The Islamic Iconoclasm in Indonesia, Dialectics of Islamic Moderation with Local Culture

Alfan Firmanto1,*, Ahmad Yunani2

1,2National Research and Innovation Agency, Indonesia
*Corresponding author. Email: alfanfirmanto@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Islamic law (fiqh) agreed that the Prophet should not be depicted in human form. It is believed to maintain the sanctity and prevent it from excessive cult to him, as it did in the tradition of Christian; Jesus (Prophet Isa). In addition, the depiction of living creatures such as human and animal figures, in the form of sculptures, paintings, or photographs, was believed as a forbidden, by some verses of the Qur'an and hadith the prophet Muhammad. Ban the depiction of living creatures known as Iconoclasm, though it is first in the Christian tradition. However, in the Islamic tradition, iconoclasm still exists and is maintained until today. Muslim artists accept the ban wisely and creatively to create works of art that contain a high aesthetic value, such as mosque architecture, decorative ornaments symmetrical, and Arabic calligraphy, which decorate various cultural objects. Many cultural objects are found in the Muslim community, especially in Indonesia, which is a real form of human and other living creatures. This paper explains the diversity of understanding of Muslims in Indonesia and elaborates the flexibility of Muslims to understand and reflect the doctrine.

Keywords: Islamic iconoclasm, Islam Nusantara, Moderate Islam.

1. INTRODUCTION

As the religion most widely embraced by the Indonesian people, Islam has spread to almost all corners of the country and has colored various cultures that have lived before. Many cultures live in the nuances of Islam as their soul. Every local culture that meets Islamic teachings seems to have its uniqueness. The openness of Islam to cultural elements that do not conflict with its spirit (substance) has allowed them to spread, even develop into a new color, with Islam as its primary color. Cultural diversity in spiritual unity is a hallmark of the culture that Islam has lived. Diversity in this unity is a source of cultural strength for nations that have encountered Islam throughout history.

However, the process of acculturation and creativity that manifests in these artifacts does not run. In Islamic law (fiqh), it is known as a law that prohibits (forbids) the depiction of living things (anthropomorphic) both in two-dimensional form (paintings, carvings, relief) as well as in three-dimensional form (sculptures/figures). The idea of prohibition is known as iconoclasm. Historically iconoclasm grew through a long time. The combination of two different cultures is reflected in attitudes, views of life and behavior. Then there is a synergy that displays the exotica of Indonesian culture with Islamic nuances throughout the archipelago. Its form can be seen in the form of mosque architectural artworks, traditional art, beautiful writing or Al-Qur'an calligraphy, performing arts, and others. These works are evidence of the greatness of Islam in carrying out dialectics with the traditional culture of the Indonesian nation.

The fact that Indonesian art develops with an Islamic spirit is the emergence of cultural objects that depict living creatures. In the artifacts of cultural arts products, several pictures of living creatures were found. Artists or art product makers seem to ignore the postulates of iconoclasm in Islam to accommodate the existence of these art objects. This fact is considered interesting to be an object of study, so the question in this paper is, what is the concept of iconoclasm in Islam? What cultural objects are included in the category of Islamic iconoclasm? How can Islamic teachings (iconoclasm) in Indonesia be accepted with Indonesian cultural objects?

The study in this paper will be limited to art objects that contain Islamic religious elements. This study will also be limited to art objects related to the description of living things, both realist and stylized,
by the iconoclasm theory, which will be used as the basis for this research. There are not many studies on iconoclasm in Islam as far as the author's knowledge, one of which has made it is Hasan Muarif Ambary. Still, it is only one chapter in his book Finding Civilization. Iconoclasm has also been discussed in the Paramadina Jakarta Religious Studies Club titled "Iconoclasm in Islam and the Expression of Calligraphy and Arabic Arts". Studies on iconoclasm in Islam generally concentrate more on calligraphy and arabesque, as in the two writings. In contrast, those who specifically study illustrations on Islamic art objects and manuscripts are suspected of not doing so.

This study will observe art objects as part of material culture, so this study aims to (1) reveal past cultural products through art objects; (2) Disclosing the function and value of the heritage of cultural objects to the receiving community, both in the past and present.

Under the study’s title, the concepts to discuss the problem are iconoclasm and aesthetics in Islamic art. In general, iconoclasticism means destroying statues, paintings, monuments, or symbols (icons), either for theological or political reasons. Derived from the word "icon" which means image. The word icon in a general sense, is usually used to describe images made on wood. The image will represent the image of God, Gods, angels, other holy people. The images presented are not the first real pictures that are detailed and beautiful according to the criteria of pure art, but rather express symbolic meanings. Therefore, the icons in this framework have a function to believe in the teachings of the faith. Icons come from Greek [1].

2. ICONOCLASM IN ISLAM

2.1 About Iconoclasm

Iconoclasm is a movement to remove images and statues from the worship of a religion (KBBI). In English, the act or activity is called "iconoclasticism". In general, iconoclasticism means destroying statues, paintings, monuments, or symbols (icons), either for theological or political reasons. The perpetrators of acts of vandalism or commonly called "iconoclasts" generally depart from a literal understanding of religious teachings that statues, paintings, monuments, and art objects are "idols" that can make believers into polytheists [2].

Iconoclasm is a movement to destroy images or icons. This movement opposes the use of images used as a means of worship. In the Christian tradition, iconoclasm views icons as a means of teaching faith rather than worship. As for the defense of the use of icons, it is possible to present Christ and the saints as a logical consequence of the incarnation in worship.

The background of Greek culture, which is famous for its mythology, such as respect for statues of gods and goddesses, seems to influence a form of appreciation of faith among the Church. This idea was developed and adopted by the Church because it was seen as something relevant and contextual to describe God in the form of humanity. The statue or image is made to represent Christ and the saints. Therefore, this honor was accepted and became a common devotion in the Church.

In the Christian tradition, icons are a means for human believers to recognize and represent the presence of the Divine into the human sensory environment. Icons are seen as an easy and effective means of experiencing Christ as God in human form. St. Theodorus said that the invisible Word of God came from an invisible Father, that word appeared and became apparent when Jesus came into the world.

This theological element is opposed by supporters of iconoclasm who think that it is impossible to represent Christ as God in a human figure, God is greater than the image that humans can give. It is impossible to reduce God who is omnipotent. The biblical basis for the attack is from the Scriptures, "No man has seen God" (1 John 4:12).

The belief in iconoclasticism that emerges in the Christian tradition is suspected of stemming from a literal understanding of the second commandment of the great "Ten Commandments", namely the commandment that forbids Christians from making or worshiping sculptures or statues. The iconoclastic movement was influential during the reign of Leo III (680-741), Roman Emperor in Byzantium. At this time, the Emperor ordered the destruction of all paintings, statues, and objects of art that were thought to lead Christians to polytheism. iconoclasm made its move between 726-843. The background of the emergence of this movement was triggered by the increasingly widespread and widespread respect for icons, so it seemed excessive. Thus, a conflict arose between the iconoclasts and the iconodules. Iconoclasts consist of the Emperor and dignitaries, some from the secular clergy and residents of Asia minor regions. Iconodule: the group that maintains the icon, namely the worshipers of excessive icon images, especially the monks, residents, and some theologians [1].

During the time of the Emperor Leo III (680-741), especially in 726, an edict was issued prohibiting the veneration of statues so that the highly revered icon of Christ was destroyed. This action led to riots in
Constantinople and rebellions in the Greek provinces. In 730 Leo III issued an order requiring the destruction of the statues. At that time, iconoclasm was legalized. The statues were removed from the Church. Many reverends were stifled, banished, and killed. In 754, at the Emperor's initiative of Constantinople V, the Synod of Constantinople was held. The veneration of statues was declared a form of idol worship until honoring the saints and honoring the mother of God was prohibited at that time. This period is the peak of inhibiting the respect of icons and the peak of glory for iconoclasm.

2.2 Islam and Iconoclasm

In Islam, statues as icons, are often identified with idols as objects in the form of living beings or objects that are revered, worshiped, worshiped, and made by human hands.

Etymologically the word idol in the Big Indonesian Dictionary [3], as a noun meaning an image of a god. The word idol then expands to creatures/objects (sun, moon, angels, animals). Anything that is worshiped other than Allah's commandments is included in the category of idols. While the verb to idolize means to worship and deify, it can also be used as a verb which means not always worship, such as the sentence "this is God who must be worshiped". It doesn't mean you have to prostrate before him. The word idolizing also extends to a person's liking for something, beyond his liking for Allah. For example, you are more afraid of someone/thing than you are afraid of Allah, or you love someone/thing more than your love for Allah.

The word “idol” in the Qur'an is used to mean three different terms, namely al-asnam, al-ausan and al-ansab. Each of these words has a different meaning according to the context in which it is used. For example, Aasnam is everything made of wood, stone, gold, silver, copper, and all kinds of materials originating from the clay, which has a shape resembling living things such as humans, animals, and plants and has a large body shape. In addition, al-ausnam undergoes an expansion of meaning which is used to show the majazi meaning of idols [4].

Aaswan from the raw material of the maker is the same as al-asnam, but this word is more general than al-asnam, because it can be in the form of anything that is form and formless, both small and large. So, the word al-asnam can be put into the category of al-aaswan. Ansab is a stone that does not have a particular shape used for slaughtering animals that will be offered (altars) to idols. Al-ansab is also used for the type of stone that is not formed, which is worshiped if it is not able to make al-asnam [5]. This word in the Qur'an is found in Surah Al-Maidah verse 90.

Iconoclasm in Islam also originates from the traditions of the Prophet Muhammad, which are not allowed to depict the figures of living beings, nor are they allowed to depict the appearance of the Prophet Muhammad, as a result, many people think that Islam does not support fine arts. Hadith is one of the references regarding the sunnah (tradition) or behavior of the Prophet Muhammad, which mentions the prohibition of painting animals, making statues, taking pictures, and others. As a result, we hardly see any Islamic art, apart from Arabic calligraphy and mosque architecture.

One of them is a hadith authenticated by Imam Bukhari narrated by Aisha, the wife of the Prophet Muhammad saw.

"It was narrated from Aisyah that she bought a small pillow for a backrest with pictures on it. When the Messenger of Allah sallallahu 'alayhi wa sallam saw him standing at the door not wanting to enter, he saw that there was a sign of hatred in the face of the Messenger of Allah from Ayeshya and said: I repent to Allah and His Messenger, what is the sin that I have committed? The Prophet replied: How about the pillow? Aisha replied, "I bought it so that you sit and lean on it," said the Messenger of Allah "Indeed, the person who made this picture will be punished on the Day of Resurrection while it is said to them: turn on the pictures that you make. Truly the house that has this picture in it is not entered by the Angels." (Bukhari Muslim).

In this hadith the translator (H Zainuddin Hamidy et al, Translation of Sahih Bukhari Hadith Volume IV, Jakarta, 1982) defines shurrah as 'animal image', but it is often interpreted more generally, as 'image' only. The reason is, the hadith registrar did not specify in detail what pictures were on Aisyah's pillow. Some hadiths do not include an essential element in the form of a description of the image in question. As for shurra in modern Arabic it seems to have a broad meaning, so it includes sculpture and photography. This term is equivalent to the English image, which one of the meanings is 'imitation of the external form of an object, for example, an object of worship. (see paperback edition : The Pocket Oxford Dictionary, 1984).

In another hadith narrated by Ibn Abbas: The Messenger of Allah said: "Whoever hears the sound of a trumpet, enters the church, sees an image, then say “Iaa ilaaha illallah wa laa na'budu illallah..." [6] The Messenger of Allah commanded Ali ibn Abi Talib and said: "Don't you leave the statues before
you destroy them and don't leave the graves piled high before you flatten them.” (Bukhari Muslim). The Prophet Muhammad saw said: "The person who will be most severely tormented on the Day of Resurrection is the one who imitates Allah in creating creatures (painters, painters are imitators of Allah in creating his creatures).” (Bukhari Muslim). The Prophet Muhammad saw also mentioned: "The Prophet sallallahu 'alayhi wa sallam said: 'The Prophet sallallahu 'alayhi wa sallam said: ‘Amr bin Luhay of Ma’arib (Moab) a regional town in Balqa’. According to the story of Ibn Hisham, "one of the most knowledgeable people told me that the first person to bring idols to Mecca was ‘Amr bin Luhay”. Next, Latta‘, an idol made of chiseled stone, was built on a house. Latta‘ was a pious man who used to stir flour to feed the pilgrims. When he died, the people built a house over his grave and covered it with curtains. The Saqif worship this idol in Ta‘if.

Uzza, the idol in the valley of Nakhlah, is located between Mecca and Ta‘if. Around it are buildings, and curtains. This idol also has a servant/guard. Uzza is an idol belonging to the tribe of Quraysh, Sulaim; Gathafan and Jusyam and the surrounding tribes. Manaat, is an idol located near Mount Qudayd between Mecca and Medina. These idols belonged to the tribes of Khuzaymah, Aus, and Khazzraj. When they are on pilgrimage, they enter into ihram with him and worship him. These four idols are the names of pious people who lived at the prophet Abraham. After they died, some people made idols to honor these pious people excessively. They regard them as children of God. For the Arabs, these idols are not enough to offer prayers, give sacrifices, and offerings. Most of them have statues and idols in their homes.

3. ICONOCLASM PRACTICES IN ISLAM

Based on the verses of the Qur’an and Hadith, it has been understood by most Muslims; there is a prohibition for making sculptures or figures of living things. One of the important events of the practice of iconoclasm in Islamic history, is at the time of the liberation of the city of Mecca from the hands of the Arab infidels, as described in a hadith narrated by Abdullah Ibn Mas‘ud, and narrated by Imam Muslim in hadith number 3333, it is narrated that after the Muslims, led by the Prophet Muhammad, succeeded in conquering the city of Mecca, then he entered the city and...
Kaaba which contained three hundred and sixty idol statues, then the Prophet Muhammad knocked down and destroyed all the statues with his stick. This event can be considered as the practice of iconoclasm in Islam.

The practice of iconoclasm in Islam can be traced long before the Prophet Muhammad, during the time of the prophet Abraham. It is narrated in the Qur'an that the prophet Ibrahim destroyed the statues worshiped by his father and those around him, because of his actions he was then punished by being burned alive, but then God saved him.

With this incident, since then until now, almost no Muslim artist has dared to create works of art depicting living things such as humans and animals. However, the best impact of iconoclasm in Islam, then spread the art of Arabic calligraphy, which depicts the beauty of the holy verses of the Qur'an in various varieties and styles of writing. In subsequent developments, the artists transferred their artistic creative desires through building art with the mosque's architectural style, which was equipped with an imposing variety of decorations.

Figure 1: Examples of images of living things disguised in abstract form through calligraphy

Until now, most Muslims still believe that it is forbidden to draw, create, store, and sell images of living things such as humans and animals. In Saudi Arabia, a country that controls the two holy cities of Islam, namely Mecca and Medina, still strictly forbids it, as the evidence is almost certainly not going to find iconoclastic objects in the two holy cities. However, there are exceptions in the Riyal denomination, which is a photo of King Ibn Saud.

The practice of iconoclasm in Islam that has shaken the world in modern times is the tragedy of the destruction of an ancient Buddha statue in Bamiyan, Afghanistan, by the Taliban rulers in March 2001. The Buddha statue in Bamiyan is a Buddha statue that is one of the most important archaeological remains, located about 200 kilometers northwest Kabul, which is about 1800 years old. The statue is in the form of three statues of the Buddha figure with a height between 53 meters to 35 meters, made by carving a rock wall.

In the name of Islam, through a campaign to rid Afghanistan of all symbols deemed incompatible with Islam, the Taliban destroyed the statue using dynamite and anti-aircraft rockets. The international community condemned the act, including Unesco, which tried hard not to continue the action but failed, until finally the three statues had already been destroyed [7].

The practice of Islamic iconoclasm in Indonesia in the past has never been found, evidence of the absence of Islamic iconoclasm practice in Indonesia is the discovery of many statues and temples relic of Hinduism and Buddhism from the 7th century AD, if these objects are found in the damaged condition is not caused by human activities that intentionally damage it. Still, the damage is caused by nature, even in some places such as the tombs of Wali, mosques, and sultanate palaces whose kings have embraced Islam [8] [9]. At the Mantingan Mosque, Jepara, Central Java, a stone carving depicting a monkey animal figure as decoration on the walls, also at the door of the Great Mosque of Demak there is a symbol of a dragon figure called Lawang Bledeg, to a picture of a turtle as a sign of denial or the calendar year of its founding, the mosque [10] [11]. These things can be strong evidence that Islam in Indonesia is more tolerant and has never carried out iconoclasm acts.

Figure 2: The image of a dragon on "Lawang Bledeg" at the Great Mosque of Demak (up) and the carving of a monkey figure in the Mantingan Jepara mosque (down).
the bombing of the Borobudur temple on January 21, 1985, in Magelang, Central Java. The incident was terrorism with a "jihad" motive, by members of the terrorist group Komando Jihad. The explosion of a bomb that was quite powerful destroyed seven stupas in the temple, which was a legacy of the Syailendra dynasty [12]. The mastermind of this bombing incident is known to be Ibrahim alias Mohammad Jawad, alias Kresna. However, the figure of Mohamad Jawad, the mastermind of the Borobudur Temple blasting incident, has still not been found and has not been caught by the Indonesian police until now. Still, in some trials it was revealed that the motive for the blasting was not religious sentiment but more politically motivated, as an act of revenge against the government in the riot case. in Tanjung Priuk which killed many Muslims [13].

An example of an act of Iconoclasm, that is somewhat subtle and not radical, is the cutting of the head of a lion-shaped statue at the bottom of the pulpit of the Al-Wustho Mangkunegaran mosque in Surakarta. According to the acknowledgment of the mosque's management or takmir, the action was carried out based on the agreement of the ulema, which forbade statues in places of worship such as prayer rooms and mosques.

Figure 3. The lion figure with its head cut off at the podium of the Al-Wustha mosque, Pura Mangkunegaran Surakarta

When referring to the text of the Qur'an and the Prophet's Hadith, the prohibition of statues, or pictures of living creatures in Islam, stems from the historical fact of human belief, which seeks symbols of God through objects in the world. As in the story of the prophet Abraham, who sought God through the universe, by considering the stars, moon, and sun as gods, the difference is that Abraham was able to find God through the guidance of revelation. At the same time, primitive man was only guided by his limited mind. Islam, as a revealed religion seeks to guide humans to find their God correctly through revelations that were conveyed to the Prophets and Apostles.

Islam is known as a monotheistic religion, which adheres to the belief in one God, so all beliefs in many gods or polytheists are the "main enemies". One of the efforts to prevent humankind from believing in only one God is to strictly prohibit the worship or sacralization of certain objects. It is confirmed by a norm that reads "la ilaha illallah" which means that there can be no other god besides Allah SWT. The sentence of monotheism was then formulated in a proposition called the rule of fiqhiyah: “All forms of worship are prohibited (haram), unless there is evidence stating its permissibility”.

With this argument, Islam strives so that humans do not get lost in polytheistic understanding. It can be understood if most scholars, to be careful so that their people do not fall into belief in particular objects, strictly prohibit the existence of statues and anthropomorphic images. Unfortunately, this belief is often accompanied by radical actions that are intolerant of other religious beliefs with different views.

However, many scholars and Muslims interpret iconoclasm differently. One of them is Quraish Shihab, who interprets iconoclasm from the other side, stating that the fear of having statues or images of living creatures will lead to polytheism, is not found in the Qur'an, by quoting the Quranic verse in Surah Al-Anbiya (21 : 51-58), which describes the statues worshiped by the prophet Abraham's father and his people, who were ordered to be destroyed, while in the sura Saba (34; 12-13), which tells of the Prophet Solomon's Palace filled with statues of marble, glass, and copper as decorations in his palace, these statues were not worshiped but were placed as mere works of art, in Surah Ali Imran (3; 48-49), about the miracle of Prophet Isa who with Allah's permission made a bird-shaped statue from clay then after blowing the bird statue it can live into a real bird. Thus, the Qur'an's worry and rejection are not on the statue but on polytheism and worship [14].

The prohibition of depicting living things is tantamount to iconoclasm in Islam. To reinterpret the fiqh, there needs to be a review of what is called a characteristic as one of the motives of fiqh law itself, characteristics can change, and legal provisions that also give birth to the characteristics in question. If the characteristics change, then the law can also change.

In the Islamic legal tradition, changes in provisions are always made possible by shifting interpretations, either by place or time factors. With
this argument, the view that forbids the depiction of living things can no longer be held because of the changing times and motives. There is a legal "illat" in the form of a prohibition motif, which is worship and the age of idol worship (statue). If the worship motive does not exist, then the prohibition does not exist.

The fiqh argument stated: "law moves with motives, whether they exist or not". Therefore, the texts, both verses of the Qur'an and Hadith, can be interpreted to prohibit the image of living things, can be reinterpreted by prohibiting the motive of worship, which underlies the prohibition. Thus, as long as the statues are not worshiped, purified, and glorified, there will be no legal provisions that prohibit them. Yet, if there is worship of the statue one day, it must be destroyed.

The legal approach (fiqh) is indeed an approach that must be based on something external, because in Usul Fiqh itself provisions are stating that legal motives must be concrete, clear, real, and measurable, therefore this fiqh approach is almost always partial. Thus, the law almost always fails to capture the general spirit.

Iconoclasm from the cultural aspect is often considered as an attempt to hinder one's artistic creativity, by some Muslims, iconoclasm is often used to attack or damage certain works of art which they consider incompatible with Islamic teachings. Similarly, iconoclasm has also been practiced in Indonesia, such as the bombing of the Borobudur temple and cutting animal figures at the foot of the podium of a mosque in Solo.

The practice of very extreme Islamic iconoclasm, in the past in Indonesia has never been found, such as the destruction of cultural objects, buildings or places of worship. Like what happened in Afghanistan when a group of people from the Taliban destroyed one of the Buddhist sites in Bhamiyan, on the grounds of iconoclasm. If only Indonesian Muslims practiced iconoclasm to the extreme, of course, today we will not be able to enjoy the splendor of Borobudur temple and the beauty of Prambanan temple and other temples scattered in Indonesia.

The extreme presence of iconoclasm in Indonesia does not occur, but its presence can be found in the various forms of art it produces. One example is the wayang kulit, which is said to have been initiated by the Walis in Java, the shape of the puppet is made so that it is not the same anatomically proportional to the natural human form, with a thin body, arms longer than the body, eyes that are only one side, nose more sharp, there is also a three-line stroke on the neck as a symbol that it is not a living creature, but a dead object, because it has been slaughtered, as

we know animals will die if they are slaughtered. The three veins are cut off, namely the airway, the blood path and the airway, food. Likewise, the depiction of the human figure in the puppets is disproportionate to the real human form. Based on this phenomenon, iconoclasm presents in Indonesia, in various forms of art. Still, it does not necessarily hinder their creativity from continuing producing works of art in various forms so that writers will compose verses of poetry and sculptors create decorations if the painter can write calligraphic works.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion, it can be concluded as follows. First, iconoclasm is a cultural and religious event. Therefore, there are two variables to understand it, the religious variable and the cultural variable. In terms of religion, in Islam, iconoclasm was not born initially from the Islamic tradition. Chronologically the ideology was born earlier than the Christian tradition. In terms of iconoclasm is an understanding of the prohibition of depicting living things such as humans and animals, in the Islamic or Arabic tradition, it is known as taswir which can be interpreted by resembling or drawing.

Second, iconoclasm in Islam does not always have a negative impact on cultural products. The creativity of Muslim artists is like being challenged when they cannot draw living creatures and are not allowed to depict the great figure of the beloved Prophet Muhammad. Some Muslim artists gave birth to works of graphic art in the form of ornaments and mosaics of buildings and architectural arts that were very amazing, as well as calligraphy art from the verses of the Qur'an. Their love for the great figure of the Prophet Muhammad changed from a brush to a nib to compose words in the form of thousands of verses of poetry, which gave birth to Qasidah Burdah, and beautiful and heart-fluttering poems. That's how it should be when Muslim creativity hits the wall of iconoclasm, then they will find their way to be still able to express their artistic taste.

Third, we must be grateful that even though iconoclasm was once present in Indonesia, its tolerance is maintained by not necessarily destroying all things that do not belong to us Muslims. It is maintained as a treasure trove of the cultural wealth of the Indonesian nation. We are happy that our nation already has the roots of attitude excellent tolerance so that they remain creative, as can also be found in the relics of cultural objects in Indonesia.
REFERENCES


