

# Hybrid Communication for Sustaining Health Social Enterprises During Covid-19 Pandemic

\*1<sup>st</sup> Mohamad Ghozali Moenawar  
*Dept. of Communication Science*  
*Universitas Al-Azhar Indonesia*  
 Jakarta, Indonesia  
 ghozali@uai.ac.id

2<sup>nd</sup> Muchammad Nasucha  
*Dept. of Communication Science*  
*Universitas Al-Azhar Indonesia*  
 Jakarta, Indonesia  
 muchammad.nasucha@uai.ac.id

3<sup>rd</sup> Alma Mandjusri  
*Dept. of Communication Science*  
*Universitas Al-Azhar Indonesia*  
 Jakarta, Indonesia  
 alma.mandjusri@uai.ac.id

**Abstract**— The global pandemic encourage inventor and scientists to find the solution to overcome the problems. Hybrid is not the new term, nevertheless this topic always interesting and significant to be discovered and explored particularly in our today circumstance, amidst pandemic covid-19. The exploratory qualitative method used for answering the research problems: How the hybrid approach is applied in communication practices by the organizations that concerned with entrepreneurial activities in the health and humanitarian sector. By exploring various relevant literatures or documents represent the use of a hybrid communication approach by the institutions. This study contributes to the communication process by bringing benefits in the face of problems that arise during a pandemic, by maintaining the sustainability of health social entrepreneurship in a new perspective, to fit the flexibility and agility during pandemic by proposing the use of hybrid approach to improve connectivity, information exchange, knowledge sharing and social entrepreneurship working relationship harmonization in health.

**Keywords**— *communication, health social enterprise, covid-19 pandemic*

## I. INTRODUCTION

Taking into account large-scale social restrictions of all forms and degrees, as a step to reduce and stop the transmission of covid-19, many institutions, especially health social enterprises with its noble mission [1] consider the use of a hybrid approach in managing activities and services to the community. It does not always achieve productivity levels, but it delivers additional benefits such as reduced travel hours, multiple activities are done simultaneously, and many others. Most of the institutions see that condition may be able them to take advantage of the hybrid approach in the future [2]. Technology determine significantly in the circumstance. This phenomenon has resulted virtual meetings increase exponentially. Gartner Reported (2020)[3] the prediction of the proportion of company meetings held face-to-face will drop from 60% to 25% by 2024, it will be driven by remote work and changing workforce demographics exertion. While it has not yet known what the post-pandemic world of work will be like, the demand for flexible work is growing rapidly. he large-scale social restrictions of all forms and degrees during covid-19, many institutions, especially health social enterprises with its noble mission [4] Several studies in the literature emphasize on internal organizational communication where internal organizational communication is very important for organizational success because it affects the ability of

strategic managers to involve employees in achieving goals. The other studies have concentrated on the difficulties and conflicts associated with day-to-day communication. Meanwhile, others need to develop practical communication interventions so that communication theory is embedded in communication practices. Qatahweh (2018) in his study focuses on communication approaches to achieve macro and micro flows through the use of hybrid strategies and tools. Organizations need channels to transmit information about performance, goals and achievement of goals, processes and practices, and to promote synchronization and problem solving across organizational boundaries aimed at exploring how organizations can improve the performance of communication processes through hybrid means. Qatahweh (2018) proposes that communication processes needs to be based on both macro and micro level to achieve flow in different direction that includes: flow between individuals/groups within department, flow between individuals/groups between departments, flow between individuals/group between the firm and external organizations, suppliers and customers The improvement of communication is in a close relation with the technical development of the tools and technologies that make it possible and effective to communicate [5]. To achieve the above flow of information and knowledge, organizations need to use hybrid tools and techniques. Communication plan need to include the appropriate mix of online, face-to-face, and hard copy instruments to optimize the opportunities to share information with those you most need to reach.

Consider the use of a hybrid approach in managing activities and services to the community. Today's scholars are starting to understand the importance of taking a social communication hybrid approach that combines the best of face-to-face (offline) and online interaction. The approach considers the internal and external forces in people and their Communication environment. Brown (2017) suggested a hybrid approach that combines the best of face-to-face and online communication. Researchers have even found it when digital communication is a better method. It is more effective when the combination is face-to-face and online interactions All parties in a communication should try to get the best message media according to the choice of media and the type of use. This will result in increased message-focused collaboration, media mix, tasks, digital communication competence, interaction partners, optimal results, and considerations of context [6]. Looking back to Gartner's Report (2020) about the prediction the decrease of offline activities by 2024. Technological role, centrality in this

circumstance has encouraged and pushed many people, even organizations to adopt them in order to sustain and survive their life and routines. More over the global pandemic of Covid-19 indeed has brought us to the new adaptation of new ways of our routine. Nevertheless, the productivity limited by some relevant situations and factors.

Peruse the data, literature, research and related sources to the nowadays situation that designate about the relevant research focus, the hybrid approach that take along society and many social actor including the organization that concern on health and humanitarian sector as the primary goals to adopt the innovation amidst the pandemic circumstance, global and local context. And to make the research on the right focus, this research state follows problem statement or research question.

RQ: How the hybrid approach is applied in communication practices by the organizations that concerned with entrepreneurial activities in the health and humanitarian sector during pandemic situation?

## II. METHOD

This study uses a qualitative method with a descriptive analysis approach [7]. Qualitative methods allow researchers to understand entrepreneurial matters and deeper entrepreneurial activities with the context; cultural or social as well as its relationship with the immediate environment. Meanwhile, the researchers select purposively several health social enterprises institutions as the sources of primary data. The perpetrators identified as know important information related to the focus of the research will be interviewed as part of the study [8]. Document study becomes an important part for getting a variety of related data to describe in detail and sufficiently about how the hybrid approach was applied by the entrepreneurial health sector over the years the Covid-19 pandemic. Other data is collected empirically through field observations cross to in-depth interviews data that collected from the key informants [9], the three social actors of entrepreneurship come from Mer-C, Integrated Hospital Health Integrated Hospital (IHHIH), the Indonesia Escots Ambulance (IEA).

The qualitative research was used to capture the phenomenon deeply and holistically. Collecting data through field observation, documents and literature analysis, and interview with the related actors (Mer-C Indonesia, Rumah Sakit Sehat Terpadu DD (IHHIH), and Indonesian Escorting Ambulance) as the social organizations that are identified doing hybrid communication approach in their health enterprises sector, internally and externally, it appears in their relationship with the stakeholders. Data sources are selected purposefully based on relevant consideration with the focus of this research, consists of information about how the three organizations using hybrid approach in communication activities related to entrepreneurial routines during pandemic.

## III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The hybrid communication approach is part of the study of communication mediated computer (CMC) [10], It was concerned to combine face-to-face offline and online activities. CMC is a popular way people use information technology to interact. CMC is portable and it removes the

boundaries or limitations of geographical distance and time. Computer-Mediated-Relating is another term relevant for our learning journey because it addresses interpersonal dimensions of interactions, encompassing a broader spectrum of exchanges than CMC might such as online friendships and romantic communications or about whether certain interactions that occur online are perceived by some as a threat to an offline romantic relationship [11].

Likewise this approach to sustain a social enterprise in health sector as has been implemented by Mer-C, IHHIH and IEA. Regarding IEA as medical emergency requests must immediately require effective assistance the speed of action from the medical team to the location. Service access to health is carried out well, but there are things that become obstacles when an ambulance Delivering or picking up patients is obstructed by road users. Past traffic problem in Indonesia is becoming increasingly complex as the number grows population and number of motorized vehicles [12].

This led to a situation on the road highway more and more vehicles the more congested the road, so the the journey of ambulance is hampered to take the patient to the hospital. This volunteer community is called the escort team which has the name Indonesia Escorting Ambulance (IEA). After being inaugurated, the IEA was formed an advisory board nationwide, the purpose of establishing the national advisory council is to assist developing the potentials of IEA both central and throughout Indonesia and avoid arbitrariness and intervention from central to areas that could interfere with the development of an ambulance escorting in the region. The development of the escorting team community in Indonesia, till now is more than 80 (eighty) both in cities / regencies which subsequently become official regions / provinces who are members of IEA family. With guided by the motto "doing without hope"

Meanwhile IHHIH as a free medical center called Free Health Service (LKC DD) was established in 2001 by Dompot Dhuafa. In its development, LKC patients need further health services such as specialist consultation, hospitalization and surgery. Through the spirit of zakat and waqf, Dompot Dhuafa established advanced health services[13].

Considering the demand of community Dompot Dhuafa initiated to establish on 4 July 2012 as the Integrated Health Hospital - Dompot Dhuafa (RST) which is located on Jalan Raya Parung KM 42, Jampang Village, Kemang District, Bogor Regency, West Java. Although its establishment was supported by zakat and waqf funds, with the type C Hospital is facilitated with a variety of modern health services including hemodialysis machines, 4-dimensional ultrasound and cataract surgery machines. The hospital is also equipped with health services including a specialist clinic, ICU, operating room, hospitalization, 24-hour pharmacy, 24-hour emergency room and MCU.

The IHHIH vision is to become the hospital of choice that provides professional and Islamic-nuanced health services for the community, especially the poor. With the mission; Providing integrated Islamic health services that prioritize quality and patient safety, Increase caring and professional hospital human resources, Manage waqf hospitals effectively and efficiently, Raising partnerships and public awareness both at home and abroad to help the health

of the poor. The IHIIH also has implemented values: Care, Professional, Trust, Worship

According to Mer-C as health social enterprise Mer-C was founded by Joserizal Jurnal and a group of students from the University of Indonesia who took the initiative to take medical action to help victims of conflict in Maluku, in August 1999 [14]. Mer-C was an institution whose membership is called volunteers or unpaid volunteers," Mer-C was also based on Islam and adheres to the principles of rahmatan lil'aalamiin. With this principle, this humanitarian organization provides grace, in this case help to all beings, both personal and group regardless of background. "Religion, mazhab, harakah, nationality, ethnicity, class, politics, criminals or not, rebels or not, but on the basis of urgency, namely to help the most vulnerable people and the most neglected people," On this basis, Mer-C carried out its humanitarian missions to Afghanistan, Iraq, Iran, Palestine, South Lebanon, Kashmir, Sudan, Southern Philippines, South Thailand, and others. Mer-C was also a humanitarian social organization that engaged in medical emergencies and has a trustworthy, professional, neutral, independent, voluntary and highly mobile nature. Mer-C aims to provide medical services for victims of war, violence due to conflicts, riots, extraordinary events, and natural disasters at home and abroad

As social entrepreneurship, these organizations focus on creating social value [15], including handling trust in effective collaboration, no longer just about sitting together in offices, conference rooms, or common gathering spaces of the three institutions. Instead, technology equips teams for the collaborations needed to increase the digital resilience of the workforce during the Covid-19 pandemic which drastically accelerates the trend of the technology workspace, from virtual meeting software, to corporate chat platforms, to desktop-as-a-service for their public and stakeholders, the pandemic is rapidly advancing many digital workplace technologies. It's about creating constant, immediate liking for all interactions and more than cooperating with other people. This means utilizing organizational technology with combining face-to-face and online more efficiently, such as for internal meetings, client interactions, new employee interviews, and other activities. Besides, implementing the hybrid way requires time and a lot of effort from all sides. These three institutions that seem take their focus in social enterprise have been found doing hybrid communication approach in daily practice when giving their services to the public.

Let's take a look deeply to some relevant empirical data. Mer-C, the institution that has decided as an international organization has concerning to human health and peace. Mer-C has planned and declared the activities scope in international zone. However, national scope also being Mer-C's span that could be saw in their documentations, such as on this organization's website. Their relations to the public and stakeholder are categorized into internal and external. During pandemic condition, is there any difference of the routines? According to the data there are some distinctions of Mer-C's way in dealing with works. Mer-C doing coordination with the volunteer and stakeholder online and offline. Since medical treatment should offline particularly operation or such similar activities. Using online media and tools is certainly unavoidable by almost all organizations,

including Mer-C. The health and humanitarian services of Mer-C documented on media, internal and external, take the relevant of the cases. Such related data could be seen on the table:

TABLE I. TABLE I. SOME NEWS ABOUT MER-C IN PANDEMIC CIRCUMSTANCE

No	The News	Way of Communication
1	Penghargaan BNPB, pembuktian asa kinerja kemanusiaan Mer-C	Online
2	Sistem Manajemen Bencana (Sudut Pandang Kesehatan)	Online & Offline (Conditional)
3	Mer-C rawat warga Palestina di Indonesia Pasca Operasi	Offline
4	Tim Mer-C lakukan disaster Triage, bantu korban yang takut ke RS akibat Covid	Offline & Online
5	Mer-C kirim Tim Medis Bantu Korban Gempa Sulbar	Offline & Online
6	Mer-C penuhi panggilan kedua Kapolres Bogor	Online & Offline
7	Maklumat Mer-C: Pendampingan Medis HRS dan Penanganan Bencana Covid-19 di Indonesia	Online & Offline
8	Mer-C kawal kesehatan Habib Rizieq dan Advokasi Kemanusiaan	Online & Offline
9	RS Indonesia di Gaza jadi Rujukan Pasien Covid-19	Online & Offline
10	Kemenkes Palestina di Gaza Lepas Gelombang I Kepulangan Relawan RS Indonesia	Offline & Online
11	Mer-C serahkan bantuan APD Tahap 3 untuk Penanganan Covid-19	Offline & Online
12	Nakes dari Rakyat untuk Rakyat	Online & Offline
13	Rekomendasi Manajemen untuk Daerah yang Baru Mengalami Outbreak Kasus Covid-19	Online & Offline
14	PT. Repower Asia Indonesia Menggandeng Mer-C untuk Pengadaan 1.000 Paket Bantuan APD	Offline & Online
15	Mer-C terus Melanjutkan Monitoring Pasien dalam Pemantauan Covid-19	Online & Offline
16	Meski adanya wabah Covid-19, Mer-C tetap aktifkan Program Pelayanan Kesehatan Masyarakat di Sorong, Papua	Offline & Online

Looking at data that published by internal media and other mainstream media organization such as shown (see table 1) we can conclude that Mer-C try to take the relevant and supporting way in doing their activities. Even the offline activities are should be done according to the characteristics and manner of the activities or works. On the other say, offline treatment in medical aspects still considered as the primary way that should be taken by Mer-C. And it possible taken by other similar organizations (see also the picture).



Fig. 1. Mer-C Documentation Activities



Fig. 2. Mer-C Documentation Activities

Additionally, the observation outcomes on the site where the institutions take a place with their activities could be crossed by the documents that publicly accessed. Hybrid approach has examined by many researchers, and CMC (Computer Mediated Communication) as the starting point that has sketched out the focus. It appears also widely implemented by Social enterprise institutions such as Mer-C Indonesia, RST DD (IHHIH), and IEA. The three sample cases describe how hybrid communication has applied for sustaining of the organization existence and also to continue the development that planned by the institutions. The pandemic situation as we have been faced since some months design many indicators that bring us to adopt the technological inventions. The most inventions' direction are online and offline combination to support the daily activities, personally or organizationally. Moreover this condition will continue more than one year in advance. Some pressure factors, personally and socially has been explained by theories, mention two of them are uses and gratification (UG) and diffusion of innovation. However, other theories that promoted by other theorists such as Social Information Process Theory, Multimedia Multiplexity Theory and others historically when online has been essential parties of society [16, 17]. The theories explained how individual, organization, and other practice online and offline is being daily routine of society. Referring the term (hybrid), particularly communication science and theory, both ways are representing our current trend and trivialization.

The Benefit of hybrid communications make the whole team can be reached at once. They can provide the right information to the right man at the right time and the communications continue uninterrupted 24 hours a day. It looks in line with many authors and researchers that technological invention, in particular internet as the biggest

current invention has brought many changes. They can improve the communication level by having current updates, photos and videos shared by all the team members.

**IV. CONCLUSION**

The hybrid communication approach is applied by health social enterprise organizations that are concerned with entrepreneurial activities in the health and humanitarian sector. This research also explored various relevant literature or documents to be implemented in order to increase the use of a hybrid communication approach encountering pandemic circumstance like today situation. Moreover this study contributes to the communication process by bringing benefits in the face problems that arise during a pandemic, by maintaining the sustainability of social entrepreneurship in the field of health in a new perspective, to fit the flexibility and agility during pandemic by proposing the use of hybrid instruments to improve connectivity, information exchange, knowledge sharing and social entrepreneurship working relationship harmonization in health.

The hybrid communication approach is applied and seems will continue adopted by organizations that are concerned with entrepreneurial activities in the health and humanitarian sector such as Rumah Sakit Sehat Terpadu DD (IHHIH), Mer-C and Indonesian Escorting Ambulance, indeed in today circumstance when and where pandemic has happened not least that a year running. And positively that the current technology, internet, that have been widely adopted by almost all people in world definitely makes and encourage society to take the new routine in the pandemic era as this time. Instead it will increase and being more and more in the future.

**REFERENCES**

- [1] Roy, M.J., Donaldson, C., Baker, R., Kerr, S., The Potential of Social Enterprise to Enhance Health and Well-Being: A Model and Systematic Review. *Social Science Medicine* 123, 182–193. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2014.07.031> . (2014).
- [2] H. Qatawneh, Hybrid Communication Strategies and Tools as a Strategic Lever to Improve Supply Chain Performance *International Journal of Business and Management*; Vol.3, No. 3; ISSN 1833-3850 E-ISSN 1833-8119, Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education. (2018).
- [3] <https://www.tibco.com/resources/analyst-report/gartner-magic-quadrant-data-science-andmachine-learning-platforms>
- [4] F. Calo. M. J. Roy. C. Donaldson. S. Teasdale. S. Baglioni, Exploring the contributio of social enterprise to health and social care: A realist evaluation, *Social Science & Medicine* 222 (2019) 154–161
- [5] A. Jankó Electronic Communication the Effects of the Internet and Technology on Enterprise Communication. *Periodica Polytechnica. Social and Management Sciences*, 10(2), 257-267 ( 2012)
- [6] J. A. Bargh., & K.Y. A McKenna., (2004). The internet and social life. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 55, 573-90. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.55.090902.141922>
- [7] A. J. Cropley, *Qualitative research methods: A practice-oriented introduction for students of psychology and education*. 2nd updated, revised, and enlarged edition). Riga, Latvia: Zinātne. (open access – doi: 0.13140/RG.2.1.3095.6888) (2019).
- [8] M. Q. Patton, *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications (2015).
- [9] L. Neuman, *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Seventh Edition. London: Pearson Education, (2014).
- [10] M. A. Brown, *Social Communication: Recommendations for a Hybrid Approach Sr.*, *International Journal of Interactive*

- Communication Systems and Technologies Volume 8. Issue 1, January-June Florida Institute of Technology, Yorktown, USA (2018).
- [11] M.T. Whitty, M. T. The 'Realness' of Cyber-cheating: Men and women's representations of unfaithful Internet relationships. *Social Science Computer Review*, 23 (1), 57 – 67. (2015)
- [12] K. Puspita, S. Septiyani , I. G. S. Satria, Efektifitas Tim Escort Sebagai Pembuka Jalan Ambulan di Indonesia, *Jurnal Hukum Bisnis Bonum Commune* Volume 3 Nomor 2 Agustus (2020)
- [13] <https://www.rumahsehatpadu.or.id/>
- [14] <https://www.idntimes.com/news/indonesia/>
- [15] Dees, J. Gregory dan Anderson, Beth Battle, *For-Profit Social Ventures Social Entrepreneurship* edited by Marilyn L. Kourilsky and William B. Walstadm, Senate Hall Academic Publishing (2003).
- [16] Em Griffin, Andrew Ledbetter, and Glenn Sparks, *A first look at Communication Theory*, Tenth Edition, New York, McGraw-Hill (2019).
- [17] Richard West and Lynn H. Turner, *Introduction Communication Theory: Analysis and Application*, Sixth Edition, New York, McGraw-Hill (2018).