

# Comparative Study of Learning Outcomes Using Main and Supporting Textbooks in Pancasila Education Courses

Didik Iswahyudi\*

Civic Education Study Program  
Universitas PGRI Kanjuruhan Malang  
Malang, Indonesia  
\*didik@unikama.ac.id

Suwito

Geography Education Study Program  
Universitas PGRI Kanjuruhan Malang  
Malang, Indonesia  
suwito@unikama.ac.id

**Abstract**—Textbook was one of teaching material that could help students learning. Textbook should be carefully selected, processed, adapted if needed, and judged for successful application in the classroom. The study aims to compare two Pancasila Education textbook for higher education. The research was quasi experiment. The subjects were eighty students of civics education department in Kanjuruhan University of Malang. The subjects were selected by stratified sampling. Then, they were grouped into experimental and control group, both group learned Pancasila Education with different supplementary textbook. The data were gain score collected from the test and analyzed using t test. Independent test results of sample t test showed that the use of book A significantly influenced learning outcomes as the significance value less than 0.05. Book A could facilitate students to use the book effectively as well as providing contextual and analytical problem solving that affect students' learning outcome.

**Keywords**—comparative study, learning outcomes

## I. INTRODUCTION

Teaching materials are handbooks that are used by educators and written and compiled by experts in related fields to meet the needs of learning resources in learning. Teaching materials can also be referred to as written works in the form of books used in learning to achieve instructional goals. Teaching materials facilitate independent learning activities substantially as well as presentation [1].

The preparation of teaching materials needs to have principles, approaches, methods, and contains clear teaching techniques. In addition, teaching materials also need to provide good, systematic, and varied sources of information. In addition, teaching materials need to be attractive so that they can increase student interest and motivation [2].

Good teaching materials must also meet the requirements 1) enriching and supporting the curriculum, taking into account the various interests, abilities, and maturity levels of the student population using materials, 2) stimulating the growth of factual

knowledge, literary appreciation, aesthetic values, and ethical standards, 3) providing background information that will enable students to make intelligent judgments in their daily lives, 4) provide material on the opposite side of controversial issues to enable students to develop under the guidance, practice of critical reading and thinking, 5) provide material that contains many cultural contributions to heritage countries and the world [3].

Students can learn independently, find out learning outcomes independently, and emphasize mastery of learning materials optimally. Most teaching materials require learners to actively interact with learning materials, not telling them to just read passively. Through the use of teaching materials, students can do study assignments and carry out evaluations and get feedback.

Teaching materials that can develop student learning experiences are informative teaching materials (informing learning objectives), instructional (for face-to-face and practical learning), formulating clear learning experiences, motivation, exploration to help students make discoveries. new to learning [1]. The ideal teaching materials are teaching materials that can provide information and learning experiences and are developed with good designs and features.

Teaching materials that are designed are also able to develop competencies and provide meaningful learning experiences such as teaching materials developed with a total learning experience model. The development of teaching materials must involve and use student experiences in a holistic manner [4]. Teaching materials developed based on holistic experience will 1) provide many learning activities to build learning experiences, 2) utilize student learning activities to visualize and actualize learning materials, 3) utilize student learning activities to reflect mental activities and help make discovery in their learning.

There are a lot of textbook which can be used in Pancasila education course. The lecturer usually has a specific main references book. Meanwhile, there were two newest domestic

Pancasila Education books, namely book A [5] and book B [6]. Both book was similar in the content yet some difference in presentation. Textbook should be carefully selected, processed, adapted if needed, and judged for successful application in the classroom [7]. This study aims to compare both book on its effect to students learning outcome.

## II. METHODS

The form of research used to determine the effectiveness of teaching materials in this study is a quasi experiment because the treatment given to research subjects is not completely controlled. This treatment is also not carried out too strictly and is only limited to the implementation of learning in class. The subjects were 80 students of civics education department. The subjects of this study were divided into 2 (two) groups, namely the experimental group and the control group. The experimental group is the class that gets treatment using Book A while the control group is the class that gets treatment using Book B.

The instrument for assessing learning outcomes used an essay test totaling 5 essay questions. Before being used, a question review was carried out, test questions, and question analysis were to determine the suitability of the questions with the learning objectives, to determine the number of questions, and the correctness of the concepts used. The analysis includes the validity of the items, the reliability of the items, the difficulty level of the items, and the analysis of the distinguishing power of the items.

This quasi-experimental assessment data analysis technique uses inferential statistical methods. So in the analysis of this study using the t-test with a significance level of 5%. Hypothesis testing is based on the results of calculations using SPSS 16.0 for windows.

## III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The data from this research is the gain score or the difference between the initial ability score (pretest) and the final ability score (posttest). Table 1 show t-test result of the gain score. Independent test results of sample t test showed that the use of book A significantly influenced learning outcomes as the significance value less than 0.05.

TABLE I. T-TEST RESULT

| Group      | N  | Gain Score Mean | Std. Deviation | t     | df     | Sig. (2-tailed) |
|------------|----|-----------------|----------------|-------|--------|-----------------|
| Experiment | 40 | 18.333          | 6.5020         | 8.597 | 83     | .000            |
| Control    | 40 | 6.628           | 6.0475         | 8.590 | 82.241 | .000            |

There was some possible explanation why students who learned with book A got better learning outcome, as follows. Book A have a complete structure that make it easier for

students to learn independently. In the general instructions section there are several points that make it easy for students to understand how to use it. In the contents section presented material in scientific form. The textbook should be stands alone and consists of a series of activities learning designed to help students achieve a number of formulated goals specifically and clearly [8]. The book was also equipped with actual, contextual, and relevant example about the content. Contextual approach in delivering the content was proven to improve students' learning outcome [9,10]. The textbook also attached some exercise involving analytical problem solving. Higher order thinking based on problem solving can improve students' learning outcome which is character oriented [11].

## IV. CONCLUSION

The Book A improved students learning outcome better than book B. Book A could facilitate students to use the book effectively as well as providing contextual and analytical problem solving that affect students' learning outcome.

## REFERENCES

- [1] B. Tomlinson, "Materials development for language learning and teaching," *Language Teaching*, vol. 45, no. 2, pp. 143-179, 2012.
- [2] A. Bozkurt, and M. Bozkaya, "Evaluation Criteria for Interactive E-Books for Open and Distance Learning," *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*, vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 58-82, 2015.
- [3] BPSDMP-PMP, *Pedoman Penulisan Buku Ajar Peningkatan Kompetensi Pendidik*. Jakarta: BPSDMP-PMP, 2012.
- [4] B. Tomlinson and J. Avila, "Seeing and saying for yourself: the roles of audio-visual mental aids in language learning and use," *Language acquisition and development: Studies of learners of first and other languages*, pp. 61-81, 2007.
- [5] S. Wahono, S. Surajiyo, and D. Kadewardana, *Pancasila untuk perguruan tinggi*. Jakarta: Akademika Pressindo, 2017.
- [6] A.B. Nufus, N. Novitasari, and S. Mazid, *Pendidikan Pancasila sebagai Paradigma Pembangunan*. Malang: Madani Media, 2018.
- [7] F. Dar, "Textbook materials and their successful application in the classroom: Implications for language development," *Journal of Educational and Instructional Studies in the World*, vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 109-114, 2012.
- [8] N. Nasution, *Berbagai Pendekatan Dalam Proses Belajar & Mengajar (Varieties of Learning and Teaching Approach)*. Bandung: Bumi Aksara, 2006.
- [9] I. Mahendra, "Contextual learning approach and performance assessment in mathematics learning," *International Research Journal of Management, IT & Social Sciences*, vol. 3, no. 3, pp. 7-15, 2007.
- [10] S. Purnawati, A. Fauzan, and S. Rasidin, "Contextual Learning Styles-Based Approach to Improve Mathematics Learning Outcomes In Primary School," In *1st International Conference on Innovation in Education (ICoIE 2018)*, Atlantis Press, 2019.
- [11] T. Widodo, and S. Kadarwati, "Higher order thinking berbasis pemecahan masalah untuk meningkatkan hasil belajar berorientasi pembentukan karakter siswa (Higher order thinking based on problem solving to improve learning outcomes oriented to character building students)," *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, vol. 5, no. 1, 2013.