

# Satisfaction of The Stakeholders As Users of Graduates of Bali State Polytechnic

Anak Agung Ayu Mirah Kencanawati  
Business Administration Department  
Politeknik Negeri Bali  
Badung, Bali  
mirahkencana@pnb.ac.id

Ni Wayan Sukartini  
Business Administration Department  
Politeknik Negeri Bali  
Badung, Bali  
wayansukartini@pnb.ac.id

Lily Marheni  
Business Administration Department  
Politeknik Negeri Bali  
Badung, Bali  
lilymarheni@pnb.ac.id

**Abstract**—Generally, the aim of this study was to analyze the quality of satisfaction of the stakeholders as employers of the International Business Management Study Program, Department of Business Administration, Bali State Polytechnic. Specifically, the purpose of the study was to analyze stakeholders' satisfaction, and get feedback from stakeholders to improve quality of the graduates. The number of samples studied were 30 companies following the results of the 2018 tracer study. Data were collected using interviews, observations, questionnaires, and documentation. Data collection techniques included purposive sampling (companies that are already known as employers). Then the data obtained were analyzed using descriptive statistics, and qualitative descriptive. The results of this study were expected to be useful for MBI Study Program in the future development, and for stakeholders as users of D4 MBI Study Program graduates. The results of the study showed that in general the level of stakeholder satisfaction was in the category of high / satisfied category. The input obtained from the stakeholders was that the ability to communicate face to face by graduates needs to be improved. One way that can be given as a suggestion to increase stakeholders' satisfaction is to change the learning model that is able to promote students' confidence in expressing opinions for example by having more discussion activities.

**Keywords**— *satisfaction, stakeholders, graduates, MBI*

## I. INTRODUCTION

Educational institutions are institutions engaged in services that serve education, which in this era of competition are demanded to provide quality education in order to satisfy stakeholders. According to [1][2] nowadays there has been a shift in focus in higher education, namely from improving the internal operations of universities towards the focus on customers. That is, in addition to academic quality, higher education also focuses on non-academic quality such as services to customers being the stakeholders, namely: parents and prospective students, students, graduates, and employers of college graduates. To produce quality education, we should refer to the application of Integrated Quality Management (MMT) or also known as Total Quality Management (TQM) [3]. Globalization is the era of competition, and to win the competition, customer / customer satisfaction is a very important factor to consider. Customer satisfaction is a benchmark of company competitiveness, where satisfaction itself is a feeling felt by someone as a result of a comparison between actual product performance that is received and what is expected by that person (customer) [5]. A product / service will be able to

satisfy consumers if the expectations and desires of a product/service are of high quality [4]. The large number of unemployed university graduates is due to the irrelevance of curriculum. The International Business Management Study Program is one of the vocational education available at the Bali State Polytechnic. It is expected that the graduates can be absorbed by the industries. In attempt to avoid unemployed graduates, the education system applied is oriented to the needs of the industry, with the hope that graduates can be absorbed in the job market. The curriculum is structured to link and match industry needs. The link and match collaboration model are said to be effective if the link and match cooperation model delivers graduate competency standards to the competency expectations of the industrial world [6]. To compete in the future the International Business Management Study Program, Department of Business Administration, Bali State Polytechnic, does not only focus on the product (output) produced, but also on the quality aspects of graduates to meet stakeholders' satisfaction. In an effort to improve the quality of graduates, International Business Management Study Program have implemented a curriculum based on the Indonesian Qualifications Framework - IQF to conform to the Indonesian National Work Competency Standards (SKKNI). In this case there have been many efforts that have been done by the International Business Management Study Program such as improving the learning process by conducting evaluations and revisions to the curriculum on a regular basis, providing adequate facilities and infrastructure, developing teaching methods, creating a climate that resembles the work climate in the industrial world, involving stakeholders in preparing the curriculum, developing internship programs twice in the education period, table manner, industrial lectures, grooming, and also improving the quality of teachers by providing lecturers with competency skills training. Thus it is expected that the quality of graduates will always be improved and in accordance with the demands of the industry. Because the quality of graduates is the estuary of the process of implementing education that can determine the sustainability of an educational institution in the long run [7]. Good quality of graduates will increase the demand of stakeholders in recruiting workers from the institution concerned. For this reason, it is very urgent to examine the quality of graduates and satisfaction of the stakeholders as employers of the graduates, considering that the MBI study program in 2019 will fill BAN-PT forms for accreditation. In accordance with the BAN-PT standard the variable used to measure stakeholders' satisfaction as a graduate employers towards the quality of graduates is: integrity (ethics and morals),

expertise in their field (professionalism), English language skills, mastery of information technology, communication, cooperation within team, and self-development.

## II. LITERATURE REVIEW

### A. Customer Satisfaction

Kotler claims that customer satisfaction is a benchmark of company competitiveness, where satisfaction itself is a feeling felt by someone as a result of a comparison between actual product performance that is received and what is expected by that person (customer) [5]. A product / service will be able to satisfy consumers if the expectations and desires of a product / service are of high quality [4]. Customer satisfaction is a composite of important criteria that determine the real quality received by customers [8]. The education system can be seen as a system of transformation involving input, process and output. Graduate users are external parties who are consumers of the output of an educational institution. These external parties can be in the form of government institutions, private or individual. Graduates, both individuals and institutions, will assess the performance of university graduates as employees. In accordance with the criteria set by BAN PT (2010), Satisfaction of stakeholders as users of graduates can be seen from several variables, namely: (1) Ethic (ethics, Integrity, and morals), (2) Main Competence (Expertise in their field of study, professionalism), (3) English language mastery, (4) Mastery of Information Technology, (5) Communication skills, (6) Teamwork (team collaboration, and (7) Self-development.

### B. Ethic

Ethics is derived from the Greek word, *ethos* which means the character, spirit and attitudes of a group of people or culture [9]. Ethics can be learned, both through the family, the community and at school. Ethics while studying will have an impact on the world of work, high levels of academic dishonesty are especially problematic given that those who cheat in college are more likely to engage in unethical behavior in the workplace. According to [10] ethics is very important for graduates in the workplace, because skills and professional attitudes are essential for successful performance in professional roles.

### C. Main Competence

Globalization and competition, requiring a workforce with increasingly complex requirements, and always changing. To maintain a sustainable competitive advantage, companies need core competencies in terms of human resources [11]. Various skills and competencies are considered as key factors for university graduates to be employed in modern society [12]. Research shows that core competencies and some skills such as quantitative, analytical, technological abilities, strategic and integrative thinking, creative problem solving, communication and collaboration across cultures, flexibility and ability to adapt to change, self-awareness, global perspective, and ethical, responsible views socially responsible is very important [13].

### D. English Language Mastery

English has been widely accepted as the most widespread language used in the world as it is the prime means for communication globally. It is therefore very important for university students to learn English and be able to master the language; this skill could help them greatly in securing and keeping a job, especially with multinational companies. Multinational companies utilise. English as the medium of communication among the workers. Consequently, if students would like to be a part of globalisation, they must be able to communicate well in English. Foreign language is very important, and the importance of foreign-language competence and its impact on employability in the 21st-century workplace mastery of the English language as the language of the global world, is essential to indicate ones' readiness to be a member of the professional community [14]. Communication skills are acknowledged as a fundamental and imperative 21st century skill which propagates the success or failure of sustainable nation-building negotiations and efforts [15]. One of the essential soft skill expected of any employer is the need to communicate successfully in the workplace environment [16].

### E. Mastery of Information Technology

The development of information technology is very fast at this time, almost all jobs use information technology to help work. In the modern workplace, where technology is integrated into nearly every action and interaction, a younger worker's comfort with technology can be considered a significant advantage, whereas the older worker's lack of equivalent competence and familiarity with technology can be considered a disadvantage [17].

### F. Communication Skills

Communication was identified as the essential factor in effective teams, and good communication will increase understanding, collaboration, and collaboration among team members [18]. To maintain good relations at work, good communication is needed [13]. In the future, competition for meaningful work will require the best candidates to be measured by their abilities and competencies. Furthermore, communication, integration, and presentation skills will be needed for around 40% of all positions [19]. The interview is the first opportunity to filter the ability of potential candidates to communicate, integrate, and be present [20].

### G. Teamwork

Teamwork is a set of interrelated set of specific knowledge (cognitive competencies), skills (affective competencies), and attitudes (behavioral competencies) required for an interprofessional team to function as a unit [21]. To be a success team, top managers need to institutionalize and integrate teamwork within their organizations, and to look at strategies for improving teamwork activities for achieving organizational goals [22]. Teamwork in an organization involves two more individuals who perform interdependent tasks, share knowledge openly, and coordinate efforts to focus collaborative decision making and planned intervention on shared goals [23]. Although individual skills in a team are important, the most

important thing is to recognize that competent teams must collaborate and communicate well to coordinate this diversity collectively towards a common goal [24]. Effective teams need a good communication process that involves the exchange of information and clear interaction between values, strengths and attitudes among team members, and that team members must often listen to each other to develop mutual knowledge and share information to enhance collaboration and communication [25]. A good work climate and job satisfaction positively influence teamwork [26].

#### H. Self Development

Self development is a major task for emerging adults, College provides opportunities for youth to explore who they are and what they want to be, and to gain the knowledge and skills required for such personal growth [28]. The process of self-development generates a change mentality by first encouraging individuals to seek and foster change within themselves. This leads to the habit of learning to learn, and conducted in the workplace the process becomes assimilated into the work role.

### III. RESEARCH METHODS

The total number of population in this study is in accordance with the data in the D4 International Business Management Study Program, Bali State Polytechnic, 114 people. The number of samples studied were 30 companies as graduate users according to the results of the 2018 tracer study. Data were collected using interviews, observations, questionnaires, and documentation. Data collection techniques included purposive sampling (companies that are already known as graduate users). Then the data obtained were analyzed using descriptive statistics, and qualitative descriptive.

### IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSIONS

In accordance with the criteria set by the National Accreditation Board of Higher Education (BAN PT), there are 7 (seven) indicators used to measure stakeholders' satisfaction as graduate users, namely ethics, key competencies, foreign language skills, mastery of information technology, communication skills, teamwork, and self-development. From the 30 respondents (companies) studied, in general the level of stakeholders' satisfaction with MBI graduates can be categorized into the satisfied category, with an average achievement score of 3.29. The description of the quality of MBI Study Program graduates can be seen in Table I.

TABLE I. LEVEL OF STAKEHOLDER'S SATISFACTION

| Quality Indicator (Quality)                       | Mean | Remarks   |
|---|------|-----------|
| Ethic   | 3.18 | Satisfied |
| Main Competence (Expertise in the field of study) | 3.63 | Satisfied |
| Foreign Language Mastery                          | 3.02 | Satisfied |
| Mastery of Information Technology                 | 3.70 | Satisfied |
| Communicative Skills                              | 3.01 | Satisfied |
| Teamwork  | 3.33 | Satisfied |
| Self-development                                  | 3.21 | Satisfied |
| Average   | 3.29 | Satisfied |

Table I shows that of the 7 (seven) indicators used to measure stakeholders' satisfaction, the achievement of scores for communication skills is the lowest score. According to the respondents, graduates who work in companies are still timid in showing their ability to talk face to face especially in foreign languages, such as English. Communication can be divided into 2 (two) namely verbal and non-verbal communication. From these two communication modes, the low achievement score for communication skills is due to verbal communication, whereas non-verbal communication is satisfactory. The lack of achievement of verbal communication scores in this study is caused by graduates' lack of confidence in communicating face to face. From the results of in-depth interviews conducted with the respondents, graduates like lacking self-confidence when invited to join a discussion, even though they actually have the ability in the topic being discussed, especially in English. This is in accordance with the results of research [27] that employers indicated that students is lack of confidence, emotional intelligence, and the ability to integrate into a team environment.

From the results of this study, what needs to be done to improve self-confidence is that the learning model needs to be evaluated. In the learning process it is necessary to do a learning model that is able to encourage the students to express their opinions for example through discussion activities. One of the learning models that has succeeded in increasing self-confidence in communication, especially in English is by using project work, because project work provides multiple opportunities for them to engage in language interactions [29]. By doing peer mediation, it can improve students' learning and performance in oral English communication skills [30]. Project work provides multiple opportunities for them to engage in language interactions. Through these interactions, they learned to progress in their language ability. It was also revealed that the series of scaffolding projects which were carefully organized enabled them to develop their oral communication ability and other skills that are useful for organizing projects. With these kinds of task, they continually built their ability and confidence upon what they had already learned.

### V. CONCLUSION

In general the level of stakeholders' satisfaction is high / satisfied category with an average achievement score of 3.29. From the seven indicators used to measure the satisfaction of stakeholders, the average achievement score of ethic indicators (ethics, integrity, and morals) is 3.18, main

competence (expertise in their field of study, professionalism) is 3.63, English language mastery is 3.02, mastery of Information Technology is 3.70, communication skills is 3.01, teamwork (team collaboration) is 3.33, and self-development is 3.21.

The input obtained from the stakeholders is that the graduates' ability to communicate face to face needs to be improved. One way that can be given as a suggestion to increase stakeholders' satisfaction is by changing the learning model so as to be able to boost students' confidence in expressing opinions, for example by having more discussion activities.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This project was financially supported by Bali State Polytechnic.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] G. G. B. Rant and G. Anderson, *Customer Relationship Management: a Vision for Higher Education*, A Publication of Educause and Nabosu. Jossey-Bass Inc, 2002.
- [2] D. Schuller, V. Chlebovsky, Doubravsky, Karel, and V. Chalupsky, "The conceptual scheme for managing university stakeholders satisfaction", vol. 62, no. 4, p. 719-727, 2014.
- [3] A. Zahroh and B. Maunah, "Total quality management (tqm): sebuah langkah dalam mengedepankan kualitas output melalui sistem kontrol mutu (quality control) sekolah", *Journal of Realita*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 224-234, 2015.
- [4] E. B. Godwin and A. A. Johnson, "Labour market distortions and university graduate unemployment in Nigeria: issues and remedies," *Current Research Journal of Economic Theory*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 67-76, 2012.
- [5] P. Kotler, *Marketing Management*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 2003.
- [6] I. Putranto, "Pengembangan model kerja sama link and match untuk meningkatkan kesiapan kerja bagi lulusan smk kompetensi keahlian akuntansi di Kota Semarang", *Jurnal Mandiri*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 69 – 83, 2017.
- [7] M. R. Asmawi, "Strategi meningkatkan lulusan bermutu di perguruan tinggi," *Makara Sosial Humaniora*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 66-71, 2005.
- [8] K. D. Kelsey and A. B. Julie, "A model for measuring customer satisfaction within an academic center of excellence," *Journal of Managing Service Quality*, vol. 11, no.5, pp. 359-367, 2001.
- [9] K. K. Ali, Z. Ramly, and L. T. Chai, *Business Ethics*. Oxford University Press, 2014.
- [10] J. Navaitiene, "Career adaptability of young adults: Psychological aspect of professional socialization," *Pedagogika*, vol. 116, pp. 124-135, 2014.
- [11] M. Murray, S. Dutton, M. M. R. Quaid, and A. Richard, "Employer demands from business graduates," *Education + Training*, vol. 58, no. 1, 2016.
- [12] Z. Stofkova, I. Sedláková, and P. Seemann, "The managerial competencies of students of selected public university", *CBU International Conference On Innovations In Science And Education*, Prague, Czech Republic, vol. 6, 2018.
- [13] J.M. Fritz, *Professional Civility: Communicative Virtue at Work*. New York: Peter Lang, 2013.
- [14] S. Arkoudis, L. Hawthorne, C. Baik, G. Hawthorne, K. O'Loughlin, D. Leach, and E. Bexley, *The Impact Of English Language Proficiency And Workplace Readiness On Employment Outcomes And Performance Of Tertiary International Students*. Melbourne: Centre for the Study of Higher Education, University of Melbourne, 2009, p. 45.
- [15] S. G. Ramdoo and A.B. Rumjaun, "Education for sustainable development: connecting the dots for sustainability", *Journal of Learning for Development*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2017.
- [16] K. Kereluik, P. Mishra, C. Fahnoe, and L. Terry, "What knowledge is of most worth: Teacher knowledge for 21st century learning", *Journal of Digital Learning in Teacher Education*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 127-140, 2013.
- [17] T. Broady, A. Chan, and P. Caputi, "Comparison of older and younger adults' attitudes towards and abilities with computers: implications for training and learning", *British Journal of Educational Technology*, vol. 41, no. 3, pp. 473–485, 2010.
- [18] J. Sargeant, E. Loney, and G. Murphy, "Effective interprofessional teams: contact is not enough to build a team," *Journal of Contin Education Health*, vol. 28, pp. 228–234, 2008.
- [19] "New study reveals most important skills for students. Microsoft News Center", downloaded from <https://news.microsoft.com/2013/10/15/new-study-revealsmost-important-skills-for-students>.
- [20] "What employers seek in job applicants: You've got the skills they want", downloaded from <http://www.apa.org/ed/precollege/psn/2013/09/job-applicants.aspx>
- [21] E. Salas, G. D. Diaz, S. J. Weaver, and H. King, "Does team training work? principles for health care", *Academic Emergency Medicine*, vol. 15, No. 11, p. 1002-1009, 2008.
- [22] M. Manzoor, H. Ullah, M. Hussain, and Z. Ahmad, "Effect of teamwork on employee performance," *International Journal of Learning and Development*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 110-126, 2011.
- [23] S. A. Nancarrow, A. Booth, S. Ariss, T. Smith, P. Enderby, and A. Roots, "Ten principles of good interdisciplinary team work" in *Hum. Resour. Health*, vol. 11, no. 1, 2013.
- [24] L. Lingard, "Paradoxical truths and persistent myths: reframing the team competence conversation," *J. Continuing Educ. Health*, vol. 36, pp.19–21, 2016.
- [25] D. Neufeld, Z. Wan, and Y. Fang, "Remote leadership, communication effectiveness and leader performance," *Group Decision and Negotiation*, vol. 19, no. 3, pp. 227-246, 2010.
- [26] S. Chien, T. Wan, and Y. Chen, "Factors influencing teamwork and collaboration within a tertiary medical center," *World Journal of Methodology*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 18-23, 2012.
- [27] M. Anthony, Baird and S. Parayitam, "Are employers dissatisfied with college graduates? An empirical examination," *International Journal of Arts & Sciences*, vol. 10, no.01, pp. 151-168, 2017.
- [28] J.J. Arnett, *Emerging Adulthood, The Winding Road from The Late Teens Through The Twenties*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- [29] N. Siritaratn, "Improving low-proficiency EFL learners' oral communication by using project work," *International Journal of Arts & Sciences*, vol. 08, no. 06, pp. 335–348, 2015.
- [30] B. Mamo and A. Yigzaw, "Fidelity of peer mediation and its role in improving students' oral English communication skills," *Science, Technology and Arts Research Journal*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 203-214, 2015.