

Implementation of Green Open Space Policy in the Utilization of Public Space in City of Medan

Tunggul Sihombing^{1*}, Deddy Hutapea²

^{1,2} Public Administration Studies Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sumatera Utara

*Email: tunggul@usu.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The existence of Green Open Space (GOS) in Medan City has a number of challenges, such as availability, distribution, and other supporting infrastructure. In addition, green open space policies in Indonesia, including the city of Medan, must refer to Law Number 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning, in which one of the laws and regulations mandates local governments to allocate at least 30 percent of their area as green open spaces. The researchers used a qualitative descriptive study to see how the Medan City Government implemented the green open space policy. Through this approach, researchers collect data, applicable regulations, and conduct interviews with relevant agencies and the public regarding the availability of green open spaces in the city of Medan. The related agency in this research is the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service as the implementer of the green open space policy in the city of Medan. The implementation model used is the Mazmanian and Sabatier theory which consists of three indicators, namely 1) Characteristics of Problems in Policy; 2) Policy Characteristics; and 3) Environmental Relations to Policy.

Keywords: *green open space, policy implementation, land use*

1. INTRODUCTION

The city is an area that has developed into a center of civilization and community activities in fulfilled their needs. Literally, the basic human needs consist of 3 (three) namely the need for clothing, housing and food. However, over time, the needs of urban communities are increasingly complex. Along with the times and the massive development in fulfilled the community needs, the city area is getting denser. The density of big cities is also caused by residential areas, economic activities, and government centers in the area. The impact of massive development caused the natural oxygen-producing elements of the city are reduced, so that people are more sensitive and easily emotional. (Munir, Menjawab Kebutuhan Masyarakat Perkotaan Masa Kini, <https://www.medcom.id/nasional/metro/0k8jO-5oN-menjawab-kebutuhan-masyarakat-perkotaan-masa-kini>, accessed on Monday, July 5th 2021 at 18.28 WIB).

Green open space is a means used to reduce the stress burden of society, especially in urban areas. Jennings, Browning, and Rigolon (2019:1), explain that open space in urban areas functions as an ecosystem facility that aims to maintain human health and the shape of the city. Actually, open space is just one type of public space. However, public open space is not necessarily able

to meet the needs of clean air for urban communities. Thus, the function of green open space is to produce clean air for urban communities.

Then, green open space serves to provide clean air that urban communities need. Therefore, the existence of green open space is one aspect of urban development, especially to meet the elements of urban environmental sustainability. Green open space also plays a role as a rainwater catcher, provides clean water, a place for root recreation, and improves the aesthetics of the city as stated by Austin (2014:5). Green open space in urban areas has different standards. According to Government Law no. 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning, the government makes a scenario for the development of green open spaces and the division of responsibilities, where 30 percent of the city area must be green open space consisting of 20 percent by the public (built and managed by the government), local government) and 10 percent by the private sector (built and managed by the private sector and the community).

The government must develop green open spaces by taking into account a number of aspects, such as needs based on population based on oxygen demand, as well as the appropriate distribution of green open spaces for each region. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Public Works Number 05/PRT/M/2008 concerning Guidelines for Provision and Utilization of Green Open Spaces in Urban Areas, the standard for the utilization of urban areas that must be used as green open spaces is 30 percent of the city area. In addition, the configuration of green open spaces must be accompanied by the fulfillment of indicators that have been regulated, namely physical-ecological, such as species and germplasm enrichment, economic values, namely productive/financial values and balancing values for environmental health, and socio-cultural functions, including education, cultural values, and psychological. The regulation requires cities with a minimum population of 480,000 people to have green open spaces in the form of urban forests with an area of 4 m²/resident. It aims as a city pollutant suction which is mostly caused by the use of motorized vehicles, industrial activities, household activities, etc.

The state of green open space in the city of Medan still does not meet the applicable regulations. Based on research conducted by Silalahi and Harianja (2014: 227), explained that the area of green open space in the city of Medan in 2014 still reached 8.46 km², or only 10.6 percent of the ideal area based on the city area which reached 79.53 km², with an area of urban forest managed by the Medan City Government of 12,219 m². In the context of providing clean air, the government can build green open spaces that have facilities and the concept of an urban forest. Meanwhile, if using the recommendations of the World Health Organization (WHO) in the research of Maryanti, Khadijah, Uzair, and Ghazali (2016:370), every citizen needs at least 9 m² of green open space. Thus, in the context of the population of Medan City in 2020 which amounted to 2,524,321 people, the Medan City Government must at least allocate an area of 22.7 km² of the total area of Medan City which reaches 265.1 km². Based on the findings above, the author makes a research on the Implementation of Green Open Space Policy in the Utilization of Public Space in City of Medan.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Public Policy

Public policy is a concrete instrument held by the state in realizing the goals of the state which leads to meeting the needs of the community. Public policies are made to answer public problems that the government chooses to do or not to do. Thus, the policies taken by the government in a country/region greatly affect the quality

of life of its people. The definition of public policy according to Srivastava in Farazmand (2018:598), is described as the overall framework of actions taken and carried out by the government to achieve public goals.

2.2 Implementation of Public Policy

The implementation is one of the most important aspects of public policy. Seraw and Lu (2020:113), stated that the public policy implementation is the way in which the government provides institutional resources to implement programs or processes under certain institutions with reference to the budget to be spent, the laws that must be enforced, the employees to be hired, and action plans to be made. Public policy implementation is determined through the characteristics of the problem, the behavior of the implementing bureaucracy, and the behavior influenced by the environment. According to Mazmanian and Sabatier in Wahab (2004:68), the implementation of public policy is defined as the implementation of policy decisions in the form of laws, but also in the form of executive decision orders or legal decisions.

2.3 Mazmanian and Sabatier Public Policy Implementation Model

Public policy implementation can be reviewed through models and theories. Mazmanian and Sabatier in Nugroho (2014: 220), state that policy implementation can be seen through the implementation of basic policy decisions, set forth in the articles of association but can also be in the form of executive orders or court decisions. The decision identifies the problem to be addressed, establishes targeted policy objectives, and in some way "structures" the implementation process.

Mazmanian and Sabatier in Subarsono (2010:94), state that the public policy implementation model has three groups of variables related to successful implementation, including.

- a. Tractability of the problems. This character according to Mazmanian and Sabatier in Mubarak, Zauhar, Setyowati, and Suryadi (2020:35), refers to the level of technical difficulty in achieving or not achieving the objectives of a policy will depend on a number of technical requirements, the diversity of regulated behavior, and the level or scope of behavior change. desired, i.e. the greater the number of behavioral changes expected by the policy.
- b. Ability status to implement structure. This intention, according to Mazmanian and Sabatier in Mubarak, Zauhar, Setyowati, and Suryadi (2020), refers to the authority of the implementor in preparing the implementation process appropriately with a number

of steps, such as accuracy and alignment of the goals to be achieved. , causality theory to explain the goals to be achieved. through policy implementation, proper allocation of financial resources, hierarchies within and between implementing agencies, decision-making rules taken by implementing agencies, formal access from outside parties, and variables outside the law that affected the implementation.

- c. Ability of bureaucracy structure to implementation. This intention, according to Mazmanian and Sabatier in Mubarak, Zauhar, Setyowati, and Suryadi (2020), refers to the authority of the implementor in preparing the implementation process appropriately with a number of measures, such as accuracy and alignment of goals to be achieved, causality theory to explain the goals to be achieved. through policy implementation, appropriate allocation of financial resources, hierarchies within and between implementing agencies or institutions, decision-making rules from implementing agencies, official employees, formal access from outside parties, and variables outside the law that affect implementation.
- d. External variables that affect implementation. Subarsono (2010: 98), explains that there are several characteristics that influence policy implementation, such as social, economic, technological conditions, public support, constituent group attitudes, level of bureaucratic commitment, and skills of the implementing apparatus.

2.4 Green Open Space Concept

The policy of green open spaces developed through the concept of limited urban open space. Adler and Tanner (2013: 256), described the existence of green open spaces that affect the city's ecosystem are to maintain people's health, physically, mentally, and so on. Gallion (1994:38), said there are few type of green open spaces, including space for playground for children, or space to accommodate public activities generally. Urban green open spaces can be form of green lines, zoos, city parks, and botanical gardens. The goal of green open spaces are to restore the natural environment of the city. According to Sugandi (2007:104), the actors of green open space management includes:

1. Government;
2. Private sectors, (such like corporation that manages private green open space);
3. General public; and
4. Media, forming public opinion and monitoring.

The area of GOS must be met with city regulation. In the context of Indonesia, including Medan City, the regulation of green open spaces are regulated in

Law No. 26 of 2007 about Spatial Planning, which is at least 30 percents of the city area with a proportion of 20 percents public (government) and 10 percents private (private/individual). Then, by the Regulation of the Minister of Public Works No. 05/PRT/M of 2008 concerning Provision and Utilization of Green Open Spaces in Urban Areas Guidelines, the GOS has some main functions or intrinsic/ecological functions and addition functions (extrinsic), they are:

1. Main functions (intrinsic), namely the ecological function:
 - a. Urban city lungs;
 - b. Regulate city's microclimate;
 - c. City shader;
 - d. Produce oxygen;
 - e. Rainwater absorber;
 - f. Animal habitat provider;
 - g. Absorbs pollutants from the air, water and soil; and
 - h. Windbreaker.
2. Additional functions (extrinsic), which is as follows:
 - a. Social and cultural functions, as a place for public to express, including for communication space, rec-reational place, education place, etc;
 - b. The function of the economy as a place for urban agriculture that can be a source of community income;
 - c. Aesthetical functions, as factor to increase the comfort of the city, beautify urban environment;
 - d. Increase creativity and productivity of citizens, creating a balanced atmosphere between urban and residential areas.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

This research use descriptive qualitative approach. This research method allows the authors to describe the phenomena studied systematically, factually, and accurately, both in the context of the relationship between the phenomena and the theory used. Then, the authors collected data through direct observation and interviews, where the results of the research were analyzed using an inductive approach through a meaning approach and not generalization as stated by Sugiyono (2015:9).

This research is located at the Sanitation and Parks Service as the implementer of green open space policies in Medan City. Besides, the researchers also interviewed the people of Medan as the object of policy and the North Sumatera Wahana Lingkungan Hidup (Walhi) as environment concerned NGO in Medan.

The data collection technique used in this study is the author uses the interview method in collecting data. Bungin (2015: 134), explains that the interview method is a process of obtaining information and data needed by

research through direct question and answer between interviewers and respondents, either with or without using guidelines. This study uses the method of observation. According to Suprpto (2013: 82), the observation method is the collection and observation of data directly on the object of research in the field as well as recording phenomena that occur in the field. So, before making observations, the author prepares guidelines first.

The author collects data through the documentation method. This method is one of the ways commonly used in qualitative research to get a complete picture through documents or explanations from the relevant sources.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The stage of implementation of public policy is an important stage and can determine the success of a policy made by the government. The process of implementing a policy can be said to be successful if it meets the variables of public policy implementation proposed by Mazmanian and Sabatier. In the policy implementation stage, the function of these variables is very important in measuring the success or failure of a policy.

The researcher discuss by using the Mazmanian and Sabatier's policy implementation model, which this model explains carries out basic policy decisions, incorporated in the articles of association, but can also take the form of executive orders and important court decisions. Public implementation policies can assumed ideal if the implementators fulfill several things, namely decisions to identify problems to be faced, set goals to be pursued, and in various ways structuring the implementation process.

Public policy implementation can be studied with 3 (three) groups of variables related to policy implementation, they are problem characteristics, policy characteristics and environmental variables. The three variables will be described as follows:

4.1 Problem Characteristics of Green Open Space in Medan

Medan Sanitation and Parks Service faced some challenges in develop green open space by number and area. The challenges could be seen by four characteristic aspects of the problems contained in the Mazmanian and Sabatier policy implementation model, including:

a. Valid Technical Theory and Technology Availability

The valid technical theory and technology availability is the fundament thing in implement a policy. In implementing the Green Open Space policy, the Medan Sanitation and Parks Office implements the technical green open space policy

based on Law no. 26 of 2007 concerning Green Open Space. Technically, the law mandates that local governments use 30 percent of the area to be used as green open space, with 20 percent managed by the government and 10 percent by the private sector, as written in in Article 17 paragraph 5. The allotment of land used as green open space then mandated in the Regency/City Spatial Planning and Strategic Area Plan.

b. Target Group Behavior Diversity

The behavioral diversity of the target group refers to the types of groups that are affected by a policy. According to this variable, the policy of implementing the green open space policy in the city of Medan has not fulfilled yet. The diversity of the needs of the people of Medan who visit green open spaces, such as cleanliness, parking spaces, and WiFi facilities are not available, causing this category to be unfulfilled.

c. Target Groups Proportion to Population

The target group to the all population proportion is the number of parties affected by the entire existing population. The relationship between the need for green open spaces and the proportion of the target group has not been fully met. This is due to the limited land that can be used by the Medan City Government as a green open spaces.

d. Level of Behavior Shifts

The level of behavior shifting is a measure of the expected impact of a policy. The expected shift from the presence of green open space is to increase public participation to visit green open space in Medan. The expected level of behavior shift from the green open space policy by the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service cannot be fulfilled caused the Medan Green Open Space facilities are not fulfilled with the modern society needs such as Wi-Fi networks.

4.2 Medan Green Open Space Policy Characteristics

Mazmanian and Sabatier describes the policy implementation can be seen through seven categories, including:

a. Clear and Consistent Goals

The clear and consistent goals is the process that is expected from the implementation in accordance with the policy foundation in the policy rules. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Public Works No. 05/PRT/2008 about Guidelines of Provision and Utilization of Green Open Space in Urban Areas, green open space has a main function (intrinsic/ecological function), namely to provide guarantees for the funding of green open space to be part of the air circulation system (lung). urban lungs), microclimate regulator,

shade, oxygen producer, rainwater absorber, animal habitat provider, air, water, and soil pollutant absorber, and windbreaker. Besides, green open space has additional functions (extrinsic), namely social and cultural functions, economic functions and aesthetic functions. This category has not been fulfilled yet. This is due to inconsistencies in the determination of green open space development zones such as in the Polonia area as stipulated in the Medan City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2015 about Spatial Planning and Medan City Zoning Regulation Details 2015-2035 which has now been converted into business area (Central Business District/CBD) by Medan Spatial Plan 2030 document. In fact, Medan City's green open space managed by the government has not yet reached 20 percent.

b. Adequate Causal Theory

Adequate causal theory refers to the causes and effects that occur in implementing a public policy. Referring to the main function of green open space as stipulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Public Works No. 05/PRT/M of 2008 concerning Guidelines for Provision and Utilization of Green Open Space in Urban Areas, urban green open space has a main function, namely, to guarantee the provision of green open space to be part of the air circulation system (city lungs), microclimate regulator so that the circulation system Air and water can naturally run smoothly, as shade, producer of oxygen, absorber of rainwater, provider of animal habitat, absorbent of air, water, and soil pollutants, and windbreaker. Besides, the city's green open space also has additional functions such as an economic function and an aesthetic function. Thus, the existence of green open space in urban areas is an important requirement for the city. If the existence of green open space cannot meet the needs of the city, then the main functions and additional functions contained in green open space cannot be fulfilled. So, by not fulfilling the number of green open spaces in accordance with applicable regulations, the resistance of the city of Medan to ecological disturbances is not optimal. Thus, the category of establishing a causal theory that is sufficient for the green open space policy in the city of Medan is fulfilled.

c. Finance Resources

Financial resources are the financial basis for implementing a policy. The government's maintained green open space in city of Medan, they uses regional finance to implement programs and policies. The financial resources referred to refer to the Regional Budget and Revenue (APBD) proposed by the Medan City Sanitation and Parks Service for the implementation of the green open space policy every year..

d. Integrated Support for Implementing Institutions

Integrated support for implementing institutions is collaboration between agencies in

implementing a policy. In implementing the green open space policy in the city of Medan, the Medan City Sanitation and Park Service carries out the major's order which functions as a regulator and directs the ranks of the Regional Work Units (SKPD) so that there is no overlapping of functions and authorities. The category of integrated support for implementing institutions on green open space policies in the city of Medan has been fulfilled. This is due to the existence of written rules on policies relating to green open space that are implemented by involving other institutions based on the decision of the major together with the SKPDs and stated in every agreed regulation and decision.

e. Clarity and Consistency of Existing Rules in Implementing Institutions

The clarity and consistency of the rules contained in the implementing agency can be seen from the regulations that bind a policy. The linkage between regulations on the green open space policy in the city of Medan carried out by the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service is not fulfilled. This is due to the inconsistency of derivative regulations contained in the implementation of the Medan City green space policy such as Kepwali No. 35 of 2013 about the Provision of Green Open Space in Every Building Persil in Medan City as the solution for adding green open space which is not in accordance with central regulations, in this case Law no. 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning regarding the use of 30 percent of the city's land area to be used as green open space.

f. Level of Apparatus Commitment to Policy Objectives

The level of commitment of the apparatus to the policy objectives is a measure that can show the consistent efforts of the implementor in implementing the policy. The commitment of the implementers of the green open space policy in the city of Medan can be seen through the Regional Regulation and the Mayor Decision which regulates the green open space policy in the city of Medan and the availability of the budget to finance programs/activities in the green open space policy. The level of commitment of the apparatus to the policy objectives in implementing the green space policy has been achieved through coordination meetings and performance evaluations between the heads of offices and the mayor which were held to see how far the program has achieved with the program budget that has been budgeted in 1 (one) year.

g. Access of Outside Groups to Participate in Policy Implementation

Context External group access is the participation of groups outside the government to participate in implementing policies. The government involves community groups in implementing several

policies, such as in Kepwali No. 35 of 2013 concerning the Provision of Green Open Spaces in Every Building Persil in Medan City, requires the building owners to allocate a number of private lands as green open space or roof gardens for the requirements for submitting a Building Permit (SIMB).

5. **Environmental Linkage to the Implementation of Green Open Space Policy in Medan**

The relationship between the environment and the green open space policy in Medan according to the theory of Mazmanian and Sabatier policy implementation can be reviewed through six aspects, including:

a. **Socio-Economic and Technological Conditions**

Socio-economic and technology conditions are used to see the situation of the affected community in terms of socio-economic and technological. The social condition of the people of Medan, similar to the condition of metropolitan cities community which relatively increase due urbanization. Meanwhile, the economic activities of the people of Medan City are dominated by private sector workers and self-employed jobs. This shows that the people of Medan City have a limited working time and need a comfortable public space for recreation. So, green open space must be a means for the community to relax cheaply, easily and can provide a sense of comfort for the community by providing services that are in accordance with the times, such as WiFi networks, entertainment services such as amphitheatres, and integrated transportation systems that facilitate public access.

b. **Media Supports to the Policy**

Media support to the policies related to publication and counseling assistance carried out with basic support and media objectivity in policy coverage carried out by the government. The government includes the media in publishing the green open space socialization policy carried out by the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service.

c. **Society Supports to the Policy**

Society supports to the policy is related to the efforts that the community has taken to support the green open space policy in Medan City. The support of the people of Medan for the green open space policy is still quite minimal. Support given to several community groups to the Medan Sanitation and Park Service through CSR assistance provided. Meanwhile, there are still many conditions of green open space that

are not so good due to people who do not take care of the cleanliness and beauty of the park.

d. **Constituent Group Attitudes and Resources**

Constituent group attitudes and resources relate to statements of parties operating in the same field as controls in a policy. The Wahana Lingkungan Hidup (Walhi) as a community group in the city of Medan which is engaged in the environment, considers that the condition of green open space in the city of Medan is still far from feasible. Walhi also gave advice to the Medan City Sanitation and Parks Service in several hearings between the community and the Medan City Government in terms of solving land problems to be used as green open space.

e. **Supports from the Authorities**

Support from the authorities is an effort to facilitate the implementation of policies through the power that exists in the rulers. The land procurement for green open space development is faced by the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service through an alternative policy taken by the Mayor of Medan by issuing a policy on the procurement of roof gardens and the use of private land to be used as green open space through Kepwali Number 35 of 2013 as a condition for applying for SIMB.

f. **Commitment and Skills of Implementer Officials in Policy Implementations**

Commitment and skills of implementing officials in implementing government policies is one of the vital aspect. The commitment and skills referred to in the implementation of green open space in the city of Medan are still limited because decisions on policies are agreed on a top-down basis. That is, the highest leadership gives orders and instructions for implementing policies to be carried out by his subordinates. This makes the skills of the Medan Sanitation and Park Service in implementing the green open space policy to be limited.

5. CONCLUSIONS

According to discussion above, it can be concluded that the key to implementing the green open space policy in the utilization of public space in the city of Medan has not been maximized. This is because there are still several indicators from the theory of implementing Mazmanian and Sabatier policies that have not been fulfilled, such as the technical rule of 30 percent green open space in the city area that has not been achieved, insufficient green open space visitor comfort facilities,

the proportion of green open space with a population that has not been met, etc.

But on the other hand, there have been several theoretical indicators that have been met, such as integrated support between implementing institutions,

the commitment of the apparatus to policies in implementing green open space policies through performance evaluations every year, the Medan Sanitation and Parks Service to provide public access in building private green open spaces, etc.

REFERENCES

- [1] Adler, F.R. & Tanner, C.J. 2013. *Urban Ecosystems: Ecological Principles for the Built Environment*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- [2] Austin, G. 2014. *Green Infrastructure for Landscape Planning: Integrating Human and Natural Systems*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- [3] Bungin, M.B. 2015. *Metode Penelitian Sosial & Ekonomi : Format-format Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif untuk Studi Sosiologi, Kebijakan Publik, Komunikasi, Manajemen, dan Pemasaran*. Jakarta : Prenanda Group.
- [4] Gallion A. 1994. *Pengantar Perancangan Kota*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- [5] Jennings, V., Browning, M., & Rigolon, A. 2019. *Urban Green Spaces Public Health and Sustainability in the United States*. Cham: Springer Publisher.
- [6] Maryanti, M., Khadijah, H., Uzair, M., & Ghazali, M. 2016. *The Urban Green Space Provision Using the Standards Approach: Issues and Challenges of its Implementation in Malaysia*. *WIT Transactions on Ecology and The Environment*. Vol. 210, Pp. 369-379. DOI: 10.2495/SDP160311.
- [7] Mubarok, S., Zauhar, S., Setyowati, E., & Suryadi. 2020. *Policy Implementation Analysis: Exploration of George Edward III, Marilee S Grindle, and Mazmanian and Sabatier Theories in the Policy Analysis Triangle Framework*. *Journal of Public Administration Studies*, Vol. 5, No. 1, Pp. 33-38. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21776/ub.jpas.2020.005.01.7>.
- [8] Munir, M. 2017. *Menjawab Kebutuhan Masyarakat Perkotaan Masa Kini*. (<https://www.medcom.id/nasional/metro/0k8j> O5oN-menjawab-kebutuhan-masyarakat-perkotaan-masa-kini). Diakses pada Senin, 5 Juli 2021 Pukul 18.28 WIB.
- [9] Nugroho, R. 2014. *Kebijakan Publik di Negara-negara Berkembang*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [10] Seraw, W. & Lu, X. 2020. *Review on Concepts and Theoretical Approaches of Policy Implementation*. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research*, Vol. 4, Issue 11, Pp. 113-118. ISSN: 2643-9670.
- [11] Silalahi, J. & Harianja, A. 2014. *Analisis Kebutuhan Ruang Terbuka Hijau di Kota Medan*. *Prosiding Eskpose Hasil Penelitian Tahun 2014*. ISBN: 978-602-19559-7-0.
- [12] Subarsono, A. 2010. *Analisis Kebijakan Publik Konsep, Teori dan Aplikasi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [13] Sugandhi, A. dan Hakim, R., 2007. *Prinsip Dasar Kebijakan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan Berwawasan Lingkungan*. Jakarta : Bumi Aksara.
- [14] Sugiyono, 2015, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*, Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [15] Suprpto. 2013. *Metodologi Penelitian Ilmu Pendidikan dan Ilmu-ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial*. Yogyakarta: CAPS.
- [16] Srivastava, A. & Farazmand, A. (ed.) (2018). *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*. Cham: Springer Publisher.
- [17] Wahab, A. 2004. *Analisis Kebijakan dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijaksanaan Negara*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- [18] Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum Nomor 05/PRT/M/2008 tentang Pedoman Penyediaan dan Pemanfaatan Ruang Terbuka Hijau di Kawasan Perkotaan.
- [19] Undang-Undang No. 26 Tahun 2007 tentang Penataan Ruang.