

Community Participation in Sustainable Coastal Tourism Management (Case Study of Kuta, Kedonganan, and Jimbaran, Badung)

Ni Nyoman Triyuni
Tourism Department
Politeknik Negeri Bali
 Denpasar, Indonesia
 triyuni@pnb.ac.id

I Ketut Astawa
Tourism Department
Politeknik Negeri Bali
 Denpasar, Indonesia
 ketutastawa@pnb.ac.id

I Ketut Utama
Tourism Department
Politeknik Negeri Bali
 Denpasar, Indonesia
 ketututama@pnb.ac.id

Anak Agung Putri Suardani
Accounting Department
Politeknik Negeri Bali
 Denpasar, Indonesia
 agungputrisuardani@pnb.ac.id

Abstract—Sustainable tourism is the main goal of tourism development in the world, including in Bali. Bali tourist destinations have various types of tourist attractions, one of which is coastal tourism. The purpose of this research is to analyze the forms of community participation and coastal tourism management models. This research uses descriptive qualitative research, through grounded. This research was conducted in 3 locations (Kuta, Kedonganan, and Jimbaran). Data collection techniques are carried out by direct observation, questionnaires, interviews, literature review and documentation. Interviews were conducted in a semi-structured manner using interview guides to key informants from business managers and community leaders. The sampling technique used is disproportional purposive sampling. The sample is determined by 3 percent of the population with the consideration that business managers understand their business, understand the problem and can provide accurate information. The number of samples is 36 business managers and 6 community leaders. Data analysis is carried out with a qualitative descriptive technique, which is an analytical one to describe a phenomenon and explain the relationship. The results reveal that the level of community participation belongs to the category of interactive participation. Most of the business management community (72 percent) participated in coastal management activities starting from planning, implementing, monitoring and enjoying the income resulted in business activities. The decision is locally managed by groups and groups determining how to manage existing resources so that the group has the power to maintain business continuity. Community participation is seen from the perspective of stairs, participation is at the level of delegated power. The initiations related to coastal management have come from the community to carry out planning, implementation, operation, responsibility, and maintenance by requesting assistance from related parties such as the government through grants and the private sector through hygiene and contributions in the form of funds. The management of the Kedonganan coastal area is currently carried out by the government (state) meanwhile at Jimbaran and Kuta by the local and joint management of the government, community and private sector. Future research should be carried out related to enhance the ideal model of managing the coastal business activity for the sake of the local community's well-being.

Keywords—community participation, coastal areas, sustainable coastal tourism

I. INTRODUCTION

Tourism as a global phenomenon has become a basic necessity involving hundreds of millions of people. As a basic need, it is appropriate for a tour to be part of human rights, which must be respected and protected. This ultimately led to various international organizations such as the United Nations, the World Bank and the World Tourism Organization (WTO), recognizing that tourism is an integral part of human life, especially concerning social and economic activities.

Tourism is a particular attraction in increasing regional income, where the development of the tourism sector must be considered logically and realistically. Tourism is one of the development sectors that continues to be developed both by central and regional governments. This is because tourism plays an important role in Indonesia's development, especially as a regional income generator.

The role of tourism for Bali in development shows an increasing trend from year to year. The tourism contributes to Bali Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP), the percentage distribution of Bali Province GRDP based on current prices from providing accommodation and meals to drinking shows a noticeable increase. In 2015, GRDP from tourism amounted to 23 %, 2016 decreased slightly to 22.7 %, then increased again to 23.3 % in 2017 [1]. Tourist attractions by relying on the beauty of nature and cultural richness can develop rapidly and the benefits are greatly felt by the local community because it contributes to the provision of new livelihoods [2],[3], [4].

One field of business that provides employment is a coastal tourism business which is one part of the water tourism business services. Water tourism services business is a business that organizes tourism and water sports, including the provision of facilities and infrastructure and other services that are managed commercially in seawater, coastal, rivers, lakes, and reservoirs. Water tourism facilities include

activities for providing recreational tourism services underwater; on the beach in seawater, rivers, lakes, and reservoirs, and other services related to marina activities [5].

Badung Regency is one of the Regencies which is famous for its hectic tourism activities. The competitive position of tourist attraction in the coastal area of Badung Regency based on tourist attractions, as much as 52.84 % has the potential of surfing tourism attractions; 11.75 % diving; 17.65 % fishing; and 5.88 % for water sports. Based on tourist attraction, 23.53 % has the potential of coral reefs, 5.88 % of the potential sunrise spot; 52.94 % sunset spot; 58.82 % have white sand; 17.65 % has a cliff wall, and 29.41 % have a sacred area. Based on the type of tourism, 47.06 % has the potential for cultural tourism and the overall object has natural tourism potential [6].

This research was initially based on the fact that businesses related to tourism activities on the coastal of Kuta, Kedonganan, and Jimbaran certainly have different characteristics due to the location, attractiveness, and superiority of the products provided to satisfy tourists' tastes with different characteristics. Business activities on the coastal of Kuta are divided into 20 business zones, starting from the north coast side which borders Legian beach in front of The Stone Kuta hotel, to the south side of the beach in front of the Patra Jasa Kuta hotel. Kuta beach tourism is managed by the management of Kuta Beach Tourism Management Agency managing 68 business managers with a total of 1,168 business people.

Business activities on the coastal of Kedonganan are divided into 4 business zones. Zone 1 is located along the coastal next to Segara Temple to the south to the Jimbaran beach boundary. Zone 2 is located in the middle area with a distribution of 24 cafes to 6 Banjar (1,250 families). Zone 3 is located on the north side (KUD) with Furama Café boundary to the north, and zone 4 located offshore (bay waters). Broadly speaking, the coastal area of Kedonganan is divided into 3 domains, namely: economy (café and other tourism activities), socio-cultural (melasti places - traditional and religious ceremonies) and green environment (coastal, waste management and parking location). Kedonganan coastal tourism is managed by the management of the Kedonganan Coastal Tourism Zone Management Agency (BPKP2K).

Business activities on the coastal of Jimbaran are divided into 2 business zones. Zonal 1 is the café on the north side as many as nine cafes and zone 2 is the café designation on the south side as many as 19 cafes which are managed by the management of the café business from the local community under the coordination of the customary village.

The coastal tourist attraction that supports the hectic activity in Badung Regency is Kuta, Kedonganan and, Jimbaran with locations not far from Ngurah Rai International Airport, about 5 km and 10 minutes driving. Kuta is an international customary village, which is known as one of the most famous tourist destinations in the world with its white sandy beaches, good sea waves for surfing and beautiful sunsets have attracted tourists to come to Kuta repeatedly. Kedonganan is also a world-wide village with the advantages of its attractive white beaches, beautiful sunsets with views of planes landing at Ngurah Rai International Airport, hospitality-based seafood market and Seafood

Tourism [7]. Jimbaran as a village is very famous for Jimbaran grilled fish as a brand image. Jimbaran Beach has clean white sand beaches, seafood culinary attractions, and romantic dinner venues, beautiful sunset views, and provides sea-food for souvenirs at affordable prices.

The hustle and bustle of tourism certainly provide business opportunities for the local community. Business activities provide broad opportunities for people to participate in efforts to improve their welfare. Most of the income from tourism activities are enjoyed by local communities and migrants. Local communities play a role in maintaining and innovating infrastructure that supports objects and tourist attractions [8-11] and tourism planning responsibilities must be developed by the local government by involving local communities [12-14].

The role of stakeholders in the development of coastal tourism in Kuta, Kedonganan, and Jimbaran areas present a conception of tourism development that cannot be done alone. This conception leads to an understanding of coastal tourism management. Coastal tourism development must consider the potential, the capacity of natural resources and the quality of the human resources of local communities as tourism area managers to satisfy tourist experience [15].

Even though it has such a beautiful attraction (sun, sea, and sand) if Kuta, Kedonganan, and Jimbaran coastal tourism, are not well managed and do not satisfy tourists, it is feared there will be a conflict of interest and tourism will not last long. The problems raised in this study are 1) What is the form of local community participation in managing sustainable coastal tourism on Kuta, Kedonganan and Jimbaran and 2) How is the management model for sustainable coastal tourism business on Kuta, Kedonganan and Jimbaran.

Local community participation can be seen as a mechanism for sustainable development because it creates a sense of belonging among community members. This empowers people to solve their problems. There are several benefits of community participation in development programs. First, community participation provides an opportunity for people to develop programs. Second, community members can understand the goals and objectives of the program being made, committed, and then be responsible for the success and failure of the program that has been agreed upon. Third, participation strengthens local community togetherness, and fourth, participation can facilitate the use of available community resources and the local community can explore their potential.

Participation is very important in implementing development [16]. Without participation from the local community, the implementation of development which oriented to the realization of people's welfare cannot be realized. This is because people are more aware of their needs and how to overcome development problems that occur in the community. Regarding local community participation, the more important thing is to involve people to organize themselves to meet their needs.

Participation carried out by local community is divided into four aspects based on the system and mechanism of participation [17], [18], namely:

1) Participation in decision-making is community participation in the process of making organizational decisions and policies. Participation in this form is in the form of allowing people to express their opinions to assess a plan or program to be determined. The community is also allowed to assess a decision or policy that is currently running. Participation in decision making is a process where development priorities are chosen and set out in the form of programs that are tailored to the interests of the community. By involving the community indirectly experience training to determine their future democratically.

2) Participation in implementation is the participation or participation of the community in developing operational activities based on a predetermined program. In the implementation of development programs, forms of community participation can be seen from the number of active in participating, participatory forms such as energy, material, money, all or part, direct or indirect participation, enthusiasm for participation, occasionally or repeatedly repeat.

3) per

4) Participation in evaluation is community participation in the form of participation in assessing and supervising development activities and their results. This assessment is carried out directly, for example by participating in monitoring and evaluating or indirectly, for example, giving suggestions, criticism or protest.

II. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research was conducted in Kuta Sub-district, Badung Regency on three coastal areas (Kuta, Kedonganan and Jimbaran) for six months from March to August 2019 by observation, interviews with community leaders and business managers on the coastal. Data sources of this research are: primary data was obtained through questionnaires and interviews with respondents and observations on the three coastal areas of the research location. Secondary data was obtained from the Operational Office of BP-KP2K, Tourism Management Agency of Kuta Beach and Jimbaran customary village office, from literature through the internet, newspapers and reading books and articles relating to this research.

The sampling technique used is disproportional purposive sampling, namely the technique of determining samples by 57 (30 %) of the population of 188, with the consideration that business managers are business people, who understand the problem and can provide accurate information. In addition to business managers, samples of respondents were also selected from community leaders with a total of 36 from Kuta, Kedongan and Jimbaran beach.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Respondent Characteristic

Manager of tourism business on Kuta coastal, based on gender; 71 % of men and 29 % of women with an age range from 20 to 60 years and the average age of respondents is 40 years. Formal education of respondents consisted of 24 % of elementary schools, 24 % of junior high schools,

43 % of high school /vocational high schools and 9 % of tertiary institutions. The level of income shows that, 33 % smaller than IDR. 2,700,000, then 33 % between IDR. 2,700,001 - IDR. 3,700,000 and 33 % between IDR. 3,700,001 - IDR. 4,700,000 with a working period of 11 years.

Tourism business managers on the Kedonganan coastal, based on gender; 86 % of men and 14 % of women with age range from 27 to 54 years and the average age of respondents is 45 years. The formal education of respondents consisted of 14 % of elementary schools, 72 % of high schools/vocational schools and 14 % of tertiary institutions. The income levels mostly (42 %) smaller than IDR.2,700,000, then 29 % between IDR. 2,700,001 - IDR. 3,700,000 and 29 % were greater than IDR. 3,700,001 - IDR. 4,700,000 with a working period of 5 years.

Manager of the tourism business on Jimbaran coastal, based on gender; 50 % of men and 50 % of women with age range from 22 to 45 years and the average age of respondents is 34 years. The formal education of respondents is 100 % high school/vocational education. The income levels mostly (62 %) smaller than IDR. 2,700,000, then 25 % between IDR. 2,700,001 - IDR. 3,700,000 and 13 % were greater than IDR. 3,700,001 - IDR. 4,700,000 with a working period of 6 years.

B. Participation in Sustainable Coastal Tourism Management

The forms of community participation in sustainable coastal tourism management. The form of business management community participation is seen from the aspect based on the system and mechanism of participation, the business management community on the coastal, in making decisions, the community is allowed to express their opinions to assess a plan or program to be determined. The implementation of business activities on the beach is currently carried out by the government together with the local community, but in the future, the local community wants the role of the government to be more dominant in the domain of management participation with the community and the private sector.

The development of sustainable tourism on the coastal is reflected through the environment, tourism products, and community participation. Maintenance of the clean environment on the Kuta coastal is addressed by several efforts, for example, food vendors collecting waste then taking it home to be disposed of to landfills through garbage trucks. Food business managers address waste with septic tanks. Seasonal waste is cleared by beach cleaners from Kuta customary village and the regional government of Badung Regency. While on the coastal of Kedonganan, waste is handled manually at each restaurant/café by making a septic tank. Waste management is given to the private sector or to village residents who have a waste extraction business. Likewise, the case on the coastal of Jimbaran, the waste handling system by bringing it to the landfill.

Environmental safety and comfort on the coastal of Kuta through a management system by establishing a Beach Task Force formed by Kuta customary village by conducting field

supervision according to standard operational procedures (SOP). The implementation of environmental safety and comfort on the coastal of Kedonganan is carried out independently and assisted by the Institution for environmental security and comfort. Maintenance of security and comfort with the mechanism that every employee is required to maintain the environment that is following the existing SOP, each business unit has a security unit, the regional environment has a security officer (BPKP2K) formed by Kedonganan customary village. The safety and comfort of the environment on the coastal of Jimbaran are carried out with self-help contributions to pay for security services and equipped with security units and Closed-Circuit Television (CCTV) that function as surveillance cameras.

Tourism products available on the Kuta coastline vary from beach food and drinks, surfing services, young coconut, fruit, umbrellas, food, and beverages to semi-permanent food stalls and various eye care products by moving traders. The provision of tourism products on the coastal of Kedonganan and Jimbaran is relatively the same, such as restaurants/cafes.

The form of public participation refers to the Eight Rungs on a Ladder of Citizen Participation [19]. Business community participation in the three coastal areas is at the Partnership level towards delegated power. This is reflected in the initiation of coastal tourism development that has come from the community but planning is still assisted by related parties such as the involvement of the coastal management community independently, the government and the private sector because of a similar role. This condition leads to delegated power which is reflected in the initiation that has come from the community managing coastal tourism to carry out planning, implementation, operation, responsibility, maintenance of cleanliness, security, and comfort of the environment by requesting assistance from related parties.

The results of the study reveal that the local community has knowledge about business management on the coastal, knows the benefits of the availability of business in their village to meet their family needs, and takes the initiative to participate in activities that support environmental hygiene, safety and comfort for togetherness. The tendency towards the level of delegated power with the characteristic that the coastal management community knows about managing coastal tourism knows its benefits and takes the initiative to participate in coastal business activities, for example, fishermen groups are given a zone for business.

C. Model of Sustainable Coastal Tourism Business Management

Each coastal area at the research location is unique. The supply of goods and services on Kuta coastal is more varied as outlined above and what makes the Kuta coastal more unique is branding with “to Bali is incomplete if not to Kuta”. While the uniqueness of the products on the coastal of Jimbaran and Kedonganan is culinary offerings of seafood with the icon “grilled fish” as an attraction.

The coastal zone designation is almost the same, namely the zone for the activities of the *Ngaben* (cremation) ceremony, the zone for tethering the *jukung* (sailboat), the zone for the activities of the *ngangkid* ceremony, *nyekah* and *nyegara gunung*, zones for certifying ceremonies and zones for business. The difference is that the allotment of the zoning zone on both shores (Kedongan and Jimbaran) is indeed specifically for religious ceremonies. The allotment of Kuta coastal zone is changed to business premises which previously for specific religious activities. Business activities closed when there is a *melasti* (purification) ceremony held on the beach. Local community participation related to the use of coastal areas as a place for the general public, for customary, cultural and economic activities as well as the benefits felt both by the community managing the business and the local community at present.

The public view of the current Jimbaran coastal business management of business locations, most (100 %) stated that it was very appropriate. This is logical because the coastal of Jimbaran started with the culinary seafood business model and from the very beginning it was very popular with the Jimbaran grilled fish brand. The community view becomes relevant and logical because it runs its business focusing on culinary in the form of a restaurant/ café. Unlike the case with business activities on the coastal of Kuta and Kedonganan with conditions at present still possible to provide more varied products and services. Kuta coastal tourism has a strong potential for organizing international events and services related to integrated surfing activities. Whereas for the Kedonganan, variation in the supply of products and services in the form of Mini Beach Club by utilizing one zone of ward designation. The anchoring of fishermen's *Jukung* with a profit system is applied to the village (interview with the head of the customary village). The concept developed for services to tourists is the moment of drinking coffee or eating while taking a bath and swimming and sunbathing on a long chair.

The derivative of this activity has implications for efforts to empower fishermen groups and young people to be able to become entrepreneurs. Perceptions of efforts to involve youth participation in traditional villages for such business activities are like continuing because most people (71 %) say the effort is very appropriate. The benefits felt by managers and the local community over the management of the coastal area at Jimbaran at this time, most of them stated that it was beneficial (100 %), Kedonganan (71 %) and in Kuta (67 %). The distribution of this percentage varies because it is a reflection of the form of local community participation and the management model of business activities has an impact on the benefits felt by the community both the business manager and the local community.

Furthermore, viewed from the aspects of benefits and risks that are directly or indirectly felt by the community relating to the management of coastal areas, as follows: the availability of jobs for the local community, allowing work while learning foreign languages, adding insight into the field of tourism. While the aspects of risk that might be faced, such as large waves and wind direction from the west, abrasion, and competition between types of businesses are very tight because of the tendency of declining visitors.

There are several suggestions given by the local community in an effort to anticipate risks: (a) It is necessary to increase local community and private sectors cooperation in overcoming coastal problems such as beach cleanliness, parking lots, and the comfort or security of coastal tourism; (b) Guidance for managers and traders related to guest comfort needs to be intensified; (c) Supervision is intensified; (d) Customary villages are expected to contribute to the sustainability of businesses along the coast; (e) Customary village in charge to oversee the service standards provided in order to comply with international standards; (f) Build relationships with all parties to promote the region; (g) Expand unique tourism events; (h) The government is expected to participate in making policies to provide health benefits for workers on the coast.

Identification of the participation of the local community concerning the determination of zone designation can be seen in Table I.

TABLE I. PARTICIPATION REGARDING THE ESTABLISHMENT OF BUSINESS ZONE

Question	Response	Coastal Area (%)		
		Kuta	Kedonganan	Jimbaran
To decide on a plan for determining the area/ location/ zone of activity/ event and business/ trade, then the best according to you:	Give suggestions about which area/ location/ zone is suitable for activities/ events and business/ trade	5	0	0
	Discuss together which area/ location/ zone is the best for conducting activities /events and business/ trade	95	100	100
	Only approve the proposed region/location/ zone	0	0	0
	Not approving the proposed area/ location/zone	0	0	0

The participation of the local community (100 %) on both coastal area of Jimbaran and Kedonganan, and 95 % on Kuta, in deciding the zone designation plan on the coast, should be done by first discussing it together about which zone is the best according to designation to make it better.

IV. CONCLUSION

Local community participation in three coastal areas is at the Partnership level towards delegated power. This is reflected in the initiation of coastal tourism development that has come from the local community but planning is still assisted by related parties such as the involvement of the coastal management community independently, the government and the private sector because of a similar role. This condition leads to delegated power which is reflected in the initiation that has come from the community managing

coastal tourism to carry out planning, implementation, operation, responsibility, maintenance of cleanliness, security, and comfort of the environment by requesting assistance from related parties.

The coastal zone designation is almost the same, namely the zone for the activities of the *Ngaben* (cremation) ceremony, the zone for tethering the *jukung* (sail boat), the zone for the activities of the *ngangkid* ceremony, *nyekah* and *nyegara gunung*, zones for certifying ceremonies and zones for business. The difference is that the allotment of the zoning zone on both shores (Kedongan and Jimbaran) is indeed specifically for religious ceremonies, while on the Kuta coastal zone there is a change. The zone has previously been specific to religious activities, but shift to business premises with a condition, business activities closed when there is a *melasti* (purification) ceremony held on the zone.

The results of the study reveal that the community has knowledge about business management on the coast. They know the benefits of the availability of business in their village to meet their family needs. They take the initiative to participate in activities that support environmental hygiene, safety, and comfort for the sake of togetherness. The tendency towards the level of delegated power with the characteristic that the coastal management community knows about managing coastal tourism, its benefits and takes the initiative to participate in coastal business activities, for example, fishermen groups are given a zone for business due to the obligation of handling the temple festival.

The public view of the current Jimbaran coastal business management of business locations, most (100 %) stated that it was very appropriate. This is logical because the coastal of Jimbaran started with the culinary seafood business model and from the very beginning it was very popular with the Jimbaran grilled fish brand. It is relevant and logically running its business focusing on culinary in the form of a restaurant/ café. Kuta and Kedonganan coastal were still possible to provide more varied products and services.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This paper is part of academic research funded by Daftar Isian Pelaksanaan Anggaran (DIPA) Direktorat Jenderal Penguatan Riset dan Pengembangan, Kementerian Riset, Teknologi dan Pendidikan Tinggi Nomor SP DIPA-042.01.2.401006/2019, Tanggal 05 December 2018. The researchers thank the Director of PNB and the students who help in collecting research data, and the business management of café and other beach vendors on Kuta beach, Kedonganan beach, and Jimbaran beach.

REFERENCES

- [1] "Bali Province In Figures 2018", downloaded from <https://bali.bps.go.id/publication/2018>.
- [2] I. K. Astawa, A. A. P. Suardani, and A. A. Harmini, "Explorative study on management model of tourism business zone at Kuta, Bali," *Journal of Physics*, vol. 953, pp. 012074, January 2018.
- [3] I. K. Astawa, M. Suardani, A. A. P. Suardani, "Kuta Beach Area, Bali: A Study on Tourism Zoning and Carrying Capacity," *Journal of Applied Sciences in Tourism and Events*, vol 3, pp. 81-92, June 2019.
- [4] Law No. 10 of 2009 Concerning Tourism. 2009.
- [5] I. M. B. Wisnawa, P. A. Prayogi, and I. N. Aristana, "Positioning coastal zone development in badung regency as a creative and

- sustainable destination,” National Seminar Proceedings, Universitas Mahasaraswati Press, November 2016.
- [6] I. G. A. P. Yukitasari and I. G. A. O. Mahagangga, “Tips on managing seafood culinary tourism in providing tourist services at Kedonganan beach”. *Journal of Tourism Destination*, vol. 6, pp. 192-198, Juli 2018.
- [7] H. U. S. Z. Anikó, “Experience oriented exploitation of the natural and cultural resources of mosonmagyaróvár and its surroundings, a Hungarian micro-region”. *Journal of Social Sciences*, vol. 3, pp. 317-335, September 2017.
- [8] A. C. Buntén, “More like ourselves: Indigenous capitalism through tourism”. *American Indian Quarterly*, vol. 3, no. 3, pp. 285-311, Summer 2010.
- [9] T. Andrianto, G. Sugiama, “The Analysis of Potential 4 A’s tourism component in the Selasari rural tourism, Pangandaran, West Java,” *Asia Tourism Forum. The 12th Biennial Conference of Hospitality and Tourism Industry in Asia (ATF-16)*, Atlantis Press, 2016.
- [10] M. S. Reed, A. Graves, N. Dandy, H. Posthumus, K. Hubacek, J. Morris, and L. C. Stringer, “Who’s in and why? A typology of stakeholder analysis methods for natural resource management”. *Journal of Environmental Management*, vol. 90, pp. 1933-1949, February 2009.
- [11] A. C. Buntén, “More like ourselves: Indigenous capitalism through tourism”. *American Indian Quarterly*, vol. 3, no. 3, Summer 2010, pp. 285-311.
- [12] A. S. Can, F. Alaeddinoglu, N. Turker, “Local authorities participation in the tourism planning process,” *Transylvanian Review of Administrative Sciences*, vol. 41, pp. 190-212, October 2014.
- [13] C. Tosun, “Challenges of sustainable tourism development in the developing world: the case of Turkey”. *Tourism Management*, vol. 22, pp. 289-303, June 2001.
- [14] F. Rahmafritria, R. M. Wirakusuma, A. Riswandi, “Development of tourism potential in watersports recreation, Santirah River, Pangandaran Regency, Indonesia,” *Social Sciences*, vol. 3, issue 1, pp. 712-720, March 2017.
- [15] J.M. Cohen, N. Uphoff, *Rural Development Participation: Concepts and Measure for Project Design, Implementation, and Evaluation*, Center for International Studies, Rural Development Committee. Monograph no. 2, p. 317, Ithaca: Cornell University. January 1977.
- [16] J. M. Cohen, N. T. Uphoff, “Participation’s place in rural development: Seeking clarity through specificity,” *World Development*, vol. 8, No. 3, pp. 213-235, March 1980.
- [17] J. N. Pretty, “Participatory learning for sustainable agriculture,” *World Development*, vol. 23, pp. 1247-1263, August 1995.
- [18] S. Arnstein, “A ladder of citizen participation,” *The American Institute of Planners*, vol. 35, issue 4, pp. 216-224, November 2007.
- [19] B. Mikkelsen, *Participatory Research Methods And Empowerment Efforts*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 2003.