Inconsistency of Covid-19 Information Among Tourism Stakeholders in Indonesia

Yenni Sri Utami1,*, Pawito Pawito2, Prahastiwi Utari3, Drajat Tri Kartono4

1 Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta
2 Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta
3 Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta
4 Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta
* Email: yenni.sriutami@upnyk.ac.id

ABSTRACT
This article discusses the analysis of the production of the COVID-19 message by tourism stakeholders to restore the economy of the tourism sector. Even until almost a year of pandemic, a way to restore the tourism sector is nowhere to be found. The hotel business and other businesses supporting tourism collapsed and closed their businesses. Tourism recovery efforts have been carried out by tourism stakeholders. Starting from the provision of COVID-19 protocol facilities at tourist attractions, certification from the government, and massive promotions. One of the assumptions for the slow recovery of the tourism sector is the inconsistency of information about COVID-19 by the government. The inconsistency of this information is marked by frequent revisions of information that have been submitted to the public, replacement of COVID-19 spokespersons, and uncoordinated production of information about COVID-19. The uncertainty of this information raises public doubts about doing activities, including tourism activities. This study analyzed conversations about the COVID-19 policy on Twitter using the Conversation Analysis method. Data crawling was done using NodeXL software. The results showed that the government as the main actor in the development of the tourism sector was inconsistent in determining the policy of the tourism sector. Policies were not completely guarded, causing uncertainty in the tourism business. Meanwhile, the media presented information causing controversy. Information in the media was not oriented toward reducing uncertainty but instead created uncertainty. Meanwhile, society was divided into two groups, one which supported government policies and another opposed government policies.

Keywords: Tourism Recovery, Tourism Stakeholders, COVID-19 Information Inconsistency.

1. INTRODUCTION
The Indonesian government’s policy in dealing with COVID-19 is considered inconsistent [1]. One expression of dissatisfaction with the policy is the emergence of the hashtag #indonesiaterserah on social media [2]. This hashtag had become a trending topic for several days. The hashtag #indonesiaterserah was raised as a protest against the government's selective slashing policy [1]. The government strictly imposes sanctions on citizens when they violate the COVID-19 protocol, while violations committed by certain parties do not receive any sanctions. In practice, this policy inconsistency often confuses local governments. For example Lockdown policy. The central government and local governments often differ in implementing this policy. When the central government instructed the easing of community activities, the local government decided to lockdown, and vice versa. This difference then gave birth to a ‘national’ policy called Large-Scale Social Restrictions (PSBB) [2].

On top of the PSBB policy, the government has again socialized the New Normal policy. The background of
this policy is more on economic considerations. The government considers PSBB psychologically to hamper the economic activity of the community. For this reason, steps have been taken to make COVID-19 policies that are friendly to economic activity. The New Normal label is seen as a term that gives an understanding that people can move with a new culture. This new culture is characterized by daily actions that are beneficial to live along COVID-19. COVID-19 is analogous to tuberculosis, influenza, and other diseases. It is expected of people to look after themselves.

However, according to the emotional lexicon analysis of netizens regarding COVID-19 on social media, fear (fear), trust in the government (truth), and surprise dominate the psychological condition of netizens. Fear shows a fluctuating graph. The situation of netizens' fear is almost similar to the situation of anticipation, while the truth is relatively stable. However, interestingly, at the end of this survey period (March 11), netizens' sadness and anger increased dramatically [3].

Figure 1 Survey period of netizens' sadness and anger

The confusion of information circulating has confused the public in responding to COVID-19. Public anxiety arises due to the circulation of various hoaxes and misleading information. The Ministry of Communication and Information during 2020 recorded as many as 1,028 hoaxes circulating on social media. In January there were 40 hoaxes, February 100 hoaxes, March 265 hoaxes, and this month it was recorded as the first case of COVID-19 in Indonesia. In April 219 hoaxes, May 172 hoaxes, June 102 hoaxes, July 108 hoaxes, and August as many as 22 hoaxes [4].

Research conducted by Nasir and Iqbal (2020) shows several themes of the COVID-19 hoax. They found that respondents believe Indonesia's climate is not suitable for the development of the virus and COVID-19 will end soon. While some others stated that COVID-19 was a chemical weapon. Meanwhile, the others believe that gargling with salt water or vinegar can kill the COVID-19 virus. The conclusion of this study is A group of people still do not understand the misinformation related to COVID-19. Various efforts are needed to harmonize public understanding of COVID-19 prevention and provide accurate information [5]. The information circulating nowadays causes cognitive dissonance in individuals [6].

To reduce confusion, the public hopes that the government will provide one-stop information to provide precise, fast, accurate, and accountable information to minimize public unrest arising from hoax news [7]. Currently, people have done self-censorship by looking for additional information on external media, especially Instagram. The Ministry of Communication and Informatics is more focused on evaluating the information received by discussing between sub-sections and other sub-sections in order to reduce disinformation [8].

Disinformation in the media appears in five categories, namely politics, health, foreign affairs, business, and crime. In the first place is the category of politics and health with a total of 68 stories each. The health category contains disinformation about the characteristics and causes of COVID-19 and how to prevent and cure it. This includes COVID-19 patients, the discovery of COVID-19, and procedures for burying COVID-19 victims. Meanwhile, the political category contains false news about political figures, public policies for COVID-19 affairs, and lockdown policies [9].

Figure 2 Monthly visits of foreign tourists

The inconsistency of government policies also has an impact on the tourism sector. Data on foreign tourist arrivals to Indonesia in April 2021 decreased by 19.33 percent from 158.06 to 127,512 in the same month the previous year. This decline was caused by the COVID-19 pandemic which almost stopped human mobility around the world. However, policies in various sectors that are out of sync are also the reason for the lack of recovery in tourism activities. An interesting phenomenon occurred during the ban on going home for Eid. The Eid homecoming ban is aimed at reducing the spread of COVID-19. On the other hand, the government welcomes people who are not going home to visit tourist attractions. A contradictory policy. This article discusses

Similar policies make it difficult for tourism village
managers in the field. When tourists are excited to travel in groups, the police order the tourists to disperse. This kind of uncoordinated policy creates uncertainty for tourism managers in the field. The public is encouraged to travel and managers are instructed to prepare for the COVID-19 protocol, when the instructions are implemented and running, the police disperse the tourist visitors. The government seems to be in a position of confusion between keeping the economy running and the interests of health to keep COVID-19 from spreading. This confusion still occurs because there is no comprehensive policy that guarantees various sectors run in sync.

2. METHOD

This study employed the Conversational Analysis method to reveal the sentiment of speech regarding government policies related to COVID-19 in the tourism sector on Twitter. The tool used for data crawling was NodeXL. The keyword used for crawling was 'covid-19 tourism'. The data obtained were then analyzed for the sentiment. In addition to sentiment, analysis was also carried out on the appearance of the sociogram map that emerged from the conversation about these keywords. From this sociogram, data were then obtained on who were the influential actors in the reality of social media. Analysis was carried out on the structure of the network, groups, and actors in the conversation.

3. BASIC THEORY

3.1. Cognitive Dissonance Theory

Every individual tends to balance his cognition when there is a difference between what is desired and stated behavior [10]. Anxiety also arises when there are inconsistent cognitions, namely cognitions that conflict with one another. In this situation, the individual will try to change his cognition to restore consistency with other cognitions or change his behavior to suit his cognition [11]; [12].

Dissonance is an aversive drive for individuals to be more consistent. Dissonant pressure motivates individuals to change behavior (behavior) or change beliefs in an effort to avoid anxiety. The higher the discrepancy between the individual's behavior and beliefs, the higher the magnitude of the dissonance that will be felt [12]. Dissonance is an imbalance of feeling (disequilibrium) of attitude elements. While consonance is a balance or equilibrium of the elements of attitude [13]. Attitude elements include between cognition or between cognition and behavior. Brown explained that efforts to reduce cognitive dissonance can be seen as efforts to achieve consonance [11].

Cognitive dissonance theory explains two elements in three types of relationships, namely consonant, dissonant, and irrelevant relationships [11]:

1) The consonant relationship exists between elements that are balanced with each other.
2) The dissonant relationship exists between elements that are not balanced with each other.
3) The irrelevant relationship is a relationship that exists between two elements that do not affect each other.

Consonant relationships and irrelevant relationships can not cause discomfort, but dissonant relationships can cause psychological discomfort. [11]. When individuals experience cognitive dissonance, individuals will make various efforts to reduce it. This kind of action is referred to as Cognitive Dissonance Reduction. Efforts are made in two ways, changing behavior or making certain communication efforts. Change behavior that is contrary to cognitive into behavior that is in accordance with cognitive. Meanwhile, certain communication efforts are carried out through reassurance, encouragement, selective exposure, rationale, selective attention, selective retention, as well as minimal justification.

In the context of tourism recovery amid the COVID-19 pandemic, unclear information results in dissonance. Dissonance occurs because there are two different cognitions. On the one hand, the COVID-19 protocol procedure has intensively campaigned in the tourism sector, but on the other hand, the government does not allow tourism destinations to be opened. The two inconsistent pieces of information circulated at the same time. Tour managers feel this uncertainty. In the community itself, information about the prohibition to return to their hometown during Eid was conveyed massively and accompanied by threats, but on the other hand, there was an appeal to visit tourist sites.

Cognitive imbalance due to inconsistent tourism information encourages tourism managers to change their actions in relation to the tourism objects they manage. This is especially true for tourism objects that are initiated by the community (community-based tourism). Uncertainty resulted in neglected tourism objects. Doubts about investing in preparing COVID-19 protocol facilities to arise due to the lack of certainty of information that will guide visitors. This uncertainty has also resulted in the community's decision to postpone their tourist visits as a decision to maintain their cognitive consistency.

3.2. Cognitive Dissonance in COVID-19 Pandemic

Governments all across the world are putting pressure
on their citizens to follow health rules as the COVID-19 pandemic spreads. This is intended to slow the transmission of the virus. [14] discovered that attitudes and risk perceptions of COVID-19 can influence overall health habits. People try to adjust their thoughts or their conduct to restore stability and remove discord. The level of each element's commitment determines which aspects of cognition change.

The study conducted by [14] is consistent with Eddie Harmon-Jones' proposal for "An Action-Based Model of Cognitive Dissonance Processes." The intellect of a person influences his conduct. This cognition has the potential to impact behavior. Some cognitions, however, have a more direct and long-lasting impact on actions than others. When confronted with contradicting conditions, this cognition creates even more discomfort. Individuals may then attempt to align cognition for behavior to occur as a result of this dissonance. Situations that frequently cause dissonance to entail challenging judgments that necessitate a commitment to action. Individuals will act if they are committed to doing so. That is, they are motivated to act in accordance with their obligations.

Another study, conducted by [15], found that perceptions of the risk of COVID-19 can influence people's preventive behavior in the United States. One of the cognitive aspects that exist in a person is the perception of this threat. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the existence of this impression is reported to have had a substantial impact on protective behavior.

4. FINDINGS

Tracing the issue of government inconsistency regarding Covid and tourism issues on Twitter with the keyword 'covid-19 tourism' resulted in an interesting response in the reality of social media. From 1090 Vertices, the majority of Netizens gave negative sentiments as many as 1041 (96%). Meanwhile, those who gave a positive response were only 49 netizens (4%). Jokowi is the most popular actor on this network. He was contacted by 165 accounts (Indegree). On the other hand, he did not call back the account that contacted him (outdegree = 0). This relationship indicates that Jokowi's communication on Twitter was linear. One-way communication was instructional, regardless of the response given by residents. When viewed from his posts, Jokowi's messages from time to time are not interrelated. Posted messages always have different content.

Table 1 Table of Three Influential Accounts in search with the keyword "Covid Tourism"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Akun</th>
<th>In Degree</th>
<th>Out Degree</th>
<th>Betweenness Centrality</th>
<th>Closeness Centrality</th>
<th>Eigenvector Centrality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>jokowi</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10321.324</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kafiradikalis</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>80307.612</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dayatia</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>217695.663</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this case, Jokowi did not post any messages, but netizens mentioned him. The mention addressed to him was the message “…Covid is at a high-level conference in Jakarta. Sponsored by the @jokowi regime, which since the beginning of the pandemic has provided tourism incentives for foreign tourists to enter. Even 1-2 months ago India was exploding with Covid by the regime …this is even allowed to enter its citizens.” This message was originally a tweet from the @kafiradikalis account on June 26, 2021. This tweet was in response to the news from CNBCIndonesia entitled “Cases are increasing! The Worldwide Variant of Covid Gathers in Jakarta”.

The @kafiradikalis tweet was then retweeted and mentioned to Jokowi by 160 accounts. This means that if the data has an Indegree score of 165, then 161 of them are mentions from @kafiradikalis's tweet. While the other 4 are mentions that all have negative sentiments, namely:

- @CNNIndonesia the economic impact of covid is getting bigger because the existing news affects the people's physics even though there are many other news events, but covid alone dominates the news. Change the picture of the news, whether it is about tourism or something else, and the problem related to COVID-19 will go away on its own. @jokowi
- @jokowi @PutraWadapi Because from the start it was only made fun of, even to the point of paying BuzzterRp to deny Covid and open the door to tourism. Official bullshit!!!
- @cnbcindonesia whatever. Surprised, do you know that if the pandemic has not subsided, any incentives given will not have any effect. First, get rid of covid, finish it, then arrange tourism, infrastructure, the new capital city, toll roads, and others. It's up to you @jokowi @sandiuno
- @Dennysiregar7 @jokowi Denny the desert lizard Zulfikar is stupid, that's why the handling of the pandemic is damaged because according to the opinion of experts. The economy has been wrecked, and tourism has been stifled, despite the fact that no epidemiologist is required by law. From the beginning, the apparatus took Covid lightly with their stupidity, it was raining to prepare umbrellas, the people who were victims had already conceded.
Mentions to President Jokowi that are not replies or retweets of his posts indicate that citizens' anxiety about the handling of COVID-19 in Indonesia is increasing. Another tweet shows the people's desire for the government to take COVID-19 more seriously. Residents agree with the thoughts of the @kafiradialis account, so this account has an in degree score of number 2 after Jokowi (160). This score is also a reply from netizens. This means that @kafiradialis’ tweet made this account popular. Same with Jokowi, @kafiradikalis did not respond to me who had replayed it. He only contacted 1 actor, namely Jokowi through his mention of messages that became trending topics (Out Degree).

The account whose tweet received the third most netizen responses was @dayatia. "If I were the tourism minister, I would make Lombok and Bali a Pfizer vaccine for all, zero covid, and become a covid-free tourist destination. All happy. *bismillah to be the minister of tourism” in response to the government’s policy of “Work from Bali”. This program aims to rethink Bali tourism. In practice, this program is big in public discourse. Once established, there is no effect at all on Bali tourism. The quality of this policy is a trigger for netizens to give negative sentiments to the government. The tweet was originally uploaded by @dayatia's tweet which was followed by the words “…*bismillah to be tourism minister” which was also a negative expression for the government which appointed Abdi Negara Nurdin (personnel of the “Slank” Band) as commissioner of PT Telkom. This meme has become a trending topic based on the assumption that it is enough to support and flatter Jokowi. Thus, in return he will be appointed as a commissioner of a State-Owned Enterprise (SOE).

@dayatia's Outdegree score of 2 indicates that this account only contacts 2 accounts. Both are in the form of their Tweets as discussed earlier and the Retweet of the @anakpetir account which reads “This is a great idea, doc. There is one area where the Covid response was made, tracing and treatment were good. Therefore, tourism can be opened with real protocol and might be on a small pilot scale. * Bismillah Stafsus.” This Tweet is a Threat criticizing Jokowi's officials.

The three accounts, @jokowi, @kafiradikalis, and @dayatia have the same Closeness Centrality coefficient, which is 0.001. The smaller this coefficient number indicates that this actor is getting closer to other actors. Thus the three accounts have a fairly close relationship with the account that contacted them. This closeness shows the intensity of mutual communication between actors very often. Communication can be one-way (as a follower) or two-way (reciprocal).

Judging from the Betweenness Centrality, the @dayatia account has the highest score, which is 217695.663. The calculation of the Betweenness Centrality score illustrates the important position of an account in connecting between each actor. The higher the score, the more important the actor's position is. This position relates to the control and manipulation of information in the network. Jokowi in terms of Betweenness Centrality is at 103121.324. The analysis of these two accounts shows a different phenomenon even though they are in the top two positions. The @dayatia account has an important position in the network because of the influence of the information load factor on its tweets. If you look in more detail at the contents of the tweet, this account often creates threats that provide new knowledge for its followers about COVID-19. In addition to the threat, @dayatia who seems to be a doctor criticizes the government in a measured and logical manner.

Unlike @jokowi. Although Betweenness Centrality is a big number, it can be seen because of his position as president. The relationship that was built by another actor was not due to Jokowi’s tweet, but another actor's tweet (@kafiradikalis) that was mentioned to him. This means that this relationship is solely because the actor as a citizen intends to convey a message to Jokowi to be more serious in dealing with COVID-19. Meanwhile, the account @kafiradikalis ranks with a score of 80307.612. This means that in this case, he has a position that is not so high, both seen from his post and his position. However, the positive point of @kafiradikalis is that it can arouse other actors to mention Jokowi through the messages he uploads.
Figure 4 Graphic of @jokowi

Figure 5 Graphic of @kafiradikal

Group analysis of the three accounts illustrates a clearer position of them. The @dayatia account has a self-contained cluster. In addition, the @dayatia cluster is also related to other clusters. This means that his tweet also attracts actors who have quite a central position in other clusters. The distribution is fairly even in each group. This is in contrast to @jokowi and @kafiradikal. These two accounts occupy the same cluster. Both are the same because the @jokowi cluster was awakened by an actor who mentioned his tweet @kafiradikal. In this position, @jokowi acts as a passive actor whose relationship is built from mentioning other actors.

In relation to tourism and COVID-19 issues, tweet initiatives emerged from citizens who were mentioned to the government, two influential actors were able to trigger netizens to jointly criticize the government. Two large clusters and other small clusters gave a negative response to government policies in the tourism sector in the COVID-19 situation.

5. DISCUSSION

Netizens' tweets using the keyword "Covid Tourism" which were crawled from Twitter using the Nodexl application, illustrate that residents experience cognitive instability with various inconsistent information. This cognitive instability, in Leon Festinger's language, is Cognitive Dissonance, is shown in the mention of 165 accounts to President Jokowi. This mention is solely a message factor that represents their feelings. A tweet from the @kafiradialis account reads “...Covid is another high-level conference in Jakarta. Sponsored by the @jokowi regime, which since the beginning of the pandemic has given tourism incentives to foreign tourists to enter. Even 1-2 months ago India again exploded with Covid by the qnl regime, even though it was allowed to enter its citizens.” It represents an expression of citizens' frustration with inconsistent government policies. It alludes to the arrival of Chinese citizens who are left alone, while their citizens are treated strictly.

Citizens' cognitive dissonance can also be seen from the expression of their Tweets on the @dayatia account criticizing the "Work from Bali" policy. People's confusion regarding the COVID-19 issue has not been answered, the government has added to the problem by inaugurating a musician as a BUMN commissioner. This confusion was expressed in @dayatia's tweet which was followed by the meme *bismillah stafsus. This meme criticizes how easy it is to become a Jokowi official with only praise for Jokowi.

One of the residents' expressions of frustration was reflected in the tweet “Current state problems: 1) People's purchasing power plummeted; 2) The debt burden exceeded the normal ratio; 3) COVID-19 victims continued to increase; 4) The business world was headed for collapse; 5) Tourism was quiet; 6) Unemployment increased; 7) Corruption is still rampant, etc... Moeldoko's problems: 1. Lust becomes Ketum @Pdemokrat” uploaded by the @deslini2 account. The uncertainty of information on government policies in the tourism sector amid the COVID-19 pandemic will arouse citizens' despair in managing tourism and the interest of citizens to travel. Doubts will always haunt both managers and visitors.

In essence, information is used to reduce uncertainty. This means that Cognitive Dissonance will be reduced if there is information that reduces uncertainty. Such information is consistent information and answers the existing problems. From this understanding, it can be interpreted that currently, the government is less consistent in providing information about COVID-19, especially those related to the tourism sector. As a result, actors in this sector in some places do not dare to take the initiative to activate this sector.

6. CONCLUSION

The tourism issue during the COVID-19 outbreak is not yet solved. Residents feel they do not understand the direction of government policy. At least this can be seen in the reality of the conversation on Twitter related to the keyword "COVID-19 Tourism". Popular tweets are dominated by conversations criticizing the government about its policies. The three dominant accounts in this regard, namely @jokowi, @dayatia, and @kafiradikal, all of whom complained about inconsistent government policies. The @jokowi account here occupies a position as a passive account and is the target of criticism. Meanwhile, the other two accounts have a central position in conveying criticism and gaining support from twitter residents. The reality of Twitter media illustrates that information on handling COVID-19 Bracken, B. A. (1992).
Examiner's manual for the multidimensional self-esteem scale, Austin, TX: Pro-Ed. is felt to be inconsistent. The expressions of the residents showed annoyance towards the government which did not provide certainty in responding to COVID-19. Inconsistent information, picky policies and do not provide certainty about activities become citizens' cognition. It can be said that currently, citizens are experiencing Cognitive Dissonance in responding to government information inconsistencies.

REFERENCES


