



Criteria for Evaluation of the Implementation of Mutation and Promotion of State Civil Apparatus in Bulukumba Regency, Indonesia

Andi Meuthia AM. (✉), Muh. Akmal Ibrahim, and Muhammad Yunus

Universitas Hasanudin, Makassar, Indonesia
andimeuthiamatalatta@gmail.com

Abstract. The implementation of mutations for employees in each agency is an effort in the process of providing guidance and development for these employees. In addition to improving employee performance, another purpose of the transfer is to eliminate boredom with the tasks and work assigned to him and to provide new experiences for employees with an office environment that is different from before. Both through the implementation of employee rotation and the implementation of employee promotions. Thus, the purpose of this study was to determine the evaluation criteria for the implementation of employee transfers and promotions based on effectiveness, efficiency, equity, and responsiveness to the implementation of the development of the state civil apparatus in the implementation of transfers and promotions in Bulukumba Regency. The type of research used is descriptive qualitative by using the type of phenomenology. By using data collection techniques through observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation. While the data analysis used is data reduction, data presentation, verification, and conclusion. The results of the study indicate that the implementation of the mutation of the Regional Civil Apparatus of Bulukumba Regency has been running quite well. However, in the process of implementing employee transfers and promotions, it has not been carried out objectively and openly because of the impression of political interests carried out by political officials that it has an impact on the quality of employee work, including causing disharmony among fellow employees and bureaucratic officials.

Keywords: Evaluation Criteria · Mutation · Promotions

1 Introduction

One way that is usually done to improve employee performance, especially within the scope of government, both at the central and regional levels is by holding transfers. The implementation of mutations for employees in each agency is an effort in the process of providing guidance and development for these employees. The implementation of employee transfers is usually carried out vertically or horizontally. Vertical mutations are usually referred to as promotions and demotions while horizontal mutations are employee rotations [1]. The purpose of holding a vertical transfer is to reward employees for the

performance they have done so far. Usually, the implementation of a vertical mutation in the form of promotion is followed by the granting of a higher position/position than before followed by a wider authority. In addition, the vertical mutation in the form of demotion aims to impose sanctions on employees who are considered to have violated the code of ethics for civil servants (PNS) as regulated in [2] concerning State Civil Apparatus Article 5 regarding the ASN code of ethics.

Employee transfers carried out in Bulukumba Regency are expected to be carried out professionally and transparently without prioritizing individual or group interests. So that it will be able to provide new enthusiasm and positive impetus for every employee to be able to work better. There are several findings in the implementation of this mutation [3–5], including; (1) there are still employees who are placed not in accordance with their field/position/educational background, so the implementation of the transfer is sometimes assumed to be negative by some employees, especially for employees who are demotion. (2) there is an intervention carried out by political officials against employees in the implementation of transfers with the aim of strengthening the bargaining position of the political officials concerned; and (3) the implementation of employee transfers carried out by the Bulukumba Regency Performance Assessment Team is more familial and not transparent.

In addition, the findings obtained by the authors in field observations are that KASN asks for an open selection process, mutation, or rotation of employees both in high-ranking primary leadership positions as well as supervisors and administrators in the future to be carried out with reference to the on the applicable laws and regulations the contents of the letter. KASN warns that promotions, transfers, and job rotations that violate procedures have the potential to cause state losses because they provide access to benefits to unauthorized parties due to the appointment process that violates procedures. Based on Article 1 paragraph 22 [2] concerning State Civil Apparatus which states that the Merit System is a policy and ASN Management based on qualifications, competence, and performance fairly and reasonably without distinction of political background, race, skin color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age, or disability [6, 7].

In addition to some of the findings described by the authors above, the Bulukumba Regency Performance Assessment Team should always communicate and coordinate more intensely with each head of the Department/Agency throughout the Bulukumba Regency in its efforts to realize a fairer and more objective implementation of the mutation. So that it does not create negative assumptions about the mutations carried out by the Performance Assessment Team as the person in charge of the mutation implementation process in Bulukumba Regency. With a description of some of the findings above, the author aims to look in depth at the implementation of mutations and whether it is under existing regulations in terms of the theory put forward by [8].

2 Methods

The research method used in this study is qualitative, the authors use interviews, direct field observations, and analysis of written materials as the main data sources. The research was conducted in Bulukumba Regency. The purpose of this research is to understand the phenomena and work processes experienced by the research subjects.

The focus of this research is to see the process of evaluating the implementation of transfers and promotions of state civil servants using indicators of effectiveness, efficiency, equity, and responsiveness. In his analysis, the author uses descriptive techniques to describe the results of the research systematically, honestly, and concretely [9, 10].

2.1 Data Analysis

Data analysis is the next step to managing data where the data is obtained, worked on, and used in such a way as to conclude the problems posed in compiling research results. According to Miles and Huberman in, these components are as follows [9, 10]:

2.1.1 Data Reduction

The data obtained in the field is quite a lot, and for that, it needs to be recorded carefully and in detail. As has been stated, the longer the researcher is in the field, the more the amount of data will be, complex and complicated. For this reason, it is necessary to immediately conduct data analysis through data reduction. Reducing data means summarizing, choosing the main things, focusing on the things that are important, looking for themes and patterns, and removing unnecessary ones.

2.1.2 Data Presentation

In qualitative research, data presentation can be done in the form of brief descriptions, charts, relationships between categories, and the like.

2.1.3 Conclusion Drawing and Verification

The third step in qualitative data analysis is drawing conclusions and verification. The initial conclusions put forward are still tentative and will change if no strong evidence is found to support the next stage of data collection. However, if the data conclusions presented at an early stage are supported by valid and consistent evidence when the researcher returns to the field to collect data, then the conclusions put forward are credible.

2.1.4 Data Triangulation

The purpose of data triangulation is to check the correctness of certain data in various ways and at various times [9, 10]. In this study, triangulation was carried out on the information provided by the Regional Secretariat of the Bulukumba Regency. The data triangulation used by the author is as follows:

Source triangulation is done by checking the data that has been obtained from several sources. In this case, the researchers collected and tested the data that had been obtained through observations, interviews, and existing documents. Next, the researcher compares the results of observations with interviews and compares the results of interviews with existing documents.

Technical triangulation. This is done by checking data from the same source with different techniques. In this case, the data is obtained by interview, then checked by

observation and documents. If the three data credibility testing techniques produce different data, the researcher conducts further discussions with the relevant data source or others, to ensure which data is considered correct or maybe all of them are correct because of different points of view.

Time triangulation. The data collected by interview technique in the morning when the interviewee is still fresh, there are not many problems, will provide more valid data so that it is more credible. For this reason, testing the credibility of the data, it can be done by checking with interviews, observations, or other techniques in different times or situations. If the test results produce different data, then it is done repeatedly so that the certainty of the data is found.

3 Findings and Discussion

In this study, the author uses several theories of Evaluation Criteria by William N. Dunn, the term evaluation according to [8] can be equated with appraisal, rating, and assessment. Policy evaluation is an activity to assess the level of achievement of policy objectives, evaluation is related to the production of information regarding the value or benefits of policy outcomes. In producing information on policy performance, the analysis uses different types of criteria to evaluate policy outcomes. The criteria for evaluation were applied retrospectively (ex-post). [4] suggests several criteria for assessing policy performance.

In analyzing the evaluation criteria for the transfer and promotion of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) on this topic, the researcher describes the mutation and promotion of the State Civil Apparatus in the Bulukumba Regency.

- a. Mutation; Interpreting a mutation as a change to the position and position including the place and previous work, whether done vertically (promotions and demotions) or horizontally (rotations) carried out in an organization [5]
- b. Promotion; Promotion can also be interpreted as a process of increasing a person's class, rank, or position at a better level and is part of the career planning process. Thus, employee promotions will always be followed by higher duties, responsibilities, and authority than previously occupied positions, Edison et al. [5]
- c. State Civil Apparatus; As explained by Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus Article 1 Paragraph 1 which states that the State Civil Apparatus, hereinafter abbreviated as ASN, is a profession for civil servants and government employees with work agreements who work for government agencies [6]

The implementation of transfers and promotions is part of the development of the state civil apparatus, by [6] concerning the State Civil Apparatus which regulates the Management of Civil Service Personnel of the State, namely paragraph 5 concerning Career patterns, article 72 and article 73 regarding promotion and transfer of Apparatus State Civil Servants which are included in the development of employees. In terms of the implementation of mutation, it is a process of transferring employees which are carried out routinely based on the results of employee performance appraisals for a certain period in a government institution. In addition, the implementation of mutations is a strategic

step to apply the principle of “the right man in the right place” or in other words, placing people (employees/employees) based on their expertise and abilities appropriately so that the expected goals can be achieved effectively and efficiently.

Because this study uses a qualitative method, the discussion in this study relates to the questions formulated by [4] for each criterion. The following are the results obtained through the Evaluation Criteria indicators:

1. Effectiveness

The effectiveness of this policy is meant to achieve the results of the process of fostering the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in the implementation of mutations and promotions in the Bulukumba Regency. The focus on this indicator is the rules of the purpose of implementing mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency, so it can be seen that in the development of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in the implementation of mutations and promotions within the Bulukumba Regency government, the criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of regulations have been carried out according to [6] in the implementation of mutations and promotions for employees, but the purpose of these regulations has not been carried out optimally and effectively, as is what happened in the field that it is still not running effectively because there are still some employees who are placed in positions that are not under their fields or education. This is certainly very influential on the effectiveness of employees who are less than optimal.

In the implementation of mutations where promoting employees are not under their rank and class, this violates the merit system of the existing rules, from here we can see that the development of ASN (State Civil Apparatus) in the implementation of mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency still needs to be done. Efforts to improve the implementation system of mutations and promotions to match the goals and expected results in accordance with the rules. The implementing party or the performance appraisal team continues to do their best so that the results in the transfer and promotion process can be run by the objectives of the rules that have been set.

2. Efficiency

The focus of efficiency in this study is how much effort is needed in the development of the state civil apparatus to achieve effective results in the implementation of transfers and promotions within the Bulukumba Regency government. In the implementation of transfers and promotions, it can be seen that a performance assessment is carried out by looking at the level of ability of each ASN that can affect his career, from this it is clear that the performance appraisal team for the implementation of mutations and promotions is very concerned about matters that support the careers of the state civil apparatus (ASN) [11, 12] namely by carrying out training and education under the position to be given.

In fostering the state civil apparatus (ASN) for In fostering the state civil apparatus (ASN) for the implementation of transfers and promotions within the scope of the Bulukumba Regency Government agencies, leadership training, technical guidance, and workshops are always held to develop themselves, from this it can be seen that the efforts that have so far been carried out by the government in fostering the state civil apparatus are: with routine training for career development and the potential of state civil servants where this can also support employees in the implementation of promotions. State Civil Apparatuses (ASN) who occupy positions in both echelons II, III, and IV are required

Table 1. Data on Structural Officials (DIKLATPIM) in Improving Competence

No	Position	Amount	Have attended leadership training	No leadership training
1	Echelon II	88	80	8
2	Echelon III	185	155	30
3	Echelon IV	579	499	80
Amount		852	734	118

Source: Sub-sector of education and training for ASN Regional Personnel Agency of Bulukumba Regency 2019–2020

to take part in training and education, namely leadership training. Table 1 of officials who have attended and have not attended PIM training:

ASN participation in PIM training so far has followed the DUKDIK pattern, meaning that they sit first in the office and then follow Pim training. This phenomenon is not by [6] concerning ASN which implies that every apparatus that will occupy a position must first follow and pass the PIM training, meaning that the apparatus occupying a position has fulfilled the competence of its position. From the Table 1, it can be seen that in the implementation of mutations and promotions the efforts made in the development of the state civil apparatus have not been effective and efficient because there are still several officials who occupy structural positions who still have not attended PIM training, namely 118 officials, which very supports the transfer and promotion process, so the Bulukumba Regency government must at least make more efforts so that all structural officials are included in the training process so that it runs effectively and efficiently under the objectives of the existing rules.

3. Alignment

Alignment in the evaluation criteria of public policies is seen from the fairness or fairness of existing regulations or policies. In the sense that all sectors, as well as all levels of society who are the target and object of the policy, must equally be able to feel the results of the policy, as is the case in the implementation of the development of the State civil apparatus towards the implementation of mutations and promotions in the Bulukumba Regency area, one of which supports this indicator is the placement of employees according to the level of education they have.

In fostering ASN the educational aspect of the State Civil Apparatus in the Bulukumba Regency area is one of the basic considerations in implementing employee promotions that cannot be separated from work experience which in the process of distribution is in accordance with the level of education possessed by employees, although in the field of placement sometimes there are still employees who are not appropriate in the field of education. With the level of education possessed by employees, they do not necessarily have the skills or expertise in carrying out the tasks and responsibilities given, because in completing tasks in the field the level of education must be accompanied by good experience, so that when employees are promoted they can carry out their duties and with good responsibilities, from here we can see that the performance

appraisal team of Bulukumba Regency must work even harder in providing improvements to the implementation of the development of the state civil apparatus so that when promoted, employees must align their level of education with work experience. In the implementation of mutations and promotions in the Bulukumba Regency, the level of education possessed by employees when promoted is still in the stage of equalization [11, 12].

4. Responsiveness

The responsiveness criteria referred to in the implementation of mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency are responses from state civil servants and the performance appraisal team in the implementation of mutations and promotions as targets for implementing these regulations with regard to how far the implementation can satisfy the needs and values of the employees. Civil servants of the State (certain groups) of Bulukumba Regency. In the implementation of transfers and promotions, sometimes there are responses from employees who are not satisfied with this, giving rise to pros and cons in its implementation, because employees sometimes cannot accept the conditions with their new placements, because sometimes the placement of positions is not in accordance with their field skills or expertise in work, and it can be seen that the implementation is in accordance with orders from superiors where in the ASN coaching career it has not gone well because it is influenced by the role of authorized officials. The role of the staffing supervisor is more dominant in carrying out employee development, while the role of the authorized official is only limited to carrying out orders from the staffing supervisor official in the appointment of positions, which in the selection process is not fully carried out with a merit system [11, 12].

As for some of the responses from employees of the State Civil Apparatus, the opinion is that in carrying out mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency, the political system and kinship are prioritized in a promotion. In this case, the family system is still put forward in the implementation of structural position promotions by means of its own closeness by regional officials in related agencies, the influence of the spoil system (politics) still occurs in the implementation of mutations and promotions within the Bulukumba Regency government [13]. The transfer of structural positions within the Bulukumba Regency Government for the 2014–2020 period is recognized as having an impact on reducing the degree of professionalism of the bureaucracy in the region. There are still many strategic positions or positions in the government structure that are not commensurate with the qualifications of the employees in the office. Forming professional and competent regional civil servants is also very difficult to implement, considering that political interests are stronger than the level of achievement possessed by regional civil servants in obtaining their employment rights. This, as happened in the field, cannot be separated from efforts to provide support in the Regional Head Election (Pilkada) [14–16]. Officials who support a certain regent candidate and win in the Pilkada automatically get a certain position as well. Meanwhile, officials who support other regent candidates and lose the Pilkada will be transferred and get unfavorable positions such as expert staff, down echelon, or even in non-jobs. A conclusion is that the implementation of the development of the state civil apparatus in transfers and promotions is given solely on the basis of political loyalty to the leadership to the exclusion of competence, professionalism, and work performance. Political factors like this can

lead to filling positions in positions that are not under their competencies and work performance which have a negative impact on service to the community and employees in the career system.

4 Conclusion

The conclusions in the evaluation criteria for the implementation of mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency are:

- 1) Effectiveness In the implementation of mutations and promotions in the development of the State civil apparatus in Bulukumba Regency has not run effectively because there are still many violations that do not meet the merit system in the implementation or appointment of State civil servants in the implementation of mutations and promotions.
- 2) The efficiency of the implementation of transfers and promotions has not been effective because there are still many employees in promotions who have not carried out leadership training which is not in accordance with the rules.
- 3) Smoothing does not occur in the placement and appointment of employees in structural positions because it is not in accordance with the skills and fields of education possessed by an employee of the State civil apparatus, even though all of these indicators have been regulated in [6] concerning State Civil Apparatus.
- 4) Responsiveness in the evaluation criteria for the implementation of mutations and promotions in Bulukumba Regency, it can be seen that some employee responses are not in accordance with the results of the implementation of the mutation and promotion policies that occur, due to the occurrence of several violations that are not in accordance with the merit system regulations in the implementation, such as the placement of employees who not in accordance with the field or ability so that it can slow down the performance of the employee
- 5) Political intervention in the implementation of mutations and promotions in the Bulukumba district is still very influential and entrenched, where the implementation of mutations and promotions is still dominantly carried out by the Regent as the final holder in the implementation decision, which is greatly influenced by political factors

As for suggestions, there is a need for transparency in the implementation of mutations, promotions in positions between regional officials and state civil apparatus employees within the local government of Bulukumba Regency in placing promotions so that system nepotism does not occur again, spoil the system and provide opportunities for some appropriate employees in terms of promotion so that the criteria for implementing mutations and promotions run according to the rules that have been set.

References

1. Wulandari, F. (2022). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia.
2. Pasiak, P., Maramis, R. A., & Pinasang, D. R. (2020). Pengembangan Karier Aparatur Sipil Negara (Asn) Berdasarkan Sistem Merit Menurut Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 Tentang Aparatur Sipil Negarapada Pemerintah Kota Bitung. *Lex Administrator*, 8(2).

3. Purba, J. H. (2020). Pengaruh Mutasi dan Promosi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan. *Jurnal of Manajam*, 6(2).
4. Animun, J. S. D., Sepang, J. L., & Uhing, Y. (2017). Analisis Pelaksanaan Promosi Jabatan Dan Mutasi Berdasarkan Prestasi Kerja Karyawan Pada Pt. Bank Rakyat Indonesia (Persero), Tbk Cabang Manado. *Jurnal of EMBA Journal of Risk Ekonom Manajemen, Bisnis dan Akunt*, 5(3).
5. Edyanto, E. (2018). Analisis Proses Mutasi Promosi Jabatan Pegawai Negeri Sipil di Kantor Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Gowa. *Journal of Noken Ilmu-Ilmu Sos*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.33506/jn.v3i1.79>
6. Mariani, P., & Sumada, I. M. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 Tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil (Studi Penelitian Mengenai Pejabat Fungsional Penyuluh Pertanian pada Dinas Pertanian dan Pangan Kabupaten Badung), *Jurnal of Widya Publika*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.47329/widyapublika.v9i1.653>
7. Handoko, T. H. (2008). Manajemen Personalial dan Sumber Daya Manusia, *Bpfe*, 10(2).
8. Dunn, W. N. (2003). *Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik*.
9. Sugiyono, S. (2017). 60, *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*, 53(9).
10. Sugiyono. (2017). Metode penelitian pendidikan, pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D. *Angew Chemie International Edition*, 6(11), 951–952.
11. Dwinanta, A., & Ginting, R. (2012). Analisis Pelayanan Kenaikan Pangkat Pegawai Negeri Sipil (Studi Kasus di Kabupaten Semarang). *Jurnal Ilm Civil*, II(1).
12. Selatan, P. S. (2017). Peraturan Bupati Bulukumba No. 78 Tahun 2017 Tentang Analisis Jabatan dan Beban Kerja (vol. 4, pp. 1–4). <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Home/Details/114972/perub-kab-bulukumba-no-78-tahun-2017>
13. Garaika, G. (2020). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*.
14. Faizal, L. (2011). Reformasi Birokrasi Menurut Hukum Administrasi Pembangunan. *Jurnal of ASAS*, 3(1).
15. Buyanov. (2020). Pengaruh Pembangunan Dalam Kualitas Pelayanan Administrasi Pembuatan Akta Otentik Pada Kantor Notaris Dan Ppat Chairina Mursyada Razak, Sh, M.Kn. *Angew Chemie International*, 6(11).
16. Anggara, S., & Sumantri, I. (2016). Administrasi Pembangunan. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*.

Open Access This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

