

# Fostering Religious Moderation's Perception in the 4.0 Era: Citizenship Education Challenge

Silvia Rahmelia *STAKN*  
*Palangka Raya Palangka Raya,*  
 Indonesia  
 silviarahmelia@gmail.com

Chris Apandie *STAKN*  
*Palangka Raya Palangka*  
 Raya, Indonesia  
 capandie@gmail.com

**Abstract—** Citizenship education and religious moderation intersect in state life aspect. Citizenship education that concerned in establishment citizen character both informal and formal institution, has a role to control the development of 4.0 Industrial Revolution so it can keep along with national identity. Then, the emergence of religious moderation term, which was initiated by Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs, marked the need to improve implementation of religious values by internalizing the understanding or perception about the difference. As this world's public space today tends to be dominated by radicalism, political identity, and exclusivity. Formulation of the problem in this study is "How to fostering religious moderation perception in the 4.0 industrial revolution era through citizenship education?". The method in this research is Systematic Literature Review (SLR). The results of this literature research show that citizenship practice changes as fast as technological developments occur. Perspective of citizens in participating becomes more open especially on social media platforms. This openness can be utilized for disseminated of religious moderation by digital platform. Citizenship education needs to develop themselves by delivering learners to a comprehensive awareness of diversity and Indonesia with the authenticity of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*. In the end, the understanding of religious moderation in citizenship education needs to be implanted along with efforts to fostering tolerant attitude in a multicultural education and tolerance education. Way of thinking on every citizens need to equipped with an understanding of diversity and tolerance in order to grow a good perception about diversity.

**Keywords:** *citizenship education, industrial revolution 4.0, religious moderation*

## I. INTRODUCTION

The 4.0 Industrial Revolution has transformed individual perspectives in many aspects of life. This transformation certainly affect religious aspects. These fundamental components need to be strengthened in order to harmonize 4.0 transformation so that's not deviated from religion values. Diversity as part of Indonesia's wealth has also been target aspect of implementation religious values in the 4.0 era. The emergence of religious moderation term, which was initiated by Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs, marked the need

to improve implementation of religious values by internalizing the understanding or perception about the difference. Diversity is certainly a religious issue, in the information technology era that brings openness in the opinion, nowadays diversity becomes the center of attention. This is as Fidiyani stated, the example form of diversity in Indonesia is religion. Indonesia is not a secular country, also not a religious country, but the recognition of religion by the state only includes only six religions, namely Islam, Hindu, Buddhis, Christian, Catholic, and Kong Hu Chu [1].

In addition, diversity becomes an important part as impact from disclosure of information in the 4.0 era, considering that religion has become a material political campaign. This is evidenced by many hate speech that tend to identity politics. Religious diversity is often assumed to trigger the occurrence of conflict in a majority group against the minority [2].

This issue is closely related to citizenship education in the digital age. Because in the digital age, the source of information accessed by citizens became unfiltered. Beside not all citizens are able to control themselves and apply good ethics in the use of digital platforms in this 4.0 era.

The emergence of various new habits that were born from the change makes a citizen feel free to speak anything and do anything with the sophistication. Exchange opinions and comments on social media becomes commonplace and seems to be a compulsory activity of a citizen to be recognized its existence in the industrial digitalization 4.0. But the problem is the substance and the way of a citizen in channeling opinions and expressing his curiosity. The rise of hoaxes and hate speech as example of the negative impact of digitization. Citizens have made it easier to spread the news of a lie or hate speech with a single touch. The less-than- wise dissemination caused an intolerant attitude to even radicalism. The reality of social life becomes possible to accommodate differences and diversity among humans. The new problematic that occur today are beginning with the reality that religious conflicts are seen as a phenomenon that real [3].

The connection with citizenship education is that a citizen's digital activity needs to be restricted by a citizen's ethics in social media. This ethical question is not only about how a citizen can wisely use social media, but even more about the substance in social media that should be full of positive values and civic virtues. These values can be the basis of fostering tolerance perception. As results of the research by Nisvilyah and Lely, stated that basic values of tolerance

among religious people are religious values and cultural values. Meanwhile, empirically consists of humanity value, nationalism, historical, role model by figure, and patience [4].

Citizenship education and religious moderation intersect in aspects of national and state life. Citizenship education needs to develop themselves by delivering learners to a comprehensive awareness of diversity and Indonesia with the authenticity of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*. While religious moderation emphasizes attitude. "In the Muslim-majority countries, moderation attitude for instance recognition of others existence, tolerant, reverence for disagreements, and does not impose the will in a violent manner" [5].

Industrial Revolution 4.0 has brought people to rapid technological developments, especially automation and digitization. Digitization replaces human resources that popular in Industrial Revolution 1.0 and 2.0. A revolution will certainly lead to fundamental changes in every aspect, including hard skill and soft skill. Through education, humans are educated, honed and trained to be able equalize of both cognitive, affective and psychomotor aspects. In the 4.0 era citizens were required to be able equalize the fulfillment of its rights and obligations as an individual, citizen, and also global citizen. Citizens should adapt to the disruption that brought by 4.0 industrial Revolution, including efforts to strengthen character of citizens. Ease of access wherever and whenever make citizens can freely download and upload something almost unfiltered and culminated to hoax. Therefore, it is necessary to anticipate the diverging understanding of civic values and national identity. Citizenship education that concerned in establishment citizen character both informal and formal institution, has a role to control the development of 4.0 Industrial Revolution so it can keep with national identity.

Thus this study focuses on scientific dialectics on "How to fostering religious moderation perception in the 4.0 industrial revolution era through citizenship education?"

Based on the introduction, the purpose of this research is to analyze then to provide information regarding the understanding and the perception of religious moderation in the 4.0 industrial revolution era through citizenship education.

## II. THEORETICAL REVIEW

### A. Industry 4.0

The 4.0 Industrial Revolution was introduced by Professor Klaus Schwab, a German technician and economist. Through his book *Fourth Industrial Revolution*, he mentioned that "today we are at the beginning of a revolution that fundamentally changes the way we live, work and relate to one another. The change was very dramatic and occurred at an exponential pace".

Today we are in the fourth industrial revolution that was triggered by the development of Information and Communications Technologies (ICT). Its technological basis is smart automation of cyber-physical systems with decentralized control and advanced connectivity (IoT functionalities). The consequence of this new technology for industrial production systems is reorganization of classical

hierarchical automation systems to self-organizing cyber physical production system that allows flexible mass custom production and flexibility in production quantity [6].

### B. Citizenship Education

Civic education in a democratic society most assuredly needs to be concerned with promoting understanding of the ideals of democracy and a reasoned commitment to the values and principles of democracy.

Civic education (also known as citizen education or democracy education) can be broadly defined as the provision of information and learning experiences to equip and empower citizens to participate in democratic processes. The education can take very different forms, including classroom-based learning, informal training, experiential learning, and mass media campaigns. Civic education can be targeted at children or adults, in developed or developing countries, and at the local, national or international level [7]. Citizenship practice changes as the technological developments occur. The perspective of citizens in participating becomes more open especially on social media platforms.

Way of thinking in every citizens need to equipped with an understanding of diversity and tolerance in order to grow a good perception about a difference

## III. RESEARCH METHODS

The method in this research is systematic review literature. Systematic Literature Review (SLR) is a term used to refer a particular research or methodology and development conducted to collect and evaluate related research focus on a particular topic. SLR research conducted for a variety of purposes, among which to identify, review, evaluate, and interpret all available research with the subject areas of interesting phenomena, with specific research questions relevant [8].

As explained by Wahono, step of SLR are:

1. Identify the relevant literature
2. Perform selection of primary studies
3. Perform data extraction
4. Assess studies' quality
5. Conduct synthesis of evidence [9].

Themes of the discussion in this research are about tolerance, diversity, religious moderation, and certainly citizenship education

## IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### A. Industry 4.0 and Citizens Way of Thinking

The 4.0 Industrial Revolution also affects education system in Indonesia. Digitization era and automation have opened the horizons of learning process become wider and limitless with such a multitude of learning resources.

The challenge of 4.0 industry revolution grows the complexities of a process from merely understanding and perception, but it's further necessary to involve analytical and problem-solving skills. Changes to the life aspects caused by

the 4.0 industrial Revolution include economic, social, cultural, educational, and political aspects. So, of course it's very impactful to the life patterns of citizens.

Advances in technology are causing automation in almost all areas. New technologies and approaches that incorporate physical, digital, and biological worlds will fundamentally change the life patterns and interactions of men [10]. Citizenship practice changes as the technological developments occur. The perspective of citizens in participating becomes more open especially on social media platforms. Communication openness due to the sophistication of technology is certainly causing a lot of information i.e unproven truth (hoax). Dissemination of information that's not legitimate and misleading of because it's too tendentious against a particular sides, causes citizens need to anticipate hate speech. For now, many social media platforms are dominated by exclusivity and extremism conversation. An understanding of spirituality sometimes split and not integrated with the perception of diversity. Whereas the divine values of God and religion are in line with the universal values that have every religion and also each ethnic society, whatever their places. Khotimah suggests that religions have the same view of the harmonious world that will materialize with attitude of tolerance [11].

Way of thinking in every citizens need to equipped with an understanding of diversity and tolerance in order to grow a good perception about a difference. It's not a prohibition in understanding religious values. Because in our Indonesia's legal religion, we surely know the religious moderation. So that harmony and tolerance between religious people can be a tools of unity, then the diversity must managed properly and correctly. Interfaith dialogues, could be an effective way. All this time, inter religion conflict religious occurs because of disconnection about an information between the religions to another so that arise negative prejudice [12].

The perception of religious moderation is more complete with multicultural education and tolerance education which usually inherent in citizenship education. Multicultural and tolerance is a concept that's not deepened in religious subject for school, because the practice of the two is more intense in citizenship education. Multicultural education is a pattern of education based on growing sense of tolerance to the diversity of culture and toleration of differences so as to establish a spirit of social inclusivity for the academic society [13]. While education tolerance is a solution to foster mutual respect, with tolerance education, it will be born a millennial generation who uphold those values in a nation's life and state [14].

## B. Religious Moderation in 4.0 Age

The spread of religious moderation needs to be transformed, especially in the 4.0 Industrial Revolution. This needs for understanding religious moderation should be disseminated especially among young generations who has a massive curiosity Their curiosity certainly must be based on scientific reason, so it doesn't deviate from the philosophy and values that are supposed to be. Therefore, understanding of religious moderation through digitization also needs to be controlled by the role of citizenship education.

Utilizing a digital platform can make it easy for citizens to exchange minds and search for insights. This will equip citizens with good knowledge of politics and the state, so that digital public space is not only the arena of contestation. As this world's public space today tends to be dominated by radicalism, political identity, exclusivity. Therefore, "digital canals need to be packaged in an attractive way to preach and spread religious moderation" [15]. The exclusivity of the majority group increasingly conical on digital channels, it is necessary to be denied with 'religious moderation', that disseminated on the digital platform. As Casram says "religious practices did not stop at claim stage of exclusivity ("I") that leads to a personal relationship with God (solitary), nor at the stage of Inclusifism ("you") with his attention to the recruitment of theological or ideological support (solidarity), but also the phase of openness ("We") where religious passion for humanity's values has been emphasized (humanist)" [16].

The exclusivity attitude of a group in digital channels needs to be equalize with a tolerance education and multicultural education. From there, each citizen's person is able to disseminate the concept of religious moderation through his perception in addressing differences. The digital channels of a citizen need to maintain ethics in issuing opinions in order not to offend certain people. Here is one example of tolerance attitude,

1. Does not impose a religion to others;
2. Not hostile to people who are different religions;
3. Living the pillars and the peace of our fellowmen and helping each other [2]

The religious moderation in the 4.0 era can be strengthened by implementing tolerance and multicultural education on digital channels. This thought has been strengthened by the research stated that "there was an influence between religious tolerance with positive relationship, which means that if the news of tolerance is high, so it will affect the attitude of high tolerance as well. The results of this research also explained the value of the coefficient of determination by 0.140 or by 14%, meaning news religious tolerance can be a variation of the tolerance attitude of 14% [17].

This means the attitude of tolerance can grow from our perception when reading news of religious tolerance. So, media that switched from print to digital certainly brought changes to the dissemination of information. Moreover, the media became an important aspect of the 4.0 industry revolution. Media as a change agent required to always responsible for its role as a distributor of opinion to the public. Therefore, news published by its media should be the benchmark in tolerance culture among people. It is the aspect of the sealing for each layer of society.

The role of media as a communication instrument contributes more to personal mobility even social community. It is impossible to recite that the growth of today's media has established a community mindset [18].

It is not wrong that religious moderation can flourish in the sophisticated 4.0 era. This sophistication must be utilized to disseminate the concept of diversity and un- exclusivity

rooted in Bhinneka Tunggal Ika. One of the important themes displayed by the media is tolerance, in relation to this issue is tolerance among people [19]. Thus the perception of citizens about religious moderation can be supported by the development of digital era.

### C. Understanding Religious Moderation in Citizenship Education

The 4.0 Industrial Revolution certainly also affects the education system in Indonesia. Digitization and automation have opened the horizons of the learning process to become wider and limitless with such a multitude of learning resources. Teaching and learning activities in the original class were conventional, caused by sophistication of digital industry 4.0, impact the teachers as the only learning source can switch into an unlimited digital learning resource.

Many learning resources will certainly not bring benefits if they are not properly filtered. Especially if the students are not equipped with the character as they should get in religious subjects and citizenship education. Religious moderation becomes one of the aspects that need to be implanted in citizens. So it will grow a comprehensive perception of diversity as a resource owned by Indonesia.

Multiculturalism, a concept often accomplished in mediating a distinction is often unsuitable in practice. Multiculturalism closely implementation with citizenship practice. Therefore, it is necessary to young citizens at a formal educational institution. As according to Suparlan, that multiculturalism is not just a discourse, but rather an ideology that must be fought because it is needed as a foundation for the strong democracy, human rights, and welfare. Multiculturalism requires a set of concepts that are building concepts using to understand and develop in community life, such as the concept of democracy, justice and law, cultural values and ethos, togetherness in equal differences, nationalities, volunteerism, ethnicity culture, religious beliefs, cultural expressions, private and public domains, human rights, community cultural rights, and other relevant concepts [20].

Citizenship education with the aim and vision to fostering the knowledge, character, and skills of citizens need to expand and deepen the scope in the practice of multicultural education. Bank explains that there are five dimensions in the multicultural education as follows. Firstly, the integration of education in the curriculum (content integration) which involve diversity in one educational culture that aims to remove prejudice. Second, knowledge construction is realized by knowing and comprehensively understand the diversity that exists. Thirdly, prejudice reduction is born from inter diversity interactions in educational culture. Fourth, pedagogic equality of man (equity pedagogy) that gives the same space and opportunity to every diverse element. Fifth, the empowerment of school culture as a pioneer in changing social element that unstable structure to an equitable structure [21].

Instilling a perception of multiculturalism as part of religious moderation dissemination, requires a dialogue theological approach. Religion is dogmatic, but its rituals will

never teach a bad one. So it's in treating our fellowmen. Fidiyani calls it a theological approach. Talks in formal or informal forms such as interfaith forums can be a dialogistic theological approaches, which are the methods through dialogue of normative values on each genre or religion. Therefore, there needs to be openness between each religion [1].

After implanting a perception of multiculturalism, which puts forward the thought that difference is necessity and tolerance become its glue, then for sure education tolerance which becomes one of the elements in Citizenship education has got a challenge. Because today's tolerance becomes more complicated in its reality. A slight splash of sentiment sometimes could lead to intolerant problem.

According to Widiyaningih, examples of mutual respect among people as follows:

1. Do not interfere with other religions that are in worship
2. Giving greeting speech to the followers of other religions that are conducting celebrations in their Great Holy day
3. Provide assistance to others who are struggling even if they've different religion from us
4. Do not playing with objects or words that are considered sacred another religion [22]

In the end the understanding of religious moderation in citizenship education needs to be implanted along with efforts to fostering tolerant attitude in a multicultural education. Appreciate the diversity of religion and ethnicity and keep it a citizen's duty. A citizen must uphold Pancasila and of course its own religious values.

### D. Fostering Religious Moderation's Perception in the 4.0 Era: Citizenship Education Challenge

The 4.0 industry that understand as the presence of a sophisticated technology eases humanity. The facility has changed citizenship practice to deliver community in a new cultural value setting. Irian to simplifies the challenge of the 4.0 industry; 1) readiness of industry; 2) trusted workforce; 3) the ease of socio-cultural arrangement; and 4) diversification and creation of employment and industry opportunities 4.0 ie; (1) ecosystem innovations; (2) competitive industrial base; (3) investments in technology; and (4) integration of small medium enterprises (UKM) and entrepreneurship [8].

Transformation in social culture's value also change the perception of citizens as person that exist in both real world and cyberspace. Simplifying everything makes citizen forget to apply ethics in cyberspace. This is why the hoaxes and hate speech grew out of the attitude of exclusivity, feeling that they were right and others outside their mind, so that extremism was born. The radicalism and religious extremism evolved from fanatical and absolute attitudes to an ideology. Therefore, it is necessary to be prevented by the education of multiculturalism which can be internalized in the learning of citizenship education. As Parech suggests that multiculturalism is not a pragmatic political doctrine, but a way of view in human life. It can be said that the fundamental essence of the behavior of multiculturalism is to understand

each other. As for the process of establishing understanding can be initiated by cohesively and social inclusion in the form of knowledge transfer by establishing effective communication with different individuals and groups of backgrounds [23].

Cyber-friendliness generated from the sophistication of 4.0 technology (internet of things era) should not be missed. As citizens of the country we must fill any gaps in the changes by promoting the etiquette of citizenship. The digital world needs to be utilized to generate peace and prosperity. Although it does not cover the possibility of it there must be some who are harmed and its reality to be contradictory.

Religious moderation is an effective formula in responding contemporary dynamics against intolerance, extremism, and excessive fanaticism that shreds the harmony of Indonesia. Citizenship education gets a new challenge to complement religious lessons by embedding the value of tolerance and awareness of diversity in this digital era. Citizenship education in this case doesn't take over religious education in addressing religious moderation in the

4.0 era, but in its reality as it says Ambar wangi stated that religious teaching emphasizes ritualism and -eternal life-orientation which lack of associating its effectiveness with the contextual case, potentially brings students to the divisive attitudes and behaviors [24].

An intolerant attitude which born from the exclusivity should not owned by student as young citizen because it's degrading and mostly not respect others beliefs. Then one more important thing is sometime they feel that the truest religion is themselves. So, it couldn't grow on young citizen perception. An example about tolerance for students as well as civic disposition/civic virtues is to not respond and despised accusations of the adversary [25]. This action may be a good decision for a citizen especially if it is exchanging opinions in the comments field. Cyberspace is sometimes shifted from the substance of the preaching spoken, people are actually busy responding to the accusation of not being blamed. Because of that, people must find the point of equality and do not expand differences that will eventually lead to social conflicts. The core problem is disputes or conflicts between people lies in unbelief and suspects each other [3].

Religious moderation in the 4.0 era is a concept that must be implanted in citizens through citizenship education as informal scope and civic education as formal scope. Education of multiculturalism and tolerance that has been existing and become a core component in civic education need to expand with strengthening of ethics and citizen's character of citizens in the form such as:

1. To avoid yourself/ourselves from an exclusivity attitude
2. Dare to accept the differences that exist as a necessity and be grateful for that as one of the wealth of Indonesia
3. Utilize the sophistication of technology for exchange thoughts and expand insight, rather than train yourself to blaspheme and exacerbate the atmosphere
4. Mastering technological devices and learning and use them to optimally so that be able to filter information on our single touch gadget

5. Empower yourself as digital volunteer through respective social media accounts in campaigning for tolerance among others.

## V. CONCLUSION

Diversity as part of Indonesia's wealth has also been target aspect of implementation religious values in the 4.0 era. This issue is closely related to citizenship education in the digital age. Because in the digital age, the source of information accessed by citizens became unfiltered. Beside not all citizens are able to control themselves and apply good ethics in the use of digital platforms in this 4.0 era.

The connection with citizenship education is that a citizen's digital activity needs to be restricted by a citizen's ethics in social media. This ethical question is not only about how a citizen can wisely use social media, but even more about the substance in social media that should be full of positive values and civic virtues.

The spread of religious moderation needs to be transformed, especially in the 4.0 Industrial Revolution. This needs for understanding religious moderation should be disseminated especially among young generations who has a massive curiosity. Their curiosity certainly must be based on scientific reason, so it doesn't deviate from the philosophy and values that are supposed to be. Therefore, understanding of religious moderation through digitization also needs to be controlled by the role of citizenship education.

Religious moderation in the 4.0 era is a concept that must be implanted in citizens through citizenship education as informal scope and civic education as formal scope. Education of multiculturalism and tolerance that has been existing and become a core component in civic education need to expand with strengthening of ethics and citizen's character of citizens in the form such as (1) To avoid yourself/ourselves from an exclusivity attitude; (2) Dare to accept the differences that exist as a necessity and be grateful for that as one of the wealth of Indonesia; (3) Utilize the sophistication of technology for exchange thoughts and expand insight, rather than train yourself to blaspheme and exacerbate the atmosphere; (4) Mastering technological devices and learning and use them to optimally so that be able to filter information on our single touch gadget; (5) Empower yourself as digital volunteer through respective social media accounts in campaigning for tolerance among others.

## REFERENCES

- [1] F. Rini, "Kerukunan umat beragama di Indonesia (Belajar Keharomonisan dan Toleransi Umat Beragama Di Desa Cikakak, Kec. Wangon, Kab. Banyumas,," *J. Din. Huk.*, vol. 13, no. 3, 2013.
- [2] Revinna Ornela Kartini, Junaidi Indrawadi, Isnarmi, and Fatmariza, "Toleransi dalam keberagaman di sekolah mayoritas budha (Studi di SD Manjushri Padang)," *JCE*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2019.
- [3] Siti Faridah, "Kebebasan Beragama dan Ranah Toleransi," *Lex Sci.*, vol. 2, no. 2, 2018.
- [4] Nisvlyah dan Lely, "Toleransi antarumat beragama dalam memperkokoh persatuan dan kesatuan bangsa (studi kasus umat islam dan kristen dusun segaran kecamatan dlanggu kabupaten mojokerto)," *Pendidik. Kewarganegaraan*, vol. 2, no. 1, p. <http://ejournal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/jurnal-pendi>, 2013.
- [5] A. Masykuri, "Meneguhkan moderasi beragama," *UIN Syarif Hidayatullah*, 2015.
- [6] A. Rojko, "Industry 4.0 Concept: Background and Overview,," *Int. J.*

- Interact. Mob. Technol., vol. 11, no. 5, 2017.
- [7] McCracken, "Civic Education." [Online]. Available: <https://www.youthpower.org/resources/civic-education>. [Accessed: 25-Jun-2019].
- [8] Lusiana dan M. Suryani, "Metode SLR untuk Mengidentifikasi Isu-Isu dalam Software Engineering," *Sains dan Teknol. Inf.*, vol. 3, no. 1, 2014.
- [9] Romi Satria Wahono, "A Systematic Literature Review of Software Defect Prediction: Research Trends, Datasets, Methods and Frameworks," *J. Softw. Eng.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 1–16, 2015.
- [10] Irianto, "Industry 4.0; The Challenges of Tomorrow," 2017.
- [11] R. Tjandrawina, "Industry 4.0: Industrial Revolution of The Century and Its Influence on Health and Biotechnology," *Medicine (Baltimore)*, vol. 29, no. 1, 2016.
- [12] Khotimah, "Agama dan Civil Society," *J. Ushuluddin*.
- [13] Nazmudin, "Kerukunan dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama dalam Membangun Keutuhan Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia (NKRI)," *J. Gov. Civ. Soc.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 23–39, 2017.
- [14] W. R. Jati, "Toleransi beragama dalam pendidikan multikulturalisme siswa sma katolik sang timur Yogyakarta," *Cakrawala Pendidik.*, vol. XXXIII, no. 1, p. garuda.ristekdikti.go.id, 2014.
- [15] E. Sugianto, "Pendidikan Toleransi Beragama bagi Generasi Milenial," *J. Misykat Al-Anwar Kaji. Islam dan Masy.*, vol. 30, no. 1, 2019.
- [16] D. K. Winata, "Moderasi Beragama Harus Didigitalisasi," 2019. [Online]. Available: <https://mediaindonesia.com/read/detail/220167-moderasi-beragama-harus-didigitalisasi>.
- [17] Casram, "Membangun Sikap Toleransi Beragama dalam Masyarakat Plural," *Wawasan J. Ilm. Agama dan Sos. Budaya*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2016.
- [18] S. Paramitha, Suha, "Pengaruh Berita Toleransi Beragama di Media Online terhadap Sikap Toleransi Siswa," *J. Bid. Ilmu Sos. dan Ilmu Polit.*, vol. 6, 2019.
- [19] Eko Digdoyo, "Kajian Isu Toleransi Beragama, Budaya, dan Tanggung Jawab Sosial Media. Jurnal Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan," *J. Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan*, vol. 3, no. 1, 2018.
- [20] Triyono Lukmantoro, "Retorika Media tentang Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama," *J. Ilmu Sos.*, vol. 13, no. 2, 2014.
- [21] P. Suparlan, "Paradigma Naturalistik dalam Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kualitatif dan Penggunaannya," *Antropol. Indones.*, vol. 21, no. 53, pp. 1–16, 2014.
- [22] Sopiiah, "Pendidikan Multikultural dalam Pendidikan Islam," *Forum Tarb.*, vol. XIII, no. 1, 2009.
- [23] R. Widyastuti, *Kebaikan Akhlak dan Budi Pekerti*. Semarang: Sindur Press, 2010.
- [24] B. Parekh, *Rethinking Multiculturalism*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2010.
- [25] Ambarwangi, "Pendidikan Multikultural di Sekolah Melalui Pendidikan Seni Tradisi," *Harmonia*, vol. XIII, pp. 78–85, 2013.