

# Addition and Deletion of Information in the Translation of *Negeri 5 Menara* by A. Fuadi

Rita Sutjiati Djohan\*, Novia Diah Lestari

Gunadarma University, Jakarta, Indonesia

\*Corresponding author. Email: [ritadjohan@staff.gunadarma.ac.id](mailto:ritadjohan@staff.gunadarma.ac.id)

## ABSTRACT

This paper attempts to investigate why there are many additions and deletions of information in the translated text of *Negeri 5 Menara*. This paper applies a descriptive qualitative method. This method describes and explains the phenomenon or events in the social world. The objects of this research are the novel of *Negeri 5 Menara* and its translation. The data is collected by taking notes of the added and deleted information in the target text. Then the writer found out the problems that cause the translator to add and delete the information, and what procedures the translator applied to solve the problem. The data were analysed using Newmark's theoretical framework. The finding shows that the translator has added the information mostly in cultural and religious terms; the translator also tends to delete the information related to cultural words and the name of the important Indonesian and Islamic figures. It can be concluded that the addition in the target text is considered a good decision, since it helps the readers understand the text and make the text more readable. On the other hand, the deletion reduced the information intended by the author. It would be better if the translator considered to still give the information in a way that makes the readers understand the text instead of deleting the whole information.

**Keywords:** Addition, deletion, translation.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Translation is a process of transferring meaning from the source text into the target text. Albrecht, said that, "... what is being translated are not 'codes' or languages but 'messages' or texts" (Fawcett, 1997, p. 4). Baker (2018 p. 180) proposed that "... the translation is designed to achieve a different effect, he or she should make an effort to present the target text from a perspective similar to that of the source text". As we know that every language has its own structure. Changing one language into another language means that we change the structure of the language. But in the translation, we focused on the meaning of the text being translated. Although the structure is different, the most important thing is that the meaning contained in both source text and target text are the same.

In translating a text, a translator must be able to properly transfer the message from the source text into the language text. A good translation is the one that does not add or delete information from the source text. However, these additions and deletions are needed in order to make the translation results sound more natural and easily understood by the target reader. In adding and

deleting information, the translator must not do it arbitrarily. There must be careful consideration and calculation before the translator enters additional information or deletes information from the source language. One of the translations that contained addition and deletion of information is in the translation of the novel *Negeri 5 Menara* by A. Fuadi.

Nozizwe and Ncube (2014), in their research, they used the term loss and gain to refer to addition and deletion in translation. Their research resulted that in translation, gain is done to overcome communication barriers between the two languages. This gain is done by translators based on their creativity in providing explanations or solutions to terms that are difficult to translate. On the other hand, loss in translation occurred due to the gap between the source text and the target text. The greater the linguistic and cultural differences between the two languages, the more losses occurred, even to the point of being untranslatable. This can lead to misunderstandings due to misinformation.

Hardiyanti, Nugraheni, Nababan, and Santosa (2021) found that the novel of "*Gadis Kretek*" had eight cultural categories. Each category used several translation

techniques. The use of this technique was related to the accuracy, acceptability and readability of the translation results. Based on the technique and quality of the translation, translators are not very successful in conveying the specificity of Javanese culture into the concept of the target language in their translation.

Unlike the two researches above, this study discusses the addition and deletion of a novel that contains many cultural and religious terms. This paper aims to find out the reason of why there are many addition and deletion of information in the translated text of *Negeri 5 Menara*. The writer also aims to find out in what aspect the addition and deletion occurred.

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In this paper, the writer uses translation theory proposed by Newmark (1998). Newmark's translation theory is about the procedure that can help the translator decide what they should do when they face difficulties while translating the text. Newmark (1998) stated that the additional information a translator may have to add to his version is normally cultural (accounting for difference between SL and TL culture), technical (relating to the topic) or linguistic (explaining wayward use of words), and is dependent on the requirement of his, as opposed to the original, readership.

Based on the explanation above, it is said that the additional information given in the translated text is mostly in culture, technique and other terms that need more explanation since the terms are unfamiliar with the target readers. "Addition of new, relevant, non-inferable, information or omission of irrelevant

information; with 'addition' and 'omission' often listed as separate translation strategies in the literature ... (William & Chesterman, 2014, pp.87-116). Further, "In the translation process, translation fails or untranslatability may still occur" (Hilman, 2015, p. 68). Guerra (2012) stated that in overcoming problems that occur in the translation process, translators can use various ways to deal with the differences between the two languages. This can be done if the translator understands and aware about the differences between the two languages. Translators can use translation techniques, strategies, or procedures to help them solve problems that arise when translating a text. While translating the text, the translator can use the strategy of translation techniques to help her/him get the best way of transferring the meaning to the target readers.

Haroon (2019, p.132) stated that, "Within the field of Translation Studies, the use of footnotes is regarded as one of the procedures that the translator has at their disposal when translating". Chow, Haroon, and Omar (2020) explained that giving notes in a translation is part of the translation study. In that case, the translator determines what information s/he thinks is important to be given in the text. Pym (2004) said that notes can be put at the bottom of the page, at the end of the chapter, or at the end of a book.

## 3. METHOD

This paper applies a descriptive qualitative method. This method describes and explains the phenomenon or events in the social world, in which the writer will explore it from the point of view of the translator and reflect on their own interpretation. The qualitative

**Table 1.** Translation Procedures by Newmark (1988, pp.81-93)

<b>Transference</b>	The process of transferring a SL word to a TL text.
<b>Naturalisation</b>	This procedure adapts the SL word first to the normal pronunciation, then to the normal morphology of the TL.
<b>Cultural Equivalent</b>	Translating the SL cultural word with the TL cultural word.
<b>Functional Equivalent</b>	This procedure requires the use of a culture-free word, sometimes it neutralises or generalises the SL word.
<b>Synonymy</b>	This procedure is used for a SL word where there is no clear one-to-one equivalent and find out the near equivalent in the TL.
<b>Through-translation</b>	The literal translation of common collocations, names of organisations, the components of compounds. It is known as <i>caique</i> or loan translation.
<b>Shifts or transpositions</b>	A translation procedure involving a change in the grammar from SL to TL. (i) The change from singular to plural, (ii) the change is required when an SL grammatical structure does not exist in the TL.
<b>Modulation</b>	The translator translates the text with the change of viewpoint or perspective.
<b>Compensation</b>	A translation procedure when loss happened in one part of a sentence and it is compensated in another part.
<b>Reduction and expansion</b>	Reduction is the procedure when the translator is more likely to reduce the number of elements that make up the SL by not eliminating important information in the translation. Expansion refers to the case where the translator exceeds the number of SL words in the translation.
<b>Paraphrase</b>	This is an amplification or explanation of the meaning of a segment of the text.
<b>Notes, additions, glosses</b>	Additional information in the translation may take various forms: (1) Within the text (2) Notes at bottom of page. (3) Notes at end of chapter. (4) Notes or glossary at end of book.

method in this paper means that the result of this paper is analysed and elaborated descriptively. The source data used in this paper is the novel of *Negeri 5 Menara* by A. Fuadi and its translation, the novel *The Land of Five Towers* translated by Kilbane. The original novel is written in Indonesian, and it is translated into English.

To collect the data, the writer noted the added and deleted information in the target text. After that, the writer found out the problems that cause the translator to add and delete the information, and find out what procedures that the translator applied to solve the problem. The writer purposely chose the data based on the difficulties that mostly occurred while the translators are translating the text to be analysed. The chosen data then will be analysed using the translation theory proposed by Newmark (see Table 1). There are 5 data of addition and 5 data of deletion that will be analysed.

#### 4. DISCUSSION

Excerpt 1

Source Text:

*Bekalku, sebuah tas kain abu-abu kusam berisi baju, sarung, dan kopiah serta sebuah kardus mie berisi buku, kacang tojin dan sebungkus rending kapau yang sudah kering kehitam-hitaman.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 14)

Target Text:

My provisions were an old grey cloth bag with a shirt, sarong and kopiah prayer cap inside, and an empty noodle box containing Tojin peanuts and a package of dried, blackish rendang—spicy meat.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 14)

In the translation above, we can see that the translator added the phrase ...kopiah prayer cap... to translate the word ...kopiah... The translator gave additional information next to the word 'kopiah', to indicate that the 'kopiah' here refers to the cap using by men when they are praying. The translator did this to differentiate between the *kopiah* of hajj cap which has the circle shape and the *kopiah* of praying which has the oval shape and usually the color is black.

The reason why did the translator put the additional explanation is related to the culture of Indonesian people. The character in the novel is still a boy, and usually a boy used *kopiah* the praying cap instead of *kopiah* the hajj cap. The translator used the procedure of expansion, in which the translator has translated the text with more words by adding more information.

Excerpt 2

Source Text:

*Terdengan suara Sazli Rais yang berat membuka acara Dunia Dalam Berita TVRI.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 6)

Target Text:

The news anchor's heavy voice was opening the World News on TVRI, the state-owned TV channel.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 6)

In the translation above, the translator added information namely ...*the state-owned TV channel*. In this case, the translator tried to explain to the target readers that 'TVRI' is the name of one of Indonesia's state-owned television stations. For readers of the source language text, they already know that what 'TVRI' is. However, unlike the readers of the source text, this term is unfamiliar for the readers of the target text, so the translator provided additional information to assist the readers in understanding the meaning that the author wants to convey.

The reason why did the translator has given additional information related to 'TVRI' because at that time TVRI is the only television channel in Indonesia, and the 'World News' or '*Dunia dalam Berita*' is the most popular television program. In this translation, the translator used the procedure of additions (within the text), in which the addition information is inserted after the translated text as a form of explanation.

Excerpt 3

Source Text:

*Seperti Buya Hamka yang sekampung dengan kita itu.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 8)

Target Text:

Like Buya Hamka<sup>2</sup> from our Village.

<sup>2</sup> A renowned Indonesian Muslim scholar, politician, and author (1908-1981).

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 8)

In the translation above, it can be seen that the translator used footnotes at the bottom of page to provide additional explanation. In this case, the translator used footnotes because if the translator inserted the additional information into the sentence, the sentence will look less effective. The information added in the translation is in the form of a long explanation, so it would be more appropriate if the information was written in the footnote.

The additional information provided by the translator in the translation above is a brief profile of a well-respected and well-known figure among the Indonesian people, namely Buya Hamka. According to the translator, this information is important for the readers of the target text to know, so the translator wrote the explanation in the translation.

**Excerpt 4**
**Source Text:**

*Bekalku, sebuah tas kain abu-abu kusam berisi baju, sarung, dan kopiah serta sebuah kardus mie berisi buku, kacang tojin dan sebungkus rendang kapau yang sudah kering kehitam-hitaman.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 14)

**Target Text:**

My provisions were an old grey cloth bag with a shirt, sarong and kopiah prayer cap inside, and an empty noodle box containing Tojin peanuts and a package of dried, blackish rendang—spicy meat.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 14)

In the translation above, the word ...*rendang*... is translated into ...*rendang*—spicy meat... the phrase 'spicy meat' is written right after the word *rendang*. This is because the phrase is an explanation of the word '*rendang*' in the source text. Readers of the source text are certainly familiar with what *rendang* is, because *rendang* is one of the most favorite Indonesian food for Indonesian people. However, for readers of the target text, they may have a little difficulty in interpreting the word '*rendang*'. Therefore, to help the readers to get what the meaning of the term, the translator added the phrase ...spicy meat... in the target text as a general description of the term *rendang* in the source text. In this translation, the translator used the procedure of additions (within the text), in which the addition information is inserted after the translated text as a form of explanation.

**Excerpt 5**
**Source Text:**

*Televisi di ujung ruang kantor menayangkan Weather Channel yang mencatat suhu di luar minus 2 derajat Celcius. Lebih dingin dari secawan es tebak di Pasar Ateh, Bukittinggi.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 2)

**Target Text:**

The television at the end of the office showed the Weather Channel, displaying a temperature of minus two degrees Celcius—definitely colder than a glass of shaved ice made by a spinning machine in my village in West Sumatra.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 2)

In the translation above, the translator has translated the word ...*secawan es tebak*... into ...a glass of shaved ice made by a spinning machine ... The term '*secawan es tebak*' in the source text has no equivalent in the target text since in the culture of the target readers, there is no such thing. The term '*secawan es tebak*' is a traditional drink of West Sumatra. *Secawan es tebak* is a glass of ice which is shaved using the machine, and it is added by the syrup and other condiments made of rice flour. The target readers might not familiar with this kind of drink, thus the translation added an explanation to make it clear.

That is why the translator has translated the term '*secawan es tebak*' by paraphrasing to make the text more readable by the target text.

**Excerpt 6**
**Source Text:**

*Kepalanya selalu ditutup songkok dan di lehernya tergantung selendang.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 6)

**Target Text:**

Her head was always covered with a colorful scarf.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 6)

In the translation above, the translator deleted the word ...*songkok*... in the target text. The translator chose not to translate the term because '*songkok*' is a cultural term in the source text country and it is unfamiliar for the target readers. Actually, '*songkok*' is the cap for women, usually used when they want to cover their head and wear a veil. Besides, the translator thought that it is okay not to translate the term *songkok*, since there is already the word scarf which has the same function to cover women's head. The translator used the procedure of reduction while translating the text.

**Excerpt 7**
**Source Text:**

*Akibatnya, madrasah menjadi tempat murid warga kelas dua, sisa-sisa... coba waang bayangkan bagaimana kualitas para buya, ustad dan dai tamatan madrasah kita nanti.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 7)

**Target Text:**

Consequently, the madrasah becomes a place for second class students, the leftovers. Try, son, to imagine the quality of religious leaders and preachers graduating from our madrasah later.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 7)

In the translation above, the translator deleted the word ...*buya*... in the target text. The translator chose not to translate that term because '*buya*' is a term from Arab in which it has been naturalised into Indonesian language and has the meaning of an old man who has high knowledge in religion and honored by the people. Besides, the translator thought that it is okay not to translate the term '*buya*', since there is already the word religious leader which almost has the same meaning as *buya*. The translator used the procedure of reduction while translating the text.

**Excerpt 8**
**Source Text:**

*Ayahnya atau kakekku yang aku panggil Buya Sutan Mansur adalah orang alim yang berguru langsung kepada Inyik Canduang atau Syekh Sulaiman Ar-Rasuly. Di awal abad kedua puluh, Inyik Canduang ini berguru ke Mekkah di bawah asuhan ulama terkenal seperti Syekh Ahmad*

*Khatib Al-Minangkabaw dan Syekh Sayid Babas El-Yamani.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 7)

Target Text:

Her father, my grandfather, who I call Buya Sutan Mansur, was a pious man and a student of Syekh Sulaiman Ar-Rasuly, a famous cleric who studied in Mecca at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 7)

In the translation above, the translator has deleted some information related to the history of one of the famous religious leaders in Minangkabau. The translator has deleted the name *Inyik Canduang*. *Inyik Canduang* or Syekh Sulaiman Ar-Rasuly is the famous religious leader in Minangkabau. But, for the people in Indonesia especially Minangkabau, they tend to know *Inyik Canduang* instead of Syekh Sulaiman Ar-Rasuly. Although *Inyik Canduang* and Syekh Sulaiman Ar-Rasuly refers to the same person, but still the translator should have not deleted the name *Inyik Canduang*.

In addition, the translator has also deleted the information related to *Inyik Canduang's* history. In the source text, it is written that *Inyik Canduang* is the student of Syekh Ahmad Khatib Al-Minangkabaw and Syekh Sayid Babas El-Yamani. But this information is deleted in the target text. It can be understood that the translator has deleted it to avoid the readers of getting confused of the unfamiliar names. But still, deleted the whole information cannot be considered as a good thing to do.

Excerpt 9

Source Text:

*Dia lebih sering menyebut-nyebut keteladanan Bung Hatta, Bung Sjahrir, Pak Natsir, atau Haji Agus Salim, dibanding Buya Hamka. Padahal latar belakang religious ayahku tidak kalah kuat. Ayah dari ayahku adalah ulama yang terkenal di Minangkabau.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 10)

Target Text:

-

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 10)

In the translation above, the translator has deleted all the sentences and has not translated any of those. In the source text, the information deleted by the translator is about the list of names of national heroes that become role models for most Indonesian people. The text tells about the father of the main character admired Indonesian national heroes more than he admired the religious leaders, though the father are the descendants of a religious leader in Minangkabau. The reason why the translator has deleted the information is because the text consists of many names who are unfamiliar for the target readers. The translator should add many explanations to make the readers acknowledge those names and it will

make the translation less readable for the readers. So instead of adding a lot of information, the translator has chosen to delete it all.

But the translator's decision of deleting the whole sentences is not the best option. The translator should have considered to give the information in a way that makes the readers understand instead of deleting the whole information. In this translation, the translator applied a total deletion in the target text.

Excerpt 10

Source Text:

*Dia lebih banyak membicarakan kehebatan sepupunya yang tamatan STM, merantau ke Jakarta dan sukses mempunyai kios reklame di Aldiron, Blok M dengan nama Takana Jo Kampuang. Kangen Kampung.*

(Fuadi (2009) *Negeri 5 Menara*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 21)

Target Text:

He spoke more about the success of his cousin, who had graduated from vocational school, travelled to Jakarta and had a successful advertising kiosk called *Missing the Village*.

(Kilbane (2011) *The Land of Five Towers*. Fuadi (trans). Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, p. 20)

The phrase *...Takana Jo Kampuang* is deleted in the target text. As we can see that the phrase *...Takana Jo Kampuang* is a cultural term or a traditional language of Minangkabau. It means that the village is being missed by the people. In the target text, after the phrase *...Takana Jo Kampuang*, there is an explanation missing the Village, which is the meaning of the phrase '*Takana Jo Kampuang*'.

The translator did not translate nor put the traditional term because the translator tried to avoid repetition. Since the target readers do not understand the term, if the translator puts the traditional term into the target text, the translator should add notes to explain it, leading to repetition of meaning and information. So, although the translator has deleted the traditional language, the author's meaning and information can still be conveyed to the readers.

## 5. CONCLUSION

Translation is conveying meaning from one language to another. In the process of conveying the meaning, sometimes the translator has to add or delete some information to make the translation more readable and easily to be understood by the target readers. Based on the analysis above, it can be concluded that the translator had done some addition and deletion in the target text. The translator has added some information by giving direct notes within the text or additional notes below the page. This addition aims to give more explanation to the readers so that they can get what the author intends. The addition information is mostly in term of culture or religious. The addition that the author has done is not

fatal, instead it helps the readers to get the piece of information they are unfamiliar with. The translator did not add the information arbitrarily, the translator gives the explanation or notes in accordance with the meaning that the author intended.

Besides the addition, the translator has also done some deletion in the translated text. There are some information that has not been transferred from the language text into the target text. Some of the deletion is done while the translator is translating the cultural term in a traditional language. The translator has also deleted the important names of the source language. The important names in term of religion or national have been deleted, because the target readers might not know about them and their background. So it will confuse the readers if the translator still mentioning the names without giving any explanations. But, if the translator has given more explanations of those names, the translation will become less effective. Thus, the translator has decided to delete the names all in all.

The addition and deletion in the translation can help the readers to get the point of the text they read if the techniques are applied properly. However, if the addition or deletion is too extreme, it will affect the text. So, instead of adding or deleting too many information, it would be better if the translator finds another way to state the same meaning—as the author intended—with different style or structure.

## REFERENCES

- Baker, M. (2018). *In other words: A coursebook on translation*. Routledge.
- Williams, J., & Chesterman, A. (2014). *The map: a beginner's guide to doing research in translation studies*. Routledge.
- Chow, Y. F., Haroon, H., & Omar, H. C. (2020). Reaching out to the readers: The translation of Japanese manga in Malaysia. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(2), 538-550. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v10i2.28605>.
- Fawcett, P. (1997). *Translation and language: Linguistic theories explained*. UK: St. Jerome.
- Fuadi, A. (2009). *Negeri 5 menara [5 towers country]*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Guerra, A. F. (2012). Translating culture: Problems, strategies, and practical realities. [sic] - a journal of literature, culture and literary translation. 1(3), 1–27.
- Hardiyanti, D., Nugraheni, Y., Nababan, M., & Santosa, R. (2021). The reconstruction of the image of Javanese as an old language through an English translation of Javanese cultural terms in Indonesian novel 'Gadis Kretek'. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 11(1), 30-38. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v11i1.34670>.
- Haroon, H. (2019). The use of footnotes in the Malay translation of *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. *Translation & Interpreting*, 11(1), 130-146. <https://doi.org/10.12807/ti.111201.2019.a08>.
- Hilman, E. H. (2015). The translation of Indonesian cultural lexicons in the novel *Saman*. *Lingua Cultura*, 9(1), 67-74.
- Kilbane, A. (2011). *The land of five towers*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation* (Vol. 66). New York: Prentice hall.
- Nozizwe, D., & Ncube, B. (2014). Loss and Gain in Translation: A Case of Court Translation. *African Journal of Scientific Research*, 12(1).
- Pym, A. (2004). *The moving text: localization, translation, and distribution*. 49. John Benjamins Publishing.