

The Research on Social Security Satisfaction and Determinants of the Foreigners in China: Based on Descriptive Statistics and Gologit Model

Liling Feng¹ Xiaoqin Wang^{1,*} Yu Yang¹ Yue Fei¹

¹Department of Economics and Management, China Jiliang University, Hangzhou, Zhejiang

*Corresponding author. Email: 13486112209@163.com

ABSTRACT

To further protect the social rights of the foreigners, we analyzed the social security satisfaction level and determinants based on descriptive statistics and gologit model, using the first-hand data collected by qualitative interviews and questionnaires in Yiwu city. The results showed that the foreigners hold a positive evaluation of social insurance in general, where 54.10% were very satisfied and 29.48% were relatively satisfied. The male and those who are not living alone were more satisfied. Foreigners who have a better understanding of related policies and those who don't have a double burden of payment were more satisfied. Therefore, this paper proposes to continue to publicize the relevant policies and regulations, to promote the experience of Yiwu and other initiatives.

Keywords: social security, foreigner, satisfaction, determinant

1. INTRODUCTION

Many migrant-receiving developed countries and regions, such as Europe, North America and Japan, have early incorporated the transnational employed population into the overall framework of the social security system, and most of them implement the social security system which is integrated with the residents of their own country (region) after certain conditions are met. So, there are a lot of literatures about the social security of transnational employment population abroad. Judging from the existing literature, most foreign scholars or research institutions (Vincenzo, 2001; Stephen Castles, 2004; Sarah Thomson and Elias Mossialos, 2007; Edward Tamagno, 2008; Andy Hall, 2012; Eleanor Brooks, 2012; Christine Brickenstein, 2015; Federico Benassi and Ricardo Iglesias-Pascual and Luca Salvati, 2020; Dutta Anwesha and Fischer Harry W, 2021)^{[1]-[8]} discusses how to bring the transnational employed population into the framework of social security system and public protection policy from the aspects of welfare equity and labor protection. Of course, there are significant differences in protecting social rights between "north-north" and "north-south" migration in host countries like Europe and the United States (Holzmann and Koettl, 2005)^[9] and "south-south"

migration in host countries of developing countries (Avato and Koettl, 2009).^[10] Avato and Koettl consider that bilateral or multilateral social security agreements applied between developed countries or regions cannot be directly applied to low-income areas with less developed economies.

From the experience of social security for foreigners, Yu Shuhong and Zheng Hao (2019)^[11] believe that compared with developed countries such as the European Union, China is still at the initial stage, there are some shortages about the social security bilateral agreement, such as single cooperative insurance, narrow beneficiary group, lack of "accumulative calculation clause" and limited coverage of country, etc. Xie Yongcai and Wang Maofu (2018)^[12] think that the foreigners' social security dilemma also includes slow development process, bad implementation effect. Of course, the narrow social security coverage has its practical obstacles, such as the migration characteristics, work characteristics and difficulties in the implementation of international cooperation agreements (Yin Baoming, 2019).^[13] Legally speaking, there is a lack of a working law for foreigners in China (Liu Guofu, 2011).^[14] All the above studies explore the issue of social security of foreigners, but there is no micro analysis to specific regions.

As the largest small commodity wholesale and trade market in the world, Yiwu has attracted a large number of foreigners since 2000. Did these foreigners get “National treatment” and how satisfied they are with the local social security policy? This paper intends to fill the gaps in the related research fields as a basis of further research.

2. QUESTIONNAIRE DESIGN AND RESEARCH METHODS

2.1. Investigation background and questionnaire design

On September 18, 2018, Yiwu took the lead in exploring the extension method of work permit for foreigners from small and micro business enterprises in the whole province, and issued the “Detailed rules for pilot implementation of work permit for foreigners from small and micro businesses in Yiwu”. It requires that foreigners who later apply for their permit have to buy social insurance. According to the survey statistics, Yiwu has a full social insurance coverage for foreigners with residence permits. The payment standard is roughly divided into three categories: 600 RMB per person for the third category, 800 RMB for the second category and 1,050 RMB per person for the first category.

The survey, from November 2020 to January 2021, focused on Yiwu’s Social Security Bureau, Immigration

Service Companies, foreign chambers of commerce and the foreigners. The questionnaire mainly includes the personal basic information of foreigners, the situation of buying social insurance in China and home country, the cognition of Chinese social insurance, and the evaluation of Yiwu’s government service and business environment. It is available in English and Chinese. A total of 22 questions were designed and 329 valid questionnaires were returned.

2.2. Research methods

In this paper, we used qualitative interviews and questionnaires to collect first-hand data of the foreigners in Yiwu. Firstly, this paper analyzes the social security level of foreigners through sorting out the characteristics. Then, we explore the relationships with social security satisfaction through some classification variables such as demographic characteristics, socio-economic status and so on. Lastly, we discuss several measures in the integration about the foreigners and local society.

The questionnaire asked the foreigners for their overall evaluation of social security, including very satisfied, relatively satisfied and relatively dissatisfied options. The satisfaction of foreigners is finally an ordinal dependent variable of grade 3 (1=less satisfied(1LS), 2=relatively satisfied(2RS), 3=very satisfied(3VS)). Based on the questionnaire, the main explanatory variables of this study are as follows (Table 1)

Table 1: The evaluation of determinants for the social security satisfaction of the foreigners in Yiwu

Explanatory variables	Evaluation
Demographic characteristics	
Age (measured in years)	1=less than 30; 2=30~45; 3=45~60; 4=greater than or equal to 60
Sex	1=male; 0=female
State	1=Asia; 2=Africa; 3=Europe; 4=South America; 5=North America
Religion (religious belief)	1=Christianity; 2=Catholicism; 3=Islam; 4=Buddhism; 5=Atheist
Socioeconomic status	
Edu (education level)	1= High School and below; 2= Junior College; 3= Bachelor; 4= Postgraduate and above
Yincome (annual income)	1=low-middle-income; 2=middle and upper-income; 3= high-income
Live (living arrangement)	1=alone; 2= with family from motherland; 3= with friends; 4= with Chinese spouse
Time (duration of stay in China; measured in years)	1=less than 1; 2=1~3; 3=3~5; 4=greater than 5
Social insurance	
Pay (double payment)	1= yes; 0=no
Info (degree of understanding the policy)	1=little; 2=partly; 3=deeply
Benefit (treatment enjoyed)	1=yes; 0=no

3. ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONNAIRE SURVEY RESULTS

3.1. Basic characteristics of the sample

Among the foreign respondents, 178(54.10%) were very satisfied. 97(29.48%) were relatively satisfied and

54(16.41%) were less satisfied (see Table 2). 88.15% were male. 51.67% were aged 30-45. 63.50% were from Asian countries and 78.42% were Muslim. From the above information, we can see that Asians who believe in Islam account for a relatively high proportion of foreigners. Middle-aged men are in the majority. In terms of the socioeconomic, 60.18% high educational foreigners show that the Yiwu government has done well in its strategy of attracting foreign talent. Living alone

accounted for 57.85%. Only 8.21% of foreigners married Chinese. It shows that foreign groups have a relatively independent life circle. The annual income from low to high accounts for 49.24%, 21.28% and 29.48% respectively. The low-middle-income takes over high proportion due to the impact of COVID-19 on international trade among them. A large number of foreign businessmen complained that in the survey, but some said it has little impact on their business. Among the foreigners surveyed, 55.32% have lived in China for

more than five years, which also reflects the restrictions on entry-exit personnel under the epidemic situation. Among the relevant factors of social insurance, 51.06% of them had a double burden of payment, 55.02% of them knew little about the Interim Measures for Participating in Social Insurance for Foreigners in China (hereinafter referred to as the Interim Measures), and 55.93% of them don't have enjoyed the relevant treatment. On the whole, the foreigners hold a positive evaluation of social security.

Table2: The characteristics and bivariate analysis for foreigners in Yiwu (n, %)

	Total	1LS	2RS	3VS
Demographic characteristics				
Sex	329(100.00)			
male	290(88.15)	48(16.55)	79(27.24)	163(56.21)
female	39(11.85)	6 (15.38)	18(46.15)	15(38.46)
Age (years old)	329(100.00)			
<30	130(39.51)	25(19.23)	39(30.00)	66(50.77)
30~45	170(51.67)	27(15.88)	46(27.06)	97(57.06)
46~60	25(7.60)	2(8.00)	9(36.00)	14(56.00)
>60	4(1.22)	0(0.00)	3(75.00)	1(25.00)
State	326(100.00)			
Asia	207(63.50)	39(18.84)	50(24.15)	118(57.00)
Africa	64(19.63)	11(17.19)	21(32.81)	32(50.00)
Europe	41(12.58)	2(4.88)	24(58.54)	15(36.59)
South America	11(3.37)	1(9.09)	1(9.09)	9(81.82)
North America	3(0.92)	1(33.33)	1(33.33)	1(33.33)
Religion	329(100.00)			
Christianity	33(10.03)	1(3.03)	16(48.48)	16(48.48)
Catholicism	7(2.13)	0(0.00)	2(28.57)	5(71.43)
Islam	258(78.42)	35(13.57)	71(27.52)	142(55.04)
Buddhism	2(0.61)	1(50.00)	0(0.00)	1(50.00)
Atheist	29(8.81)	7(24.14)	8(27.59)	14(48.28)
Socioeconomic status				
Edu	329(100.00)			
High School & below	100(30.40)	16(16.00)	27(27.00)	57(57.00)
Junior College	31(9.42)	7(22.58)	9(29.03)	15(48.39)
Bachelor	161(48.94)	27(16.77)	48(29.81)	86(53.42)
Postgraduate & above	37(11.24)	4(10.81)	13(35.14)	20(54.05)
Yincome	329(100.00)			
low-middle-income	162(49.24)	28(17.28)	47(29.01)	87(53.70)
middle & upper-income	70(21.28)	11(15.71)	20(28.57)	39(55.71)
high-income	97(29.48)	15(15.46)	30(30.93)	52(55.67)
Live	329(100.00)			
alone	190(57.75)	29(15.26)	64(33.68)	97(51.05)
with family of homeland	75(22.80)	18(24.00)	19(25.33)	38(50.67)
with friends	37(11.25)	4(10.81)	8(21.62)	25(67.57)
with Chinese spouse	27(8.21)	3(11.11)	6(22.22)	18(66.67)
Time	329(100.00)			
<1year	12(3.65)	1(8.33)	4(33.33)	7(58.33)
1~3years	69(20.97)	9(13.04)	22(31.88)	38(55.07)
3~5years	66(20.06)	11(16.67)	20(30.30)	35(53.03)
>5years	182(55.32)	33(18.13)	51(28.02)	98(53.85)
Social insurance				
Pay**	329(100.00)			
yes	168(51.06)	30(17.86)	59(35.12)	79(47.02)
no	161(48.94)	24(14.91)	38(23.60)	99(61.49)
Info**	329(100.00)			
Little	181(55.02)	36(19.89)	56(30.94)	89(49.17)
partly	103(31.31)	16(15.53)	29(28.16)	58(56.31)
very	45(13.68)	2(4.44)	12(26.67)	31(68.89)
Benefit	329(100.00)			
yes	145(44.07)	28(19.31)	44(30.34)	73(50.34)
no	184(55.93)	26(14.13)	53(28.80)	105(57.07)

* $p < 0.1$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

3.2. Social security satisfaction determinants of the foreigners

First of all, from the sample characteristics (Table 2), it can be preliminarily seen that females were more conservative than males in the evaluation of satisfaction, with 56.21% of males choosing "very satisfied" and 46.15% of females choosing "relatively satisfied". It can be seen that women express a stronger desire to seek better protection of their social rights. It is relatively large that the proportion of young people expressed dissatisfaction with social security. 19.23% were under the age of 30, i.e., one out of five people expressed the intention of dissatisfaction. Reasonable explanations can be made for the choice of young people considering their healthy body and low demand for security. In addition, 24% of foreigners living with their family of home country expressed dissatisfaction. This higher proportion reflects that the foreigners accompanied by relatives will face more social security problems and also have a stronger desire to seek social security. As can be seen from the duration of stay in China, the longer you stay in China, the less satisfied you are with China's social security. Those who did not have a double burden of payment and those who were more familiar with China's relevant policies both showed high satisfaction. Foreigners who have not enjoyed social insurance treatments showed high satisfaction.

3.2.1. Bivariate analysis with social security satisfaction

Bivariate analysis measures the correlation between two variables without considering the influence of other variables. The results show that there is no correlation among the demographic characteristics, socioeconomic status, and social security satisfaction. However, double payment dilemma has a significant effect on satisfaction ($p < 0.05$) (Table 2). At the same time, the degree of understanding the policy was closely related to the degree of satisfaction with social insurance ($p < 0.01$)

3.2.2. Generalized Ordered Logit (gologit) Estimates

The gologit model can be written as

$$P(Y_i > j) = g(X_i \beta_j) = \frac{\exp(\alpha_j + X_i \beta_j)}{1 + \{\exp(\alpha_j + X_i \beta_j)\}}, j = 1, 2, \dots, M-1 \quad (1)$$

where Y_i is evaluation level of social security satisfaction for the i th foreigner; X_i is a p -dimensional vector, showing the values of combination of p explanatory variables in the i th foreigner's evaluation about satisfaction; β_i is also a p -dimensional vector, showing the regression coefficient of each explanatory

variable; $P(Y_i > j)$ shows the probability that the evaluation level is greater than j ; M is the number of categories of the satisfaction.

Some well-known models are special cases of the gologit model; e.g., the parallel-lines model fitted by ologit. It requires β 's is the same for all values of j . A key problem with the parallel-lines model is that its assumptions are often violated. Another special case of the gologit model overcomes these limitations. In the partial proportional odds model(gologit2), some of the β coefficients can be the same for all values of j , while others can differ. So, formula (1) can be written as

$$P(Y_i > j) = g(X_i \beta_j) = \frac{\exp(\alpha_j + X_{1i} \beta_j + X_{2i} \beta_j + \dots + X_{Mi} \beta_j)}{1 + \exp(\alpha_j + X_{1i} \beta_j + X_{2i} \beta_j + \dots + X_{Mi} \beta_j)}, j = 1, 2, \dots, M-1 \quad (2)$$

where X_{Mi} is a q -dimensional vector($q \leq p$), showing the values of q variables of p explanatory variables change with j in the i th foreigner's evaluation about satisfaction.

From the above, it can be determined that the probabilities that Y will take on each of the values 1, ..., M are equal to

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y_i = 1) &= 1 - g(X_i \beta_1) \\ P(Y_i = j) &= g(X_i \beta_{j-1}) - g(X_i \beta_j) \quad j = 2, \dots, M-1 \\ P(Y_i = M) &= g(X_i \beta_{M-1}) \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

The gologit2 results yield in Table 3. The first panel contrasts category 3 with categories 1, 2; the second panel contrasts categories 3 and 2 with category 1. Hence, odds ratio >1 indicate that higher values on the explanatory variable make it more likely that the respondent will be in a higher category of Y than the current one, whereas odds ratio <1 indicate that higher values on the explanatory variable increase the likelihood of being in the current or a lower category. Let's take the age variable in Model 1 as an example,

Older(age=4) and younger(age=1):

Odds (very satisfied)/Odds (relatively satisfied+ less satisfied)=1.443

Odds (very satisfied+ relatively satisfied)/Odds (less satisfied)=0.992

It means that older group were 1.443 times more likely to express "very satisfied" than "relatively satisfied + less satisfied"(95% CI: 0.916,2.273), while 0.992 times more likely to express "very satisfied + relatively satisfied" than "less satisfied" (95% CI: 0.709,1.389).

Similarly, men were more likely to be very satisfied and relatively satisfied with their social security than women($p<0.1$). From the data in the Table 3, we can see that the parameter estimations of model 2 and model 3 are the same. These results are relatively straightforward, intuitive, and easy to interpret. Those with higher education and those that are longer residence in China were less satisfied with social security. Those with higher

income and those who are not living alone were more satisfied with social security ($p < 0.1$). Those who have a double burden of payment were less satisfied with social security ($p < 0.05$), and those who know more about social security policies were more satisfied ($p < 0.01$). This is also consistent with the bivariate analysis in Table 2. Then, the variables of demographic characteristics and socioeconomic status remained stable when three types of factors were included in model 4. Both the situation of double payment and the degree of understanding the policy are related to the evaluation of satisfaction, in

which double payment is negatively related to the satisfaction, and policy understanding is positively related to the satisfaction.

Overall, the correlation of social security satisfaction with individual variables in demographic characteristics and socioeconomic status can be significantly explained at the level of $p < 0.1$. The relationships between age, state, income and satisfaction are not statistically significant, but the trend is basically the same as that shown in Table 2. The two variables of social insurance have the most significant effect on the satisfaction.

Table3: The logit of determinants for the social security satisfaction of the foreigners in Yiwu (OR and 95% CI)

	model (1)	model (2)	model (3)	model (4)
1LS				
Age	1.443 [0.916,2.273]			1.428 [0.840,2.428]
Sex	1.314 [0.481,3.589]			1.231 [0.416,3.648]
State	1.414 [0.920,2.173]			1.445 [0.927,2.253]
Religion	0.654** [0.467,0.917]			0.626** [0.424,0.923]
Edu		0.949 [0.773,1.165]	0.889 [0.720,1.098]	0.983 [0.720,1.340]
Yincome		1.043 [0.811,1.342]	1.070 [0.826,1.385]	1.186 [0.803,1.754]
Live		1.238* [0.988,1.552]	1.225* [0.971,1.547]	0.920 [0.657,1.289]
Time		0.898 [0.707,1.141]	0.868 [0.679,1.108]	0.755 [0.526,1.085]
Pay			0.589** [0.376,0.922]	1.013 [0.535,1.920]
Info			1.619*** [1.179,2.224]	1.833** [1.096,3.068]
Benefit			0.734 [0.465,1.159]	0.678 [0.340,1.354]
2RS				
Age	0.992 [0.709,1.389]			0.893 [0.614,1.298]
Sex	2.016* [0.932,4.359]			2.267** [1.016,5.060]
State	0.901 [0.672,1.208]			0.985 [0.725,1.340]
Religion	0.857 [0.654,1.124]			0.949 [0.712,1.264]
Edu		0.949 [0.773,1.165]	0.889 [0.720,1.098]	0.840 [0.671,1.053]
Yincome		1.043 [0.811,1.342]	1.070 [0.826,1.385]	0.981 [0.742,1.297]
Live		1.238* [0.988,1.552]	1.225* [0.971,1.547]	1.320** [1.031,1.691]
Time		0.898 [0.707,1.141]	0.868 [0.679,1.108]	0.906 [0.695,1.181]
Pay			0.589** [0.376,0.922]	0.518*** [0.321,0.837]
Info			1.619*** [1.179,2.224]	1.547** [1.091,2.192]
Benefit			0.734 [0.465,1.159]	0.710 [0.432,1.164]
N	326.000	329.000	329.000	326.000
Pseudo R2	0.0326	0.0063	0.0317	0.0787

Reference class in parentheses, * $p < 0.1$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

4. CONCLUSIONS

4.1. Conclusions

4.1.1. *The overall satisfaction of the foreigners to the social security is higher*

The male and those who are not living alone were more satisfied. The foreigners who have a better understanding of related policies and those who don't have a double burden of payment were more satisfied. From the results, the satisfaction level of the foreigners to the social security is 83.58%, which partly reflects the remarkable effect of the Yiwu government in serving the foreigners. This positive feedback not only shows the tolerance of the foreigners in China, it also potentially shows that foreigners like Chinese society. In addition, 51.05% of the foreigners in Yiwu is facing double payment, which means half of the foreigners is suffering from it.

4.1.2. *A positive correlation between the understanding of relevant policy and social security satisfaction*

The deeper understanding of policy, the higher satisfaction of social security. When asked about the Interim Measures, 55.02% of the people said they didn't understand it, and only 13.68% knew it very well. Some businessmen said that they would ask professional companies to follow up the related business. While some foreigners do not meet the conditions of enjoying owing to payment records of interruption.

The foreigners do not pay enough attention to their own social security rights, and also do not have a clear definition of their obligation to pay social insurance. This indifference attitude will not only make themselves lose rights, also lose the motivation to deeply integrate with the local society. Moreover, when the government carries out relevant work without corresponding feedback, many problems will be shelved because of the lag of laws and the inertia of reform. So, the Yiwu government still need to do more propaganda work for foreigners.

4.1.3. *Foreigners who have not enjoyed social insurance treatments show high satisfaction*

From the result, foreigners who have not enjoyed social insurance treatments were more satisfied. Most of the foreigners engaged in cross-border trade are required to buy social insurance according to Yiwu's law. But they have little or no treatment due to the high frequency of entry and exit. Even so, it's more important that buying social insurance can make their company to

operate legally, and many works can be carried out normally and smoothly.

4.2. Yiwu experience

Looking back, it was the first time in China that Yiwu was authorized to directly apply for foreigners' visas and residence permits in 2005. Since then, the registered number of foreigners coming to Yiwu has reached more than 500,000 each year. In 2012, on the basis of the Regulations on the Administration of Foreigners' Employment issued in 1996, Yiwu actively innovated the contents and ways of employment services for foreigners. In 2018, Yiwu actively implemented the interim measures of "one window handling, one step handling" to solve the problem of difficulty in obtaining licenses. In 2019, the conditions for applying for a five-year work residence permit were relaxed. In 2020, the online operation process of "One Thing" involving foreign companies will be established and put into trial operation.

As mentioned above, 83.58% of the foreigners in Yiwu were satisfied with social security, while the satisfaction to the local government service was 98.78%, higher than the proportion of social security. That means the Yiwu government shows resourcefulness in attracting and retaining the foreigners, but she need to do much more to improve the social security system for foreigners in the future.

Fund Project

Major Advantages of Philosophy and Social Sciences in Zhejiang Province "From 'Old Before Rich' to 'Rich and Fast Old': Multi-state prediction and Pension Policy Simulation Research of Aging Chinese Population (2018-2070) "(19YSXK03ZD); Major Natural Science Foundation of Zhejiang Province Project" Turning Crisis to Machine: Monitoring and Early Warning and Public Health Strategy System Simulation under the Background of Coronavirus Global pandemic " (LD21G030001)

REFERENCES

- [1]Vincenzo. Portability of Supplementary Pension Rights in the European Union, International Social Security Review, General Secretariat of the I.S.S.A., Geneva, Switzerland, 2001(4):54. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-246X.00085>
- [2]S. Castles, The Factors that Make and Unmake Migration Policies, International Migration Review, Wiley-Blackwell, New Jersey, US, vol. 38, 2004, pp. 852–884. Stephen Castles (2004).

- DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2004.tb00222.x>
- [3] S. Thomson and E. Mossialos, *Regulating Private Health Insurance in the European Union: The Implications of Single Market Legislation and Competition Policy*, Journal of European Integration, Taylor and Francis Online, vol. 29, 2007, pp. 89–107. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/07036330601144490>
- [4] E. Tamagno, *Strengthening social protection for ASEAN migrant workers through social security agreements*. ILO Asian Regional Programme on Governance of Labour Migration, Bangkok, Thailand, 2008, pp. 134.
- [5] E. Brooks, *Crossing borders: A critical review of the role of the European Court of Justice in EU health policy*, Health Policy, Elsevier, Amsterdam, Netherlands, vol. 105, 2012, pp. 33–37. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthpol.2011.12.004>
- [6] C. Brickenstein, *Social protection of foreign seasonal workers: from state to best practice*, CMS, Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg, vol. 3, 2015, pp. 2. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40878-015-0004-9>
- [7] F. Benassi, R. Iglesias-Pascual, and L. Salvati, *Residential segregation and social diversification: Exploring spatial settlement patterns of foreign population in Southern European cities*, Habitat International, Butterworth-Heinemann Elsevier Ltd, Oxford, United Kingdom, vol. 101, 2020, pp. 102–200. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2020.102200>
- [8] A. Dutta and H. W. Fischer, *The local governance of COVID-19: Disease prevention and social security in rural India*, World Development, Butterworth-Heinemann Elsevier Ltd, Oxford, United Kingdom, vol. 138, 2021, pp. 105–234. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105234>
- [9] R. Holzmann, J. Koettl, and T. Chernetsky, *Portability regimes of pension and health care benefits for international migrants: an analysis of issues and good practices*, The World Bank, 2005, pp. 80.
- [10] J. Avato, J. Koettl, and R. Sabates-Wheeler, *Social Security Regimes, Global Estimates, and Good Practices: The Status of Social Protection for International Migrants*, World Development, Butterworth-Heinemann Elsevier Ltd, Oxford, United Kingdom, vol. 38, 2010, pp. 455–466. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2009.10.003>
- [11] S.H. Yu, and H. Zheng, *The Development, Problems and Solutions of Bilateral Cooperation on Social Security in China*, Wuhan University Review of International Law, WDP, Wuhan, China, vol. 3, 2019, pp. 23–40. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.13871/j.cnki.whuilr.2019.05.003>
- [12] Y.C. Xie, and M.F. Wang, *The Main Difficulties and Countermeasures of Bilateral Cooperation of Social Security in China*, China Soft Science, CSSM, Beijing, China, vol. 32, 2018, pp. 49–62.
- [13] B.M. Yin, *Realizing the full coverage of social security of transnational migrant population*, China Labor, CLM, Beijing, China, vol. 69, 2019, pp. 20–36. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.19390/j.cnki.chinalabor.2019.05.002>
- [14] G.F. Liu, *On Immigration Integration System: From the Perspective of Legal Issues of Immigrants' Integration into China*, Pacific Journal, PJM, Beijing, China, vol. 19, 2011, pp. 63–75. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14015/j.cnki.1004-8049.2011.07.010>