the hotel. Tourism Competence Certification is therefore not the main factor to improve the quality of employee performance.

### D. Competition with the Other Workers

Competition or part of conflict is where a conflict occurs because of individual struggles to obtain rare things, such as values, status, power, authority and others, in which the purpose of those involved in conflict is not only to gain profit, but also to subjugate rivals [13]. In this study, there are two perceptions of hotel employees regarding the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification in facing the competition from other workers, namely those that claim to be beneficial and not useful. The benefits of competition with other workers referred to in this study illustrate how hotel employees perceive the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification for competition with other workers.

Based on the results of interviews of researchers with 21 speakers, 10 or 47.62%, stated that certification was beneficial for competition with other workers and 11 people or 52.38%

who stated otherwise. Broadly speaking, the perception of hotel employees regarding the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification to competition with other workers is divided into two, namely useful and not useful. Hotel employee perceptions that state certification is beneficial for competition with other workers can be seen through the following conversation excerpt:

*“For competition, you can say that if you are certified, you will consider it the same level (foreign workers).”*

Resource: Informant 15

The perception of hotel employees who say that Tourism Competence Certification can help them to compete with other workers including foreign workers, is that the certificates they obtain can act as a selling power to apply for work because it has been recognized by the state, so in broad outline they have also been recognized by the state. Other perceptions can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*“So the effect is that we become more confident, and administratively we are already complete.”*

Resource: Informant 15

Certification provides an increase in self-confidence because the status of the certificate they have is recognized by the state and plays a role as a supporting document or value plus when hotel employees apply for jobs to hotels. The perception of hotel employees that Tourism Competence Certification can increase self-confidence is in line with the statement put forward by [6] indicating that for job seekers who have competency certificates including credibility and self-confidence will increase, have evidence that their competence has been recognized, increase selling value in recruitment of workers, greater career opportunities, and clear parameters of expertise and knowledge. Meanwhile, the perception of hotel employees stating that certification is not beneficial for competition with other workers can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*“...so far it hasn't been seen yet, actually the certification is still not too effective for us, for example “sir, I have this certification” and you will guarantee more.”*

Resource: Informant 10

Through this interview and conversation piece, in detail there are certain factors that are considered by the hotel in choosing a workforce as a hotel employee and/or increasing the position level of a hotel employee. Factors that influence competition with other workers are based on the quality of the workforce itself, because certified workforce is not necessarily a qualified workforce even though the purpose of certification is to improve the quality of HR. The quality of the workforce can be seen through the basic skills of both hard skills and soft skills. The basic is the most important factor to be considered in getting a job. Another factor that is also important in influencing competition with other workers is performance and work experience, because the more work experience they have

both in terms of place and duration of work, the more skills and abilities they have and the more it can affect performance. Other perceptions can be seen through the following conversation piece:

*“Because if for abroad, I don't think the certification that we get from Indonesia will have any effect.”*

Resource: Informant 16

On the other side of the three factors described above, other factors that make Tourism Competence Certification still not become a powerful weapon to face competition from other workers. Hapsari [6] argues that currently many certifications are built only on the basis of good intentions, but have not been built with the system and competency that can be traced. So, to ensure and maintain competency, a credible certification system is needed. This makes Tourism Competence Certification unable to provide a significant role in influencing competition between workers. Another factor is that international chain hotels have their own training system for their employees in detail and periodically.

Tourism Competency Certification cannot be a weapon that plays a significant role in facing labor competition, but it is able to provide protection to Indonesian workers in the tourism industry. This is in line with [6] which indicates that certification has a dual function, namely to provide protection to domestic tourism workers from attacks by foreign workers and at the same time provide and increase recognition in the competition for global competencies. One thing that is taken into consideration is that Tourism Competence Certification as a capital of HR infrastructure is absolutely necessary in the face of competition in the global market.

#### *E. Characteristics Of Hotel Employees*

According to [14], individual characteristics show someone's distinction about motivation, initiative, the ability to stay tough to face the task to completion or solve problems or how to adjust changes that are closely related to the environment that affect individual performance. Individual characteristics include traits in the form of abilities and skills; family, social and experience background; age, nation, gender and others that reflect certain demographic characteristics; and psychological characteristics which consist of perception, attitude, personality, learning, and motivation [15].

Based on the perceptions expressed by hotel employees, there are three levels that are the scope of the characteristics of hotel employees. The intended level is a category that describes the value of each individual hotel employee as a whole, not just skills and abilities. The level is divided into three, namely experience, scope and linearity with the following explanation.

*Experience*, namely the work experience of hotel employees is based on the perceptions expressed because the amount of work experience can affect the quality of hotel employees. This confirms [16] who argues that the wider the work experience of a person, the more skilled the work is and the more perfect the pattern of thinking and attitude in acting to achieve the stated goals. There are several things to determine

whether or not an employee is experienced as well as an indicator of work experience according to [17], namely the length of time or work period, the level of knowledge and skills possessed, and mastery of work and equipment. In the level of experience, hotel employees who declare Tourism Competence Certification are useful, namely hotel employees who have little work experience and are not yet in a middle or high level position. Meanwhile, hotel employees stated that they were not useful, namely hotel employees who had a lot of work experience and were in middle or high level positions. Work experience talks about how long and how many positions the hotel employees have (track record). While the position of the middle or high level is a benchmark for hotel employees regarding their abilities and skills because middle or high level employees are certain to have the capability to do a variety of large jobs.

*Scope* is understood as the scope of work of hotel employees. The scope of work in question is the coverage of hotel employee workplaces, both local and international hotels. The scope of work can influence the characteristics of hotel employees because within the scope of work there are several elements such as work environment, work procedures, operational standards, and company or hotel policies. The characteristics of hotel employees who declare Competency Certification are useful are those who work in local hotels. Whereas hotel employees stated that they were not useful, namely hotel employees who worked in international chain hotels. International chain hotels have more detailed training programs and are conducted regularly so that the skills and abilities of their employees can be monitored continuously. Whereas local hotels generally do not have such training programs so certification is a medium to develop themselves.

*Linearity* is the relevance or accuracy between the educational background and the field of work. According to [18], relevance is the suitability between abilities or skills obtained through the level of education with job requirements. The accuracy of the educational background with the field of work undertaken can affect the perception of hotel employees, so that different characteristics are created with hotel employees who work in accordance with the educational background pursued. The characteristics of hotel employees who declare Tourism Competence Certification are useful are those who have an educational background not from the tourism industry or hospitality. Differently, hotel employees who stated that they were not useful are those whose educational background are tourism industry education or hospitality.

## V. CONCLUSION

The characteristics of hotel employees can be found based on the coverage of three different levels, namely experience, scope, and linearity. The characteristics of hotel employees in experience level are based on whether or not work experience and position level positions are based, the level scope is based on hotel employees' work places, including local hotels and

international hotel chains, and the level of linearity is based on the level of accuracy of the hotel employees' educational background work.

Hotel employee perceptions of the benefits of Tourism Competence Certification based on the results of interviews with all speakers are divided into two groups of employees stating Tourism Competence Certification can be beneficial and not beneficial for career paths, employee performance, and competition with other workers. Based on the results and findings of the study, dominant hotel employees have the perception that Tourism Competence Certification does not provide significant benefits for career paths, employee performance and competition with other workers.

This research is still not perfect and still needs to be improved in the future, so that I will recommend for further research to conduct questionnaires so that it can more easily determine the perceptions of the interviewees. This research is expected to be an evaluation material and input for the government or policy makers in improving tourism competency certification policies.

## REFERENCES

- [1] M. Asrori, *Psikologi Pembelajaran*. Bandung: Wacana Prima, 2009.
- [2] M. Toha, *Perilaku Organisasi Konsep Dasar dan Aplikasinya*. Jakarta: Grafindo Persada, 2003.
- [3] M. S. P. Hasibuan, *Manajemen Sumber daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2014.
- [4] A. W. Widjaja, *Administraasi Kepegawaian*. Bandung: Rajawali Pers, 2006.
- [5] P. Kotler, *Manajemen Pemasaran-Analisis Perencanaan Implementasi dan Pengendalian*. Jakarta: Erlangga, 2000.
- [6] M. I. Hapsari, "Pengkajian Program Khusus dan Penempatan Lulusan," Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2016.
- [7] I. Suprayogo, *Metodologi Penelitian Sosial*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2001.
- [8] J. Soeprihanto, *Penilaian Kinerja dan Pengembangan Karyawan*. Yogyakarta: BPFE, 2000.
- [9] Y. L. Kandou, P. Victor, K. Lengkong, and G. Sendow, "Pengaruh Knowledge Management Skill dan Attitude Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan (Studi pada PT. Bank Sulutgo Kantor Pusat di Manado)," Universitas Sam Ratulangi, 2016.
- [10] A. Mangkunegara and A. P. A, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya, 2001.
- [11] P. Sunarcaya, "Analisa Faktor-Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Kinerja Pegawai di Lingkungan Dinas Kesehatan Kabupaten Alor NTT," Universitas Terbuka Jakarta, 2001.
- [12] S. Prawirosentono, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Kebijakan Kinerja Karyawan*. Yogyakarta: BPFE, 2008.
- [13] P. Anoraga, *Psikologi Kerja*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2001.
- [14] A. Rahman, "Pengaruh Karakteristik Individu Motivasi dan Budaya Kerja terhadap Kinerja Pegawai pada Badan Keluarga Berencana dan Pemberdayaan Perempuan Kabupaten Donggala," Universitas Tadulako Palu, 2013.
- [15] Winardi, *Manajemen Perilaku Organisasi*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2004.
- [16] P. Abriani, *Faktor-Faktor yang Berpengaruh Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja dan Kinerja Manajer Perusahaan Manufaktur*. Jakarta: Jurnal Akuntansi dan Auditing Indonesia, 2004.
- [17] B. Foster, *Pembinaan untuk Peningkatan Kinerja Karyawan*. Jakarta: PPM, 2001.
- [18] A. Muhson, D. Wahyuni, Supriyanto, and E. Mulyani, "Analisis Relevansi Lulusan Perguruan Tinggi dengan Dunia Kerja," Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, 2009.