

The Development of Character through Extra-Curricular Programs

Solfema^{1(*)}, Syafruddin Wahid², Alim Harun Pamungkas³

^{1,2,3}Department of Nonformal Education Faculty of Education Universitas Negeri Padang

(*)✉ (e-mail) solfema@fip.unp.ac.id

Abstract

Development in the field of education is not merely aimed at the development of intellectual intelligence, even which is no less important is the character building. This matter because the character is higher in value than intellectuality. Stability of life depends on the character possessed. It because the characters make people able to survive, has the stamina to keep fighting, and able to overcome the disadvantage meaningfully. Thus, the impact of character development is not only on social behavior, but also affects academic achievement. Developing learners' character in an increasingly complex and changing world is not a simple task. Education should be properly dened, as the best means to trigger resurrection and move the times. Schools across the world must be the best place to build the character, among them extra-curricular activities. In this regard, this paper will discuss the importance of character education through extra-curricular activities with sub-sections as follows (1) the nature of education of character, (2) character development as education needs, and (3) extra-curricular activities as container of character development.

Keywords: education, character development, extra-curricular program

Introduction

Development in the field of education is not merely aimed at the development of intellectual intelligence. Even though, it is far more widely, as mandated in law on the national education system Number 20/2003, namely the intellectual life of the nation and develop a complete humanity of Indonesia, the man who believes and piety to God Almighty and virtuous noble character, possessing knowledge and skills, physical and spiritual health, a stable and independent personality, and sense of community responsibility and nationality. Based on the purpose of education is contained meaning that the formation of character is an absolute manifest (Tirri, 2011).

The focus of attention on character education is not unreasonable. Various threats and worries to the nation is due to the weakness of the development of the character of the nation, not to mention the character of our protégé generation in various educational institutions (Kaur, 2015). We are lulled by spurring intellectual development (Simatwa, 2010) (Baker, 2013). School emphasizes more on the developing academic ability but ignores other development which very large influence on life, even though is it not the only one that determines success (Roeser, Midgley, & Urdan, 1996) (Gross et al., 2015). Intellectual quotients account for only about 20% of the factors that determine success in life, so that 80% is filled by other forces (Brackett, Rivers, & Salovey, 2011; Gardner & Hatch, 1989; Hassan, Saeid, Hashim, Bin, & Khalil, 2014; Maftoon & Sarem, 2012).

Nowadays, social facts encountered, such as increased moral degradation, decline in ethics and courtesy, dishonesty, high cases of violence, free sex, drug abuse, suicide, and others, are the result of depletion of cultural values and character. The scholar from Republic of Rome, Marcus Tullius Cicero

(106-43 BC), issued the words, "The well-being of a nation stems from the strong character of its citizen...". The history of civilization in various corners of the world proves the truth of the phrase. We know, nations that have a formidable character, usually grows more advanced and prosperous. Recent examples are including in India, China, Brazil, and Russia. In contrast, the weaker nations of character are generally worse off, such as contemporary Greece and a number of countries in Africa and Asia. They become a nation that has almost no meaningful contribution to the progress of the world, even a failed state. In this regard, the famous historian Arnold Toynbee once expressed, "Of the twenty-one recorded civilizations, nineteen were destroyed not by conquest from the outside, but because of moral decay from within". It means that due to the weakness of the character.

Thus, the character is very important (Pattaro, 2016). Character is higher in value than intellectuality (Quinlan, 2011) (Keeling, 2014) (King & Mayhew, 2002) (Chowdhury, 2016) (Olowookere, Alao, Odukoya, Adekeye, & Agbude, 2015). The stability of life depends on the character possessed. These matters because the characters make people able to survive, have the stamina to keep fighting, and able to overcome the disadvantage meaningfully (Hamid, 2012). The impact of character development is not only on social behavior, but also it affects academic achievement (Barch, Harris, & Bonsall, 2012; Lapsley & Woodbury, 2016). Developing learners' characters in an increasingly complex and changing world is not a simple task. It is time to face the challenge (Lickona, 1991). Therefore, it is time to work to build character in earnest. Education should be properly denned, as the best means to trigger resurrection and move the times. Schools across the world must be the best place to build and develop character. Character development is not a one-sided responsibility, as a matter of course; it will be the responsibility of all parties, everyone and every institute. Therefore, character education can be implemented through various paths, such as through the container of extracurricular activities (Sardjijo, 2017). In relation to the various problems that have been proposed, this paper will discuss the importance of character education through extracurricular activities with sub-sections as follows (1) the nature of education character, (2) education needs, and (3) extracurricular activities as a container for character development

Approach Character Education

What is the Meaning of Character Education

Talk about the character education and its development, it cannot be separated from the understanding of the meaning of educational objectives which has been mandated in Law on the national education system Number 20/2003, namely the intellectual life of the nation and develop a complete Indonesian man, the man who believes and piety towards God Almighty and virtuous noble character, possessing knowledge and skills, physical and spiritual health, a stable and independent personality and sense of community responsibility and nationality.

National education serves to build the character and civilization of a dignified nation in order to educate the life of the nation (Sardjijo, 2017). Throughout its history, among the world, education has essentially two goals, namely to help people to be smart and educated and help them become good human beings, smart, and educated (Lickona, 1991). Making people smart and educated, it may be easy to do, but making people to be kind and wise people seems to be much harder or even more difficult. Thus, it means that moral problems (Schuitema, Dam, & Veugelers, 2008) are acute or chronic problems that accompany human life anytime and anywhere, then education should have an impact forming the character of a nation called character education.

Based on the purpose of this education contained the meaning that character development is an absolute manifestation. In our country, to strengthen character education is also followed up by the issuance of the Presidential Regulation of Republic Indonesia No. 87/2017 on strengthening character education published by the Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia (online), explains that to

build and develop the character of Indonesian people and nation possess kindly character, superior, and noble; then the effort made is through education

Talking about character education, it can be seen some expert opinions. The characters relate to moral concepts (moral knowing)(Silay, 2014), moral attitude (moral feeling)(Thirachai & Sunthorapot, 2016), and moral behavior (moral behavior)(Aini, 2013; Fallis et al., 2013). Based on these three components, it can be stated that good character is supported by knowledge of goodness, the desire to do good, and do good deeds.

The character as a way of thinking and behaving that characterizes each individual to live and work together, both within the family, society, nation, and country. They also stated that education has the same essence and meaning with moral education and character education(Suyatno, Sumedi, & Riadi, 2009). The goal is to build learners' personality, to be a good human being, a citizen, and a good nation. In addition, as good human criteria, good citizens, and good nation for a nation's society are, in general, certain social values that are heavily influenced by the culture of the peoples(Novianti, 2017). Therefore, the essence of character education in the context of education in Indonesia is the value of education, namely the noble values education that comes from the culture of the Indonesian nation itself, in order to foster the personality of the young generation.

Based on the grand design developed by National Education Ministry of Indonesia, psychologically and socially culture is the formation of character in the individual that is the function of all human potential (cognitive, affective, co native, and psychomotor) in the context of cultural social interaction (in family, school and community) and lasts for life(Sardjijo, 2017). Configuration of characters in the context of the totality of psychological and socio-cultural processes can be grouped in spiritual and emotional development, intellectual development, sports and kinesthetic development, and affective and creativity development.

Throughout the character education which is the behavioral education involved all aspects; cognitive, feeling, and action. This matter, stated that without these three aspects, the education cannot be effective. Character education does not only involve the moral knowing, but also moral feeling and moral action. There are number of character concepts such individual character, private and public character and nation character(Lickona, 1991).

Psychologically individual characters interpreted as a result of integration of four parts, namely spiritual and emotional development, intellectual development, physical and kinesthetic development and affective and creativity development(Sardjijo, 2017). While the characters, including individual characters, private and public characters, and the character of the nation. So it can be concluded that character education does not just teach what the right and wrong ones, more than that, character education inculcates habits about which is good in order that the learners become aware of what right and wrong ones, able to feel good and normal value and able to practice it.

Functions, Purposes, and Impact of Character Building

In accordance with the national educational functions contained in law on the national education system Number 20/2003 stated that national education function is to develop the ability and build the character and civilization of dignified nation in order to educate the life of the nation, aims to the development of potential learners in order to become a human being who believes and cautious to God Almighty, noble, healthy, capable, creative, independent, and become a democratic and responsible citizen. To enable such education, character education is required.

Character education aims to develop the ability and shape the character and civilization of a dignified nation in order to educate the nation's life. Furthermore, character education functions such as (1) developing the basic potential for good-hearted, good-minded, and well behaved; (2) strengthening and building multicultural nation behavior; and (3) enhancing the nation's competitive civilization in the association of the world.

Furthermore, character development is expected to have an impact on academic success. Several important research findings on the impact of character development were published by a bulletin, *Character Educator*, published by *Character Education Partnership*. In the bulletin, Marvin Berkowitz of the University of Missouri, St. Louis, showed an increasing in the motivation of school learners in achieving academic achievement in schools that applied character education.

Classes that are comprehensively involved in character education show a drastic decline in learner negative behavior that can hinder academic success. The emotional factor of character has a great influence on the success of life. Meanwhile, intellectual intelligence only accounts for about 20% for the factors that determine success in life; the other 80% is filled by other forces (Brackett et al., 2011; Gardner & Hatch, 1989; Hassan et al., 2014; Maftoon & Sarem, 2012).

Character Development as an Education Needs

Character education has been the concern of many countries in order to prepare quality generation which is not only for the individual interests of the citizens, but also for the people as a whole. Character education is a deliberate effort of all dimensions of life to help character formation optimally. Character education is a demand that cannot be ignored in the development of education, because character education is a mandate of education that has been poured in on the national education system and reinforced by Presidential Regulation Number 87/2017.

Therefore, by applying the education of character systematically and sustainably, learners will be emotionally intelligent. Emotional intelligence is an important bullet in preparing children for the future, because one will be easier and able to cope with all kinds of life challenges, including the challenge of academic success with improved academic performance(Goleman, 2001).

There are several reasons why schools should provide clear and comprehensive direction on moral education commitments and character development, among which are the following(Lickona, 1991): (a) urgent need because there is an increasing number of young generations who commit violence and harm, both themselves and others, because of the lack of awareness of moral values; (b) giving moral values to the young generations is one of the most important functions of civilization; (c) the role of the school as a character educator becomes more and more important as many children gain some moral teaching from parents, communities, or religious institutions; (d) the emergence of conflicts in the society caused by differences in basic views of ethics; (e) democracy has a special need for moral education because democracy is a rule of, for, and by society; (f) nothing is considered a value-free education. Schools teach values every day through design or without design; (g) commitment to the character education is so important, when it is a pleasure and continues to be a good educator; and (h) effective character education makes schools more civilized, caring for the community, and refers to.

Values and Terms of Character Building

In accordance with the essence and main goal of character development, which is to form a nation that is strong, competitive, noble, moral, tolerant, worked together, spirited patriot, dynamic, and science-oriented and technology all of which are imbued with faith and piety, and based on Pancasila, need to formulated the values that need to be invested in building the character of the nation(Amir, 2013). Thus, the Center for Curriculum, Development, and Education of Culture and Character of the Nation has identified as many as 18 values derived from religion, Pancasila, culture, and educational objectives, as follows(Indriani, 2017).

- a) *Religious*, attitudes and behaviors that obedient in implementing the religious teachings that are adhered to, tolerant, and live in harmony with the followers of other religions.

- b) *Honest*, behavior based on an attempt to establish himself as a person who can always be trusted in words, actions, and work.
- c) *Tolerance*, attitudes and actions that respect different religious, ethnic, ethnic, opinion, attitude, and other person's differences.
- d) *Discipline*, actions that demonstrate orderly conduct and abide by various rules and regulations.
- e) *Hard work*, actions that demonstrate orderly behavior and adherence to various rules and regulations in doing so.
- f) *Creative*, think and do something to produce new ways or results from something you already have.
- g) *Independently*, attitudes and behaviors that are not easy depending on others in completing tasks.
- h) *Democratic*, thinking, acting, and acting ways that judge equal rights and duties of himself and others.
- i) *Curiosity*, attitudes and actions that always seek to know more deeply and extensively what they learn, see, and hear.
- j) *The spirit of nationalism*, thinking, acting, and insight that put the interests of the nation and state above the interests of self and his group.
- k) *Love the homeland*, way of thinking, acting, and insight that put the interests of the nation and state above the interests of self and his group.
- l) *Appreciate the achievements*, attitudes and actions to produce something that is useful to society, recognize, and respect the success of others.
- m) *Friendly/communicative*, attitudes and actions that produce something that is useful to society, acknowledge, and respect the success of others.
- n) *Love peace*, with attitudes and actions that are useful to society, and recognize, and respect the success of others.
- o) *Fond of reading*, the habit of providing time to read the various readings that give good to him.
- p) *Care for the environment*, attitudes and actions that always try to prevent environmental damage, and repair the damage that already happened.
- q) *Social care*, attitudes and actions that always want to provide assistance to others and communities in need.
- r) *Responsibility*, carrying out obligations to self, society, environment, country, and God Almighty.

In the implementation of character education in schools, although there have been 18 values forming the character of the nation, of course each school will not be the same application (Nuridin, 2015). Schools and regions can prioritize according to the interests and conditions of their respective regions and schools. In its application the number and type of characters prioritized depends on the respective interests (Amir, 2013; Indriani, 2017).

The truly process of character education requires a lot of things. At least, there are three principles that are keys to the organization of character education (Amir, 2013). *First*, character education must be oriented to foster the potential of learners thoroughly and integrated. Education should be oriented to harmonize between the heart, taste, thought, and exercise. Character education should provide enough space for the growing potential of intuition, emotion, and cognition of learners in an integrated manner. *Second*, character education can only take place well if there exists in the application of character education in each educational environment. *Third*, character education must take place through habituation and all the time in daily life. Character education is not limited to certain space and time. Wherever and whenever, the character education process should be done and become a habit.

Taking into account the values and precedent of character education, it can be concluded that character education can be conducted in formal, informal, and informal education units. In the formal educational unit, through intra-curricular, co-curricular, and extracurricular activities are performed.

Extracurricular Activities as an Organization Container of Character Development

Related to the strategy that can be used in the character education training through extracurricular activities, it is necessary to review the extracurricular activities as educational activities conducted outside the normally hours lessons. These activities are conducted within and/or outside the school environment in order to broaden knowledge, improve skills, and internalize religious values and rules as well as social norms, both locally and nationally (Fischer & Theis, 2014).

Taking into account the activities of extracurricular education conducted outside the school hours, it can be said that the implementation of extracurricular activities should be different from intracurricular interception in a more formal school system. Extracurricular activities should be implemented with a more flexible system, that is, the participants can choose the type of activities that suit the interests and needs studied, treated with a variety of methods, and educated by people who have competencies relevant to the type of activity (Massoni, 2011).

Looking forward the real situation, extracurricular activities aim to help the development of learners according to their needs, potential, talents, and interests. Therefore, extracurricular activities help improve the ability of learners, be it cognitive abilities, affective, and psychomotor. In addition, extracurricular activities are undertaken to develop the talents and interests of learners in the effort of personal coaching towards the full human development.

The purpose of this extracurricular activity clearly illustrates how the character of learners is well built. Extracurricular activities work to develop the ability and creativity of learners according to their potential, talents, and interests. Extracurricular activities also have a social function, namely to develop the ability and sense of social responsibility learners. In addition, this activity also serves to develop an atmosphere of relaxed, exciting and fun for learners who support the development process. Looking at the essence of extracurricular activities that have been put forward, it is clear that this activity contains elements that can build the character of learners (Massoni, 2011).

Based on the thoughts that have been put forward, it can be said that extracurricular activities that are part of the effort to give birth to a person who is not only smart, but also a good character. Therefore, extracurricular activities have an important role in building learner character.

Through extracurricular activities, learners can grow God's love attitude, responsibility, tolerance, willing to sacrifice, discipline, respect for others, mutual cooperation, and so forth. It is expected that learners realize the importance of extracurricular activities, so they can follow the activity well to be a noble personality. In addition, it is expected the school was able to realize the role of extracurricular activities to build the character of learners by holding various extracurricular activities that support the development of each learner (Massoni, 2011).

To organize extracurricular activities, there are several things to be considered as follows: (a) *individually*, the principle of extracurricular activities should be in accordance with the potential, talent, and interests of each learner; (b) *the choice*, which is the principle of extracurricular activity that is in accordance with the wishes, is chosen, and is followed voluntarily by the learners; (c) *active engagement*, which is the principle of extracurricular activities that requires full participation of learners; (d) *fun*, which is the principle of extracurricular activity in the preferred atmosphere, encouraging, and engaging the learners; (e) *work ethic*, which is the principle of extracurricular activities that build the spirit of learners to work well and succeed; and (f) *social benefits*, namely the principle of extracurricular activities that are implemented for the benefit of the community.

Extracurricular is an educational activity beyond the normally school hours shown to help learners develop according to their needs, potential, talents, and interests through activities that are specifically organized by learners and/or educational personnel who are capable and authorized in school. For that the implementation of character development through extracurricular activities certainly refers to the character design of character education. The creation of character education in

the environment in formal and non formal education units can be done through (1) assignment, (2) habituation, (3) training, (4) teaching, (5) direction, and (6) guidelines.

Conclusion

Character development in extracurricular activities cannot be carried out only at randomly. Therefore, the extracurricular activities must be well planned and supported by the right tools. Activities without clear planning, making these activities will not be able to achieve the intended target. The implementation of extracurricular activities that support character education, need to be supported by the following things.

- a) Availability of guidelines for implementation of activities. This means that extracurricular activities for character development should have planning and guidance on clear rules and technical implementation and can be guided by educators, learners, and other interested parties.
- b) Capacity development of human resources in order to support the implementation of character education. Therefore, extracurricular activities for character development cannot be handled by incompetent people. Extra-curricular activities for character building must be managed by people who have the skills as educational managers; the program is designed by those who have the ability to design educational programs, and implemented by competent educators in their respective fields. Therefore, there needs to be capacity building for each related resource.
- c) Revitalize existing extracurricular activities towards character development. This is related to character development in existing curricular activities. On the other hand, it should be questioned whether the implementation of the extracurricular activities that have been running already supports the development of learners' characters. Therefore, one of the efforts that need to be done is how to revitalize the activity again.

References

- Aini, W. N. (2013). *Wildan Graduated in 22 February 2013 from English Education Study Program of Indonesia University of Education, (1972), 196–205.
- Amir, S. (2013). Pancasila As Integration Philosophy of Education And National Character. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 2(1), 54–57. Retrieved from www.ijstr.org
- Baker, D. (2013). Art Integration and Cognitive Development. *Journal for Learning Through the Arts*, 26(1), 217–220. <https://doi.org/10.5811/westjem.2011.5.6700>
- Barch, J. C., Harris, R., & Bonsall, D. L. (2012). Leadership Education as Character Development: Best Practices from 21 Years of Helping Graduates Live Purposeful Lives. *Journal of College and Character*, 13(4). <https://doi.org/10.1515/jcc-2012-1947>
- Brackett, M. A., Rivers, S. E., & Salovey, P. (2011). Emotional intelligence: Implications for personal, social, academic, and workplace success. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass*, 5(1), 88–103. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-9004.2010.00334.x>
- Chowdhury, M. (2016). Emphasizing Morals , Values , Ethics , And Character Education In Science Education And Science Teaching. *The Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Science*, 4(2), 1–16.
- Fallis, A. ., Madkur, A., Narvaez, D., Lapsley, D., Silvia, A., Steedly, M. M., ... Larson, K. (2013). Understanding the Importance of Character Education. *The Asian Conference on Language Learning*, 3(4), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Fischer, N., & Theis, D. (2014). Quality of extracurricular activities - considering developmental changes in the impact on school attachment and achievement Quality of extracurricular activities – Considering developmental changes in the impact. *Journal for Educational Research Online*, 6(3), 54–75.

- Gardner, H., & Hatch, T. (1989). Intelligences Multiple. *Educational Research*, 18(8), 4–10. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X018008004>
- Goleman, D. (2001). Emotional Intelligence : Issues in Paradigm Building.
- Gross, J. M. S., Haines, S. J., Hill, C., Grace, L., Blue-banning, M., & Turnbull, A. P. (2015). Strong School – Community Partnerships in Inclusive Schools Are “ Part of the Fabric of the School ... We Count on Them .” *School Community Journal*, 25(2), 9–34. Retrieved from <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1085646.pdf>
- Hamid, D. (2012). Belajar Pendidikan Karakter dari Thomas Lickona. Retrieved January 20, 2018, from <http://hamiddarmadi.blogspot.co.id/2012/04/belajar-pendidikan-karakter-dari-thomas.html>
- Hassan, J., Saeid, J., Hashim, F., Bin, Y., & Khalil, M. N. (2014). The impact of emotional intelligence on communication effectiveness: Focus on strategic alignment. *African Journal of Marketing Management*, 6(6), 82–87. <https://doi.org/10.5897/AJMM2010.036>
- Indriani, D. E. (2017). Character Education Based On Pancasila Values Through Curriculum 2013 On Primary Education Children in Madura. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia*, 2(1), 13–17.
- Kaur, S. (2015). Moral Values In Education. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science Ver. III*, 20(3), 21–26. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-20332126>
- Keeling, R. P. (2014). An Ethic of Care in Higher Education: Well-Being and Learning. *Journal of College and Character*, 15(3), 141–148. <https://doi.org/10.1515/jcc-2014-0018>
- King, P. M., & Mayhew, M. J. (2002). Moral judgement development in higher education: Insights from the Defining Issues Test. *Journal of Moral Education*, 31(3), 247–270. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305724022000008106>
- Lapsley, D., & Woodbury, R. (2016). Moral-Character Development for Teacher Education. *Action in Teacher Education*, 38(3), 194–206. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2016.1194785>
- Lickona, T. (1991). *Educating for Character: How Our Schools Can Teach Respect and Responsibility*. New York: Bantam Books.
- Maftoon, P., & Sarem, S. N. (2012). The Realization of Gardner’s Multiple Intelligences (MI) Theory in Second Language Acquisition (SLA). *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 3(6), 1233–1241. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.3.6.1233-1241>
- Massoni, E. (2011). The Positive Effects of Extra Curricular Activities on Students. *ESSAI(The Berkeley Electronic Press)*, 9(7), 84–87. Retrieved from <http://dc.cod.edu/essai/vol9/iss1/27>
- Novianti, N. (2017). Bildungsroman for Character Education in Higher Education: an Indonesian Context. *International Journal of Education*, 9(2), 126–132. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ije.v9i2.5474>
- Nurdin, E. S. (2015). The Policies on Civic Education in Developing National Character in Indonesia. *International Education Studies*, 8(8), 199–209. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v8n8p199>
- Olowookere, E. I., Alao, A. A., Odukoya, J. A., Adekeye, O. A., & Agbude, G. A. (2015). Time Management Practices, Character Development and Academic Performance among University Undergraduates: Covenant University Experience. *Creative Education*, 6(1), 79–86. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2015.61007>
- Pattaro, C. (2016). Character Education: Themes and Researches. An academic Literature Review. *Italian Journal of Sociology of Education*, 8(1), 6–30. <https://doi.org/10.14658/pupj-ijse-2016-1-2>
- Quinlan, K. (2011). *Developing the whole student: Leading higher education initiatives that integrate mind and heart*. London, England: The Leadership Foundation for Higher Education. Retrieved from https://www.learning.ox.ac.uk/media/global/.../Quinlan_Developing_2011.pdf
- Roeser, R. W., Midgley, C., & Urdan, T. C. (1996). Perceptions of the school psychological environment and early adolescents’. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 88(3), 408–422.
- Sardjijo. (2017). Character Education through Good Harmony Activities in School, 4(7), 3690–3694. <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v4i7.18>
- Schuitema, J., Dam, G. Ten, & Veugelers, W. (2008). Teaching strategies for moral education: A review. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 40(1), 69–89. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220270701294210>

- Simatwa, E. M. W. (2010). Piaget's theory of intellectual development and its implication for instructional management at pre- secondary school level. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 5(7), 366–371.
- Silay, N. (2014). A Study of Moral Education and its Relationship with Character Education. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(3), 131–138. <https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2014.v5n2p353>
- Suyatno, Sumedi, P., & Riadi, S. (2009). *Pengembangan Profesionalisme Guru: 70 Tahun Abdul Malik Fadjar*. Jakarta: Uhamka Press.
- Thirachai, C., & Sunthorapot, D. (2016). Development and validity testing of belief measurement model in Buddhism for junior high school students at Chiang Rai Buddhist Scripture School: An application for Multitrait-Multimethod analysis. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 11(18), 1731–1740. <https://doi.org/10.5897/ERR2016.2729>
- Tirri, K. (2011). Holistic school pedagogy and values: Finnish teachers' and students' perspectives. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 50(3), 159–165. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2011.07.010>