Analysis of Employment and Poverty Monitoring in the Subjects of Russia

Irina Omelchenko¹, Oleg Dozortzev¹, Marina Danilina¹,²,³ * Ekaterina Safonova¹, Alexander Safonov¹, Olga Selivanova¹

¹ Research Institute VNII of Labour, Ministry of Labour of Russia, Russia
² Russia Finance University under the Government of the Russian Federation, Russia
³ Russian Economic University, Russia
*Email marinadanilina@yandex.ru

ABSTRACT
This article aims to analyse employment in the Russian Federation and analyse poverty's efficiency, reducing methods and monitoring. On the basis of the analysis of the content of the documents and other sources and the use of statistical data, the authors make the conclusion about the poverty situation in the subjects of Russia. The general algorithm for assessing the effectiveness of antipoverty program activities should involve an assessment of each of the activities in the context of its elements. At the same time, the evaluation should take into account the logic of the program. It will allow assessing the relationship of indicators and expected results of activities with the target indicators of the program, as well as assess the contribution of the implementation of activities to the achievement of program objectives and identify activities that do not correspond to the objectives of the program and do not contribute to the achievement of planned targets. The article includes the results of the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs to reduce the proportion of the population with incomes below the subsistence level using the software and information complex (PIK) as well.

Keywords: Employment, Poverty, Monitoring, Labour market, Labour, Indicator, Trend, Russia, Development, Economy.

1. INTRODUCTION

The question of poverty is a problem of a great importance in Russia. As part of the study, a comprehensive assessment of the situation in regional labour markets was carried out based on a combination of such key indicators as the employment rate, unemployment rate, average time to find a job and the proportion of unemployed looking for work 12 months or more.

It is noted that a high level of interregional differentiation characterises the Russian labour market due to different degrees of socio-economic development of regions, their investment attractiveness, different effectiveness of employment policy measures, as well as geographic location, and the associated high costs of territorial labour mobility of the population.

Simultaneously, regional differences in the unemployment rate have been stable for many years and are mainly due to industry specialisation and the development of the service sector in a particular region and the influence of specific regional factors (demographic, natural and geographical).

The poverty analysis in Russia was a subject of research of many scientists and researchers, for example O. Belokrylova [1, p.7, 2, p.34], T. Zaslavskaia, N. Volgin, A. Makhmutov, N. Rimashevskaya [3, p.35, 4, p.9]). They focus on the application of the policy of the government in order to provoke the growth of income of the citizens [1, p.8].
Other researchers like for example Anand, S., Segal, P., & Stiglitz, J. E., analyse the controversies surrounding the definition of a global poverty line; the use of purchasing power parity exchange rates to map such a poverty line across countries; and the quality and appropriate use of data from national accounts and household surveys [5, p.3]. Alkire, S., Roche, J. M., Sumner, A. focus on the difference in the global distribution of multidimensional poverty and income poverty. Only a quarter of MPI poor people and just one-third of severely MPI poor people live in the world’s poorest countries. The other three-quarters of the world’s MPI poor and two-thirds of the world’s severe MPI poor live in middle-income countries, one billion of them in stable middle-income countries [6, p.2].

Another group of researchers, for example M.M. Nazaryan, E.M. Ignatova, M.G. Ivanets, A.I. Toporkov and L.A. Zhurba (Kharkiv Institute of Management). Analyse the poverty in connection with the economic development [10,11,12,13,14]. Also they mention that the level of the development of innovations plays a great role in the determination of the poverty level in the subjects of Russia [15,16,17].

The statistical data of the labour force in Russia in 2020 is given in table 1. It showed a small fluctuation of the labour force last year.

The statistical data of the employment and unemployment in Russia in 2020 is given in table 2. It shows a small fluctuation of the labour force during 2020.

One possible way to diminish the poverty is to increase social production efficiency, increase the degree of realisation of society’s needs, to grow innovations and improve the lives of the people.

One of such examples are Brazil and India. These countries successfully apply innovations in order to achieve social goals. These measures contributed to the rush growth of innovations in the last 20 years. As the result, Brazil experienced social and economic development. The poverty was diminished 50% [7].

For Russia it is useful to research international development in the sphere of poverty and choose the most successful methods for application in the subjects of the Russian Federation.

2. DEVELOPMENT OF A MECHANISM FOR APPLYING BEST PRACTICES TO COMBAT POVERTY

The table 1 presents the dynamics of the labour force in Russia in 2020. It was fluctuating in the diapason from 67.3 till 68.0 percent according to the governmental statistical data.

As noted in the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation of May 7, 2018 No. 204 "On national goals and strategic objectives for the development of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2024", new approaches to the country's development require modernization of public administration mechanisms. In order to synchronize sustainable development for all regions of the country, common goals were identified aimed at developing human capital, economic growth, and creating comfortable living conditions for citizens [8].

At the same time, the national development goals of the country are interconnected, and the achievement of one (for example, poverty reduction) is impossible in isolation from the implementation of others (for example, sustainable economic growth). Presidential Decree No. 474 of July 21, 2020 "On the National Development Goals of the Russian Federation for the Period up to 2030" presents an indicator of the achievement of national goals for sustainable growth in real incomes of citizens and a decrease in the proportion of the population with incomes below the subsistence level. It is a decrease in poverty by 2030 twice compared to 2017 [9].

Table 1. Labour force in Russia in 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Thousand people</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td>74699</td>
<td>67,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td>74428</td>
<td>67,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>74704</td>
<td>67,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>74372</td>
<td>67,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>74398</td>
<td>67,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>74556</td>
<td>67,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July</td>
<td>74797</td>
<td>67,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>75148</td>
<td>68,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>75090</td>
<td>67,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>74808</td>
<td>67,7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [9].
In conditions when the regions face serious challenges to achieve the goals and indicators set in strategic documents, regional management teams need to find and implement solutions that take into account the economic and human potential, the level of infrastructure development, financial capabilities and geographical features of the territory.

At the same time, in order to achieve a multiplier effect from the implementation of regional programs, the choice of measures to reduce poverty is becoming extremely important. In this regard, the tasks of identifying the most effective measures to combat poverty and introducing best practices into the activities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation come to the fore [18,19,20].

At present, the provisions of the Budget Code are taken as the basis for assessing strategic documents, according to which an annual assessment of the effectiveness of the implementation of state and municipal programs is carried out. The need for assessment is related to the need to measure and evaluate the results of management, to identify "problem" places of management and the reasons for not achieving the set goals.

Currently, there is no single methodology for assessing the effectiveness of regional program activities. Applied aspects of assessing the effectiveness of government programs are covered in the works of M.E. Chicheleva, D.Yu. Zavyalova, S.V. Barulina, V.S. Kusmartseva, A.G. Breusova.) [21, 22, 23, 24].

Based on the results of the conducted studies of assessing the effectiveness of state programs, it was determined the following. The assessment of the effectiveness of state programs was reduced by the following components: assessment of the achievement of specified target indicators using the measures provided for by the program (compliance of measures with a given goal); assessment of the resources required to achieve a given goal.

With this approach, the program is considered effective if the planned target indicators were achieved using the minimum amount of funds required for this. The main criteria for assessing the effectiveness of state programs are completeness of achieving target indicators (indicators) set by the state program; correspondence of the actual amount of financing to the planned one [24].

Thus, only the achievement of target indicators and the completeness of funding (full use of budget funds) were assessed. At the same time, when studying approaches to assessing the effectiveness of state programs, a number of problems were identified. They were related to approaches to measuring the costs and results of program activities, assessing the compliance of the planned values of direct and final indicators (funding volumes) with the actual ones, adjusting the approved planned values of target indicators for the next financial year, and revision of the values for the planning period, as a result of which the level of responsibility for achieving the set results decreases.

We believe that the assessment of the effectiveness of activities of regional programs to reduce poverty should be carried out on the basis of quarterly monitoring of activities of regional programs and answer the following questions:

- To what extent is the implementation of the program activities consistent with the goals and objectives of the program?
- To what extent is the implementation of the activity interconnected with the achievement of the set target indicators of the program?
- Have the planned targets been achieved for each of the program activities in the reporting period?
- Are the final indicators as planned?
- Are the costs of implementing the activities of the regional program justified?
- How are the resources used and the results obtained from the program activities related?
- To what extent do the results of the programme's activities affect the change in the main targets for poverty reduction in the region during the reporting period?

Thus, the general algorithm for assessing the effectiveness of program activities should involve an assessment of each of the activities in the context of its elements. At the same time, the evaluation should take into account the logic of the program. It will allow assessing the relationship of indicators and expected results of activities with the target indicators of the program, as well as assess the contribution of the implementation of activities to the achievement of program objectives and identify activities that do not correspond to the objectives of the program and do not contribute to the achievement of planned targets.

3. FORMATION OF REPORTING ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF REGIONAL PROGRAMS TO REDUCE THE PROPORTION OF THE POPULATION WITH INCOMES BELOW THE SUBSISTENCE LEVEL

In accordance with the methodological recommendations, the responsible executors of the regional programs are recommended to monitor the implementation of the activities of the regional program with the recommended frequency of at least once a quarter in order to assess the planned indicators.
In this regard, at the end of the reporting period, the working body analyzes the information on the achievement of the established values of the planned indicators and identifies the degree of achievement of the planned indicators. Annually at the end of the IV quarter, no later than January 31, following the reporting year, information on the implementation of planned activities of the regional program is sent to the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Russian Federation.

A positive result of the implementation of the Regional Program is the achievement of the values of the planned indicators of the Regional Program or the improvement of the actual values over the value of the planned indicator. To determine the degree of implementation of the plan for the implementation of the Regional Program, the actual timing and results of the implementation of measures and control events of the regional program are compared with the expected ones.

In case of revealing deviations of the actual results in the reporting period from those planned in the report, generated based on the monitoring results, a reasoned justification is formulated. It must be done for the reasons for the deviation of the values of indicators achieved in the reporting period from the planned ones, as well as in this regard, changes in the planned values of indicators for the coming period.

Methodological recommendations were brought to the attention of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation by the letter of the Ministry of Labor of Russia dated June 15, 2020 No. 27-3 / 10 / P-5632 with recommendations to bring regional programs to reduce the level of regional poverty. It is approved for the period 2020-2024, in accordance with new recommendations, as well as ensure the implementation and monitoring of the progress of their implementation, taking into account these guidelines.

In the letter of the Ministry of Labor of Russia dated July 15, 2020 No. 27-3 / B-102, the supreme authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation are recommended to fill out the forms for monitoring the implementation of regional programs to reduce the share of the population with incomes below the subsistence level. Also it is mentioned to take into account the methodological recommendations for the I and II quarters 2020 until July 31, 2020 If it is impossible to monitor the progress of the implementation of regional programs, it is recommended to send a letter to the Ministry of Labor of Russia in an official manner, indicating specific reasons.

By letter of the Ministry of Labor of Russia No. 27-3 / 10 / B-6088 dated July 28, 2020, the supreme authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation were recommended to ensure the approval and adjustment of previously approved regional programs. The goal of this measure is to reduce the share of the population with incomes below the subsistence level, taking into account methodological recommendations in time August 15, 2020 Monitoring of these programs is carried out quarterly no later than the 20th day of the month following the reporting quarter.

In letter of the Ministry of Labor of Russia dated August 10, 2020 No. 27-3 / 10 / B-6548, the constituent entities of the Russian Federation were informed about the order of the Ministry of Labor of Russia. This order is dated August 7, 2020 and is called No. 491 "On amendments to the methodological recommendations for the development of regional programs to reduce the share of the population with income below the subsistence level, approved by order of the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Russian Federation dated June 11, 2020 No. 326 ".

As of October 30, 2020, 26 regional programs are under development and have not been sent for expertise. They include the programs in the following regions or subjects of the Russian Federation: Kostroma Region, Tambov Region, Tula Region, Yaroslavl Region, Republic of Karelia, Republic of Komi, St. Petersburg, Republic of Adygea, Volgograd region, Sevastopol, Kabardino-Balkar Republic, Chechen Republic, Republic of Mari El, Republic of Tatarstan, Perm Territory, Nizhny Novgorod Region, Orenburg Region, Chelyabinsk Region, Republic of Tyva, Republic of Khakassia, Novosibirsk Region, Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), Kamchatka Territory, Khabarovsk region, Amur region, Sakhalin region.

For six regions (Ivanovo Oblast, Smolensk Oblast, Tver Oblast, Republic of Dagestan, Republic of Ingushetia, Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Okrug), there is no information on regional programs.

Monitoring of the implementation of measures and the achievement of indicators laid down in the regional program is carried out with the help of PIK.

The purpose of monitoring is to assess the current state of implementation of regional programs, to provide the Ministry of Labor of Russia with up-to-date, complete, reliable and regularly updated information on the implementation of activities of regional programs.

By October 29, 2020, regional poverty reduction programs were approved in 31 constituent entities of the Russian Federation. However, the timing of the implementation of a number of programs does not correspond to the deadlines set for achieving the national development goals of the Russian Federation. This goal must be implemented in accordance with the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation of July 21, 2020 No. 474 "On the national development goals of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2030 ". Also this goal must take into account the Methodological Recommendations approved by the Order of the Ministry.
of Labor and Social Protection of the Russian Federation dated 07.08.2020 No. 491.

In this regard, a significant part of the regional programs is being finalized in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation after the examination carried out by the All-Russian Research Institute of Labor. In view of this, the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs to reduce the proportion of the population with incomes below the subsistence level is not continuous.

As part of the monitoring, the subjects post a report on the activities carried out in the PIK of the Ministry of Labor of Russia.

The report is posted in three forms in the section "Indicators for the implementation of the Regional Program": "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens", "Reduction of poverty in the constituent entity of the Russian Federation by half", "Information on the implementation of planned measures / control events".

As a result of the analysis of the reports submitted to the PIK, it was revealed that a part of the reports in the section "Indicators for the implementation of the Regional Program" was incompletely consistent with the information approved within the framework of regional programs.

For example, in the report of the Irkutsk region on the implementation of planned measures / control events for the 3rd quarter of 2020, there is no information about the event "Training of specialists of social protection agencies under professional development programs" approved for execution within the framework of the regional program. Despite its planned implementation in 2021-2023, in order to ensure comparability, it is recommended to reflect all activities, filling out a note that the activity will be implemented later.

We also note that the report of the Irkutsk region on the implementation of planned activities / milestones does not provide quarterly values. This does not allow tracking intra-annual dynamics and creates risks of failure to achieve target indicators.

Another monitoring problem is the non-simultaneous provision of different program indicators. For example, at the time of this writing, the responsible executive of the Altai Territory provided a report in the form "Information on the implementation of planned measures / control events", but did not provide reporting on the forms "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" and "Reduction of poverty in subject of the Russian Federation ".

This leads to the impossibility of a full analysis of the implementation of the regional program, which creates risks of failure to achieve the target indicators of the program. It is necessary also to pay attention to the need to update a significant number of regional programs.

4. MONITORING OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF REGIONAL PROGRAMS TO REDUCE THE PROPORTION OF THE POPULATION WITH INCOMES BELOW THE SUBSISTENCE LEVEL USING THE SOFTWARE AND INFORMATION COMPLEX (PIK)

Monitoring of the implementation of measures and the achievement of indicators laid down in the regional program is carried out with the help of the PIK of the Ministry of Labor of Russia.

The purpose of monitoring is to assess the current state of implementation of regional programs, to provide the Ministry of Labor and Social Insurance with up-to-date, complete, reliable and regularly updated information on the implementation of activities of regional programs.

By October 29, 2020, regional poverty reduction programs were approved in 31 constituent entities of the Russian Federation. Not all regional programs have been approved in accordance with the requirements of the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation. This decree is dated July 21, 2020 No. 474 "On the national development goals of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2030" and Methodological recommendations approved by the Order of the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Russian Federation dated 07.08.2020 No. 491.

In this regard, a significant part of the regional programs require adjustment, and are currently being finalized. In view of this, the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs to reduce the proportion of the population with incomes below the subsistence level is not continuous.

Formation of reporting in the PIK is carried out using three forms: "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens", "Reduction of poverty in the constituent entity of the Russian Federation by half", "Information on the implementation of planned measures / control events".

In the form No. 1 "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" the subjects enter the values of the target indicators characterizing the increase in the income of citizens.

Form No. 1 includes the following columns:
- item No.;
- name of the indicator;
- unit;
- the values of the indicators of the regional program for the period preceding the reporting period;
planned values of indicators of the regional program;
- the actual values of the indicators of the regional program;
- implementation costs;
- substantiation of deviations in the values of the indicator at the end of the reporting period (if any).

In form No. 2 “Reducing the poverty level by half in the constituent entity of the Russian Federation”, the constituent entities enter the values of target indicators characterizing the reduction in the poverty level.

Form No. 2 includes the following columns:
- item No.;
- name of the indicator;
- unit;
- the values of the indicators of the regional program for the period preceding the reporting period;
- planned values of indicators of the regional program;
- the actual values of the indicators of the regional program;
- selling expenses, thousand rubles;
- substantiation of deviations in the values of the indicator at the end of the reporting period (if any);
- note.

It should be noted that, despite significant similarities between these reporting forms, there are a number of differences. So in the column "Expenses for implementation" in the form No. 1, it is envisaged to detail the sources of resource support for federal and regional.

Form 2 does not provide such detail. Meanwhile, measures taken to achieve the target indicators reflected in this form can also be financed from the federal budget. Also in the form No. 2 there is a column of notes, in which you can enter additional information. Form No. 1 does not provide for the possibility to enter additional information. These differences should be taken into account when improving monitoring.

In the form No. 3 “Information on the implementation of planned measures / control events”, the subjects enter information on the measures taken by the regional program aimed at reducing the level of poverty.

Form No. 3 includes the following columns:
- item No.;
- task name;
- the name of the event;
- responsible executor (full name, position, organization);
- the planned end date of the implementation of the event / milestone;
- the actual date of the end of the implementation of the event / milestone;
- the planned result of the implementation of the event / milestone;
- the actual result of the implementation of the event / control event;
- expenses for the implementation of the event / control event, thousand rubles;
- substantiation of deviations in the values of the indicator at the end of the reporting period (if any).

The report forms are standardized, but each subject fills them out independently, entering the indicators approved in a specific regional program.

The report form "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" is similar to the form "Reducing the poverty level in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation by half". They reflect two types of regional program indicators. At the same time, the regional program itself may contain more types of indicators, or some classification of indicators may be absent.

For example, in the regional program of the Ulyanovsk region, the indicators are divided into 7 categories: "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens", "Reducing the poverty level by half", "Reducing the expenditure side of the citizens' budget", "Providing social assistance to citizens in need", "Effective use social contract ", "Social adaptation of poor citizens ", " Ensuring economic growth ".

Thus, it is impossible to divide all indicators into two forms, which necessitates improving the forms of monitoring.

To increase the efficiency of monitoring the indicators of the regional program, it is recommended to combine the following forms. These forms are as follows: "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" and "Reducing the poverty level by half in the constituent entity of the Russian Federation" into a single form "Indicators of the regional program for reducing poverty", which will reflect all the target indicators of the regional poverty reduction programs.

The composition of the form "Indicators of the regional poverty reduction program" is given in Appendix B. The modified form will significantly simplify the analysis of regional programs.

It is recommended to adopt the reporting form "Indicators of the regional poverty reduction program" in the following columns:
- item No.;
- target;
- name of the indicator;
- unit;
- values of indicators of the regional program:
- the period preceding the reporting period;
- reporting period:
  a) plan;
  b) fact;
- selling expenses, thousand rubles:
- implementation costs (federal budget), thousand rubles;
- implementation costs (regional budget), thousand rubles;
- implementation costs (general), thousand rubles;
- the period preceding the reporting period;
- reporting period:
  a) plan;
  b) fact;
- substantiation of deviations in the values of the indicator at the end of the reporting period (if any);
- note.

This composition of the reporting form will allow you to analyze the attainability of indicators, their dynamics, financing features, deviations from plans.

At the same time, in the improved reporting form, it is possible to enter the information about any target indicators of the regional program. It makes them provided, that they correspond to the goals and objectives of the regional program. Also it shows that the programs do not contradict the achievement of national goals to ensure sustainable growth in incomes of citizens and reduce poverty, determined by the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation dated July 21, 2020 No. 474 "On the national development goals of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2030".

Thus, in order to improve the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs, it is recommended to combine form No. 1 "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" and form No. 2 "Reducing the poverty level in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation" into a single form "Indicators of the regional program for reducing poverty." It is recommended to leave the reporting form "Information on the implementation of planned measures / milestones" unchanged.

In order to improve the technical aspects of PIK, it was recommended to implement the function of copying / pasting from documents in doc and docx (MS Word), xls and xlsx (MS Excel) formats. The implementation of this function will greatly facilitate the filling and analysis of reporting forms.

5. RESULTS

The result of the analysis of the reports submitted to the PIK, it was revealed that a part of the reports in the section "Indicators for the implementation of the Regional Program" was incompletely consistent with the information approved within the framework of regional programs.

Another monitoring problem is the non-simultaneous provision of different program indicators. This leads to the impossibility of a full analysis of the implementation of the regional program, which creates risks of failure to achieve the target indicators of the program. It is necessary also to pay attention to the need to update a significant number of regional programs.

Also it was determined that a significant part of the regional programs require adjustment, and are currently being finalized. In view of this, the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs to reduce the proportion of the population with incomes below the subsistence level is not continuous.

Also in order to improve the monitoring of the implementation of regional programs, it is recommended to combine form No. 1 "Ensuring sustainable growth of real incomes of citizens" and form No. 2 "Reducing the poverty level in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation" into a single form "Indicators of the regional program for reducing poverty." It is recommended to leave the reporting form "Information on the implementation of planned measures / milestones" unchanged.

6. CONCLUSION

To conclude, the general algorithm for assessing the effectiveness of program activities should involve an assessment of each of the activities in the context of its elements. At the same time, the evaluation should take into account the logic of the program. It will allow assessing the relationship of indicators and expected results of activities with the target indicators of the program, as well as assess the contribution of the implementation of activities to the achievement of program objectives and identify activities that do not correspond to the objectives of the program and do not contribute to the achievement of planned targets.

As the result of the work on the questions raised, in the next researchers will be developed the methodology for assessing the effectiveness of regional programs. It
has the goal to increase incomes of citizens and reduce poverty, on the basis of which work will continue to identify the most effective measures to combat poverty and introduce best practices to combat poverty in the activities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

REFERENCES


[10] A. Bashkatova, If the population becomes poor, the country will not become a great power [Poka naseleniye bedneyet, strana ne stanet velikoy derzhavoy], Independent newspaper [Nezavisimaya gazeta], Iss. 4, 2019.


[16] O. Solov'yeva, Russian poverty infected developed countries [Rossiyskaya bednost' zarazila razvitiye strany], Independent newspaper [Nezavisimaya gazeta], Iss. 4, 2019.


