

The Effectiveness of Reading to Tell the Story to Students' Reading Comprehension Reviewed from Autonomy Level

Lafziatul Hilmi^{1*} and Ainul Addinna²

^{1,2}English Department, FBS Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, Sumatra Barat 25131, Indonesia

*Corresponding author. Email: lafziatul.hilmi@fbs.unp.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to investigate the effectiveness of Reading to Tell the Story Strategy to students' reading comprehension reviewed from students' autonomy level. This was a quasi-experiment research. The population of this study is the students of Intermediate Reading course academic year 2019/2020. Two classes selected to be the samples were the experimental class with an extra treatment called Reading to Tell the Story, and the control class with the conventional strategy only. The data were attained through a questionnaire to determine the level of students' autonomy, and a reading comprehension test in forms of spoken and written reports. The data were analyzed by using statistical formula. The results revealed three findings. First, reading comprehension of students taught by using Reading to tell the story strategy was higher than that of students taught by using conventional strategy. Second, reading comprehension of students with high autonomy level was higher than that of students with low autonomy level. Third, there was a significant interaction between the different reading strategies with students' autonomy level toward students' reading comprehension. Therefore, Reading to tell the story strategy is suggested to use in Reading class in order to enhance students' ability to comprehend the text.

Keywords: reading comprehension, reading to tell the story, learners' autonomy

1. INTRODUCTION

Reading is one of receptive skills that help someone to attain, comprehend, and interpret written information. It is not a passive activity because it activates the cognitive aspect in comprehending the information [1]. As a receptive skill, reading is also an effective way to learn foreign languages through contextual sources [2]. For college students, mastering reading skill is really needed in order to achieve the learning goals. Some goals of reading are being able to read more English texts, attaining knowledge about English in learning process, comprehending semantics knowledge and sentence structures, being able to adjust the reading style toward the reading purpose, and improving critical thinking skill [3]. Therefore, reading is a complex activity to understand the information.

Mastering reading skill should be integrated to other skills: listening, speaking and writing. It is used as a basic skill to engage in a good communication because it provides opportunities to enhance vocabularies, recognize the good sentence constructions, and analyze the

information critically. As a result, speaking activity can be performed naturally and writing activity produces a good writing if the reading activity is well-applied [2].

EFL students commonly have problems in fostering their reading comprehension that they need to be able to learn on their own and understand their reading [4]. Even though all theories of reading strategies have been taught, in reality those cannot be implemented well. For example, the discussions are not interactively engaged students to share and clarify their points of view, power point presentations are full of sentences instead of important points, or there is no interest in reading academic books and articles that have many difficult words and contexts. These problems lead to inability of students to comprehend the texts in higher level such as academic articles and books, and to analyze the information critically; meanwhile, one of the importance of reading comprehension is to help the students writing the academic paper and thesis as the requirement of graduation. Thus, if this condition remains, the goals of learning cannot be achieved too.

Many strategies and teaching techniques, however, have been explored to figure out ways to help students comprehend information in their reading, such as SQ3R, KWL, Active reading, Skimming, Scanning, Intensive and Extensive Reading, and so on. Unfortunately, the implementation of those techniques and strategies also deals with many problems including students' autonomy to do reading itself. Reading activities tend to be a burden because the students have to achieve the goals without being pleased with what they read. Therefore, encouraging the students to develop their positive feeling in reading will motivate them for gaining a range of language skills and doing further study and reading [5].

Reading for pleasure (extensive reading) is expected to be one of solutions to solve the problems encountered in reading activities. Pleasure reading helps students understand many aspects in English such as grammar, vocabulary, and writing [6]. Students are allowed to choose the reading material based on their own interest, knowledge, and experience that suitable their language level and they set their own time and place to read [5]. Consequently, providing opportunities for students to select their reading materials would promote a meaningful reading process, and lead to be autonomous students who are able to set their learning goals, choose their learning strategies, figure out the way to use material sources, set their own time to study, and heighten up their motivation to study themselves [7,8]

Reading to tell the story adapts the rules of reading for pleasure (extensive reading), but there are some instructions modified in order to make the activity more meaningful and suitable with the learning conditions. Principally, reading for pleasure should not be interrupted of any exercises. However, to figure out the effect of this activity in reading comprehension, the assessments have been set as a part of the overall project. The guidelines of conducting Reading to tell the story are described below:

1. *Students select the reading materials.*

Since the aim of reading to tell story activity is to make reading pleasurable, students are suggested to start reading with fictions such as short stories, narratives, fables, or novels. This is in line with the learning circumstance that the course objective is to be able to read and understand types of text. Students' condition is also a consideration that they do not familiar with the authentic English texts, so the reading materials are provided by the teacher. Then, the students choose among the stories provided in accordance with the level of difficulties of the texts.

2. *Students write a pleasure reading report.*

While students are reading their materials, they also regularly write the journal about what they read. The purpose is to enhance the reading comprehension, activate the new vocabulary, and develop their writing ability. The components of writing report are described below:

- ***Tell what the story is about.***

Students write the general information about the story or reading material including title of the story, the author, and the overall view of the book.

- ***Tell about what they like or dislike of the story.***

Students are able to express their opinion about the story they read. They can share the best part or how interesting or challenging the story.

- ***Recommendation about the story***

At the end of writing, students can share recommendation about the story; why other people should read the story.

3. *Students tell the story to other students.*

It is a kind of students' oral report to retell the best part of stories and their opinion about it.

Reading to tell the story is to make students aware of their autonomy. Students' autonomy influences reading comprehension as the students are able to adjust their own learning [9]. The students focus and know how they are responsible for their own reading because they decide what to read, when and how to achieve the goals of their reading. By enhancing these processes, the autonomy is meant to lead the students be more critical and creative [10].

In short, the specific purpose of this study is to find out whether Reading to Tell the Story has a significant effect on improving students' reading comprehension reviewed from students' autonomy level. The research problems are formulated as follows: (1) Do the students taught using Reading to tell the story have higher reading comprehension than the students taught in conventional way?; (2) Does Reading to tell the stories have significant effect on students with low or high autonomy level?

2. METHODS

This study is a Quasy-experimental research. Experimental research is one of method to examine causal relationship [11]. Experimental study reveals the

effect of treatment effects that arise. There are three variables involved, namely independent, dependent, and attributive variables. The independent variable is the Reading to tell the story and conventional strategies in teaching reading; independent variable is students' reading comprehension; and autonomy level is attributive variable which is classified into high and low level. Thus, because of the engagement of attributive variables, 2x2 factorial design is used.

The population of this study is the students of Intermediate Reading course academic year 2019/2020. Two classes were selected the experimental class with an extra treatment called Reading to Tell the Story, and the control class with the conventional strategy only. The treatment was conducted for 8 times. Since it was in pandemic situation, the activities of Reading to tell the story was conducted online by keeping up the report of activity through WhatsApp group.

The data were attained through a questionnaire and a reading comprehension test. The questionnaire adapted from Zhang dang Li [12] was used to collect the data of students' autonomy level. The questionnaire had two parts; the first part consists of 11 questions with 5 scales of responses including *never* to *always*, and the second part consists of 10 questions with range score 1 to 5 (A=1, B=2, C=3, D=4, and E=5). The maximum score was 105 and minimum score was 21. Students had 30 minutes to complete the questionnaire.

Moreover, reading comprehension test was set in two forms of reports; spoken and written reports. Both experiment and control classes had to perform these two reports to see how well they understand the text. The form of assessment was adapted from Mikulecky [6] with the main components to assess were: (1) what the story is about; it is about how the title and the author are told, (2) students' opinions about the best part of the story and why they like or dislike the story, (3) recommendation why people should read the story. The final scores of reading comprehension were taken from the mean score of multiplication of speaking and writing reports. Then, the final score of both classes were analyzed by using ANOVA. ANOVA is used to answer the research questions and to see the relationship among the variables.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

3.1. Findings

Based on the analysis of the autonomy level questionnaire, it was shown that there were 19 students who have high autonomy level in experimental class, and

there were 15 students who have low autonomy level. Meanwhile, in control class, 15 students had high autonomy level and 19 students had low autonomy level. So, the total students who have high level autonomy were the same as the total students who have low autonomy level. The data is described in Table 1.

Table 1. Distribution of students' autonomy level

Strategy	Autonomy level	Mean	Std. Deviation	N
Reading to tell the story	High autonomy level	80.53	10.260	19
	Low autonomy level	79.33	10.998	15
	Total	80.00	10.445	34
Conventional	High autonomy level	80.00	7.559	15
	Low autonomy level	68.42	9.582	19
	Total	73.53	10.410	34
Total	High autonomy level	80.29	9.040	34
	Low autonomy level	73.24	11.473	34
	Total	76.76	10.851	68

To fulfill the assumption of homogeneity, *Levene* test was used in order to make sure the data analyzed were homogenous based its significant value. The significant of homogeneity 0.629 (≥ 0.05) indicates that the data were homogenous. The analysis result is described in Table 2.

Table 2. Levene's Test of Equality of Error Variances

F	df1	df2	Sig.
.581	3	64	.629

The data were analyzed by using ANOVA with a factorial 2x2 design. The F-ratio for reading strategies was 5.810. The P-value of strategy was .019 with significant level .05 ($\alpha=.05$). The result showed that P-value of strategy was lower than the significant level ($0.019 < .05$). It means that there was significant different mean score of students' reading comprehension after being thought with Reading to tell the story and with conventional technique. Moreover, the P-value of autonomy level was .009 with significant level .05 ($\alpha=.05$). In other word, the autonomy level has significant different score between the high and low level when teaching in different strategies. The data are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Test of Between-Subjects Effects

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	1847.534 ^a	3	615.845	6.525	.001
Intercept	398316.801	1	398316.801	4.220E3	.000
Strategy	548.380	1	548.380	5.810	.019
AutonomyLevel	683.674	1	683.674	7.243	.009
Strategy * AutonomyLevel	452.095	1	452.095	4.790	.032
Error	6040.702	64	94.386		
Total	408600.000	68			
Corrected Total	7888.235	67			

a. R Squared = .234 (Adjusted R Squared = .198)

Furthermore, the data analysis also tailored the estimated marginal means. It can be seen from Table 4 that the experimental class taught by Reading to tell the story had higher mean score (79.93) than the control class taught by using conventional reading activity did (74.21). Meanwhile, students with high autonomy level had better reading comprehension (80.26) than students with low autonomy level did (73.87). The data are described in Table 5

Table 4. Estimated marginal means of reading strategies

Strategy	Mean	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval	
			Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Reading to tell the story	79.930	1.678	76.578	83.282
Conventional	74.211	1.678	70.859	77.562

Table 5. Estimated marginal means of autonomy level

AutonomyLevel	Mean	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval	
			Lower Bound	Upper Bound
High autonomy level	80.263	1.678	76.911	83.615
Low autonomy level	73.877	1.678	70.525	77.229

The last finding is the estimated marginal means of reading strategy across autonomy level. The data analysis was described in Table 6. It was revealed that students with high autonomy level had higher mean score of reading comprehension in experimental class taught by Reading to tell the story (80.52) than students who had low autonomy level (79.33). Besides, students with high autonomy level had higher mean score than students with low autonomy level taught by using conventional strategy.

Table 6. Estimated marginal means of reading strategies across autonomy level

Strategy	AutonomyLevel	Mean	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval	
				Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Reading to tell the story	High autonomy level	80.526	2.229	76.074	84.979
	Low autonomy level	79.333	2.508	74.322	84.345
Conventional	High autonomy level	80.000	2.508	74.989	85.011
	Low autonomy level	68.421	2.229	63.968	72.874

3.2. Discussion

The implementation of Reading to tell the story affects students' understanding of the text. Since students are exposed more in lots of reading materials, they have found their own ways to expand their vocabularies and strategies to better understand the various types of text. This finding was in line with the results of previous researchers that found significant relationship between extensive reading activity and reading comprehension. First, it was confirmed that students in extensive reading group had higher score than students in intensive reading. It was found that extensive reading program had big influence in improving students' reading comprehension because the students were motivated to read the remarkable chosen book [13]. Moreover, the another finding figured out the positive effect of extensive reading on students' reading comprehension performance since students were able to read the self-selection materials [14]. Therefore, Reading to tell story that is adapted from extensive reading have the same impacts as a mean to gain students' comprehension and enhance the literacy development.

Another result to highlight is the relationship of students' autonomy level and reading comprehension. Students with high autonomy level tend to be more independent and critical in completing reading activity as they enjoy and are able to choose the texts equal with their reading level. This finding is supported by the current studies that students' autonomy and reading comprehension had positive and strong relationship [15, 16]; students with high autonomy have more control on their own learning, and are able adapt to the new strategy to improve their reading comprehension. So, the more autonomous the students, the more skilled and proficient readers they are [16].

4. CONCLUSION

The current research aimed at figuring out the effect of Reading to tell the story toward reading comprehension reviewed from students' autonomy level. Based on the findings, it can be concluded that there was significant relationship between Reading to tell the story and reading comprehension. It indicated that the reading exposure such as reading short stories and novel gave better understanding to students and made them able to think critically. Moreover, students with high-level autonomy have greater opportunity to expand their reading comprehension since they are able to adjust and control their own reading. Therefore, using Reading to

tell the story, especially for students with high-level autonomy, was able to enhance students' reading comprehension.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researchers would like to thank the people who helped in and contributed to the research. First, the researchers would like to thank LP2M UNP who has provided financial support which distributed from Dana PNBP 2020 in conducting the research. Finally, the appreciation goes to the research assistants, the English Department students, especially those who took Intermediate Reading course in 2019/2020 academic year who supported totally during the research.

REFERENCES

- [1] M. Rhalmi, Teaching receptive skills to ESL and EFL learners, *My English Pages*, November 25th, 2019, [Online]: available: <https://myenglishpages.com> [retrieved: Februari 20th, 2020]
- [2] C. Mart, "Developing Speaking Skills through Reading", *International Journal of English Linguistics*, vol. 2, no. 6, pp. 91-96, 2012
- [3] T. Hedge, *Teaching and Learning in the Language Classroom*, UK: OP, 2003
- [4] D. M. Coronado and M. M. N. Miyashiro, "Autonomous learning strategies in the reading comprehension of high school students", *Propósitos y Representaciones*, vo. 7 no. 2, pp. 134-159, 2019, doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.20511/pyr2019.v7n2.276>
- [5] L. Tatiana, "Reading logs: integrating extensive reading with writing task", *English Teaching Forum*, vol. 49, no. 1, pp.26-34, 2011
- [6] B. S. Mikulecky and L. Jeffries, *Reading power: reading for pleasure, comprehension skills, thinking skills, reading faster*, 3rd Ed, New York: Pearson Education, 2005
- [7] A. I. Castillo and S. J. Bonilla, "Building up Autonomy through reading strategies", *PROFILE Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 67-85, 2014
- [8] A.S. Fatimah, "Potraying learner's autonomy in extensive reading classroom at Siliwangi Univeristy Tasikmalaya", *OKARA: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, vol 13, No. 1, pp 35-46, May 2019
- [9] M. Koosha, A. Abdollahi, and F. Karimi, "The relationship among EFL learners' self-esteem, autonomy, and reading comprehension", *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, vol. 6, no. 1, p. 68, 2016
- [10] N. Sari and A. Addinna, "What makes a student-poet a poet: learner's autonomy, creativity, and self-identity in the EFL classroom", in *Proceedings The 62nd TEFLIN International Conference*, ISBN: 978-602-294-066-1, p. 679-685, September 2015
- [11] M. Latief, *Metode Penelitian Pembelajaran Bahasa*, Malang: UM Press, 2010
- [12] L.X. Zhang, and X.X. Li, "A Comparative Study on Learner Autonomy Between Chinese Students and West European Students", *Foreign Language World*, no. 4, pp. 15-23, 2004
- [13] T. Bell, "Extensive reading: Speed and comprehension", *The Reading Matrix*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2001
- [14] A. Endris, "Effects of extensive reading on EFL learner's reading comprehension and attitude, International Journal of Research in English Education, vol. 3, no. 4, 2018
- [15] S. E. Zafrian and A. Nemati, "The effect of learner's autonomy on EFL learner's reading comprehension", *Journal of Administrative Management, Education and Training* ISBN 1823-6049, vol. 12, no. 3, pp. 526-533, 20016
- [16] A.A. Zarei, and K. Gahremani, "On the relationship between learner autonomy and reading comprehension", *TELL*, vol. 3 no. 10, pp. 81-99, 2010