**ATLANTIS
PRESS**

Reformulating Civic Education as Political Education in Indonesia in the Convergence Era

Yayuk Hidayah
Civic Education Department,
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia,
Bandung, Indonesia
yayukhidayah@upi.edu

Sapriya
Lecturer in Civic Education
Department,
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
sapriya@upi.edu

Cecep Darmawan
Lecturer in Civic Education
Department, Universitas Pendidikan
Indonesia
cecepdarmawan@upi.edu

Elly Malihah
Lecturer in Civic Education
Department, Universitas
Pendidikan Indonesia
ellyms@upi.edu

Abstract: The purpose of writing this article is to reformulate Civic Education as a political education in Indonesia in the era of convergence. The research method used in this article was the library research. The results of the study show; First Civic Education becomes an instrument in political education in the era of convergence. Secondly, to formulate Civic Education as a political education in Indonesia is basically not only meant to make the citizens possess the political knowledge and arouse political participation, but also to build citizens' awareness of their responsibility as citizens. Third, reformulating citizenship education as a political education in Indonesia in the era of convergence also means reintegrating the values of Pancasila in order to be integrated into the citizens' mindset and to let citizens aware of the ideology itself. Based on the research results, the author was able to conclude that citizenship education is an appropriate formulation as the instrument of political education in Indonesia in the era of convergence. Through this article, the authors recommend being able to actualize citizenship education not only for gaining the knowledge but also increasing the experience so as to empower the position of citizens in the country in the era of convergence.

Keywords: civic education, political education, convergence era

I. INTRODUCTION

Formulating Civic Education as political education in Indonesia in the convergence era is more than just a necessity. The involvement of the public sector in almost all forms of formal education activities is diverse and broad [1]. The results of research on the effectiveness of civic education and variations in the teaching methods used by teachers in America have resulted that Civic Education can influence democratic capacity only for students from less-privileged backgrounds and teachers who use broader teaching methods seem to hinder knowledge stimulation for this student [2]. Meanwhile, research on Civic Education in post-colonial countries in Africa resulted that African continent have experienced significant changes in the past 30 years related to democracy [3].

Another study on Civic Education resulted that this education is very suitable to strengthen civic activism because it is in line with the general objective of Civic Education [4]. Studies analyzing secondary school teachers in Missouri to determine the ideology of Civic Education show that the ideology of the stronger

conservative and liberal Civic Education is associated with a higher level of the system justification while supporting the teaching of more passive forms of citizenship. However, the ideology of critical Civic Education is negatively associated with the system justification and is aligned with the active forms of civic participation [5]. The position of Civic Education as a tool in "keeping" citizen recorded in history that the Civic deficit after world war two made the hope of democratic Civic increasingly sticking out. In Germany, the Institute was established to formalize Civic Education [6]. In Ethiopia, after nearly two decades of military dictatorship, Citizenship Education has been integrated into the school curriculum. A questionnaire survey of 179 randomly selected high school students shows that the Citizenship Education curriculum and the existing ethics are eclectic in character that combines a minimum interpretation of the democratic citizenship education with an inclusive concept of ethnic-cultural diversity that is relevant to multicultural societies [7]. Comparative study of educational experiences in Madagascar and the Sahel, West Africa takes conclusions about ways to draw inspiration for school-based citizenship education [8]. Meanwhile in Indonesia, the urgency of Civic Education is taught until higher institutions based on Article 37 paragraph (1) and (2) of constitution No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System.

The content of Civic Education, which is nearly close to Civic, is a concept related to the concept of social capital. In his research in Italy, Putnam (1993) positioned social capital as a key to democracy, Putnam's view of social capital was based on the concept of social capital from Coleman (1988) namely social capital from interaction [9]. In his dissertation, which analyzes Civic Education multidimensionally, Winataputra stated that firstly there are ontology of multidimensional Civic behavior and culture in Civic Education. Secondly, there are three paradigms in Civic Education, namely interactive, curricular and socio-cultural. The three components supporting intelligent citizens are devout, religious and civilized in the Indonesian context, namely Belief in the one and only God [10]. Meanwhile, a survey of 266 lower secondary education students in public elementary schools in Aveiro (Portugal) whose ages ranged between 12 and 16

resulted that students' perceptions in facing difficulties in learning Citizenship Education was organized in three dimensions namely conception, relevance, and classroom management [11]. More on the content of Citizenship Education, a research examining the relationship between citizen involvement and critical thinking skills of Malaysian students has proven that citizen involvement has an impact on students' critical thinking skills and their sub- domains can explain nearly half of the variance in critical thinking skills in the Malaysian context [12].

Based on these gap problems, the focus of this article review is how political education in Civic Education in the convergence era is formulated through two (2) formulations of the problem, namely: What is meant by political education? What is the content of Political Education in Civic Education? The argument underlying the novelty of this article is first on the side of the study. The emphasis of the study in this article is an effort to reformulate Citizenship Education as a political education in Indonesia in the era of convergence which is based on the inevitability of the process of developing Citizenship Education studies in Indonesia. The achievement of education depends on various mechanisms that influence the teaching and learning process [13]. Narrative thinking of political education in Indonesia in the era of convergence was covered by a digital political space framework which makes the Civic Education studies interesting enough as the political education. Democracy in Indonesia has revealed its existence [14] thus the digital political space in the form of participatory democracy, digital political space and interactive political communication needs to be approached by not abandoning the discourse of cyber democracy. The novelty of the second research is on the results of the study.

By the results of the study, the researchers hope to be able to answer the void of space in the studies of Citizenship Education as a political education theoretically and practically. Political education is not directly more veiled by taking the form of simulation but it can have many contradictory political implications [15]. The mediation of political education must be understood relational [16] in the Indonesian context. Article 1 paragraph (4) of the constitution number 2 of 2011 concerning Political Parties has provided the confirmation of the need for political recognition for citizens. Thus it becomes the responsibility of all people in realizing citizens who understand their rights and obligations in the life of the nation and state. Political Education can support the interactive dialogue that links the points between economic, race, and gender inequality for change [17]. Theoretically this research is expected to be able to contribute to the world of education, especially Citizenship Education in the Political Education and to update and consider the latest research theory to reflect the expansion of ongoing field [18]. Theoretical benefit is providing fresh air in the Citizenship Education study. Education should improve citizenship skills and political knowledge functioned as causal mechanisms that trigger

participation [19]. So the practical contribution in this article can be a reference for academics and observers of Citizenship Education in Indonesia. In addition, the results of this study can also be a reference for future researchers with the same topic, but with different points of view.

II. THEORETICAL REVIEW

A. Political Education

The definition of political education is different from defining education and politics. It is because between education and politics have different terms of meaning and purpose [20]. Mostly western people consider that political education is identically associated to indoctrination and totalitarianism [21]. Slightly, there are three aspects in political education. Those are political cognitive knowledge, affective aspects of citizen character's establishment, and psychomotor aspects citizen skills' development [22]. Based on this opinion it can be concluded that in defining political education the content of concepts and objectives is emphasized.

Here is the definition of political education in the constitution of the Republic of Indonesia "Political education is the process of learning and understanding of the rights, obligations and responsibilities of every citizen in the life of the nation" (Republic of Indonesia Constitution No. 2 of 2011 concerning Political Parties Chapter 1 Article 1 paragraph (4),n.d.). Meanwhile, some experts define political education as an organized, planned, ongoing, and continuous activity to reduce the values and norms of the country's ideology [23]. In line with Sumatri's opinion, another opinion revealed that political education is a systematic effort to form individuals into political awareness and to behave politically in achieving political goals [24]. Political education is an awareness effort to instill a set of values and attitudes that can be used for the public interest [25].

Based on the definition of political education, it can be concluded that political education is a structured awareness effort aimed to educate citizens to have political personality and awareness. In terms of form, political socialization is the most common form of political learning in schools [21]. Basically, the function of political education is to improve the citizens' skill regarding political life so that it will lead to the optimization of roles in the political system [26]. Practically political education aims to prepare citizens to be useful for themselves and to contribute to the growth and development of society in general [27]. Ideological differences are important not only for old attitudes and judgments, but also for creating attitudinal differences at the earliest stages of evaluation [28]. Political education is the right instrument in creating the ideal political life. The relationship of power, ideology, and identity become the core of inquiry in political discourse [29]. Political education is a strategic area in growing citizens' political knowledge in order to support the ideal political system[30]. It is due to the fact that in the context of political communication, there is a difference between political and general communication [31]. Thus, the

process of political education has one main dimension as 'learning by doing' [32].

Table 1: The Transmission of Values, Skills and Political Knowledge is Described by Harber

Political Indoctrination	Political socialisation	Political education
The intentional inculcation of values and beliefs as truths. The process may involve deliberately falsifying or ignoring evidence as well as presenting it in a biased way in order to achieve the desired end. Often associated with totalitarian states, i.e. where individuals have little access to alternative viewpoints.	The learning of preferences and predispositions toward political values and attitudes though often in contexts where orther viewpoints are available.	The attempt to create critical awareness of political phenomena by open, balanced discussion and analysis of a range of evidence and opinions. Has an underlying democratic ideology of political choice.

Source: [21]

B. Civic Education

Generally, Civic Education is a process that influences beliefs, commitments, abilities, and actions as the permanent members and the candidate in a community [33]. Recent research on Citizenship and Ethical Education (CEE) in Ethiopia reveals the need for improvements in some fields related to the current CEE curriculum [34]. Civic Education is considered as a way to get citizen's participation in government [35]. It must have a goal to be able to contribute knowledge about politics to students [36]. The aim of Civic Education is to create citizens who will participate in democratic processes [37]. There are differences in defining Civic Education. Firstly, it can be defined as a forum for learning about knowledge that contains political education and skills. Meanwhile other definitions stated that responsible citizens are the goal of Civic Education [38]. Based on this opinion, defining Civic Education is an instrument in shaping the ideal character in the democratic process. The point is Civic Education is designed to generate 'good citizens' even though the idea of what constitutes such individuals differs from one country to another country [39].

In the Indonesian context, the definition of Civic Education is contained in Indonesia constitution No. 20 year 2003 concerning the Education System that is an effort to equip students with basic knowledge and abilities in favor of citizen relations and education in the defense of the State to become reliable citizens by the nation and country. Meanwhile, Soemantri (2001) explained that Civic Education is an education that has a core of political democracy while other knowledge might be its supporting complement [40]. Based on these statements, it referred that Civic Education has a vision to make citizens be aware of their rights and obligations especially in governmental processes. The

results of studies that explore the relationship between different educational approaches in citizenship education among adult students in 13 European countries result that the students' citizenship knowledge shows a controversial relationship with various attitudes, while citizens' self-efficacy is consistently positively related [41].

C. Political Education in Civic Education

There is plenty of evidence to suggest that educating only concentrates on teaching and learning. Teachers believe that their task is to accommodate the social, emotional, and physical needs in order to grow up being utilitarian members in society [42]. Meanwhile, political literacy is a problem that has long existed within the scope of Citizenship Education. The article examining teachers' beliefs about the goals of Citizenship Education in 12 countries from Europe and Asia produces a single belief in understanding how teaching contributes to the development of students' citizenship. Teachers in various countries believe that it is important to encourage students' participation in schools or local communities more than to encourage their political participation in the future [43]. The biggest difficulty in the scope of citizenship is political literacy [44]. Regarding to the content of political literacy, in various countries, the package of political education is integrated in other subjects. In Turkey, the Social Studies Curriculum related to political literacy is taught in 5th, 6th and 7th grade [45]. Meanwhile, in the United States, Australia, Canada and Turkey, skills to be a good citizens is taught in Social Sciences [46][47][48][49]. In social sciences, students learn about history, forms of government, citizen rights (children's rights), and duties as citizens [50]. Meanwhile, the urgency of political education in citizenship education is in line with the realization of the ideals of smart and good citizens. Knowledge, skills, and attitudes are required to make every individual informed about politics and able to participate in public life [51].

The results of the analysis of three documents from the United Nations (UN) and Education, UNESCO which emerged over the past 5 years to frame the content and pedagogy of Civic Education resulted in the importance of reflectively constructing the values, assumptions, and strategies of policy makers in the objective domain, and educational applications for a variety of contexts, needs and conditions for local education [52]. In the meantime, in the UK the Advisory Group on Education for Citizenship recommends that school should educate students about the citizenship and democracy. The consideration of this recommendation is that there is no formal political education at school [53].

D. Convergence Era

In order to understand how and what the era of convergence is, some researchers argue that convergence is the result of changing society into a more modern direction. While others define convergence as a more efficient media chain management [54]. The word "convergence" has been widely used in various fields. Swedish National Encyclopedia defines convergence in

several fields. In the realm of mathematics, convergence is a movement towards certain values. In oceanography, convergence discusses horizontal water flow to an area. In medical field, convergence is the direction in the eye, which occurs when looking at objects at the close range. In biological field, convergence is illustrated in how the same biological structure has evolved from separated original sources. Nevertheless, the definition of convergence in biology continues to develop [54]. Meanwhile, in the field of media, convergence has triggered media organization namely the synergy of text, audio, and video material through the same cable, wireless connection, or optical fiber [55].

Based on the notion of convergence, it can be understood that convergence is a unified process with a platform change that refers to the efficiency and digitalization. The world is becoming more globalized and interconnected. As a result, there is an emphasis to ensure that the next generation can adapt and work in the novice global industry and that a new work environment needs to be emphasized [56]. The huge impact of globalization and digitalization occurs through its interactions, asa form of convergence [57]. Convergence as a process of information technology and telecommunications is now getting closer to people's real life [58]. A steady definition of convergence will continue to develop in various fields; this is because there are 5 reasons for difficulties in defining convergence. First is Polysemy which says that the term "convergence" has many meanings. The second is Polymorphism explaining that the concept of convergence takes a concrete form in every media market. The third difficulty is Complexity which means that convergence is a complex phenomenon. It is because of the profound implications it has on the fields of technology, business and others. The next difficulty is Instability explaining that convergence is a process that occurs over a period of time. The fifth difficulty is called Proximity which means the process of convergence in the media has been emphasized, accelerated, and multiplied by the impact of digital technology [58].

As a result of globalization, convergence has penetrated various fields of life. Building on this complementarity, several specific empirical directions are proposed for the directions of future research [59]. Convergence is not only about technology, but also about services, new ways of performing business and interacting with society [55]. Thus, human life is in a wave of convergence. The most obvious developments are on broadband internet, 3G phones, 4G cellular phones and digital television. The latest interesting example is the Apple iPhone released in 2007 that unites the capabilities of cellphones, iPod, web browsers and computer email applications all in one tool [60]. Responding to the development of the convergence era, on the other hand there are benefits of convergence that can be felt by humanity. Technology, Economics, public interest, socio-politics are the factors that will be influenced by regulation in the era of convergence [61].

In the economic field, the benefits of convergence include expanding access to promotion, encouraging the development of more efficient services, reducing telecommunications costs [62].

In the political field, the swift flow of convergence era has made social media affect the form of communication in society. Political skills in the use of social media will be the future study [63].Social media is increasingly being used in a political context [64]. While the formation of ASEAN as a reflection of the globalization process marked by international cooperation found that based on data from six developing countries in ASEAN from 2006 to 2012, the overall globalization index had a positive and significant impact on economic growth in the region. However, social globalization does not affect the economic growth. On the other side, inflation, infrastructure, education quality, technological readiness, and government spending also have a positive impact on economic growth [65].

The philosophy and epistemology of technology education are relatively unique because the subject focuses mostly on gaining specific knowledge of relevant tasks rather than having explicit epistemological disciplinary boundaries [66]. In the education field, the emergence of ICT has become a necessity in improving the quality of educational output. The case study of applying methodology in Lithuania results that this methodology is one of the example of the application of Research in Technology Improvementin Higher Education [67]. Various innovations in e- learning have presented new ways to gain knowledge, but on the other hand it leads to the imbalances in the learning process [68]. Digital convergence in education has presented cultural, social, ethical and economic gap that cultural, social, ethical and economic elements are important elements in teaching ICT to students [69].

III. RESEARCH METHODS

The research design is qualitative research especially a library research. The library research methodology consists of reading, analyzing, and sorting the literature to identify the main problems [70]. The library research methodology was descriptive that contains the similarities and differences therefore the author had the affirmation regarding to the position of writing in the form of rejecting, accepting or criticizing [71]. In this study, researchers departed from the data and then ended with the theory. Characteristics of the subjects in this study are library data which are related to Citizenship Education, Political Education and the Convergence era. The process of collecting data was done in two ways, namely distinguishing primary data and secondary data. Collecting the research data is in the form of library data that has been selected, sought, presented and analyzed. Data analysis was done by content data analysis, which is analyzing the message content of the data.

This study can be summaries from some sources, besides it has the organizational patterns and the combination of summaries and syntheses [72]. The literature review is an objective summary, comprehensive and critical analysis of available research and relevant non-research literature on the topic studied [73], [74]. The purpose of this study is to identify, critically evaluate, and synthesize all the literature on a particular topic [74]. Thus, the construction of new concepts can be built. It can inspire research ideas by identifying gaps or inconsistencies in the body of knowledge, therefore it helps researchers to determine or define research questions [72].

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

After conducting literature review, it can be stated that Civic Education is the right formation as an instrument of political education in Indonesia especially in the convergence era. The question of what is meant by political education in the Indonesian context can be discussed through the need of democracy in the current convergence era. Brownhill in Crick argued that the results of political education cannot be seen directly, but in a certain time, this is because political education is related to attitude or behavior [75].

In Australia, there is a strong and widely accepted belief that education and politics are, or at least must be, separated [76]. Political education will have a strategic position if it is placed in the digital era. In this era, political education has played a role in strengthening the citizens' intelligence in the case of information dissemination and efforts to improve politics. The existence of debate on deliberative and participatory democracy shows that a social movement has increased the responsiveness of the government which is being challenged [77].

Political education in Indonesia is viewed from both theoretical and practical perspective. Theoretically, the need for political education, especially in a democratic country, is an actualization of the need for participation in a democracy. Obviously, participation is the key to the formation of political democracy [78]. In addition, political literacy is an essential component in knowledge, skills and attitude [75] Crick further gave a suppressant that political literacy has a broad scope to make someone aware of her/ his position as a citizen. Crick emphasized that political education does not only about comprehending the political philosophy but also on personal abilities in communication.

The amount of information circulating in the community makes the need of political education important. It is also to avoid the high number of hoax. One of political activities that can be carried out through digital information media is political education [16]. With the existence of political education, it is hoped that people will become more intelligent and aware of the political consequences from the actions. Ideology produces contradictions between groups [79] so it is appropriate to be able to utilize political education instruments to optimize political electability and also to encourage

education for the community. Developing theories about the role of participation for democracy and juxtaposing them with competing theories of neo-liberalism and individualism can take the action to prepare better citizens in political participation [80].

Practically, political education related to the meaning of education. Education must be able to develop cognitive, psychomotor, and affective [81]. Thus, political education in Indonesia as a democratic country is in line with the ideas of the country itself. Political education is an educational attempt to realize political goals by equipping individuals with political awareness [82]. Based on its urgency, theoretical and practical aspects, thus political education in Indonesia is related to democracy. Political education and democracy are the efforts so that citizens can participate optimally in the political system [83]. Within this scope, between education and democracy provides understanding [82].

Comprehensively, the development of the era with digital devices can benefit the education world. The need for political education in a democratic country can be an evaluation in aligning the community's needs and policies. In Macau, there are three strategies in citizenship education policy, namely the governance of the state, the construction of moral and citizenship education, and social harmony as a new form of civic citizenship [84]. Aspects of political education in democratic countries are the keys in improving the democratic system. Education is consistent in relation to the better attitudes [85]. By maturing democracy in society, the people will not become the objects on the stage of the Democratic Party.

The next problem is how political education manifested in Civic Education in Indonesia. Previously, it is necessary to emphasize that each country has its own way of managing Civic Education. Each country has different policies regarding to the implementation of Civic Education [86]. The education system in various countries aims to bring political knowledge [45]. Specifically, on behalf Indonesian context, the replacement of the packaging for Civic Education has changed many times. In Indonesia, Civic Education has experienced many changes since the mid-1970s[86]. Philosophically and pedagogically is to facilitate students to be religious, civilized, united, democratic, inferior and harmonious citizens in multiculturalism [87]. Civic Education in Indonesia especially in this globalization era is a result of the wave of convergence in political education, value education, conflict resolution and multicultural nationalism [88].

In everyday life, politics cannot be separated. In general, in a cognitive development, students are the potential candidates on the political stage. Every country has a concept of citizenship based on the ideology of the country [89]. A study comparing the development of the Civics Education curriculum in China, the two Special Administrative Regions of Hong Kong and Macau which are increasingly under the impact of globalization found that elements of active and global citizenship

such as participation can be found in their studies in addition to the emphasis on national citizenship. In addition, the notion of global citizenship and dual citizenship starting from the local began to develop [90]. The formulation of political education in Citizenship Education in Indonesia can be done through the material mapping that can provide space in the partisan political phenomena. Citizenship education is considered to be the way to nurture good citizens who work to develop governance [35].

Political education in various countries has its own guideline and urgency. Croatia started with outlining objectives, then outlining tasks and finally providing a table of contents for the subject [91]. Furthermore, Canada suggested that for the Civic tests, all the questions should be about: rights and obligations as Canadian, Canadian democratic history, Canadian social and cultural symbols, and Canadian physical and political geography [92]. Meanwhile, Turkey utilized political knowledge and skills to be good citizens through social studies [45]. However, the mediation of political education must be understood relationally. Teacher as a community organizer has a significant rule to emerge the education paradigm [16].

Reformulating Civic Education as political education in Indonesia is inseparable from Pancasila as the state ideology. In reformulating Civic Education as political education, the researchers argue that this also mean to do integrative values on the Pancasila so that citizens can become individuals who are aware to the ideology. Pancasila as the foundation of the state in the realization of global citizenship is applied not only in schools, but also in everyday life [93]. Further, Kaelan emphasized that, based on the function aspect, Pancasila owned the position as the basis of the state as the finalist cause from the founding fathers [94].

The idea of political education in accordance with the basis of the Indonesian state (Pancasila) has the aim of creating a political atmosphere that is democratic, conducive and in accordance with the ideals of the state based on the 1945 Constitution in paragraph 4. Political scientists adopt a psychophysiological modality to investigate the political behavior and attitude [95]. Pancasila in the political education scheme becomes the foundation and the goal of political life in Indonesia. An ideological orientation can provide some efficient heuristics to guide citizens' political judgments [96]. Research that explores the effects of the Citizenship Education program on the level of citizens' trust toward the institutions of Dominican Republic believes that trust comes from the types of groups that conduct citizenship education in democratic countries and many of which are not politically or socially neutral [97]. Political Education that does not heed the values of Pancasila can affect the wheels of politics in Indonesia. By not being oriented to the values of Pancasila, the political stage will only become a land in realizing the personal interests of political actors.

As a flexible framework, the Five Pancasila principles were originally formulated under Sukarno's Leadership in the 1940s [98]. Pancasila is a word originating from Sanskrit which means the five principles of voluntary representing five principles of nationalism, humanity/internationalism, democracy, social justice and monotheism [99]. Historically, Soekarno described Pancasila in his speech in June 1945 [99]. Furthermore, the philosophy of Pancasila is attached to Bhinneka Tunggal Ika (unity in diversity) as the motto of the Indonesian nation was created by Mpu Tantular in the fourteenth century [99]. The history of Civic Education in Indonesia, is part of an effort to provide knowledge about their rights and responsibilities as citizens [100]. Further, Ki Hajar Dewantara emphasized that national education must be based on national culture [100].

Based on these findings, the researchers stated that in reformulating Civic Education as political education in Indonesia is to re-integrate the values of Pancasila as the state ideology as a manifestation of the unity among the educational goals, the state basis, state goals, and making Civic Education as one of the efforts to establish ideologically conscious citizens. In the future, investing in education to increase public support [101] with political education in accordance with the values of the Pancasila will achieve the ideals of conducive democracy. With this achievement, it can be ensured that the problems of the political camp will diminish and do not harm the country.

V. CONCLUSION

After reviewing the literature, the researcher can conclude that Civic Education is able to become a part of political education mission as a manifestation of one of the instruments of national education goals. Political education is a systematic effort to realize the ideal conditions of political goals. Furthermore, the content of Political Education in Civic Education in Indonesia is to integrate the values of Pancasila as the basis of the state. Through Civic education which is formulated as political education it will coincide with the creation of the ideal condition of a democratic country that is having the life of citizens who are politically conscious and have political personalities.

The appropriate political learning is by presenting a problem, because it will help students be more critical while dealing with problems. Theoretically, the implication of this article is expected to be able to contribute to the world of education, especially Citizenship Education in the Political Education Zone in the study of Citizenship Education in Indonesia. Meanwhile, the practical implication is that it can be a reference for future researchers on the same topic, but with a broader study.

Furthermore, the author through this article recommends to actualize Civic Education not only to the extent of knowledge but also to increase experience so as to empower the position of citizens in the country especially in the convergence era.

REFERENCES

[1] T. S. Dee, "Chapter 8 - Education and civic engagement," S. Bradley and C. B. T.-T. E. of E. (Second E. Green, Eds. Academic Press, 2020, pp. 103–108.

[2] J. Gainous and A. M. Martens, "The Effectiveness of Civic Education: Are 'Good' Teachers Actually Good for 'All' Students ?," *American Politics Research*, vol. 40, no. 2, 2012.

[3] L. J. Quaynor, "Researching citizenship education in Africa: Considerations from Ghana and Liberia," *Research in Comparative & International Education*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 120 –134, 2015.

[4] E. Susanto and N. P. Saylendra, "Civic Education as Empowerment of Civic Activism," in *Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018) Civic*, 2018, vol. 251, no. Acec, pp. 15–17.

[5] R. T. Knowles and A. J. Castro, "The implications of ideology on teachers' beliefs regarding Civic Education," *Teaching and Teacher Education*, vol. 77, pp. 226–239, 2019.

[6] A. Buck and B. Geissel, "The education ideal of the democratic citizen in Germany," *education, citizenship and social justice*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 225–243, 2009.

[7] T. Semela, T. Bohl, and M. Kleinknecht, "Civic Education in Ethiopian schools: Adopted paradigms, instructional technology, and democratic citizenship in a multicultural context," *International Journal of Educational Development*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 156–164, 2013.

[8] C. Antal and P. Easton, "Indigenizing Civic Education in Africa: Experience in Madagascar and the Sahel," *International Journal of Educational Development*, vol. 29, no. 6, pp. 599–611, 2009.

[9] D. Schulz, Wolfram, Fraillon, Julian, Ainley, John, Losito, Bruno, Kerr, *International Civic and Citizenship Education Study*. Amsterdam: IEA, 2008.

[10] U.S.Winataputra, *Disertasi: Jatidiri Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Sebagai Wahana Sistemik Pendidikan Demokrasi (Suatu Kajian Konseptual dalam Konteks Pendidikan IPS)*. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia., 2001.

[11] F. Nogueira and A. Moreira, "Civic Education – Portuguese students' perceptions," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 15, pp. 1771–1776, 2011.

[12] S. Ahrari, B. A. Samah, M. S. H. Bin Hassan, N. W. A. Wahat, and Z. Zaremohzzabieh, "Deepening critical thinking skills through civic engagement in Malaysian higher education," *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, vol. 22, pp. 121–128, 2016.

[13] F. Nogueira and A. Moreira, "A Framework for Civic Education Teachers' Knowledge," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 47, pp. 1179–1183, 2012.

[14] E. Saepudin, K. Suryadi, and E. Malihah, "Deliberative Democracy in Digital Era," *International Journal of Scientific & Engineering Research*, vol. 9, no. 4, pp. 859–863, 2018.

[15] N. Mirshak, "Education as Resistance: Egyptian Civil Society and Rethinking Political Education Under Authoritarian Contexts," *Critical Sociology*, p. 0896920519856398, Jun. 2019.

[16] M. Zavala and N. Henning, "The Role of Political Education in the Formation of Teachers as Community Organizers: Lessons From a Grassroots Activist Organization," *Urban Education*, 2017.

[17] R. O'Malley, "Pocket Political Education: A New Tool from United for a Fair Economy," *Labor Studies Journal*, vol. 44, no. 2, pp. 184–187, Nov. 2018.

[18] D. McQuail, "Mass communication theory: An introduction, 2nd ed.," *Mass communication theory: An introduction, 2nd ed.* Sage Publications, Inc, Thousand Oaks, CA, US, pp. xvi, 352–xvi, 352, 1987.

[19] M. Persson, "Education and Political Participation," *British Journal of Political Science*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 689–703, 2015.

[20] K. Affandi, Idrus & Suryadi, "Teori dan Konsep dalam Konteks Pendidikan Politik," in *PKNI4423/MODUL 1*, Universitas Terbuka, 2016, pp. 1–19.

[21] C. Harber, "International Contexts for Political Education," *Educational Review*, vol. 43, no. January 2015, pp. 37–41, 2006.

[22] Halking, "Aspek-aspek Pendidikan Politik dalam Kehidupan Demokrasi untuk Mewujudkan Kecakapan Warga Negara yang Smart and Good Citizenship," *https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/snh http://fh.unnes.ac.id*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 1205–1228, 2018.

[23] D. Sumantri Endang, *Pendidikan Politik*. Jakarta: Universitas Terbuka, 2003.

[24] K. Kartono, *Pendidikan Politik sebagai Bagian dari Pendidikan Orang Dewasa*. Bandung: Mandar Maju, 2009.

[25] E. O. S. Lyamu, "Citizenship education in Nigeria schools. Rationale and constraints.," *Nigeria Journal of educators*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 35–51, 1999.

[26] D. Z. Tarsidi, "Berfungsikah Pendidikan Politik di Mesin Partai Politik?," *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan,* vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 50–56, 2018.

[27] E. O. Oladejo, Azeez Olalowo&Oni, "Political Education and Community Development in Nigeria: Issues and Challenges," *Canadian Social Science*, vol. 13, no. 3, pp. 45–54, 2017.

[28] C. T. Smith, K. A. Ratliff, L. Redford, and J. Graham, "Political ideology predicts attitudes toward moral transgressors," *Journal of Research in Personality*, vol. 80, pp. 23–29, 2019.

[29] V. O. Gbadegesin and P. A. Onanuga, "The enactment of ideology and self-presentation in political campaign videos of the 2015 general election in Nigeria," *Discourse, Context & Media*, vol. 28, pp. 121–130, 2019.

[30] Nasiwan, "Model Pendidikan Politik: Studi Kasus PKS DPD Sleman, Yogyakarta," *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, vol. 3, pp. 459–482, 2005.

[31] K. Suryadi, "Perspektif Komunikasi," *MANAJERIAL*, vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 36–43, 1998.

[32] T. E. D. Tapper, "Political Education in Independent Schools: the traditional perspective reviewed and analysed," *Educational Review*, vol. 36, no. 2, pp. 142–147, 1984.

[33] P. Crittenden, J., & Levine, "Civic Education. In The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy. Stanford, CA: Center for the Study of Language and Information, Stanford University," *http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2013/ entries/civic-education*, 2013.

[34] B. Ghebru and M. Lloyd, "From civic to citizenship education: Toward a stronger citizenship orientation in the Ethiopian CEE curriculum," *International Journal of Educational Development*, vol. 72, p. 102143, 2020.

[35] T. W. W. Yuen, "Civic Education stuck in a quagmire: A critical review of Civic Education in Hong Kong?," *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 69–82, May 2016.

[36] W. A. Galston, *Liberal Purposes: Goods,Virtues and Diversity in the Liberal State*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

[37] I. Macmullen, "'Religious schools, Civic Education, and public policy: A framework for evaluation and decision,'" *Theory and Research in Education*, no. X, pp. 1–21, 2018.

[38] J. Westheimer, J. and Kahne, "Educating the 'good' citizen: political choices and pedagogical goals," *Political Science and Politics*, vol. 37, no. 2, pp. 241–47, 2004.

[39] A. Mouritsen, Per & Jaeger, *Designing Civic Education for Diverse Societies: Models, Tradeoffs, and Outcomes*. Berlin: Futures Working Group is a Migration Policy Institute Europe initiative,Robert Bosch Stiftung, 2018.

[40] N. Soemantri, *Menggagas Pembaharuan Pendidikan IPS*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2001.

[41] Z. Blaskó, P. D. da Costa, and E. Vera-Toscano, "Non- cognitive civic outcomes: How can education contribute? European evidence from the ICCS 2016 study," *International Journal of Educational Research*, vol. 98, pp. 366–378, 2019.

[42] P. Mertala, "Teachers' beliefs about technology integration in early childhood education: A meta-ethnographical synthesis of qualitative research," *Computers in Human Behavior*, vol. 101, pp. 334–349, 2019.

[43] F. Reichert and J. Torney-Purta, "A cross-national comparison of teachers' beliefs about the aims of Civic Education in 12 countries: A person-centered analysis," *Teaching and Teacher Education*, vol. 77, pp. 112–125, 2019.

[44] H. Davies, I. & Sylivia, *Political Literacy: Issues for Teachers and Learners. . In J. Demaine (Ed.), Citizenship and political education*

today. London: Palgrave/Macmillan, 2004.

[45] Ö. Kus, Zafer & Tarhan, "Political Education In Social Studies Classrooms: A Perspective Political Education In Social Studies Classrooms : A Perspective From Turkey 1," *Journal Of Theory and Practice in Education*, vol. 12, no. April 2016, pp. 464–483, 2016.

[46] Y. Keskin, "Türkiye'de ilkokul programlarında yer alan Sosyal bilgiler içerikli derslere ait öğretim Programlarının gelişimine tarihsel bir bakış," *Türkiye Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, vol. 12, no. 2, 2009.

[47] Z. Kuş and Ö. Tarhan, "Political Education In Social Studies Classrooms: A Perspective From Turkey 1" *Journal Of Theory and Practice in Education*, vol. 12, no. 3, pp. 464–483, 2016.

[48] N. C. for the S. S. NCSS, *Expectations of excellence: Curriculum standards for the social studies*. Washington, DC: NCSS, 1994.

[49] C. Öztürk, *Sosyal bilgiler: Toplumsal yaşama disiplinlerarası bir bakış. In C. Öztürk (Ed., pp. 1-31)*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık, 2009.

[50] Z. Kuş, *Politik okuryazarlık ve aktif vatandaşlık (Ed. Ebru Gençtürk ve Kadir Karatekin) Sosyal Bilgiler İçin Çoklu Okuryazarlık*. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık, 2013.

[51] Crick&Porter, *Political Education and Political Literacy*. London: Longman, 1978.

[52] E. V. Toukan, "Educating citizens of 'the global': Mapping textual constructs of UNESCO's global citizenship education 2012–2015," *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 51–64, 2018.

[53] E. Frazer, "Citizenship Education: Anti-political Culture and Political Education in Britain," *POLITICAL STUDIES*, vol. 48, pp. 88–103, 2000.

[54] E. Appelgren, "Convergence and Divergence In Media: Different Perspectives Convergence and Divergence In Media: Different Perspectives," in *8th ICCC International Conference on Electronic Publishing*, 2014, no. January 2004, pp. 237–248.

[55] J. O. Olawuyi and M. Friday, "Technological Convergence," *Science Journal of Electrical and Electronic Engineering*, vol. 2012, 2012.

[56] M. L. Scott and R. A. Cnaan, "Youth and religion in an age of global citizenship identification: An 18-country study of youth," *Children and Youth Services Review*, vol. 110, p. 104754, 2020.

[57] S. M. Lee and D. L. Olson, "The Impact of Convergence on Organizational Innovation," *Organizational Dynamics*, vol. 39, no. October 2017, pp. 218–225, 2010.

[58] L. Navarra, Elcha, "Media convergence," in *The Handbook of Global Online Journalism, First Edition*, no. January, E. S. and A. Veglis, Ed. John Wiley & Sons, Inc, 2012.

[59] A. Wieland, L. Bals, M. J. Mol, and R. B. Handfield, "Overcoming blind spots in global sourcing research: Exploiting the cross-sections between supply chain management and international business," *Journal of International Management*, p. 100709, 2019.

[60] Knowledge@Wharton, "Matching Technology to Consumers Demand," *http://www.upenn.edu/researchatpenn/article.php?1166&tc h*, 2007.

[61] Mortensen, M.J., "Beyond Convergence and the New Media Decision: Regulatory Models in Communications Law," *Canadian Journal of Law & Technology*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2003.

[62] C. Torre, M. D.L.,& Rush, "Key Regulatory issues in an Era of Convergence," *http://www.tmgtelecom.com/_PDFS/Key_Regulatory_Issues_in_an_Era_of_Converg ence.pdf*, 2006. .

[63] S. Zivnuska, D. S. Carlson, J. R. Carlson, R. B. Harris, and K. J. Harris, "Investigating the impacts of regulatory focus and political skill within a social media context," *Computers in Human Behavior*, vol. 91, pp. 151–156, 2019.

[64] S. S. L. Dang-xuan, "Social Media and Political Communication - A Social Media Analytics Social media and political communication: a social media analytics framework," *Soc. Netw. Anal. Min. DOI*, no. January, 2014.

[65] S. C. Suci, A. Asmara, and S. Mulatsih, "The Impact of Globalization on Economic Growth in ASEAN," *International Journal of Administrative Science & Organization*, vol. 22, no. 2, 2015.

[66] J. Buckley, N. Seery, D. Canty, and L. Gumaelius, "Visualization, inductive reasoning, and memory span as components of fluid intelligence: Implications for technology education," *International Journal of Educational Research*, vol. 90, pp. 64–77, 2018.

[67] E. Kurilovas and S. Kubilinskiene, "Lithuanian case study on evaluating suitability, acceptance and use of IT tools by students – An example of applying Technology Enhanced Learning Research methods in Higher Education," *Computers in Human Behavior*, p. 106274, 2020.

[68] P. Zahariev, N. Bencheva, G. Hristov, and Y. Ruseva, "ICT Convergence Challenges in Education and their Impact on both Instructors and Students," 2013, no. May.

[69] A. Serrano-santoyo and M. R. Cabrera-flores, "Channeling Digital Convergence in Education for Societal Benefit [Commentary]," *IEEE TECHNOLOGY AND SOCIETY MAGAZINE*, no. January 2016, pp. 3–6, 2014.

[70] G. Lin, "Higher Education Research Methodology-Literature Method," *International Education Studies*, vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 179–181, 2009.

[71] A. Prastowo, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dalam Perspektif Rancangan Penelitian*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media, 2012.

[72] A. Ramdhani, M. A. Ramdhani, and A. S. Amin, "Writing a Literature Review Research Paper: A step-by-step approach Writing a Literature Review Research Paper : A step - by - step approach," *International Journal of Basic and Applied Science,* vol. 3, no. December 2016, pp. 47–56, 2014.

[73] C. Hart, *Doing a Literature Review*. London: Sage Publications, 1998.

[74] M. Cronin, P., Ryan, F., & Coughlan, "Undertaking a literature review: a step-by-step approach," *British Journal of Nursing*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 38–43, 2008.

[75] B. Crick, *Essays on Citizenship*. London: Continuum, 2005.

[76] H. G.S., "The Politics of Education in Australia," *Journal of Educational Administration*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 3–16, Jan. 1970.

[77] D. Sofia, "When Social Movements Become a Democratizing Force: The Political Impact of the Student Movement in Chile," in *Protest, Social Movements and Global Democracy Since 2011: New Perspectives*, vol. 39, Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2016, pp. 167–196.

[78] E. Bahmueller, Charles F., Ed,; Patrick, John J., *Principles and Practices of Educational for Democratic Citizenship: International Perspectives and Project*. Washington: Office of Education Research and Improvement, 1999.

[79] K. D. H., "Ideological Call to Arms: Analyzing Institutional Contradictions in Political Party Discourse on Education and Accountability Policy, 1952–2012," in *How Institutions Matter!*, vol. 48A, C. J. A., Ed. Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2016, pp. 329–391.

[80] K. Matthew, "Why do young adults vote at low rates? Implications for education," *Social Studies Research and Practice*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 139–153, Jan. 2017.

[81] B. S. (Ed.). Bloom, *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives: The Classification of Educational Goals-Handbook 1, Cognitive Domain*. London: Longmans, 1956.

[82] S. Rohmat, Holish, Amarru, Iqbal, "Pengaruh Pendidikan Politik dan Demokrasi Bagi Generasi Muda Terhadap Tingkat Partisipasi Pelaksanaan Pemilihan Umum," in *Seminar Nasional Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang Volume 4 Nomor 3 Tahun 2018, 1191-1204*, 2018, pp. 1191– 1204.

[83] R. Kantaprawira, *Sistem Politik Indonesia, Suatu Model Pengantar*. Bandung: Sinar Baru Algensido, 2004.

[84] V. S. Kuan, "Harmonizing a melody?! A critical study of moral and Civic Education policy of the non-tertiary education system in Macao," *Asian Education and Development Studies*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 71–93, Jan. 2016.

[85] E. Ryan, "A cross-national examination of prejudice toward immigrants: the role of education and political ideology," *Journal of Aggression, Conflict and Peace Research*, vol. 8, no. 4, pp. 279–289, Jan. 2016.

[86] E. S. Nurdin, "The Policies on Civic Education in Developing National Character in Indonesia," *International Education Studies*, vol. 8, no. 8, pp. 199–209, 2015.

[87] U. S. Winataputra, "Multikulturalisme-Bhineka Tunggal Ika Dalam Perspektif Pendidikan Kearganegaraan Sebagai Wahana pengembangan Karakter bangsa Indoneia," *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan.*, 2008.

[88] B. Maftuh, "Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Pancasila dan Nasionalisme Melalui Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan," *EDUCATIONIST*, vol. II, no. 2, 2008.

[89] F. Lazzavietamsi, I. Affandi, C. Darmawan, and A. Ausop, "Pemikiran Politik Kyai Dalam Kewarganegaraan Indonesia," *Jurnal Moral Kemasyarakatan*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 46–54, 2019.

[90] S. Yudan, "Chinese Civic Education being globalised: What changes have been made in Civic Education curriculum in China, Hong Kong and Macao," *Social Transformations in Chinese Societies*, vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 37–63, Jan. 2019.

[91] K. Doolan and M. Domazet, "Political Education in Croatian Secondary Schools : an emergency reaction to a chaotic context," *Research in Comparative and International Education*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 210–221, 2007.

[92] C. W. Ruitenberg, "The Practice of Equality," *democracy & education*, vol. 23, no.1, p. http://democracyeducationjournal.org/home/vol23/, 2012.

[93] M. Murdiono, Sapriya, A. A. Wahab, and B. Maftuh, "Membangun Wawasan Global Warga Negara Muda Berkarakter Pancasila," *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, vol. 2, 2014.

[94] Kaelan, *Negara Kebangsaan Pancasila (Kultural, Historis,Filosofis, Yuridis dan Aktualisasinya)*. Yogyakarta: PARADIGMA, 2013.

[95] K. B. Smith and C. Warren, "Physiology predicts ideology. Or does it? The current state of political psychophysiology research," *Current Opinion in Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 34, pp. 88–93, 2020.

[96] J. A. Vitriol, M. R. Tagar, C. M. Federico, and V. Sawicki, "Ideological uncertainty and investment of the self in politics," *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, vol. 82, pp. 85– 97, 2019.

[97] S. E. Finkel, C. A. Sabatini, and G. G. Bevis, "Civic Education, Civil Society, and Political Mistrust in a Developing Democracy: The Case of the Dominican Republic," *World Development*, vol. 28, no. 11, pp. 1851– 1874, 2000.

[98] P. K. Gellert, "Optimism and Education : The New Ideology of Development in Indonesia," *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 371–393, 2015.

[99] I. Adams, "The International Journal of the History of Sport Pancasila : Sport and the Building of Indonesia - Ambitions and Obstacles Pancasila : Sport and the Building of Indonesia – Ambitions and Obstacles," *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, vol. 19, no. November 2014, pp. 37–41, 2010.

[100] A. Ubaedillah, "OF DEMOCRACY : LESSONS," *The Review of Faith & International Affairs ISSN:*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 50–61, 2018.

[101] E. N. Fobissie, "The role of environmental values and political ideology on public support for renewable energy policy in Ottawa, Canada," *Energy Policy*, vol. 134, p. 110918, 2019.