

# Key Success Factors Implementation of Parking Meter System in Padang to Optimize Parking Levy Revenue:

## A Qualitative Study from Academicians and Bureaucrat Perspectives

Henri Agustin<sup>1,\*</sup> Halmawati<sup>2</sup> Fefri Indra Arza<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, Indonesia

\*Corresponding Author. Email: [henri\\_feunp@yahoo.co.id](mailto:henri_feunp@yahoo.co.id)

### ABSTRACT

In the last 3 years (2017-2019) the average percentage of the effectiveness of parking fee receipts in the city of Padang is very low, which is only 33.17% per year. This figure should be an early warning for evaluating policies and management of collecting parking levy. This study aims to gain understanding in sociology and public policy experts, and officials of the Padang city transportation service regarding the parking meter system as a new innovation for collecting parking levy. This research is a phenomenology qualitative research. The research data were obtained through in-depth interviews with 2 sociologists and public policy experts, and 1 official from Padang City Transportation Agency. The interactive analysis model developed by Miles and Huberman (1992) was used to analyze the data. This study found that character & capacity building, leadership, technology, and rule of law are key success factors that must be needed for successful implementation of parking meters system in Padang city. Research with similar topics in the future is expected to attract input from public transportation and urban planning expert, for better insights how parking meters system makes public for better transportation in Padang city.

**Keywords:** *Parking meter system, parking levy, academicians, bureaucrat, Padang.*

### 1. INTRODUCTION

This study aims to get a deep understanding from sociologist and public policy expert, and also padang city transportation agency officials regarding the parking meter system as an new innovation to collect parking levy in Padang city. The views of these experts and officials need to be known in order to gain an in-depth understanding of how the public policy process is created, and how the attitudes of the city community in facing these new public policy changes.

This research was inspired by the news of the [1] and [2] which reported that the Padang City Transportation Agency intends to re-implement the meter parking system after previously being stopped since February 2017. This research is also a response to research suggestions by [3] for periodic evaluation on the implementation policies as well as the technical and operational aspects of collecting parking fees implemented by the local government, as well as research by [4] and [5] to examine the idea of implementing an e-parking system to maximize the acceptance of parking fees, and the importance of

the role of parking meter machines along with parking restrictions and parking management as an instrument for on-street parking control.

The contribution of this research lies in completing the parking meter research niche in Indonesia (in general) and the city of Padang (in particular). Until this article was completed, research on the parking meter system or e-parking system in Indonesia was still concentrated on 4 big topics, First conflicts that occur due to the parking meter system, for example [6]. Second, financial feasibility study of the e-parking system, for example [7]. Third, rejection of the meter parking system, for example [8]. Forth, and evaluation of the implementation of the e-parking system, for example [9], [10], [11], [12], [13]. This study is also a follow-up to the research findings of [14] which found that transportation experts, students, shop owners, and vehicle owners in the city of Padang prefer the metered parking system than the ticket system to be implemented on Permindo, Niaga, and Pondok street based on traffic smoothness and vehicle safety considerations.

For the city government of Padang, the findings of this research can be used as input to determine the best parking levy collection policy, which not only could increase original regional income, but also in line with the expectations of city residents. As for the academic world, the findings of this research can be used as a source of additional literature on parking meter system research in Indonesia.

## 2. RESEARCH METHOD

This research is a phenomenology qualitative research, which is research that provides a comprehensive and in-depth picture of a topic or phenomenon, based on the understanding or perception of the research subject in natural settings [15]. Primary data required in this study were obtained by conducting in-depth interviews with research informants from academia and local parking management officers. For academia, in-depth interviews were conducted with 3 sociologist academics and 2 public policy expert. As for local parking management official, an in-depth interview was conducted with 1 ASN from parking subag of the Padang City Transportation agency

The research team used a recording device to store research data. Interview material with key informants consist of (1) failure of the parking meter system pilot project in 2017, (2) the idea of a ticket system being replaced by meter parking system, (3) the key success factors of implementing meter parking system, (4) the best parking meter technology for the city of Padang. The interview data obtained were then analyzed using an interactive analysis model developed by Miles and Huberman (1992); namely data collection, data presentation, data reduction, and drawing conclusions [15].

## 3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### 3.1. Agree or disagree with parking meter

The Padang city government is interested in parking meters as a new innovation in collecting parking fees, because this innovation was reported in a number of mass media successfully implemented in Jakarta). Mr W from padang Transportation agency confirmed it.

*“.....Parkir konvensional (sistem karcis ini kan rawan ya pak .....sering bocor....lalu gak terukur....Kita pengennya PAD meningkat kan....kebetulan di jakarta udah coba....kalo di jakarta itu jenis mesinnya 1 mesin bisa pantau 20 mobil.....Kebetulan tahun 2016, ada penawaran dari swasta...PT MATA namanya...mereka presentasi di depan pak wali....mesin yang mereka bawa itu 1 mesin bisa pantau 4 mobil, jadi tipe mesinnya beda....pak wali tertarik.... dibuatlah*

*MOU dengan pak wali....PT. MATA ini bersedia investasi, kita pemko gratis gak keluar biaya....*

(Interviewed with Mr W, official of Padang city Transportation Agency )

Mr. Dr. (candidate) A, a sociologist from Andalas University and Mr Dr. EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang firmly refuses to agree that the parking meter idea is implemented in the city of Padang, because it is feared that it will create new unemployment, plus the potential for vehicle owners to suffer from double levies, and potential destruction of public facilities.

*“.....parkir meter itu tidak akan efektif.....tidak akan bermanfaat....dan akan merugikan konsumen, karena ada kemungkinan konsumen kena 2x....mereka tetap bayar ke petugas walaupun telah bayar parkir melalui mesin, karena rasa tidak enak sama petugas)..... Parkir meter itu hanya cocok diterapkan di negara2 maju yang tenaga SDM nya kurang....kita ini kelebihan penduduk (surplus tenaga)...kerja)...kita pakai parkir meter ini akan menyisihkan mereka.....contoh, biasanya di permindo ada 6 tukang parkir, kalau dipasang alat ini 2 aja yang nanti terpakai, 4 lainnya dikemakan ? ....kalau ini rencana mau dijalankan pemko, itu rencana yang tidak masuk akal, tidak ramah dengan kenyataan bahwa kita surplus tenaga kerja.....”*

(Interview with Dr.(candidate) A, sociologist from Universitas Andalas)

*“.....cara seperti ini tidak efektif....dimana mau dipasang mesin parkirnya nanti ?....kalau pasang ditrotoar jalan kayak di permindo itu ....salah itu....Trotoar itu untuk pejalan kaki, kok dipasang mesin ?.....”*

(Interview with Dr.EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

Meanwhile, other key informants accepted the idea of parking meter system with various considerations. For instance, because it is time for the management of a conventional parking system (ticket system) to adapt to the times and developments in IT. it's just that it must be implemented in certain zones. Another reason is more potential to make parking order better than the current conventional parking system (ticket system).

*“..Padang ini sudah menuju kota modern, sementara pengelolaan parkirnya masih konvensional.....tertinggal dibandingkan daerah lain.....Kebijakan parkir meter di kota padang ini sebenarnya bisa diterapkan, tapi mesti kita batasi....ada zonanya....pada zona2 tertentu saja...”*

(Interview with Dr.ED, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

*".....Ambo antusias dengan ide parkir meter ini, mungkin karena ambo pernah tinggal di luar negeri, jadi pengen tahu pula bagaimana gaya parkir meter ala Padang. Cuma ambo lebih suka dengan potensi ketertibannya, dibandingkan dengan untuk tingkatan PAD jika awak adopsi parkir meter ini....sebab selama ini dengan tidak ada parkir meter (tetap menggunakan sistem karcis sekarang)...ketertiban itu tidak ada...gak nampak....dan semua orang keliatannya feel ok dengan ketidaktertiban itu....."*

(Interview with Dr.AK, public policy expert from Universitas Negeri Padang)

### **3.2. Key Success Factors of Parking Meter System Implementation**

#### **3.2.1. Character & Capacity Building**

Our key informants suggest that character and capacity building is necessary for successful implementation of parking meter system in Padang, because parking meter system will introduce new habit and new culture to people of Padang. Mr. Dr. EVP sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang (UNP) suggested that the Padang city government conduct intensive socialization, so that the public can accept paying parking levy via parking meters as a new norm or habit. Mr. Dr. ED another sociologist from believes that education and outreach from the regulatory government makes the community ready to accept these changes.

*".....pemda perlu melakukan sosialisasi kebijakan ini kepada masyarakat masyarakat bisa menerima itu sebagai norma baru....sosialisasi ini mesti masif, intens, biar masyarakat ingat paham mengapa bayar via parkir meter ini penting, dan bayar ke jukir itu salah...."*

(Interview with Dr. EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

*"....kalau perlu pasang papan pengumuman "anda memasuki kawasan parkir meter".....seperti di tepi laut itu....."kawasan bebas pungli"....kalau udah seperti itu cek dan recek kan jalan....masyarakat bisa negur jukir yang masih pungli...."*

(Interview with Dr. EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

Unlike the 2 previous academicians, Dr AK public policy expert from Universitas Negeri Padang chose the social engineering process to built new norm or habit.

*"...kalau kota Padang ini ingin melakukan social engineering dengan aturan itu....kalau ingin mengajarkan masyarakat parkir menggunakan parkir meteran....itu ok...jika mau mengintrodusir sebuah kebudayaan baru.."*

(Interview with Dr. AK, public policy expert from Universitas Negeri Padang)

#### **3.2.2. Leadership**

Our key informants express several indicator that lead to characteristics of good leadership. The first indicator of leadership is the ability or willingness to map parking problems well, as well as to find the right solution to the problem. Mr. Dr. (candidate) A, a sociologist from Universitas Andalas questioned whether before arriving at the idea of the meter parking system, the Padang city government (the mayor and the transportation agency) had studied the parking problem of Padang city comprehensively. Because if you only focus on increasing PAD, the potential for parking meter failure is believed to be high, because it is not necessarily an effective solution to other parking problem.

*"....kita tidak bisa menata kota kita ini seperti kota lain, karena kenyataan dan masalah sosialnya beda....sosiologisnya beda...jika bikin kebijakan tanpa mau menelaah kenyataan sosial, masalah sosial yang ada....coba aja....paling 3 bulan kemudian gagal lagi....."*

*".....coba kita lupakan ide parkir meter ini dulu.....dengan sistem parkir sekarang saja (sistem karcis/setor target), apa saja persoalan parkir yang sudah dibenahi pemda ? 1....memaksa jukir pasang rompi gak bisa pemda....apalagi mengurus insiden2 yang terjadi dilapangan,....2. target PAD gak tercapai....itu karena ada pasar gelap di sini....lai tau pemda tu? potensi duit yang bisa dipungut sebetulnya jauh lebih besar dari estimasi/target yang ditetapkan pemda,.... ada invisible hand yang ngatur setoran parkir ini...3. cari parkir susah....terhalang sama pedagang yang buka lapak di badan jalan....mampu tidak pemda atasi ini hanya andalkan parkir meter saja ???"*

*".....dari seluruh ruas jalan yang ada di Padang ini...yang dipunguti duit parkirnya....pemda udah tau belum jalan mana yang pendapatan parkir nya paling tinggi ? yang paling rendah setoran parkirnya....udah pelajari belum kenapa bisa tinggi penerimaan parkir disana, tapi di jalan ini dikit ?....jika pemda gak tau...berarti mereka gak liat kondisi di lapangan, lantas bagaimana yakin bahwa parkir meter solusinyo ???"*

(Interview with Dr.(candidate) A, sociologist from Universitas Andalas)

The second indicator of leadership so that the plan to re-implement the parking meter system runs well is the ability to eliminate sectoral egos. When the local government realizes that the parking problem is complex, it must be handled across sectors. The bureaucracy that is under the regional head must synergize with each other.

*"...pemda harus tegas,... nampakkan leadership itu... walikota terutama.... supaya jangan birokrasi di bawahnya seperti pegang bola panas.....ini urusan dishub karena parkir, ini urusan dinas perdagangan karena di pasar raya.....oh ini....urusan satpol PP karena mesti tertibkan urang bagak....kepala OPD-OPD tersebut mesti bisa diarahkan menjadi 1 teamwork....dia punya kewenangan dan punya regulasi...optimalkan itu, jangan diam saja...."*

(Interview with Dr.(candidate) A, sociologist from Universitas Andalas)

The third indicator of leadership so that the plan to re-implement the parking meter system runs well is seriousness and assertiveness. Whatever the local government policy, even if the goal is good, it will always be raw if there is no seriousness and decisiveness from the top to the bottom level to execute it. If this happens then the policy can be viewed as a mere trial error, so that it can reduce the credibility and authority of the government in the eyes of the public.

*".....kalau udah diputuskan pemda mesti serius menjalankannya...pilih rekanan yang kompeten, yang udah pengalaman, (2) dukung dengan perda yang mengatur parkir meter, ada kejelasan juklak dan juknisnya, (3) sanksi mesti tegas kepada yang langgar...dari atas sampai perangkat di bawah..."*

*".....tidak bisa kebijakan itu anget2 tahi ayam, sekedar trial error,..... sekali diputus, kawal terus sampai berhasil...ketemu masalah dicari solusi.....jangan diam saja"*

(Interview with Dr. ED, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

The forth indicator of leadership so that the plan to re-implement the parking meter system runs well is monitoring and evaluation. Because it is believed that there will be many conflicts of interest that occur, as well as resistance from those who feel they have been harmed. Local governments need to ensure that this policy is indeed effective.

*".....ada masalah/budaya dibiokrasi kita....asal sesuatu udah diserahkan ke swasta....mereka lepas tangan....pengawasan buruk....padahal dilapangan pengelolaan buruk....swasta ko gak bisa maksimal dapat duit karena masyarakat gak diedukasikan, disosialisasikan....urang bagak ado gak ditertibkan ...dibiarkan aja ikut mungut, terutama di tempat yang minim petugas parkir...."*

(Interview with Dr. ED, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

### 3.2.3. Technology

The key informants of this study emphasized that whoever is the private party elected by the

Padang city government, must bring technology or other alternatives that are in accordance with the culture of the people of Padang city who do not want to be complicated, fast, and cheap. Because previous machine is considered inflexible and outdated. For example QRIS or parking subscription.

*".....saya gak rekomended kalo masih pakai mesin di permindo itu....merusak penataan trotoar....kenapa gak pertimbangkan alternatif lain yang lebih simpel, tapi tidak merusak fasilitas publik. Parkir berlangganan misalnya...kita udah bayar dimuka, tinggal tunjukan kartu.....atau pakai QRIS ....tinggal di scan barcode saja...lebih mudah dan mobile....dan yang penting itu uangnya kan tetap masuk ke pemda....tapi biaya teknologi itu lebih murah,....feasibel pula, semua orang bisa melakukan itu....pake HP bisa kita bayar parkir jadinya..."*

(Interview with Dr. EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

*"....betul itu, mesin parkir meter yang besar itu saya liat modernisasi mesinnya kurang...ribet lo....pakai siap sedia lo dengan koin, atau beli kartu segala...kalau mau memodernisasi pemungutan parkir....cari teknologinya yang praktis.... ....ada yang pake scanner barrcode .....ya QRIS .....kayaknya lebih praktis, bisa digunakan pake HP....mesjid aja ada sekarang yang pakai QRIS untuk kumpul infkak, sedekah jemaah....kenapa gak bisa pula dicoba untuk pungut parkir meter ??..."*

(Interview with Dr. ED, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

### 3.2.4. Rule of Law

Mr. Dr. MFA, a public policy expert from Universitas Negeri Padang emphasized the importance of the existence of a rule of law if this parking meter is to be run again by the Padang city government. The legal regulation could be in the form of revision prious perda (local regulation), so it accommodate both ticket system and parking meter system. In the other hand, it could be create new perda accodating parking meter system.

*".....Sistem karcis itu diatur dalam perda atau perwako ? perda.....? perda lama tidak bisa memayungi ini karena untuk sistem karcis, sementara parkir meter kan beda jauh....sesuatu yang jalan tanpa perda atau perwako berarti liar. ...berbahaya sekali penyerahan pengelolaan pemungutan parkir yang tidak didukung dengan aturan main yang jelas.....Bagaimana mengajak orang untuk patuh...atau mau kasi sanksi pelanggaran jika aturannya saja gak ada...."*

(Interview with Dr. MFA, public policy expert from Universitas Negeri Padang)

In Addition, Dr. EVD, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang focuses on the clarity of legal rule, that must not have multiple interpretations and be unambiguous. Thus there is minimal opportunity for someone to behave deviantly such as avoiding rules or negotiating rules.

“.....banyak kebijakan negara itu berpedoman pada norma hukum...dia (negara atau daerah) bisa paksakan itu pada masyarakat.....contoh pada kasus parkir ini ...(1) jika tidak ditegakan sungguh2 maka mereka gak mau bayar parkir, parkir sembarangan, dsb.....(2) jika hukum itu bisa diterjemahkan multi tafsir....orang juga akan bisa berperilaku menyimpang.....menghindar misalnya,.....menegosiasi hukuman misalnya...”

(Interview with Dr. EVP, sociologist from Universitas Negeri Padang)

#### 4. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

The plan of the Padang city government to re-implement parking meters can be interpreted as two important things. First, the willingness to improve the management of public road parking fees. Second, the willingness to open alternatives other than the ticket system; which has long been criticized for being prone to being misused, not transparent, uneconomical, triggering the growth of illegal parking in many places. The failure implementation of parking meter system at Jalan Permindo, Pondok, and Niaga, caused the Padang city government to be more careful in implementing this new alternative. In-depth knowledge is needed on what things must be prepared so that the parking meter system produces a better impact than the previous system (ticket system).

Our key informants have different opinions on the idea of parking meters replacing the ticket system to collect public road parking fees. The majority of key informants expressed their agreement with the idea of a metered parking system, due to the potential for producing better orderliness and in accordance with urban modernization trends. However, another key informant who expressed his disagreement with metered parking, due to the potential for double levies and an increase in new unemployment. Apart from this, all key informants agreed that considering the fairly complex parking problems in the city of Padang (leaky deposits, chaotic, limited parking space, etc.), a breakthrough parking policy is needed.

This research finds that capacity & character building, leadership, technology, and rule of law are things that must be prepared if the meter parking system is to be re-implemented in the city of Padang to collect parking levy. Capacity & character building can be done by means of socialization,

education, and social engineering. Leadership must be implemented in the form of mapping problems, eliminating structural egos, seriousness and assertiveness, and monitoring and evaluation. The technology brought by operators is expected to be simpler but still IT-based, so that QRIS and bank cards should be considered. Meanwhile, legal regulations can be done in the form of revisions to old regional regulations, or or make local regulations or special perwako parking meters.

Research with similar topics in the future is expected to use academics in urban planning and public transportation as key informants, to further complement the insight into the solution to parking problems and at the same time make the parking management of Padang city better.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] <https://hariansinggalang.co.id/parkir-meter-bakal-diterapkan-lagi-di-padang/>
- [2] <https://sumbar.antaranews.com/berita/228037/padang-segera-terapkan-kembali-sistem-parkir-meter>.
- [3] Gunawan, Endra. (2018). Pengaruh Efektifitas Penerimaan Pajak Daerah dan Retribusi Daerah Terhadap Pendapatan Asli Daerah Kabupaten Aceh Timur. *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Manajemen Teknologi (JEMT)*. 2(1). 28-37.
- [4] Religia, Destika dan Pratomo, Dudi, (2014). Analisis Pengaruh Efektifitas Pajak dan Retribusi Parkir Terhadap Efektifitas Pendapatan Asli Daerah Kota Bandung Tahun 2011-2013. *E-proceeding of Management*. 1(3). 158-169.
- [5] Roza, Angelalia; Guvil, Quinoza; Birman, Redho Budiman. (2018). Analisis Kinerja Ruas Jalan Akibat On-street Parking Pasca Pemasangan Alat Parkir Meter. *Jurnal Teknik Sipil ITP*. 5(2). 62-76.
- [6] Rahayu, Ega Sri; Firdaus; Asshary, Salman. (nd). *Konflik Penerapan Parkir Meter di Kota Padang: Studi Kasus Penolakan Parkir Meter oleh Juru Parkir Manual di Kecamatan Padang Barat*. 1-11.
- [7] Negara, Nyoman Widana; Ariawan, I Made Agus; Nursanjaya, Kadek Dwipa. (2018). Kelayakan Finansial Pemasangan Parkir Meter Untuk On Street Parkir di Kota Denpasar (Studi Kasus: Jalan Maluku). *Jurnal Ilmiah Teknik Sipil*. 22(1). 1-6.
- [8] Agustin, Henri and Betavia, Ade Elsa. (2018). *User Resistance To Use E-Parking System In*

*Indonesia From Status Quo Bias Theory Perspective: Evidence from Padang City, West Sumatera Province.* 2<sup>nd</sup> International Conference on Banking, Accounting, Management, and Economics (ICOBAME).

- [9] Qohar, Muhammad Taufan. (2018). Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Terminal Parkir Elektronik di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Wacana Kinerja*. 21(2). 37-54.
- [10] Pradipta, Rizky dan Hariani, Dyah. (2017). Efektifitas Program Terminal Parkir Elektronik (TPE) di DKI Jakarta (Studi Kasus Jalan H. Agus Salim Jakarta Pusat). *Jurnal Kebijakan Publik & Review Manajemen*. 6(2). 1-10.
- [11] Artamalia, Deldha Eky dan Prabawati, Indah. (2019). Evaluasi Program E-Parking di Balai Kota Surabaya. *PUBLIKA*. 7(3). 1-8.
- [12] Hayati, Rahadatul dan Fanida, Eva Hany. (2018). Strategi Pengembangan Pelayanan Parkir Melalui E-Parking Di Tepi Jalan Umum Oleh Dinas Perhubungan Kota Surabaya (Studi Kasus E-Parking di Jalan Jimerto dan Jalan Sedap Malam Kota Surabaya). *PUBLIKA*. 6(1). 1-8.
- [13] Kireina, Nurani Fitri. (2017). Mesin Parkir Elektronik Sebagai Wujud Dari Smart City di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik (JISPO)*. 7(2). 63-80.
- [14] Saputri, Olvina; Nur, Hamdi; Aditia, Ezra. (nd). Kajian Pilihan Sistem Parkir antara Sistem Parkir Konvensional dan Sistem Parkir Meter dan Dampak Penerapannya dengan menggunakan Metode *Analytical Hierarchy Process* (Jalan Permindo-Jalan Niaga-Jalan Pondok Kota Padang). 1-20.
- [15] Creswell, John W. (2014). Research Design: Penelitian Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed. Terjemamah Ahmad Fawaid. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.