A Review of Research on Bullying Behavior in Indonesian Islamic Education Institutions: Analysis of Ecological Theory

Sutipyo Ru'iya
Islamic Education
Universitas Ahmad Dahlan
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
sutipyo@pai.uad.ac.id

Abstract—**Bullying behavior can occur randomly by not choosing a place, time, and to anyone. Bullying also often occurs in Islamic educational institutions including in madrasah, Islamic schools (integrated) and also pesantren. This phenomenon will worsen the image of Islamic education institutions in the eyes of the community, so it should be solved properly. This study aims to analyze the behavior of bullying that occurs in several Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia that have been published in journals. Data were processed by using meta-synthesis analysis with an ecological theory approach. The results obtained are few studies bullying in educational institutions compiled in approach microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, macrosystem, and chronosystem. Although not all elements in ecological theory are consistently represented in the discussion by published researchers, ecological theory is well worth recommended as a knife of analysis to overcome bullying combined with counseling programs.**

Keywords—ecological theory, bullying, microsystem, mesosystem exosystem, macrosystem, chronosystem

I. INTRODUCTION

The Objective of Islamic education is to produce learners become a perfect man or insān kamīl [1]. Therefore, Islamic education seeks to educate students holistically in every aspect of education [2] starting from mind education (cognitive), heart education (affective), and behavioral education (conative). By using holistic education in every aspects, learners are expected to be closer to Allah Almighty and the friendship relationship with fellow students (humans) are in harmonious. Harmonization of this life will have an impact on one's well-being.

The idealism of Islamic Education above apparently cannot be enjoyed by students with the rampant violent behavior that occurs between them. One form of violence that often occurs in Islamic Education Institutions is bullying behavior. Bullying behavior is really a haunting and frightening specter for students in Islamic Education Institutions because it has a very big impact. As in several studies it is known that the impact of bullying behavior on victims includes psychological, physical and social impacts [3] and sometimes the worst effect is death [4], [5].

The reality above, gave negative image for Islamic Education Institutes for the parents as they put their children in, in order to become good children. It seems that now Islamic Education Institutions were no longer different from public education institutions, whereas, religious-based educational

institutions should be "commanders" in shaping the civilization and character of students [6]. It is very ironic to see the current reality where violence such as bullying often occurs at Islamic Education Institutions. Even Sanaky said that a lot of violence occurred in the name of religion.

Bullying behavior occurs at all levels and Islamic educational institutions, both traditional Islamic Educational Institutions and modern Islamic Educational Institutions. The pesantren, known as the forerunner of traditional Islamic Education Institutions in Indonesia, did not escape from the bullying behavior among the students. It can be known from former researches as follows: Athi 'Linda Yani and friends who conducted research at a pesantren in Jombang [6], [7] Endang Finiswati's research at a pesantren in Jombang as well, [8] Farhan and Aziah's research at a pesantren in Probolinggo which clearly explained the bullying behavior at the pesantren. [9] Research on bullying behavior in madrasah which was conducted by Retno Mawarni and friends at one of madrasahs in Yogyakarta, [10] Saifudin's study in a madrasah in Polman, [11] and a research which is conducted by Nurul Fitri and friends in a madrasah in Lampung [12], has described the bullying behavior that occurs in madrasahs in detail. Meanwhile Hairani IS Nasution and Wilda F Hasibuan also conducted the same research at an Integrated Islamic Middle School in Batam [13] and also Martunis and Nailul Authar who conducted a research on several boarding schools in Aceh[14] explained the behavior of bullying in integrated Islamic schools or known as Islamic boarding schools .

The rise of the facts about bullying phenomenon in Islamic educational institutions as revealed above, has aroused the desire to do some further research on "Why does bullying at the Islamic Education institution in Indonesia continue to happen?" and "How do Institutions of Islam act to overcome this bullying behavior?" Hopefully, even though the bullying behavior can't be completely eliminated in this institution, the amount of bullying behavior that occurs can be minimized as much as possible.

II. PSYCHOLOGICAL AND ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE ON BULLYING BEHAVIOR

A. Psychological Perspective on Bullying Behavior

Bullying behavior in this study refers to the definition given by Olweus that bullying behavior is intentional negative behavior, usually occurs with some repetition and geared towards people who have difficulty defending themselves. The definition is clear that bullying is a form of certain of the

aggressive behavior that infringes toward others. Bullying is a form of violation of many anti-social rules and behaviors [15].

Farrington in 1993 divided the forms of bullying into three types namely physical, verbal, psychological, and bullying of others to always commit violence [16]. While Besag in 1989 stated that other forms of bullying were social bullying and other bad deeds [17]. The forms and types of bullying behavior continue to develop in accordance with the times. Forms of physical bullying behavior can include hitting, slapping, pushing /pulling, kicking, tackling, punching or hurting other physical members. Forms of verbal bullying behavior can include giving bad titles, cursing, calling names with other bad names, provoking fight with others, chasing and scaring. Forms of psychological bullying behavior such as intimidating, insulting, harassing, threatening, preading slander over victims in the form of false rumors. Forms of social bullying behavior such as isolating in groups, not asking to talk, not allowing talking to other people and so forth. While bullying behavior is related to other bad behavior such as taking, disposing, and damaging the victim's belongings.

At first, bullying is done directly and face to face between the perpetrators and the victims. The development of increasingly sophisticated technology and communication tools in recent years has also had an impact on the type of bullying behavior, which is to become indirect bullying, known as cyberbullying [18]. According to Burton, cyberbullying, although cyberbullying still leaves differences of opinion, Burton said that essentially cyberbullying has many similarities with traditional bullying [19]. Cyber-bullying perpetrators try to direct their attacks to victims who are helpless many times in a certain time.

Bullying behavior that can occur at any time has a negative impact on the victim. According to Kartal & Asude in 2009 , the impact on school students will be very visible on the academic, emotional and social development of these students. [20] Safran cites the results of previous studies such as: Hoover, Oliver, & Thompson in 1993, concluded that due to bullying behavior makes the victim always feel tense and worried so it is very influential in the learning process of each child. Garbarino & deLara in 2002, concluded that the victim felt his life was not safe so that his psychological well-being was low. Harryman in 2004, reported that many students gradually suffered from intense pain and stress, thereby reducing physical and psychological health. Twemlow in 2000 resulted in even a very serious impact on the victims experienced a trauma for a long time, especially victims of bullying that are not detected [21].

Long-term trauma can result in serious frustration, so that some victims of bullying are forced to commit suicide to end their suffering [22]. Hong and Espelage also stated that the worst effects of victims of bullying were physical / bodily, psychological and social disabilities until the victim died.

There is a pathetic phenomenon revealed by Smith, Twemlow, and Hoover in 1999 which states that as a result of this bullying behavior has been going on continuously from time to time and from year to year so that bullying behavior is considered normal. Bullying behavior is considered as part of the normal state of a school community so as if it has become a series of cultures that can not be separated from a school [21].

For more details, the following describes some of the characteristics of a behavior can be classified as bullying behavior:

- The presence of an intention to hurt . The perpetrators of bullying must have the intention to really hurt the victim, so that if someone who hurts someone else, but he does not intend to hurt or unintentionally, the act does not include bullying behavior [17]. Intentions to make others suffer are a condition of an action classified as bullying behavior [3]. This feature is disputed by some researchers, because there is difficulty in expressing the intentions that are symptoms in one's heart.

- Done several times. Guerin and Hannessy quote Tattum who argues that by applying repetitive pressure, victims will feel depressed, down, and helpless so that they experience stress. Tattum also said that if an action is carried out once, but the impact is the same as the above also still classified in the bullying behavior [17].

- Provoke other people to do unwanted actions. This requirement is in accordance with Farrington's definition that if someone forces other people to do an undesirable action (especially bad deeds) then this is classified as bullying [16].

- The imbalance power between the perpetrator and the victim. This imbalance of power results in victims unable to fight back, evade, even just to defend themselves. This requirement was agreed upon by all bullying researchers [3], [17].

- Adversely affect the victim. Losses suffered by victims of bullying can be psychological, economic, and social losses. The disadvantage of this is se s ne certainly suffered by the victim, so it can easily be detected

- Perpetrator's satisfaction. The perpetrator feels happy and satisfied for his behavior and the suffering or helplessness experienced by the victim.

Dhar's research revealed several reasons and people who have the potential to carry out bullying,[23] including:

- More social strata. In society, various types of social strata have developed rapidly, so that the social strata above usually tend to act arbitrarily to people who have lower social strata.

- Having a relationship with the authorities. The ruler together with his accomplices can act arbitrarily towards others, especially those who are under their authority.

- Abuse of position. People who have a high position tend to do arbitrarily to subordinates. Abusing power is like telling subordinates to do personal work that is not their job so that the employer benefits him.

- Due to serious stress. Bullying people are people who feel stressed about the reality of life, so they try to vent their frustration and anger toward others.

- The impact of low morale. Bullying is a person who has low moral reasoning. The low moral reasoning of a person, he can not distinguish what is good and what is bad, so they will do what they want.

- The desire for revenge. Most of the perpetrators of bullying are people who have been victims of bullying. Those who are hurt by the behavior they receive, try to get revenge.

Jun Sung Hong and Dorothy L. Espelage [22] describe several factors that are vulnerable to becoming victims of bullying in certain groups, including:

- Age. Younger age than average age in certain groups has more vulnerability than equal age.

- Gender. In some studies the fact that women are more vulnerable to being victims of bullying is obtained.

- Race or light. Race or ethnic minorities are usually very vulnerable to becoming victims, dominant ethnic groups usually want to preserve cultural traditions and ethnic ties so that they place emphasis on the lower ethnic groups (minorities).

- Health status. People who are overweight (obese) are usually easy targets for bullying. Teenagers in British schools that have obesity problems either male or female are significantly more likely to be victims of bullying.

- Intelligence. A student who is intellectually weak or stupid tends to get bullying behavior, children who have high intelligence usually support the occurrence of bullying and gifted youth have participated in bullying behavior.

Economic status. Poverty status is found to be a high risk factor for being a victim of violence in his community. Richer children usually oppress people who are economically low or poor.

B. Islamic Perspective on Bullying Behavior

Islam views that all behavior is part of the akhlak discussion. Akhlak is a value system based on faith in God and afterlife. It emerges a moral system that is based on faith (a faith in God inside someone which always guides his life), Islam (a form of worship and worship to God as a realization of his beliefs), and *ihsan* (a sentiment where a person feels that he is always under God's supervision) [24]. Akhlak is a person's behavior which is carried out as a manifestation of his soul's feelings, so that consistent and uncomplicated behavior appears [25]. The barometer of akhlak is the teachings of Islam, so that good and bad morals are measured by *qaṭ`i* Islamic teachings.

In Islamic teachings, human morals are divided into two namely good morals and bad morals. Good character *(akhlāqul karīmah)* is human behavior that is in accordance with the teachings of the Islamic religion contained in the Qur'an and Hadith. Bad morals were *(akhlāqul maẓmumah)* is a human behavior that violates the prohibitions Islam.

Seeing the definition of bullying above, the behavior of bullying is prohibited in Islamic teachings. People who perform bullying behavior are classified as those who practice *akhlāqul maẓmumah*. The Qur'an has stated:

"The believers! Do not let people ridicule other people (because) maybe they (who are mocked) were better than them (who mock). And for women, do not mock other women, because may be women who (are mocked) were better than them (who mocks). And do not be self-deprecating and do not call other with a name that contains ridicule. The worst call is call after faith and those who don't repent, then they are the wrongdoers." (QS. Al-Hujurāt [49]: 11)

In another verse, Surah Qalam (68): 10-13 Allah SWT also reminds Moslems not to do violence.

Bullying as a sinful behavior which must be avoided by all who believe. People who carry out such activities will get sin against God and fellow human beings. To redeem for the crime of bullying, one must apologize to the person who has been bullied. In the hadith narrated by Abu Dawud 3096 numbers, the Prophet said: "If someone breaks the goods of others, then he is obliged to replace the goods with items which have the same quality with the items he ruined."

Rasulullah SAW said: "Whoever hits his slaves excessively, the compensation is to free them." (HR. Muslim No. 3131)

From Abu Hurairah, he said: Rasulullah SAW said: " If there are two people who are insult each other, the insults uttered by the two, the sin will be borne by those who started the scolding, as long as he does not exceed the limit." (HR, Muslim No. 4688)

From Rasulullah SAW, that he was asked: "O Messenger of Allah, what is called ghibah?" He replied: "That is, you call your brother something he does not like." He said: "O Messenger of Allah, what do you think if what I say is in him?" He said: "If what you say is in him, then you have done ghibah, and if what you say is not in him, then you have slandered him." (HR. Ahmad No. 86 48)

There are still many other hadis which talk about some actions classified bullying. In another hadis the Prophet also warned people to do good things. Because in fact the arrival of the Prophet Muhammad is to improve human akhlak *(innamā buiṡṡu lī utammima makārim al-akhlāq)*. From this hadith it is known that in the view of Islam, bad behavior must be avoided and all Muslims must always try to do commendable behavior *(akhlāqul karīmah)*.

C. Islamic Education Institutions in Indonesia

Islamic education can be understood broadly divided into two things, namely as an institution or as teaching content [26]. Islamic education as an educational institution or institution in Indonesia is at least divided into three namely pesantren, madrasah and schools, as stated by Karel A. Steenbrink [27].

Educational institutions in Indonesia since the beginning have seen the dualism of education, namely general education and religion-based education. Pesantren is an Islamic educational institution that learns and studies only the religious sciences, as well as madrasah, where most of the educational material is religious sciences, and a little general

knowledge as an addition. Whereas schools are Indonesian educational institutions which mostly study general sciences and religious sciences are very minimal. In the end because of their dissatisfaction of Islamic educational institutions there emerges a new organization calling itself the Integrated Islamic School [28] which then continues with its new version, Islamic Boarding School.

III. RESEARCH METHOD

This study is a review of several previous studies with the same theme, namely bullying that occurred Islamic educational institutions. To analyze the data in this study is a meta-synthesis approach or better known as a *systematic review* [29], [30]. *Systematic review* or meta-synthesis is the integration of various qualitative research results to be a solid foundation for determining decisions and policies and also for the development of a theory [31], [32].

The steps taken in this study are:

- Searching for data and selection of primary studies through https://scholar.google.co.id with keywords bullying in madrasahs, bullying in Islamic boarding schools, and bullying in Islamic schools. From these search results, the data sources are articles from journals, assuming that the articles that have been loaded in journals are the results that have passed the editing process of the journal so that they are more trusted or valid. The journals obtained from the search results are relatively minimal, compared with studies of bullying behavior in Islamic educational institutions contained in the thesis or thesis.

- This qualitative data analysis process follows the flow of Miles and Huberman's theory [33] which begins with data collection, data presentation, data reduction and conclusion making.

- At the time of the presentation of the data using the *Ecological Theory* approach initiated by Urie Bronfenbrenner in 1977. The use of this theory is very important, because according to this theory all problems can be traced in detail, that is by finding the root cause of an event, so it will be closed the possibility to ask questions - Another thing that was missed from the discussion [22].

IV. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

A. *Ecological Factors that Can Support Bullying Behavior in Indonesian Islamic Education Institutions*

After conducting an in-depth study of data in the form of journals, which were then reduced to the ecological theory of Urie Bronfenbrenner [34] factors that support and can protect bullying behavior on Indonesian Islamic education institutions are presented in the following article.

1) *Characteristics of Students*

Students in Islamic educational institutions that are the subject of research include Islamic boarding schools, madrasa's tsanawiyah and aliyah, and Islamic boarding schools at junior high and senior high schools. From the age side they are in their teens. Adolescence is a period

where friendship and peer support is very important. Teenagers seek autonomy from their caregivers and ask for social assistance from their peers and peers. Thus, it is not surprising that negative peer relationships and lack of peer support are significant risk factors for bully behavior. Finiswati and Matulessy's research said that boys have a greater tendency to bully than girls. He also said that children in the first and last positions have greater potential as perpetrators of bullying. Finiswati and Matulessy's research results are the same as those of Hong and Espelage [8], [22]. Meanwhile, Fitri and friends stated that men and women have the same potential for bullying. This study concluded that there was no significant difference in the tendency to bullying between men and women [12].

2) *Microsystem*

Lack of attention from parents towards children, feelings of being loved and feeling excluded are the cause of bullying behavior [13]. Looking for self-sensation so that he is recognized by others, is also one of the reasons someone is bullying [10]. In addition, self-control is also a significant factor in controlling bullying behavior. One of the causes of bullying at pesantren is low self-control [35]. Particularly for some children in Islamic boarding schools, some feel themselves alienated by parents. As a result of these feelings, a santri tries to get attention by bullying them to be sent home by a pesantren [6].

3) *Mesosystem*

The education system that applies in some pesantren educational institutions or almost all pesantren is giving senior authorities high authority to assist the educational process at these institutions. This phenomenon makes seniors feel they have power to the juniors, so that deliberately or not bullying behavior often occurs [6], [7], [35].

4) *Exosystem*

Surrounding environmental factors that contribute to bullying behavior in Islamic educational institutions (pesantren) that are particularly striking are the lack of supervision from caregivers to seniors [6], [13]. Experiences when seeing a peer or bully perform an action, make someone who is inferior about himself desires to imitate this.

5) *Macrosystem*

Announcement of bullying behavior in Islamic education institutions is enormous. Victims very rarely report their experiences to caregivers (ustad) or parents. This fact makes the behavior of bullying as a culture that cannot or is difficult to eradicate. If a bullied victim reports her experience, sometimes it is not taken seriously by the employer so that it is almost useless [7]. Bullying seems to be a regular thing, and there is even an assumption that bullying can be a tool to familiarize each other between seniors and juniors [36].

The development of technology and information that is increasingly advanced is also one of the causes for someone to bully. Data from the media about bullying is

easily accessible by anyone. The exposure of a teenager to information on violence makes the teenager a bullying agent [13].

6) Chronosystem

A person's life journey that changes, especially changes that are drastic and undesirable to be one cause of bullying. Divorce of parents so that someone who has stepparents is prone to bullying [13], [22], [37].

B. An Effort to Protect Bullying Behavior in Indonesian Islamic Education Institutions

Efforts to tackle bullying behavior in Islamic education institutions have been widely carried out. However, such a phenomenon is explained by some media that bullying behavior in Islamic educational institutions continues to occur. The following are some programs or efforts that have been made to overcome bullying.

1) Give sanctions to the perpetrators of bullying

One of the policies carried out by the management is to formulate pesantren regulations which cover the types of violations and penalties. Bullying is included in the types of breaches ranging from commemoration to severe abuses, depending on the type and impact of bullying committed [14]. Mild bullying is usually given advice and counseling so that they do not repeat their behavior. Physical sanctions are also imposed on those who carry out intimidation, and they can even be removed from the institution.

2) Reconcile the perpetrators and victims of bullying

Victims and perpetrators sought reconciliation to avoid prolonged grudges. Revenge from victims of bullying is one of the reasons why someone will bully in the future. Reconciliation is carried out through mediation by caregivers. Caregivers make persuasive communication with the perpetrators so that they are aware and do not repeat their actions [9], [14]. This is following the teachings of Islam as in the hadith that a human being must not silence one another for three days. In many traditions, it is also advisable for fellow humans to forgive one another for forgiveness.

3) Appoint foster guardians

Foster guardians are administrators at an institution whose job is to accompany a student or student [9]. The foster care program is sharing with foster children, private meetings so that there is a warm interaction with their students. Foster care attempts to see the development of their students, so they can monitor if there are things that are not desired. Foster caregivers are obliged to report every foster child's development.

4) Islamic guidance and counseling for santri/students

Personal guidance to students or students becomes very important because the desire to do or not to behavior is in the person [11]. In carrying out this personal guidance, what needs to be considered are the religious elements which form the basis of every Muslim's actions. As a Muslim, the implementation of counseling must be based on Islamic values [38]. The premise of this religion will be a reliable driver for someone to do or not do an action. As a Muslim,

we believe that every deed will get reward and sin. Only by relying on religious values, someone who has a strong belief will avoid evil deeds and futility.

Islamic counseling is the implementation of the concept of counseling, including conventional counseling but has been given a load of Islamic values. Rasool said that Islamic counseling is counseling based on the Qur'an and Hadith [38].

Meanwhile, Hamjah explained that Islamic counseling must stand upright from the joints of Islam, namely aqeedah, morals, and worship [39]. Aqidah is the main joint in the teachings of Islam. A human being who has a strong aqeedah, will be the basis in every behavior. Right Aqeedah will lead someone to have good morals, good morals to God, to fellow human beings and also to other fellow creatures of God. A person of good faith and good character, then, of course, he will be able to worship well to Allah. Hamjah strengthens his reasoning by citing Cornish and Wade in 2010 that the implementation of Islamic counseling is not just for individual counseling. Islamic counseling, according to Cornish and Wade, will also be useful for group counseling.

There are various kinds of Islamic counseling approaches offered. In essence, Islamic counseling must continue to be on the Islamic track taught by the Prophet Muhammad through his traditions. Integrating the science of counseling with Raulullah's teachings in a thick spiritual frame. One example is the pioneering Farah Lodi, who was introduced under the name *"The HEART Method: Healthy Emotions Anchored in RasoolAll's Teachings."*[40]

V. CONCLUSION

The effort to incorporate and understand some of the previous research is essential as feedback to stakeholders. Likewise, it highlights the causes and countermeasures of bullying behavior.

Through the knife analysis of ecological theory, it becomes clear what causes bullying in Islamic educational institutions. What programs have been carried out by Islamic education institutions to deal with bullying have also been seen clearly. It turns out that stakeholders have touched not all cases of bullying to tackle bullying. Therefore, it is exciting if further research is carried out that pays attention and responds to every part of the ecological factors that cause bullying behavior in Islamic educational institutions

REFERENCES

[1] N. Ghorbani, P. J. Watson, M. Omidbeiki, dan Z. J. Chen, "Muslim attachments to God and the 'perfect man' (Ensān-e Kāmel): Relationships with religious orientation and psychological adjustment in Iran.," Psychol. Relig. Spiritual., vol. 8, no. 4, hlm. 318–329, Nov 2016.

[2] R. Utari, W. Madya, dan P. Knpk, "Taksonomi Bloom: Apa dan Bagaimana Menggunakannya?," hlm. 13.

[3] H. Sercombe dan B. Donnelly, "Bullying and agency: definition, intervention and ethics," J. Youth Stud., vol. 16, no. 4, hlm. 491–502, Jun 2013.

[4] "Di Pesantren, Iqbal Sering Jadi Korban Bullying," suarasurabaya.net, 04-Nov-2017.

[5] "Jadi Korban Penganiayaan Teman, Seorang Santri di Pondok Pesantren Ini Meninggal Artikel ini telah tayang di tribunpontianak.co.id dengan judul Jadi Korban Penganiayaan Teman, Seorang Santri di Pondok Pesantren Ini Meninggal, Editor: Jamadin," tribunnews.com, 03-Apr-2018.

[6] A. Linda Yani, I. Winarni, dan R. Lestari, "Eksplorasi Fenomena Korban Bullying Pada Kesehatan Jiwa Remaja Di Pesantren," J. Ilmu Keperawatan J. Nurs. Sci., vol. 4, no. 2, hlm. 99–113, Nov 2016.

[7] A. L. Yani dan R. Lestari, "Mengalami Bullying di Pesantren : Mengamankan Diri Sendiri Walaupun tiada gunanya," J. Holist. Nurs. Sci., vol. 5, no. 1, hlm. 49–55, Feb 2018.

[8] E. Finiswati dan A. Matulessy, "Kecenderungan Melakukan Bullying Ditinjau dari Jenis Kelamin dan Urutan Kelahiran pada Santri di Pondok Pesantren," Fenom. J. Psikol., vol. 1, no. 1, hlm. 13–23, 2018.

[9] F. Farhan dan A. Aziah, "Upaya Wali Asuh pada Peserta Asuh Mengatasi Bullying di Pesantren Nurul Jadid Perspektif Komunikasi Persuasif," Briliant J. Ris. Dan Konseptual, vol. 4, no. 1, hlm. 46–55, Feb 2019.

[10] R. Mawarni dan T. R. Andayani, "Hubungan Antara Mencari Sensasi dan Empati dengan School Bullying Pada remaja Putra Kelas X dan XI di Madrasah Mu'allimin Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta," J. Ilm. Psikol. Candrajiwa, vol. 4, no. 2, hlm. 148–162, 2015.

[11] Saifuddin, "Pengembangan Model Bimbingan Pribadi Sosial untuk Mereduksi Perilaku Bullying Siswa di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Polman," J. Pendidik. ISLAM PENDEKATAN Interdisip., vol. 2, no. 1, hlm. 1–12, 2017.

[12] M. N. Fitri dan R. E. Andriyanto, "Analisis Perilaku Bullying Siswa Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 Bandar Lampung Tahun Ajaran 2018/2019," ALIBKIN, vol. 1, no. 1, hlm. 1–15, 2018.

[13] H. I. S. Nasution dan W. F. Hasibuan, "Penyebab Verbal Bullying di Kalangan SiswaSMP IT Ulil Albab Batam," J. KOPASTA, vol. 2, no. 2, hlm. 111–115, 2015.

[14] M. Marthunis dan N. Authar, "Bullying at Aceh Modern Islamic Boarding Schools (Pesantrens): Teachers' Perceptions and Interventions," Sukma J. Pendidik., vol. 1, no. 2, hlm. 219–248, Nov 2017.

[15] D. Olweus, "Bullying at school and later criminality: Findings from three Swedish community samples of males," Crim. Behav. Ment. Health, vol. 21, no. 2, hlm. 151–156, Apr 2011.

[16] D. P. Farrington, "Understanding and Preventing Bullying," Crime Justice, vol. 17, hlm. 381–458, Jan 1993.

[17] S. Guerin dan E. Hennessy, "Pupils' definitions of bullying," Eur. J. Psychol. Educ., vol. 17, no. 3, hlm. 249–261, Sep 2002.

[18] H. J. Thomas, J. P. Connor, dan J. G. Scott, "Integrating Traditional Bullying and Cyberbullying: Challenges of Definition and Measurement in Adolescents – a Review," Educ. Psychol. Rev., vol. 27, no. 1, hlm. 135–152, Mar 2015.

[19] K. A. Burton, D. Florell, dan D. B. Wygant, "The Role of Peer Attachment and Normative Beliefs About Aggression on Traditional Bullying and Cyberbullying: Peer Attachment, Aggression, and Cyberbullying," Psychol. Sch., vol. 50, no. 2, hlm. 103–115, Feb 2013.

[20] H. K. Al-Raqqad, E. S. Al-Bourini, F. M. Al Talahin, dan R. M. E. Aranki, "The Impact of School Bullying On Students' Academic Achievement from Teachers Point of View," Int. Educ. Stud., vol. 10, no. 6, hlm. 44, Mei 2017.

[21] E. R. Safran, "Bullying Behavior, Bully Prevention Programs, and Gender," J. Emot. Abuse, vol. 7, no. 4, hlm. 43–67, Feb 2008.

[22] J. S. Hong dan D. L. Espelage, "A review of research on bullying and peer victimization in school: An ecological system analysis," Aggress. Violent Behav., vol. 17, no. 4, hlm. 311–322, Jul 2012.

[23] R. L. Dhar, "Why Do They Bully? Bullying Behavior and Its Implication on the Bullied," J. Workplace Behav. Health, vol. 27, no. 2, hlm. 79–99, Apr 2012.

[24] Marzuki, Prinsip Dasar Akhlak Mulia, Pengantar Studi Konsep-konsep Dasar Etika dalam Islam. Yogyakarta: Debut Wahana Press, 2009.

[25] S. Ru'iya, "Strengthening Morality And Character of Madrasah Tsanawiyah's Students in Kulon Progo by Developing Good Habits and Effective Communication With Parents," Adv. Soc. Sci. Educ. Humanit. Res., vol. 317, hlm. 172–176, 2019.

[26] A. M. Mulkhan, "Filsafat Tarbiyah Berbasis Kecerdasan Makrifat Bagi Percepatan Pembejalaran Berbasis Boarding School," J. Pendidik. Islam, vol. 2, no. 2, hlm. 219–239, Des 2013.

[27] K. A. Steenbrink, Pesantren, Madrasah, Sekolah: Pendidkan Islam dalam Kurum Modern. Jakarta: LP3ES, 1986.

[28] S. Suyatno, "Sekolah Islam Terpadu dalam Peta Sistem Pendidikan Nasional," ALQALAM, vol. 32, no. 2, hlm. 309–330, Des 2015.

[29] S. Green, "Systematic reviews and meta-analysis," Singap. Med J, vol. 46, no. 6, hlm. 270–274, 2005.

[30] E. Aromataris dan A. Pearson, "SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS, Step by Step," Syst. Rev., vol. 114, no. 3, hlm. 6, 2014.

[31] Y. Mariyani, P. U. Paula, Rahjanto, dan O. W. Budijanto, Ed., Studi meta analisis upaya negara terhadap perlindungan anak dalam perspektif hak asasi manusia, Cetakan pertama. Jakarta: Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Hukum dan HAM, Kementerian Hukum dan HAM RI, 2016.

[32] A. Perry dan N. Hammond, "Systematic Reviews: The Experiences of a PhD Student," Psychol. Learn. Teach., vol. 2, no. 1, hlm. 32–35, Mar 2002.

[33] M. B. Miles dan A. M. Huberman, Analisis Data Kualitatif: Buku Sumber Tentang Metode-Metode Baru. Jakarta: UI-Press, 1992.

[34] U. Bronfenbrenner, The ecology of human development: experiments by nature and design. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1979.

[35] Ernawati, "Sosialisasi Meningkatkan Kesadaran Santri terhadap Tindakan Bullying di Pesantren," J. Abdi MOESTOPO, vol. 1, no. 2, hlm. 38–44, 2018.

[36] Failasufah, "Dampak Cyberbullying Terhadap Pembentukan Karakter pada Kalangan Pelajar Madrasah," J. Pendidik., vol. VII, no. 03, hlm. 253–264, Des 2016.

[37] A. H. Farrell dan A. A. Volk, "Social ecology and adolescent bullying: Filtering risky environments through antisocial personality," Child. Youth Serv. Rev., vol. 83, hlm. 85–100, Des 2017.

[38] G. H. Rassool, Islamic counselling: an introduction to theory and practice. East Sussex ; New York, NY: Routledge, 2016.

[39] S. Hanin Hamjah dan N. S. Mat Akhir, "Islamic Approach in Counseling," J. Relig. Health, vol. 53, no. 1, hlm. 279–289, Feb 2014.

[40] C. Y. Al-Karam, "Islamically Integrated Psychotherapy," hlm. 264.