Analysis of the Implementation Process of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policy
——Taking Lankao County of Henan as an Example

Shangmeng Li¹, †, Guotong Liu², *, †, Yanru Yu³, †

¹Faculty of Arts and Humanities, The University of Sheffield, Sheffield, The United Kingdom, S10 2TN.
²HNU-ASU Joint International Tourism College, Hainan University, Haikou, Hainan, China, 570228.
³School of Management, Wenzhou Business College, Wenzhou, Zhejiang, China, 325035.
*Corresponding author. Email: gtliu@asu.edu
†These authors contributed equally.

ABSTRACT
In 2013, China's President Xi Jinping first put forward "precision poverty alleviation". Lankao County of Henan Province was listed as a poverty-stricken national county by the poverty alleviation and development leading group of the State Council in 2012, starting the targeted poverty alleviation. However, in implementing the targeted poverty alleviation policy, Lankao County still has some problems in the policy implementation process. How does Lankao County's targeted poverty alleviation policy develop? What factors lead to the implementation deviation? Taking Lankao County of Henan Province as the object of empirical analysis, this paper obtains detailed data by searching second-hand data. In addition, using the research methods of literature and case analysis, combined with media reports and government documents to analyze the policy development and implementation process of targeted poverty alleviation policy in Lankao. The paper summarizes the development of a targeted poverty alleviation policy in Lankao County, divided into two stages. The policy of the first stage focuses more on the macroscopic plans of poverty alleviation. The second stage focuses on the formulation and implementation of targeted policies. Besides, analyzing Smith's policy implementation model, results indicate that the transmission of a multi-level administrative system leads to policy information asymmetry, limited cultural level of target groups, and low execution efficiency of execution institutions. Smith's policy implementation model broadens the scope of the theoretical policy analysis and has certain positive theoretical and practical significance for other poor agricultural areas and even all poor areas to refer to and learn from.

Keywords: Targeted poverty alleviation, Policy implementation process, Smith policy implementation model.

1. INTRODUCTION

Poverty has always been one of the most important social problems in the world. As the largest developing country globally, poverty also affects China's economic development and socialist construction. Since the founding of the People's Republic of China, the Communist Party of China has been committed to leading the people out of poverty. In 2013, the Chinese Present Xi Jinping put forward the concept of "Targeted Poverty Alleviation" for the first time and made important instructions for poverty alleviation to "giving differentiated guidance for targeted poverty alleviation in line with local conditions by seeking truth from facts" [1]. Lankao County of Henan was listed as a national poverty county by the Leading Group of Poverty Alleviation and Development of the State Council (LGPAD) in 2012. In 2014, Lankao County Committee promised President Xi Jinping to achieve the goal of "three years of poverty alleviation and seven years of well-off" [2]. After three years of efforts, Lankao County completed the poverty alleviation goal on March 27, 2017, and officially withdrew from the national poverty county, becoming a national role model in poverty alleviation. However, Lankao County still has some problems in the policy implementation process, which are worth studying and analyzing deeply.
Based on the above background, the paper intends to analyze the policy implementation and development process of targeted poverty alleviation in Lankao and use Smith Policy Implementation Process Model to explain the causes of the problems. In the previous studies on the implementation deviation of targeted poverty alleviation policies, few studies have used theoretical models and cases to specifically analyze the implementation process of targeted poverty alleviation policies. In addition, this paper also summarizes and analyzes the targeted poverty alleviation policy in Lankao County to display the policy evolution process clearly. These are the two innovations of this paper and can fill the gap of previous studies. This paper will introduce our research method first and the studies of targeted poverty alleviation policy. Then, it will analyze the development of the targeted policy alleviation of Lankao and the possible reasons that may lead to policy implementation problems.

2. METHODOLOGY

The case study method is widely used in research papers. The case study researcher selects one or several scenarios, systematically collects data and information, and conducts an in-depth study to explore the situation of a phenomenon in a real-life setting. It is suitable for answering research questions such as 'how', 'why' and 'what' when the boundaries between the phenomenon and the actual context are unclear and not easily distinguishable, or when the researcher is unable to design precise, direct and systematically controlled variables. What is the outcome. It also incorporates a unique design logic, specific data collection and a unique approach to data analysis [3].

We have chosen Lankao County in Henan Province as our case study because it is representative and exemplary of poverty alleviation policy. The problem of policy implementation blockage in the process of poverty eradication in Lankao County is also somewhat representative of some of the problems in policy implementation that occur across China in the overall process of poverty eradication. Lankao County took the lead in completing the targeted poverty alleviation work and played a leading and exemplary role.

On the other hand, we chose Lankao County as our case study. Firstly, Lankao County is located in Henan Province, which has many poor counties with similar poverty alleviation problems, while Lankao County is one of the more famous of the many small local counties because of the spirit of Jiao Yulu. We have chosen Lankao County as a case study to analyze policy implementation deviations, which can make the reader feel more involved. Secondly, data on poverty alleviation in Lankao County are better found on the website of the People's Government of Lankao County, and some secondary policy data and literature are richer than other counties and cities, which can provide better data support for our analysis and research.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

3.1 Studies of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies

Scholars have done much research on targeted poverty alleviation policies with rich materials. It can be seen that "targeted poverty alleviation" is the focal point of scholars' research and the research mainly focuses on basic theory research and problem research.

In the research of basic theory, Wang and Guo believe that the most basic definition of targeted poverty alleviation is that policies and measures should be aimed at real poor families and populations [4]. Through targeted assistance to the poor, various obstacles leading to poverty can be fundamentally eliminated to achieve sustainable poverty alleviation. Ge et al. believe that targeted poverty alleviation is a means of poverty control, which refers to use compliance procedures to identify accurately, assist and manage poor households, and guide the optimal allocation of various poverty alleviation resources to realize poverty alleviation to each village and household, gradually build a long-term poverty reduction mechanism, and help poor people get rid of poverty [5].

In the research on targeted poverty alleviation, Zhang et al. believe that there are some injustices in poverty alleviation, including "poverty alleviation according to social relationship" and "poor counties are actually not poor" [6]. Some poverty alleviation projects are less targeted, and poverty alleviation efficiency is low, such as "supporting agriculture" rather than "poverty alleviation". Ge believes that the problems faced by targeted poverty alleviation mainly are the lack of farmers' participation, social mobility, ability to obtain effective information [7].

3.2 Studies of Policy Implementation Deviation

Chinese scholars' research on public policy implementation deviation mainly focuses on the causes of implementation deviation, mainly divided into subjective reasons of implementation subject and objective reasons such as implementation object and external environment. Many scholars believe that policy executors cause the deviation of policy implementation. For example, Ding pointed out that the cognitive defects of policy implementation subjects will lead to policy implementation deviations, including cognitive defects in policy value, function and content [8]. At the same time, he also points out that to maximize their own interests, policy executors use the information disadvantages, regulatory loopholes and risk-sharing mechanism of policymakers, resulting in deviation in policy implementation through inaction and fake implementation [9]. Qian believes that the attitude,
3.3 Studies of the Relationship between Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies and Implementation Deviation

In the research on the relationship between targeted poverty alleviation policy and implementation deviation, Wan believes that the defects of grassroots poverty alleviation policy objectives and resources, the constraints of local natural and cultural environment, selective and risk-averse policy implementation methods, the lack of coordination and low efficiency among grassroots implementation agencies, as well as the imbalance of work responsibilities and rights and the interaction between various factors have led to the implementation deviation of the targeted poverty alleviation policy at the grassroots level [13]. In Yang and Chen's research, from the perspective of subject behavior, they analyze the direct factors affecting policy implementation from the aspects of interest demands, role orientation and executive ability of actors, from the perspective of institutional structure, the governance system, role positioning and the system logic are the factors causing deviation, from the perspective of governance situation, the factors causing the difference policies implementation between different regions are the choice of industries, the operation model of industries and relationship network [14].

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Lankao County began to implement the targeted poverty alleviation policy in 2014 and accurately identified poor households. One hundred fifteen poor villages were identified in the county in total, with a poverty population of 23,275 households and 77,350 people, with a poverty incidence rate of 10% [15]. It can be seen that the poverty alleviation work in Lankao County is very challenging. Therefore, from 2014 to 2020, governments at all levels have formulated various targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies to promote poverty alleviation goals.

From the summary of targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies, we can discover that the planning of targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies in Lankao County is a complex dynamic process from the central to the local, from the overall layout to specific poverty alleviation projects, in which problems are inevitable. The causes of these problems are analyzed and explained through Smith's policy implementation process model. On the contrary, the nature and conditions of these policies determine the specific contents of the four elements of Smith's policy implementation process model.

4.1 Development of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies in Lankao County

Since implementing the targeted poverty alleviation policy in 2014, the Central Government, Henan Provincial Government and Lankao County Government have issued many policies to promote and ensure the targeted poverty alleviation work. (see Table 1) The targeted poverty alleviation policy has been implemented since 2014, so the selected policy starts from 2014. The policies are compiled according to the representative targeted poverty alleviation policies published on the websites of the State Council, Henan Provincial Government and Lankao County Government.

Table 1. Summary of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policy of all Levels Governments (2014-2020)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Departments</th>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Main Context</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>General Office of the CPC Central Committee (GOCCPC) and the State Council LGPAD, the Central Agricultural Office, the Ministry of Civil Affairs, etc.</td>
<td>Opinions on Innovating Mechanism and Solidly Promoting Rural Poverty Alleviation and Development</td>
<td>2014.1.25</td>
<td>Improve the assessment mechanism of poor counties; Improve the assistance system for village cadres; Reform the management system of poverty alleviation funds; Improve the financial service;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>LGPAD</td>
<td>Implementation plan for establishing targeted poverty alleviation mechanism</td>
<td>2014.5.12</td>
<td>Poverty registration and information construction; Cultivate poverty alleviation and development brand projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>LGPAD</td>
<td>Guide to the vocational education of Drewdrop Program</td>
<td>2015.8.17</td>
<td>Provide subsidies for children of poor households to receive secondary and higher vocational education;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>People's Government of Lankao (PGL)</td>
<td>Reexamination of Basic Living Allowance for</td>
<td>2015.9.18</td>
<td>Further, standardize the work of ensuring the minimum living standard in rural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The targeted poverty alleviation policies issued by governments at all levels can be roughly divided into two stages. The first stage is from 2014 to 2015. At this stage, the main policies include the Opinions on Innovating Mechanism and Solidly Promoting Rural Poverty Alleviation and Development and Implementation Plan for Establishing Targeted Poverty Alleviation Mechanism. These policies mainly clarify the objectives and work plans of targeted poverty alleviation, such as improving the information construction of poverty registration, establishing the assessment mechanism of targeted poverty alleviation, improving the assistance mechanism for village cadres, and developing educational and financial characteristic industries poverty alleviation. At the same time, the central government also calls for strengthening rural infrastructure construction and ensuring rural housing, electricity and drinking water. In the first stage, the policy also involves some more precise special poverty alleviation policies. For example, in 2015, the LGPAD issued the educational poverty alleviation policy of the guide to the vocational education of the Dewdrop Program, which provides financial subsidies to poor students in secondary vocational schools.

The second stage of the policy is from 2016 to 2020. The policies in this stage are mainly more specific poverty alleviation policies formulated by the county government to implement the objectives and tasks of the first stage of the targeted poverty alleviation policy. The Implementation Opinions on Winning the Battle Against Poverty issued by the Henan Provincial Government in 2016 implemented classified poverty alleviation management for poor counties in Henan and the poverty alleviation work of Lankao County should be completed in 2016. At the same time, when the Present Xi Jinping visited Lankao County in 2014, Lankao County secretary made a solemn promise of "three years out of poverty and seven years of well-off". Therefore, to ensure that Lankao County can successfully achieve the poverty alleviation goal, the Lankao County government began to enact a series of targeted poverty alleviation policies according to local situations, including financial poverty alleviation and photovoltaic industry poverty alleviation, medical poverty alleviation and education poverty alleviation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Issuing Organization</th>
<th>Policy Title</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>GOCCPC, State Council</td>
<td>Decision on winning the battle against poverty</td>
<td>2015.11.29</td>
<td>Develop characteristic industries poverty alleviation, guide labor export alleviation, implement relocation poverty alleviation, combination with ecological protection poverty alleviation, and strengthen education poverty alleviation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Henan Provincial Party Committee and Government</td>
<td>Decision on winning the battle against poverty</td>
<td>2016.2.20</td>
<td>Implement classified poverty alleviation management for poor counties, and require Lankao County to achieve poverty alleviation in 2016; Increase the &quot;Internet plus&quot; poverty alleviation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>PGL</td>
<td>Notice on the implementation plan of accelerating financial poverty alleviation loans in Lankao County</td>
<td>2016.7.24</td>
<td>Promoting the work of poverty alleviation through financial loans; Ensure the number of financial loans; Speed up the progress of financial lending and expand the scope of lending.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>PGL</td>
<td>Opinions of Lankao County on supporting the construction of photovoltaic poverty alleviation projects</td>
<td>2016.9.1</td>
<td>Establish innovative and scientific poverty alleviation projects for photovoltaic poverty alleviation; Simplify the project approval process. Strengthen power grid services and strive for financial support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>PGL</td>
<td>Implementation plan for special treatment of serious diseases of rural poor people in Lankao County</td>
<td>2017.6.8</td>
<td>Establish a healthy poverty alleviation management database, strengthen the dynamic management of information; Establish designated hospitals and treatment plans; Improve the payment policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>LGPAD</td>
<td>Notice on further improving the employment assistance work for poor unemployment families</td>
<td>2018.10.17</td>
<td>Clarify the responsibility of helping unemployed families, making detailed dynamic records of unemployment families, and implementing the monthly report system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>PGL</td>
<td>Interpretation of Educational Poverty Alleviation Policy in Lankao County</td>
<td>2020.5.7</td>
<td>Provide subsidies to students in preschool education, compulsory education, high school education and secondary vocational education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These policies have accelerated the targeted poverty alleviation work, consolidated the poverty alleviation work, and ensured the rapid development of the local economy after exiting poor counties in 2017.

4.2 Analyzing the Case of Lankao County by Smith’s Policy Implementation Process Model

4.2.1 Idealized Policy of Targeted Poverty Alleviation in Lankao County

In Smith Policy Implementation Process Model, the idealized public policy needs to be regulated by a legal document, the policies include many aspects, and the policy scope is clear and be supported by the public [16]. Lankao County has rich types of targeted poverty alleviation policies, including various fields such as education, health care, finance and industrial development, covering various target groups. In the actual implementation of targeted poverty alleviation policies in Lankao, there is still some formalism, such as insufficient education for poverty alleviation target groups [17]. In addition, poverty alleviation policy-making in Lankao from the central level to the provincial level, county level, and village levels. The multi-level administrative system and policy-making process make the policy information transmitted level by level to reach the grassroots implementation agencies and personnel. In the lack of information transmission and communication mechanism, the transmission will be accompanied by information reprocessing and information dissipation each time, which will lead to policy deviation caused by information asymmetry.

4.2.2 Target Groups of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies in Lankao County

Lankao County is a typical agricultural county. In 2016, the urbanization rate of Lankao County was only 37.61% [18]. Due to the low economic level of Lankao County, many young and middle-aged labor force go to urban areas or other economically developed areas to work or go to school. In recent years, the rural young and middle-aged labor force in Lankao County has been continuously transferred to the city. There are few young people in the rural areas of Lankao County. The scale of the left-behind elderly is expanding, and the phenomenon of the empty village is becoming more and more serious [19]. Most of the poor families and people in Lankao County are old, and the poor people who are over 50 years old make up a huge percentage [17]. From a series of poverty alleviation policies of Lankao, the focus of the policies is industrial poverty alleviation, giving certain characteristic industries, rather than simply providing subsidies to poor households. Most of the left-behind elderly in rural areas have low educational levels, and they are conservative and have a backward idea. They cannot understand various policies, and it is difficult for them to get the policy focus and make efforts by themselves to get rid of poverty.

4.2.3 Implementing Organization of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policy in Lankao County

The implementing agencies of targeted poverty alleviation policies in Lankao County are mainly divided into the county, township, and village levels. The county-level implementing agency of Lankao County is mainly the Poverty Alleviation Office of Lankao. The township-level implementing agencies are mainly the Poverty Alleviation and Development Service Centers of townships.

The organizational structure of the Lankao County Poverty Alleviation Office is stable, and the division of personnel is clear. These leader divisions include overall coordination, industrial poverty alleviation, development planning, financial work, supervision and assessment [20]. Although the division of labor of the Poverty Alleviation Office in Lankao County is clear, the organizational structure is too simple. The organizational structure of the Poverty Alleviation Office of Lankao County is divided into a comprehensive unit, a planning and finance unit, industrial finance unit and an information center, which only has 4 units [20]. These units do not include units especially responsible for supervision and assessment like many other counties, which will easily lead to perfunctory policy implementation. Among the 13 townships in Lankao, 6 townships have not set up a special department responsible for poverty alleviation, which will also reduce the efficiency of downward implementation of the policy to a certain extent [21]. At the same time, the number of staff in the Poverty Alleviation Office of Lankao County is insufficient. At the beginning of the targeted poverty alleviation policy in 2014, the Poverty Alleviation Office of Lankao County had only 15 staff, which is far less than some other poor counties with a total population much smaller than Lankao [22]. It increased great work pressure to the Poverty Alleviation Office with only 15 staff and easily led to deviation in policy implementation.

4.2.4 Environmental factors of Targeted Poverty Alleviation Policy in Lankao County

First is the economic environment of Lankao. Since the implementation of the targeted poverty alleviation policy in Lankao County in 2014, the economic development level of Lankao County has increased significantly. However, overall, the economic level is still low. In 2016, the per capita GDP of Kaifeng was 38,445 yuan, while Lankao was about 30,246 yuan, which is still far from the average level of the city [19]. Second, the infrastructure construction in Lankao County is relatively backward, which is reflected in the inconvenient travel of people in some rural areas and the low rate of Internet
access [23, 24]. Infrastructure environments such as transportation and network largely affect the efficiency of policy transmission from top to bottom, and farmers are inconvenient to obtain information, resulting in policy implementation deviation.

The third is the support from the upper-level government. Lankao County is a provincial county directly under the jurisdiction of Henan Province, which has more support than other counties. However, the economic development level of Lankao County's rural area is still not high. In 2017, the disposable income of rural residents in Lankao County was 10,907 yuan, lower than the national level of 14,017 yuan for rural residents and far lower than the level of 23,068 yuan for urban residents in Lankao [25]. The main reason for the low income of rural residents in Lankao is that governments at all levels have a low investment in rural science and technology projects in Lankao. The cost of agricultural scientific research and development in Henan accounts for only 0.3% of every year's total expenditure. Lankao County still has a large gap with other counties in Henan in terms of agricultural investment, facilities and equipment level, agricultural output efficiency and industrialized management [26].

5. CONCLUSION

In this paper, we analyze the problems associated with implementation bias in the process of policy implementation. As an example, we use the implementation process of the precision poverty alleviation policy in Lankao County, Henan Province, to summarize the problems of implementation bias in Lankao County and apply the Smith's Policy Implementation Process Model to explain the causes of the problems.

Governments' targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies at all levels from 2014 to 2020 generally show a trend from macro to micro and from face to point. They increasingly formulate and implement the targeted Poverty Alleviation Policies of Lankao County according to local conditions, which can more clearly understand the reality and development process of the targeted poverty alleviation policies of Lankao County, and provide a theoretical policy basis for the study of implementation deviation. For Smith's policy implementation model. First, from the perspective of the policy itself, a multi-level administrative system leads to information asymmetry and inadequate content under the transmission. Second, in terms of the main implementing agencies in Lankao County, there are low implementation efficiency, insufficient staff, and no department specially responsible for supervision and assessment, which is easy to lead to the problem of perfunctory policy implementation. Finally, environmental factors, low economic level, underdevelopment infrastructure construction and low investment in rural science and technology projects in Lankao County. The above four factors lead to the deviation of policy implementation.

This paper has certain value and significance. In the theoretical sense, this paper combines Smith's policy implementation model with the implementation problems and reasons of targeted poverty alleviation policy in Lankao County, enriching and expanding the explanatory power of the theoretical model and the scope of applicable policy analysis to provide help and reference for future researchers. In the practical sense, this paper takes Lankao County, Henan Province as a poverty alleviation sample to analyze the lack of implementation of targeted poverty alleviation policies, hoping to have a certain reference significance for other local governments to effectively.

REFERENCES

[9] Ding, H. & Li, X. (2010). Research on the causes and avoidance mechanism of moral hazard in the process of public policy implementation -- from the
perspective of interest game. *Journal of Beijing Administrative College*, 4(04), 16-23.


