

Legal Protection Model on Esthetic Beauty Clinics Patients: Between Fulfilling Constitutional Rights and Doing Business

Siska Diana Sari^{1,*} Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani², Pujiyono³

¹*Faculty of Law, Universitas PGRI Madiun, Madiun, Indonesia*

^{2,3}*Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, East Java,, Indonesia*

* *Corresponding author. Email: siskadianasari@gmail.com*

ABSTRACT

This article studied the implementation of law protection model for esthetic beauty clinic's patients in citizen's constitutional right protection perspective. The research method used was an empirical qualitative on the stakeholders of esthetic beauty clinics in 10 cities in 5 provincial in Indonesia. The result of the research showed that the implementation of legal protection model to aesthetic clinic's patients, viewed from implementation content and drug and executor regulations, was less comprehensive and still needed improvement. The Context of Implementation was Ministry of Health and Local Government as leading sector in esthetic beauty clinic service less responsive to the violation esthetic beauty clinics employing executing officers and using medicines and dangerous chemicals inconsistently with the specified guideline. Regulation and Supervision conducted by Ministry of Health, Local Government and Law Enforcer had not run maximally yet. IDI played a very limited role and patients had poor understanding on their right and law protection. As a regulator, the government was recommended to govern the right and the law protection of beauty clinic's patients in more detailed; education should be given to the people about healthy and safe cosmetics and about consumptive culture to prevent them from being the victim of beauty clinics that break the law.

Keywords: *law protection, patient, esthetic beauty clinic, citizen's constitutional right*

1. INTRODUCTION

As Southeast Asia's largest economy, Aesthetic Indonesia has a GDP of US\$ 888.5 billion, a population of 250 million and rising incomes; analysts forecast that Indonesia will be one of top five markets for cosmetics in the next 10 to 15 years[1]. The demand for personal care and cosmetics and particularly skin, make-up and hair care products grows rapidly and consistently by 10-15 percent per annum

Skincare market globally is classified into facial care (2/3 of the total sales), hand and body care and sun care¹. This segment' success is a precondition to the prosperity of whole beauty industry. Despite economic downturn reducing growth rate, it was possible to restore its prerecession growth in subsequent years. A peculiarity of Asian skincare markets is the leading role of face-whitening products, as pale skin continuously considered as the beauty ideal in Asia. For that reason, there is always a strong demand for skin whiteners[1].

This growth of beauty business builds on metrosexual women and men's desire in Indonesia to appear perfectly, thus to accomplish it they want to spend their money

voluntarily to buy face and body treatment product at expensive price. The wish to appear beautifully/fascinatingly and well-treated is an individual's physical need, particularly women. Even the existing age development no longer says so, because now men are as if unwilling to be left behind in appearing neatly and fascinatingly; such men class is called metrosexual men. It is this reality that encourages many companies to operate in *Beauty and Personal Care* field to keep innovatively creating high-quality product the consumers look for to win the market.

The investors read this condition to establish healthcare service business in esthetic beauty clinic using the best cosmetic and technology in order to fulfill the wish of the patients present to get optimum condition, therefore the people are served with many healthcare service promotions in order to be tempted to be the customers of it, as shown in the finding of study below:

Cosmetic is one of pharmaceuticals preparation advertised vigorously in print media, electronic media or internet. People are faced with cosmetics advertising mostly offering a variety of skin care products, especially for women to get the skin whiter and brighter[2].

Esthetic beauty clinic is bond by medical service standard to take care of and to protect its patients' body as implied in the statement below:

Given the role cosmetic surgery and, more generally, the feminine beauty system-play in the disciplining and inferiorization of women's bodies, a feminist cosmetic surgeon would seem to be a contradiction in terms. It is hard to imagine how cosmetic surgery might be practiced in a way which is not, by definition, disempowering or demeaning to women[3].

Respect for patient autonomy, as a basic principle in contemporary bioethics, guides the process of informed consent through which expectedly patients' wishes are determined and executed. However, when procedures are exclusively cosmetic, questions arise concerning the ethical legitimacy of such requests and enhancements [4]. Indonesia is a Constitutional State as stated clearly in the fourth amendment to 1945 Constitution in 2002, the conception of a State of Law or "*Rechtsstaat*" previously mentioned in the basic explanation of 1945 Constitution, and formulated in Article 1 paragraph 3 which declare that "Indonesia is the State of Law"[5]. Considering the concept of Constitutional State, it must be a commander in all aspects of life, including on Aesthetic Beauty Clinic Treatment. Here, as the State of Law which has constitutional should be obligated to protect the citizens' constitutional rights especially in aesthetic beauty clinic treatment.

2. METHODS

This study was a juridical sociological research, discussing the reality and data existing in practical field to be connected later to the enacted legal provision.

The data source of research employed consisted of primary law material constituting the way of collecting data obtained and closely related to primary law material such as books on health law, consumer protection law, and constitutional right of citizen, and secondary law material constituting the one that is binding in nature, consisting of 1945 Constitution, Legislation related to health law and consumer protection law, and other regulations related to esthetic beauty clinic practice.

Technique of collecting data used by author was field work, the one conducted by observing directly the location while interviewing those related from Ministry of Health, Consumer Protection Agency, Indonesian Clinician Association, BPOM (Food and Drug Administration), and aesthetic beauty clinic in 10 cities in 5 provincial areas in Indonesia.

Data obtained through library study and field observation were analyzed using descriptive qualitative method, representing the data obtained just like the way it is, to be organized systematically later, so that a description is obtained concerning what is expected according to the objective of research and conclusion can be drawn. The last, this research using policy implementation theory perspective of Grindle's[6].

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Urgency of Constitutional Right Protection in Esthetic Beauty Clinic Practice

Article 28H clause (2) states "Everyone is entitled to get facility and special treatment in order to acquire equal opportunities and benefits to achieve equality and justice". The state's duty is to fulfill the citizens' constitutional right, right to health, right to law guarantee and protection, and right to law protection constituting the citizen's constitutional right.

Government's principal obligation is to ensure the health and welfare of its population. It does so through the enactment and enforcement of laws designed to create the conditions necessary for citizens to lead healthy, safe lives. Law can be used as a tool for improving the health of a society by creating public health authorities, defining their powers, and denoting the means by which those powers can be used. In addition, health law focusing on the characteristics that make it different from other areas of law[7].

Furthermore, the rights to law guarantee and law protection is human rights in civil area, including negative right the nature of which is inherent and fulfilled, so that the state should be present maximally in its fulfillment. In organizing this esthetic beauty clinic, the most prominent right is the right to health. State should guarantee the fulfillment of citizens' constitutional right. It serves as the implementation of welfare state principle, in which the state interfere with the citizens' welfare affairs, despite some other parties involved in this case, esthetic beauty clinic[8]. Esthetic beauty clinic is in the forefront position to protect and fulfill the right of citizens (users). However, in fact there is a rule in informed consent of medical action in beauty clinic stating that when something unexpected occurs, the patient will not file lawsuit either in criminal or civil manner. In such condition, the state cannot intervene with it, because the decision to enter into an agreement and to take medical action lies on patients and beauty clinic management's hands.

The state, in this case central and local government should obligatorily do anything to fulfill the citizen's constitutional right existing in esthetic beauty clinic practice. It can be accomplished maximally by reforming Context of Implementation and Content of Implementation by all stakeholders in the organization of esthetic beauty clinic.

This healthcare service can be adopted from how European Union states pay much attention to the healthcare service based on the result of study below:

The European Union (EU) has expanded either geographically or its actions' coverage, to be an important supranational body whose policies affect almost all aspects of its citizens' lives. It also affects health and healthcare services. The EU's formal responsibilities for health and

healthcare services are limited in scope, but, it affects them substantially and indirectly. EU's institutions, its legislative process, and European law's characteristics affects the free movement of goods, people, and services impacting on health or necessary to deliver healthcare. The influence of the EU goes far beyond the activities most visible to health professionals, such as research funding and public health programmes, and involves an extensive body of legislation affecting almost every aspect of health and health care[9].

In addition, the effect of globalization results in the citizens' increased need for body treatment in beauty clinic. It also impacts on the increased need for law protection and the fulfillment of constitutional right related to its organization.

Law protection for the patients of esthetic beauty clinic viewed from the protection of citizen's constitutional right serves as an attempt of protecting the citizens as the patients considered as more important either materially or formally, recalling that science and technology are the driver of product and service producer's productivity and efficiency yielded in the attempt of pursuing and achieving them either directly or indirectly. Therefore, the consumers will feel its effect[10]. Many losses the patients experience with this service provided by beauty clinics mushrooming require the government to reconstruct law protection model for esthetic beauty clinic's users in the perspective of constitutional right protection for citizens. The presence of BPSK (Consumer Dispute Settlement Agency) as mandated by the Law has not reached yet the problem of beauty clinic's consumer protection effectively. BPSK's limited existence and its absence in some cities/regencies and its funding imposed to APBD (Regional Income and Expense Budget) make the Local Government finding difficulty in supporting the efficiency and effectiveness of BPSK.

Most harmed consumers will abandon the service in beauty clinic, and only a few bravely file lawsuit and come directly to the beauty clinic to ask for compensation. The data obtained from Supreme Court's website shows that there is a limited number of court's verdicts related to beauty clinic, about 40 (forty) cases only. The problem these patients of beauty clinic encounter is like an iceberg phenomenon that does not appear on the surface but it is very large actually.

2. *The Implementation of Law Protection Model for Beauty Clinic Patients in Indonesia*

Based on research result's about the implementation of Law Protection Model for Beauty Clinic Patients in Indonesia, there is disharmony which happened in this practice namely the pros and cons about predicate for customers who use goods and treatments in the aesthetic beauty clinic. It gives impact to the Law of protection and its application. According to the Expert of Customers

Protection Law of Indonesia, Yusuf Shofie, and Ir. Ardiansyah Parman (National Consumer Protection Agency of Indonesia) said that the people who used aesthetic beauty clinic treatment are categorized as customers or consumers, because there are transaction and deal of selling and buying about goods and treatments which have done among them. It can be called *Resultaatsverbintenis*, is a form of agreement based on the result to be achieved or has been previously agreed. But in Health Law, this agreement does not permit because of the differences condition of each customer, so that make result which want to be achieved will be different. Besides, the other factors of ability from customers' self, doctors, and available facilities of it will be effect for the result too.

Meanwhile, according to dr. Yanti Herman, S.H., M.Hkes, Head of Sub-Regulation of Health Service Division in the Ministry of Health of Indonesia, and Dr. Roberia, S.H., M.H., Head of Sub-Directory of Harmonization of Legislative I, Human Resources Division in the Ministry of Law and Human Right of Indonesia, stated that customers of aesthetic beauty clinic are categorized as a patient, because they get health treatment in this place. Automatically, the rules that organized about it is Health Law start from the standard of health treatment, the professional experts, receipt of medicine, tools, and medical act which have done in it. Then, the relations which happen between doctor and patient are a form of *Inspanningsverbintenis*. A doctor should commit themselves to give maximum effort (*inspanning*) to the patient and not bind themselves just to achieve a specific result (*resultant*). The primary of this relation is patient beliefs for her/his doctor (*fiduciary relationship, trust, vertrouwen*). In every medical act, it always has uncertain elements which make medical contracts called *Inspanningsverbintenis* and not a *Resultaatsverbintenis*. Based on the finding research, the relations that occur in beauty clinic is more *Resultaatsverbintenis*, means when someone comes to an aesthetic beauty clinic they wants to treat or improve body skins or face to be better in accordance with promotion which has offered by this clinic to make customers interested to do it.

In some cases that have met by Researcher show the majority of Police and Judiciary used Health Law to catch the perpetrators who have done harming act for the customer of aesthetic beauty clinic. It also becomes a basis Law of customers protection who use aesthetic beauty clinic when any case that occurs here.

Further findings research which have done in fifteen skincare clinics at five area of Indonesia such as Jakarta, West Java, Central Java, East Java and Yogyakarta get result:

- a. A medical practitioners in a beauty clinic are doctors who do not have competence to do certain medical

action (take specialist action) like an Expert of Medical Act.

- b. The types of treatment or service in the beauty clinic include: facial, bleach injection, acne treatment, body slimming or firming, micro-dermabrasion, jet peel, cauter, oxy therapy, mesotherapy and LAT.
- c. Type of equipment that is owned by beauty clinic such as: slimming tools, cauter, micro-dermabrasion, laser and IPL.
- d. Any difference rules and operational permits which have made by each Local Government for beauty clinic performances.

The finding results of questionnaires with 200 customers or patient of beauty clinic at five area of Indonesia such as Jakarta, West Java, Central Java, East Java and Yogyakarta showed that a lot of medical practitioners include the customers who have minimum knowledge and information about safety, legality and Law protection about it. Based on the result above, it can be concluded that some beauty clinic has conducted their medical activities but unclear rules about who is responsible for the management, moreover about the systems of famous skincare clinic in some branches of city or district throughout Indonesia.

Another finding about the legality of aesthetic beauty clinic training for doctor who have practice in beauty clinic, based on the guidance of Indonesian aesthetic beauty clinic practices which have been decided by Ministry of Health of Indonesia, stated that doctor who authorized to establish and practices in beauty clinic is a doctor who has professional competence in medical act and gets specialist education or training from beauty clinic institution that is recognized by Ministry of Education of Indonesia. Based on interview results with Dr. Nazar, SP.P., M.HKes, Chairman of Guidance Law and Defense Members of Indonesian Medical Association, obtained data that the Indonesian Medical Association only release practice license following professional doctor competences that are proof by certificate which issued by the College / Association. The Indonesian Medical Association in each area has been done supervision and monitoring at least two times within a period of one year. It was a form of customers' protection if there is any problem which happens in the beauty clinic and can be revoked the doctor practice licenses too. It will be process by Indonesian Council Code of Medical Ethics, Indonesian Honorary Board of Medical Ethics and Indonesian Council of Medical. Then, data of doctors who have problems in esthetic beauty clinics in Indonesia is an average of 1 per year since the last 6 years.

The last finding show that the existence of protection / backing from Police and Indonesian National Armed related to the practice of beauty clinics, whether that is accordance or not accordance with rules. Because of the case, it can be threat for the customers of beauty clinic if

any problems which happen here, but they still get backing from Police and Army to resolve it

Considering Grindle's theory, a successful implementation of public policy can be measured from the process of achieving the outcomes, whether or not the expected objective is achieved. Grindle suggests that the measurement of a successful policy implementation can be seen from 2 aspects.

The result of research is analyzed using Grindle's theory, as explained below:

a. Content Implementation

Regarding the content of implementation, esthetic beauty clinics have been governed particularly in the Guideline of Esthetic Beauty Clinic Organization issued by Republic of Indonesia's (RI's) Ministry of Health, Directorate General of Medical Service Building of RI's Department of Health in 2007. In 2007, institutionally it was still named Department of health, rather than Ministry of Health and generally other legislations related to Health Act and Consumer Protection Act and the implementation at local level is governed by local regulation in each of City/Regency.

Constitutional study in the content of implementation related to the regulation of esthetic beauty clinic in Indonesia involves:

a. Constitutional Right

Constitutional right in RI's 1945 Constitution related to the organization of esthetic beauty clinic in Indonesia is mentioned in[11]:

1) Article 28D clause (1) "Every person shall have the right of recognition, guarantees, protection and certainty before a just law, and of equal treatment before the law".

The meaning of the clause above is that every citizen deserves recognition and protection from the state. And every citizen deserves fair and equal treatment before the law without discrimination.

2) Article 28H clause (1) "Every person shall have the right to live in physical and spiritual prosperity, to have a home and to enjoy a good and healthy environment, and shall have the right to obtain medical care".

Considering the result of study, this constitutional right aspect mentioned in Article 28H clause (1) should be restudied by means of judicial review to elaborate more clearly the right to health, both physically and psychically. Meanwhile, the right to healthcare service should be confirmed in relation to primary, secondary, and tertiary healthcares and the organization of healthcare by government and private that should be consistent with the enacted standard of medical care in order to achieve this healthy objective maximally.

b. Legal Right

This section studies the regulation of law related to the policy and implementation of esthetic beauty clinic organization. Considering the result of research, some

problem is found in Legal Right aspect related to the policy not giving law protection yet to the patients of esthetic beauty clinic; it can be seen from many problems found in its implementation.

Some problems are also found in relation to the implementation of policy concerning esthetic beauty clinic. They are disharmonious local regulations, city/regency government not adopting the substance of guideline for the organization of esthetic beauty clinic issued by the Ministry of Health, and only using old legal foundation that has been replaced, concerning the healthcare service provided by private and clinic. Even it is faced with the reality that a latest clinical rule has been ratified. It of course impacts on the organization of esthetic beauty clinic. The data shows that the degree of rule is less strong, as it constitutes a guideline only, so that it cannot be included into the legal foundation of local regulation development.

Based on the result of study on the court's verdict about beauty clinic case, the regulation of sanction is less clear. In relation to the *Context of Implementation*, the guideline does not mention the severe punishment threat, related to product and service given to the patients.

There is disharmony of rules and jurisdictions related to the position of citizens as patients and consumers. The Ministry of Health insists that patients of beauty clinic are patients, so the law enclosing it is the Health Law. However, BPKN and practitioners of consumer protection law argue that patients are consumers, because there are transaction and product and service objects in its service.

Several matters have not been governed yet in the guideline enacted today:

- a. Legalization of doctor (clinician) course;
- b. Standardization and education of beautician; the finding shows many course organizing institutions cooperating with the producers of beauty clinic equipment;
- c. Medical equipment used;
- d. Chemicals used
- e. Online service
- f. Risk litigation
- g. Compensation

Health sector affected mostly by globalization includes healthcare service, health workers, pharmaceutical industry, health equipment and health insurance. Esthetic beauty clinic as one of fields in health sector begins to compete for improving the quality of service to its users due to health globalization using most sophisticated equipments and drugs that can give the best result on order to attract patients as many as possible.

Further finding shows that many legal foundations have been replaced and no longer relevant to the need for law protection and for the fulfillment of citizen's constitutional right today. They are[12]:

- a) Law Number 23 of 1992 about Health has been substituted with Law Number 36 of 2006 about Health;

- b) Law Number 32 of 2004 about Local Government has been substituted with Law Number 9 of 2015 about Local Government;
- c) Government Regulation Number 20 of 2001 about Building and Supervision of Local Government Organization has been substituted with Government Regulation Number 79 of 2005 about Building and Supervision of Local Government Organization;
- d) Government Regulation Number 8 of 2003 about Guideline of Local Apparatus Organization has been substituted with Government Regulation Number 41 of 2007 about Local Apparatus Organization;
- e) Ministry of Health's Regulation No. 1419 of 2005 about the Organization of Clinician and Dentist's Practice has been substituted with Ministry of Health's Regulation No. 512 about Practical License and the organization of medical practice.
- f) RI Ministry of Health's Decree Number 131/Menkes/SK/II/2004 about National Health System has been substituted with Presidential Regulation No.72 of 2012 about National Health System;
- g) Minister of Health's Regulation No. 1184/Menkes/Per/X/2004 about the Security of Medical Equipment and Household Health Provision has been substituted with Minister of Health's Regulation No. 1190/Menkes/Per/VII/2010 about the License of Health Equipment and Household Health Provision Circulation.
- h) Some legal foundation is used in the guideline for the organization of esthetic beauty clinic, while it has been void at that time, Minister of Health's Regulation No.920 of 1986 about Private Healthcare Service Attempt in Medical Area that has been substituted with the enacted one at that time, Minister of Health's Regulation No.84 of 1990 about Private Healthcare Service Attempt in Medical Area that has been substituted with Minister of Health's Regulation No.9 of 2014 about Clinic.

The constraints found with the implementation of law protection model for patients, viewed from the Program Executor aspect, include:

- a) Disharmony of jurisdiction between RI's Ministry of Health and BPKN related to predicate and position of beauty clinic's patients as consumers or patients.
- b) Less maximum supervision and monitoring conducted by Provincial/Regency/City's Health Department.
- c) Disharmony of local regulations about the organization of esthetic beauty clinic.
- d) Local government giving the license of esthetic beauty clinic operation and organization less selectively.
- e) Less maximum building and supervision over related Professional Organization (IDI).
- f) No regulation has been issued by Ministry of Education and Culture related to training and education institution

as well as certification and standardization for the operators in esthetic beauty clinic.

b. Context of Implementation

The trend and standard of beautiful women today includes glowing face and lean and/or slim body. Women become afraid of being old. It is relevant to a study conducted in China, finding that 80% of Asian consumers assume skin whitening to be the most important property of skincare cosmetics, and more than 50% assumes their anti-aging effect to be important [13].

Woman becomes the main target in this beauty clinic business, because of her wish to meet the standard beauty and to keep her skin health condition optimum sometimes by overriding her health and safety aspect. Some studies on women as the commodity of beauty advertisement found the following.

In consumer society, female body is formed as commodity, and placed at the centre of the consumption. In consumer society, female body, therefore, is a kind of investment according to capitalist ideology. Capitalist ideology bears like advertising, billboards, posters and TV fashion reality shows feature not only ideal body image, but also how to reach and consume those images. From the perspective of these mass media, women are portrayed to be tall, slim, young attractive and charming for social approval. These mass media, women are portrait to be tall, slim, young attractive and charming for social approval [14].

The culture of community as the consumers of beauty cosmetic should be evaluated, because if it is not followed with good knowledge and self-control it will be harmful to the self. Motivation to appear beautifully and interestingly is not enough, as it should be followed with standard healthy and safe, because majority women are obsessed with beauty and do any treatment by overriding the risk of skin cancer [15].

In consumer culture, woman with her body has a particular place. Her body thus located in the centre of consumption, defined as 'missing', 'flawed' and 'insufficient'. She can remedy these deficiencies and reach ideal beauty standards through only buying commodities for her body. To reach this changing beauty and fashion perceptions, women are inclined to buy commodities that are imposed by consumer culture [16].

The concept of body perfection is introduced to persuade people to undergo physical transformation [17].

What has been labeled a "body-changing culture" becomes popular and pervasive in many societies, and now includes the changes in nearly all body parts, particularly the most intimate ones, through a growing list of surgical procedures [18].

Appearing beautifully motivates the woman to undertake any body treatment. It is of course a personal right but it should be followed with a good understanding on the

meaning of beauty, to prevent the woman from undertaking any treatment by overriding its risk and consequence. All women are beautiful with their own uniqueness and affected with congenital genetic and cultural factors as suggested in the following statement.

Beauty face is a characteristic of a face giving a perceptual experience of pleasure, meaning, or satisfaction. Some evidence shows that a preference for beautiful faces emerges early in child development, and that the standards of attractiveness are similar across different genders and cultures [19].

The next factor is metrosexual phenomenon with its consumptive behavior today. Metrosexual men are women-oriented men [20]. Furthermore, a metrosexual man is described as the one love very much not only himself but also metropolitan lifestyle he undertakes [20]. The characteristics of metrosexual men, according to Kartajaya [21], are (1) generally living and staying in big cities, of course related to the opportunity of accessing information, intercourse and lifestyle undertaken and clearly affecting their existence, (2) coming from the have class and having much money because of high cost needed to support the lifestyle they undertake; (3) having urban and hedonistic lifestyle, (4) intensely following fashion development in men's fashion magazines in order to find out the latest fashion development followed easily, and (5) generally having smooth, dandy appearance and paying much attention to body appearance and treatment.

The next context of implementation is limited education and socialization about healthy and safe cosmetics conducted by local government and Food and Drug Administration at regional level, based on Article 3 of Presidential Regulation Number 80 of 2017 concerning Food and Drug Administration or BPOM. In addition, people are consumptive and select beauty clinic less precisely and are tempted easily with advertisement or closest people's persuasion, thereby becoming the patients of esthetic beauty clinic inconsistent with the related legislation.

4. CONCLUSION

The implementation of the legal protection model for patients of the aesthetic beauty clinic of patients in Indonesia based on the theory of policy implementation from Grindle that has not fulfilled the constitutional rights of citizen. Based on Content of Policy in the form of Interest Affected, Type of Benefits, Extent of Change Envision, Site of Decision Making, Programme Implementer and Resources Committed. Also based on the Context of Implementation, in the form of Power, Interest, and Strategy of Actor Involved, Institution and Regime Characteristic, Compliance and Responsiveness

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author is very grateful to Directorate of Research and Community Service of Directorate General of Research and Development Reinforcement of the ministry of Research, Technology, and High Education for funding this research, corresponding to the contract in fiscal year of 2019 Number: 718/UN27.21/PN/2019.

REFERENCES

- [1] S. Cheong *et al.*, "Asia Personal Care Cosmetics Market Guide 2016," *Book*, p. 234, 2016.
- [2] raharni budiarto, "Beauty Clinic Services and Using of Cosmetic for Beauty Clinic Attendees at Jakarta , Indonesia," *Int. J. Sci. Basic Appl. Res.*, vol. 4531, pp. 77–87, 2014.
- [3] K. Davis, "Cosmetic surgery in a different voice: The case of madame noël," *Womens. Stud. Int. Forum*, vol. 22, no. 5, pp. 473–488, 1999.
- [4] J. A. M. De Roubaix, "Beneficence , non-maleficence , distributive justice and respect for patient autonomy e reconcilable ends in aesthetic surgery?," *Br. J. Plast. Surg.*, vol. 64, no. 1, pp. 11–16, 2011.
- [5] S. J. MPR RI, "Undang Undang Dasar 1945," no. April 2007, p. 10, 2011.
- [6] M. S. Grindle, *The promise of good governance*. 2007.
- [7] L. O. Gostin, B. E. Berkman, and J. Kraemer, *Foundations in Public Health Law*, Second Edi., vol. 2. Elsevier, 2016.
- [8] S. Diana Sari, "PERLINDUNGAN HUKUMBAGI PENGGUNA KLINIK KECANTIKAN ESTETIKA BERDASARKAN PERSPEKTIF HAK KONSTITUSIONAL WARGA NEGARA," *Citizsh. J. Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 140–154, 2018.
- [9] S. L. Greer, T. K. Hervey, J. P. MacKenbach, and M. McKee, "Health law and policy in the European Union," *Lancet*, vol. 381, no. 9872, pp. 1135–1144, 2013.
- [10] E. Makarim, *Metrosexuals*. Pt. Rajagrafindo Persada, 2004.
- [11] S. Diana Sari, I. G. Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, and Pujiyono, "Government and Aesthetic Beauty Clinic's Responsibility in Fulfilling the Citizens' Constitutional Right to the Service of Aesthetic Beauty Clinic in Indonesia," *SHS Web Conf.*, vol. 54, p. 02003, 2018.
- [12] S. Diana Sari, I. G. Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, and Pujiyono, "The Factors Making the Law Protection for the Patients of Esthetic Beauty Clinic in Indonesia not fulfilling Citizen's Constitutional Right," *Med. Leg.*, vol. 19, no. 1, p. J, p252-256. 5p., 2019.
- [13] F. Business and I. Centre, *China 's cosmetics market*, no. June. 2015.
- [14] H. Dittmar and S. Howard, "Professional hazards? The impact of models' body size on advertising effectiveness and women's body-focused anxiety in professions that do and do not emphasize the cultural ideal of thinness," *Br. J. Soc. Psychol.*, vol. 43, no. 4, pp. 477–497, 2004.
- [15] C. Finger, "Brazil's cosmetic surgery industry is thriving, but why is beauty so important?," *Lancet*, vol. 362, p. 1560, 2003.
- [16] S. Ara, D. T. Journal, and I. Social, "PERCEPTION OF BEAUTY AND FASHIION AMONG YOUNG ADULT WOMEN IN THE," pp. 827–833, 2015.
- [17] N. Chaipraditkul, "AS I SEE IT Thailand : beauty and globalized self-identity through cosmetic therapy and skin lightening," vol. 13, pp. 27–37, 2013.
- [18] M. Berer, "Cosmetic surgery, body image and sexuality," *Reprod. Health Matters*, vol. 18, no. 35, pp. 4–10, 2010.
- [19] G. V. Cruz, "Journal of Psychology in Africa Cross-Cultural Study of Facial Beauty Cross-Cultural Study of Facial Beauty," no. November, pp. 37–40, 2014.
- [20] J. Empati, S. Triswidiastuty, Y. Franz, and L. Kahija, "Memahami makna menjadi pria metroseksual," vol. 4, no. April, pp. 58–64, 2015.
- [21] W. Rahardjo and F. Hasan, "Perilaku konsumtif pada pria metroseksual serta pendekatan dan strategi yang digunakan untuk mempengaruhinya," vol. 2, pp. 21–22, 2007.