

# Development Planning Deliberatif:

## Making Frame Work Democratic Governance

Nani Harlina Nurdin\*

Student Doctoral Program of Public Administration Science  
 Universitas Hasanuddin  
 Makassar, Indonesia  
 \*naniharlinda69@gmail.com

Sulaiman Asang, Gita Susanti

Lecture of Department of Administration Science  
 Universitas Hasanuddin  
 Makassar, Indonesia

**Abstract**—Democratic governance is the main model for the success of a national development. In this context, democratic governance is needed so that development success can be maximally achieved. This is because basically the goal of every development is to make the people more prosperous and meet the needs of a country. This study aims to reveal the existence of processes and mechanisms in democratic development planning deliberations in Bone Regency, South Sulawesi Province. This study uses a qualitative approach with data collection techniques through in-depth interviews. The informants interviewed consisted of heads of SKPD, NGOs, sub-district heads, village heads, women's groups, youth groups, community leaders and poor households (RTM). Processing and data analysis using NVivo 12 Plus Application. The results showed that in general development planning deliberations were carried out in accordance with the processes and mechanisms but not fully democratically and focused on governance, so a framework was needed that could assist the government in realizing the direction of regional development policies. Therefore, it is necessary to have a common goal and understanding regarding the Musrenbang that the Musrenbang must be built by the spirit of togetherness so that it can encourage the role and participation of the community in formulating and making decisions with the government in the preparation of annual development plans at the District level, Regional Apparatus level and Regency level.

**Keywords**—*development planning deliberative, democratic governance*

### I. INTRODUCTION

In encouraging the development process, a planning system is needed. However, the reality is that not all countries need and use planning systems in their governments such as the United States and Europe. The development process in both countries is driven and controlled by the market mechanism or the invisible hand. In this case, the increase in community needs will be met without the need for significant government efforts and funds to encourage it through planning. However, this is not the case in a socialist country, all development activities use planning as a tool to encourage and control the development process.

In a country with a socialist system, the role of the government is very large so that automatically development planning also has a very large role in coordinating the activities carried out by development actors. Developing countries also use development planning as a tool to encourage and coordinate development activities and to accelerate the progress of their country for three main reasons, namely: to direct, control and encourage the development process in their country both at the national and regional levels.

Indonesia as a developing country, development planning still has a very large role as a tool other than to encourage it as well as a tool in controlling the development process in a more rapid and directed manner. That development planning also requires synergy between stakeholders to realize development in accordance with community needs. This mechanism should receive attention in the implementation of regional development planning at this time because development is in a very complex condition.

Development cannot succeed without planning. Planning will not produce development well in this case in accordance with the aspirations and needs of the community if it has not optimized community participation in the planning process. Besides that, without community participation it will be difficult to expect the community to comply with and maintain the implementation in accordance with the plans that have been made. It is even worse if the community does not take full advantage of what the government has built. So that the need for optimal use of community participation in planning. In this context, namely by conducting community aspirations in the form of meetings, be it discussions or seminars, to get people's views on the vision and mission of development they want. Furthermore, the initial draft of development planning is completed, so that the aspirations of the community can be absorbed through the implementation of the Development Planning Consultation (Musrenbang) activities which are carried out in stages starting from the village level to the district, city and provincial levels.

Musrenbang is one way to produce development in accordance with the needs of the community. Musrenbang is a planning mechanism, a regional planning institution and a mechanism for submitting proposals. Musrenbang is a vehicle

for synchronizing and reconciling a “top-down” with a “bottom-up” perspective, a community needs assessment perspective with a technical assessment; conflict resolution on various interests of local governments and non-government stakeholders for regional development, between the needs of development programs and the capacity and funding constraints, and a vehicle for synergizing various sources of development funding. Of course, by paying attention to: demand driven process, strategic thinking process, participatory and inclusive, conflict resolution in nature, is a continuous process, and prioritizes cooperation. The current position of the Musrenbang is very strategic because now it is in an era of partnership between the government and the community.

The implementation of the Musrenbang in Bone Regency, South Sulawesi Province has been physically carried out in accordance with the existing mechanisms, but the fact is that the urgency and effectiveness of the Musrenbang forum is still questionable because it is considered that the process has not been fully institutionalized and democratic. Musrenbang has not been implemented based on the spirit of togetherness, but only based on a bureaucratic mechanism, and has not been fully developed based on the spirit of regulations. For this reason, this research aims to answer the existing phenomenon by offering a democratic governance approach. The concept of democratic governance is a mechanism that requires the involvement of citizens together with other development actors in achieving the objectives of demand in participatory, accountable, and transparent policy-making mechanisms, systems and processes accompanied by the enforcement of rules and laws.

## II. THEORETICAL REVIEW

### A. Policy Formulation and Decision Making

Policy formulation is part of a meaningful stage of the public policy-making process. This is important because in carrying out the next process, namely the implementation and assessment of policies, it can only be carried out after the policy formulation process has been completed. The success or failure of the implementation of a policy depends on whether or not the policy formulation process is perfect [1].

Thus, policy formulation can be said to be the core of the policy process. Because policy formulation functions to respond to and answer problems that exist in society through policies decided by the government. The perfect formulation process is expected to be able to produce public policies that are appropriate and relevant to the existing issues.

Policy formulation is an effort to develop proposed actions in dealing with public issues that are relevant and acceptable [2]. In this case, some of these suggestions must be presented to deal with certain problems. However, policy formulation does not always lead to legal, executive orders, or administrative rules.

The policy formulation process was preceded by a policy issue. These policy issues can take the form of problems, needs of citizens or the state, which are very basic in nature, have a large scope and government regulation. In determining the policy issue, it must be able to map whether the problem in question is a common problem and a common goal or not, so that policies that arise do not only belong to the interests of certain groups but for the interests of many people [3].

In relation to the achievement of development goals that are in a complex situation, the policy formulation process certainly gets the main attention.

Decision making is a recommendation from the problem-tracking process starting from the background of the problem, identification until the recommendation or conclusion is formed. In this case the resulting recommendations are important because if there is an error or error in the assessment of a problem, it will greatly affect decision making.

Policy making in several developed countries follows the entire process starting from agenda setting, policy formulation, policy adoption, policy implementation and policy evaluation. Decisions will be made based on the results of the policy evaluation, whether the plans and policies that have been selected will continue or be stopped, or will be replaced [4].

Currently the decision-making paradigm requires attention and a holistic approach in seeing and requires collaboration from all stakeholders to overcome challenges in especially in realizing development programs.

### B. Democratic Governance and Development Planning

The concept of democratic governance is a combination of the right of citizens to control themselves (democracy) with the structures and mechanisms used to manage the public according to accepted rules and procedures (governance) [5]. Democratic Governance is synonymous with very broad participation covering modern democratic life as well as very broad and reliable participation that focuses on governance. It means that democratic governance can't be separated from the implementation of good governance [6]. In this context, all activities in determining policy are carried out collectively by plural actors (government, private and civil society). In this case the supervision is carried out with an informal system because in this case the actor's position is parallel. So that the government must prepare a mechanism that can realize participation and accountability as the main conditions for the application of democratic governance. The content it produces can accommodate all interests and high involvement of the community in obtaining policy choices to support successful development.

In the context of democratic governance, the main indicators of development are the increase in the welfare of the population and the civilization of the socio-cultural order. However, this condition will become even more complicated considering that public, private and government understanding of this matter is generally still low. So that in such

circumstances the role of development planning becomes very urgent to direct the activities of development actors and actors, both government, private and society to achieve a clear and useful target. The government in this case functions as an agent of development in society.

Basically, development planning is the deliberate control and regulation of the economy by a central authority (government) to achieve certain goals and objectives within a certain.

Development Planning is a collection of policies and development programs to stimulate the public and the private sector to use available resources more productively, where the stimulus is provided in the form of economic incentives both micro and macro that can encourage more productive use of resources so that the process development will be further increased [7].

Basically, development planning is 1) a planned and systematic government effort to control and regulate the development process; 2) covers long term, medium term, and annual period; 3) concerning the variables that affect economic growth and development, either directly or indirectly; 4) have a clear development goal in accordance with the wishes of the community.

The aims and objectives of development planning are to ensure the realization of the use of resources, both funds and manpower, in an effective, efficient, and fair manner. Without planning, development activities can be carried out but there is a big possibility that they will not be carried out effectively, efficiently, and as expected. Therefore, development planning is still needed today in almost all developing countries and is likely to be implemented in the future. An important aspect that the government needs to continue working on is to ensure that development planning can be properly formulated.

From the description above, it can be said that regional development planning carried out using the perspective of democratic governance is at least able to create welfare for the community in line with the performance indicators of democratic governance that have been mentioned earlier. Besides that, a democratic governance perspective can realize the meaning of regional development itself in the form of planned efforts to increase the capacity of local governments in providing services to the community and managing regional economic resources in a democratic manner. For the community, this perspective can empower people in all regions to enjoy a better, more advanced, and peaceful life and increase their dignity and self-respect.

### *C. Institutional Building in Support of Democratic Governance*

The institution building model has been designed especially for developing countries that are aiming for modernization, their main goals are socio-economic development and nation-building so that in their understanding institutions are products of interaction and adaptation. When an organization goes

beyond its normal function of encouraging and protecting innovation and change to become significant and important in the environment it serves, it earns it the status of an "institution". Thus, value is one of the important dimensions of an institution with the assumption that institutional building is different from institution change. Milton J. Esman, who conceptualized the model, and considered that institution building is a general social process and recognizes a set of elements and actions. The analysis is developed into three analytical categories: institutional variables, transactions, and linkages.

In explaining the model, Esman has defined and described five main variables of institution building: Leadership, Policy, Resources, Programs, and Structure [8].

- Leadership is defined as a group of people who direct the internal operations of the institution and manage its relationships with the external environment.
- Policy components are defined as statements of values, objectives and approaches that underlie the actions of the Institution.
- Resources influence all aspects of the agency's activities. Includes input that is tangible such as financial, physical, and human as well as intangibles such as legal and political authorities and information about technology and the external environment.
- Program is the translation of policies into concrete actions based on the allocation of institutional resources in relation to the external environment of the institution.
- The structure will consist of the distribution of roles within the organization, the pattern of authority, the communication system, the duties and responsibilities of each personnel and the capacities needed to carry out.
- The approach to institutional building dimensions put forward by Esman is expected to be able to provide good input for the realization of a democratic planning process so that it will have a significant impact on the program as a policy product in the welfare of society. In addition, the concept of institutional building is also able to explain the opportunities and challenges of implementing a democratic model in development planning and providing sustainable solutions.

The Planning and Development Deliberation (Musrenbang) is essentially a formal development planning forum and a forum that brings together all the aspirations of the community regarding their needs in development as well as development program proposals from government agencies [9]. Musrenbang is a very important forum and form of assessment for program proposals that are prioritized by the community because what is produced in the deliberations is the real community needs. Referring to the applicable legal regulations, namely Law No. 25 of 2004 concerning the National Development Planning Strategy, community participation is the main thing in planning development as a form of the democratic process. Besides that,

the success of the musrenbang can determine the continuation of development because a comprehensive plan that has been prepared will certainly create democratic governance and in accordance with the expectations of the community as well as the vision and mission of the regional government.

Musrenbang is a process of community deliberation on regional development planning in accordance with the needs and interests of the community and is carried out to produce an agreement among the people in each area for development. Musrenbang is a forum where the community can convey their aspirations in the context of the development process that will be carried out. Musrenbang is also a process in advancing regions starting from the village / sub-district, sub-district, district / city, province to the center.

The Musrenbang Regional Government Activity Plan is a public forum (public event) to guide all stakeholders in understanding development issues and problems in their regions and is a forum to gain consensus on development priorities and solve various regional development problems.

### III. RESEARCH METHODS

This study uses a qualitative approach by considering that the phenomena that arise in the Musrenbang process are undemocratic. Furthermore, to analyze the musrenbang process, the processes and mechanisms in a democratic development planning deliberation use the institutional building model. This research wants to reveal more deeply about the process that takes place at the implementation of musrenbang to carry the aspirations of the stakeholders to achieve this development goals as well as being a reference in governance in Bone Regency, South Sulawesi Province.

The research location is in Taneteriattang District, Barebbo District, Salomekko District, Lappariaja District and Awangpone District. This location was chosen because it represents the division of territory in Bone Regency.

Data collection was carried out through interviews, direct field observations. The selected informants were those directly related to the musrenbang process, namely Forkopimda Bone Regency, SKPD Leaders, Heads of Sub-districts, Bank Leaders, Community Figures, Religious Leaders and Youth Leaders of Bone.

Processing and data analysis using NVivo 12 Plus Application.

### IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Musrenbang is usually held when the situation analysis and plan design as the preparation stage of the entire planning process has been completed. The implementation of the Musrenbang is to construct issues and problems, obtain agreement on development program priorities and the mechanism for handling them. Based on observations in the field, it was found that the development planning in Bone

Regency that was produced through musrenbang had not been implemented democratically and institutionalized.

Musrenbang which is held annually to prepare a work plan for the following year in which there is a policy direction for regional government development. Kabupaten Bone in Preparing RKPDP in 2021 has implemented Musrenbang in March 2020 and set the policy direction for the Bone Regency Government in 2021 on the development of information and technology-based public services, sub-district infrastructure development, poverty alleviation, accelerated availability of educational facilities and infrastructure throughout districts, the availability of health facilities and infrastructure in all districts, and the development of local and cultural-based tourist destinations.

The main cause of the ineffectiveness of the musrenbang process lies with the community itself, including NGOs, community groups and other civil society, due to insufficient capacity and capability to participate in the development planning process. In the observations in the musrenbang that their proposals have been implemented, most of them are in physical development because of their understanding that development is solely in physical form. Another weakness is due to cultural factors where Bone Regency is thick with aristocratic influences, thus making the atmosphere less conducive. So that in its implementation, only a handful of people dare to express their opinions and even some want the forum to be ended soon.

The results of research on five institutional building variables in musrenbang in Bone district are as follows:

#### A. Leadership

Several elements determine the value of leadership, namely political sustainability, professional status, technical competence, competence and organizational continuity as leadership properties or variables. Successful leadership can be the result of ranking high in each of the variable.

One of the important elements in institutional development is leadership. This is due to the whole process that leads to change, requires comprehensive handling and managing and requires full competence and commitment and responsibility from internal institutions. In implementing musrenbang, several aspects in this research are related to leadership in implementing musrenbang in Bone Regency.

The government, as the most responsible element in the development planning process, does not realize that in civil society we do not have sufficient information about the vision, mission and objectives to be achieved. The government only considers that in the preparation of development planning it is sufficient to convey problems and program proposals, so that the proposals submitted by the community are not in line with government programs.

In addition, some bureaucratic officials at the lower level (village) and sub-district do not get complete information about district programs. The reason is that the information obtained is

insufficient and those themselves who do not want to know about the development planning that is contained in the planning document.

Another thing related to this aspect of leadership is that the Musrenbang has not yet produced an appropriate and quality formula because the competence of the facilitator in directing and exploring the ideas and aspirations of the Musrenbang participants is still lacking. In addition to the foregoing, musrenbang facilitators must give up their desire to influence decisions and as experts.

TABLE I. LEADERSHIP EFFECTIVENESS IN MUSRENBANG

Dimension	Result		
	Effective	Not yet effective	Not effective
Technical Competence	√		
Political competence	√		
Comitment to doctrine		√	
Comitment to doctrine		√	
Continuity succession		√	

The results of research 2020.

Table 1 shows that political continuity, professional status, technical competence, competence and organizational continuity as leadership properties or variables have not been effective in leading the success of the development planning process in Bone district. The success and success of the process depend heavily on the leadership element so that the results can be valuable.

Thus, it is necessary to increase the capacity and knowledge as well as good competence for the government, especially at the village, sub-district, and sub-district levels in understanding the principles and philosophy of the musrenbang as well as for the facilitators who play a role in the running of the musrenbang.

### B. Policy

The role of values, goals and approaches that underlie all actions of the institution, activities, and programs to be implemented. The results of research on the Musrenbang process in Bone Regency found that:

1) *Policy research*: The process of drafting development planning refers to Law Number 25 of 2004 concerning the National Development Planning System, while the process of implementing the musrenbang refers to Perda Number 08 of 2008 concerning the Regional Development Planning Deliberation (Musrenbang) of Bone Regency. Planning is carried out using a participatory approach which emphasizes the approach from, by and for the community as well as a bottom-up approach. The methodology used in the preparation of development planning uses the Rapid Rural Appraisal method, Participatory Rural Appraisal, Focus Group Discussion (FGD), Ziel Oriented Project Planning (ZOPP) as

well as Strength, Weakness, Opportunity, and Threat (SWOT) Analysis.

The results show that the regulations used are the old regulations, namely the 2008 regional regulation and have not been updated until 2020. So that some clauses are no longer relevant to the current situation and conditions which have an impact on the lack of quality both in the musrenbang process and the resulting policies.

2) *Sensitivity towards social norms*: Ideally, the construction in the Musrenbang process is a discussion forum between stakeholders and the government to compile a development plan so that the objectives are right on target and in accordance with existing regulations to be right on target. However, there are always suggestions that are not well accommodated, and some are not realized. This is because the proposals in the following year are only repetitions of the proposals.

The Musrenbang is a discussion forum between stakeholders and the government to formulate a development plan so that the objectives are right on target and in accordance with existing regulations to be right on target. However, there are always suggestions that are not well accommodated, and some are not realized. This is because the proposals in the following year are only a repetition of the previous year's program proposals so that the tendency towards change is late.

3) *Consistency and articulation*: In essence, a political party is an organization that is part of the political structure of our country which has several functions including meeting interests, interest aggregation, leadership selection and political communication. Observations show that these functions are not functioning properly so that the community feels disappointed because their aspirations cannot be channeled during the musrenbang at both the village and sub-district levels. Whereas they should have been in the musrenbang forum to respond to and secure the aspirations of the community. The community also thinks that their presence at the musrenbang forum is of no benefit.

### C. Resource

Another element that greatly influences all aspects of an institution is resources because it is important to include resources in institutional development.

The results showed that:

1) *Budgetting*: In running the government, the government gets income from various sources and makes spending to support its duties. In 2019, the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) of Bone Regency reached 180.15 billion rupiah, an increase of 12.75 percent from 2018. This value contributed 8.82 percent of total revenue.

Bone Regency revenue is also obtained through a balance fund. The largest fund was obtained from the General Allocation Fund (DAU) worth 1,088.62 billion rupiah and contributed 53.3 percent to the revenue of Bone Regency.

However, in almost all sectors, the number of activities that have been decided in the musrenbang and recorded in the RKPD cannot be implemented due to budget constraints.

Bone Regency revenue is also obtained through a balance fund. The largest fund was obtained from the General Allocation Fund (DAU) worth 1,088.62 billion rupiah and contributed 53.3 percent to the revenue of Bone 1.088,62 billion rupiah and contributed 53.3 percent to Bone Regency revenue.

However, in almost all sectors, the number of activities that have been decided in the musrenbang and recorded in the RKPD cannot be implemented due to budget constraints.

2) *Human resource capacity*: Currently, human resources are capital for institutions or organizations, both government and private, in addition to other resources. This perspective emerges as a result of the development plan which always ignores everything related to improving the quality of human resources.

The results showed that in relation to human resource capacity, Bone Regency continues to strive to create programs that involve various stakeholders both in terms of the availability of the number and quality of human resources, educational technology, and information technology in encouraging the acceleration of quality improvement. However, some of these problems remain a concern both in the process and in the preparation of development planning in Bone District:

- There are still areas especially in border areas where education services are not yet reached
- There are still schools whose capacity exceeds the existing standards
- There are still schools whose laboratory and library classrooms have suffered minor, moderate, or severe damage
- The placement of teachers has not been well ordered so that there are schools with excess teachers and insufficient notes
- Facilities and infrastructure, especially libraries and learning facilities, are still lacking
- Teacher competence is still low, especially pedagogical competence

3) *Limited information and technology*: Observations show that there are still villages that do not have a telephone or internet network. This shows that technology has an important role in people's lives because we can communicate and exchange information without being hindered by distance.

In addition, the research results show:

- Limited communication and information networks in various regions to support public access to information through information technology

- Limited availability of human resources in the field of information technology and limited community information groups (KIM)
- Limited apparatus facilities and infrastructure to support the smooth work of the internet network
- Laws and regulations that tend to change, especially those related to the development of communication and information in local government administration
- Limited Regional Regulations governing the development of communication and information in regional governance
- Lack of facilities and infrastructure that support encryption equipment
- Not yet optimal utilization of information and communication networks to the public at large

This achievement is categorized as Less. So that this greatly affects the process of preparing development planning which currently depends heavily on the availability of information in seeing the phenomena that exist in society to meet their needs in participating in development.

#### *D. Program*

Regional development programs are priority programs to be implemented throughout a period which are intended to resolve various problems and strategic issues in society and fulfill various needs as well as to utilize and take advantage of regional capacities. Some elements that are important in the success of regional development programs cannot be denied because they are very closely related to the implementation of development. The results of research on some of these elements indicate that:

The Regional Government Work Plan (RKPD) or also known as the Regional Annual Development Plan is an elaboration of the medium-term planning document or the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) which is prepared based on a participatory, technocratic, political as well as top-down and bottom-up approach. The preparation of the Bone Regency Regional Government Work Plan (RKPD) in 2019 is guided by the Bone District Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) 2005-2025 and refers to the 2019 Government Work Plan (RKP) and the Regional Government Work Plan (RKPD) of Sulawesi Province. South of 2019.

This is to create certainty and synergy of planning and implementation of regional development between regions, between development fields and between Regional Apparatus. In addition, to achieve efficiency and effectiveness in planning the allocation of resources in regional development. However, several development programs that have been set out in the RKPD are not implemented, as well as the programs in the RPJMD that are not spelled out in the RKPD. This is because the community does not have a method to monitor their aspirations. There is no clear data on proposed programs and

activities that come from the aspirations of the community, government or DPRD. So that this creates counter-productive in further regional development.

#### *E. Structure*

Success in building a democratic political and legal culture such as in the formulation of a development program or policy, the Bone district government holds an annual musrenbang which is open to the public. This forum is a space for active participation from all levels of society in submitting their proposals. This awareness and participation occurred in the scope of the demand for the bureaucratic apparatus of Bone regency. The Regent is very open with various suggestions for each service in his government. The Regent of Bone district also always motivates that every proposal is always directed to the RPJMD that was agreed upon at the outset.

Government management has been regulated based on clear SOPs regarding tasks, methods, responsible work units, costs, and the length of a job.

Although there are still some problems and shortcomings in the process, the Musrenbang activity is effective in fostering community participation and involvement, accountability and transparency as the main elements in the concept of democratic governance.

#### V. CONCLUSION

Musrenbang is a deliberative forum in formulating and determining development priorities and policies that are implemented democratically. The Musrenbang in Bone Regency has not yet been fully implemented in a democratic manner, because the vision or goals to be achieved in the Musrenbang have not yet been created and the understanding of the stakeholders involved in the Musrenbang is still different. This is because the musrenbang process is still being built by bureaucratic mechanisms and has not been fully developed with the spirit of togetherness. Therefore, institutionalized strengthening of the Musrenbang values and system should be built together in order to help the Bone Regency government make policies and priorities for regional

development that are appropriate and in accordance with the needs of stakeholders.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We would like to thank the Bone Regency Government especially to the Head of the Regional Development Planning Agency and his staff who have provided a lot of assistance in the form of information regarding the development planning process and the implementation of the Musrenbang, both in the form of data and information. Very much needed in completing the stages in this research. And lastly, we would like to thank the informants and all parties who have helped make this research process a success.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] S.E. Pratiwi, "Formulasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Kabupaten Jombang dalam Pengendalian Alih Fungsi Lahan Pertanian," *J Unair*, vol. 4, no. (4), pp. 1-7, 2013.
- [2] J.E. Anderson, *Public Policymaking An Introduction*. Third. New York: USA Library of Congress Catalog, 1984, p. 93.
- [3] S. Bagaskara and D. Lituhayu, "Formulasi Kebijakan Perlindungan Anak di Kota Semarang," *Journal of Public Policy and Management Review*, vol. 6, no. (3), pp. 104-114, 2017.
- [4] S. Hassan and L. Goodson, "The Cultures of Decision-Making: A qualitative study of urban transport projects in Alexandria, Egypt," *Transportation Research Procedia*, vol. 48, pp. 2401-2420, 2020.
- [5] D.W. Brinkerhoff, "Democratic governance and sectoral policy reform: Tracing linkages and exploring synergies," *World Dev.*, vol. 28, no. (4), pp. 601-15, 2000.
- [6] M. Bevir, *Democratic Governance*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2010.
- [7] L. Arthur, *Development Planning*. New York: Harper & Row, 1966.
- [8] M.J Esman, *Institution Building in National Development: An Approach to Induced Social Change in Transitional Societies*. Pittsburgh: Graduate School of Public and International Affairs (GSPIA), 1965.
- [9] S. Ma'rif, P. Nugroho, and L. Wijayanti, "Evaluasi efektivitas pelaksanaan musyawarah perencanaan pembangunan (musrenbang) Kota Semarang," *Riptek*, vol. 4, no. (11), pp. 53-62, 2010.