Textual Research on Madam Huarui in the Late Shu

Xin Yue

School of Humanities, Southwestern University of Finance and Economics, Wenjiang District, Chengdu, Sichuan province, China
* 2382617253@qq.com

ABSTRACT

In the process of study, the author doubts about whether the experience of Concubine Xu (Fei), the concubine of the Lord in the late Shu, Mengchang, is real or not. Therefore, on the basis of previous studies and combined with historical materials, this paper combs the development process of the legendary deeds gradually added from the possible interpersonal relationships, historical events, characters and spiritual qualities of Madam Huarui in the late Shu. Finally, the research found that there was no so-called legendary experience of Madam Huarui of the late Shu in history, and her life story was fabricated by later generations.

Keywords: Madam Huarui, Concubine Xu, palace poems, the late Shu

1. INTRODUCTION

At present, it is recognized that there were three Madams Huarui in the five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms period, namely, concubine Xu of the former Shu emperor Wang Jian, concubine Xu of the late Shu Emperor Mengchang, and younger concubine Huarui of the Later Tang Dynasty emperor Li Yu. Since the Northern Song Dynasty, the concubine of Mengchang, the emperor of the Later Shu Dynasty, is generally considered to be "Madam Huarui", the poet of the palace words. In 1946, Mr. Pu Jiangqing made comprehensive textual research on Madam Huarui's palace words, and concluded that the author should be Concubine Xu in the former Shu.

But there is almost no record of Madam Huarui of the late Shu state in official history. However, there are more and more materials related to her in later generations. Her story became more legendary and varied, inconsistent and illogical. And she is often confused with the younger Concubine Xu in the former Shu, but in fact, the history materials of the younger Concubine Xu is far more detailed and clear than the late Shu Madam Huarui. This paper will analyze the related historical records of Madam Huarui in detail from the perspectives of interpersonal relationship, character and historical background.

2. IN HISTORY, THE RECORDS OF MADAM HUARUI IN THE LATE SHU ARE SKETCHY

Since the Northern Song Dynasty, it is widely believed that the concubine of Mengchang, the emperor of the Later Shu Dynasty, was the creator of palace poems. During the Five Dynasties period, the economy and culture of Shu were prosperous, and there are many records about it in history. After consulting the historical data, we can find a lot of information about Mengchang.

It is recorded in Volume 136 of The History of the Old Five Dynasties:

"Chang, the third son of Zhixiang. His mother, Li, was a concubine of Li Cunxu, emperor of the Later Tang Dynasty. She was given to Meng Zhixiang. Tang Tianyou sixteen years, Meng Chang was born in Taiyuan......In the spring of Qiande three year, The troops of the imperial court pacified the land of Shu, ordered the Mengchang's whole clansmen to the imperial palace, and granted him a residence in the capital. They gave rich rewards to his subordinates, and soon conferred the title of King of Chu on him. In the autumn of that year, he died in Bianjing at the age of forty-seven."[1]

It can be seen that the history not only recorded the existence of Mengchang himself, but also recorded detailed information about his place of birth, family rank, mother's identity, interpersonal relationship and time of death.
In the fifth year of Jiayou in the Northern Song Dynasty, Ouyang Xiu rebuilt the history of the Five Dynasties and wrote the New History of the Five Dynasties, which is described in Volume 64:

"After Meng Chang reached Bianliang, he was honored as The Duke of Qin and Jian Jiao official. Serving as the head of The secretariat. He died seven days after his ordination, then he was proclaimed king of Chu. His mother, Ms.Li, makes a clear distinction between right and wrong, and was treated well. The imperial edict called her the mother of the state. Once Zhao Kuangyin summoned her and said: 'Mother you are a self-respecting person, not too sad because of missing The kingdom of Shu, one day should send you home. 'Li said: ' My hometown is Taiyuan. It would be my greatest wish to return to my hometown when I am old. 'At this time Liu Jun was still alive. Zhao Kuangyin was very happy and said: 'After defeating Liu Jun, the mother's wish can be satisfied.' When Mengchang died, Li did not cry, but sprinkled wine on the ground and prayed: 'You cannot die for your country, greedy life to now. The only reason I don't want to die because you're still alive. Now you are dead, I live what is the meaning of?' So she fasted and died."[2]

This is the description of the situation after Meng Chang surrendered to the Song. However, if it is true that madam Huarui in late Shu entered the Song Dynasty, which has been widely known, it should be recorded in this book. However, it can be found that there is no record of this legend or even Madam Huarui in the late Shu.

In contrast, the former Shu emperor Wang Jian and his two important concubines, former Shu Concubine Xu and little Concubine Xu, are recorded in detail. In the Later Shu Period, He Guangyuan wrote in Precepts volume 5:

"During the former Shu Period, Xu Geng had two daughters who were very beautiful. Taizu (Wang Jian) is looking for beauty, but he did not know that Xu Geng had two daughters. Xu geng painted portraits for his daughters to charm Taizu. Taizu took them into his harem, and they all gave birth to sons. The elder sister was called Yi Sheng Taifei and gave birth to King Peng (Zong Ding). Her sister was called the Shun Sheng Taihou, and she gave birth to Zongyan."[3]

He Guangyuan, like former Shu concubine Xu, lived in the Five Dynasties, and his accounts have relatively high credibility. This section on concubine Xu's family relations, the reason for entering the palace, the title in the royal court, the circumstances of the children are more detailed description. In addition, He Guangyuan recorded eight poems written by concubine Xu, which all show superb creative level and can be used as circumstantial evidence of concubine Xu's writing of palace poems.

Ouyang Xiu in the Song Dynasty recorded the history of the former Shu in detail in the History of the New Five Dynasties. The History of the New Five Dynasties is the only private revisionist history after the Tang and Song dynasties, which plays a very important role in the history of Chinese historiography, especially after the Tang and Song dynasties. In the history of the New Five dynasties, the accounts of concubine Xu's entry into court, heirs, titles and deaths are as follows:

"In wang Jian's later years, there were many concubines in his harem. concubine xian and her sister concubine Shu were all spoiled for their beauty."

"Wang Zongyan was the youngest son. His mother was Concubine Xu, and because her mother was in favor, he was appointed crown Prince."

"Wang Yan honored her mother Xu as the Empress Dowager, and her sister concubine Shu as the Imperial Consort."

"In the Apirl of Tongguang four year, when they got to the Qin Chuan Yi, Zhuang Zong of the Later Tang Dynasty took Jing Jin's advice and sent eenuch Xiang Yansi to kill Wang Yan and his clan. Before the execution, Wang Yan's mother Xu shouted, "My son came to surrender as a nation, but he was killed. Your faith and loyalty have been abandoned. I feel that your calamity will soon follow! " Wang Yan's concubine Liu , was a beautiful woman with hair like clouds on her temples. The executioner planned to pardon her, but she said, "I would rather die than be insulted. Then die at ease."

In addition, the history of Shu, written by Zhang Tangying in the fourth year of The Reign of Emperor Zhiping of The Northern Song Dynasty, contains the following information about concubine Xu's father's name, place of residence, education methods, economic status, anecdotes, history of entering The palace, children and heirs, and position in The palace:

"Xu Geng, from Chengdu. He had two daughters, both of them were beautiful. Xu Geng taught them to read and recite poems, and they had the talent to write articles. Xu Geng's family was very poor. A physiognomist said to him, 'You will be successful and rich in a short time. 'Xu Geng asked him to physiognomize his two daughters. The physiognomist said, 'Mount Qingcheng has a king's spirit, and it has been stirring for 12 years. Within ten years, there will be a king, and your two daughters will be queens. Your rise will be the result of your two daughters. 'When Wang Jian entered the city, hearing that Xu Geng's daughters were beautiful, so he took them into his harem. The elder sister gave birth to Zong Ding, and the younger sister gave birth to Zong Yan. After wang Jian ascended the throne, he made the elder sister concubine Shu, the younger sister concubine, and Xu Geng Piao qi general. After wang Yan ascended to the throne. He conferred imperial concubine the title of Empress Dowager Shun Sheng and Concubine Shu the title of Empress Dowager..."
Yi Sheng. Their elder brother Yanqiong and younger brother Yangui were both serving as imperial Taishi Shizhong. Wang Yan was addicted to drunkenness, and the Xu sisters each had their own favorite courtiers. It was their fault that they could not persuade the emperor to correct mistakes, which eventually led to the ruin of the state.\(^{[6]}\)

Zhang Tangying was gifted in historiography. He kept more than 100 volumes of shu history books at home and wrote many books. His The History of Shu, which identifies and demonstrates the errors of many different historical accounts, is of great reference value. The book was written only a hundred years before the fall of the Later Shu Dynasty, and the materials it is based on are reliable, which are indispensable historical materials for governing the local history of Sichuan, especially the history of the former and the Later Shu Dynasty. The History of Shu corrects The mistake of Ouyang Xiu in The New History of The Five Dynasties in mistaking Concubine Xu as Concubine Xian and The biological mother of Wang Yan. Other events related to Mengchang in The Book are roughly The same as those in The New History of The Five Dynasties, and do not include The legendary concubine of Mengchang, Madam Huarui.

In summary, Madam Huarui in the former Shu, Concubine Xu in the former Shu, Meng Chang, Wang Jian and others have detailed records, But this Madam Huarui in the late Shu is difficult to find the corresponding historical evidence. Even though she is rumored to be the concubine of Mengchang, the descriptions in historical documents of mengchang's life are mostly about his mother Li and concubine Liu, and there is no record of his concubine Madam Huarui.

3. THE EVOLUTION OF THE LEGEND OF MADAM HUARUI IN THE LATE SHU

The first record of Madam Huarui's palace poems can be seen in Xu Xiang Mountain Ye Lu written by the monk poet Wen Ying in the Song Dynasty:

The Recording of the Xiang Mountain·Madam Huarui's Palace Poems can be seen in The Song Dynasty's Shu Wenying's Xu Xiang Mountain Ye Lu ·Madam Huarui's Gong Ci:

"Wang Pingfu (Wang Anguo) ordered li Xiyuan to dispose of the books donated by the shu, Chu and Qin. Many of these books were stripped, and two pieces of paper were written with Madam Huarui's poems. The handwriting on them was written by Madam Huarui, and the content was also peculiar, which was no different from wang Jian's poems. Wang Jian's poems have been recited since the Tang Dynasty, but only these poems have been left unread. Also ordered Sanxia to write, and then cancelled, it is a pity. Then ordered the historian Guo Xiang to write it out in the Sanguan. After returning home, Wang Anguo recited several poems to Jing Gong (Wang Anshi), Jing Gong talked about it the next day, And Wang Gui and Feng Jingtai were willing to recite these poems, so they became popular."\(^{[5]}\)

The book only describes the origin and reciting of The palace poems of Madam Huarui, but it does not explain which Madam huarui is the specific one of the three Madam huarui in the Five Dynasties period, and the information in the text is not enough to judge the identity. In addition, Wen Ying also described Meng Chang's death and the martyrdom of his mother Li after he surrendered to the Song dynasty in volume 4 of The Descriptions over A Jade Pot. Similar to Ouyang xiu's account, Wen Ying did not make any indication in the book that palace poems were written by the concubine of Mengchang.

In the Northern Song Dynasty, after Ouyang Xiu wrote Liuyi Poetry Talks, more and more poetry talks appeared. Poetry talks mainly records the anecdotes of poetry, most of them are hearsay, with multifarious content and diverse sources, and it is difficult to distinguish true from false. During the Yuan you period, it began to be said that Madam Huarui's palace poems were written by the concubine of Mengchang, the Lord of the Later Shu Dynasty. In Liu Ban's Zhongshan Poetry Talks, he wrote:

"During the period of Meng Shu, Madam Huarui was said to be able to compose poems, but none of them were circulated. Wang Pingfu got about 80 or 90 of the books in the library, but only about 30 remain, which are very similar to Wang Jian's poems."\(^{[5]}\)

It can be seen that at that time, Liu Ban had taken "Meng Shu" as the creation time of palace Poems and the era of Madam Huarui, the author of Palace Poems.

Not long after that, Chen Shidaos Houshan Poetry Talks further added the surname, hometown, talent and appearance, experience and treatment in the palace, poems and other contents from the hearsay, making the legend of Madam Huarui richer:

"Fei, a native of Qingcheng of Shu, entered the Palace of Shu with her talent and beauty. The emperor loved her very much. She was known as Madam Huarui and wrote one hundred palace poems in imitation of Wang Jian's. After the fall of the state, she was taken into the harem by Taizu. When He heard about her, he called her to compose poems. She recited a poem about the subjugate of the state: 'The flag of surrender was erected on the castle tower of the king of The Later Shu. How am I supposed to know this, locked away in this deserted palace? One hundred and forty thousand soldiers laid down their arms and surrendered, and not one of them was a real man! 'Taizu was very happy. The Shu army numbered about 140,000 while the Song army numbered only tens of thousands.' "\(^{[7]}\)

In fact, in the Southern Song Dynasty, Lu You, a litterateur, historian and poet, had already found plenty of
corrupted and untrue descriptions in Houshan Poetry Talks. There is a suspicious place in this Poetry Talks: Wang Chengzhì, a follower of Prince Li Jiji of Zhuangzong, experienced the collapse of the former Shù and wrote a poem about the surrender of the emperor.

“Shù's foolish monarch came out to surrender, holding jade and sheep to drag the flag. It was a pity that two hundred thousand soldiers surrendered, and there was no real man left.”

The poem in Poetry Talks is very similar to this poem, and it is suspected that the posterity modified wang Chengzhì's poem and attached it to the Madam Huarui in the late Shù, with a view to embellishing and enriching the story of beauty. If this suspicion is true, the image of Madam Huarui in the hearts of the people will be greatly changed.

Tittle- Tattle of the Tiewei Hill was written by Cai Tao in Shaoxing twenty years in the Southern Song Dynasty. This book is the first time in history to put forward the view that there were two Huarui Ladies in Former Shù and Later Shù respectively. It also recorded the story that "Taizong intentionally shot And killed Madame Huarui in the hunting garden", indicating that the death of Madame Huarui in The later Shù was mostly false, because people did not know that there were two Madame Huarui in The Shù state, and they were both killed “:

“Madame Huarui, Concubine of Wang Jian in shu, was later called the Younger Concubine Xu. The elder Concubine Xu gave birth to Wang Yan, and the Younger Concubine Xu was her sister. During Wang Yan's reign, the Xu sisters entertained, feasted and interfered in state affairs, leading to the ruin of the state. After the destruction of Shù, the Xu sisters followed Wang Yan to the Central Plains and were killed on the way. When Meng set up shu again and his son Chang succeeded him to the throne, there was another Madame Huarui, who wrote the palace poems. The late Shù surrendered to Song, and Madam Huarui went with Mengchang to the Central Plains. After about ten days, she was summoned to the palace. At this time mengchang died. Chang Ling later also confused about this, trying to make poison, but there are many times very worried, so cannot succeed. When Zhao Guangyi was still in the palace of Jin. He repeatedly tried to persuade Zhao Kuangyin to get rid of Madam Huarui, but to no avail. One day,Zhao Kuangyin and Zhao Guangyi were hunting in the garden. Madam Huarui also followed them. At that time, Zhao Guangyi adjusted the bow full, people thought he was going to kill the beast, unexpectedly, he suddenly turned his head, shot an arrow at Madam Huarui, and she died. Many of the stories being told are false, because people did not know that there were two Madame Huarui in The Shù state, and they were both killed “ [8]

It can be seen that in all kinds of narration, the deeds and information about Madam Huarui keep increasing, and the character image gradually becomes clear and full.

Shaoxing twenty-seven years, Wu Zeng mentioned in Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai that When Madam Huarui of the later Shù entered the palace, Taizu ordered messengers to escort her:

“Mengchang was the emperor of Shù, Xu Kuangzhang's daughter was sent to Mengchang's harem, was awarded as the imperial concubine, alias Madam Huarui, not only more beautiful than flowers, and especially light and delicate. And title hui Concubine, because the title is in keeping with her character. When the army arrived in Shù, Taizu heard her name and ordered messengers to escort her. On the way she wrote:' On the way to leave the Shù, I felt as if I had broken my heart The glorious spring days seemed to drag on. From time to time around the cuckoo call to urge people to cry. Three thousand maids of honor are beautiful as flowers, and I am the most charming. During this trip to the capital, I am only worried that the emperor's favor will be given to others. ’” [9]

After Meng Chang's mother Li surrendered to the Song Dynasty, she was treated with courtesy by Zhao Kuangyin, the emperor Taizu of the Song Dynasty. Volume IV of the Descriptions over a Jade Pot also gave a detailed account of this:

“"The troops of the Song Dynasty attacked Shù, and Mengchang sent troops to resist. The battle potential has been very nervous, Meng Chang finally ordered Wang Quanbin to surrender. So Mengchang took his mother and officials down the Xijiang river. When he arrived in Jiangling, Song Taizu sent emissaries to reward them generously and to comfort his mother with tea."

According to this, after the emperor of Later Shu surrendered to the Song dynasty, Emperor Taizu of the Song Dynasty did send emissaries to comfort Meng Chang's mother Li and treat her with courtesy. However, there is no historical record that Song Taizu sent a envoy to escort Mengchang's "Concubine Hui". Therefore, it can be seen that Taizhi's request for escort of "Concubine Hui" probably came from the historical events related to Mengchang's mother Li's surrender to the Song Dynasty.

The legend of Madam Huarui in the Late Shu had been roughly completed so far, and all kinds of poems, notes and Poetry talks after the Song Dynasty mostly follow them.

In the Ming Dynasty, the preface written by Wang Anguo appeared in Madam Huarui's Palace Poems (The Ming Wanli period imitated the Song dynasty version). The contents are as follows:

“Xi Ning five years, Wang Pingfu (Wang Anguo) ordered li Xiyan to dispose of the books donated by the Shu, Chu and Qin. Many of these books were stripped, and two pieces of paper were written with Madam Huarui's poems. The handwriting on them was written by
Madam Huarui, and the content was also peculiar, which was no different from Wang Jian's poems. Wang Jian's poems have been recited since the Tang Dynasty, but only these poems have been left unread. It is a pity that this part of the poem has been left out of the San Guan compiled. So Wang Anguo ordered official Guo Xiangshan to write it in the San Guan. After returning home, Wang Anguo recited several poems to Jing Gong (Wang Anshi), Jing Gong talked about them the next day, and Wang Gui and Feng Jing were willing to recite these poems, so they became popular. Huarui, the concubine of Mengchang, the Lord of the late Shu, was recorded in national history. Written by Wang Anguo.

Compared with the original "The Recording of the Xiang Mountain", the title has changed. And there's an extra sentence at the end: "Huarui, the concubine of Mengchang, the Lord of the late Shu, was recorded in national history. Written by Wang Anguo." If this sentence is true, according to "was recorded in national history", there should be historical materials related to "Huarui, the concubine of Mengchang, the Lord of the late Shu" in the Song History at that time. But look it up and we can find there is no record of the Concubine of Mengchang in the Song History. If Wang Anguo's preface is true, it can be inferred that this section of history has been deleted from historical books. If so, why? Since it is impossible to verify, most of the later records of various deeds come from hearsay. Poetry talks or notes, forming an imaginary and pieced together image of "Madam Huarui of the late Shu". And judging from the appelation, at the time of writing this preface, his elder brother Wang Anshi served as assistant administrator, while Wang Gui and Feng Jing were ZaiZhi ministers. He should not call his brother or his court officials by their names. So we can know that this preface is a forgery that imitated Song-Dynasty-style typeface. Since it is a forgery, the end of the sentence "Huarui, the concubine of Mengchang, the Lord of the late Shu" may not be credible, so we cannot judge the existence of Madam Huarui of Later Shu, let alone take this as evidence that Madam Huarui of Later Shu was the palace poems' author.

4. THERE ARE MANY INCONSISTENCIES IN THE LEGEND OF MADAM HUARUI OF THE LATE SHU

4.1 Cause of Death

The cause of death of Madam Huarui in late Shu has been mentioned in the previous article. Cai Tao said in Tittle-Tattle of the Tiewei Hill:

“One day, Zhao Kuangyin and Zhao Guangyi were hunting in the garden. Madam Huarui also followed them. At that time, Tai Zong adjusted the bow full, people thought he was going to kill the beast, unexpectedly, he suddenly turned his head, shot an arrow at Madam Huarui, and she died."

During the same Period, Wang Gong in Wen Jian Jin Lu recorded the person killed by Tai Zong's arrow as Madam Jincheng:

“Madam Jincheng was favored by Tai Zu, One day, Tai Zu led a banquet of princes and harems to hunt in the garden. Taizu offered wine to Taizong to persuade him to drink, but Taizong refused. Taizu advised him to drink again. Taizong looked under the grandstand and said: ‘If Madam Jincheng will fold me a flower, I will drink.’ Taizu ordered Madam Jincheng to fold flowers. Taizong shot her to death with a bow. Then he hugged The legs of Taizu in tears and said, 'Your Majesty, as you have just acquired the kingdom, should put the country first. 'Taejo drank wine and shot arrows as before.'"[10]

Yu Zhengxie, a scholar in the Qing Dynasty, gave the following statement in Volume 12 of Gui Si Lei Gao:

“Madam Jincheng of the Song Dynasty was Madam Huarui of Meng Shu.”[11]

For this view of Yu Zhengxie, Pu Jiangqing said in Textual Research on Madam Huarui's Palace Poems that there is not enough evidence for Yu zhengxie's statement. It's probably just a guess based on what Wang Gong expressed in Wen Jian Jin Lu.[12]

4.2 Moral Character

Chen Shibao of the Northern Song Dynasty mentioned in Houshan Poetry Talks that Lady Huarui of the Later Shu state was brought into the palace of Taizu after the collapse of the state and recited poems of the state of mourning: “The flag of surrender was erected on the castle tower of the king of The Later Shu. How am I supposed to know this, locked away in this deserted palace? One hundred and forty thousand soldiers laid down their arms and surrendered, and not one of them was a real man! ”[13] In Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai, Wu Zeng in the Southern Song Dynasty wrote that Lady Huarui of the Later Shu state was escorted to the Palace by Taizu and wrote a poem on the way: “On the way to leave the Shu, I felt as if I had broken my heart. The glorious spring days seemed to drag on. From time to time around the cuckoo call to urge people to cry. Three thousand maids of honor are beautiful as flowers, and I am the most charming. During this trip to the capital, I am only worried that the emperor's favor will be given to others. ” The contradiction between these two views is that under the circumstances of that time, Mrs. Huarui of Later Shu, as a person whose country has perished, can speak "One hundred and forty thousand soldiers laid down their arms and surrendered, and not one of them was a real man " with her imposing manner and ideological height as a woman in Houshan Poetry Talks. Should not as Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai said, be thinking about things like The emperor's favor in the
poem, and it is not consistent with the image of "preparing for revenge" described in other historical materials. But if it is not enough to extrapolate from her qualities and her image in other books, the question remains doubtful.

In this regard, Yang Shen made a more reasonable comment in the book Ci Pin based on the social background at that time, the situation of Madam Huarui and the confirmed poems she wrote:

"Madam Huarui is not only good at palace ci, but also very good at composing yue Fu poems. When Shu fell, she came to The bian area and wrote on Jia Meng Yi's wall: 'On the way to leave the Shu, I felt as if I had broken my heart The glorious spring days seemed to drag on. From time to time around the cuckoo call to urge people to cry. ' The army hurried her away before she could finish it. Later generations continued to write this poem: 'Three thousand maids of honor are beautiful as flowers, and I am the most charming. During this trip to the capital, I am only worried that the emperor's favor will be given to others.' When Huarui met song Zu, she wrote the poem 'There was no real man left'. How could she have written such immoral words when she was marching with the army? The people who continued to write are just making it up and write a deplorable sequel to a masterpiece. " [13]

It should be noted that In Yang Shen's point of view, Madam Huarui in the Late Shu is regarded as Madam Huarui as the real author of Palace Poems. But Pu Jiangqing has made detailed and accurate Textual Research on the author of Palace Poems in "Textual Research on Madam Huarui's Palace Poems". Confirm that the palace ci writer should be the younger Concubine Xu in the former Shu. Therefore, only the reasonable points in Yang Shen's comments are discussed here.

4.3 Last Name

"Fei, a native of Qingcheng of Shu, entered the Palace of Shu with her talent and beauty. The emperor loved her very much. She was known as Madam Huarui" written in Houshan Poetry Talks by Chen Luchang in the Northern Song Dynasty is the earliest expression that Madam Huarui is Fei, while Wu Zeng in the Southern Song Dynasty said in Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai that "Chen Wujia believed that Madam Huarui's surname was Fei, which was wrong." That Madame Huarui should be surnamed Xu, not Fei. Tao Zongyi continues Wu Zeng's message in Chuogeng Notes Volume 17:

"Mengchang, emperor of Shu, had Xu Kuangzhang's daughter in his harem. The girl was awarded as the imperial concubine, alias Madam Huarui, not only more beautiful than flowers, and especially light and delicate. The idea that her last name is Fei is wrong." [14]

MAO Jin, a Scholar of the Ming Dynasty, directly attacked Tao zongyi's views in the Preface to The Three Family Palace Poems:

"Tao Zongyi thought it was wrong to call Xu Kuangzhang's daughter Fei because Meng Chang brought Xu Kuangzhang's daughter into the harem and made her a noble concubine, alias Madam Huarui. Because Tao Zongyi did not know that Wang Jian had Concubine Xu and Mengchang had concubine Fei. The emperors of Shu were different in time, and Madam Huarui was a concubine of shu. There was no research on whether the king was Wang Jian or Meng Chang, whether the concubine was Concubine Xu or Fei, whether she was Shunsheng or Huarui. One hundred Palace Poems were actually written by Fei, the Concubine of Mengchang. I never heard of the Younger Concubine Xu."

Among the scholars supporting the view that Madame Huarui in the Late Shu was surnamed Xu, there was also a well-read and deserving heavyweight: Wu Renchen, Litterateur and the Book Collector of the Qing Dynasty. His History of Ten Kingdoms is often regarded as the wing of The History of the Five Dynasties, and its importance goes without saying. History of Ten Kingdoms volume 50 gives a detailed account of Madam Huarui in the Late Shu state:

"Hui Concubine Xu, qingcheng people, Talent and beauty from childhood, her father was Guo Zhang, she was included in the emperor's harem, very favored, was named as the Imperial concubine, alias Madam Huarui, also known as hui Concubine. She once climbed a building together with the empress and painted the Long Nao Mo on the white fan, which fell to the ground and was acquired by others. People in Shu followed this method and named it xue Xiang Fan. The emperor of Shu spent the summer with her on the Mahe Pool and wrote a poem in praise of her: 'The muscles and bones are as bright and clean as ice jade. Evening wind water temple filar silk fragrance diffuses, etc. The poems were hotly circulated throughout the country. Xu was good at writing poems. She wrote about 100 palace Poems modeled after Wang jian, which were praised by many people at the time. After the fall of the state, she came to the Song Dynasty, and The Emperor Taizu of the Song Dynasty summoned her to recite a poem about the cause of the fall of the state. Her poem included the words' It was a pity that forty thousand soldiers surrendered, and there was no real man left. 'Taizu was pleased. Xu's heart did not forget Shu, hanging in the house of Shu monarch Mengchang's portrait to sacrifice, lie that this is the god of son. It is rumored that her tomb is in Chong 'an, Fujian province.'"

The History of Ten Kingdoms account has several different accounts:

This view of "Concubine Hui surnamed Xu" is the same as Wu Zeng's view in Random Notes of Nenggaizhai;
"Qingcheng people" and "talented and beautiful" are the same as Chen ShiDao's views in Houshan Poetry Talks;

"Guo Zhang" should be "Kuang Zhang", because the shape of similar and lead to errors;

"the imperial concubine", "concubine Hui" are the same as Wu Zeng in Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai and Tao Zong Yi in Chuogeng Notes;

The "Xue Xiang Fan" can be seen in Qing Yi Lu by Tao Gu:

"Mengchang painted Long Nao Mo on the white fan to fan the wind. One night he climb up the tall building with Madame Huarui to admire the moon, and accidentally dropped the fan, which was acquired by others. Some people copied it and gave it the name Xue Xiang Fan."[17]

In addition to those who directly support the surname Fei or Xu, there are also works such as All Tang Poetry and Poems of the Five Dynasties that show that it is impossible to confirm which surname Fei is. Pu Jiangqing said, "I have no opinion on the debate about surname Fei or Xu" , "The debate about surname Fei or Xu has nothing to do with the gist. "[18] He only quoted Huang Xiufu's Remarks in Guest's Remarks of Mao Ting for analysis and interpretation, but failed to reach a definite conclusion. Moreover, the Guest's Remarks are mostly some anecdotes of that time, which are more different from the reality. It is not enough to serve as a basis, but can only serve as circumstantial evidence.

To sum up, the surname, conduct and cause of death of Madame Huarui in the late Shu are all complicated and confusing, so it is impossible to draw a definite conclusion. Moreover, many later generations have added to the story, which makes the figure seem full and clear, but in fact, her identity is more ambiguous and difficult to judge. Rather than being a real historical figure, Madame Huarui in the late Shu was closer to a fictional figure who had been put together by various anecdotes and legends under the name of Madame Huarui.

5. CONCLUSION

There is no such thing as Madame Huarui with legendary experience in history, whose life story is fabricated by later generations. The specific reasons are as follows:

In history, the accounts of Madame Huarui in the late Shu are sketchy. Referring to historical data such as The History of the Old Five Dynasties, The History of The New Five Dynasties, Precepts and The History of Shu, it can be seen that there are many descriptions of several figures associated with Madame Huarui of Later Shu. For example, Meng Chang, Former Shu concubine Xu, Wang Jian and other people have detailed records, but Madame Huarui is difficult to find the corresponding historical evidence; Even in the rumor, Madame Huarui of Later Shu was the concubine of Mengchang, but in the historical documents, the description of Mengchang's life story is more about his mother Li and his concubine Liu, but there is no record of Madame Huarui.

The legendary story of Madame Huarui of the Late Shu showed obvious evolution and attachment. From the vague specific information of Madame Huarui mentioned in The" The Recording of the Xiang Mountain-Madam Huarui’s Palace Poems "by Shuwen Ying in the Song Dynasty. After going through the process of Liu Ban's Zhong Shan Poetry Talks, Chen Shidao's Houshan Poetry Talks, CAI Tao's Title-Tattle of the Tiewei Hill, and Wu Zeng's Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai and other historical books whose authenticity is yet to be verified, The last name, hometown, talent and appearance, experience of entering the palace, treatment in the palace, poems and causes of death of Madame Huarui of the Later Shu Dynasty state were constantly improved. The characters were gradually clear, and the legendary stories became more and more abundant.

The legendary story of Madame Huarui of the Later Shu Dynasty state has many inconsistencies besides the suspicion of attachment. About the last name, Houshan Poetry Talks (Chen Shidao), Random Notes of Nenggai Zhai (Wu Zeng), Chuogeng Notes (Tao Zongyi), the Preface to The Three Family Palace Poems (MAO Jin), History of Ten Kingdoms (Wu Renchen), Poems of the Five Dynasties (Li Tiaoyuan) and other historical books have much controversy about the debate about surname Fei or Xu, with few definite conclusions. As for the cause of death, Madame Huarui and Madame Jincheng's death description in Wen Jian Jin Lu written by Wang Gong at the same time are almost identical. In terms of character, after surrendering to the Song Dynasty. Lady Huarui not only wrote a generous and unrestrained poem "One hundred and forty thousand soldiers laid down their arms and surrendered, and not one of them was a real man", but also wrote a poem "During this trip to the capital, I am only worried that the emperor's favor will be given to others.", which was completely different from the integrity and writing style of the same period, and was not in accordance with the image of "revenge".

In conclusion, the author believes that Madame Huarui in the late Shu is a fictional figure created by later generations, and all kinds of legendary stories do not exist in history.

REFERENCES


[17] [Song] Tao Gu. Qing Yi Record, Jingming Treasure Yan Tang Secret Book of the Republic of China, Vol.4