

Implementation of Labor Inspection Policy in West Java Province at Indonesia in Facing the Digital Era 4.0

Khairul Ismed*, Wibowo Wibowo, Hamidah Hamidah

Universitas Negeri Jakarta
Jakarta, Indonesia

*khisme2000@yahoo.com, wibowo@unj.ac.id, hamidah@unj.ac.id

Abstract—This research aims to analyze labor inspection in Indonesia in the digital era 4.0. This research method used an evaluative descriptive method. The object of the research was focused on the four labor and transmigration offices of West Java Province. Data is collected through observation, documentation studied, and in-depth interview. Data analysis used descriptive evaluative techniques, through four stages, namely: data collection, data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing/verification. The results of the studied found that the number of labor inspectors was considered very limited, the professionalism of labor inspector needed to be improved, the labor inspection mechanism was still conventional, the budget requirements for labor inspection had not been met, the number of violations of labor norms and work accident cases. From the found above, it is necessary to increase the number of labor inspectors, need to upgrade labor inspectors, labor inspection mechanisms used information technology (digital), provide adequate labor inspection budget requirements, and enforce strict labor norms, as well as institutional strengthening through system strengthening labor inspection.

Keywords—implementation; labor inspection policy; digital era 4.0

I. INTRODUCTION

The era Digital 4.0 is characterized by a comprehensive transformation of all aspects of industrial production through the incorporation of digital and internet technology with conventional industries and integration of Cyber Physical System (CPS) and Internet of Things and Services (IoT and IoS) in to industrial processes [1].

Lifter and Tschiener stated that the basic principle of Digital 4.0 is to implement intelligent networks, workflows, systems and the incorporation of machines in the chain and production processes to control each other independently [2]. According to Prasetyo and Sutopo, that the Industrial Revolution 4.0 aims to improve the competitiveness of each country's industry in the facing a very dynamic global market. But on the other hand is the challenge of the Indonesian people [3]. As stated by Wolter, there are 5 challenges from the Industrial Revolution 4.0, namely: (1) information technology security, (2) reliability and stability of production machinery, (3) lack of adequate skills, (4) no change in policy

determinants, (5) loss of a lot of work because of changing technology automation services [4].

Responding to the challenges of the Digital 4.0, strategic efforts are needed from all components of the nation, in particular, the government, academics and society to improve the quality of Indonesia's human resources to have competitiveness in the Industrial market, including the field of employment in Indonesia.

Employment conditions in Indonesia based on the results of the August 2018 National Labor Force Survey show that the majority of the population working in Indonesia has a lower secondary education with 72,883,221 people (58.77%), 36,018,086 senior high schools (29.05%), while Diploma and Bachelor graduates were 15,103,643 (12.18%). To face globalization competition, development in the field of labor must be directed at the formation and improvement of a professional, independent, high-work, productive and efficient workforce, competitive and strong entrepreneurial spirit.

The quality of labor has a close correlation with the quality of labor protection. Protection of labor is intended to guarantee basic rights of laborer and ensure equality of opportunity and treatment without discrimination on any basis to realize the welfare of laborer and their families while taking into account the progress of the business world. The low quality of labor causes labor to lack understanding and do not even know their rights and obligations as a worker / laborer. The rights of labor include the rights to protect labor norms regulated in Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Labor.

Based on the Minister of Manpower and Transmigration Regulation Number 09 of 2006, it shows that the number of companies violated labor norms as many as 24,163 companies out of 228,062 companies with 8.86 million labor in which 40,981 were foreign labor. The number of companies with 228,062 is classified into small companies with 166,088 companies, medium companies with as many as 44,505 companies, and large companies with 17,469 companies. The Ministry of Manpower distinguishes the classification of the company based on the number of labor in a company. Small companies are companies that employ as many as 25 labor, companies are employing as many as 26-100 people, and large companies employ as many as 100 people.

Company compliance reports that employment conditions in the company are regulated in accordance with Law Number 7 of 1981 concerning Obligatory Employment Report at the Company. Companies that report employment conditions are still low, namely until 2018, only 40.66 percent, while 59.34 percent of companies have not complied with these obligations. Companies that do not pay labor' wages according to the minimum wage of 11.01 percent, and companies that have not compiled company regulations or collective labor agreements amounted to 15.43 percent.

Cases of termination of employment occurred based on data from the Directorate General of Industrial Relations Development and Social Security of Labor, Ministry of Manpower, in 2014 there were 1,887 cases, in 2015 there were 245 cases, in 2016 there were 1,648 cases, in 2017 there were 2,345 cases and year 2018 as many as 2,319 cases, as in the data in Table 1.

TABLE I.
CASES OF STRIKES FOR 2012-2018 YEAR CASE OF LABOR INVOLVED IN LOST BUSINESS HOURS

No	Year	Case	Labor of Involved	Lost Business Hours
1	2014	193	48.212	265.166
2	2015	124	85.406	571.640
3	2016	122	51.626	702.901
4	2017	63	40.029	448.360
5	2018	36	21.027	339.808

Source: Ditjen PHI and JSTK, 2018.

The application of occupational safety and health norms in accordance with Law Number 1 of 1970 concerning Occupational Safety is still low. This was marked in 2018, from the Ministry of Manpower's data, there were 6,585 violations of occupational health and safety norms with the most violations, namely 29.87 percent of companies did not conduct workforce health checks, 27.49 percent of companies had not yet formed an Occupational Safety and Health Advisory Committee and 9.86 percent of the companies have not yet appointed an Occupational Safety and Health Expert.

Based on the description above, this study focused on "Implementation of the Labor Inspection System at the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

In this study, researchers tried to outline and summarize the various theories that have been described by experts related to the implementation of labor inspection policies. The theory described is used as a tool to analyse the implementation of labor inspection policies in West Java Province.

A. Implementation of Labor Inspection Policies

According to Rose in Winarno, policy is an act chosen to direct decision making [5]. Makmur says policy is a form of decision that is binding on certain people [6]. Heglo stated that policy is "a course of action intended to accomplish some end" [7].

Based on the above understanding, policies are all things in the form of decisions or provisions taken by a person or group of people who have authority set forth in the form of guidelines or regulations to regulate and direct the community.

Policy implementation is an important step in the policy process. According to Nugroho "Implementation of policy is a way for a policy to achieve its objectives [8]". H Keviniemi in Purwanto and Sulistyastuti that states "Public policy implementation is a complex process. It often takes years, and it "According to Purwanto and Sulistyastuti, the process of policy implementation began with a set of activities to manage regulations, form organizations, mobilize people, resources, technology, and according to Purwanto and Sulistyastuti [9]. Establish procedures [8], so that policy implementation becomes a bridge or deliver between the world of concepts and reality. Grindle states establish a link that allows goals [9]. According to Purwanto and Sulistyastuti, that "it involves, therefore, the creation of "policy delivery system", which is designed and designed to be expected of arriving at particular ends" [9].

In implementing the policy, it is related to two main factors, namely internal factors and external factors [7]. Effective policy according to Meter and Horn presupposes the implementation of policies running linearly from public policy, implementor, and the performance of public policy [8].

According to Weihrich and Koontz in Aedi said "The managerial function of the control is the measurement and correction of performance in order to make sure that enterprise objectives and plans are designed to be accomplished" [10]. Atmosudirdjo defined supervision as a process to determine what work is carried out, desired, planned and considered [11]. Jumanto and Nasution that supervision is all activities carried out by the manager in an effort to ensure that the actual results are in accordance with the planned results in order to be able to oversee the increase in the existing work productivity of employees [12]. Satori states that supervision is an administrative function to ensure that activities carried out are in accordance with what has been determined or desired [13].

In Law number 14 of 1969, what is meant by labor is each person who is capable of doing work both inside and outside the work relationship to produce services or goods to meet the needs of the community. Agusmidah, states that Labor is anyone who is capable of doing work to produce good goods and / or services to fulfil their daily needs [14]. So employment is all matters relating to labor at the time before, during, and after the work period.

B. Evaluation of the Implementation of Labor Inspection Policies

To analyse the effectiveness of the implementation of labor inspection policies, it can be rejected through evaluation of policy implementation. According to Stufflebeam and Coryn, evaluation of systematic assessment of object's merit, worth, probity, stability, safety, significance, and equity" [15]. Owen writing evaluation is a process of decision making about the value or feasibility of an object that is being reviewed by Provus in Wirawan defines evaluation as a process of program suitability against program standards [16]. Furthermore Weiss

stated that, "program evaluation is a systematic method for collecting, analysing, and using information to answer questions about projects, policies, and programs, particularly about their effectiveness and efficiency" [17]. Dunn defines evaluation as an attempt to determine the benefits or social uses of a policy or program [18].

From these various opinions, it is stated that evaluation is a systematic and planned activity to obtain a clear picture or information about the effectiveness, efficiency, and benefits or uses of a policy, program or project. In this study to analyse the evaluation of the implementation of labor inspection policies in West Java Province, the CIPP model was formulated [8].

Preparation of evaluation criteria is intended as a benchmark for evaluating an object. Criteria are a standard or minimum limit or benchmark for an object being measured. Criteria can also be used to answer and account for the results of evaluations made by the evaluator. The criteria hereinafter referred to as evaluation standards, are presented in the form of a table containing the evaluation component column, evaluated aspects and success evaluation criteria.

TABLE II. CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING LABOR INSPECTION POLICIES

No	Evaluation Stages	Evaluated Aspects
1	<i>Context</i>	The Labor Inspection System has a legal foundation document
		The Labor Inspection System has clear objectives, vision and mission
2.	<i>Input</i>	Activity Planning
		Planning activities.2 Labor Examination Mechanisms
		Graduates of the Employment Supervision Training
		Facilities and infrastructure for labor inspection are adequate
		Budget for labor inspection
3.	<i>Process</i>	Enforcement of labor law
4.	<i>Product</i>	Implementation of effective and efficient labor inspection

In evaluating labor inspection policies in West Java, evaluation aspects and criteria were developed. This criterion was developed based on the characteristics of the implementation of the labor inspection system policy. The approach used in this study is a combination of fidelity approaches and process approaches. The fidelity approach is that evaluation criteria are developed before researchers take to the field to collect data. While the process approach is carried out with the intention of developing evaluation criteria after the researcher is in the field so that the evaluation criteria compiled are closely related to the reality in the field.

III. RESEARCH METHODS

The method used in this research is evaluative descriptive method. The object of the research was focused on the four labor and transmigration offices of West Java Province. Data is collected through observational, documentation studied, and in-depth interview. Data analysis used descriptive evaluative

techniques, through four stages, namely: data collection, data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing/verification.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

After the text edit has been completed, the paper is ready for the template. Duplicate the template file by using the Save As command, and use the naming convention prescribed by your conference for the name of your paper. In this newly created file, highlight all of the contents and import your prepared text file. You are now ready to style your paper; use the scroll down window on the left of the MS Word Formatting toolbar.

A. Research Findings

The results of the study are described in the stages of evaluating context, input, process, and product according to the CIPP evaluation model.

1) *Context evaluation:* To analyze the implementation of labor inspection policies in West Java Province, a context evaluation was carried out, namely the legal basis. The legal basis for labor inspection in West Java Province in terms of the division of concurrent government functions between the central government and the provincial and regency/city regions is Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. Based on the answer to the questionnaire that the researchers randomly distributed to 44 employees in the supervisory field there were 47.73 percent stating that it was not appropriate that the labor inspection system referred to Law Number 23 of 2003 concerning Regional Government and 52.27 percent stated that it was appropriate, meaning the system labor inspection does not refer to Law Number 23 of 2003 concerning Regional Government (Labor Inspectors in the Province).

From the respondent's answers above, it shows that the legal basis for labor inspection still needs to be socialized to labor inspectors, because there are still 47.73 percent of the answers that do not refer to Law Number 23 of 2003 concerning Regional Government (Labor Inspectors in the Province).

The labor inspection system in West Java Province has a clear purpose, vision and mission, this is indicated by the respondent's answer of 64.77 percent stating agree, and 27.27 percent states strongly agree that the labor inspection system in West Java Province has a purpose, clear vision and mission. While 6.82 percent answered that they did not agree that the labor inspection system had clear goals, vision and mission.

From the respondent's answers above, it shows that the objectives, vision and mission of the labor inspection system still need to be socialized to labor inspectors, because there are still 6.82 percent of the respondents who do not agree that the labor inspection system has clear objectives, vision and mission.

2) *Inputs evaluation:* The aspects evaluated are related to input, namely planning activities, work mechanisms for labor inspection, graduates of labor inspection training, facilities and infrastructure for labor inspection, and operational budget for

labor inspection. In terms of planning activities, the Office of Manpower and Transmigration of the Province of West Java has the right strategy for planning activities (goals, schedules, objectives and budget). This is shown from the answers of 44 questionnaires that returned to the researchers, amounting to 55.69 percent agreeing, and as much as 33.70 percent stated strongly agree that the planning of labor inspection system activities at the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province had an activity planning strategy (goal, the right schedule, target, and budget). Whereas there are still 12.13 percent, answering that they do not agree that the planning of labor inspection system activities at the Department of Manpower and Transmigration of West Java Province has the right strategy for planning activities (goals, schedules, objectives and budget).

In terms of the work mechanism of labor inspection, the answers to 44 questionnaires returned to the researchers, 49.67 percent answered agree, and 29.88 percent strongly agreed that there were operational standards for labor inspection work procedures at the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province. Whereas there were 20.45 percent who answered that they did not agree to the availability of operational standards for labor inspection work procedures at the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province.

It was viewed related to graduates of labor inspection training, amounting to 37.73 percent of respondents agreeing and 25.45 percent strongly agreed that all graduates of education and training in Labor Inspection were given assignments and functional and structural positions of labor inspection. Whereas 35.68 percent of respondents disagree that all graduates of education and training in labor inspection are given functional duties and structural positions in labor inspection.

Viewed from the side of facilities and infrastructure labor inspection is adequate, the answers of 44 questionnaires that returned to the researcher recorded 63.64 percent of respondents strongly agreed and as much as 31.36 percent of respondents agreed there must be availability of facilities and infrastructure that support the implementation of labor inspection both at the center and area. While for 4.55 percent of respondents who disagree with the availability of facilities and infrastructure that support the implementation of labor inspection both at the central and regional levels.

In terms of the operational budget of labor inspection, the answers to 44 questionnaires that returned to the researcher recorded 54.57 percent of respondents stated the availability of budgetary costs.

3) Process evaluation: The evaluated aspect is related to the process, namely the enforcement of labor law. Enforcement of labor law includes the process of fostering labor norms, examining labor norms both first, periodically, repeatedly, and specifically, testing technical objects / occupational safety and health equipment, investigating labor crime, and reporting individuals and work units.

The process of guiding labor norms in West Java Province as the answer data from 44 respondents amounted to 52.27 percent answered agreed, and as much as 23.86 percent strongly agreed, meaning that it had been carried out according to the procedure. Whereas 21.59 percent answered disagree, meaning that the development of labor norms in West Java Province had not been implemented according to the procedure. Thus the function, the benefits of labor norms development still need to be socialized to labor inspectors, because there are still 21.59 percent of respondents who do not agree that labor norms development in West Java Province is carried out according to procedures.

In terms of the process of examining labor norms both first, periodically, again, and specifically in West Java Province, it is seen that 56.81 percent of respondents answered the process of inspection of labor norms both first, periodically, repeated, and specifically carried out according to the procedure. 37.8 percent answered that sometimes the first, periodic, repeated, and special labor inspection process was carried out according to the procedure. Whereas the other 21.59 percent answered that the inspection process for labor norms had never been done first, periodically, repeated, and specifically carried out according to the procedure. This shows that the procedures for the inspection of labor norms are either first, periodic, repeated, and specifically socialized to labor inspectors, because there are still 21.59 percent of the answers that have never been inspected for labor norms first, periodically, repeated and specifically according to procedure.

The process of testing technical objects / occupational safety and health equipment in West Java Province is carried out according to the procedure. This is shown from the data of 44 respondents' answers received by researchers, that as much as 59.09 percent of respondents answered agree and amounted to 35.23 percent answered strongly agree with the process of testing technical objects / safety and health equipment work in West Java Province carried out according to the procedure. Whereas the other 2.27 percent answered disagreeing, meaning that the process of testing technical objects / occupational safety and health equipment in West Java Province was not carried out according to the procedure. As such, it still needs to be disseminated to labor inspection supervisors in West Java Province regarding the process of testing technical objects / occupational safety and health equipment, because there are still 2.27 percent of respondents who do not agree that the process of testing technical objects / safety and health equipment works in the Province West Java is not carried out according to the procedure.

Judging from the side of the investigation process employment crimes have been carried out according to the procedure, shown from the data of 44 respondents' answers received by researchers, 50.00 percent of respondents answered that it was appropriate and amounted to 47.73 percent that the investigation into labor criminal acts was carried out according to the procedure. Whereas the other 2.27 percent answered incorrectly, the meaning still needed to be disseminated to Civil Servant Investigators in West Java Province.

Regarding the reporting process, both individual and work unit reports have been prepared according to the procedure.

This is indicated by data from 44 respondents' answers received by researchers, amounting to 45.45 percent of respondents answered very according to the procedure, and 40.34 percent of respondents answered according to the procedure. Whereas the other 14.77 percent answered that it was not in accordance with the individual reporting process or work unit compiled with reporting procedures. Thus it still needs to be socialized to labor inspectors and the administration of labor inspection administration in West Java Province in relation to the labor inspection reporting process.

4) Product evaluation: The aspects that are evaluated are related to product, namely labor inspection implementation. Manpower supervision is carried out including increasing the understanding and adherence of employers and workers to labor legislation, the implementation of memorandum of inspection and testing in accordance with the time set by the company, and the implementation of minutes of investigation of labor crimes in accordance with the time set by the company.

In terms of increasing the understanding and adherence of employers and workers to labor legislation, 77.98 percent of respondents agreed and 17.32 percent stated strongly agree that employers and workers have increased their understanding and adherence to labor laws. While there is still 7.09 percent.

TABLE III. RECAPITULATION OF SCORES ON IMPLEMENTATION OF LABOR INSPECTION POLICIES

No	Aspect	Score					
		R		M		T	
		Value	(%)	Value	(%)	Value	(%)
1	Context	27.27	40.11	56.25	25.97	22.73	18.85
2	Input	25.48	37.47	40.65	18.77	33.86	28.09
3	Process	9.09	13.37	47.46	21.92	42.27	35.07
4	Product	6.15	9.05	72.20	33.34	21.68	17.99
Total CIPP		67.99		216.57		120.54	
Average		16.78		53.46		29.76	
(%)		16.78		53.46		29.76	

Based on the table above, it can be stated that the evaluation of the implementation of labor inspection policies in West Java Province is considered quite effective. This can be seen from the answer with the value of the respondent's statement score of 53.46 percent stating that it is quite effective and 29.76 percent states it is very effective, but there are still 16.78 percent judging ineffective.

B. Discussion of Research Results

Based on the results of the evaluation as described previously and has provided an overview of the implementation of labor inspection system policies based on context, inputs, processes, and products.

The legal basis for government administration in the field of labor inspection in Indonesia is Law Number 23 Year 2014

concerning Regional Government. Some of the reasons for the informants were that labor inspection was withdrawn to the province, namely in order to improve the performance of labor inspectors, reduce the intervention of regional leaders (Regents / Mayors) towards the implementation of labor inspection, reduce transfer / transfer of supervisors from the labor inspection unit. However, all informants stated that the implementation had not yet proceeded properly, because it was still in transition.

The above data is confirmed by the statement of the Head of the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province that the objectives, vision and mission of the labor inspection system in West Java Province support the vision and mission of the West Java Province Manpower and Transmigration Office in the 2014-2019 Strategic Plan. The vision of the Office of Manpower and Transmigration of West Java Province is "Realization of Advanced and Prosperous Labor and Transmigrants". The mission of the Manpower and Transmigration Office of West Java Province is a) to improve the quality and productivity of the workforce, b) to increase facilitation of the placement and expansion of employment opportunities, c) to increase the development of industrial relations and labor inspection, d) to improve the transmigration and independence of transmigrants.

Labor inspection is carried out by independent labor inspectors who have competence and legitimacy. In carrying out the duties of labor inspection, labor inspectors must continue to uphold the honor and code of ethics of the labor inspection profession. The labor inspector is appointed by the Minister or appointed official. The activities in the form of socialization are carried out through various opportunities and socialization media so that the industrial community can know and understand labor norms so that they are expected to be able to implement the laws and regulations in the workplace.

Examination, testing or advisory is carried out based on a predetermined work plan, the Labor Inspector must make a field visit to the company or workplace.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings of research on the implementation of labor inspection policies in West Java Province, the following conclusions can be formulated:

- Implementation of labor inspection policies in terms of aspects related to the legal basis covering legal basis documents, objectives, vision and mission declared to be quite effective. This is seen from the tendency of the respondents' answers as much as 56.25 percent to be effective and 22.73 percent to say it is very effective towards the implementation of labor inspection policies.
- Implementation of labor inspection policies in terms of input aspects related to planning activities, work mechanisms for labor inspection, graduates in labor inspection training, facilities and infrastructure for labor inspection, and operational budget for labor inspection are declared effective. This is seen from the tendency of respondents' answers as much as 40.65 percent to be effective and 33.86 percent stated that it was very

effective towards the implementation of labor inspection policies.

- The implementation of labor inspection policies seen from the aspect of the process related to the enforcement of labor law includes the process of fostering labor norms, examining labor norms both first, periodically, repeatedly and specifically, testing technical objects / occupational safety and health equipment, investigating labor crimes, and reporting individuals and work units declared effective. This can be seen from the tendency of the respondents' answers as much as 47.46 percent to say that it was effective and 42.27 percent stated that it was very effective towards the implementation of labor inspection policies.
- Implementation of labor inspection policies seen from the product aspect related to the implementation of labor inspection includes increasing the understanding and adherence of employers and labor to labor legislation, the implementation of memorandum of inspection and testing in accordance with the time set by the company, and the implementation of minutes of investigation into labor the time set by the company is declared effective. This is seen from the tendency of respondents' answers as much as 72.20 percent stating effective and 21.68 percent stated that it was very effective towards the implementation of labor inspection policies.

VI. LIMITATION AND FUTURE RESEARCH

The limitations of this study are the methods and data sources. The method used only relies on descriptive evaluative, not evaluating as a whole, so the data sources used are only limited to key informants who are involved in labor inspection, do not dig deeper information from experts and experts. So that further research can improve this research.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The researcher would like to thank the leaders and staff of the Employment Agency in West Java Province of who had helped in the completion of this research.

REFERENCES

- [1] B. Lavanya, B.S. Shylaja, and M.S. Santhosh, "Industry 4.0," The Fourth Industrial Revolution International Journal of Science, Engineering and Technology Research (IJSETR), vol. 6, no. 6, 2017.
- [2] M. Liffler and A. Tschiesner, The Internet of Things and the Future of Manufacturing. McKinsey & Company, 2013.
- [3] H. Prasetyo dan W. Sutopo, "Industri 4.0 Telaah Klasifikasi Aspek dan arah perkembangan Riset," J@ti Undip: Jurnal Teknik Industri, vol. 13, no. 1, 2018.
- [4] Y. Muhammad, Era Industri 4.0: Tantangan dan Peluang Perkembangan Pendidikan Kejuruan Indonesia, 2018.
- [5] B. Winarno, Kebijakan Publik Era Globalisasi. Yogyakarta: CAPS (Center of Academic Publishing Service, 2016.
- [6] Makmur, Efektivitas Kebijakan Kelembagaan Pengawasan. Bandung: PT. Rafika Aditama, 20115.
- [7] S.Z. Abidin, Kebijakan Publik, Edisi Kedua. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika, 2012.
- [8] R. Nugroho, Public Policy; Teori, Manajemen, Dinamika, Analisis, Konvergensi, dan Kimia Kebijakan (Kelima). Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo, 2014.
- [9] E.A. Purwanto and D.R. Sulistyastuti, Implementasi Kebijakan Publik: Konsep dan Aplikasinya di Indonesia. Yogyakarta: Gava Media, 2015.
- [10] N. Aedi, Pengawasan Pendidikan: Tinjauan Teori dan Praktik. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2014.
- [11] S. Murhaini, Manajemen Pengawasan Pemerintah. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2014.
- [12] Jumanto and A.P. Nasution, "Pengaruh Keselamatan Dan Kesehatan Kerja Terhadap Produktivitas Karyawan Bagian Seksi Cutting Crimping Di Pt . Sumitomo Wiring Systems Batam Indonesia," Jurnal BENING Prodi Manajemen Universitas Riau Kepulauan Batam, vol. 4, no. (2), pp. 1–21, 2017.
- [13] D. Satori, Pengawasan dan Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2016.
- [14] Agusmidah, Hukum ketenagakerjaan Indonesia: dinamika dan kajian teori. Ghalia Indonesia, 2010.
- [15] D.L. Stufflebeam and C.L.S. Coryn, Evaluation Theory, Models, and Application. San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons Inc, 2014.
- [16] Wirawan, Evaluasi Teori, Model, Metodologi, Standar, Aplikasi, dan Profesi. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2016.
- [17] Sugiyono, Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif & RnD. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2013.
- [18] W.N. Dunn, Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik, edisi II. Yogyakarta: Gadjahmada University Press, 2003.