

Relevance For The Establishment Of The Truth And Reconciliation Commission For The Enforcement Of Human Rights In Indonesia

Woro Winandi¹ & Endah Lestari Dwirokhmeiti²

^{1,2}Narotama University, Surabaya-Indonesia

E-mail: woro.winandi@narotama.ac.id/ endah.lestari61@yahoo.co.id

Abstract-The rise of cases of gross violations of human rights in Indonesia that have not been resolved through the courts must be resolved by an institution that adopts the values of the local wisdom of the community. The formation of an institution called the truth and reconciliation committee is expected to put the parties on the dispute, namely: victims of gross violations of human rights on the one hand and perpetrators of gross violations on the other into equal positions. With this parallel position, it is hoped that can create a sense of "ngewongke uwong" (humanizing human beings) of fellow human beings. If this humanizing process can take place then this reconciliation process will also automatically take place for the formation of Indonesian regulations.

Keywords: Relevance, Establishment Of Truth And Reconciliation Commissions; Enforcement Of Human Right

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

The reforms that took place in Indonesia in 1998 still have a tough task to be carried out by the government to date, namely

the unresolved cases of *gross violations of human rights* that occurred before the enactment of Law Number 26. Year 2000 concerning Human

Rights Courts, hereinafter abbreviated to the Law on Human Rights Courts.

In fact, the Law on Human Rights Courts has regulated a mechanism for resolving gross violations of human rights, namely through the penal channel (human rights court and ad hoc human rights court) and non-penal channels through the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, the establishment of which is regulated in separate statutory regulations.

1.2. Concept of a Truth and Reconciliation Commission

Human Rights Courts are used to resolve cases of gross human rights violations that occurred after the promulgation of Law no.26 of 2000 concerning Human Rights Courts, while the Ad Hoc Human Rights Courts are used to resolve cases of gross human rights violations that occurred before the promulgation of Law no.26 of 2000 concerning Human Rights Courts.

The Truth and Reconciliation Commission, which is a mechanism for resolving gross violations of human rights through non-penal channels, is used as a means to resolve cases of serious human rights violations as an alternative if there are obstacles in both juridical techniques in resolving gross violations of human rights through the route. penal.

1.3. Concept of Human Rights

The term human rights refers to the rights inherent in humans based on their nature, namely the rights inherent in humans based on their nature, in other words human rights are rights that are owned by

humans as humans.[1] This means that human rights exist since humans are born.

Human Rights, hereinafter abbreviated as HAM, originated and were popular from Western nations, this is evidenced by the existence of John Locke's thought which is seen as the philosophical basis of human rights in his writing entitled *Second Treaties of Government of Political or Civil Society* written in 1690.[2]

II. PROBLEMS

In connection with the background of the problem as described in the description above, the following problems can be formulated first What is the relationship between establishing a Truth and Reconciliation Commission and upholding human rights? And, Second What is the process for resolving gross violations of human rights through the Truth and Reconciliation Commission?

III. RESEARCH METHODS

This study conducted with literature and statute review. The purpose of this review is to get answer to legal issue.

Starting from the problems that underlie this research, the research to be carried out uses the following approach: First, in order to explain The RELEVANCE FOR THE FORMATION OF THE TRUTH COMMISSION AND RECONCILIATION FOR THE ENFORCEMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN INDONESIA, A Normative Juridical Approach Is Used,[3]

Second, in order to explain the establishment aTruth and Reconciliation Commission in an effort to realize the unity of the nation of Indonesia to the completion of Severe violations of human rights in Indonesia it through non-penal, use normative approaches with a reason to dig the law aspired (*ius constituendum*) in Indonesia. In order to support this research, interviews were used to victims of gross human rights violations, commissioners of the National Human Rights Commission, and non-governmental organizations engaged in the field of human rights.

IV. DISCUSSION

4.1. The Relationship between the Establishment of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and the Upholding of Human Rights

The existence of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (hereinafter abbreviated as KKR) is very important for the resolution of cases of gross human rights violations, which have not been resolved through human rights courts, especially in realizing the sense of justice in society. In order to achieve reconciliation between victims and perpetrators of gross human rights violations, there are 2 elements that must be fulfilled, namely: "the element of forgiveness and admitting guilt" in order to achieve reconciliation.

The effort to realize the two elements above is not an easy task, considering that the perpetrators of gross human rights violations in the past were dominated by the military (although it does not rule out that the perpetrators of gross human rights violations also came from civilian circles), often unwilling to admit mistakes. As a result, the perpetrators of gross human rights violations are not touched by law by reason of "carrying out state duties" for the sake of national unity and stability.

Just to provide a clearer picture of victims of gross human rights violations, which occurred in the past which were closely related to victimization of crime victims (stigmatizing a person or group as victims, is largely determined by the power holders), therefore people who do not have power (*powerless*) are often victims of crime. This condition is evident in the extrajudicial processes that occur in Indonesia, which have resulted in victims, particularly victims of *abuse of power* . Such a dispute settlement path is common in *gessellschaft* communities , which use local potential because they are considered efficient, [is](#) sufficient to satisfy the disputing parties.

Likewise, cases of gross human rights violations in Indonesia must be resolved by an institution that adopts the values of local wisdom. It is hoped that the establishment of this institution can place the parties in dispute, namely: Victims of gross human rights violations on the one hand and perpetrators of gross human rights violations on the other hand, in an equal position. With this parallel position it is hoped that it can cause a sense of

"ngewongke uwong" among humans. When this "ngewongke uwong" process can take place, the reconciliation process itself will also take place.

As a real example of the influence of local wisdom on reconciliation can be seen in the reconciliation that occurred between PKI victims / families of victims in South Blitar and Nahdlatul Ulama (NU).

There was a new awareness among the Nahdiyyin there that they were used by the military to crush the Indonesian communist party (PKI). The old kyai were upset, on the one hand, they agreed with the idea of "making up again" with the former PKI / BTI (Indonesian peasants' ranks) and their families; on the other hand there is a sense of regret which cannot be easily removed. That is why they promote reconciliation, but did not say explicitly. On the other hand, the former PKI / BTI and their families are more eager to welcome this social reconciliation. They feel again "diuwongke" (humanized).[4]

There is an impression, as expressed by Budiawan, that the psychological burden of the past is even stronger among "perpetrators" than among "victims". (Compare Tzvetan Todorov, *Facing The Extreme: Moral Life in the Concentration Camp*, 1999). Due to the psychological burden among (some) old kyai, reconciliation is not in the form of apologies such as Eid al-Fitr, or "public confessions" such as in South Africa, but is packaged in joint art performances, to commemorate the Prophet Muhammad's birthday with joint committee. Planning, financing to implementing activities are discussed and carried out together. Chosen artistic performances together (kentrung among NU, and mix the juice of the families of ex-political prisoner) is a tactic activists NU youth to facilitate the permission of local authorities such as Danramil (military rayon commander), Kapolsek (sector police chief) and Camat (sub-district head). In order the message of reconciliation is vague because it is still difficult to disclosed verbally, artistic performances together deliberately held in the yard of Trisula Monument.[5]

By held at that monument, two groups who now adjoining it, be reminded of their position

opposite of 1968: PKI / BTI as a target of military operations, while the NU supporters / front behind the operation. So far, both parties have viewed the moment with traumatic feelings. But now through art performances together and in different psychological situations, the meaning of the "historical sites" that too changed. The monument has become a witness of social reconciliation. In this way, a new event is proclaimed to neutralize the bitter past memories and at the same time this new event is recorded as a collective memory. In there was no public testimony such as in South Africa, but the truth has been revealed.

Related to the reconstruction among the people of South Blitar, can be said that the form of this reconsolidation take the values of local wisdom without using a third mediation. This is what distinguishes the reconciliation that is built by the community itself with local wisdom in it and the reconciliation that the Government of Indonesia intends to establish in the form of a law.

4.2. The Process of Resolving Serious Violations of Human Rights through the Truth and Reconciliation Commission

4.2.1. Religious Values in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission

To be able to realize unity, means having to take the path of reconciliation or reunification by forgetting the past which is a national concern (the murder in the thirty september movement (G30S)/ PKI case and various other human rights violations).

Efforts to improve relations deng a n fellow citizens in Indonesia also expressed by Sri Sultan HB X:

... During transitional period of uncertainty it is we really need a collective consciousness and mobilization of national intelligence. A National intellectuals may be able to generate intellectual consensus about the national system in a concrete and more detailed form through a series of witness agendas. Because we are racing against time, the outlines and basics that have become consensus can immediately be put into effect. Because, there is not a single system in the world that is actualized without major experiments ...[6]

Without being accompanied by the awareness to make peace with the past and

worshipping past traumas, unity will not materialize, what happens is only "unity" in its symbolic form .

Regarding the ad hoc human rights trial process in the Tanjung Priok case, from the TNI, in this case the perpetrators of gross human rights violations offered a method of settlement called "Islah" (derived from Arabic).

The existence of Islah is contained in QS Al Baqarah 224 which reads: " Do not make (the name) of Allah in your oath as a barrier to doing good, pious and holding islah among people. And Allah is Hearing and Knowing ".

In QS An Nissa 114: "There is no goodness in most of their whispers, except the whispers of people who tell (humans) to give alms, or do ma'ruf, or make peace between humans. And whoever does this because he seeks the pleasure of Allah, then one day we give him a great reward.

The foundation of Islah based on the Qur'an is in the QS . Al Hujuraat 9-10 on how to resolve disputes that arise in Muslims, the contents of which are stated:

- "And if there are two groups of believers at war then make peace between the two. If one of the two groups persecutes the other group, then fight against the group that did the persecution so that that group returns, at Allah's command, then reconcile the two fairly and act justly. Indeed, Allah loves those who behave fairly "
- "Verily, the believers are brothers, therefore between your two brothers and fear Allah so that you may receive mercy".

In the process, it is required that victims of serious human rights violations are promised to be given a capital in the form of money and a motorbike, but on the condition that they do not need to continue the judicial process. A similar explanation was corroborated by the victims of gross violations of human rights which basically stated that victims of violations of severe human rights that deny the existence of "reconciliation" as intended by the perpetrators of gross human rights violations.

Basically, in the Tanjung Priok case there are two groups of victims, on the one hand they oppose the existence of "Islah" on the grounds that it does away with evil acts; one of the victims' families who refused the term, namely the late family. H. Amir Bikkie, while on the other hand there is a group that wants a "reconciliation" by providing materials as compensation for what the victim has experienced. Between Islah and reconciliation are similar in that the two terms refer to an act to restore a friendly relationship to its original state; actions resolve differences. [7]

The state as a forum that houses the citizens of the nation cannot be allowed to be trapped in the midst of a heated political and social constellation between "actors" on the one hand and those who fight for justice for past acts of violence committed by state apparatus on the other.

Therefore we need a step which on the one hand is part of the effort to resolve past political crimes and punishments that do not cause resistance from the "perpetrator". This step needs to be taken if the realization of justice is proportional it will have an impact on the threat of unity and integrity as well as can create "unrest" for the community in general.

That step is Islah. This step has been taken for the Tanjung Priok case, in which Try Sutrisno signed the "Peace Charter" with the victims of the Tanjung Priok incident including the wife of the late Amir Bikkie, Mrs. Dewi Wardah, Nurcholis Majid and Pangdam Jaya (Commander of the Jakarta Raya military area) Bibit Waluyo also signed the charter as witnesses. .

Although there is an assumption that this step is merely the application of historical amnesia, at least a peace agreement between the perpetrator and the victim will certainly have a better impact than the effort to uphold justice which results in social clashes. Islah should not be viewed as a measure to perpetuate impunity. Islah is an alternative to create peace and tranquility over the wounds of past history. Islah also should not be seen as a discriminatory step in resolving one case against another. Islah is nothing more than a peace effort to erase the historical revenge of the victims and their descendants against the perpetrators of violence. [8]

Islah is not a reflection of traditional justice in the context and parameters outlined by ELSAM (Institut for Policy and Advocacy). But the term is not in favor of the doer for what has been done in the past. The perpetrator who commits reconciliation has at least confessed that he has indeed committed the crime that has been charged and admits the crime and has the desire to make peace. This is because it is impossible for a person to come to terms with something that he has absolutely no attachment to. So what needs to be seen is that the desire to make peace is a symbol of the perpetrator's recognition of crimes he committed in the past. This cannot be found in a court forum, where there will not be a desire for peace when the former generals are brought forward. Therefore, as an effort to realize historical justice, islah can be considered as a means of creating traditional justice in order to eliminate historical grudges for the continuation of the nation's life journey.

According to the author, Islah is seen as a form of traditional justice because (1) Islah has no legal awareness and is only known through religion; (2) the terms offered by Try Soetrisno to the victims of Tanjung Priok tended to be more towards attempts of impunity, so that this was rejected by some of the victims of the Tanjung Priok case.

From the point of view of Christianity, the issue of human rights is a very basic issue, moreover humans are the image and image of God in accordance with Genesis 1: 26-27 which reads:

- Allah said, "Let us make men in Our image and likeness, so that they may rule over the fish of the sea and the birds of the air and over livestock and over all the earth and over all the creeping things of the earth."
- So God created man in His image, in God's image He created him; male and female He created them.

Humans as God's creation, who have the highest degree among God's creations, the issue of human rights occupies special attention, moreover, human rights are the concern of the *World Council of Churches* (WCC) or the council of churches worldwide.

Through one of its commissions, namely *the Commission of Churches on International Affairs* (CCIA), this commission has the following duties: [9]

1. *To serve people in the field of international relations and promoting reconciliation and oneness of human beings.*
2. Together with member countries, the main director of CCIA has participated in *drafting the Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, since then CCIA has been involved in providing input and hobbies regarding human rights.
3. Participated in dealing with the apartheid issue in South Africa by issuing a strong declaration on apartheid;
4. In the end the WCC improvised an extraordinary theological, political and legal movement in Kitwe, South Africa in 1964 which campaigned for racial justice in South Africa.

In Christianity, reconciliation is seen as embodiment of the "Second Law of Love" which means that humans must be able to love others as if they love themselves, including those who have hurt themselves and even have deeply traumatized as taught by the Lord Jesus Christ in Christianity.

This condition can be found in the opinion of the Eka Darmaputera who sees human rights from a theological perspective. According to Eka Darmaputera, it is said that:[10]

1. Rights implies obligations, because rights will only become rights after the obligations are fulfilled, should the obligations also imply rights, because obligations can only be carried out properly if they are respected. Rights without obligation are arbitrary, while obligations without rights are "slavery". Where in Christian ethics "freedom" is interpreted as a right, while "obedience is interpreted as an obligation. Between freedom and obedience are like two sides in one coin, namely responsibility, there is no responsibility without obedience, on the other hand there is no responsibility without freedom.

2. Between Human Rights (HAM) and Human Obligations (KAM) stem from God's claim to humans. Therefore, human rights are inseparable from human historical experience, but human rights are not derived from human experience, but from God's actions in human history. That is, Human Rights (HAM) is not a formulation of the ideal of man about himself, but rather an understanding of what God wants about man: who man is, what his existence means, and what is the purpose of his life from God's perspective.

Furthermore, Eka Darmaputera said that human rights violations are intrinsically a violation of God's own human rights, because human rights come from the sovereignty of Allah which is given to each and every human being; consequences when human rights violations, the violations of human rights is not opposed to the violation of the obligations, but with the sovereignty of God, the power of love full of patience Generosity and Persuasion more coercive based, reciprocally, and reconciliatory rather than through confrontation cause conflict.

Thus, the formation of a TRC to resolve gross human rights violations is a manifestation of returning humans to the image of God, reflecting the use of power by God himself.

The existence of a Truth Commission can assist the implementation of such a resolution by acknowledging the suffering suffered by victims, mapping the effects of past crimes, and recommending reparations, the Truth Commission can also recommend certain reforms within public institutions, such as within the police and trials with the aim of preventing the recurrence of human rights violations.[11]

Starting from descriptions of the relationship between reconciliation with local wisdom values, teachings in Islam and Christianity, a TRC form that is in accordance with the character of the Indonesian nation can be formulated, namely:

First, adopting the format of the truth and reconciliation commission formed by South Africa, with the consideration that this format has been

recognized by the international community, namely the United Nations.

Second, adopting local wisdom values as contained in the reconciliation carried out by the people of South Blitar between the NU Youth (GP. Anshor) and PKI victims and families in commemorative ceremonies, one of which is holding a campursari event in the industry at Tugu Trisula (when commemorating "Operation Trisula"). [12]

4.2.2. Basic elements of Transitional Justice

1. Truth-Expression

In the transitional justice there are 5 important elements, namely: (1) The revelation of truth; (2) trial and punishment; (3) legal and institutional changes; (4) reparation and rehabilitation of victims of violence, and (5) reconciliation.

The disclosure of the truth is an entry point to achieve the final goal, namely the realization of a reconciliation, which reconciles the victim and the perpetrator of gross human rights violations, especially the handling of past violence. This activity has the meaning and scope as an effort to gather information which will later be compiled into a chronological event, which includes verification through complex procedures. [12]

In addition, according to Hebermas, what is meant by truth are three categories:

"First, factual truth, that is, truths occur or actually exist. Second, normative truth, which is truth relating to what is perceived as fair or unfair. Third, justice will become truth if it is stated incorrectly".

In the framework of establishing TRC, the truth is the truth that blends used three theories serve targeted, why the TRC was formed to propose and find the facts or the reality of something event with all consequences thereof. [12]

According to Hilmar Farid and Rikardo Simarmata, truth telling is done using 5 roads consisting of:

- a. Testimony gathering, this has been done by LPKP (1965-66 Murder Victims Research Institute) and Pakorba (The New Order Victims Association) to collect information on the victim by distributing the form through members and branch organization. Meanwhile the Humanitarian Volunteer Team (TRK) in collaboration with the Cultural Work Network

- (JKB) recorded the testimonies of about 400 victims of violence in 1965-66 in front of the province. Similar activities were also carried out by the Lontar Foundation, also States that collect information from several members and leaders involved in the eradication NU leftist 1965-66.
- b. Fact Finding Mission, fact finding is usually carried out by the government in collaboration with NGOs such as ELSAM, KONTRAS (Commission on missing persons and act of violence), TRK, and YLBHI (Indonesian Legal Aid Foundation). The information gathered is used to compile a chronology of events and a list of required humanitarian assistance.
 - c. Archive and Documentation Research, this activity is carried out for the advocacy process of certain cases, institutions that handle violence and natural resource conflicts rely heavily on archives in cases of political violence, as evidence of the involvement of the apparatus or the bureaucracy. Even though this activity is important, it is only temporary, because it is often considered not too urgent in handling cases.
 - d. Public activities, memorials and monuments, are generally carried out by holding public gatherings such as group prayers or a night of solidarity, as the most popular forms. The aim is to break the silence as a product of the New Order repression with orations from figures conveying their thoughts, film screenings, photo exhibitions and other cultural activities, thereby attracting public and media attention. Apart from seminars and conferences, which invited a large number of people to listen to presentations from several speakers accompanied by a question and answer forum. It is carried out in connection with important international moments such as World Human Rights Day which is commemorated every December 10, as well as International Women's Day.
 - e. Publishing and Disseminating Information, in the form of publishing books and reports, is considered as the most effective means of

reaching the Indonesian public. Generally, published manuscripts are the results of investigations and research on certain types of violence. In Indonesia, there are several NGOs that are categorized as the most productive in publishing products in the form of books, reports and journals by collaborating with commercial publishers in Jakarta and Yogyakarta. Apart from publishing books and reports, other media used are audio visuals. For example, NSB once recorded the activities of excavating mass graves in collaboration with a *production house* managed by activists and disseminating it to the public. In addition to NSB, ELSAM also never finance a film about the victims of violence in Aceh and exploration of the possibilities on making *feature films* about the detention camps on Buru Island.

In line with the five ways to reveal the truth above, the commission's operations must be supported by the restoration of the dignity of victims of gross human rights violations.

The formation of truth commissions in countries that have experienced suffering due to authoritarian regime governments is more of a choice taken to make peace with the past or even the formation of a TRC is more likely to be "cathartic" in society to fill formal steps to follow past crimes that have long been closed.

It is also important to understand that efforts to resolve violence in the past are not simple things, especially when viewed from the level of public policy.⁸ Many countries have issued regulations related to resolving past violence at the domestic level through adjustments to the needs and social context of society after the authoritarian regime. These types of adjustments indicate that there is no standard design as a reference for other countries that are trying to escape the historical burden of injustice in their regions.[14]

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the description above, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- 5.1. The link between the formation of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and upholding human

rights lies in the resolution taken by the Government to overcome the impasse that arises from settlement through court channels, which require a complicated procedural law process.

- 5.2. The resolution of gross violations of human rights through the Truth and Reconciliation Commission is carried out by means of the perpetrators of serious human rights violations and victims of serious human rights violations in the same position at the time of reconciliation so as not to generate resentment between the two parties.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In order to support the completion of this research, the research team did not forget to thank:

Leaders of the Faculty of Law, Narotama University Surabaya who have provided the opportunity to conduct research, the Head of Research and Community Service Institution of Narotama University Surabaya who has assisted in obtaining research permits, victims of gross human rights violations in the Tanjung Priok case who have been pleased to provide information, the families of the Research Team who are pleased provide the opportunity for the research team to conduct research.

REFERENCES

- [1] A. Gunawan Setiardi. Hak-hak Asasi Manusia Berdasarkan Ideologi Pancasila, Yogyakarta: Penerbit Kanisius, Yogyakarta, 1998
- [2] Walter Laqueur & Barry Rubin (Ed) The Human Rights Reader, American Book, New American Library New York, 1970
- [3] Ronny Hanitijo Soemitro, Metodologi Penelitian Hukum dan Jurimetri, Jakarta: Penerbit Ghalia Indonesia, 1994.
- [4] Asvi Warman Adam, Perjuangan Melawan Kekuasaan Adalah Perjuangan Ingatan Melawan Lupa, MESIASS (Masarakat Indonesia Sadar Sejarah), [Online] Available: <http://www.8k.com/asvi> [Accessed 25 September 2010]
- [5] Buiawan, Mematahkan Pewarisan Ingatan: Wacana Anti Komunis dan politik Rekonsiliasi Pasca Soeharto, Jakarta: Penerbit ELSAM,. 2004,
- [6] Sultan Hamengkubuwono X. PANCASILA: SUMBER INSPIRASI, VISI DAN AGENDA AKSI REFORMASI, Disampaikan Dalam Diskusi Panel yang diselenggarakan pusat study pancasila UGM dengan tema : “Pancasila Dalam Perspektif Gerakan Reformasi, di Yogyakarta 15 Juni 1998.
- [8] Satrio Pramono, Islah Sebagai Usaha Perwujudan Keadilan Transisional Sebagai Suatu Keadilan Sejarah, [Online] Available: www.indonesianlawreview.com [Accessed: 13 Februari 2010]
- [9] Natan Setiabudi,, 2006, Sikap dan Pemikiran Kritis dalam Pergumulan Mengatasi Persoalan Bangsa Indonesia di Era Reformasi, Tinjauan dari Sudut Sosiologikal-Teologikal Etis, Jakarta: Penerbit Suara GYKE Peduli Bangsa, 2006
- [10] Eka Darmaputera, 1996, Hak Asasi Manusia Perspektif Kristiani, dalam Weinata Sairin & J.M. Pattiasina (Penyunting), Hubungan Gereja dan Negara dan Hak Asasi Manusia, Jakarta: Penerbit BPK. Gunung Mulia, 1996.
- [11] Agung Yudhawirana, Menyelesaikan Pelanggaran Hak Asasi Manusia di Masa Lalu: Masalah Indonesia Pasca Transisi Politik, *DIGNITAS, JURNAL HAM, ELSAM*, Vol. I, No. I Tahun, 2003
- [12] Hilmar Farid & Rikardo Simarmata, 2004, Demi Kebenaran, “Pemetaan Upaya-upaya Pencarian Keadilan dalam Masa Transisi Di Indonesia”, Jakarta: Penerbit Lembaga Studi dan Advokasi Masyarakat (ELSAM).

- [13] Jurgen Habermas, 2008, *The Teory of Communication Action*, Jilid 1, Boston, 1984 dikutip dari Knut D. Asplund, Suparman Marzuki, dan Eko Riyadi (Editor), *Hukum Hak Asasi Manusia*, Yogyakarta: PUSHAM-UII, 2008..
- [14] Harison Citrawan; Sabrina Nadilla, *Hukum, Hak Asasi Manusia, dan Struktur Pengetahuan: Refleksi Metodologis Tentang Kekerasan Massal*, Jurnal, JURNAL HAM, Vol. 11, No. 1, April 2020