City Promotion For Tourism Development:

The City Branding Theory and Concepts

Andriani Kusumawati*, Supriono
Department of Business Administration
Universitas Brawijaya
Malang, Indonesia
*andriani_kusuma@ub.ac.id

Abstract—**City branding is a very interesting topic for scholars also policymakers. As cities seek to attract tourism, as well as investment and other purposes to be able to compete globally, brand strategy concepts are widely adopted from commercial domains by cities for regional development and quality of life improvement. This paper aims to provide a very different perspective on city branding theory. It is intended to connect the basic concept of place branding (country/city/destination), the purpose and benefits of city branding with the application of its application in various cities in the world including the process, obstacles and challenges as well as policy recommendations from the results of empirical studies presented in the form of cases. Large databases were selected to search for published articles related to urban tourism. Thereafter, the retrieved articles were categorized and analyzed. This paper highlights several main topics in the literature of city branding. Majority research published on city branding comes from marketing and urban studies fields. Instead of interdisciplinary fields, these two disciplines tend to parallel each other. The linkage of this conceptual framework will be a theoretical basis for understanding the implementation of city branding as well as providing recommendations for the development of cities through marketing tourism in the future.**

Keywords—city branding, tourism, promotion, city

I. INTRODUCTION

Branding is not a new topic in marketing especially when it applies in a company's product. A brand is an identity that is inherent in a product or service. Brands are also used in the world of tourism to give an identity to the region to have a characteristic with the term "city branding". Communities, cities, countries, nations, and regions have increasingly enhanced the concepts of marketing and branding as a tool to increase exports, investors, businesses, visitors, citizens, events and other important sources of income. This ubiquitous marketing effort shows the geographical location supported by factories and products. Application of the brand in a country, region, or city commonly referred to as Place Branding, Destination Branding or City Branding. This concept began to emerge because of intense competition between cities and between countries around the world as a competitiveness in improving the regional economy. According to Anholt, city

branding is the organization of the image of a destination through strategic communication, social, commercial, cultural, and government regulations [1].

Discussion of the purpose of branding, in contrast, is often used classical theories about products as a given conceptualization [2,3]. In addition, according to empirical studies, discussing in tourism destination marketing organizations (DMOs) has understood brand goals from the perspective of product branding, while complicated understanding of brands as names or logos has been approved by discussions [4,5]. Anholt first stated that nation branding can benefit from the perspective of corporate branding [6].

In addition, the number of scholars and academics who have written about regional marketing from 'place marketing' to 'place branding', 'destination branding' and 'city branding'. In challenging research, this research study seeks to develop a careful meta-analysis of two studies on 'place of branding', 'destination branding' and 'city branding'. This study is a systematic literature review on the concepts of 'city branding' for promoting urban tourism. This research was conducted to discuss the literature on how brands apply in the context of 'city branding' which discusses related brand concepts for companies used in the literature on 'place branding', 'destination branding' and 'city branding'. This study aims to discuss previous works related to the promotion of urban tourism through the lens of 'city branding' theory.

The paper is organized as follows, after the introduction in the first section, the next sections contain the related work of city branding theory from the previous conceptual and empirical studies. The next sections explained the methodology conducted for this paper. After the methodology part, the result sections contain the findings as well as discussion regarding the city branding theory in pertinent literature especially in developing urban tourism sector were. and last section concludes research work with future directions.

II. RELATED WORK

According to Anholt [1], city branding implies the strategic innovation and coordination of all aspect including social, economic, cultural, and commercial, as well as government

regulations in order to manage a destination image. Chaniago stated that city branding is a process of creating a brand of city in order to easier recognize and introduce it to the target market thru some positioning statement, logo, icon, symbols and other promotional media. Regional brands are defined as marketing activities to promote a tourist destination with a desirable image in order to influence consumers' decisions to visit it [7].

Over time, City Branding evolved into various approaches. There are several approaches regarding City Branding from various scientific fields. Kavaratzis sees city branding from the city image communication perspective by using three phases of communication: primary, secondary, and tertiary [8]. While Rainisto explains the Place Branding theory framework that focuses on efforts to market the city [9]. Based on this explanation, city branding can be concluded as a strategy to promote a region and attract target market with all it's potentials.

III. METHODOLOGY

A contemporary and concise examination of the city branding research area, specifically the research approach of researchers in this dicipline, characteristics that have been studied and selected, and how the study was designed. Through repeated searches in several literature databases, studies that meet the requirements of city branding are identified and used as evaluation material. Their studies will then be scrutinized, evaluated and grouped base on several criteria such as bibliographic data, methodologies used, empirical foundations, theoretical bases, branding aspects, and reporting on the results of these branding activities.

City branding studies that emerge as a research area recognized internationally are considered and evaluated with a high level of multi-disciplines, rapid proliferation within and between fields, and academic foundations. On the basis of research interests, three viewpoints recognized (creating, using, and critiquing city brands) emerged in all academic disciplines. Research articles in English, published in academic journals are examined, which are limited by the scope of professional and international research. This scope of selection is also limited by time period. Searches from electronic and online databases, such as: EBSCO (Premier Business Sources and PSYCINFO), JStor, ERIC, Emerald Full Text, ProQuest, Ingenta (Direct Science) were made. Additionally, an online search and physical media were conducted as well to find other periodicals and ancillary references by authors who supported the earlier search. Supplementary articles are appreciated from exploring bibliographies for articles taken. Exploration strategies use keywords or thesaurus, for instance "place branding", "destination branding" and "city branding". Then developed again using the term "brand" from "branding" to get better results.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In the early 1990s, researchers began writing on the concept of place marketing [10-12]. But city branding is a new problem [13] and, accordingly, little literature is on it. Kavaratzis and Ashworth add that there are recognizable literature gaps with respect to the general process of city branding [14] and real case studies in particular [6,9]. Little empirical research is found to identify how city brands are successful [13]. It is, therefore, more difficult to understand this problem in depth as far as pseudo theory does not exist. Hankinson supports this idea when he says: yet, however, no general theoretical framework exists to support the development of brand names other than classic brand, product-based theories [2]. Therefore, some authors begin their study with the assist of branding theory in general, followed by marketing theory, particularly urban marketing, though this problem is relatively new also in the literature. It can be seen that the researchers conducted a study of this literature, coming from different backgrounds. Most of them have roots in business, for example marketing and have an interest in urban problems. Others have roots in urban planning and focus on marketing. Discourse is not necessarily contradictory but the subject's approach is very different.

Hankinson added that some academic domains have their own perspective [2]. Curiously, a literature review of the two domains, admittedly, can never be truly comprehensive, showing the absence of conceptual articulation between the two domains. As the link argues, it can advance the level of brand conceptualization much further. Ashworth and Voogd state that place marketing in general has experienced a misunderstanding of the marketplace and the market of the place manager [10]. Kavaratzis added that implementing limited place marketing was due to lack of knowledge about marketing among city administrators [8].

Kavaratzis and Ashworth state that people experience places through perception and image [12]. Indeed, they argued before, that the orientation of the population depended on how they experienced the city, through the physical and symbolic elements they faced. They add that the three processes affect the construction of mental construction sites, what they call mental maps: planned interventions, the way in which they [people] or others use certain places, and finally through various forms of place of representation such as films, novels, paintings, news reports and so on. It's with this mental picture that branding is dealing with. Brand place management tries to influence this picture [12]. The object of marketing a city is not the city 'itself', but the image [8].

As described earlier, this study found that the most discussed problems among researchers were problems related to very little deficiencies of concept and theory in the field [8,13]. The research domain is traced through the terminology used in the literature as conceptual framework. Nevertheless, evaluating terminology might generate several difficulties that have been experienced by other researchers [15,16]. Simply by scrutinizing the vocabulary employed in the literature, aside from showing the broad use of the term "city", which mentioned about ninety-six times, no other obvious problems can be seen. For having a meaningful conceptual review, the conceptual characteristics was generated from city categories

concept as a better indicator. This method could allow for deeper analysis of the different paradigms and conceptual approaches presented in the research domain.

TABLE I.   RELEVANT SCIENTIFIC ARTICLES RELATED CITY BRANDING

Author-date	Journal Title	Unit of Analysis	Approach	Methods
Kavaratzis [8]	Journal of Place branding	City (in general)	Communicating the brand	Conceptual
Truemann, Klemm and Giroud [17]	Journal of Corporate Communication	City (in general)	Communicating the brand	Case study
Parkerson and Saunders [13]	Place branding	City	Brand management, network	Case study
Vitiello and Willcocks [18]	Place Branding	City	Communicating the brand	Conceptual paper, case examples

In order to understand the conceptual context being analysed completely, this study counts the amount of articles use a tentative model (see table 1). The proposing models found in several articles basically have different propositions (for example models for calculating city images or city brand organizations theoretical models). Out of those articles proposed model, more than a fifty percents are based on marketing models (for example, relationships, dominant service logic and networks) and business models (e.g. products, services, companies), or traditional branding while the remaining mainly focuses on the multi-attribute city image and perceptions and personal attitudes of residents/visitors. More than the past few years, the majority of publications presented in proposing models studies apply place marketing concepts and tend to qualitative based.

In order to understand the conceptual confusion described above, this study chooses the model used by Berg [19], where there are differences amongst perspectives about the unit character branded, but also two different approaches to brands as activities. There are no less than three different standpoints on the fundamental component characters to be stamped. The first has to do with space, namely destinations, places or areas that related to relative position of the entities and occasions happen as well as geography directions or spatial distribution and beyond. In this stage, thoughts like place of marketing [20,21], marketing objectives [22], places [23], place promotions [24,25] and territorial marketing [26] can be found. The second perspective holds about the things to be marketed or branded is cities, regions, and regions, in other words, administration, regulated, areas inhabited by a certain significance. Here are concepts such as city marketing [10], city promotion [24,25], destination cities [27-29] or selling cities [30] and urban planning [31] can be discovered. Third step, urban standpoints reviews certain classic features or qualities of the city as a community, it might conditions of social or cultural in general that characterize city life (social

and cultural), certain metropolitan cities' personalities (including multiplicity, connectivity, and others) or certain criteria of cities classifications, for instance cities being entrepreneurial, being creative, and cities being design. Several illustrations of this domain are urban brands [32], urban promotion [24], urban marketing [24], metropolitan marketing [33], and even brand cities [34]. It is also possible to distinguish different strategies in promoting a city. Firstly, the marketing strategy explained the method or technique related to the cities or cities parts promotional including the process to promote, distribute, and sell the product provisions [11]. These include place marketing practices [9,11,20,35,36], destination marketing [22], promoting cities [25], and urban marketing [24].

TABLE II.   RESEARCH JOURNAL AND FIELD OF STUDIED IDENTIFIED

Journal name	Field of study
Place Branding and Public Diplomacy Cities Journal of Place Management and Development City	Place/City Branding
Journal of Macromarketing Australasian Marketing Journal European Journal of Marketing Journal of Marketing Management Industrial Marketing Management Journal of Strategic Marketing International Journal of Consumer Studies The Journal of Brand Management Journal of Service Marketing The Marketing Management Journal Marketing Theory Journal of Product and Brand Management The Marketing Review	Marketing/ Branding
Annals of Tourism Research Leisure Studies Journal of Hospitality Marketing&Management Tourism Geography Journal of Travel Research Tourism Culture &Communication Journal of Vacation Marketing Tourism Management Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing Tourist Studies	Tourism
Urban Studies Journal of Urban Design International Journal of Urban& Regional Research European Urban and Regional studies Urban Research and Practices Habitat International Journal of Urban Affairs Urban Policy and Research Canadian Journal of Urban Research Urban History Journal of Urban Technology Urban Affairs Review Urban Forum	Urban studies
European Planning Studies Built Environment Co Design Environment and Planning European spatial and Research Policy International Planning Studies Planning Practices & Research Planning Theory Town Planning Review	Planning

Secondly, the branding approach namely the symbolic representation of the purpose of connecting all information for building city association and expectation surrounds it [37], including place branding [38], location branding [14, 39, 40], destination branding [41], city branding [42], city brands [40, 43-47] and city re-branding [48], city image [43, 49], and both location branding and place branding [14, 50]. Currently, city branding becomes an emerge research area recognized internationally and considered multidisciplinary field with very related amongst disciplines, and foundation. However, the perspectives rather fragmented theoretically based on research interests emerged in all academic domains.

City branding could be defined as a corporate branding application, in which both city and companies have the same complexity of dimensions [42]. This dimension as explained by Ashworth and Kavaratzis [42] who cited Balmer and Gray's idea consists of "multidisciplinary roots, multiple stakeholder groups, a high degree of intangibility and complexity, requiring to take account of social responsibility, dealing with multiple identities, and both require a lengthy development term" (Balmer and Gray in Ashworth and Kavaratzis [42]. Comprehensive components must be utilized for each city to get the expectations of stakeholders and community for creating the right city branding and avoiding city branding failure [51]. As such, recognizing the incorporated approaches to build strong city brands is essential.

V. Conclusion and Future Scope

This study largely explored and found the main key elements of the city brand area as well as the process of this field being studied currently. Also, the concept of historical considerations and development, interdisciplinary compositions, research emphasis, and the contexts both conceptual and empirical. This research is conducted only for published scholarly journals and English-based research articles. As this exclusion of other language, and therefore the possibility to generate comparison internationally is limited. Additionally, publication included in this research only covers selected time periode and excluded the research publication before 2004 and no later than 2016. This selection serves as another limitation, although the discussion was combined by the later publication.

There are several assumptions, such as the fact that cities can become clear brands, by understanding more complicated literature. It is seen here that it is important to have a hypothesis but in this study it is necessary to seriously analyse all the different cases. The literature review is also really interesting in its limits on various opinions on the same subject.

One of the research implications identified is the need of conducting a meta-analysis related to city branding academic domain for understanding the hidden effects, relationships, and patterns because of confusing concepts as a result of disciplinary foundations fragmented in the research field. In this case, it is the first and really difficult to find literature because there is not much literature about city branding. Future

research related to this must investigate in many different sources from journals and personal collections.

Finally, this research tries to bring the most relevant information to enable the reader to get a good picture of this complicated problem. The literature never answers research questions clearly and only provides instructions for understanding this phenomenon to analyze efficiently. Answering this research question to the extent that it shows that now it is not really possible to provide a solution to a research problem but can provide advice and recommendations namely in-depth study of literature which helps research to answer the development of research around city branding.

References

[1] S. Anholt. The Anholt City Brands Index: How the World Views Its Cities. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan; 2006.

[2] G. Hankinson, "Relational Network Brands: Towards a Conceptual Model of Place Brands," Journal of Vacation Marketing, vol. 10, no.2, pp. 109–21, 2004.

[3] L. Murphy, P. Benckendorff and G. Moscardo, "Destination Brand Personality: Visitor Perceptions of a Regional Tourism Destination," Tourism Analysis, vol. 12, no. 5-6, pp. 419-32, 2007.

[4] A. Tasci., "Destination brands vs destination images: Do we know what we mean?," Journal of Vacation Marketing, vol. 12, pp. 299-317, 2006.

[5] K. Dinnie, "Place Branding: Overview of an Emerging Literature," Place Branding, vol. 1, pp. 106-10, 2004.

[6] S. Anholt, "Some important distinctions in place branding," Place Branding and Public Diplomacy, vol. 1, no. 2, pp.116-21, 2005.

[7] C. Blain, S.E. Levy and R.B. Ritchie "Destination branding: Insights and prac-tices from destination management organizations," Journal of Travel Research, vol. 43, pp. 328–38, 2005.

[8] M. Kavaratzis, "From city marketing to city branding: towards a theoretical framework for developing city brands," Place Branding, vol. 1, no.1, pp. 8-73, 2004.

[9] S.K. Rainisto, Success Factors of Place marketing: A study of place marketing practices in Northern Europe and the United States, 2003, Helsinki: Helsinki University of Technology.

[10] G.J. Ashworth and H. Voogd, "Marketing the City: Concepts, Processes and Dutch Applications," The Town Planning Review, vol. 59, no. 1, pp. 65-79, 1988.

[11] P. Kotler, D.H. Haider and I. Rein, Marketing Places: Attracting Investment, Industry, and Tourism to Cities, States, and Nations, 1993.

[12] M. Kavaratzis and G.J. Ashworth, "City branding: An effective assertion of identity or a transitory marketing trick?," Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie, vol. 96, pp. 506-14, 2005.

[13] B. Parkerson and J. Saunders, "City branding: can goods and services branding models be used to brand cities?," Place Branding and Public Diplomacy, vol. 1, no.3, pp.242-64, 2004.

[14] G. Hankinson, "Location Branding: A Study of the Branding Practices of 12 English Cities," The Journal of Brand Management, vol. 9, pp. 127-42, 2001.

[15] S. Pike, "Destination image analysis—a review of 142 papers from 1973 to 2000," Tour. Manag., vol. 23, no. 5, pp. 541–549, 2002.

[16] S. Hanna and J. Rowley, "An analysis of terminology use in place branding," Place Brand. public Dipl., vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 61–75, 2008.

[17] M. Trueman, M. Klemm, and A. Giroud, "Can a city communicate? Bradford as a corporate brand," Corp. Commun. an Int.

[18] R. Vitiello and M. Willcocks, "The difference is in the detail: Its potential as a place branding tool and impact upon perceptions and responses," Place Brand., vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 248–262, 2006.J., 2004.

[19] P.O. Berg, "Diseno de Marcas Metropolitanas Competitivas:: Poscionamento Estrategico de Regionens Metropolitanas en el Norte Europa," Rev. Cult. y ciencias Soc., no. 60/61, pp. 131–152, 2009.

[20] H. Madsen, "Place-marketing in Liverpool: a review," Int. J. Urban Reg. Res., vol. 16, no. 4, pp. 633–640, 1992.

[21] D. Haider, "Place wars: new realities of the 1990s," Econ. Dev. Q., vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 127–134, 1992.

[22] D. Buhalis, "Marketing the competitive destination of the future," Tour. Manag., vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 97–116, 2000.

[23] C.M. Hall, "Geography, marketing and the selling of places," J. Travel Tour. Mark., vol. 6, no. 3–4, pp. 61–84, 1997.

[24] W. Cudny, Urban Events, Place Branding and Promotion: Place Event Marketing. Routledge, 2019.

[25] W. Cudny, City branding and promotion: the strategic approach. Routledge, 2019.

[26] A. Kalandides, "City marketing for Bogotá: a case study in integrated place branding," J. Place Manag. Dev., 2011.

[27] S. Abbasian, "Solo travellers to city destinations: an exploratory study in Sweden," Int. J. Tour. Cities, 2019.

[28] D. Blaće, G. Ćorić, and B. Jurič, "Branding the city of Šibenik as a sustainable tourist destination using social networks," Ekon. Vjesn. Contemp. Business, Entrep. Econ. Issues, vol. 28, pp. 109–124, 2015.

[29] F. Farida, R.H.E. Putro, and Z. Zulaikha, "City Branding as a Concept for the Regional Tourism Development," Res. Soc. Dev., vol. 8, no. 10, p. 21, 2019.

[30] G. Kearns and C. Philo, Selling places: the city as cultural capital, past and present. Pergamon, 1993.

[31] A. Bonakdar and I. Audirac, "City branding and the link to urban planning: Theories, practices, and challenges," J. Plan. Lit., vol. 35, no. 2, pp. 147–160, 2020.

[32] A. Vanolo, "The image of the creative city: Some reflections on urban branding in Turin," Cities, vol. 25, no. 6, pp. 370–382, 2008.

[33] J.R. Freire, "Managing destination brand architecture–The case of Cascais Municipality," Place Brand. Public Dipl., vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 78–90, 2016.

[34] Y.-D. Liu, "Major event and city branding," J. Place Manag. Dev., vol. 8, no. 2, 2015.

[35] P. Kotler and D. Gertner, "Country as brand, product, and beyond: A place marketing and brand management perspective," J. Brand Manag., vol. 9, no. 4, pp. 249–261, 2002.

[36] S. Zenker and E. Braun, "Branding a city: A conceptual approach for place branding and place brand management," 2010.

[37] A. Dickinger and L. Lalicic, "'This City Is Absolutely Fun and Trendy' A Destination Brand Personality Analysis in a Web 2.0 Setting," in Information and communication technologies in tourism 2015, Springer, 2015, pp. 321–333.

[38] S. Anholt, "Place branding: Is it marketing, or isn't it?" Springer, 2008.

[39] V.-A. Briciu, "Differences between place branding and destination branding for local brand strategy development," Bull. Transilv. Univ. Brașov, Ser. VII Soc. Sci. Law, no. 1, pp. 9–14, 2013.

[40] W. Ma, D. Schraven, M. de Bruijne, M. De Jong, and H. Lu, "Tracing the origins of place branding research: A bibliometric study of concepts in use (1980–2018)," Sustainability, vol. 11, no. 11, p. 2999, 2019.

[41] L.A. Cai, "Cooperative branding for rural destinations," Ann. Tour. Res., vol. 29, no. 3, pp. 720–742, 2002.

[42] G. Ashworth and M. Kavaratzis, "Beyond the logo: Brand management for cities," J. Brand Manag., vol. 16, no. 8, pp. 520–531, 2009.

[43] L. Vitale Lollo, "City branding for tourism: the power of image selection," 2018.

[44] H. Lu and M. de Jong, "Evolution in city branding practices in China's Pearl River Delta since the year 2000," Cities, vol. 89, pp. 154–166, 2019.

[45] S. Serçek, "A Conceptual Study on City Branding," Batman Univ. J. Life Sci., vol. 8, pp. 1–11, 2018.

[46] T. Moilanen, "Challenges of city branding: A comparative study of 10 European cities," Place Brand. Public Dipl., vol. 11, no. 3, pp. 216–225, 2015.

[47] V. Taecharungroj, "City-district divergence grid: a multi-level city brand positioning tool," Place Brand. Public Dipl., vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 101–114, 2018.

[48] N. Ntounis and M. Kavaratzis, "Re-branding the High Street: the place branding process and reflections from three UK towns," J. place Manag. Dev., 2017.

[49] A. Shirvani-Dastgerdi and G. De-Luca, "Boosting city image for creation of a certain city brand," Geogr. Pannonica, vol. 23, no. 1, pp. 23–31, 2019.

[50] S.B. Hornskov, "On the management of authenticity: Culture in the place branding of Øresund," Place Brand. Public Dipl., vol. 3, no. 4, pp. 317–331, 2007.

[51] A.C. Middleton, "City branding and inward investment," in City Branding, Springer, 2011, pp. 15–26.