

ON THE FOREIGNIZATION OF THE ENGLISH TRANSLATION OF EXPRESSIONS DISCRIMINATING GENDER AND SOCIAL CLASS IN PRAMOEDYA'S 'GADIS PANTAI' AND ITS IMPACT ON THE ISSUE OF GENDER AND SOCIAL CLASS INEQUALITY

Nunun Tri Widarwati
Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris
Universitas Veteran Bangun Nusantara
Sukoharjo, Indonesia
nununtriwidarwati@gmail.com

Abstract— *Apart from the propositional meaning, translation is supposed to transfer the hidden ideology carried in the source text. The challenge for translators all this time has been whether or not they can unfold the message of particular ideology in the source text and afterwards whether or not they can bring it forward to the audiences in the culture of the target text. Some other time, translators opt to take a stance and domesticate the ideology in the translation for various purposes. Therefore, this paper is aimed to find out whether the translators strive to maintain (foreignize) or shift/adjust (domesticate) the expressions discriminating gender and social class in English translation of Gadis Pantai novel written by Pramoedya Ananta Toer. The novel is thick with the issue of gender and social class inequality that is deemed crucial to be rendered in the translation. The identification result of this study tells that the novel speaks more of social class discrimination than gender discrimination. It is in conjunction with the theme that Pramoedya Ananta Toer always brings in all of his pieces. The study also unfolds that the translator embraces the foreignization ideology in translating the expressions. It means that most of the expressions containing discrimination of gender and social class are maintained in the English translation without any change or adjustment to the English culture. It concludes that translator attempts to convey the message of the issue of gender and social class inequality in the source text culture. Consequently, this will inform target readers and open up their horizon that Javanese have a history of struggling with discrimination of gender and social class since the age of colonization.*

Keywords—foreignization, domestication, discrimination of gender, discrimination of social class,

I. INTRODUCTION

Pramoedya Ananta Toer is one of several prominent Indonesian authors whose a number of novels have been translated into English. He always stood for man equality during his lifetime. The major topic of his novels is always about discrimination of social class and gender in the land of Java where he lived. Therefore, he was always considered as a loyal supporter of socialist party. This led to the government's

act on forbidding people from reading his novels. However, that did not discourage him. On the contrary, he even produced more pieces ever since.

One of his many novels is entitled 'Gadis Pantai'. Like his other novels, the issue of this novel still centers on the discrimination of social class. In addition to that, this novel also includes the issue of gender inequality in the story more than can be found in his other works. The two topic issues together shape the flow of the story of a girl from the coast who is forced to marry a regal class man. For that reason, other than serving as an underlying theme of the novel, the two issues also serve as a device that develops the plot of the story. The novel was once banned for that reason. Right now, the novel is one of several eminent novels written by Pramoedya that are translated into English.

The task of the translators in translating such a novel with dense content of sensitive issue on discrimination of social class and gender is even more laborious. They are conflicted with choices they have upon conveying the message of the source text into target text.

First, they may adjust expressions or aspects that reflect the discrimination of social class and gender in the original novel with the acceptable ideology in the target culture. Western culture has been battling against the discrimination culture of social class, especially gender (Stahlberg et al in Prewitt-freilino et al, 2012:268). Therefore, any appearance of discrimination of gender and social class will trigger disagreement even a rejection in the target culture. In this way, the translation will be more acceptable according to the western culture, hindering the audiences from the awareness that men can order women as they please or women's place is in the kitchen and they will always be second-class society in the source text culture. Other than that, the value of the issues shaping the plot of the story will be ceased in the translation. Somehow it can disrupt the plot of the story.

In the alternative, translators can brutally convey the message about the discrimination of social class and gender contained in the expressions in the source text. Consequently, this could be met with disgust in the culture of target text as the westerners have been growing concerned of eradicating the social class and gender in societies. However, this action is in accordance with the basic nature of translation, that is to convey message of the source text in the target text (Nida, 1982:12; Newmark, 1988:5; House, 2018:9). Doing the contrary, translators betray the notion of the accuracy of the message, even though they are after the acceptability of the form for the form or the style should be considered after the message, not before it (Nida, 1982:12). Bringing forward the message of the discrimination of social class and gender from the source text can also help the original author deliver his intended message, that is to inform and give the light to the world that Javanese has a history of struggling with social class and gender discrimination. It is in the hope of the original author that people from over the world can learn from the story of how life of Javanese was in the age of colonization. Ultimately, it can preserve the grand authentic theme of the famous pieces of Pramoedya.

In relation with the choices translators have upon conveying the message of the source text, Newmark puts it strongly that translation is too precious to be neutral (1995:51). In relation with discrimination of social class and gender, Newmark comments that it is in the domain of moral truth (1995:50). Translators must have a stance towards the universal moral truth contained in the source text: whether to deliver it into the target text or to omit it. For instance, for moral value, a text that is very sexist can be neutralized in the translation by the translator (Newmark, 1988). It means that translators take a stance against sexism.

Indeed, translators must have a stance or ideology in doing translation. When translators have a tendency of leaning more towards the source text, they are said to have a foreignization ideology. On the contrary when translators adjust his translation more into target text, it means that they have the ideology of domestication (Venuti, 2008:19).

In conjunction with them all, many translation studies on how translators translate a text that contains discrimination of gender have been conducted (Paleczek, 2010; Bengoechea, 2014; Palacios, 2013; Santaemilia, 2013; Rahmawati et al, 2016; Nurrochman, 2017). However, none of them has touched the area in which gender discrimination intercorrelates with social class discrimination. In addition to that, two of the studies unfold the translation of sexist language from English into Indonesian (Rahmawati, 2016; Nurrochman, 2017). Nevertheless, none of them discusses the opposite translation, from Indonesian to English. The two languages have different cultures and therefore, translation of expression containing discrimination of social class and gender from one of them into another must have a specific behavior, especially from Indonesian into English for English has so far been going against the practice of discrimination of social class, especially gender.

Based on that need, this study is aimed to unveil the ideology of the translator in translating the expressions of

social class and gender discrimination in the novel '*Gadis Pantai*' written by Pramoedya Ananta Toer into the English version of the novel 'The Girl from the Coast' translated by Hary Aveling. After that, the study discusses the impact of the stance of the translator on the issue of social class and gender inequality in the global world with special emphasis in the Javanese and western culture.

II. THEORETICAL REVIEW

In analyzing the source text, the underlying theory employed in this study is the theory of social discrimination. Social discrimination is unequal perception or treatment on someone or a group of people for their social labels (Theodorson & Theodorson, 1979; Sears, et al, 1985). These labels can be natural or social construct made by society. Social discrimination can manifest as, among others, social class discrimination and gender discrimination (Fulthoni, 2009:5). In general, social discrimination, especially social class and gender discrimination, has five different forms. They are marginalization, sub-ordination, stereotyping, violence, workloads (Handayani, 2006).

Then, in analyzing the translation, the underlying theories put into use are the nature of translation (Nida, 1982) and the concept of foreignization and domestication (Venuti, 2008). According to Nida, translation is a transfer of message from a source language into a target language, first in terms of meaning, and second in terms of style (1982:12). In reality, translation does not only convey a propositional meaning into target text, but it is also often supposed to reconstruct a concept or ideology hidden in the source text into target text. This ideology has many forms. Often times, it is in the forms of social class and gender discrimination. Upon facing a text that portrays this ideology, translators are challenged to choose his stance. Translators may be truthful to the source text and therefore they retain the social and gender discrimination ideology in the translation. In this regard, they are said to have foreignization ideology. It means that they lean more to the source text than the target text. On the contrary, when translators eliminate the discriminating aspect in the translation, they are said to have a domestication translation ideology. They might argue that social class and gender discrimination is not acceptable in the target text so they neutralize it in the translation. It means that they resort more to target text than the otherwise. Foreignization and domestication are two opposing ideologies of translation: the former is leaning more towards source text and the latter is more towards target text (Venuti, 2008).

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research employs a qualitative paradigm. It is a descriptive study with case study method. The sampling is purposive. It means that the choice of the data source and the data of this study is based on certain criteria. The data source of this research are in the form of documents. They are the original Indonesian novel '*Gadis Pantai*' and its English version 'The Girl from the Coast'. The novel was chosen as data source because it contains a lot of expressions showing discrimination of gender and social class. Apart from that, the novel is translated into many languages other than English. It

makes this discussion even more crucial and useful for readers across the globe. The data used in this study are all expressions portraying discrimination of social class and gender in the original novel and the translation in English. The method of collecting data is document analysis. Afterwards, by benefiting from the nature of ethnography (Spradley, 1980), the technique of analyzing data in this research consists of domain analysis, taxonomy analysis, componential analysis, and finding cultural values. In domain analysis, the domain of data was determined. After that, taxonomy analysis was conducted by classifying expressions showing discrimination of gender and social class into their form categories and finally determine the translation ideology of the translator. Finally the relation of expressions showing discrimination of gender and social class, their form categories, and the ideology of the translator are portrayed in componential analysis. The reason on how and why they are related is unfolded in the process of finding cultural values.

IV. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

After identification, there were found as many as 47 expressions of discrimination in the original novel. 33 of them show discrimination of social class and 14 of them show that of gender. This composition tells something. As the novel written by Pramoedya Ananta Toer, a well-known author who never stopped voicing a protest against social class discrimination in Javanese culture and society, it embodies the ideology of its writer. Also, there are more aspects of social class discrimination voiced out in the novel than gender discrimination. It does not therefore mean that gender discrimination was not his interest. The fact that social class discrimination topples gender discrimination in the novel proves that the two kinds of discrimination occurs in the Javanese culture and society, as the setting of the novel, with social class discrimination taking place more often than gender discrimination.

This seemingly is the same case with other novels written by Pramoedya. He was known for his blatant protest against social class discrimination through all novel he wrote. The finding of the composition of expressions showing social class discrimination and gender discrimination in '*Gadis Pantai*' only strengthens of such a claim. Actually, people read his novels particularly because of that reason.

In addition to that, interestingly, all data found in this novel fall under stereotyping category of discrimination. It seems that Pram made use of Javanese social stereotypings as examples to manifest in this novel. Then again, stereotyping is the most common practice of discrimination, especially in Javanese society. Javanese as an old construct of culture is filled with many wisdoms as well as stereotypes. As these are established in the society, unequal perception and treatment on certain people or certain groups of people are also triggered.

Next, of all data, 44 of them are translated by maintaining the aspect of social class and gender discrimination. Nevertheless, there are three data that are translated by neutralizing the discriminating aspect. These three data are of expressions showing social class discrimination. The sample of each phenomena is shown and explained below. Fig. 1 portrays samples of expressions showing discrimination of gender and

social class and the way they are translated using foreignization paradigm. Fig. 2 shows one of the three data of social class discrimination that are translated by omitting the discriminating aspect.

No	Type of Discrimination	Source Text	Target Text
1	Gender	<i>Perempuan Nak, kalau sudah kawin jeleknya laki jeleknya kita, baiknya laki, baiknya kita.</i>	When a woman marries bad, life is going to be all worse for her. But when she marries good, then it's good for her too.
2	Social Class	<i>Tak ada orang berlaku kasar terhadap wanita utama.</i>	You must never raise your voice to Bendoro's wife.

Fig. 1 Data translated by maintaining the discriminating aspect

Firstly, two data sampled above are categorized into stereotyping. As explained earlier, all data found in this study fall under the category. Then, both are translated by still maintaining the same meaning as the original. The first sample above is of gender discrimination. The source text contains a discrimination against women. It is said in the sentence that women will always be the representative of their husband. When their husband is good, they are good. When their husband is not good, they are not, too. This perceives woman to be a dependent individual. This view is established in Javanese culture. The translation has the same view with original, rendering the discriminating stereotype.

The second sample shows the same attitude as the first. The source text tells that no one should dare to argue the wife of *Bendoro's*. *Bendoro* is a title referred to someone who has high position in government. This is an old Javanese term. This portrays how Javanese people respect high classes. The title gives them privileges as well as different treatments in the society. The translation of the sentence also carries the same effect as the original.

No	Type of Discrimination	Source Text	Target Text
1	Social Class	<i>Istri mesti belajar, mesti bisa melegakan hati bendoro.</i>	She must be able to please The Master.

Fig. 2 Data translated by neutralizing the discriminating aspect

The source language contains discrimination against women, especially those who already have husband (wives). Javanese culture perceives women to be the one who is responsible to please their husband. It is their job, and their job alone, to take care of their husband. Most of the time Javanese women are not allowed to work. Their life is limited to only taking care of domestic lives. In the translation, the word 'wife' as a general reference to any married women, is translated into implicit pronoun 'she' as if this only refers to a particular woman. This neutralizes the discriminating effect.

After all, despite few data translated as neutral, it is clear from the finding that translator resorts to foreignization ideology in translating the expressions showing discrimination

of gender and social class. This could root from the fact that *Gadis Pantai*'s grand theme is about social class and gender discrimination. It might be a consideration on why most of all expressions are retained to carry the original discriminating aspect.

The use of foreignization ideology helps retain the message of gender and social class discrimination and the fight Pramoedya did in writing against them. This leads to the broadening of the discussion of the issue of gender and social class discrimination happening in Javanese society. People across the globe, through this literature, can see how miserable those who are treated inequally are. Therefore, it is expected that this story can inspire more people in the world to join forces and stand up to discriminations of any kind.

V. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, translator employs foreignization in translating expressions showing discrimination of gender and social class in 'Gadis Pantai'. This shows that translator resorts more to source language culture than otherwise. The adoption of this translation ideology retains the message of gender and social class discrimination in the English version. This helps maintain the grand theme in 'Gadis Pantai' and deliver the ideology of Pramoedya Ananta Toer to the foreign readers. This also can help spread the awareness of the issue of gender and social class discrimination.

REFERENCES

- [1] J. K. Prewitt-Freilino, T. A. Caswell, E. K. Laakso, "The gendering language: A comparison of gender equality in countries with gendered, natural gender, and genderless language", *Sex Roles* No. 66: 268-281, 2012.
- [2] E. Nida. and C. R. Taber, *Theory and practice of translation*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1982.
- [3] P. A. Newmark, *A textbook of translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice Hall International, 1988.
- [4] J. House, *Translation the basics*. Oxon: Routledge, 2018.
- [5] P. A. Newmark, "Truth and culture in translation", *Lebende Sprachen* 2, 1995.
- [6] L. Venuti, *The invisibility of translator: A history of translation*. London: Routledge, 2008.
- [7] U. Paleczek, "Olga tocarsczuk's gouse of day, house of night: Gendered language in feminist translation", *Canadian Slavonic Papers*, Vol LII Nos. 1-2, Marh – June, 2010.
- [8] M. Bengoechea, "Feminist translation? No way! Spanish specialised translators' disinterest in feminist translation", *Woman's Studies International Forum* 42 pp 94 – 103, 2014.
- [9] M. Palacios, "Translation in the feminine: Theory, commitment, and (good) praxis", *Women's Studies International Forum* No. 42, pp 87 – 93, 2014.
- [10] J. Santaemilia, "Sex and translation: On women, men, and identities", *Women's Studies International Forum* No. 42, pp 104 – 110, 2014.
- [11] A. A. Rahmawati, M. R. Nababan, R. Santosa, "Kajian teknik penerjemahan dan kualitas terjemahan ungkapan yang mengandung seksisme dalam novel 'the mistress' revenge' dan novel 'the 19th wife'", *Prasasti: Journal of Linguistics* Vol. 1 No. 2, November, 2016.
- [12] Nurochman, M. R. Nababan, R. Santosa, "Translation quality of sexist language in the novel 'little women' by lois may alcott", 6th ELTLT International Conference Proceedings, October 2017.
- [13] G. A. Theodorson and A. G. Theodorson, *A modern dictionary of sociology*. New York: Barnes and Noble Books, 1979.
- [14] D. O. Sears and J. Citrin, *Tax revolt: Something for nothing in california*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1985.
- [15] Fulthoni, *Memahami diskriminasi: Buku saku kebebasan beragama*. Jakarta: ILRC, 2009.
- [16] T. Handayani, *Konsep dan teknik penelitian gender*. Malang: UMM Press, 2006).
- [17] J. Spradley, *Participant observation*. Orlando: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1980.