

# Recruitment/Regeneration Function of Political Party in Indonesian Local Elections

Junaidi Junaidi\*

Lecturer at the Faculty of Law

Riau University

Pekanbaru, Indonesia

\*junaidi.fhur@gmail.com

**Abstract**—Political parties as pillars of democracy need to be organized and refined to realize a democratic political system, especially to realize good governance, both at the center and in the regions. This paper seeks to examine the relationship between the function of recruitment / regeneration of political parties with the phenomenon of the minimal number of pairs of regional head candidates that occur in several regions in Indonesia. In practice political parties have not optimally carried out the recruitment / regeneration function, this has been seen in the implementation of the local elections so far. There are at least two things that are the reasons; first, political parties still tend to recruit candidates who are not members of the political parties. Secondly, the emergence of regions that hold regional elections is only followed by one pair of candidates and also supported by many political parties.

**Keywords:** *political party, democracy*

## I. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia has chosen a democratic system as a way to manage its state of life. As stated in Article 1 paragraph (2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (1945 Constitution) that "Sovereignty is in the hands of the people and implemented according to the Constitution". Therefore, political parties are placed as one of the important instruments in the realization of national democracy. It cannot be denied that political parties are pillars of the democratic system. Without political parties, democracy cannot work and work, or it can also be said that the functioning and functioning of a democratic state of life is very dependent on the existence of political parties. With a political party, people's aspirations and desires can be channeled and fought for [1].

As mandated by the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, freedom of association, assembly and expression of opinion is a human right that must be implemented to strengthen the spirit of nationalism in the democratic Republic of Indonesia. The right to associate and gather is then manifested in the formation of political parties as one of the pillars of democracy in the Indonesian political system [2].

Almost every literature states that a democratic political system is a mandatory prerequisite that must be able to facilitate the life of a political party that is free, autonomous,

and competitive, or in other words to create a democratization of political parties requires that the democratization of a political system first requires. In a non-democratic political system, the life of political parties is generally not free, not autonomous, and uncompetitive. But even if the existing political system has been relatively democratic, in the course of a representative democracy not only requires the presence of political parties, but also demands that political parties contribute positively and constructively to the realization of quality representative democracy practices, meaning that the actions of political parties are variables that influence quality of democracy. If political parties carry out their roles and functions properly, the quality of democracy will be good, and vice versa. In a representative democracy system, the condition of political parties is a barometer of the quality of democratic practices in general [3].

Political parties as pillars of democracy need to be organized and refined to realize a democratic political system to support an effective presidential system. The structuring and refinement of political parties is directed at two main things, namely, first, to form a patterned or systemic attitude and behavior of political parties to form a political culture that supports the basic principles of a democratic system. This is indicated by the attitudes and behavior of political parties that have an adequate selection and recruitment system for membership and develop a strong cadre and political leadership system. Second, maximizing the functions of political parties both the functions of political parties against the state and the functions of political parties that are effective in producing cadres of prospective leaders who have political abilities [4].

Leadership and political parties are like two sides of a coin. Political parties proceed to come to power which will then lead the public policy making process. This, destroys political parties to prepare prospective leaders who are expected to be able to regulate the course of government [5]. Therefore, this paper will discuss how the role should be carried out by political parties in carrying out the recruitment and regeneration functions in local elections.

## II. RESEARCH METHODS

This study aims to determine the application of recruitment and regeneration functions in political parties in Indonesian Local Elections. Therefore, the method used in this research is literature review with document studies that discuss recruitment and regeneration in political parties. The analysis was carried out with the aim of finding out to what extent political parties implemented recruitment and regeneration functions in their political parties.

## III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### A. Definition of Political Parties

Etymologically, Maurice Duverger mentions that the word party comes from the Latin 'pars', which means "part". With this understanding, it can be understood that because it is a part there must be other parts. Therefore, to fulfill this understanding, ideally it is not possible in a country if there is only one party [6].

Jimly Asshiddiqie said that the party also came from an English part, which means part or class. The word party refers to the group as a group of people based on certain similarities such as goals, ideology, religion, and even interests. The grouping takes the form of general organization, which can be distinguished according to the area of activity, such as community organizations, religious organizations, youth organizations, and political organizations. In its development, said the party is more associated with political organizations, namely community organizations engaged in politics [7]. Then according to Inu Kencana Syafii, the word 'politics', etymologically derived from Arabic from the word *Siyasyah* which was then translated into tactics, or in English called politics [8].

Thus, the understanding of political parties according to Miriam Budiardjo, in general is an organized group whose members share the same orientation, values and ideals. The purpose of this group is to gain political power and seize political position (usually) by constitutional means to carry out its programs.

Furthermore, according to Carl J. Friedrich, A political party is a group of human beings, stably organized with the objectives of securing of maintaining for its leaders the control of a government, with the further objectives of giving to members of the party, through such ideal control and material benefits and advantages [9].

According to R.H Soltau, "Political parties are a group of citizens who are more or less organized, who act as a political entity and who use their power to choose to control the government and carry out their public policy" (A group of citizens more or less voting power, aim to control the government and carry out their general policies) [10].

Joseph Schumpeter in his book *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy* states that political parties are, "... is a group whose members propose to act in concert in the competitive struggle for power ... Party and machine politicians are simply the response to the fact that the electoral mass is incapable of action other than in a stampede, and the constitute an attempt to

regulate political competition exactly similar to the corresponding practice of a trade association [11].

William Crotty and Ricard S Kartz, define political parties as an autonomous group of citizens whose purpose is to run in elections and compete in elections in the hope of gaining power over government through the power of public offices and government organizations [12].

While the understanding of political parties in Article 1 number 1 of Law no. 2 of 2008, concerning Political Parties, stated that: "Political parties are organizations that are national in nature and are formed by a group of Indonesian citizens voluntarily on the basis of the common will and ideals to fight for and defend the political interests of members, society, nation and state, and maintain the integrity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia based on the Pancasila and the Law -Basic grounds of the Republic of Indonesia in 1945".

From some of the above meanings, it can generally be concluded that a political party is an official political organization formed by people who have the same interests in order to control the government by placing their members in the government through an electoral mechanism.

### B. Function of Political Parties

Many opinions expressed about the functions of political parties. For example Monte Palmer said that the function of political parties in developing countries is to provide support for a stable mass base, a means of integration and mobilization, and to maintain the continuity of political life [13]. Meanwhile according to Roy C. Marcridis, the function of political parties is as a representation (representation), articulating the interests and expressions of political parties for the interests they represent, conventions and aggregations; transformation from the input process into output, integration, persuasion, repression, recruitment and election of leaders, consideration and formulation of public policies, and control of the government [14].

Meanwhile, according to Ramlan Surbakti, political parties have a function [15]:

- First, the function of the articulation of interests, namely the process of inputting various needs, demands and interests through group representatives who are included in the legislative body, so that the interests, demands and needs of the group can be represented and protected in making public policies.
- Second, the function of aggregation of interests. Aggregation of interests is the way in which demands made by different groups are combined into alternatives for public policy making. Aggregation of interests is carried out in a political system that does not allow open party competition.
- Third, the function of political socialization. This function is a way to introduce the political values that apply or are adopted by a country. Formation of political attitudes or in other words to form a political attitude and belief requires a long time through a process that lasts endlessly. Fourth, the function of

political recruitment. Political recruitment is a process of selection or recruitment of group members to represent their groups in administrative and political positions.

- Fifth, the function of political communication. Political communication is one of the functions carried out by political parties with all the available structures, namely carrying out communication of information, political issues and ideas to the public.

On the other hand, Miriam Budiardjo, distinguishes the functions of political parties in democratic countries and in authoritarian countries [16]. In democratic countries political parties can relatively carry out their functions according to their dignity at the time of their birth, which is a vehicle for citizens to participate in the management of state life and fight for interests before the authorities. On the contrary, in an authoritarian country, the party cannot show its dignity, but rather carries out the will of the ruler.

So, according to Miriam Budiardjo, in a democratic country, there are four functions of political parties, namely [16]:

- First, as a means of political communication. As a means of political communication, parties play a very important role in the effort to articulate interests (political interests) that are or sometimes are hidden in society. These various interests are best absorbed by political parties into ideas, visions and policies of the political parties concerned. After that, ideas and policies or policy aspirations are advocated so that they can be expected to influence or even become official state policy material.
- Second, as a means of political socialization. Related to this political socialization, the party also plays a very important role in the framework of political education. The party is the intermediate structure which must play a role in grounding the ideals of state in the collective awareness of the citizens of the community.
- Third, as a means of political recruitment. The party formed was intended to be a legitimate vehicle for selecting cadres of state leaders at certain levels and positions. Some of the cadres are elected directly by the people, some are chosen through indirect means, such as by the House of Representatives, or through other indirect means.
- Fourth, as a means of regulating conflict (conflicts management). Values (values) and interests (interests) that grow in people's lives are very diverse, complicated, and tend to compete with each other and collide with each other. If there are many political parties, the diverse interests can be channeled through the polarization of political parties that offer ideologies, programs and alternative policies that differ from one another. In other words, as the party's conflict management (conflict management), it acts as a means of aggregating interests that channel different types of interests through the channel of political institutions.

There are some differences related to the functions of political parties according to the experts that have been described above, but according to the focus of the study in this paper, from several functions of political parties, the author will only discuss two functions, namely the recruitment function and regeneration function.

1) *Recruitment / cadreization function*: One function of political parties is as a means of political recruitment. Without political recruitment, political parties do not have reliable members or figures in various political activities. The recruitment function is considered to have a relationship with how a political party encompasses a person or group of people as a political cadre, also related to how a person, both from "in group" and "out group" becomes party leader or national leader (president or vice president).

Rush & Althof defines political recruitment as, "The process by which individuals guarantee or register themselves to occupy a position [17]. Furthermore Rush & Althof recruitment or recruitment is a two-way process, and can be formal or informal. It is said to be a two-way process, because individuals may be able to get a chance, or may be approached by others and get certain positions. In the same way recruitment can be formal if individuals are openly recruited through procedural and institutional methods of selection. Then called informal, when individuals are recruited *prive* (alone) or "under the hand" without passing through or very little through institutional means".

Meanwhile, Ramlan Surbakti stated that political recruitment is, selection and selection or appointment of a person or group of people to carry out a number of roles in the political system in general and government in particular. Recruitment is a continuation of the function of seeking and maintaining strength and also looking for and inviting talented people to actively participate in political activities as party members [15].

According to Gabriel Almond, the recruitment process is an opportunity for the people to select political activities and government positions through appearances in communication media, become members of organizations, run for certain positions, education and training [18]. While Jack C. Plano interpreted that the recruitment process as the selection of people to fill roles in social systems. Whereas political recruitment refers to filling in formal and legal positions, as well as informal roles. For formal positions, such as filling the positions of president and parliamentarians, while the informal ones are the recruitment of activists and propaganda [19].

Recruitment is defined as the process in which individuals or groups of individuals are involved in active political roles. Understanding such recruitment is relatively general. Specifically in the political context political recruitment often refers to candidate selection (candidacy), legislative and executive recruitment. In the general sense of recruitment includes how the party recruits members. While in the context of political recruitment, it is generally related to the electoral system and the prevailing political system, specifically for filling positions as legislative and executive members.

Therefore, in outline the recruitment function carried out by political parties can be divided into three forms, namely:

- First, Recruitment of members and volunteers. One of the absolute requirements that must be fulfilled by a political party in order to be recognized by the state as a political party is to have a certain minimum membership. Therefore, membership recruitment is the main requirement that must be met. All political parties basically have nothing to limit their membership. Recruitment is done openly.
- Second, Recruitment of management and staff. The recruitment of party officials and staff has more stringent criteria and selection processes than the recruitment of members. The criteria and selection process for party administrators is carried out through a conference or large party meeting which involves the old management and / or party members. The recruitment of management is needed for its internal interests, where each party needs qualified cadres. This is reasonable because only with such cadres can he become a party that has a greater opportunity to develop himself. By having good party cadres, political parties will not be difficult to determine their own leaders and have the opportunity to nominate candidates to enter the national leadership exchange.
- Third, Recruitment of candidates for public officials. The recruitment of candidates for public officials by political parties basically opens up equal opportunities to enter, compete (compete), and may occupy political and governmental positions for every citizen. After that, there will be certain requirements that must be met by individuals who want to be recruited as candidates. This requirement is applied by political parties with objective, rational considerations, in accordance with applicable regulations. Of course not all positions can be filled by the role of political parties as a means of political recruitment. Professional positions in the field of civil servants, and others that are not political (potential appointment), may not involve the role of political parties. Parties may only be involved in filling political positions and therefore require the appointment of officials through political procedures as well (political appointments).

Some theories state that candidate selection is the key and decisive stage. Because the recruitment process will produce people who will be the people's representatives and who will govern. These results depend on the recruitment process used, usually including three stages, namely the certification, nomination and selection stages. The certification stage is the initial stage or definition, which includes determining the desired criteria, internal party rules, electoral rules, and social norms. While the nomination stage relates to the availability (party cadres) who fulfill the requirements and positions to be filled. The next stage relates to the selection process, which generally relates to how to vote, who is involved to vote, and how to determine who will win.

Regarding the grounds or reasons for a political recruitment, Barbara Geddes classifies the recruitment system into four models [20]:

- First, Partisanship, which is political recruitment from political parties which are judged on the basis of loyalty to the party and trying to collect partisans. This model pays little attention to competencies.
- Second, meritocratic, namely political recruitment from among those who have high competencies such as technocrats, entrepreneurs, teachers, expert workers, and others.
- Third, compartmentalization, namely political recruitment based on meritocratic appointment of information for positions considered important for pragmatic success, while at the same time making it possible to use other appointments for short-term support and the development of loyal followers.
- Fourth, survival, namely political recruitment based on the principle of reciprocity and applicant resources and tend to be patronage.

2) *Regeneration*: Cadre formation in any organization is the pulse for an organization. Cadre formation is the process of preparing human resources (HR) so that later they become leaders who are able to build the role and function of the organization better. In cadre training, there are two important issues [21]:

- First, how the efforts made by the organization to increase the ability of both skills and knowledge.
- Secondly, is the ability to provide a cadre stock or organizational HR, and is especially focused on young people.

In general, regeneration is related to how political parties will "foster" their cadres, by encouraging the birth of cadres who have abilities, both political, organizational, and leadership abilities. Cadre formation is related to how political party organizations prepare human resources who will work for the party, will lead the party and will be a source of political recruitment in filling political positions.

The application of good and sustainable cadre formation patterns in the recruitment of political parties will certainly have an impact on the quality of the cadres produced by the political parties. Basically, the format of the party cadre system must be arranged as well as possible. Ideally this cadre system must be able to prepare and project political party cadres as future leaders. Cadre preparation to fill party structure positions, executive positions in government, and legislative positions in the representative council must be arranged in accordance with the orientation of his political career, so that no more politicians who hold concurrent positions in the government as well as administrators of the party structure and involve a large number of family members in political offices.

With a good and sustainable cadre formation pattern, cadres of political parties will be ready to be nominated in general elections both DPR / DPRD members and regional / head of state elections. Although it cannot be denied that each party has

its own way of doing its regeneration patterns. Based on ideology, for example, religious-based parties will certainly have different patterns from nationalist parties. Likewise the long-established party, of course the cadre pattern is far more mature than the new party.

Furthermore, according to Syamsuddin Haris et al., the regeneration of political parties can be carried out well only if the process applies the following principles: [22]

- First, be open. This open principle implies that the regeneration process must be followed by all members of political parties, meaning that political party members have the same opportunity to receive training and other activities in the regeneration process. Cadre formation needs to be accompanied by a guarantee that all cadres who have become members of political parties as well as members of party wings who have the potential and / or other assessments determined by democratic political parties can participate in all stages of regeneration activities. In this regard, it is also necessary to establish a healthy and transparent competition system within the body of political party organizations. Cadres must be familiarized with a fair and transparent competition system. With a competition system that is free from collusion and nepotism, leadership regeneration will be able to produce qualified prospective leaders.
- Second, non-discriminatory. Providing equal access to the regeneration process also means that the regeneration mechanism also opens the same space for all members to participate in and / or get political promotions and careers through the regeneration process without differentiating their skin color, class, religion, gender, or ethnicity. The principle of non-discrimination in regeneration at the same time can reduce the political party oligarchy associated with candidacy in the contestation of legislative elections, regional heads and presidents / vice presidents as well as the election of party cadres in other public positions.
- Third, tiered. Classification of political party regeneration is based on a gradual, multilevel or pyramidal coating. This can be arranged for example by conducting cadre formation at the basic, intermediate, advanced or other names. The rationalization of this hierarchical model selection can be done because of the reasons for the selection as a result of phasing the regeneration material (pyramid material) and the selection as a result of career phasing in the organization (career is pyramidal).

Using the selection model will create several implications in relation to the internal life of the party.

- First, it is done because there is a need to complete on other capacity supplies. In essence, the cadre material is assumed in the pyramid scheme. Phasing the material in the pyramid scheme will be useful to be able to ensure that each party cadre will have the same level of capacity because through the same regeneration process (standardization).

- Second, the generation of regeneration as a result of the need to pursue an organization's career in positions at the local or regional level. For example, this can be seen from the specific cadre level requirements that must be followed by candidates for party leaders, secretaries general and so on at every level.

However, the classification based on the regeneration material will automatically affect the political career path that will be achieved by politicians. For example, a person who has received a first-level cadre training, his political career will stop as a political party administrator or legislative member or regional head at the district / city level. In the end this cadre formation is needed.

The quality of the recruitment process of political parties certainly affects the quality of the cadres produced which will later be chosen both in filling the central position within the political party itself and in the general election. This is closely related to the implementation of the regeneration process in the recruitment process of political parties. The quality of the cadres of political parties will also contribute to the advancement of the people's welfare in general later because political parties everywhere have the same duties and functions as forming state policies. Seeing its duties and functions, political parties become very strategic in a democratic country. Political parties are required to be able to manage so many human resources that they have capabilities based on party ideology.

### *C. The Function of Recruitment and Regeneration of Political Parties in Regional Elections.*

The Indonesia Institute found indications of the failure of political parties in carrying out the function of political recruitment in a democratic, transparent and meritocratic basis. The filling of management in the party is often done in ways that are thick with cartelism. Not only has cartelism undermined the institutional political parties in Indonesia, but the pragmatism virus has also undermined the behavior of party elites, cadres and party constituents, the oligarchism virus has plagued the model of leadership and decision-making within the party, and the factional virus weakened the attachment of party organizations. With such institutional conditions, ideological ties within the party cannot be expected. Because of that, the symptoms of politicians often jump fence.

Every failure in party institutions can be traced to the source of which elements are experiencing dysfunction. For example, the strengthening of pragmatism is the impact of the failure of political parties to carry out a regeneration system, ideologization and the function of political education for cadres and voters. As the unbroken causality of pragmatism that lives within the body of the party will degenerate cadre militancy, in conditions of low cadre militancy and the strengthening of voter pragmatism, party returns will tend to use instant means of attracting voters' sympathies by using the power of money politics.

The function of political recruitment for political parties has become more important and strategic after entering the era of reform and democratization after the collapse of the authoritarian New Order regime with the fall of Suharto, who

has been in power for more than three decades. For the first time in the history of national politics, through a constitutional amendment that took place in 1999-2002, the political recruitment function of the political parties was introduced into the text of the amendment to the 1945 Constitution [23]. Article 6A paragraph (2) mandates, "The pairs of candidates for President and Vice President are proposed by political parties or a combination of political parties participating in the general election before the general election ". Furthermore Article 22E paragraph (3) of the 1945 amendment states that, "Election participants to elect members of the People's Legislative Assembly and members of the Regional People's Legislative Assembly are political parties".

The mandate of the constitution resulting from the above changes underlines the strategic position of political parties in the function of political recruitment, both for the positions of president and vice president as well as members of the DPR and DPRD, provincial and district / city. Since 2005 the direct election of regional heads and deputy regional heads has now been followed by pairs of candidates who are carried by political parties and / or a combination of political parties in addition to being able to be participated by pairs of candidates individually. That is, almost all public positions in executive and legislative institutions are determined by the political recruitment process carried out by political parties, both through elections and local elections.

However, according to Syamsuddin Haris, the recruitment and regeneration process within the political parties has so far tended to apply "traditional" patterns and styles [24]. The parties that are developed more characterized by catch-all parties do not yet have a clear and specific social basis, and are still dependent on individual figures. Political parties also face challenges in the regeneration process. Most political parties do not have a clear cadre system, so the source of political recruitment tends to be oligarchic. The results of a study conducted by P2P in collaboration with IMD showed that the recruitment pattern still followed the line determined by primordial factors such as religion, regional relations, regional similarity, as well as factors of loyalty and closeness to party leadership.

In the direct implementation of the elections in 2005 until the implementation of simultaneous local elections which began in 2015, then in 2017 and finally in 2018, there were new phenomena in a number of regions, namely the minimal number of regional head candidates and deputy regional head candidates participating in the elections. More ironically, political parties are busy giving support to one pair of regional head candidates without giving the opportunity for other candidates to emerge. Even more embarrassing is the case of the candidate pair of mayors and deputy mayors in Makassar who lost against an empty box despite being supported by the majority of political parties. This is a concrete fact that the function of recruitment and regeneration of political parties is not yet optimal.

The minimal number of regional head candidates that occur in a number of regions in Indonesia suggests that the organization of political parties is still not properly and properly organized. Political parties tend to be managed

traditionally and personally. Recruitment is dominated by party strongholds, families, dynasties, for example related to the relationship of children, son-in-law, uncle, and wife. The filling of strategic positions in political parties is also inseparable from the influence of personification, dynasty (family), and rich people (business people). Not surprisingly, the process of political candidacy is thick with political transactions, political dowry, and ignores the factors of integrity and political capacity of candidates. To some degree, the process of candidacy is confined by party oligarchies that are increasingly centralized and not decentralized. Political parties in Indonesia also show the lack of a vision of nationalism, the environment, human rights, health, poverty and a number of other socio-cultural, political and economic issues.

Awareness and commitment to clean, transparent and corrupt government issues is still low, because many politicians and political party cadres are entangled in corruption cases. Corruption data from the Corruption Eradication Commission shows that more than 51 percent of the politicians caught in corruption are young politicians, politicians under the age of 50 years. A number of studies on electoral corruption also mentioned that the party began to "not be trusted by the public," political parties also practice deviant politics such as money politics, political transactions, and bribery.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the above study, it can be concluded that political parties have not optimally carried out the recruitment and regeneration functions internally. This can be seen in the implementation of a minimal election with the number of candidate pairs so that the election is only followed by one pair of candidates. Therefore, so that the implementation of the elections does not lack a pair of candidates, political parties must continue to strive to improve their internal recruitment and regeneration systems. Public expectations, political parties should always be ready to offer the best party cadres when needed by the state to fill public positions. With a good and sustainable cadre formation pattern, political party cadres will emerge who are ready to be nominated both for regional head elections and general elections for DPR / DPRD members and the president and vice president.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] T. Imansyah, "Regulasi partai politik dalam mewujudkan penguatan peran dan fungsi kelembagaan partai politik," *Jurnal Rechts Vinding: Media Pembinaan Hukum Nasional*, vol. 1, no. 3, pp. 375-395, 2012.
- [2] Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 2 of 2011 concerning Political Parties.
- [3] P. Lewis and G. Pridham, *Stabilising Fragile Democracies: Comparing New Party Systems in Southern and Eastern Europe*. Psychology Press, 1996.
- [4] R.J. Dalton and M.P. Wattenberg, *Parties without partisans: Political change in advanced industrial democracies*. Oxford University Press on Demand, 2002.
- [5] Koirudin, *Partai Politik dan Agenda Transisi Demokrasi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta, 2015, pp. 105.

- [6] M. Labolo and T. Ilham, *Partai Politik dan Sistem Pemilihan Umum di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 2017, pp. 9.
- [7] J. Asshiddiqie, "Partai Politik dan Pemilihan Umum Sebagai Instrumen Demokrasi," *Jurnal Mahkamah Konstitusi*, 2006.
- [8] S.I. Kencana, *Al-Quran dan Ilmu Politik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 1996.
- [9] C.J. Friedrich, "Political leadership and the problem of the charismatic power," *The Journal of Politics*, vol. 23, no. 1, pp. 3-24, 1961.
- [10] H.S. Roger, *An Introduction to Politics*, London: Longmans, Green & Co, 1961, pp. 199.
- [11] J. Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy*, New York: Harper, 1942, pp. 283.
- [12] W. Crotty and R.S. Kartz, *Handbook of Politic*, 2014, pp.3.
- [13] O.I.E. Fathaly and M. Palmer, *Political development and social change in Libya*. Lexington Books, 1980.
- [14] R.C. Macridis and R.J. Art, *Foreign policy in world politics*. New York, NY: Prentice Hall, 1992.
- [15] R.A. Surbakti, *Interrelation between religious and political power under New Order Indonesia*, 1992.
- [16] M. Budiardjo, *Dasar-dasar ilmu politik*. Jakarta: Gramedia pustaka utama, 2003.
- [17] M. Rush and P. Althof, *Pengantar Sosiologi dan Politik*, 2002.
- [18] G.A. Almond and S. Verba, *The civic culture: Political attitudes and democracy in five nations*. Princeton university press, 2015.
- [19] J.C. Plano and M. Greenburg, *The American political dictionary*. Harcourt College Publishers, 2002.
- [20] B. Geddes, *Politician's Dilema: Building State Capacity in Latin America*. University California Press, 1996, pp. 78-79.
- [21] Koirudin, *Partai Politik dan Agenda Transisi Demokrasi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2015, pp. 113-114.
- [22] A.P. Budiatri, S. Haris, L. Romli, S. Nuryanti, M. Nurhasim, L.S. Amalia, and R.I. Hanafi, "Personalisasi Partai Politik di Indonesia Era Reformasi," *Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia*, 2018.
- [23] S. Haris, *Pemilu langsung di tengah oligarki partai: proses nominasi dan seleksi calon legislatif Pemilu 2004*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2005.
- [24] S.Haris, *Panduan Rekrutmen & Kaderisasi Partai Politik di Indonesia*, Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia (LIPI) dan Komisi Pemberantasan Korupsi (KPK). Jakarta, 2016, pp. 4.