Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi: Creating Value for Character Education Through Narrative

Akmal Rijal[1(✉)], Aceng Kosasih[2], and Encep Syarief Nurdin[2]

[1] Universitas PGRI Silampari, Lubuklinggau, Indonesia
akmalrijal@upi.edu
[2] Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract. Character issues are the most important issues in human life, so character education that emphasizes the ethical dimension of religion becomes relevant to apply. The author uses the concept of the ideas of Thomas Lickona and the idea of character education according to Yusuf Qardhawi so that it is hoped that we can contribute an understanding of building characters that are abstract and universal. This type of research approaches qualitative narratives with narrative types. The data source for this study is reference data, which is summarized in Thomas Lickona's book Educating for Character, the introductory book of Islamic studies, a comprehensive analytical study of the pillars of substance, characteristics, goals, and sources of Islamic reference by Yusuf Qardhawi, as well as articles, essays, and journals that discuss character education of children. Data collection techniques used are documentation studies for story collection, reporting experiences, and discussing the meaning of the experiences of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi. The characteristics of Muslims offered by Yusuf Qardhawi are in line with Thomas Lickona's thought that there are similarities between the two, namely moral knowledge or syumul (universal), moral feelings or rabbaniyah (divinity), moral actions or insaniyah (humanity), wasathiyah (moderate) and a combination of principle firmness and flexibility. Therefore, character education requires transparency and touch from early childhood to early adulthood.

Keywords: Characters · Thomas Lickona · Yusuf Qardhawi

1 Introduction

Character is the most important issue in human life. In the twenty-first century, humanity faced social challenges such as religious extremism [1], so character education that emphasizes the ethical dimensions of religion became relevant to apply [2]. Character education is divided into two long-debated theoretical perspectives of Western and Islamic perspectives [3]. Western conceptions of value are primarily based on human ratios and ignore revelation, despite revelation being the primary source in religion. While [4] claims that Western moral education has failed to recognize the continuity that has always existed while changing circumstances, rejecting divine revelation, religious belief, or metaphysical understanding as reliable moral sources.

Character education is not only a school obligation, but also a shared responsibility that includes schools, families, and all walks of life, across government agencies, organizations, political parties, non-governmental organizations, corporations, and other community groups [5, 6]. Also, in its implementation, character education requires a universally different understanding and appreciation [7]. Both western and Islamic perspectives aim to teach virtue to people to benefit humankind and influence how people act, think, and feel in diverse ways [8].

Based on this background, the author believes that character education should be intensively internalized in school and outside of school from all values, both objective, subjective, and absolute values, so that good deeds are motivated to achieve eternal welfare in the afterlife [9]. Therefore, the author wants to examine the concept of thought of two influential figures in education related to a character in the Western world, namely Thomas Lickona, and an influential figure in the East, Yusuf Qardhawi.

Through his works, Thomas Lickona is a well-known figure in the field of character education in the West, who made the Western world aware of the need for character education. Lickona served on the board of commissioners of the Character Education Partnership, as well as the advisory boards of the Character Count Coalition and the Medical Institute for Sexual Health, after becoming president of the Moral Education Association [10–12]. The second figure was Yusuf Qardhawi. He was a cleric who had a great influence on the world of Islamic education. Yusuf Qardhawi occupied a vital position in terms of contemporary Islamic thought and proselytizing. His life was spent serving Islam and talking about issues facing Muslims in many countries [13] and [14].

The author draws on the challenges and concerns raised above to combine the concepts of thought of the two figures by combining the concepts of character education proposed by Thomas Lickona (Western figures) and Yusuf Qardhawi (Eastern figures). It is believed that these two ideas will enable them to produce a generation that is endowed with virtue from a young age [15], behaves following religious ethics [16], and social intelligence [17], and does not behave radically while still upholding culture as a national identity [18]. So that future generations of nations do not experience a crisis of character, both religiously and culturally Building a nation with a complete identity requires an educational vision that has holistic materials [19], and is supported by good management and implementation [20]. It is important to compile the concept of thinking of the two figures because we think the two character education figures are figures who contribute very much to thinking about the problems of character education. This is what attracted us to study this topic.

2   Methods

This type of research uses a narrative qualitative approach (narrative research) with a narrative type from the thoughts of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi [21]. This paper will describe the individual's life, collecting and telling stories about life, the future, and possible experiences with different points of view from Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi, with the steps of identifying problems, collecting stories, retelling, and validation [21, 22]. Participants in this study are researchers themselves, along with character education experts from the doctoral study program of general education and character at the Indonesian University of Education.

The Biographical Narrative Interpretive Method (BNIM) was used to generate data from Thomas Lickona's book Educating For Character (educating to form characters), the introductory book of Islamic studies, a comprehensive analytical study of the pillars of substance, characteristics, goals, and sources of Islamic reference by Yusuf Qardhawi, as well as articles, essays, and journals that discuss character education of children [23]. Data collection techniques used are documentation studies for story collection, reporting experiences, and discussing the meaning of the experiences of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi [24, 25]. Data analysis is divided into four stages: (a) data reduction; (b) data presentation; (c) data analysis and interpretation; and (d) drawing and verifying conclusions [26].

3   Findings and Discussion

3.1   Findings

The study of documents and in-depth discussions of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi's works are reviewed in-depth. First, we discuss the origins of the concept of character education, as well as core values, and then compare and contrast the theories of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi on character education. We conclude with the implications of the concept of character education in contributing to a new understanding and resuscitating the school and family (parents) by instilling and building one's character, especially abstract and universal characters.

a.   Tracing the Origins of Thomas Lickona's Character Education

In many nations, the topic of character development has become divisive. The arguments for and against adding color to the discussion of character education are long gone. Although it has received less attention, character education is a crucial component of academics. The lack of focus on character education in the educational system has caused Lickona to see an increase in the prevalence of some social diseases [27].

Thomas Lickona defines character education as having three fundamental elements: knowing the good, loving the good, and acting in the good. Children's character education not only imparts knowledge of right and wrong, but also instills in students a habit of the good so that they comprehend, can feel, and want to act positively. Character education, therefore, fulfills the same function as moral education or moral training.

The character is also concerned with moral beliefs (moral knowledge), moral attitudes (moral feelings), and moral behavior, according to Thomas Lickona. Knowledge of the good, a desire to do good, and performing good deeds based on these three elements are the foundations of good character. Lickona defines character education as a conscious effort to support individuals in understanding, caring about, and upholding fundamental ethical principles. An intentional attempt to understand, care about, and implement fundamental ethical principles is character education.

Table 1. Student core character values

Best Quality	Quality Concept
Wisdom	Good judgment
Justice	Honesty, courtesy, mutual respect, tolerance
Courage	Tenacity, patience, perseverance, endurance, confidence
Self-control	Controlling emotions, controlling lust, resisting temptation
Love	Empathy, compassion, kindness, generosity, service, loyalty
Positive attitude	Hope, enthusiasm, flexibility, sense of humor
Hard work	Initiative, perseverance, goal setting, ingenuity
Integrity	Following moral principles, having moral awareness
Thankful	The secret of living a happy life is not easy to complain
Humility	Responsibility for mistakes, admitting mistakes, making amends

b. Thomas Lickona Character Education: Creating Core Student Values

Thomas Lickona in his book Character Matters, as a result, the process of character education, or moral education, and the nation's character should be understood as a deliberate and planned endeavor, rather than something that happens by happenstance. In other words, character education is an earnest attempt to understand, shape, and cultivate ethical values, both for oneself and for all citizens or citizens as a whole. Thomas Lickona mentions seven elements of essential and primary character values that must be instilled into the student that includes. (Table 1 describes each of the ten core value forces and their component concepts.)

These ten core characters are, according to Thomas Lickona, the most important and basic to develop in learners, in addition to many other character elements. In addition, the ten elements of character that become the core character, character education activists try to paint important pillars of character in the picture by showing the synergistic relationship between family, school, community, and the world of work.

c. Tracing the Origin of The Value of Yusuf Qardhawi's Thought

Yusuf Qardhawi claims that Islamic education involves educating the full person—including their head, heart, spirit, and body. Islamic education prepares man to face real life, with all his good and evil, sweet and bitter [13]. Currently, education is only oriented to cognitive values, so many people are clever but morals or characters have not been formed. So many people are clever and use their minds regardless of morals to do something that results in moral disobedience and the destruction of the state. So why moral education is so important?

Yusuf Qardhawi said that in fact, something that becomes apparent to the person who studies Islam through the verses of His holy book and the sunnah of His Prophet and contemplates his texts and spirits (souls) is that Islam in its essential substance level is a moral treatise (morals) with all the understandings it contains from the depth

Table 2. Characteristics of Islamic values in character education

Best Quality	Quality Concept
Rabbaniyyah	Sourced from God
Insaniyyah	Controlling emotions, controlling lust, resisting temptation
Syumuliyah	Pursuing meaningful relationships with others, nature, or a higher power
Al-waqi'iyyah	Can be practiced by anyone without distinguishing social status
Al-jam'u baina ats tsabat wa al murunnah	Flexible in its implementation

and overarching scope. And it is not surprising that moralism (moralism) is a character among the common Islamic characters [14].

d.   Yusuf Qardhawi's Thoughts: The Core Values Underlying Character Education

The concept of Yusuf Qardhawi's thought on character education, in his book "Madkhal Lima'rifatil Islam," contains five common characteristics are the values that underlie character education. Seven important things are not found in other religions, and this is also one of the reasons why, until now, so many people are interested in Islam that they declare themselves to convert to Islam. (Table 2 describes each of the five characteristics of Islamic teachings that are very important for us to understand.)

The first character is Rabaniyyah. Rabbaniyyah means that Islam is a religion derived from Allah SWT, not from humans, while the prophet Muhammad did not make this religion, but he just conveyed it. Therefore, in his capacity as Prophet, he spoke based on the revelation revealed to him. The second characteristic is insaniyyah. Islam is a religion that is passed down to humans. Therefore, Islam is the only religion that matches human nature. There is not a single teaching of Islam that is contrary to the human soul. A man has a natural desire for property, the throne, women, and all things worldly, which are not forbidden in Islam but must be balanced with ukhrawi pleasures.

Syumuliyah is the third characteristic. Islam is a whole religion that doesn't just emphasize one feature while ignoring others. The concept of Islam in several areas of life, spanning from personal issues to public policy, demonstrates the fullness of Islamic teachings, family, and society, to matters of nation and state. The fourth character is al-waqi'iyyah. Another characteristic of this Islamic teaching is al-waqi'iyyah which shows that Islam is a religion that can be practiced by humans or in other words can be realized in everyday life. Islam can be practiced by humans even though they have different backgrounds of rich, poor, male, female, adult, adolescent, children, highly educated, poorly educated, noble people or ordinary people, different tribes, customs, customs, customs, and so on. Al-jam'u baina ats tsabat wa al murunnah is the fifth and final character. There are both permanent and adaptable doctrines in Islam. What is meant by permanent are things that cannot be contested and must be done, such as five-time prayer, but some provisions can be flexible.

Table 3. Similar Values of Character Education Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi

Thomas Lickona's Character Qualities	Yusuf Qardhawi's Character Quality
Moral knowledge	Syumul
Moral feelings	Rabbaniyah
Moral actions	Insaniyah, wasathiyah, and firmness

e. Comparison of The Values of Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi in Character Education

The purpose of character education is to follow the main elements that must be achieved, namely: knowing the good, loving the good (desiring the good), and doing good (doing the good). The existence of the same mission between character, moral, and moral education, is then in line with what Yusuf Qardhawi expressed about the purpose of education. The characteristics of Muslims offered by Yusuf Qardhawi are in line with Thomas Lickona's thought that there are similarities between the two. (Table 3 describes each of the similarities between the characteristics of Muslims offered by Yusuf Qardhawi that are in line with Thomas Lickona's.)

Character education serves to instill and impart the Islamic principles found in the Qur'an and Sunnah, according to Yusuf Qardhawi. The goal of Thomas Lickona's and Yusuf Qardhawi's strategies is the same: the protégé himself. Students must be taught and understood about character education, besides that there need to be examples or examples in its implementation, namely through educators, parents, and a good environment. The role of an educator both teachers and parents are very influential here because children see, hear and interact with educators. In addition, a good environment (bi'ah) will make character education can be achieved following the goals.

3.2 Discussion

Character development is an important part of education. According to Thomas Lickona, kindness (knowing the good), loving-kindness (desiring the good), and doing good are the three essential aspects. The methods used by Lickona to achieve character education include teachers as caregivers (givers, examples, and mentors); moral disciplines; moral communities; democratic classroom environments; teaching values through the curriculum; cooperative learning; conscience awareness; encouraging reflection on moral education; and teaching kids to resolve conflicts. Character education is effective if teachers can strive for the implementation of various methods such as telling various stories, stories or fairy tales accordingly, giving learners the task of reading literature, carrying out case studies, role-playing, discussions, debates about morals, and the application of cooperative learning [28].

According to Qardhawi the position of morals in Islam is very important. Islam in its essential substance level is a moral treatise. Morals penetrate all the existence of Islam and in all its teachings, down to the creed, worship, and mu'amalah. Qardhawi mentions that the common characteristics of Islam are rabbaniyah, insaniyyah, syumul, wasathiyyah, and a combination of firmness of principles and flexibility. The purpose of

Qardhawi character education is to build a shalih man based on the Qur'an and sunnah, a man of rites and worship, who always remembers the person who created the universe, a place to ask for help, a moral and grammatical human being, the man has rules that must be fulfilled. The character education strategy offered by Yusuf Qardhawi is to gather based on faith, appreciate shalih charity, jihad in the way of Allah SWT, brotherhood and love, meekness and compassion, mutual support and help, cooperation and provide solidarity, mutual advice, and adventure, become part of a society that is advanced, especially in fumigating barriers and cultural differences in the world [29].

Yusuf Qardhawi mentioned that the methods of character education include thariqul worship (method of worship), thariqul adab (method of manners), thariqut tarbiyahwa al-ta'win (method of education and formation), thariqul ilmi wa al-taujih (method of presenting knowledge, direction, and civilization of the ummah), and thariq al-tasyri' (method of legislation or rules). This step is a sustainability effort to practice the faith and spirituality of Muslims in a society, especially in diverse communities [30, 31].

Character education and moral education share the same focus on character development. The difference that moral education impresses the east and Islam, while character education seems Western and secular, is not a reason to be disputed. In reality, both have room to fill each other. Even Lickona's title as America's Father of character education alludes to the intimate connection between character and spirituality. So far, activists have successfully developed character education to a very operational stage, encompassing methodologies, strategies, and procedures, while moral education is loaded with ideal criterion knowledge and good character sources, and the two have been combined into a very exciting offer [32, 33].

It also serves as a starting point for discussing how character education works in tandem with spiritual and religious principles to help children develop abilities like communication, social interaction, emotional control, and critical thinking [34, 35]. Character development must be integrated into an educational learning process, realized by teachers as an educational goal, developed in transactional learning not instructional, and based on a deep understanding of student development because character education is lifelong education [36, 37]. Therefore, character education requires transparency and touch from early to adulthood.

4   Conclusion

In this study after collaborating on the concept of thought, Thomas Lickona and Yusuf Qardhawi contributed thoughts about the problem of character education. The findings in the study revealed that the concept of Thomas Lickona's character education thinking is following the main elements that must be achieved, the knowledge of the good, love of the good, and deeds of the good. Therefore, the shared goal of character, moral, and moral education is consistent with what Yusuf Qardhawi said regarding the aim of education. The characteristics of Muslims offered by Yusuf Qardhawi are in line with Thomas Lickona's thought that there are similarities between the two, namely moral knowledge or syumul (universal), moral feelings or rabbaniyah (divinity), moral actions or insaniyah (humanity), wasathiyah (moderate) and a combination of principle firmness and flexibility. Character development must be integrated with an

educational learning process, realized by teachers as an educational goal, developed in transactional learning not instructional, and based on a deep understanding of student development because character education is a lifelong education. Therefore, character education requires transparency and touch from early to adulthood.

Authors' Contributions. The following contributions to the paper were confirmed by the authors: A.R. was the author of the study's conception and design; A.K. was the author of the data collection, and E.S.N. was the author of the analysis and results. The final draft of the manuscript was approved by all authors after they had evaluated the findings.

References

1. Redesign, C. F. C. (2010). *21st century skills for students and teachers.* Kamehameha Schools: Research & Evaluation Division.
2. McKay, R., & Whitehouse, H. (2015). Religion and morality. *Psychological Bulletin, 141*(2), 447–473. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0038455
3. Kania, D., Zarman, W., & Romly, T. (2017). Value education in the perspective of western and Islamic knowledge. *At-Ta'dib*, *12*(2), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.21111/at-tadib.v12i2.1194
4. Hussain, K. (2007). An Islamic consideration of western moral education: An exploration of the individual. *Journal of Moral Education, 36*(3), 297–308. https://doi.org/10.1080/030572 40701552802
5. Jeynes, W. H. (2019). A meta-analysis on the relationship between character education and student achievement and behavioral outcomes. *Education and Urban Society, 51*(1), 33–71. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124517747681
6. Jeynes, W. (2019). A meta-analysis on the relationship between character education and student achievement and behavioral outcomes. *Education and Urban Society, 51*(1), 33–71. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124517747681
7. White, R., & Shin, T. S. (2017). Integrative character education (ICE): Grounding facilitated prosocial development in a humanistic perspective for a multicultural world. *Multicultural Education Review, 9*(1), 44–74. https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615x.2016.1276670
8. Baehr, J. (2017). The varieties of character and some implications for character education. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 46*(6), 1153–1161. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10964-017-0654-z
9. Hakam, K. A., & Nurdin, E. S. (2016). *Metode Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai: Untuk Memodifikasi Perilaku Berkarakter*. Maulana Media Grafika.
10. Lickona, T. (1991). An integrated approach to character development in elementary schools. In *Moral, character and civic education in the elementary school*. Teachers College Press.
11. Lickona, T. (1992). Character development in the elementary school classroom. In *Character development in schools and beyond*. The Council for Research in Values and Education.

12. Lickona, T. (2012). *Educating for character* (U. Wahyuddin, ed.; J. A. R. Zien, Trans.). Bumi Aksara.

13. Al-Qardhawi, Y., Gani, H. B. A., & Ahmad, Z. A. (1980). *Pendidikan Islam dan madrasah.* Hasan Al-Banna: Bulan Bintang.

14. Qardhawi, Y. (2010). Pengantar Kajian Islam (Studi Analitik Komprehensif tentang pilar-pilar Substansi, Karakteristik, Tujuan, dan Sumber Acuan Islam), Pustaka Al-Kautsar.

15. Somad, M. A. (2021). Pentingnya Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Membentuk Karakter Anak. *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, *13*(2), 171–186. https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v13i2.882

16. Taja, N., Nurdin, E. S., Kosasih, A., Suresman, E., & Supriyadi, T. (2021). Character education in the pandemic era: A religious ethical learning model through Islamic education. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching, and Educational Research*, *20*(11), 132–153. https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.20.11.8

17. Sholeh, M., Affandi, I., Komalasari, K., & Wiyanarti, E. (2018). Building social intelligence based on Islamic boarding school values. In Gunawan, Wasino, A. Wijaya, & N. S. Akhiroh (Eds.), *Proceedings of the international conference on rural studies in Asia (ICoRSIA 2018)* (pp. 41–47). Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/icorsia-18.2019.11

18. Purwati, P., Suryadi, A., Hakam, K. A., & Rakhmat, C. (2021). Meaning of radicalization. In C. A. K. Paksi, Suryanto, & C. S. Ramadhan (Eds.), *Proceedings of the international conference on sustainable innovation track humanities education and social sciences (ICSIHESS 2021)* (pp. 280–285). Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.211227.043

19. Sauri, S. (2021). Pendidikan Berbasis Agama, Filosofi, Psikologi Dan Sosiologi. *Rihlah: Jurnal Inovasi Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam*, *6*(2), 107–136. https://doi.org/10.33507/CAKRAWALA.V5I2.413

20. Suyadi. (2013). Strategi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Karakter, PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

21. Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Pearson.

22. Kwok, A. (2018). Promoting "quality" feedback: First-year teachers' self-reports on their development as classroom managers. *Journal of Classroom Interaction*, *53*(1), 22–36. https://api.elsevier.com/content/abstract/scopus_id/85043510659

23. McAloon, C. G., Macken-Walsh, A., Moran, L., Whyte, P., More, S. J., O'Grady, L., & Doherty, M. L. (2017). Johne's disease in the eyes of Irish cattle farmers: A qualitative narrative research approach to understanding implications for disease management. *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*, *141*, 7–13. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.prevetmed.2017.04.001

24. Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison. (2018). *Research methods in education* (8th ed.). Routledge.

25. Missel, M., & Birkelund, R. (2020). Ricoeur's narrative philosophy: A source of inspiration in critical hermeneutic health research. *Nursing Philosophy, 21*, 12254. https://doi.org/10.1111/nup.12254

26. Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis, a methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Sage Publications.

27. Zubaedi. (2013). *Desain Pendidikan Karakter (konsepsi dan Aplikasinya dalam Lembaga Pendidikan).* Kencana.

28. Dalmeri. (2014). Pendidikan Untuk Pengembangan Karakter (Telaah terhadap Gagasan Thomas Lickona dalam Educating for Character). *Al-Ulum*, *14*(1), 269–288. https://journal.iaingorontalo.ac.id/index.php/au/article/view/260

29. Hussain, A. (2004). Islamic education: Why is there a need for it? *Journal of Beliefs & Values,* *25*(3), 317–323. https://doi.org/10.1080/1361767042000306130

30. Grine, F., Bensaid, B., Nor, M. R. M., & Ladjal, T. (2013). Sustainability in multi-religious societies: An Islamic perspective. *Journal of Beliefs & Values, 34*(1), 72–86.

31. Samho, B., Suryadi, A., Hakam, K. A., & Budimansyah, D. (2020). Strengthening students' tolerance in the context of plurality. In A. Suryadi, A. S. Akhyadi, Y. Shantini, Sardin, & A. R. Rosmia (Ed.), *Proceedings of the first transnational webinar on adult and continuing education (TRACED 2020)* (pp. 143–145). Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k. 210508.026

32. Lapsley, D., & Woodbury, R. (2016). Moral-character development for teacher education. *Action in Teacher Education, 38*(3), 194–206. https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2016.119 4785

33. Haron, H., Jamil, N. N., & Ramli, N. M. (2020). Western and Islamic values and ethics: Are they different. *Journal of Governance and Integrity*, *4*(1), 12–28. https://doi.org/10.15282/ jgi.4.1.2020.5609

34. Keränen-Pantsu, R., & Rissanen, I. (2018). What kind of tensions are involved in the pedagogical use of religious narratives? Perspectives from Finnish Evangelic Lutheran and Islamic religious education. *Journal of Beliefs & Values, 39*(2), 157–168. https://doi.org/10.1080/136 17672.2018.1450804

35. Metcalfe, J., & Moulin-Stożek, D. (2020). Religious education teachers' perspectives on character education. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1080/ 01416200.2020.1713049

36. Hidayat, T., & Kosasih, A. (2019). Analisis Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia Nomor 22 Tahun 2016 Tentang Standar Proses Pendidikan Dasar Dan Menengah Serta Implikasinya Dalam Pembelajaran PAI di Sekolah. *Muróbbî: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, *3*(1), 45–69. https://doi.org/10.52431/murobbi.v3i1.172

37. Salahudin, A., & Alkrienciehie, I. (2013). Pendidikan Karakter, CV. Pustaka Setia.