

The Role of Traffic in Reducing Wildlife Trafficking in Southeast Asia 2019-2020

Cheshe Havara Moonray^{1,*}, Sugito Sugito², Mutia Hariati
Hussin³

¹ *International Relations, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

² *International Relations, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

³ *International Relations, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

* Email: cheshehavara50@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Southeast Asia is an area with a rapid rate of wildlife trade and extinction, therefore making the wildlife in this area sharply decline. Animals species in Southeast Asia are identified as threatened. TRAFFIC as a non-governmental organization engaged in the environmental issues, protects natural biodiversity and supports sustainable development. There is a lot of wildlife trade going on in Southeast Asia, TRAFFIC is working to close this illegal market, helps end the wildlife trade to prevent further movement of the wildlife trade to nearby countries. The research was conducted using qualitative methods through literature studies. The data collection is done by looking for references from journal articles, books, and other websites related to the topic. The type of data collected also uses secondary data from several studies that have been conducted. TRAFFIC's role in tackling wildlife smuggling in Southeast Asia and helping prevent trade and other practices. TRAFFIC aims to create opportunities for the development of realistic solutions and the integration of well-managed wildlife trade as a more prominent component of long-term development planning.

Keywords: *South East Asia, TRAFFIC, Wildlife Trafficking.*

1. INTRODUCTION

The study of international relations has undergone many developments and changes over time. At first, the study only discussed issues of international politics and focused on the state as the main object or as an actor. Such as Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), International Governmental Organizations (IGOs), Multinational Cooperation (MNCs), and individuals with significant power and influence are examples of this type of organization. The development of state non-actor has increased sharply. Sovereign countries are indeed important, but they are not one of the important actors in international relations [1]. These actors then interact and work together to form certain communities and patterns of interaction. Now, in the development of international relations, is no longer just the aspect of inter-state relations are just covering the political,

economic, cultural and as well as other aspects but also as economic interdependence, human rights, security and transnational. [2].

One thing became the world's focus aside from the political aspects that are often and always discussed, non-state actors such as NGOs, take the spotlight on environmental issues.

The environment really needs to be the spotlight of the world, this cannot be allowed because humans depend on living with the surrounding environment. One million plant and animal species are on the verge of extinction, largely owing to human activity [3]. This is a major issue in the world and highlights the illegal trade in wildlife. Wildlife according to the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) includes all animals, birds, and fish, as well as wood and non-timber forest products. The illegal trade, smuggling, hunting, capture or collection of

endangered species, protected wildlife, their derivatives, or their products are examples of wildlife trade. Illegal exploitation of the world's wild flora and fauna is broadly defined as a crime against wildlife. In addition to drug trafficking, arms trafficking, and people trafficking, the wildlife crime has become one of the major transnational organized criminal organizations. Transnationally organized wildlife crime is especially acute in increasing countries because resource-poor governments often lack the capacity to regulate the exploitation of their natural assets.

Crimes against wildlife and forests threaten biodiversity and endangered species, people's livelihoods, and have a profound impact on security, national, social, and economic development [4]. Currently, there are many non-state actors who enforce justice or take their focus on the environment or wildlife trade. Trade Records Analysis of Flora and Fauna in Commerce (TRAFFIC) is a non-governmental organization that fights the global traffic in wild animals and plants to protect biodiversity and promote sustainable development. TRAFFIC is a wildlife trade monitoring network formed in 1976 by World Wildlife Fund (WWF) and International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) to gather data, analyze it, and provide recommendations to help people make better decisions about wildlife trafficking. In 2017, TRAFFIC is evolving into an independent non-profit organization, with representatives from the WWF and IUCN on the Board of Directors, as well as participants of the independent Board of Directors [5]. With this NGO assisting in the wildlife trade, it is intended that the incentive for consuming endangered wildlife goods will shift, which is not just required by Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) parties [6] to protect against extinction, an agreement that is necessary.

CITES was drafted as a result of a resolution adopted in 1963 at a meeting of IUCN members. The CITES, also known as the international regime to regulate animal trade, was established in 1972, is a multilateral agreement to address one of the threats to species extinction. As a result of CITES, the authority that regulates wildlife trade issues and is associated with the link between biodiversity conservation and sustainable development, efforts are required to conserve this animal from extinction [7]. CITES is legally binding on the Parties — in other words, they must implement the Convention — but it does not supersede national legislation. Rather, it establishes a framework that must be followed by each Party, which must enact domestic legislation to ensure that CITES is implemented on a national level [8] TRAFFIC states that they play a unique and primary role as specialists in

dealing with the wildlife trade. In terms of handling, they perform research, investigation, and analysis to obtain evidence that may be used to prompt authorities, businesses, and individuals should work together with partners to ensure that the wildlife trade does not endanger nature conservation.

A study analyzing and mentioning successful arrest in ten Southeast Asian countries in recent years focused on some of the most closely monitored land animals groups of animals that are not visible include; confiscation of approximately 225,000 kg of *Loxodonta Africana* African Elephant tusks involving Cambodia, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand and Vietnam during the period 2008–2019; Traded 895,000 pangolins globally from 2000-2019, while more than 96,000 kg of pangolin scales of mostly African species originated from 2017–2019 across Malaysia, Singapore and Vietnam, representing about 94% of the total number of scales seized in Southeast Asia during this period. confiscation of 100,000 Pig-nosed Turtle *Carettochelys insculpta* in Indonesia from 2003–2019; Over 45,000 songbirds only in Sumatra and Java from 2018–2019 [9].

Kanitha Krishnaswamy, Director of TRAFFIC in Southeast Asia said, "Not a day goes by without the arrest of wildlife crimes that take place in Southeast Asia, and too often in gaping volumes. Arrest are certainly laudable, but what must be eradicated are the many basic enabling factors that drive and fueling illegal trade." According to WWF Pangolins are of great interest to countries such as China and Vietnam. The study focuses on the key challenges that continue to allow illegal trade to grow in the region, such as the prevalence of organized criminal networks transporting contraband wildlife, low penalties, inadequate regulations, and poor control of markets and retail outlets. Wildlife cybercrime, as well as challenges that have persisted over time such as widespread corruption, lack of political will, and continued consumer demand for wildlife, are also examined in the report. Demonstrates the close ties that exist between Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) members and the world. The region embodies the roles of sourcing, consumer, and transit. Only political will and the will to act at all levels of government can break the grip of illegal trade chains and networks, according to Krishnaswamy [10].

The trade of protected animals without regard for existing regulations is referred to as wildlife trade. Some people trade in animals that are protected either illegally, even in living conditions, or animals that have been preserved. These actions are very detrimental to the Indonesian government. Therefore, the Indonesian government establishes international cooperation to address cases of wildlife trafficking, not just through law

enforcement, and involving more than one country necessitates international collaboration. Khoirunnisa (2017) explained how the Indonesian government's efforts to eradicate the practice of wildlife trafficking notwithstanding the inadequacies and hurdles faced by the Indonesian government owing to a lack of suitable personnel and financial resources. One of the efforts made by the Indonesian government is by making special programs with institutions- international agencies such as UNDP, USAID, GEF and international organizations such as WWF to reduce the level of wildlife trafficking [11].

Chairunnisa (2018) stated that the Javan rhino population is increasingly threatened with extinction. Therefore, The Javan rhinoceros population is on the decline, prompting WWF an environmental organization that also works with endangered species, to join efforts to save this animal. This document details WWF's work to conserve the Javan rhino population in Indonesia so that it can continue to exist in its natural habitat. The study's findings, therefore, suggest that the WWF has played an important role as an international organization in preventing the extinction of the Javan rhino. The WWF's Javan rhino population protection effort in Indonesia has resulted in an increase in the Javan rhinoceros' population. As a result, WWF plays a vital role in the conservation of Indonesia's Javan rhino population [2].

The World Wildlife Fund's involvement in preventing wildlife smuggling in Indonesia, as well as the challenges the World Wildlife Fund has in preventing wildlife smuggling in Indonesia. Ismaya (2016) the author of this paper focuses on a single topic: the role of the WWF in stopping elephant ivory smuggling. WWF serves as a motivator, communicator, middleman, organizer, and legislative advocate in the fight against elephant ivory smuggling [12]. In three previous studies, WWF has explained the roles of WWF in preventing wildlife trade in Indonesian territory. We can see in Ismaya's research (2016) that WWF has several roles in preventing wildlife smuggling and trade in Indonesia. The author describes that the roles performed by WWF are as motivators, communicators, intermediaries, legislators, and organizations. In this study, WWF describes the obstacles to preventing wildlife smuggling, where there are many conflicts and differences of opinion that make things a bit complicated to solve. So, this paper will better describe WWF's role in preventing wildlife trade.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

The term NGO is broad and ambiguous. This includes a wide range of organizations in civil society,

from political action groups to sports clubs. A clear definition is still being debated. However, it can be said that all NGOs can be said to be civil society organizations although not all civil society organizations are NGOs. NGOs are a component of social movements. Similarly, civil society is a broader concept to include all social activities of individuals, groups, and movements. The concept of a NGO that came into use in 1945 after the founding of the United Nation which recognized the need to give a consultative role to organizations that were not classified as government or members [13]. The role and activities of NGOs have received special attention. As most contemporary conflicts include unstable state-society ties with significant ramifications for civilians, NGOs have become prominent actors in numerous international arenas and in diverse modes of conflict prevention [14]. NGOs have played an important role in the formulation and implementation of development policies, being key actors in the political economy of development. This makes NGOs have increased cooperation with the government and aid agencies that can offer alternative models of development. The formation of NGO institutions marks a change in approach and contributes to sustainability and according to the function of the NGO itself, namely developing to embrace environmental sustainability, people suffering from poverty, and gender equality [15].

This NGO is a heterogeneous group that works in various fields with varying scope of work. NGOs include private volunteer organizations, civil society, the independent sector, non-governmental organizations, grassroots organizations, sector volunteers, social movement organizations, transnationals, and non-state actors. According to the typology of the world bank, NGOs are classified into operational and advocacy NGOs. Operational NGOs aim to design and implement development-related projects. The scope of operational NGOs can be national, international or community based. Meanwhile, Advocacy NGOs aim to promote certain goals. It makes efforts to increase awareness and knowledge by carrying out various activities such as lobbying, press work, and activist events [16]. According to the European Commission, from the article "Enforcement of wildlife law: the vital role of NGOs" says that NGOs have two categories, namely, NGO campaigning, with the aim of raising public awareness about wildlife crime; and Law enforcement NGOs, aiming to ensure that wildlife laws are properly enforced.

According to Philip Eldridge, NGOs fall into two categories: development NGOs and mobilization NGOs. Development NGOs focus on traditional community development initiatives like irrigation, drinking water, agriculture, animal husbandry, health facilities, and economic development. Second, the Mobilization NGO

works on issues of ecology, education, human rights, women's status, legal rights in land ownership status, and environmental protection [17]. Environmental NGOs are gaining popularity as a result of the shift from state-centered environmental regulations to a polycentric configuration of "governance" that includes governments, NGOs, intergovernmental organizations, corporations, and social movements [18]. Changes in environmental policies and governance are not only centered on state actors, but also the role of civil society organizations as representatives of non-state actors. NGOs are able to play an important role in environmental diplomacy, developing transnational living networks in response to private sector environmental problems. In other words, NGOs are one of the dominant sectors in contemporary environmental politics [19]. NGOs participating in environmental politics are not limited to "green-chip NGOs" household names such as WWF and Greenpeace [20]. On the other hand, NGOs, are made up of various scientific, humanitarian, and special interest organizations, from the Kenyan Center for the Study of African Technology to the Norwegian Refugee Council (Norway). Existing ENGO research leans towards traditional environmental conservation and advocacy groups. [18].

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Systematic research/investigation required methods. Research methodology contained knowledge that examines the methods used in research [21]. This Research adopted a constructivist paradigm by using a qualitative approach to provide explanations and understanding events that are or have occurred, which emphasizes the interpretation of the meaning of the developing categories of research informants qualitative approach [19]. Data collection mostly used secondary and primary data. Secondary data is data obtained from research studies and books. The data used are a source of information about TRAFFIC's role in tackling wildlife trafficking.

Therefore, this research used a research library. This technique is based on information researched from literature reference sources such as scientific journals, books, news articles, opinions, or previous research on TRAFFIC's role in handling wildlife trafficking cases that occur in ASEAN. In analyzing the data and information obtained for this study, qualitative data analysis techniques are needed. The goal of qualitative research is to comprehend the meaning of reality in order to construct it. As a result, qualitative research typically focuses on processes, experiences, and authenticity. In accordance with the study's goals, describing the role of TRAFFIC in addressing the problem of wildlife trafficking in ASEAN based on

information and facts obtained from secondary data or literary sources in accordance with the research discussed [22].

4. RESULT & DISCUSSION

In 2016, in Asia the bulk of the tusks were taken from 20,000 to 25,000 elephants. This problem stems from the region's growing middle and upper class-driven demand with exotic tastes in pets, decor, food, and fashion [23]. According to the TRAFFIC February 2020 report, more than 200 tons of African elephants, 100,000 pig-nosed turtles, and 900,000 pangolins are traded globally, with a large fraction tied to Southeast Asia [6]. State of Indonesia, which is a country with high natural wealth, has a very high rate of animal extinction, especially pangolins. The high hunting for pangolins is due to the high market demand for various rare and wild animals to be used as food, medicine, or knick-knacks. The targeted market demand is not only in the regional area but also at the international level (Chalimatus Sa' Diyah, 2019). What happened in the Philippines in 2019 was the smuggling of 1,500 rare turtles. This smuggling took place in the baggage of a passenger on a Filipino plane arriving in Hong Kong [24].

The Philippines is one of the key suppliers and transit hubs for wildlife trade, according to a 2018 report by the US Department of State [25]. Southeast Asia serves as a consumer, a provider, and a general import-export marketplace. Much of this trade is domestic and does not cross international borders, for example, medicinal herbs, charcoal, wild meat, and fisheries, and thus falls outside the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora's possible scope (Traffic, 2004). TRAFFIC seeks to identify and address the issues and opportunities for biodiversity conservation and sustainable development that come with wild species trading with the goal of reducing illegal and unsustainable trade pressures on biodiversity and increasing the benefits for wildlife conservation and sustainable development. In the movement of NGOs, the role of NGOs such as TRAFFIC is that they cannot be separated from campaigning and enforcing the law for a good global cause to protect wildlife.

4.1. TRAFFIC's Role in Reducing Wildlife Trafficking

4.1.1. TRAFFIC Campaign

According to a TRAFFIC report published in 2019 that investigated the 'bear bile trade in peninsular Malaysia', namely about sun bears in Malaysian territory. In this regard TRAFFIC organized a conference on TCM practices in Malaysia, with the aim

of introducing an herbal alternative as effective as bear bile in 2017. The research for this report was conducted as part of TRAFFIC's ongoing efforts to support action to end the illegal bear trade and ensure Malaysia remains a stronghold for the wild sun bear population [26]. According to a TRAFFIC report published in 2019 that investigated the 'bear bile trade in peninsular Malaysia', namely about sun bears in the territory of Malaysia. In this case TRAFFIC organized a conference on TCM practices in Malaysia, with the aim of introducing an equally effective herbal alternative to bear bile that was conducted in 2017. The research for this report was conducted as part of TRAFFIC's ongoing efforts to support action to end the illegal bear trade and ensure Malaysia remains a bastion of wild sun bear population [26].

Consumers catch animal such as elephant and tiger tusks for use as accessories, medicines, and even talismans, as is well known. Happened in Thailand, where residents were advised not to buy or own amulets made from elephant and tiger ivory because demand for elephant and tiger ivory is a major driver of illegal wildlife trade, was done as part of TRAFFIC's new campaign, 'Mercy is Power.' Mercy is Power is a collaboration between TRAFFIC, the Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation (DNP), and the UN Development Program (UNDP), with funding from the Global Environment Facility. The public pledged on the *graceidpower.com* website not to buy or acquire amulets produced from elephant and tiger tusks as part of this initiative. In exchange for this care, the community receives a customized e-yantra [6]. The campaign itself is a good approach for long-term impact in reducing the demand for wildlife products where this is done creatively. This campaign combines the social power of questioning whether buying or owning animal parts derived from animal killings can create luck, success and power and is also a useful campaign in informing initiatives at reducing consumer buying and use of illegal wildlife products [27].

4.1.2. TRAFFIC in Law Enforcement

Law enforcement agencies must develop strategies to deal with the phenomena that occur in the wildlife trade. In a case where there is a change in trading patterns, the unclear legality of trade, the location of users and traders who have not been verified which makes the need for collaboration between national and international law enforcement and enforcement agencies that must be pursued, collaboration should not be limited to law enforcement agencies but must also include trading platforms, as in the case of online

trading, is carried out on Facebook and Instagram. Then NGOs can play a useful role in terms of ongoing dedication to monitoring. In 2019 TRAFFIC together with WWF, and the International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW) introduced a policy to prohibit the trade of all live animals on the platform of endangered species. This step is a positive first step in tackling this problem and has a closer engagement with the government to identify and act against violating laws, particularly repeat violations, in addition, law enforcement agencies must constantly monitor the dynamics that occur on other platforms, to prevent trade shifting from one online platform (such as Facebook or Instagram) to another. With close monitoring and ongoing monitoring, investigations, and strong penalties for those found to be involved in criminal activities can reduce the scale of trafficking over time. Law enforcement efforts must be directed at identified trade-prone points [28].

In a 2019 case in Malaysia where provisions under Malaysian wildlife law for the species allowed judges to punish offenders using a combination of fines and imprisonment. However, violators spent 24 months in prison instead of the full 152 months that came from the seven charges they received because the court ordered all prison sentences to be carried out simultaneously as stipulated. In this regard TRAFFIC analyzed legal actions involving the seizure of the Sumatran serow *Capricornis Sumatraensis* finding that the sentences handed down by courts in Peninsular Malaysia from 2017-2019 were significantly higher than the previous period 2005-2010. More than 102 people have been arrested in connection with wildlife trafficking and hunting offences since Malaysia launched an enhanced law enforcement campaign against wildlife crime in September 2019, 43 of them local citizens and the rest foreigners [26].

5. CONCLUSION

From this research it can be concluded that the role of the NGO TRAFFIC in wildlife trade in Southeast Asia is to provide opportunities to develop and manage practical solutions. Wildlife trade is a more important element of sustainable development initiatives. TRAFFIC has also done its best to combat wildlife trafficking in Southeast Asia, enforce and enhance anti-poaching trade control capacity, special units for covert investigations, and prevention and incentives, and implement effective regulation and enforcement of respective laws. each country. To preserve Southeast Asia's natural heritage, countries, governments, and individuals must work together to combat the unsustainable harvest and trade of wildlife.

This study also uses an analysis of the concept of movement of NG and then uses qualitative research methods through journals, books, articles, and reports using secondary techniques through journals or research that has been carried out related to the topic of discussion. In this study, the authors describe two important roles of TRAFFIC in conducting campaigns and law enforcement based on the concept of movement of NGOs used. These roles can fulfill the purpose of this research, namely, to analyze the relevant efforts that have been made by TRAFFIC in wildlife trade.

In this study the authors still have difficulties regarding the limitations of data collection regarding the role of TRAFFIC in Reducing Wildlife Trafficking in Southeast Asia, this is because the information or data released is still lacking in accessibility and public transparency, so the authors only analyze based on existing or previous research data. Then most of the available data and information criticizes TRAFFIC's role which is considered not optimal in dealing with wildlife trade issues in Southeast Asia, therefore the authors only take data and information about the efforts that TRAFFIC has made. It is hoped that in the future data and information related to TRAFFIC can be more transparent so that it is easily accessible, and the role of TRAFFIC must try harder and bolder to protect and stop wildlife trade that occurs both in Southeast Asia and the world.

REFERENCES

- [1] N. Inna Alifiyah, Hubungan Internasional, no. 1. 2015.
- [2] E. Chairunnisa, "Peranan World Wide Fund for Nature (Wwf) Dalam Upaya Konservasi Populasi Badak Jawa Di Indonesia," *Glob. Polit. Stud. J.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 72–87, 2018, doi: 10.34010/gpsjournal.v2i1.2012.
- [3] U. Environment, "World Environment Day: Spotlight on biodiversity," no. Retrieved from UN environment programme: <https://www.unep.org/cep/news/blogpost/2020-world-environment-day-spotlight-biodiversity>, 2020.
- [4] UNODC, World Wildlife Crime Report 2020. Trafficking in protected species. 2020.
- [5] WWF, "WWF and IUCN congratulate TRAFFIC on its new governance arrangements which will guide future action on wildlife trade," no. Retrieved from WWF: https://wwf.panda.org/wwf_news/?312511/WWF-and-IUCN-congratulate-TRAFFIC-on-its-new-governance-arrangements-which-will-guide-future-action-on-wildlife-trade, 2017.
- [6] TRAFFIC, "Asia," no. Retrieved from TRAFFIC: <https://www.traffic.org>, 2021.
- [7] C. Suyastri, "Mengukur Efektivitas CITES Dalam Menangani Perdagangan Satwa Liar Dengan Menggunakan Identifikasi Legalisasi Artikel CITES Cifebrima Suyastri, SIP, MA," *Transnasional*, 4(1), 790–808, 2012.
- [8] CITES, "No Title," no. Retrieved from CITES: <https://cites.org/eng>, 2021.
- [9] TRAFFIC, "No Title," no. Southeast Asia At the heart of wildlife trade. Retrieved from TRAFFIC: <https://www.traffic.org/publications/reports/renewed-game-plan-needed-to-tackle-southeast-asias-massive-wildlife-trafficking-problem/>, 2020.
- [10] K. Krishnasamy and M. Zavagli, "Southeast Asia: At the heart of wildlife trade," 2020.
- [11] P. Ani Khoirunnisa, "Upaya Penanganan Tingkat Perdagangan Satwa Liar Oleh Pemerintah Indonesia Pada Tahun 2013-2016," *Glob. Insight J.*, vol. 01, no. 02, pp. 96–106, 2017.
- [12] D. ISMAYA, "PERAN WORLD WILDLIFE FUND DALAM MENCEGAH PENYELUNDUPAN SATWA LIAR DI INDONESIA," vol. 3(2), 1–14, 2016.
- [13] P. Willetts, "What is a Non-Governmental Organization? UNESCO Encyclopedia of Life Support System," 2002.
- [14] O. P. Henry F. Carey, "Mitigating Conflict The Role of NGOs," London Frank Cass. Indraswari, K., Leupen, B. T. C., Minh, D. T. (2020). A Snapshot Online Ivory Trade Indones. Thailand, Viet Nam 2016 with an Updat. 2019 (Issue July), 2003.
- [15] O. Owa, "THE ROLE OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS (NGOs) IN STRENGTHENING CIVIL SOCIETY AND DEMOCRATIC DEVELOPMENT," *IDOSR J. ARTS Manag.* 2(2) 91-98, 2017. 92-93, 2017.
- [16] Sushant, "Types of NGOs," no. Retrieved from NGO: <https://web.archive.org/web/20180325020421/http://www.ngo.in/types-of-ngos.html>, 2010.

- [17] F. Mansour, "Masyarakat Sipil untuk Transformasi Sosial: Pergolakan Ideologi LSM Indonesia," Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 1996.
- [18] S. Partelow, K. J. Winkler, and G. M. Thaler, "Environmental non-governmental organizations and global environmental discourse," *PLoS One*, vol. 15, no. 5, pp. 12–15, 2020, doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0232945.
- [19] D. Ardhan, S. Adiwibowo, and E. Sri Wahyuni, "Peran Dan Strategi Organisasi Non Pemerintah Dalam Arena Politik Lingkungan Hidup," *Sodality J. Sociol. Pedesaan*, vol. 4, no. 3, 2016, doi: 10.22500/sodality.v4i3.14429.
- [20] P. R. Jepson, "Governance and Accountability of Environmental NGOs," no. *Environmental Science & Policy* 8(5):515-524, 2005.
- [21] M. A. Dr.H. Abdul Manah, *Penelitian Pnedidikan Pendekatan Kualitatif*. Depok, Yogyakarta: KALIMEDIA, 2005.
- [22] M. R. M. T. Lauder, U. B. Nusantara, and M. R. M. T. Lauder, "Makara Human Behavior Studies in Asia," vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 37–44, 2002.
- [23] I. L. Douglas, "TheJakartaPost," no. Retrieved from Wildlife trafficking needs to be a policy priority in Asia Pacific before it is too late: <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/06/06/wildlife-trafficking-needs-to-be-a-policy-priority-in-asia-pacific-before-it-is-too-late.html>, 2016.
- [24] U. Wirawan, "BERITA SATU," no. Retrieved from Filipina Bongkar Penyelundupan 1.500 Kura-kura Langka: <https://www.beritasatu.com/dunia/541536/filipina-bongkar-penyelundupan-1500-kurakura-langka>, 2019.
- [25] U. . D. of. State, "2018 END Wildlife Trafficking Report. Washington, DC: U.S. Departmen of State," no. Retrieved from 2018 END Wildlife Trafficking Report: <https://www.state.gov/remarks-and-releases-bureau-of-oceans-and-international-environmental-and-scientific-affairs/2018-end-wildlife-trafficking-report/>, 2018.
- [26] L. Gomez, "An update on the bear bile trade in Peninsular Malaysia," no. October, p. 22, 2019.
- [27] Burgess G. et al., "Reducing Demand for Illegal Wildlife Products," *Conserv. Biol.*, vol. 33, no. 3, pp. 623–633, 2018.
- [28] K. Indraswari, B. T. C. Leupen, and D. T. Minh, A Snapshot of the Online Ivory Trade in Indonesia, Thailand, and Viet Nam in 2016 with an Update in 2019, no. July. 2020.