

The Difference of Human Resource Management Textbook Between Western and Islamic Perspective

Wisber Wiryanto

National Institute of Public Administration
Jakarta, Indonesia
wisberwiryanto@yahoo.com

Abstract—The discipline of science today is influenced by the Western with secularism, liberalism, pluralism, and secularism. It is found in human resource management (HRM) disciplines that are empty of the values of revelation and cause problems. So that, a problem solving is needed with a solution through the Islamization of knowledge. The research used a qualitative method of literature study. The object of this research is Islamization of knowledge; while this subject, HRM textbooks are used in higher education institutions in Indonesia. Data collection is done through identification of categories from the HRM textbook in this study. Then, data analysis is done to find out the differences between HRM Western and Islamic legacy. The result of this research shows, there is a different concept between HRM Western and Islamic perspective from the HRM concept until pension categories. Problem-solving for these differences needs to be done through the Islamization of HRM, by arranging HRM textbook in Islamic perspective. The stakeholders in higher education institutions in Indonesia have to solve the secularism of science by applying the Islamization of knowledge.

I. INTRODUCTION

According to Al-Attas, today's science is influenced by the Western with secularism [1]. This can be seen in educational institutions currently facing problems caused by the secularization of science [2] Educational institutions currently face problems caused by the secularization of science. As an impact, the secularization of science is the colonization of other nations. Furthermore, countries with the full ideology based on Islam, it has been a Western colony, such as Malaysia and Indonesia [3]. Another impact, in a predominantly Muslim country, but the field of education imitates the secular Western, so Islamic education is not progressing [4]. The lack of the concept of Islamic education is also caused by, among others, the absence of relevant textbooks [5] so that more use of textbooks published abroad. Books published abroad is not necessarily in accordance with the conditions of the people of Indonesia [6]. Why is that? Because Western textbooks are not neutral so that the values of secularism are entered. Thus, the

cause of such educational problems is the secularization of science.

The problem of the secularization of science is influenced by the Western worldview which is full of secularism, liberalism, and pluralism. Secularism is the notion that separates the relationship of human activity with religious values, thus giving rise to the educational dichotomy that is the separation of science and religion. While pluralism is the notion that teaches that all religions are the same, and all religious followers will enter and live side by side in heaven [7]. As for liberalism, it is a notion that teaches freedom to do without being bound by the rules of revelation [8].

Furthermore, the notion has added the next problem that is Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Trans-Gender (LGBT) in college. The inclusion of LGBT on the campus of the University of Indonesia has made the case as reported by print and electronic media in 2016.

In order to overcome the problem of secularism of science, among Islamic intellectuals seeks to advance Islamic education through the idea of Islamization of knowledge. This idea consists of 5 (five) approaches, including instrumentalist, justification, sacralization, integration and Islamic paradigm [9]. This study chose an approach that is the integration approach initiated by al-Faruqi. The Islamization of knowledge aims to direct the flow of Islamic thought toward the attainment of the pattern of God's plan [10].

What is the relevance of the goal of Islamization of knowledge with the objectives of education in Indonesia? According to Article 31 of the 1945 Constitution paragraph (3), the government arranged a national education system regulated by law. Furthermore, Article 33 of Law no. 20/2003, states the purpose of national education, among others, for the development of potential learners to become human beings who morals, believe and taqwa to God Almighty [11]. Based on the above description, the purpose of Islamization of such knowledge; in line with the purpose of education in Indonesia to develop the potential of learners to become human beings who morals, believe and taqwa to God Almighty.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The problem of the secularization of science can be found in one of the disciplines of science that is management discipline. Some management experts highlight the problem of different concepts of Western management and Islamic treasures. Foreign cultures may be adopted according to Islam. An organization will be healthy if it is developed with a healthy value such as the value of sincerity sourced from religion; while in conventional management this value does not exist [12].

Comparison between conventional management and sharia management shows differences in the various categories. The category of difference between material-oriented conventional management and the life of the world; and Islamic management sourced to the Qur'an. These differences, among others: (1) the purpose of human existence in organizational management; (2) the purpose of the organization; (3) organizational management guidance paradigm; (4) the nature and purpose of the organization; (5) sources of ethics and values governing organizational management; (6) human motives work; (7) work motivation; (8) the concept of time and work planning; (9) the concept of natural resources; and (10) organizational oversight; (11) locus of supervision; and (12) responsibility and accountability [13]. There are differences in management thinking in Islam because it comes from the Quranic texts and Sunnah guidance, whereas conventional management, is value-free and only oriented toward the achievement of mundane benefits [14]. Furthermore, conventional management has an impact. Management developed by the Western and contains Western values and understandings. Western civilization has made a dichotomy between science and religion. Whereas in the worldview of Islam, religion and science are both related and complementary. Western management taught in college and practiced, has caused physical impacts such as environmental damage, global warming, poverty, and psychological such as greed, greed, stress, and others [15]. Therefore, it is necessary to conduct research on differences in HRM between the Western and Islamic perspectives.

The problems of different concepts of Western management and Islamic legacy as described above, These problems among others: (1) the differences of Western management and Islamic legacy, including the differences in HRM that lead to the conflict between them. (2) The existence of mismanagement that many encountered so far because the management is based only by the human mind is not spared from mistakes because it is not guided by revelations that provide guidelines for the happiness of life in the world and in the hereafter. Therefore, is urgent the

need to find a solution through Islamization of knowledge.

The formulation of this research problem is, how the different categories of HRM between Western and Islamic legacy? While the purpose of this study is to determine the differences HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives in any categories. The result of this research is used to know the existence of different categories of HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives, so that can do Islamization of textbook of HRM in college, which useful for student and lecturer as reference in teaching learning process in college; and as a contribution to the development of Islamic education science.

III. METHODS

This research using descriptive qualitative research and literature study approach or documentary study. This study chose the object of research the Islamization of HRM. The subject of this research is the HRM textbook used in the college are relevant to "Human Resource Management." The textbook used is 15 (fifteen) textbooks of HRM collected as sampling. These books were written by scholars working as lecturers, published between 2001 and 2014, and have been used as human resource management textbooks at universities in Indonesia until now.

The technique of collecting data through library research and library surveys [16]. Assuming the textbooks used today are mostly secular. The data collected in the form of theories of management of Western and Islamic perspectives. The results of data collection are outlined in the HRM category; the study of HRM theory both Western and Islamic perspectives; as well as mapping of HRM issues.

The data sources of teaching HRM books that were studied are 15 (fifteen) books as follows: [17]; [18]; [19]; [20]; [21]; [22]; [23]; [24]; [25]; [26]; [27]; [28]; [29]; [30]; [31].

Furthermore, an analysis data using content analysis of the difference HRM between Western theory and Islamic legacy, by consultation and referring to the Al-Qur'an and Hadith. Analysis data is doing to looking for the difference HRM between shariah and Western-conventional system, and the solution to solve the difference [32].

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This research used the human resource management textbook data source. The profile of the textbook of HRM can be distinguished on the source/basis of the material using the Western worldview approach; Islamic worldview; or a mixture of Western worldview and Islamic worldview.

The HRM textbook profiles are examined as follows: (1) all HRM books researched are sourced/ base of foreign/ Western book material (up to 100%); (2) HRM textbooks studied based on local books (Indonesia) reached 93%; on the contrary not local book-based (Indonesia) only reached 7%; (3) HRM book based on Al-Qur'an and Hadith reach 33%; on the contrary that is not based on Al-Qur'an and Hadith as much as 67%. (4) Books of HRM based on Islamic legacy reached 33%; on the contrary, that is not based on Islamic characteristic reaches 67%. Thus the textbook of HRM used in universities today is generally secular means it is not associated with religious values.

Furthermore, the study of Western HRM theory on the one hand and the Islamic HRM theory on the other hand. The study of Western HRM theory, through the searching of themes, principles, and methods of each category of Western HRM found theories, principles, and methods in the teaching of Western secular HRM that conflict with revelation as the source of knowledge because the discipline of HRM of Western is empty of Islamic values.

Meanwhile, Islamic legacy related to HRM is done by tracing the themes, principles, and methods of Islamic repertoire associated with the category of HRM. The category of HRM is traced to theories, principles, and methods relevant to Islamic HRM whose sources are sourced to the Qur'an and Hadith as a source of knowledge. The themes, principles, and methods of Islamic HRM are further elaborated into each category of HRM. HRM review of Islamic legacy is used as a comparison of the study of Western HRM theory. Based on these comparisons, also found differences in HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives, in addition to the similarities.

Analysis of differences in HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives is done through the analysis of different categories of HRM of Western and Islamic perspectives. The process of analyzing differences in the HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives is done to determine the extent to which there are differences.

The material of the Western HRM contains secular values so that the existing material contains only worldly affairs and does not contain ukhrawi affairs based on the al-Qur'an and Hadith. In other words, Western HRM uses a secular, rational but empty approach of revelation. While the material of HRM non-secular or Islamic legacy using Islamic worldview approach so that the existing material contains both worldly and ukhrawi affairs based on al-Qur'an and Hadith. Islamic HRM employs empirical-rational approach and Islamic worldview. Islamic worldview is a perspective based on revelation to

obtain salvation for the life of the world and the hereafter.

Thus, there is a difference HRM between Western and Islamic perspectives. Based on the data source of textbooks of HRM discussed can be found the differences between the theory of HRM Western worldview and Islamic HRM theory worldview, ranging from the concept of HR to retirement/ pension of employees as the categories of HRM described below.

First, the HR Concept: The theory of Western HRM prioritizes material values to achieve organizational goals. Conversely, the theory of HRM Islamic legacy declares HR as God's creation then the action and the end goal must be according to the command of Allah SWT. Second, HRM Concept: The theory of Western HRM prioritizes the activities of designing a formal system that ensures the efficient use of HR, effective for achieving organizational plans and objectives. Conversely, the Islamic HRM theory of Islamic legacy prioritizes activities associated with the purpose of human life, no secular and religious separation, the ultimate goal to be achieved according to the command of Allah SWT.

Third, HR Planning: In the theory of Western HRM prioritizes the alignment of HR activities and organizational goals efficiently. While in the Islamic HRM theory of Islamic legacy, an activity is done by looking at the consequences if the results continue, if bad end. Fourth, Employee Procurement: In the theory of Western HRM declared hiring minority groups to give an advantage, sometimes the best candidate comes from the minority lesbian and gay. Conversely, the theory of HRM Islamic legacy more attention to the ability, strength and trustworthy, means the fear of God.

Fifth, Work Motivation: Theory of HRM Western states work motivation related to the fulfillment of human needs include physiology, safety, affiliation, esteem, and self-actualization needs. Conversely, in the theory of HRM Islamic legacy declared work motivation derived from the satisfaction obtained by devoting to Allah SWT and faith to the life of the end. Sixth, Compensation: Salary and Wages. The Western HRM theory declares compensation as an exchange of employee relationships with awards provided by the organization. While the theory of HRM Islamic legacy states the determination of salary in a fair and decent attention to the internal/ external conditions of food and board clothing.

Seventh, Culture and Work Ethics: The theory of Western HRM states changes in individual and organizational behavior adapted to today's environment. Conversely, the Islamic HRM theory of Islamic legacy prioritizes discipline culture, honesty, willingness to learn, giving the best, congregation

refers to Islamic values. Eighth, Leadership: Theory of Western HRM prioritizes the process of influencing group activities in the context of achieving the objectives of a material organization alone. Conversely, the theory of HRM Islamic legacy put Rasulullah as the good model of a leader in family, community, soldiers, and organizations engaged in economic, social and political. Not seeking power from parties with different *aqidah*.

Ninth, Supervision/ HR audit. The theory of Western HRM states that supervision is inherent through the organizational system to ensure accountability and accountability. In contrast, the Islamic HRM theory asserted that organizational oversight must operate in a manner that is designed so that humans become subject to the will of Allah SWT. Finally, tenth, Retirement/ pension: Theory of Western HRM states the breakup of relationships for reasons of efficient use of technology, loss of ability, dissatisfaction, and retirement age. Instead, the Islamic HRM theory of Islamic legacy declares dismissal due to lost capability and integrity or behavioral reasons.

Based on the analysis of these differences, it is known there are differences in the management of Western HRM and Islamic legacy ranging from the concept of HR to retirement. Therefore, a better implementation of HRM is needed based on the concept and theory of Islamic HRM.

V. CONCLUSION

There are differences in the management of Western HRM and Islamic legacy ranging from the concept of HRM to retirement/ pension. Therefore, a better implementation of HRM is needed based on the concept and theory of Islamic HRM. Problem-solving for these differences needs to be done through the Islamization of HRM, by arranging HRM textbook in Islamic perspective. The stakeholders in higher education institutions in Indonesia have to solve the secularism of science by applying the Islamization of knowledge.

VI. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The previous version of this article entitled "Perbedaan Buku Ajar Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perspektif Barat dan Khasanah Islam" was presented in the national seminar "Membangun Budaya Literasi Pendidikan & Bimbingan dan Konseling dalam Mempersiapkan Generasi Emas", Pusat Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling Islam & Magister Pendidikan Agama Islam, Universitas Ibn Khaldun Bogor, UIKA Press, March 6, 2018.

REFERENCES

- [1] Al-Attas. SMN in Daud, WMNW 2013 *Islamisasi Ilmu-Ilmu Kontemporer dan Peran Universitas Islam* (Bogor: Universitas Ibn Khaldun Bogor & Centre for Advanced Studies on Islam, Science and Civilisation Universiti Teknologi Malaysia) p 34
- [2] Nata, A 2012 *Kapita Selekta: Isu-Isu Kontemporer tentang Pendidikan Islam* (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers) p 1
- [3] Nata, A 2008 *Metodologi Studi Islam*, (Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada) Revision Ed. 12, p 405
- [4] Karim, MR in Syafri, UA 2012 *Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Al-Qur'an*. (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers) pp 5-6
- [5] Tafsir, A 2012 *Ilmu Pendidikan Islami* (Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya) p 70
- [6] Rosyadi, AR 2008 *Menjadi Penulis Profesional itu mudah*. (Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia) p 8
- [7] *Indonesia, Majelis Ulama (MUI) 2005. Fatwa MUI Nomor 7/Munas VII/MUI/11/2005 tentang Pluralisme, Liberalisme dan Sekularisme Agama, Jakarta*
- [8] Husaini, A 2009 *Virus Liberalisme di Perguruan Tinggi Islam* (Jakarta: Gema Insani) p 17
- [9] Handrianto, B 2010 *Islamisasi Sains Sains: Sebuah Upaya Mengislamkan Sains Barat Modern* (Jakarta: Al-Kautsar) p 258
- [10] Al-Faruqi, IR 1984 *Islamisasi Pengetahuan translator: Anas Mahyuddin, from title: Islamization of Knowledge: General Principles and Workplan* (Bandung: Penerbit Pustaka) p 98
- [11] Tafsir. A 2012 *Ilmu Pendidikan Islam* (Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya) p 77
- [12] Hafidhuddin, D & Tanjung, H 2003. *Manajemen Syariah dalam Praktik* (Jakarta: Gema Insani) pp 30, 64-65
- [13] Kazmi in Ahmad, K 2007 *Management from Islamic Perspective: Principles & Practices*. (International Islamic University Malaysia), pp 58-59
- [14] Sinn. AIA 2012 *Manajemen Syariah; Sebuah Kajian Historis dan Kontemporer, translator: Dimyauiddin, from title: al-Idarah fi al-Islam* (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers) p 28
- [15] Mas'ud, F 2015 *Menggugat Manajemen Barat: Mengungkap Pandangan Dunia yang tersembunyi yang menjadi dasar konsep, teori dan praktek manajemen Barat* (Semarang: Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro) p x
- [16] Bagader, Abubaker A. (Ed.) 1985. *Islamisasi Ilmu-ilmu Sosial, translator: Muchar Effendi Harahap, et al., from title: Islam and Sociological Perspectives*, (Yogyakarta: PLP2M) Cet. 1, p 17

- [17] Hasibuan S 2001 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Pendekatan Non Sekuler* (Surakarta: Muhammadiyah University Press)
- [18] Meldona 2009 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perspektif Integratif* (Malang: UIN Malang Press)
- [19] Jusmaliani 2011 *Pengelolaan Sumber Daya Insani* (Jakarta: Bumi Aksara)
- [20] Hanggraeni, D 2012 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Jakarta: Lembaga Penerbit Fakultas Ekonomi UI)
- [21] Yani, M, 2012 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media)
- [22] Marwansyah 2012 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. (Bandung: Alfabeta).
- [23] Kaswan 2012 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia untuk Keunggulan Bersaing Organisasi* (Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu).
- [24] Riani, AL 2013 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Masa Kini* (Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu)
- [25] Sutrisno, E 2014 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group)
- [26] Iswanto, Y & Yusuf, A 2014 *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Tangerang Selatan: Penerbit Universitas Terbuka)
- [27] Ardana, IK et.al 2012 *Manajemen Sumberdaya Manusia* (Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu)
- [28] Sedarmayanti *Manajemen SDM Reformasi Birokrasi dan Manajemen PNS* (Bandung: PT Refika Aditama)
- [29] Thoha. M 2014. *Manajemen Kepegawaian Sipil Indonesia* (Jakarta: Prenadanedia Group)
- [30] Bachrun, S 2014 *Buku Induk Manajemen SDM- Human Capital Syariah* (Jakarta: LAZIS Dewan Dakwah)
- [31] Fahmi, A et.al 2014 *HRD Syariah Teori dan Implementasi*. (Jakarta: PT Gramedia)
- [32] Tanjung, H & Devi A 2013 *Metodologi Penelitian Ekonomi Islam* (Jakarta: Gramata Publishing) pp 63-64