

# Textbook Evaluation of English Learning Material at SMKN 1 Lembah Melintang

Dzulfia Eka Putri<sup>1\*</sup> and Jufrizal Jufrizal<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>English Department, FBS Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, Sumatra Barat, 25153, Indonesia

\*Corresponding author. Email: [dzulfiaekaputri.tbi@gmail.com](mailto:dzulfiaekaputri.tbi@gmail.com); [juf\\_ely@yahoo.com](mailto:juf_ely@yahoo.com)

## ABSTRACT

One source of English learning material is the textbook. Textbooks aren't merely for teachers to utilize when they're teaching or learning. Textbook aids learners in acquiring material linked to their English studies. This study attempted to evaluate the English learning material in textbooks, particularly textbooks for vocational school students, based on the preceding rationale. Source of data in this study is students' textbooks that used at Grade XI of SMKN 1 Lembah Melintang. This research comes under the heading of evaluative research, which evaluates phenomena in order to describe the state of things in the field. The documentation will be used to assess the textbooks used by students as English learning materials. As a result of the study, textbook evaluation related to the English learning material is identified and classified based on BNSP's (2011) classification. It consists of content, language, and presentation aspect.

**Keywords:** *English Learning Material, Evaluation, Textbook*

## 1. INTRODUCTION

A textbook is a regular book in that field of study that also has instructional aims and objectives that are supported by employing teaching that is harmonious and easily understood by its users at school. Essentially, a textbook is a collection of learning materials related to the educational process that enables students to maximize their potential and increase their knowledge and skills needed in social life while also contributing to society.

According to Prastowo (2011) [1], the textbook has several elements such as the title of the textbook, basic competency or main material, exercise, and assessment. It can be said that textbooks can support a teaching program. The textbook has an important role to assist teachers during the teaching and learning process.

Learning resources are any type of material that teachers can use to help them carry out their teaching and learning tasks. These resources can be written or unwritten in nature. The contents of the curriculum are made up of learning materials. It is necessary for teachers to acquire core competences in order to meet the learning objectives of each subject in a given educational unit. Students can acquire a basic competency (Kompetensi Dasar) in a methodical and cohesive manner, allowing them to master all skills. Students must grasp four basic language abilities: listening, speaking, reading, and writing, as well as

vocabulary, pronunciation, and grammar aspects, according to the book for English students.

In Indonesia, English is implemented in the same curriculum between Senior High School and Vocational high school. These things being fundamentals critical thinking for the researcher to take research about the similar treatment meanwhile different in needs. The reason why the Vocational high school was chosen because the specific concept of learning activities should be clear especially for kinds of vocational high school. It is critical to have a background and reason why this research used a vocational high school as the informants of the research in order to realize vocational revitalization, which includes an English course.

Based on phenomena above, researcher is interested to analyze the suitability of English learning material on the textbooks of vocational high school students in Lembah Melintang. Furthermore, by gathering, evaluating, and objectively reviewing the applicability of the material contained in the textbook, this study tries to determine the usefulness of the book and whether it is following the set objectives or not. Then, formulate and determine policies by first considering the positive values and advantages of the book. After that, the findings of this study will be evaluated by the instructor as a factor in selecting acceptable textbooks for vocational high school students in the process of teaching and learning. Consequently, students' textbooks for class XI of vocational high

schools in Lembah Melintang must be evaluated for English learning material.

Learning materials are an important part of the overall curriculum, so they must be prepared in order for learning to take place. Also, learning material is the center of all activities in the classroom like preparation and instruction. Graves (2000)[2] notes out that materials are what a teacher used in the teaching process. It simply means that material refers to everything that the instructor uses during the teaching and learning process. As a result, it is reasonable to conclude that material is an important aspect of the classroom; without it, the teaching and learning process would be disrupted, as this instance is the cornerstone of learning activity.

Furthermore, the material has important points in teaching where the design, content, distribution, and context would greatly influence the learning process of the students. Material, according to McGrath (2002)[3], can be anything for learning and teaching languages (for example, task books, word sheets, and computer software); authentic materials that have been specially selected and exploited for teaching purposes by the classroom teacher; teacher-written materials; and learner-generated materials.

The researcher can determine that learning material is anything that teachers use to assist students learn in the classroom based on the previous statement. In the classroom's teachers and students, it becomes the focal focus of the instructional process. The teacher as well as the student were both required to participate in the teaching-learning activities.

Textbooks have previously been specified by some specialists. However, it is necessary to first check the Indonesian Ministry of Education's textbook definition. According to the Indonesian Department of Education, a textbook is the primary reference book that must be read in school and contains material targeted at developing student piety and manners as well as supporting students in science and technology studies (Kementrian Pendidikan Nasional, 2005, p. 2). According to the Ministry of Education, the Minister of Education chooses textbooks for educators and students to utilize in the teaching and learning process based on suggestions from the Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan Indonesia (2005) [4]. (Indonesian National Education Standard Board). Teachers choose the textbooks that have been determined by the Minister of Education. However, in DKI Jakarta, most teachers use commercially published textbooks as their primary textbooks in class, with textbooks from the Ministry of Education serving as supporting information.

Textbooks have become an inextricable part of the educational process. They are also an important aspect of the teaching and learning process, as they make up the output section of an instructional system, according to (Banathy, 1986)[5.] They are a part of the educational system. In addition, some experts feel textbooks have played a significant role in a broader educational framework, both within and beyond the

classroom. Authors include Celce-Murcia (2001)[6], Nunan (2003)[7], and Littlejohn (2011)[8].

In language training, textbooks, on the other hand, are regarded to fulfill two objectives. According to Richard and Renandya (2002)[9], textbooks have two purposes in the classroom. The first point of view, referred to as the deficit viewpoint, sees textbooks as a tool to make up for teachers' failings in the classroom. They're also utilized to make sure that the curriculum is covered by assigning assignments and activities that are related to it. Due to disparities in knowledge, the second point of view, also known as the alternative point of view, maintains that materials are implemented based on the best decisions made by parties other than teachers.

Some acceptable textbook criteria must be understood before textbooks can be evaluated. These criteria aid the evaluator in developing a textbook assessment instrument to evaluate the aspects under consideration. The five criteria for good textbooks were given by Riddel (2003)[10]. First and foremost, textbooks should be written by qualified instructors. Second, they must be appropriate for the grade level of the pupils. Finally, textbooks should be visually appealing and well-designed. Fourth, they should include thought-provoking issues that will push pupils to think. Finally, kids should have a variety of and well-balanced language, skill, and pronunciation activities.

Textbook evaluation is the process of determining whether or not a book is appropriate based on a set of criteria. According to Cunningsworth (1995)[11], the judicial procedure will be guided by the perspectives and priorities of the parties involved. Celce-Murcia & Marianne (2001) also believe that this is a complicated process that is carried out in a variety of ways. They range from a teacher-driven to a more decentralized decision-making process.

This study took into account seven different forms of textbook evaluations. Celce-Murcia & Marianne propose the first textbook evaluation (2001). Cunningsworth is the one who came up with the second one (1995). Littlejohn comes up with the third one (2011). Mukundan, et al. (2011)[12] present the fourth option. Nation and Macalister come up with the next one (2010). Ur (1996)[13] proposes the sixth one, while BSNP (2011)[14] formulates the last one.

In this study, the researcher will utilize indicators to evaluate the textbook used at SMKN 1 Lembah Melintang for English learning materials. In evaluating the learning material, the researcher will use the criteria of textbook evaluation proposed by (BSNP, 2011). Because these criteria are appropriate with the researcher's research problem of analyzing and evaluating how good learning material in the textbook used at SMKN 1 Lembah Melintang, they are namely content, language, and presentation aspects.

From the explanation above, several studies have been conducted related to the textbook evaluation of learning material. Textbooks are essential components of the teaching and learning process, according to

Gunantar (2017)[15]. Although textbooks may not be able to meet all of the demands of the teaching and learning process, their availability as teaching aids is essential. They become one of the most effective teaching and learning tools available, as well as a reflection of an individual's or a nation's values and ambitions. Systematic and comprehensive textbooks could aid with the cultural component.

Second, Rohmatillah & Pratama (2017)[16] demonstrated that learning materials were successfully included and developed supporting materials that interpreted about social function formed cooperating tasks, text structures were available and related the other rules of text structures, language features were available and developed based on appropriate vocabulary, pronunciation and intonation practice, and modals, adverbials, and adverbials. Appropriate subjects and multimedia were also supplied and built in accordance with the syllabus. The omission of BC 4.5 and BC 4.6 requirements, as well as enrichment vocabulary and pronunciation comments, are flaws in this textbook.

Lisa (2018)[17] came to the conclusion that a textbook is a crucial resource for teachers and students in the learning process, and that all of the writing assignments are guided writing, in which students are requested to respond to prompts in a specific amount of time. In terms of linguistic elements, the textbook treats them all together. According to this analysis, the writing activities in the textbook have been covered in a proportionate manner. The data show that self-study requires independent references for vocabulary and grammar items. Topics should also be more diverse in order to provide pupils more opportunities to be exposed to a variety of situations.

That research is relevant to the last one in that it looks at the textbook's learning elements. However, the previous research analyzed the effectiveness, students' needs, writing tasks in the textbook. This research will evaluate the English learning materials found in the textbook used in grade XI and adapted some indicators of analysis from the theory that was also used in the previous research.

## 2. METHOD

Because this study will evaluate the English learning material textbook published by the Ministry of Education and Culture for vocational high school students in grade XI, evaluation research will be used. The systematic process of gathering and analyzing data about the quality, efficacy, merit, or value of programs, goods, or behaviors, according to Gay, et al. (2011)[18], is known as evaluation research. This study examines and observes how the learning material provided in the curriculum 2013 students' book is used in grade XI at SMKN 1 Lembah Melintang by methodically assessing facts and statistics based on the content. The study takes place organically in this study, with no data manipulation. This study also gathers data on the phenomena in order to describe the current state of affairs in the field.

In this study, the tool was a checklist of learning materials from the textbook. This checklist serves as a manual assessment of the textbook's learning elements. The aspects of the learning resources in the curriculum 2013 students' book are described using a checklist approach. It covers the indicators of learning content evaluation from the curriculum 2013 textbook. The checklist will be used to assess the textbooks in three areas. They are the aspects of content, language, and presentation.

After collecting data by using a document checklist, the researcher also uses the interview to conduct this research. The researcher will evaluate based on the indicators of criteria in evaluating the learning material in the textbook. The format of the interview criteria in evaluating the learning material in the textbook can be seen as follow.

By using this format, the researcher will use Likert scale (1-3), 1 for Bad, 2 for Enough, and 3 for Good. To filling this instrument, it will fill by several inter-raters. After the inter-raters choose their evaluation, they will describe their reason why choose bad, enough, or good. Then, the researcher also writes their evaluation in the description how their evaluation to improve textbook for learning material.

## 3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

After the research is finished, the data from each sample chapter in the textbook "Bahasa Inggris" is examined. The BSNP rubric assessment criteria were used to evaluate the activity and material developed within the textbook. This evaluation will confirm that the textbook meets all of the standards for a standard textbook. In terms of content feasibility, there are a few different types:

Table 1. Types

Component	Item	Score			
		1	2	3	4
1. The materials' compliance with Core Competence (KI) and Basic Competence (KD)	a. Completeness				7
	b. In-Depth				7
2. The Materials are accurate	c. Social Functions				7
	d. Generic Structure				7
	e. Linguistic Feature	1			6
3. Supporting Materials'	f. Relevance				7
	g. Development of Life Skills				7
	h. Development of Diversity Insight	2			4
<b>Total</b>		<b>3</b>			<b>42</b>

According to the table of content feasibility above, the entire criteria rated 4 out of 7 example chapters for incompleteness, in-depth, social functions, generic structure, relevance, and development of life skills. In terms of linguistic characteristics, just one chapter received a 1 and five chapters obtained a 4, as well as two chapters receiving a 1 and four chapters receiving a 4. There are two chapters that scored a 1 and four chapters that received a 4 in terms of developing diverse insight. Out of a total of 45 categories, they have 42 in the score 4 category and three in the score 1 category. Only 1 language feature and 2 categories from the development of diversity insight failed to meet the score 4/4 standards, as shown in the previous tables.

$$P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100\%$$

$$P = \frac{42}{45} \times 100\%$$

$$P = 93\%$$

As a result, the BSNP content feasibility test passes 93 percent of the resources, exercises, and text provided in the textbook "Bahasa Inggris." According to the data, the textbook "Bahasa Inggris" was graded "good" with an average score of 93 percent. According to Pusat Perbukuan, this statement is as follows:

**Table 2.** The Four Proposed Categories for Converting the Fulfillment Average (BSNP)

Scores in the range of fulfillment	Category
80% - 100%	Good
60% - 79%	Fair
50% - 59%	Sufficient
0% - 49%	Poor

**4. CONCLUSION**

According to a study conducted by the Ministry of Education and Culture to evaluate the English textbook "Bahasa Inggris," the textbook "Bahasa Inggris" is appropriate for use in second grade of vocational high schools that have started utilizing the curriculum 2013. This book covers all of the main and fundamental competencies in the 2013 curriculum. It also used the student-centered teaching method, which is encouraged in the 2013 curriculum.

Aside from that, the tasks are engaging and useful in the classroom. It needed students to be active learners at all times, even small incompatibilities, as indicated by the BSNP assessment of a thorough examination of the lack of cultural diversity and a basic understanding of linguistic structure. The English textbook "Bahasa Inggris" is still acceptable for use in classrooms because it meets all of the requirements for Curriculum 2013.

**REFERENCES**

[1] Prastowo, A. (2011). *Panduan Kreatif Membuat Bahan Ajar Inovatif*. Diva Press.

[2] Graves, K. (2000). *Designing Language Courses: A Guide for Teachers*.

[3] Heinle.McGrath, L. (2002). *Material Evaluation and Design for Language Teaching*. Edinburgh University Press.

[4] Kementrian Pendidikan Nasional 2005

[5] Banathy, B. H. (1986). *Instructional Systems*. Fearon Publishers.

[6] Celce-Murcia, & Marianne. (2001). *Teaching English as a Second Language or Foreign LAnguage*. Thomson Learning.

[7] Nunan, D. (2003). *Practical English language teaching*. McGraw Hill.

[8] Littlejohn, A. (2011). *The analysis of language teaching materials : inside the Trojan horse*. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Materials development in language teaching*. Cambridge University Press.

[9] Richard, J. C., & Renandya, W. A. (2002). *Methodology in Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press.

[10] Riddel, D. (2003). *Teaching English as a Foreign Language*. Teach Yourself.

[11] Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your coursebook alan cunningswo*. A Division Of Macmillan, Publisher Limited.

[12] Mukundan, J., Nimehchisalem, V, & Hajimohammadi, R. (2011). Developing an English language textbook evaluation checklist : A focus group discussion. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 1 (12)*, 100–106.

[13] Ur, P. (1996). *A Course in Language Teaching: Practice and Theory*. Cambridge University Press.

[14] BSNP. (2011). *Instrumen Penilaian Buku Teks Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris* (B. S. N. Pendidikan (ed.)).

[15] Gunantar, D. A. (2017). TEXTBOOKS ANALYSIS: ANALYZING ENGLISH AS A FOREIGN LANGUAGE (EFL) TEXTBOOKS FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF INDONESIAN CULTURE. *LANGUAGE CIRCLE, 11(2)*, 173–182.

[16] Rohmatillah, & Pratama, D. A. (2017). *An Analysis of Textbook Entitled "Pathway to English" Published By Erlangga at the First Semester of the 11 th Grade of Senior High School*. *10(2)*, 326–343.

[17] Lisa, M. (2018). An Analysis of Writing Material in English Textbook "When English Rings the Bell" for Eighth Grade. *Retain, 06(01)*, 78–86.

[18] Gay, Mills, G., & Airasian, P. (2011). *Educational Research Competencies For Analysis And Applications*. Pearson