

# Cognitive and Discourse Peculiarities of Metaphor in Logical Argumentation of A. Lincoln' Discourse

Lada Shadaeva

*Irkutsk National Research Technical University,  
Institute of Linguistics and Intercultural Communication,  
Chair of English for technical specialties*

Irkutsk, Russia

Shadaeva@mail.ru

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0300-7609>

**Abstract** - This article is devoted to the study of cognitive and discourse features of metaphor in the logical type of argumentation of A. Lincoln's discourse. According to the well-known scientist A. N. Baranov, logical reasoning is aimed at reinterpreting the thesis within the framework of a given value. The cognitive feature of the metaphor in A. Lincoln's discourse is that it does not change the addressee's existing value preferences, the American people, but, precisely, the equality of all people – 'all men are created equal', and their representation of freedom – 'conceived in Liberty'. The discourse feature of the metaphor is that it is a language tool for A. Lincoln's creation of the following speech strategies: expertise, encouragement, activation of various kinds of social obligations, and propaganda strategies.

**Keywords** - *discourse, metaphor, argumentation, speech strategies, intention.*

## I. INTRODUCTION

In the cognitive approach to the study of a metaphor, it (a metaphor) is perceived as the main link in the assimilation and transfer of knowledge. Therefore, a metaphor gives us the opportunity to see an object or idea as if "in the light of" another object or idea, which allows us to apply knowledge and experience in another area. Thus, the architectural metaphor of the 19th century, biblical sayings, and the highlights of the Declaration of Independence, the wording of the laws of the US Constitution are stereotypes of the motivational level of Lincoln's language personality. As a process, the discourse of A. Lincoln represents statements and appeals organized according to the argumentative discourse. We distinguish the following types of the argumentative discourse: logical, generative and dialectical. It is characteristic for A. Lincoln to introduce the thesis and present his arguments through indirect speech acts, assumptions, expressions of opinion, etc., oriented on a picture of the world and knowledge of the addressee. In a broad sense, a communicative strategy can be defined as a type of behaviour that is conditioned and correlated with a plan for achieving global and local communication goals within a typical interactive type scenario. We analyze the logical type of argumentation in the discourse of Lincoln's language personality and define a typical interactive type scenario in the discourse of A. Lincoln.

## II. MATERIALS AND METHODS

"Logical reasoning is aimed at reinterpreting the thesis within a given value"[1]. The "basic" type of the argumentative discourse of A. Lincoln is the logical (rational) type. The essential feature of the discussed type of natural language argument is that arguments of this kind do not affect the value structures of participants in argumentative discourse, do not change the existing value preferences. For further analysis, we need a number of pragmatic mental procedures, the implementation of which is assumed for this type of argument. These procedures are: establishing compliance → comparison → assessment → explication of significance.

In order to determine the cognitive features of a metaphor in A. Lincoln's discourse, let us analyze the world – famous Gettysburg appeal of November 19, 1863. For the analysis of this appeal, we will remove from this statement non-argumentative elements of the text.

"Four score and seven years our fathers brought forth on this continent, a new nation, conceived in Liberty and dedicated to the proposition that all men are created equal.

Now we are engaged in a great civil war, testing whether that nation or any nation so conceived and so dedicated, can long endure ...

The brave men, living and dead, who struggled here, have consecrated it, far above our poor power to add or detract. The world will little note, nor long remember what we say here, but it can never forget what they did here. It is for us the living, rather, to be dedicated here to the unfinished work which they who fought here thus far so nobly advanced. It is rather for us to be here dedicated to the great task remaining before us – that from these honored dead we take increased devotion to that cause for which they gave the last full measure of devotion - that we here highly resolve that these dead shall not have died in vain - that this nation, under God, shall have a new birth of freedom - and that government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth" [2].

Thus, we excluded from the analysis the explanation and expression of A. Lincoln's emotions about the death of soldiers.

### III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Let us single out the thesis in a statement: "Four score and seven years our fathers brought forth on this continent, a new nation, conceived in Liberty, and dedicated to the proposition that all men are created equal."

Now we are engaged in a great civil war, testing whether that nation or any nation so conceived and so dedicated, can long endure." This thesis consists of two assertions: 1. It's created. 2. I've been able to understand the situation before the beginning of the civil war and in its period.

Having stopped at the foundation phase of the nation, A. Lincoln explicates his thesis using two basic values in the picture of the addressee (the American people): the first is the equality of all people – 'all men are created equal', the second is their belief in freedom – 'conceived in Liberty'. Let us dwell on the characteristics of the American people, designated by A. Lincoln with the phrase 'a new nation'. The used phrase, as we assume, is included in the concept of "new nation". This metaphor is borrowed from the New American Bible (1977) "I will make you a great nation"[3].

The colonial Puritans attached great importance to the interest of God in human history. According to the common interpretation of the Bible by the American people, God made an agreement not only with individual righteous people but with a whole nation – New England [4].

Thus, the fundamental value category of the general picture of the world in A. Lincoln's era is the belief in God's chosen American nation, which, like the biblical Abraham, received a new name and a new destiny with the God's blessing. Perhaps, it was precisely this interpretation of the biblical metaphor that A. Lincoln adhered to, changing the adjective "great" to "new". Using the conceptual metaphor of 'a new nation' is a categorical transfer within one part of speech, the adjective, "great nation" → "new nation". A. Lincoln interprets the understanding of the society in biblical terms.

The expression 'all men are created equal' is borrowed by A. Lincoln from the Declaration of Independence (1776):

"We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the pursuit of Happiness"[5].

A. Lincoln's appeal to the authority of the main official document in US history makes it possible for the addressee to accept this thesis since the overall picture of that era reflected the main ethical values of American society in the Declaration of Independence, such as the right to life, liberty and happiness.

The second part of the thesis: "It's possible to endorse", explicates the understanding of A. Lincoln and many northern Protestants of the meaning of civil war for the American society. They understood the civil war as a deserved punishment for national sins, in particular, for slavery. The present participle of 'testing' can be found in

the context of the Bible: "Sometime after these events, God put Abraham to the test". In the context of the Bible, God puts Abraham to the test, to sacrifice his only son to confirm his faith. The modern MacMillan dictionary gives the following meanings of the 'test':

- 1) to find out how much someone knows, or how well they can do something by giving them a set of questions to answer or an activity to perform;
- 2) to examine somebody's body to check that it is in good condition, or to find out if they have a particular illness;
- 3) to try using something such as a machine or product to find out whether it works correctly or satisfactorily;
- 4) to examine something to find out if it is satisfactory, or if it has a particular quality;
- 5) to show how good or effective someone or something is by putting pressure on them [6].

As can be seen from the listed interpretations, they all imply a test of capacity and compliance with any requirements. So, A. Lincoln using this verb "test" implies the significance of the current event, the civil war. On the one hand, the grammatical form of the participle I indicates the moment of action in the present; on the other hand, A. Lincoln expresses his understanding of the civil war as a test for the American people.

The propositional content of the thesis put forward by A. Lincoln will be read as follows: "Our founding fathers proclaimed the basic principles of an American society chosen by God, such as freedom and equality of all people. Civil war is God's test for the American people, the existence of slavery in society and the betrayal of the principles of American society."

Let us consider the arguments put forward by A. Lincoln in defense of the thesis.

Argument 1: "The brave men, living and dead, who struggled here, have consecrated it, far above our poor power to add or detract. The world will little note, nor long remember what we say here, but it can never forget what they did here".

It is expressed by two assertions: 1. It is far and away. 2. They show you the situation. A. Lincoln emphasizes the commonality of the victims, not highlighting, thus, neither the North, nor the South, nor the problems that caused the civil war. Attention is drawn to the second part of this argument. Z. Wendler called "illocutionary suicide" some cases which are subjected to a serious test and undermine the illocutionary function of the expressed opinion. The purpose of such statements is to prevent possible criticism, putting themselves initially in a "weak" position. Thus, in this part of the argument, A. Lincoln, explicating his opinion that "the world will hardly notice or remember what he is talking about", deliberately puts himself in a 'weak' position, thus he warns possible the addressee's criticism.

Argument 2: "This is an indirect speech act", Assertion, in which the second illocutionary act is the Directive speech act. The directive's illocutionary orientation makes the speaker perform some action.

Lincoln compares the soldiers' deaths under Gettysburg with the unfinished work. He calls on the American nation to pass God's trial (the civil war), confirm its chosenness by the God, and preserve the principles of a democratic society.

Argument 3: "It's these dead should not be expressed in vain" is expressed by the indirect speech act of the Assertion, where the second illocutionary act is the Directive speech act. J. Searle, in his work on "Indirect speech acts", compiled lists of sentences and sets of conditions for the existence of indirect speech acts. He wrote that S (speaker) can express an indirect impulse either through the assertion of the existence of valid reasons for performing A (action) by the addressee or by asking about the existence of such causes [8].

Such reasons in the statement of A. Lincoln are the following. The first reason is the confirmation of the chosenness of the American nation by God, expressed in the preservation of the union. The speaker explicates the first reason with the metaphor 'the great task'. In the context of A. Lincoln's statement, the focal word 'task' acquires a new meaning, which expands its meaning, and allows us to understand this metaphor as a "social phenomenon" – the preservation of the union of states. A. Lincoln categorizes the preservation of the union within one part of speech, the noun, in this case we have a metaphorical transfer "human activity → social phenomenon".

The second good reason is the commonality of the sacrifices made in the name of a democratic society. The speaker expresses the second reason through the metaphor, where 'the community of sacrifices' is categorized in terms of 'dimension'. Here we observe the categorial type of metaphoric transference, which results in a morphological change of lexical units involved in the nomination process: in our case, the inanimate noun 'the death' becomes an abstract noun 'measure'.

The third reason lies in the promise of A. Lincoln that 'the deaths of those who fell on the battlefield will not be in vain', which is expressed by the grammatical form of the predicate 'shall not have died' and lexically 'in vain'.

There is no doubt that important concepts are "encoded" in the language. It is often argued that the central concepts for the human psyche are reflected in the grammar of languages. It is a grammatical categorization that creates the conceptual grid, the framework for the distribution of all conceptual content, which is expressed lexically. Note that the mechanism of "transformation" of a lexical meaning into an abstract grammatical meaning can also be described as metaphorical [9].

The conclusion of the arguments of A. Lincoln is the following: "that this nation, under God, shall have a new birth of freedom - and that government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth".

The revival of the American nation' freedom, its liberation from the sin of slavery, which is explicable by the expression "that this nation, under God, shall have a new birth of freedom". The metaphor for 'new birth of freedom' is the thematic transference of "physical phenomenon → social phenomenon".

The concept of 'freedom' in the picture of the world of A. Lincoln is firmly connected with its definition in the basic document of American society – the Declaration of Independence, which gives every individual the right to life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness. A. Lincoln's understanding of the concept 'freedom' was to provide both the individual and society with the maximum opportunity to exercise freedom of self-determination, striving for ethical perfection. An obstacle was the existence of slavery in the southern states of the union. A. Lincoln expresses his attitude to the existence of slavery in his address at the Cooper Institute, in New York (February 27, 1860).

"As those fathers marked it, so let it be again marked, as an evil not to be extended, but to be tolerated and protected only because of and so far as its actual presence among us makes that toleration and protection a necessity" [10].

This attitude was reflected in tolerance towards the existence of slavery since the founding fathers recognised the existence of this institution as a compromise in the relations of states. In contrast to the position of the founding fathers, A. Lincoln considered it evil. As J. David Greenstone writes in his book on American liberalism, A. Lincoln saw the existence of slavery as a triple evil: it denied all the intellectual abilities of slaves, it corrupted the moral principles of their owners and threatened the prospects for the development of the entire white population [11].

A. Lincoln perceives the existence of the institution of slavery as a moral and ethical problem that hinders the further development of a free personality and, therefore, a free society. To overcome this problem, get rid of the existence of the institution of evil, A. Lincoln expresses his opinion in a metaphor 'new birth of freedom'.

In this case, the understanding of the social phenomenon 'freedom' is expressed in terms of the physical phenomenon 'birth'. Determining the significance of studying the cognitive reality of the egocentric category of metaphors, S. A. Khakhalova indicates that many cognitive metaphors are associated with both human activity and its physiological phenomena [12].

The expression 'that government of the people, by the people, for the people', used by A. Lincoln, will later become a symbol of the democratic power of the United States [13]. Speaking or writing the material form of a word, addressed primarily to the listener, is important for the sender of the word. It is at this moment that the word is formed and functions as a full-fledged sign because its form is directly connected with the corresponding concept or image in the mind of the speaker/writer. In such cases, the metaphor is used to create the name of realities (concepts). As an example of it is the designation of the concept of "popular government" by A. Lincoln as a metaphor "government of the people, by the people, for the people" in which he expressed his understanding of democracy. Three English prepositions express various aspects and essential features of democracy: democracy emanates "from" the people ("of"), it is carried out by the people ("by") and in the interests of the people ("for"). In this case, the metaphor performs a communicative function, since it allows you to present new information in a concise and accessible form to the addressee. The metaphor used to the speaker conveys an

understanding of democratic power through the prepositions 'of', 'by', 'for'.

We present this argument schematically as follows:

The data (thesis): Four score and seven years our fathers brought forth on this continent, a new nation, conceived in Liberty, and dedicated to the proposition that all men are created equal.

Now we are engaged in a great civil war, testing whether that nation or any nation so conceived and so dedicated, can long endure."

Base:

Argument 1. "The brave men, living and dead, who struggled here, have consecrated it, far above our poor power to add or detract. The world will little note, nor long remember what we say here, but it can never forget what they did here".

Argument 2. "It is for us the living, rather, to be dedicated here to the unfinished work which they who fought here thus far so nobly advanced".

Argument 3. "It is rather for us to be here dedicated to the great task remaining before us - that from this honoured dead we take increased devotion to that cause for which they gave the last full measure of devotion - that we here highly resolve that these dead shall not have died in vain".

Conclusion: "that this nation, under God, shall have a new birth of freedom – and that government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth".

Let's reproduce a number of mental procedures of a pragmatic nature for a logical (rational) type of argumentation. The first procedure is related to the determination of correspondence between the participants' value structures. This correspondence can be defined from A. Lincoln's discourse through explication of two main value categories in the picture of the world of the American people: the first includes the concept of "equality" (expression 'all men are created equal'), the second – the concept of "freedom" (expression 'conceived in Liberty'). The second procedure is a comparison of the thesis under discussion with actualized value concepts. This procedure may be performed in the second part of A. Lincoln's thesis, expressed by the verb 'test'. The third procedure is related to comparison, it allows us to estimate the degree of conformity of the thesis to the representation of value categories.

According to A. N. Baranov's grading assessment levels, we have a homeostatic assessment based on A. Lincoln's criteria for achieving the goal – to stand the God's test (a civil war), while preserving the principles of a democratic society.

The last procedure of the logical (rational) type of argumentation is the significance of the defended position. We observe the reinterpretation of the thesis within the given value categories: the preservation of the principles of a democratic state based on freedom, equality and popular government, expressed by the speaker through the metaphors 'a new birth of freedom', 'all men are created

equal', 'that government of the people, by the people, for the people'.

As constituents of communication strategies, we consider the goals and attitudes of both A. Lincoln and the addressee. We also take into account the well-known position in psychology that everyone hears what he wants to hear. Depending on the degree of "globality" of the speaker's intentions, strategies may characterize a specific conversation with specific goals and may be more general, aimed at achieving more general social goals (manifestation of power, ascertainment and maintenance of status, etc.) [14]. In this case, A. Lincoln's intention was to convince the addressee that civil war is God's test for the greatest sin of slavery. Speech strategies in A. Lincoln's discourse characterize the American people's chosenness by God in secular history, expressed by such expressions as 'a new nation', 'all men are created equal', 'a new birth of freedom', 'that government of the people, by the people, for the people'.

Submission strategies such as the expertise, promotion, activation of social obligations are the main strategies in A. Lincoln's discourse. Let us consider which strategies of subordination are used by A. Lincoln. The power of expertise is based on the listener's ability to perceive rational arguments. So, A. Lincoln uses the listener's ability to perceive rational arguments, based on the moral and ethical problem of American society at that time, the existence of slavery. The first rational argument of A. Lincoln is the chosenness of the American people, explicated by the metaphor of 'a new nation': "It's a new nation that has been created equal."

The second rational argument is the attitude to the civil war between the North and the South of the United States as God's testing: "so it's possible to understand that there's a country that can be defined, and it's so much it's possible to endorse".

The authors of the submission strategies, J. French and B. Raven (1960), point to the "legitimate" power when the speaker has the right to demand submission, and the "power of reference", the essence of which is to identify the hearer and speaker (it is about activating the hearer's obligations to the speaker, partner) [15]. According to these principles, A. Lincoln, endowed with the legitimate authority of the President, activates the social obligations of US citizens:

"The brave men, living and dead, who struggled here, have consecrated it, far above our poor power to add or detract. The world will little note, nor long remember what we say here, but it can never forget what they did here".

Thus, the first social commitment, activated by A. Lincoln, is the recipient's understanding of the community of victims, which, according to the speaker, united the opposing sides in achieving a common goal in a civil war – to stand God's test of the chosen nation, the American people: "It is for us the living, rather, to be dedicated here to the unfinished work which they who fought here thus far so nobly advanced". In this statement, A. Lincoln activates the social commitment of the American people to complete the work that was not completed by those who died at Gettysburg.

Then the speaker magnifies the fact of the death of the dead, prompting the addressee to fulfill the social obligation to remember the dead who gave their lives in the struggle for the ethical perfection of the chosen nation: “It is rather for us to be here dedicated to the great task remaining before us – that from these honored dead we take increased devotion to that cause for which they gave the last full measure of devotion – that we here highly resolve that these dead shall not have died in vain.”

As we mentioned before, A. Lincoln perceived the existence of the institution of slavery as a moral and ethical problem that hindered the further development of a free personality, and, therefore, a free society. The metaphor ‘new birth of freedom’ reflects his opinion for overcoming the sin of slavery.

Here we see a reward strategy, since the reward for the addressee in the struggle for the ethical perfection of society, deliverance from the institution of slavery would be, according to A. Lincoln, the eternal existence of a state, which he expresses by ‘that government of the people, by the people, for the people’.

In addition, A. Lincoln used the metaphor, which later became a symbol of the democratic power of the United States and promoted the image of the people's government, which, in turn, allows us to highlight another A. Lincoln's strategy in the analyzed appeal – propaganda.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

The analyzed material allows us to demonstrate, according to A. N. Baranov, the logical (rational) type of argumentation. The process of metaphorization in the discourse of A. Lincoln can be considered both from a cognitive point of view and from a pragmatic one. So, the cognitive peculiarity of the metaphor in the logical type of argumentation is that it does not change the addressee's value preferences, and the metaphors used by A. Lincoln do not affect the value structures of the participants in the argumentative discourse. Also, we can identify such strategies as activation of social obligations, promotion and propaganda in the argumentation of A. Lincoln.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] A.N. Baranov, “Cognitive Mechanisms of Ontologization of Knowledge in the Mirror of a Language”, in *Artificial Intelligence*, issue 793, pp. 21-39, 1988. (in Russian).
- [2] A. Lincoln, “Gettysburg appeal of November 19, 1863”. URL: <https://www.historynet.com/gettysburg-address-text>
- [3] New American standard 1977 – Bible Hub. URL: <https://biblehub.com/genesis/12-2.htm>
- [4] K.S. Hajiyeve, “American protestantism”, in *History and modern history*, no. 1, pp. 96-114, 1993. (in Russian)
- [5] Declaration of Independence. URL: <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Declaration-of-Independence>
- [6] MacMillan English Dictionary: For Advanced Learners, London: Printed and bound in Malaysia, 2003.
- [7] Z. Wendler, “Illocutionary suicide”, in *New in Foreign Linguistics*, issue 16, pp. 238-250. (in Russian)
- [8] J.R Searle, “Expression and Meaning. Studies in the Theory of Speech Acts”, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- [9] O.N. Laguta, “Metaphorology: Theoretical aspects”, Novosibirsk: NSU, 2003.

- [10] A. Lincoln, “Address at Cooper Institute”. URL: <http://www.abrahamlincolnonline.org/lincoln/speeches/cooper.htm>
- [11] D.J. Greenstone, “The Lincoln Persuasion. Remaking American Liberalism”, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1993.
- [12] S.A. Khakhalova, “Metaphor in aspects of language, thinking and culture”, Irkusk: ISLU, 1998.
- [13] B.F. Brown, “Witness to the Young Republic”, in *A Yankee's Journal*, London: University Press, 1989.
- [14] O.S. Issers, “Speech impact in the aspect of cognitive categories”, in *Bulletin of Omsk University*, issue 1, pp. 74-79, 1999. (in Russian)
- [15] F.P. French., and B. Raven, “The Bases of Social Power”, in Cartwright D. and Zander A. (Ed), N-Y.: Harper and Row, 1960.