

# Analytical Philosophy of Education: Approaches and Russian Realities

Elena Novikova

Plekhanov Russian Economic University (REU)  
Stremyanny Lane  
Moscow, 36, 117997 Russian Federation  
E-mail: novikovaelena77@yandex.ru

Andrey Galukhin

Plekhanov Russian Economic University (REU)  
Stremyanny Lane  
Moscow, 36, 117997 Russian Federation  
E-mail: mystolbard@gmail.com

Vitaly Ivlev

National Research University  
Bauman Moscow State Technical University (BMSTU)  
2nd Baumanskaya Street, 5/1  
Moscow, Russian Federation 105 005  
E-mail: vitalijivlev@yandex.ru

Marina L. Ivleva

Peoples' Friendship University of Russia  
Moscow, Russian Federation 117198  
E-mail: ivleva-ml@rudn.ru

**Abstract**—The article explores the constructive possibilities of developing theories and approaches in the field of higher school pedagogy based on the use of a system of concepts and methods of analytical philosophy. The methodological functions of analytical philosophy in relation to educational programs in higher education manifested themselves in the form of a fundamental focus on conceptual analysis, revealing substantial and variational aspects of the meaning of terms used for theoretical description and modeling of the educational process. The specifics of the methodology and the thematic profile of the analytical philosophy of education are revealed through the analysis of the concepts of R. Peters and P. Hirst, representative for this direction, which consist in certain continuity and reflect both positive heuristics and limitations of the analytical approaches used in educational theory. Russian higher education paradigms cover the stages of formation in general, which are indicated in the analytical philosophy of education. However, the epistemological similarity is accompanied by an ontological difference in the basis for the development of programs, which in Russian schools are more relevant to the specifics of the socio-economic and cultural context.

**Keywords**—*analytical philosophy; education; paradigm; culture; competence; profession; student; personality; motive*

## I. INTRODUCTION

Modernization of higher education in Russia is accompanied by contradictory and ambiguous trends, which requires the development of new models for understanding this process and their implementation in practice. The expediency of studying foreign educational experience arises from the very essence of the Bologna process. The analytical philosophy of education in recent years has acquired a special significance in pedagogical thought due to the selection of areas of analysis of the educational process, claiming universal significance. The thematic area of the

study of education in analytical philosophy was identified in the study of the discourse-language format of various educational practices, the research of their cognitive-structural conditions - the relationship of language, thinking and knowledge - based on an interdisciplinary approach, in the substrate analysis of various forms of knowledge and understanding and identification of epistemological constituents of the process education, as well as in substantiation the differences between concepts and education models, based on their teleological and praxeological implications, substantial or instrumental significance indicators.

The purpose of this article is to identify the conceptual potential of analytical philosophy in relation to Russian developments in the field of education. The methods of analysis and synthesis of data obtained on the basis of the study of the conceptual foundations of Russian higher education pedagogics during the period 2010-2018 were used for writing the article.

## II. BASIC PRINCIPLES OF ANALYTICAL PHILOSOPHY OF EDUCATION

The analytical philosophy, in the traditions of which concepts and methods, initially used (within neopositivism) to analyze the language of science, and later - to develop philosophical problems based on the study of various linguistic practices - specific "life forms" prevailing in everyday contexts, were developed, had a noticeable influence on the development of the philosophy of education, especially in the second third of the XX century, when the analytical philosophy of education ("APE") itself stood out as an independent direction, which eventually acquired the status of a comprehensive research program. The need for the development of the theory of education based on models of analysis of everyday language, proposed in the framework

of the Cambridge analytical school associated with the names of Moore, Broad, Wittgenstein, was explicitly stated in the works of K.D. Hardy in 40-ies (in the monograph "On the truth and error in the Theory of Education" some ideas of Herbart and D. Dewey were critically rethought); the beginning of the systematic development of the problems of the theory of education through the use of methods of conceptual analysis was laid in the works of I. Scheffler [1], R. Peters [2], P. Hirst [3] and other analytic philosophers who laid the foundations since the early 60s heuristic research projects, which, as it was shown by the further development of this program, were not limited only by the analytical development of conceptual matrices of the science of education, but also included epistemological reflection points (the dynamics of knowledge in the context of image studies) and expanded to the study of cognitive conditions and teleological aspects of educational practice.

The analytical philosophy of education provided not only methodological, but also argumentative resources for solving "substantial" questions about the nature and goals of the educational process and the role of education in the system of social practices, demonstrating the possibilities of reforming the approaches formed in the framework of the classical philosophy of analysis by changing the very concept of analysis in the form of a rejection of the reductionist models of linguistic analysis on the base of the recognition of "language games" diversity, correlated by the principle of "family similarities", and understanding the phenomenon of "systematic ambiguity of language" (which manifests itself in various contexts of its use), enhancing moments of interdisciplinary synthesis (building a system of concepts of educational theory based on the assimilation of sociology, psychology and anthropology data) and contingency to the continental "philosophical mainstream" (the rehabilitation of metaphysical problems, freed from the relics of speculative philosophy and the analysis of conceptual schemes entrenched in the language that underlie various types of worldviews, in the horizons of which the understanding of teleology, axiology and technology of the educational process is built) [4].

The influence of analytical philosophy on the development of theories and approaches in the field of educational philosophy has been designated both in methodological aspect (criticism and "language therapy" of philosophical theories of education, coupled with the abandonment of speculative and normative approaches, the use of a conceptual analysis method to define and clarify basic concepts such as "education", "learning", "understanding", as well as the development and evaluation of models of argumentation on the objectives and methods of education) and in conceptual aspect, which manifested itself in a number of moments: the research of discursive-linguistic and epistemological foundation of educational practice, the development of the problem of determining epistemically significant educational goals (knowledge, truth, understanding, rationality); understanding the value of alternative learning methods and their role in the overall educational process; substantiation of the basic distinction between learning, based on the idea of understanding the

assimilation of knowledge [5], and learning based on the principle of mentoring ("instruction") and "indoctrination", coupled with non-reflective perception of information content ("indoctrination"); conceptually developed interpretation of education as a process of initiation ("initiation") - an initiation of an individual to socially developed forms of knowledge associated with the transmission of social experience [6]; constructive thematization of the development of critical thinking abilities ("critical thinking"); explication of the principles of general education ("liberal education") in its difference from vocational education ("vocational education") [7]; assessment of the compliance of language models integrated in the educational process with the profile of discursive practices within a dynamic and polymorphic social environment [8].

Education suggests the practice of initiation [9], i.e. the attraction or connection of a person to socially developed activities, forms of thought and behavior, which have not instrumental, but their own — substantial value ("worthwhile") — during the process of education, the person actively masters them, becoming the agent of the corresponding forms of life and activity. And as the performance of certain tasks refers to the achievement of a meaningful result ("achievement"), so also "educational processes relate to various activities and ways of thinking and behavior that characterize an "educated person" [10].

The own line of development of the educational process, by Peters, implies, in a general sense, (1) changing a person for the better (achieving a certain perfection), due to (2) acquiring knowledge and intellectual skills that are not limited only to awareness and competence (practical and procedural knowledge), but they are acquired along with the formation of understanding (the ability for a thorough comprehension of experience and rational judgment, based on an understanding of principles) and the development of critical thinking; the morally significant equivalent of any achievements, the value of which permits specification regarding the tasks of general or special education, is (3) the actualization of a particular installation, by virtue of which a person with full responsibility belongs to the generally valid standards of rationality, knowledge and skill, representing constitutive grounds and regulatory conditions in areas of conscious involvement in which, as a competent subject, were initiated and achieved as a result of *azovaniya*; (4) mastering the forms of knowledge and the development of thinking abilities transforms the sphere of human consciousness, influences the ways of its orientation and action in the world, acting as a factor in the cognitive and moral development of the individual.

### III. CONCEPTUAL SCHEMES, REFLECTED IN THE LANGUAGE, CONCEPTUAL APPARATUS OF THE RUSSIAN EDUCATION THEORY

The conceptual schemes of the Russian paradigm in education can be most fully traced by the example of the formation of the "competence" notion. It is legitimate to indicate different directions of understanding the essence of the competence approach. In the works of such authors as

O.E. Lebedev, V.A. Bolotov, V.V. Serikov, traditional, "knowledgeable", and the competence approach are dichotomous. The traditional education is seen as the acquisition of formal rules, and competence-based — as the ability to act according to these rules [11]. Therefore, the transformation of the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the competence-based approach should cover all its links. A different point of view on the competence approach is in the works of Ivanov E.O., Bogolyubova L.N., Osmolovskoy I.M., Khutorskoy A.V., where the idea of integrating the traditional and competence approaches is supported as complementary [12].

The direction of developing the notion of competence corresponded to the expansion of ideas about the subject of education and as a result, three approaches were developed. The first approach was carried out in the works of such authors as A.V. Galukhin, E.L.Con, E.M.Con, V.I. Freiman, A.A. Yuzhakov. The competence is considered as a system of unity of knowledge, skills and skills. The own evaluation criteria is expected to be introduced for each of the components. The degree of knowledge completeness is assessed by analyzing the principles, models, processes, methods, algorithms, terms, definitions, axioms, formulas, parameters, operations, logical structures [13] [14].

Another approach to competencies and their assessment is associated with the inclusion of motivational and personal components. This approach is most consistent with the principles of the unity of professional and personal aspects in modern education. At the same time, the parameters for assessing competences are expanded due to the inclusion of student personal and civil attitudes [15].

The heuristic approach in the process of vocational education is competence-culturological. The approach is based on the idea of the theoretical foundations of professionalism, which has been developed in the works of S.A. Druzhilov, N.B. Krylov, V.A. Tsvyk, which are based on the principles of the psychological-culturological approach of L.S. Vygotsky. Culture is considered as the basis for the development of the personality and its activities, including professional ones. In accordance with this, monitoring the quality of education should reflect the following aspects of professional activity: 1) an idea of the goals and objectives of professional activity in a socio-cultural retrospective; 2) understanding of the competence and personal qualities associated with it; 3) an idea of cultural standards, on the basis of which the formation of professionally significant qualities is built; 4) decision making skills related to professional activities; 5) the personal meaning of professional activity [16].

#### IV. PRAGMATIC ASPECTS OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

The educational competences in Russian pedagogical thought are considered in relation to the conceptual analysis of the "professionalism" notion, which has been studied in various scientific and practical contexts. The studies indicate the direction of research in the professions that are relevant to domestic science. Professions should be researched in the context of a broad system of interaction, theories of

professionalism should consider culture, social structure, intraprofessional and transprofessional dynamics, as well as legal, social and economic factors.

An important direction is the research of the subject specificity of the profession, conducted under the guidance of V. A. Yadov. Another direction is the study of the social status of the profession [17]. The third direction is the study of the mechanisms of professionalization and deprofessionalization on the basis of the English-American traditions of the approach to the professions. The fourth direction is the study of professions on the basis of a wide social context, with an emphasis on the subcultural components of professional communities, using the methods of social anthropology and the anthropology of organizations [18]. Professions are interpreted in the context of subcultures based on the use of ethnographic methods. In line of another approach the professions are analyzed in the aspect of the socio-professional structure of Russian society. There is also a socio-ethical approach to the professions [19].

The value orientation in relation to the profession is discussed in literature [20]. Educational attitudes and value orientations of students are studied as a factor of training for professional activity. The professional motivation is also an actual subject of the research.

The development of basic paradigms and concepts in Russian education is immersed in a pragmatic context related to the analysis of transformations taking place in Russian society. The structure of the job market is included in the processes of the information society development, which are characterized by the rapid pace of development of new information and communication technologies, the growth of scientific knowledge, technological advances of a global scale [21]. A university graduate is faced with the constant problem of changing requirements for jobs in the labor market, the need for continuous upgrading. The competences formed at the university quickly lose their information specifics, which becomes obsolete in a short time. The specificity of the Russian labor market that influenced the fate of university graduates is the transformation and reorientation of production over short period, to which it is difficult to adapt both to the individual and to the educational system [22]. So, if at the beginning of the 90s there was a massive closure of treatment facilities and industrial enterprises and the development of the service sector, then a demand for specialties in material production has been formed on the labor market at the present time, however, the educational institutions engaged in training specialists have been redeveloped.

Another factor of the competencies development, influenced by the requirements of the job market in Russia, are changes of a civilizational, intercultural nature caused by the massive influx of migrants, on the one hand, and on the other, by the increased international activities of universities and the mobility of graduates who find jobs in other countries. The creation of enclave job markets in Russia creates certain barriers for the employment of graduates from higher educational institutions, and that also requires the development of more adaptive strategies aimed at acquiring

new competencies [23]. Civilization factors also mandate the need for continuous acquisition of new knowledge and competencies corresponding to the structure and level of work in the international economic space.

The pragmatics of personal education strategies is associated with the individualization of education, the focus on adaptation to regional conditions, as well as to the subject's changing position at the job market. Russian authors address the demand of a second education, within which the subject is resocialized [24].

#### V. THE RELATIONSHIP OF TELEOLOGY, AXIOLOGY AND TECHNOLOGY OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

The problem of the relationship of goal-oriented and value components of the educational process in the studies of Russian authors has been presented at several levels. First, this has been a theoretical level of understanding, going back to classical works from the field of philosophy, psychology, acmeology, where the development of the subject in the learning process has been considered on the basis of standards of spirituality, personal self-realization, striving for creativity and achievements [25]. Secondly, we are talking about numerous empirical works, in which it was shown that vocational education is associated with the values and motives of students, not reducible to the schematic "know", "can" and "have".

The development of the competence-based approach has been increasingly concentrated around the problem of the scrupulous integrity person and the "educated person" as a systemic unity of the qualities of the subject. In the works of Russian authors, psychological competencies have been highlighted, which had been closely related to the indicators of professional systemic development. The researches show that the cognitive, emotional, motivational, operational components of the psychological competence of students are associated with the features of professional activity [26]. In the structure of psychological competence, life values are associated with the values of professional activity, the value of self-development, interpersonal communication needs, responsibility for interpersonal relations, stability, self-determination in life. The content of psychological competence of students is directed to cognitive-semantic processes. Life values are manifested in the focus on gaining recognition, on finding stable work, well-being.

The professional self-development of the individual is associated with the authority attainment, the establishment of effective interaction with other people, an orientation towards the improvement of professional competence. The researches show the high importance of interpersonal relations in the development of cognitive-semantic and value attitudes for students. The effective solution of interpersonal problems leads to personal, and, as a result, to professional development. The career installations are associated with the achievement of professional competence, responsibility, performance and obtaining positive ratings from other people. Psychological competence, therefore, is directed mainly at the motivational-targeted sphere. The professional career should be addressed the achieving goals in the relations of

production, the manifestation of creativity and recognition of achievements. Students associate psychological competences with achieving life well-being. It includes the desire to establish positive personal relationships, the scope of hobbies, the motivation to avoid failures, own prestige. Students associate self-control in communication, which includes the regulation of interpersonal relations, the expectation of actions and assessments from others, the activity of social contacts, and the need for interpersonal relations with the formation of psychological competence [27].

Axiological aspects of the educational process have been also investigated at the level of cultural determinants of educational activities, which resulted in extensive research on multicultural competences. A cultural approach has developed on the basis of linguistic and communicative theory in modern Russian education. The inter-ethnic understanding is its goal. The cultural approach is reflected in the works of H. Weber, F. Gowen, J. Klein, O. Jaspersen, etc. The principles of the unity of language and culture are also supported by M. Berlitz, M. Walter, C. Frieze, S. Schweizer. The linguistic-cultural approach in Russian education is supported by E.M. Vereshchagin and V.G. Kostomarov, E.I. Passov [28].

Such researchers as L.S. Grebnev, E.N. Gusinsky, Yu.I. Turchaninova, V.P. Zinchenko, E.A. Martynova, N.S. Rozov, S.S. Shevelev consider that the basic elements of culture, and not the "fundamentals of science", studied within the framework of subjectness, should become the contents of education as a result of education reforming. It is noted that the standard of education reflects the science-centric "knowledgeable" professionalism which is characteristic for the ideals of an industrial society. The education reforming in Russia should form the culture-centric type of professionalism. The student's assimilation of culture is realized through five functions: developmental, learning, educational, cognitive and professional. The developmental function is associated with the development of socially and professionally significant personality qualities, which are related to the activity of cognitive processes, which include mental functions, linguistic abilities, character traits, in particular, diligence, purposefulness, will, ability to learn, motivation to master professional culture [29].

#### VI. CONCLUSION

The Russian pedagogical thought in the epistemological aspect reflects the stages and mechanisms of formation described in the analytical philosophy of education. The Russian pedagogical thought is characterized by the promising directions of the development of a research program in the field of the philosophy of education identified by R. Peters: 1) the analysis of key concepts specific to the field of education, if this area is considered from the philosophical psychology and social philosophy subject; 2) the application of concepts from the field of ethics and social philosophy to the analysis of assumptions regarding the appropriate content and procedural arrangement of education; 3) the study of conceptual schemes and assumptions that are used in the field of educational psychology for understanding the educational process; 4) the study of the philosophical

aspects of the content and organization of educational programs and related training issues.

The description of the “educated person” in all varieties of manifestations, filled with different meanings — personal, ideological, cognitive, spiritual, pragmatic, etc. is the result of the development of Russian pedagogical thought, as well as analytical philosophy.

But in terms of ontology, the concepts of Russian authors have their own specifics, reflecting the specific socio-economic and cultural characteristics of Russia. The Russian pedagogical thought is characterized by a greater emphasis on the cultural approach in education, which received an impulse in development due to the problems associated with the expansion of migration and the growth of intercultural communications in Russian society.

Understanding of professionalism in its systemic terms, as personality qualities, and not knowledge, was also shaped by the development of the Russian job-market and the employment of graduates. Such processes as the development of innovation during the spread of information technologies, the transformation of the job-market and jobs under the influence of structural changes in production in Russian society, changes in the structure of employment in Russian society, have had a significant impact on the development of an understanding of professionalism and professional competencies. It is legitimate to say that Russian pedagogical developments are more focused on actual problems of practice.

It is characteristic, that the analytical philosophy of education has already been criticized for conservatism and abstractness, methodological limitations, since it does not reflect the importance of cultural, historical and socio-practical factors determining the content of concepts [30].

#### REFERENCES

- [1] I. Scheffler, *The Language of Education*, Springfield, IL: Charles C. Thomas, 1960.
- [2] R.S. Peters, "Education as initiation", *Philosophical analysis and education*, New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2010, pp. 59-75.
- [3] P.H. Hirst and P. White, "The analytic tradition and philosophy of education: an historical perspective", *Philosophy of education. Major Themes in the Analytic Tradition. Volume I. Philosophy and Education*, New York: Routledge, 2001, pp. 1-12.
- [4] P. Gilroy, "The revolutions in English philosophy and philosophy of education", *Philosophy of education. Major Themes in the Analytic Tradition. Volume I. Philosophy and Education*, New York: Routledge, 2001, pp. 64-71.
- [5] A.V. Galukhin, "Epistemological foundations of education: on the way to understanding knowledge" (*Epistemologicheskiye osnovy obrazovaniya: na puti k ponimayushchemu znaniyu*) *Humanitarian education at an economic university*, In 2 volumes, Moscow: REU, 2017, pp. 33-37.
- [6] R.S. Peters, "Education as initiation", *Philosophical analysis and education*, New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2010, pp. 59-75.
- [7] P.H. Hirst and P. White, "The analytic tradition and philosophy of education: an historical perspective", *Philosophy of education. Major Themes in the Analytic Tradition. Volume I. Philosophy and Education*, New York: Routledge, 2001, pp. 1-12.
- [8] I. Scheffler, *The Language of Education*, Springfield, IL: Charles C. Thomas, 1960.
- [9] R.S. Peters, "Education as initiation", *Philosophical analysis and education*, New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2010, pp. 59-75.
- [10] R.S. Peters, *What is an educational process*, New York: Routledge, 2010, pp.1-16.
- [11] M.V. Dubova, "Competence-based approach among modern pedagogical approaches in the general education system" (*Kompetentnostny podkhod sredi sovremennykh pedagogicheskikh podkhodov v sisteme obshchego obrazovaniya*), *Education Integration*, no. 1, pp. 55-63, 2010.
- [12] Ibid.
- [13] V.Yu. Ivlev and Yu.V. Ivlev, "Objective Meaning of Logical Knowledge", *Proceedings of the International Conference on Contemporary Education, Social Sciences and Ecological Studies (CESSSES 2018). Series "Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research"*, vol. 283, pp. 880-885, 2018. DOI: 10.2991/cesses-18.2018.194
- [14] E.L. Kon, V.I. Freiman, A.A. Yuzhakov, E.M. Kohn, "An approach to the formation of the component structure of competences" (*Podkhod k formirovaniyu komponentnoy struktury kompetentsiy*), *Higher Education in Russia*, no. 7, pp. 37-41, 2013.
- [15] I.V. Shubin, "The system-activity approach and the formation of the competence model of a specialist in high school" (*Sistemno-deyatelnostny podkhod i formirovaniye kompetentnostnoy modeli spetsialista v vuze*), *Law and Education*, no. 4, pp. 47-55, 2014.
- [16] G.I. Ibragimov, E.M. Ibragimova, "Competence assessment: problems and solutions" (*Otsenivaniye kompetentsiy: problemy i resheniya*), *Higher Education in Russia*, no. 1, pp. 43-50, 2016.
- [17] E.Yu. Novikova, "Personal professional development and education" (*Professional'noye razvitiye lichnosti i obrazovaniye*), *Law and Education*, no. 9, pp. 40-49, 2015.
- [18] M.B. Oseledchik, M.L. Ivleva, V.Yu. Ivlev, "The fractal nature of implicit knowledge", *Proceedings of the 3-rd International Conference on Arts, Design, and Contemporary Education (ICADCE 2017). Series "Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research"*, vol. 144, pp. 673-676, 2017. DOI: 10.2991/icadce-17.2017.163
- [19] B.N. Zemtsov and T.R. Suzdaleva, "Ecological Law of Russia: Milestones of Formation", *Proceedings of the International Conference on Contemporary Education, Social Sciences and Ecological Studies (CESSSES 2018). Series "Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research"*, vol. 283, pp. 329-332, 2018. DOI: 10.2991/cesses-18.2018.74
- [20] P.N. Osipov, "Student as a subject of responsibility for the process and results of education" (*Student kak sub'yekt otvetstvennosti za protsess i rezul'taty obrazovaniya*), *Law and Education*, no. 2, pp. 4-12, 2017.
- [21] V.Yu. Ivlev, M.L. Ivleva and V.P. Sedyakin, "Information Metaphors and Classification of Information Sciences", *Proceedings of the International Conference on Contemporary Education, Social Sciences and Ecological Studies (CESSSES 2018). Series "Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research"*, vol. 283, pp. 874-879, 2018. DOI: 10.2991/cesses-18.2018.193
- [22] N.I. Gubanov and N.N. Gubanov, "Apollo's challenge as a driving force for educational development", *Vestnik slavianskikh kultur – bulletin of slavic cultures-scientific and informational journal*, vol. 50, no. 4, pp. 22-34, 2018.
- [23] E.Yu. Novikova, "Personal professional development and education" (*Professional'noye razvitiye lichnosti i obrazovaniye*), *Law and Education*, no. 9, pp. 40-49, 2015, p. 42
- [24] N.Yu. Terekhova, T.Yu. Tsybizova, "The main phases of systems genesis of students in the system of continuous education" (*Osnovnyye fazy sistemogeneza obuchayushchikhsya v sisteme nepreryvno obrazovaniya*), *European Social Science Journal*, no. 5, pp. 62-67, 2012.
- [25] A.N. Nekhamkin and V.A. Nekhamkin, "Counter-factual modeling of the past in everyday cognition", *Dialogue with Time*, no 65, pp. 336-352, 2018. DOI: 10.21267/AQUILLO.2018.65.20778

- [26] N.V. Ostapchuk, A.A. Pecherkina, "The study of psychological competence as a component of the professional health of the individual" (Issledovaniye psikhologicheskoy kompetentnosti kak sostavlyayushchey professional'nogo zdorov'ya lichnosti), *Education and Society*, no. 1, pp. 23-29, 2011.
- [27] N.I. Gubanov and N.N. Gubanov, "Criminal behavior: biological, social and personal conditionality", *Vestnik slavianskikh kultur — bulletin of slavic cultures-scientific and informational journal*, vol. 48, no. 2, pp. 53-66, 2018.
- [28] J.V. Ni, "Cultural approach in teaching a foreign language at an economic university" (ul'turologicheskiy podkhod v prepodavanii inostrannogo yazyka v ekonomicheskom vuze), *Education Integration*, no. 1, pp. 39-43, 2011, p. 40
- [29] E.A. Martynova, "Spirituality as the basis of education" (Dukhovnost' kak osnova obrazovaniya), *Education Integration*, no. 2, pp. 58-60, 2011.
- [30] I. Scheffler, *The Language of Education*, Springfield, IL: Charles C. Thomas, 1960, p. 113.