

Strategies of Translating French Pronominal Verbs in *Tintin* Into Indonesian

Alika Salsabila, Myrna Laksman-Huntley*

Department of French Studies, Universitas Indonesia, Depok, Indonesia

*Corresponding author. Email: laksman@ui.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Translating is conducted to convey source language messages to target language but due to language systems difference, translator might face difficulties. Different types of French pronominal verbs, for example, are not easy to be translated into Indonesian. This study attempts to investigate the Indonesian translation of French pronominal. The study is conducted by using the qualitative method where the data are collected from French comics, which is three series of *Tintin* comics: *Tintin en Amérique* (1932), *Tintin au Congo* (1931), and *Tintin au Tibet* (1960) in Indonesian version. The data is analysed using Molina and Albir's translation's theory (2002). The findings reveal that modulation is the most used strategy, followed by established equivalent. Modulation strategy as the most used shows that change in perspective ensures that the message is easy for target readers to comprehend while also making the dialogs more fluid in the target language. Context and translator's competence are important in translating comics. The most reflexive pronominal verbs are found in Captain Haddock's utterances which show his selfishness. The results of this study also indicate that despite having many strategies, Molina and Albir's theories cannot be fully referred to translating texts; it is necessary to refer to and/or combine with other translation theories, such as Newmark's (1988).

Keywords: *Tintin*, Indonesian, comic translation, French comic, pronominal verbs

1. INTRODUCTION

Differences in translation can be affected by several things, such as the ability of the translator, autobiography of researcher-translator, and knowledge of languages used (Ibrahim & Mansor, 2017). One of the differences between French and Indonesian is the pronominal verbs (Kridalaksana, 1994). Quoting Grevisse (2007), Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley (2020) wrote that French pronominal verbs are verbs with special pronouns, which differs according to the subject. They are (1) *me* for 1st person single pronoun (*je*), (2) *te* for 2nd person pronoun (*tu*), (3) *se* for 3rd person pronoun, (4) *nous* for plural 1st person pronoun (*nous*), and (5) *vous* for singular and plural 2nd person pronoun. There are also 4 types of French pronominal verbs: (1) *Réfléchi* (explains an action taken by and for the subject), (2) *Réciproque* (explains a reciprocal action between 2 or more subjects), (3) *Subjectif* (verb already has a special pronoun, if not, the meaning may differ or verb does not exist), and (4) *Passif* (action experienced by subject in a passive way).

Hatim (2004, in Maisaroh, 2017) stated that a translation work is not a simple matter of vocabulary and grammar, because it could never be separated from the culture. *Tintin* comics have different cultural background than Indonesia. Not only because *Tintin* speaks French and has Belgian nationality, but also the places where the adventures happen in the comics, for example, in America, Congo, and Tibet.

These differences may affect the meaning of the verb used in the dialog; thus, knowledge of source language (SL) is important to be able to transfer it correctly into the target language (TL). Translator can then refer to translation strategies that help to resolve the problem. Hence, it is important to observe the use of translation strategies to correctly convey the message, as well as adjusting the strategies used with the TL's culture. This can produce a natural and acceptable translation in the TL.

Tintin is one of the most well-known comic books in the world. The simplicity of its graphics as well as

intriguing adventure storylines (Lechner, 2009), which leads to over 100 language versions of *Tintin* comics, sold for more than 200 million copies worldwide (Pereira, 2011). Furthermore, these comics has different inspirations which can affect the different usage of pronominal verbs caused by diverse backgrounds.

The translation is also suspected to be adjusted with the contexts from the corresponding dialogs, making it important to pay attention to the story background. At the same time, the translation will be analyzed to see if the method used is a communicative method proposed by Newmark (1988), because comics are assumed to be translated by making the target reader as the focus. In a webinar about *Tintin* comic translations, Budianta and Sidharta explained that translation is done by comparing the text from different languages: French, Dutch, and English to look for the closest term to translate into Indonesian (Aldriansyah, 2020). There is also another factor that could affect the translation result, such as the editor who would modify the writings to fit inside the speech bubble. This supports the hypothesis of the usage of communicative method by the translators for these comics in this research. Therefore, the goal of this research is to describe the strategies used to translate French pronominal verbs in addition of finding the influence of contexts and translators' capabilities, as well as determining if communicative translation is used.

There are plenty of translation theories proposed by experts, such as Vinay and Darbelnet, Nida, and Newmark (1988). Their theories were then summarized and expanded by Molina and Albir in 2002 who produced 18 strategies or techniques that can be referred by translators.

Beside translation strategies, a translator can determine which method to use as a reference to translate a work as a whole. Newmark (1988, in Shakernia, 2013) divided methods into 2: semantic translation that focuses more on the source text (ST) and communicative translation that focuses on the readership. The result of both methods is different. By using the semantic translation method, the result will be stiff because it is a faithful translation. Communicative method, on the other hand, will produce a more natural, flowing translation. It is hypothesized that the latter is used as a method to translate the comics because the focus is the target reader.

Several researches about *Tintin* comics were done by Caumes (2016) who studied health on the characters, and Nursabrina and Laksman-Huntley (2017) who analyzed the equivalence of interjection between French Indonesian, and Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley (2020) studied translations of French pronominal verbs from one

Tintin comic using Newmark's theory. Tobing and Laksman-Huntley (2017) analyzed translation strategies used on Disney songs using Baker's translation theory, Igareda (2017) studied approaches to translating sounds on comic and Sell (2011) who analyzed translations and cultural exchange in Japanese *manga*. Meanwhile, García (2017) researched pronominal verbs in European languages, and Sembiring (2016) studied French pronominal verbs in French literature. Molina and Albir's translation strategies have been also used before by Fitria (2018).

Based on the studies mentioned above, it can be said that very little research has been conducted on translation strategies used to translate an element in comic, especially pronominal verbs in *Tintin*. Like Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley's study, however, this research uses Molina and Albir's theory and does not discuss the translation shift. This research is also comparable to Tobing and Laksman-Huntley's due to the research being analysis of applied translation strategies. Other previous studies help in steps of analysis, and what to expect when analyzing *Tintin* comics.

This study will focus on the application of strategies used to translate French pronominal verbs into Indonesian, like what was done by Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley. However, the difference between the two are the objects of the study, as well as the theories used. The result of this study may help in providing more insight of pronominal verb translations.

2. METHOD

The study is conducted by using the qualitative method. The data is collected from French comics, which is three series of *Tintin* comics: *Tintin en Amérique* (1932), *Tintin au Congo* (1931), and *Tintin au Tibet* (1960) in Indonesian version.

The object of this study is the translation of French pronominal verbs that are found in *Tintin en Amérique* (TA), *Tintin au Congo* (TC), and *Tintin au Tibet* (TT) and their Indonesian counterpart, *Tintin di Amerika*, *Tintin di Kongo*, and *Tintin di Tibet* which were all retrieved via various internet sites. This analysis is conducted by comparing the original vs translated versions referring to Molina and Albir's translation strategies (2002). At the same time, we also determine the method used in the translations, based on Newmark (1988). Dictionary and Indonesian thesaurus are used to determine the applied strategies.

All three titles are chosen to be analysed because each of them is inspired by the culture of the concerned

countries. According to its official website *tintin.com*, TA is inspired by critiques of modern American lifestyle which was discussed in G. Duhamel Scènes' work, TC resembles the Belgian colonial paternalistic spirit in Africa in the early 1930s, and TT contains a new dimension in comic world, that is spiritual which is related to Tibetan culture. TC is said to be one of *Tintin* comics' that have to be carefully translated because of its sensitive nature, and is still debated until today, according to Budianta and Sidharta (cited in Aldriansyah, 2020).

Tintin en Amérique (1932) is about Tintin, the young Belgian reporter with his dog, Milou, go to America to cover a story about mafia, while also indirectly stopping them. In *Tintin au Congo* (1931), both of them who are in vacation in Congo accidentally met a criminal who wants to rule the diamond production there. Lastly, *Tintin au Tibet* (1960) is about Tintin, Snowy, and Captain Haddock in an adventure to Himalayan mountains to save Tintin's friend, Tchang, and this comic does not have an antagonist. TA sparked controversy and was removed from public libraries (Wheeler, 2015). Aside the differences in the three comics, considering publishers are also an interesting: TA and TT were published by PT Indira, while TC PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Translation Strategies

Table 1. Classification of strategies based on Molina and Albir's translation strategies

No.	Translation Strategies	Frequency
1.	Particularization	26
2.	Modulation	63
3.	Generalization	15
4.	Linguistic amplification	3
5.	Linguistic compression	7
6.	Established equivalent	61
7.	Transposition	4
8.	Reduction	1
9.	Adaptation	4
10.	Unclassified	7
Total		191

Molina and Albir (2002) stated that textual and contextual categories are not enough to use for identifying, classifying, and naming choices used by translators when translating a work. Therefore, they compiled and suggested 18 strategies for translators to use. 191 data found in 3 comics consist of 135 reflexive, 6 reciprocal, 41 subjective, and 9 passive verbs. The strategies used are particularization, modulation, generalization, linguistic amplification, linguistic

compression, established equivalent, transposition, reduction, and adaptation. There are also several data that could not be classified based on Molina and Albir's (2002) theory. The table below specifies the classification numbers of all 10 strategies used. There are 4 most used and unclassified strategies that will be discussed in this analysis.

3.1.1 Particularization

Particularization is a strategy that uses a more specific equivalent in the TL. This happens when there is word or term with similar meaning in SL, but closer to the context in the TL. From 26 particularization data, there are 9 found in TA, 6 in TC, and 11 in TT.

Table 2. Particularization

SL	TL
...Maintenant, la nuit va tomber. Il va falloir s'arrêter et camper...	Sudah hampir gelap, Snowy, sebaiknya kita turun dan beristirahat di sini malam ini...

The dialog above has a context of Tintin, riding a horse, and Milou (Snowy in Indonesian version) who are exhausted from running after the villain until nighttime. Tintin then suggested that they take a break. The verb *s'arrêter* means 'to stop', therefore, it should be translated *kita harus berhenti* ('we need to stop'), instead of *turun* ('get down' or 'descend'). However, in this context, the more specified translation is still acceptable to TL readers. The word *turun* corresponds to the context of Tintin on a horse. The TL culture accepts *berhenti* in this sense.

3.1.2 Modulation

This strategy is used when the ST could not be translated literally in the TL. Therefore, a translator can change or modify the conveyance of the message. This adjustment intends to facilitate the TL readers to understand, because they are used to the way their culture delivers a message. From 63 data found, 28 are in TA, 15 in TC, and 20 in TT.

The pronominal verb *me server*, for example, is used in the context of Milou who mistakenly thought there was someone drowning so he wanted to help by throwing a lifebuoy. However, the lifebuoy is too heavy for him, so it fell on him, thus failed to help. The lifebuoy is then considered unusable.

Table 3. Modulation

SL	TL
<i>Impossible de me servir de cet engin</i>	<i>Benda itu tidak berguna bagiku...</i>

‘There’s no way I use that thing’ is changed into ‘That thing is useless to me’ (*benda itu tidak berguna bagiku*). There is no direct translation of the verb *me servir* which means ‘to use’ (vehicles, or items). The verb is integrated to the sentence in the translation by modifying the point of view, to ‘that is useless to me’ so that the message is still delivered. However, both sentences have the same message about Milou giving up using the lifebuoy, or in other words, the lifebuoy has no use for him.

3.1.3 Generalization

Molina and Albir (2002) stated that this strategy is used to translate a word or a term to its more common or neutral equivalent. This can be used when translating SL that has prominent difference in characteristics from the TL. The strategy can also be used by looking at the context from the word or term used, both in SL and TL. There are 15 data found using generalization, 3 in TA, 6 in TC, and 6 in TT.

Table 4. Generalization

SL	TL
<i>Si je le poursuis, il va s'enfuir, ...</i>	<i>Kalau kukejar, dia lari.</i>

The verb *s'enfuir* (‘melarikan diri’ or ‘to run away’) is translated into *lari* (run) in the dialog above. The context is Tintin creating a strategy to save Milou from a monkey that abducted him. The translation above experienced a generalization because from ‘running away’, which specifically has the sense of getting away from danger, is translated to ‘run’, which means to go faster than a walk. This translation is considered an under-translate because of the lack of meaning the TL has, but it is still acceptable based of the context.

3.1.4 Established equivalent

This strategy uses the equivalent of a word or term that is already established by the TL’s dictionary. A translator can use this strategy if the TL’s equivalent corresponds to the context. 61 data found use established equivalent: 7 in TA, 16 in TC, and 38 in TT.

Table 5. Established Equivalent

SL	TL
<i>Ils se sont aperçus de ma fuite.</i>	<i>Mereka sudah tahu saya lari...</i>

The data in table 5 has the context of Tintin running away from cowboys who fight against one another to capture him, only to realize that they noticed him getting away not long after. *Ils se sont aperçus* means ‘they knew’ (*mereka sudah tahu*), which is the equivalent in the TL. In Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley (2020), this data is considered a synonymy strategy referring to Newmark (1988), because of *sadar* (‘realize’) and *tahu* (‘know’). However, using Molina and Albir’s (2002) theory, established equivalent is more correct: the SL is in the past tense form, which is also followed by the translator in the TL. Therefore, the translation using this strategy is considered correct and acceptable.

3.1.5 Unclassified

7 data in this research could not be classified into any of Molina and Albir’s strategy. 5 out of 7 data combine 2 strategies to translate the pronominal verbs in the dialogs. Although the usage of 2 or more strategies does not exist in their theory, it exists in Newmark’s translation strategies called couplet.

This following sentence is an example of couplet, using modulation and transposition: *il s'appelle Beatrice* which is translated into *namanya Beatrice*. From the translation of *s'appelle*, we state that it experienced modulation because if it is translated literally, it becomes ‘he/she calls him/herself with’ (*dia memanggil dirinya sendiri dengan*) which is modified to suit the TL culture, becoming ‘his/her name is’ (*namanya*). The other strategy used is transposition. In the SL, *s'appelle* is a verb, while in the TL, it becomes *namanya*, a noun.

The remaining 2 that are unclassifiable can also be identified by referring to Newmark’s (1988) synonymy strategy. There are 2 strategies in Molina and Albir’s (2002) theory that are close to synonymy: generalization and particularization. However, both strategies are only for something more specific or generic, not a relatively more neutral or a synonym of the equivalent. An example of the data found is in TC: *Du reste, soyéz sans crainte, il se remettra vite* that is translated into *Suruh dia diet sementara, & jangan beri minum. Dalam beberapa hari*

dia akan sehat lagi... ('tell him to go on a diet for a while, and don't give him a drink. In a few days he will be healthy again'). The pronominal verb *se remettra* in that dialog has the meaning of *pulih* or 'to recover', which is the synonym as *sehat* or 'to be healthy' in the TL.

191 data found experienced different strategies to be translated, with the most strategies used are modulation and established equivalent. The usage of modulation shows that the translator adjusts the way the message is delivered with the TL culture before translating. It is also affected by the context and actions of the corresponding dialogs that use pronominal verbs.

Out of 18 strategies suggested by Molina and Albir (2002), there are only 9 found that are used in translating all 3 comics. The 9 strategies that are not used are amplification, borrowing, calque, compensation, literal translation, description, discursive creation, substitution, and variation. By not applying these strategies to translate the pronominal verbs may happen because the data are considered a smaller element than a sentence or a text. Therefore, there is no need to use these strategies because it does not concern expression or term that has to be explained or changed in the translation.

Aside from the 9 strategies used, there are also 2 strategies that could not be categorized into any of them. One of which is the combination of 2 strategies, or couplet, according to Newmark (1988). Another strategy that is not in Molina and Albir's theory (2002) is one that could use a more neutral or equal to the SL word. The data is relatively like particularization and generalization, however, the translation is not specified or generalized. In other words, the equivalent used for the data is the equivalent with equal meaning. In Newmark's theory, it is called synonymy strategy. Compared to the previous similar study by Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley (2020) which had several data that could not be identified if referring to Newmark's translation strategies, this study provides answers to those unidentified data.

3.2 Communicative translation

Newmark (cited in Shakernia, 2013) stated that this method focuses the translation on the readership. Communicative method is different from semantic translation from its tendency to under-translate a word or a term, simplifies the ST, and natural sounding translation. This under-translate bias happens because of the simplification of translation done by the translator to

facilitate the readers to understand, thus creating a translation that could deviate from or is less than its original meaning.

Based on the above results, it can be said that the translators of the 3 comics used the communicative method to translate pronominal verbs to convey messages contained in the SL. This finding supports Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley's (2020) previous study in terms of pronominal verbs translation in comic using the communicative translation method. The application of this method can be seen from the messages that tend to be less delivered in the TL. For example, *où se cache-t-elle* is only translated into *di mana ya* ('where is it') which does not convey the exact same message. *Di mana ya* contains an ambiguous meaning, because the question is not necessarily used to look for something that is specifically hiding, which differs from the context of the sentence (Milou looking for a spider that ran away and hid). Therefore, this method is used to make it easier for the TL readers to understand what the message is about. The translation carried out does not completely miss the message in the SL, but if one is too fixated on the SL, the result will sound stiff and not suitable for daily use of conversation.

Modulation as the most used strategy in translating data in these comics shows that the translator makes the reader as the focus of the translation, not the ST, so it can produce a translation that tends to under-translate because the message is conveyed in a different way from the ST. Apart from the under-translate, the result is also fluid and more natural sounding. Overall, the communicative method applied by the translators is acceptable in the TL because it can be seen from the strategies used by the translator. All 10 strategies used are focused on the readers when studied from the results of their usage, thus they are used by the translators.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, the most used translation strategies in these three comics is modulation, followed by established equivalent. This indicates that the translators adjusted SL culture into TL culture before translating. This creates changes on how messages are delivered in the TL. They can be easily received if they are written in the perspective of the TL readers. In addition, the equivalent found cannot necessarily be used as a translation for the SL, therefore there is a need to look for another method or word to use to deliver the message contained. This can happen because there is no

TL word that is the equivalent for a word in the SL. However, the number of SL words that already have the equivalents in the TL shows that they are suitable to use in comic translations, making it easier for both translators and readers to convey and understand the message.

This research shows that TT uses more pronominal verbs than the TA and TC. In TT, Captain Haddock tends to use pronominal verbs more in his dialogs than other characters. In addition, TA and TC do not have Captain Haddock in the story. TT also has the highest number of reflexive pronominal verbs between the 3 comics, which are also mostly used by Captain Haddock. This may indicate a link between his selfish personality trait and reflexive verb that focuses on the subject itself.

The result also shows that the comics are translated using the communicative method because the translators must pay attention to how the TL is used and understood by TL speakers. They first have to understand the context before adjusting the translation to the TL culture so that it can be delivered as naturally as possible. An equivalent of a pronominal verb might not be able to be used if they do not include the context as a consideration. Therefore, it is concluded that comic translation is a communicative translation because the translators make the reader as their main focus in translating the ST.

Of the many existing translation theories, Molina and Albir's (2002) theory cannot be said to be better than the previous theories. This is due to the lack of translation strategies that can be referred to in the analysis, namely couplet and synonymy that can be found in Newmark's theory. It can be said that translation theory is varied and flexible and can still be developed and improved following the changing nature of language. Referring to Salsabila and Laksman-Huntley's (2020) study which could be categorized using a Molina and Albir's theory, a theory may not be fully applicable because it can be complemented by other theories. A good translator should learn and refer to existing theories, not just one, in order to get satisfactory results

A translator must have a promising ability to be able to translate French pronominal verbs into Indonesian. They must have a deep knowledge and understanding of both languages, especially SL in order to convey the right message using TL's culture and style. The absence of pronominal verbs in Indonesian makes translation a challenge if they do not understand the SL and the context of the story. The difference in translators cannot be said to be a barrier in this study, because the results

indicate that one of the two comics published by PT Indira has a lot of data that is difficult to categorize. This can indicate the possibility that the two comics studied were not necessarily translated by the same translator.

This study can be used as one of the considerations to bring up a new, more complete translation theory that can be used in translating fictional texts, such as comics. As Igareda (2017), Sell (2011) have stated, this study, can also be referred for language teaching, especially translation. In this case, French to Indonesian, for there is analysis of the application of translation strategies to translate a foreign language phenomenon that does not exist in Indonesian correctly.

REFERENCES

- Aldriansyah, N. (2020, June 13). *Diskusi Santai KTI 7 - Petualangan Penerjemah Tintin* [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5iVIS0hSWog&feature=youtu.be>
- Caumes E., et al. (2016). Captain Haddock's health issues in the adventures of Tintin. Comparison with Tintin's health issues. In *Presse Med.* 2016. DOI: [dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.lpm.2016.02.027](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lpm.2016.02.027).
- Fitria, T. N. (2018). Translation Techniques Found in English to Indonesian Abstract Translation of Journal Translation of Journal EDUNOMIKA 2018. In *ELITE Journal* vol. 05(2).
- García, T. I. I. (2017). Pronominal verbs across European languages: What Spanish alternating pronominal verbs reveal. In Lars Hellan, Andrej L. Malchukov and Michela Cennamo (Ed.). *Contrastive Studies in Verbal Valency. Linguistik Aktuell/Linguistics Today* 237, pp. 376-406.
- Grevisse, M., and Goosse, A. (2007). *Le bon usage* (14th ed.). Bruxelles: De Boeck & Larcier.
- Hatim, B. and Munday, J. 2004. *Translation: An Advanced Resource Book*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Ibrahim, M. A. E., and Mansor, A. M. A. (2017). Factors influencing the quality of translation. In *International Journal of Advanced Educational Research* vol. 2(5), 169-172.
- Igareda, P. (2017). Approach to the translation of sound in comic books. *Babel*, 63(3), 343-363. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/317022280_Approach_to_the_translation_of_sound_in_comic_books

- Kridalaksana, H. (1994). *Kelas kata dalam bahasa Indonesia* (2nd ed.). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Lechner, J. (2009). *The Genius of Tintin*. Retrieved on March 19, 2019 from <http://johnlechner.com/the-genius-of-tintin/>.
- Maisaroh, E. (2017). Translation Shift in Garfield "Takes His Licks" a Bilingual Text. *Jurnal Linguistik Terapan*, vol 14(1): 35-46.
- Molina, L., Albir, A. H. (2002). Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach. *Journal des traducteurs*, vol. 47(4), 498-512.
- Newmark, Peter. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice HaH International.
- Nursabrina, N. N., and Laksman-Huntley, M. (2017). Interjection Equivalences in les Aventures de Tintin: L'Étoile Mystérieuse. Paper presented at the 10th Conference on Applied Linguistics Proceeding, Bandung, Indonesia.
- Pereira, R. (2011). *10 things to know about 'Tintin'*. Retrieved on March 19, 2019 from <http://www.startribune.com/10-things-to-know-about-tintin/136015968/>.
- Salsabila, A., Laksman-Huntley, M. (2020). Indonesian Translation of French Pronominal Verbs: Procedures and Shifts. In *the 3rd International Conference on Linguistics and Language Teaching* Yogyakarta, Indonesia. Retrieved from <https://www.atlantis-press.com/proceedings/icllae-19/125942902>
- Sell, Cathy. (2011). Manga Translation and Interculture. *Mecademia* Vol. 6, 93-108. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.
- Sembiring, I. F. (2016) *Analyse de la Traduction de Verbes Pronominaux dans le Roman Madame Bovary*. Undergraduate Thesis, UNIMED.
- Shakernia, Shabnam. (2013). Study of Nida's (Formal and Dynamic Equivalence) and Newmark's (Semantic and Communicative Translation) Translating Theories on Two Short Stories. In *Merit Research Journal of Education and Review* Vol. 2, 001-007.
- Tobing, I. S. L., Laksman-Huntley, M. (2017). Translation Strategies in European and Canadian French Versions of an Animated Movie's Original Soundtrack. *Francisola* Vol. 2(2), 180-188.
- Wheeler, Kim. (2015). Tintin in America pulled by Winnipeg Public Library. Retrieved from <https://www.cbc.ca/news/indigenous/tintin-in-america-pulled-by-winnipeg-public-library-pending-review-1.3000451>