



Empowering Society by Collaborative Governance

Awang Darumurti^(✉), M. Eko Atmojo, and Wildan Okto Maghribi

Departement of Government Science, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Kasihan, Indonesia
awangdarumurti@umy.ac.id

Abstract. This study aims to comprehensively analyze the implications of collaborative governance and community empowerment in tourism development in the Pakem Sub-district, especially ecotourism development, regarding the outcomes of public policy integration felt by the community and the social dynamics in the research site. This research employed a descriptive qualitative method with a case study approach. The data were collected through interviews with relevant sources from three stakeholders: regional officials in the Pakem and Hargobinangun Sub-districts, private parties from Ledok Sambu and Bumi Tangkil, and the local community from Pokdarwis and MSME forums. Meanwhile, field observation was carried out by looking at environmental and social conditions and the potential of local wisdom or cultural activities at tourist attractions in the Pakem Sub-district. This study utilized both primary data from interviews and observation and secondary data from literature studies such as journals, books, the internet, laws and regulations, and other scientific articles related to this research. The study discovered that social dynamics occurred when most of the local community began to depend on the nets of the tourism industry; local wisdom and this natural atmosphere were the main attractions for tourists. However, integrating public policies has not significantly impacted the community even though the Pakem Sub-district has begun to actively implement tourism development with the principle of ecotourism development. Subsequently, the lack of socialization for stakeholders in the management of sand mines and the construction of non-star hotels have harmed the quality of rivers and the availability of clean water for the local community. The collaborative governance system in the Pakem Sub-district has faced several challenges, such as improving the quality of human resources, aligning goals, integrating stakeholders, and adjusting social dynamics.

Keywords: Collaborative Governance · Community Empowerment · Ecotourism

1 Introduction

The Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY) has highly valuable cultural uniqueness; both the culture lived by the people and the historical heritage objects in various of its areas, and local wisdom in each area is the potential of the community and the region (Purwanta, 2015). Moreover, (Prayudi et al., 2017) discovered that Sleman Regency in DIY

© The Author(s) 2022

D. Mutiarin et al. (Eds.): ICOSI-HESS 2022, ASSEHR 710, pp. 699–719, 2022.

https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-65-7_57

could potentially be developed into an ecotourism area. Following the Sleman Regional Regulation No. 11 Article 17, the second point stated that the tourist area in the Pakem Sub-district should be based on ecotourism and several other development strategies.

Pakem Sub-district has five urban-villages: Candibinangun, Harjobinangun, Hargobinangun, Pakembinangun, and Purwobinangun. The productive land covered by the forest area ranks at the top as the most extensive; agriculture and gardens are second and third (Wafdan, 2020). With its geographical location close to Mount Merapi and cool natural conditions, the Pakem Sub-district has the potential to develop ecotourism-based tourism.

Ecotourism development is crucial because it considers several things, such as providing opportunities for the development of social, economic, and cultural activities for the local community, as well as having high opportunities for mutual support for other tourism development in the local area and development of forest conservation. Ecotourism begins when the negative impacts of conventional tourism begin to be felt (Setyawati, 2018), as proven by environmentalists, community figures, and cultural observers. The impacts of environmental damage are caused by the lack of awareness from tourists and the community, the uncontrolled influence of local culture, the reduced role of the local community, and business competition that has begun to threaten the environment, culture, and economy of the local community.

Therefore, the active role of the Pakem Sub-district and the Sleman Regency Government is required to mobilize the local community and the private sector to realize sustainable tourism development and attract many actors through collaborative governance. Hence, the implications can benefit the community, especially in capacity building and coordination in community empowerment.

Based on the performance report (Sleman Tourism Office, 2018), “the cohesiveness and synergy between tourism actors in tourism development are still low”. However, the contribution of the Local Government Revenue (PAD) generated by tourists visiting Sleman Regency has achieved 36.23%. Moreover, “collaborative governance is a process and structure of public policy decision making and management that involves people constructively through cross-actors to carry out public goals that cannot be achieved in other ways” (Emerson et al., 2012). This research examined collaborative governance in the Pakem Sub-district and determined how the relationship between humans and nature through the integrity of public policies to protect natural conditions is crucial for environmental conservation in the Pakem Sub-district, as well as the role of the private sector in solving problems with the local community. This research utilized the theory of political ecology, empowerment, and collaborative governance through qualitative descriptive analysis. This research employed eight variables to analyze the collaborative processes and three to examine community empowerment in the Pakem Sub-district.

2 Literature Review

Based on the Sage Handbook of Governance (Bevir, 2011), collaborative governance as a network refers to more than two parties in a bilateral contract. As (Rasche, 2010) asserted, the concept of collaborative governance emphasizes its arrangements by combining a diverse set of actors, such as corporations, NGOs, unions, governments, and

Table 1. Variables of Collaborative Governance

Variables	Parameters
Coproducing public goods	The policy enables the work of citizens in coproducing public goods.
Mobilizing community assets	The policy enables the community to mobilize its assets for problem-solving and development.
Sharing professional expertise	The policy mobilizes expert knowledge to enlighten and empower citizens and to use their local knowledge.
Enabling public deliberation	The policy enables and expects citizens to engage in public reasoning that forms the basis of good policy choices, democratic legitimacy, and effective implementation.
Promoting sustainable partnerships	The policy promotes collaborative work and partnerships among citizens, organized stakeholders, and public agencies.
Building fields and governance networks strategically	The policy mobilizes field-building assets strategically to enable citizens, civic associations, and broader governance networks to work effectively.
Transforming institutional cultures	The policy catalyzes public and non-profit agencies to become learning organizations for community empowerment and civic problem-solving and draws market actors into civic partnerships and culture change.
Ensuring reciprocal accountability	The policy promotes mutual accountability for collaborative work among the broad range of democratic actors and partners.

Source Sirianni (2010)

intergovernmental institutions, which attempt to influence the behavior of corporations on social and environmental issues. Moreover, (Ansell and Torfing, 2015) argued that collaborative governance as network governance signals that the collective attempts to steer society and the economy are conducted by a plural and distributed group of stakeholders whose interaction model is neither hierarchical nor contractual. Leadership for collaborative governance is extremely different from traditional notions of leadership that are organizational (hierarchical) and ultimately about authority and motivating “followers” (Morse, 2007). As (Amsler, 2016) defined, the concept of collaborative governance utilizes a broad conception of collaborative governance as an umbrella term. According to Sirianni (2010), there are eight variables of collaborative governance (Table 1).

As pointed out by (Zimmerman, 2000), the definition of empowerment theory is both a value orientation for working in the community and a theoretical model for understanding the process and consequences of efforts to exert control and influence over

Table 2. Variables and Parameters of Community Empowerment

Variables	Parameters
Community Participation	It identifies the needs based on the allocation needs of the community involved.
Community Capacity Building	Leadership and empowerment improve coordination and the ability to lead the community in development based on community needs.
Community Access to Information	Transparency and openness among stakeholders facilitate information access to create innovation and advantages.

decisions that affect one’s life, organizational functioning, and the quality of community life. Empowerment represents a non-expert power-based approach that emphasizes the ability of people facing difficult life circumstances or community conditions to define and actively solve the problems they confront (Peterson, 2014). As conceptualized by (Zimmerman & Peterson, 2004), empowerment is divided into two, psychological and organizational. Moreover, it has been stated by (Nikkhah & Redzuan, 2009) that the possibility of empowerment depends on two things. First, empowerment requires that power can change. If it cannot change, inherent in positions or people, empowerment is impossible nor conceivable in any meaningful way. Second, the concept of empowerment depends upon the idea that power can expand. Three sides to striving for community empowerment are displayed in the following Table 2.

3 Method

This research utilized a descriptive qualitative method under a case study approach. Data were obtained substantively. The researchers examined collaborative governance in empowering the local community and analyzing ecotourism development in the Pakem Sub-district. This study employed both primary and secondary data. Primary data were gathered directly from the Pakem Sub-district, Hargobinangun Village, Ledok Sambu, Bumi Tangkil, the Pokdarwis, and UMKM forums through observation, interviews, and documentation. In contrast, secondary data were collected from literature studies, such as journals, books, the internet, laws and regulations, and other related reading sources.

4 Findings and Discussion

4.1 Coproducing Public Goods

Concerning cooperation, collaborative governance in the Pakem Sub-district has created local community forums for communication. These forums could be accessed for information exchange between the government and the community. They were separated based on the business and interests of the local society. As (Ansell & Gash, 2008) asserted, “the incentives that stakeholders have to enter into collaboration will loom

large as a factor in explaining whether collaborative governance can be successful". This type of public product determines the effectiveness of the communication between the government and the community in accessing information and complaints and as a place to express ideas. The existence of the Pokdarwis and the UMKM forums has made social dynamics that turned the community into development actors in tourism development. The Pakem Sub-district has provided opportunities for the private sector and investors to open new tourist attractions, which must go through permission from the Sleman Tourism Department. After the development project is approved, it must proceed to the second presentation by inviting representatives from each existing local community group. This meeting discusses the development and division of tasks. With this type of system, when the government employs a process approach where stakeholders must follow the stages in public policy, the three stakeholders require the relationship of mutual needs for the sake of the sustainability of the development projects.

However, with an open flow of investment, the construction of non-star hotels and villas is spread in the Pakem Sub-district area, potentially threatening the continuity of access to clean water for households and agriculture. As (BPS Sleman, 2017) discovered, the construction of hotels was uncontrolled, and one 3-star hotel was not managed properly. This phenomenon does not follow Regional Regulation No. 11 of 2015, stating that tourism in Pakem must be based on recreation, environment (ecotourism), special interests, and education about Mount Merapi. Therefore, if this continues, it will threaten the sustainability of the surrounding environment and is not following what has been regulated in regional regulations. Hence, the integration of policies needs to be carried out by the Pakem Sub-district Government to provide sustainable benefits for the community and the environment. Thus, the potential of the existing environment will be sustainable to achieve the common goals and fulfill the tourism development master plan written in local regulations.

The collaboration with the private sector, such as Ledok Sambu, has empowered the local community by opening the Sayur Sambu online market to help local farmers in the Pakem Sub-district during the pandemic. The agricultural sector in rural areas has become potential local wisdom that the private sector should preserve for continuity of cooperation with the local community. Meanwhile, the government and the Sleman Tourism Department, in collaboration with the private sector, such as Jeep Merapi and convenience stores, have promoted or directed tourists to buy local products produced by the local community.

However, cooperation with convenience stores, such as Indomaret and Alfamart, has been less favorable for UMKM with limited capital because this cooperation system requires three layers of capital. Accordingly, only UMKM, with large capital deposits, could fulfill market demands from convenience stores. The engagement from the Pakem Sub-district and the CSR was in the form of moral support in the performance of local Javanese culture displayed on the cultural stage in Kaliurang. Bank BPD DIY built this stage in the form of provided facilitation. The local community was paid to perform by the manager of the tourism site, amounting to Rp 1,000,000–2,000,000. In terms of tourist destinations, Turgo Tourism Village is the Pakem Sub-district Government's cooperation with Taman Nasional Gunung Merapi (TNGM). They developed a project to make it tourism with ecotourism values. However, it was still in the development stage

with empowerment from the village government and the private sector to increase the knowledge and ability of the community to manage the potential of the tourist village environment. Local wisdom is the attraction contained in every village in the Pakem Sub-district. According to (Vitasurya, 2016), “local wisdom emerged through internal process and passed for a long time as a result of the interaction between humans and their environment”. It makes tourism programs managed by stakeholders always engage with local wisdom, local culture, and daily activities of Javanese rural communities, potential tourist attractions.

The private sector required the local people in tourism business practices. Therefore, the community often worked as outbound and camping operators. For instance, the group of housewives (PKK) cooked food for tourists, managed parking lots and maintained the land, assisted by the private sector. However, with the Covid-19 pandemic, farmers also experienced a downturn in their economy. Therefore, Ledok Sambu, having a strong relationship with the local community, began innovating an effective online marketplace to help local farmer sales in Pakembinangun. Ledok Sambu also opened up opportunities for farmers from other villages to market their crops through a platform it created.

The forums created by the Pakem Sub-district Government were useful as partners in tourism development and places for actors to carry out empowerment in one place according to the needs of the existing local community. Hence, the cross-sectoral system with the presence of local organizations has contributed to the production of public goods. It could run effectively following the objectives agreed upon through the meetings held. However, it required a little innovation and awareness from the Pakem Sub-district Government to make more tourism programs based on ecotourism concepts or realize innovative ideas conveyed by the local community. Thus, public policies would be oriented based on the public interest and not only to benefit the private sector.

4.2 Mobilizing Community Assets

In mobilizing local community assets, two ways have been carried out by the Pakem Sub-district, direct and indirect. It can be understood indirectly through Musrenbang with a bottom-to-top approach. This approach began from the hamlet level by deliberation with various community elements. After that, it continued to the village level, the Pre-Musrenbang, by discussing various inputs from every hamlet. Subsequently, determining development priorities was conducted through the Musrenbang Regional Development Work Plan (RKPD) in the Pakem Sub-district. Each submitted proposal was included in the Community Participation Proposal Ceiling (PUPM). These results reached the Pakem Sub-district level for further deliberation.

However, based on the results of the Musrenbang in 2020, the priority development programs have focused on empowering the local community, especially in managing tourist villages and the local community forums and cleaning irrigation. Moreover, outcomes regarding the “environment” contained only one priority activity, Child-Friendly Park, a follow-up program targetting the community in the Candibinangun Village. The direct way was performed through deliberation between two stakeholders to support tourism management performance, monitoring and evaluation, local community training, and direct assistance from the private sector or government to the local community.

Moreover, tourism development with ecotourism values was not discussed at the 2020 Musrenbang. Reports of the Sleman Environment Department (DLH Sleman, 2019) state that it is necessary to collaborate with the village government to utilize village treasury lands to develop green open spaces (RTH) or parks to realize the main performance, the increased sustainability of environmental functions. Although Beja Wiryanto has acknowledged it, the Leader of the Pokdarwis Hargobinangun stated that “Tree planting would bring many tourists to Pakem. So, the natural beauty of Kaliurang and the environment of the village in Pakem must be maintained”. Although in this variable, the deliberation approach was prioritized, the programs in the 2020 Musrenbang for problem-solving in the tourism sector were still limited. Bumi Tangkil and Ledok Sambu admitted that “honesty is the most important factor in this deliberation to bond a trust between the two parties”. In this case, the private sector and the government must maintain consistency in their every word to realize the outcomes of the deliberation, creating sustainable relationships in moving the assets of the local community.

In terms of tourism development, the government and the private sector have always strived for the participation of the local community fairly to benefit them, such as providing locations for selling local products, developing capabilities in product packaging, cleanliness, and tourist service standards through empowerment by the Sleman Tourism Department and the private sector. However, Governor’s Decree No. 63 of 2003 states that the government can re-socialize mining entrepreneurs regarding their obligations and disseminate information to operators/miners. The government’s inactivity in providing re-socialization has made stakeholders not understand the criteria set by the government. It caused damage to the upper part of the Pakem area and around the river, which suffered minor damage (Sutrisno, 2016). Therefore, to maintain environmental sustainability, it is necessary to realize real government implementation. Thus, integrating public policies could maintain environmental conditions for the sustainability of tourism areas in the Pakem Sub-district.

According to (Sawitri, 2019), “the condition of the water catchment area is starting to become critical in parts of the Pakem Sub-district, and a rather critical class has been discovered in almost all sub-districts in Sleman Regency, except Mlati and Sleman Sub-districts”. Concerning development for solving water absorption problems and developing facilities and infrastructure, the village government and the Pakem Sub-district Government have actively monitored the river condition because the water flow is vital in tourism attractions and agricultural practices. The collaborative governance carried out by the Pakem Sub-district has not been able to contribute much to the realization of the ecotourism concept in the region. However, this collaborative governance has contributed to public participation and empowered the local community, impacting the effectiveness of problem-solving in every tourist spot. Moreover, the Pakem Sub-district should focus more on innovative ideas to develop each village because it has not yet begun developing other tourism areas, except Kaliurang and its surrounding area, Hargobinangun.

4.3 Sharing Professional Expertise

In this discussion, professional expertise, seeing as the distribution of knowledge to the local community to enlighten them with new knowledge, could empower their activities

Table 3. Priority Activities to Empower and Insight the Local Community

Priority Activities	Activity Objectives	Location
Business Development Training + Replication Study	UMKM Forum	Pakem Sub-district
Batik Craft Training	Batik Craftsmen Group	Purwobinangun Village
Tourism Village Management Training	1. Pokdarwis Turgo 2. Pokdarwis Kaliurang Hargobinangun	1. Turgo Tourism Village 2. Hargobinangun
Agricultural Product Management Training	Farmer Group Association (Gapoktan), Women Farmer Groups	Pakem Sub-district

Source The Pakem Sub-district Musrenbang, 2020

to live more innovative or sustainably. Usually, in sharing knowledge and expertise, the Pakem Sub-district or private sector invited experts from universities or entrepreneurs to assist the community in developing their business products, skills, and effective tourism development. In supporting tourism activities, knowledge is highly required regarding existing scientific standards, allowing the tourism business to run effectively and safely. In this case, according to the LKJIP (Pakem Sub-district, 2017), the target performance indicator of “increasing community empowerment”, namely the number of facilitated community activities, in 2017, succeeded in realizing four activities, with a performance achievement of 100% (Table 3).

The programs contained in the 2020 Musrenbang focused on the development of human resources. Hence, sharing insights and expertise was required in several sectors to help the local community grow and optimally manage tourist attractions and community affairs. This integration of public policies tended to empower the local community. Although there was still a lack of tourism development programs based on ecotourism principles, the Pakem Sub-districts prioritized human resource development. According to Beja Wiryanto as a leader of the Pokdarwis, the training they received was communication ethics, English language training, a tour guide, and a first aid kit. The training was brought in if the village or sub-district government had a budget. If the government did not have the budget, the Pokdarwis groups held training only if needed. They brought in an expert to train them using chip money.

Expert knowledge could enlighten and empower the local community’s daily activities. The skills received or improved through empowerment were useful for the creativity and ideas to develop the area and the activities and for handling tourists when visiting the Pakem Sub-district. Local wisdom in Javanese, such as “unggah-ungguh,” has been closely related to tourism service activities. In serving tourists, the community has applied Javanese culture that teaches respect and courtesy. Visitors were crucial since tourism activities were the main income for the community. Pokdarwis members always reminded each other to behave politely and actively ask tourists when looking for directions, tourism sites, and stalls selling local foods.

The implications of sharing insights and expertise by the private sector aimed to train the capabilities of the local community concerning knowledge of tourism services, field maintenance, and other tourism operational skills. Hence, knowledge from experts helped people become professional in doing their jobs to satisfy tourists with their performance. The local community was often involved in tourism programs in several tourist areas. The cross-sectoral system has provided awareness to stakeholders to play an active role in developing the capacity of the local community. The concept of ecotourism that must be fulfilled is using the existing socio-cultural potential in the community to support their economy through tourism activities, with empowerment process and training by the village government, the Pakem Sub-district, the Sleman Tourism Department, and the TNGM.

4.4 Enabling Public Deliberation

Most policies between stakeholders were implemented through deliberation or a humanist approach by prioritizing the prevailing cultures in each village. The Pokdarwis and UMKM have been actively involved in the discussion of tourism activities and development because they were government partners in assisting tourism development and actors who must pay attention to development and problems regarding the capability of the local community. Most private sector members used to discuss changes or evaluations regarding tourism activities. The private sector should appreciate social dynamics such as capacity building and achievements made to provide a sense of equality because the implementation of tourism development begins from a mutual relationship between stakeholders. According to (Ansell & Gash, 2008), the government needs to periodically involve non-state stakeholders in formulating and implementing environmental conservation or tourism development programs.

Meanwhile, regarding conservancy, the TNGM has conducted meetings on the sustainability of activities requiring cooperation from various actors around the area. Collaboration governance is essential in nature conservation because it is the responsibility of all actors to protect nature and increase awareness of stakeholders to be more sustainable in their business. Increasing awareness of the environment was performed through coordination meetings, bringing in various stakeholders such as academia, the community, the private sector, and the village or sub-district government.

Based on (TN Gunung Merapi, 2019), the meetings also discussed some interests related to the mobilization of the local community in using natural resources, support from the village and district heads, and activity of an inventory and verification of the community's proposals to become materials for a conservation partnership as the next step of work. Hence, it would support the economy of the community located around the TNGM area. As (Paramita, Muhlisin, and Palawa, 2018) mentioned, empowerment and independence are reflected in the fulfillment of rural social and economic facilities and infrastructure, as well as increased community productive economic activities. The deliberation would be real action, as would an approach to empower the community and improve sustainable relationships. Thus, stakeholders moved systematically and did not threaten the environmental ecosystem.

The contribution generated from this variable was the large number of public policy choices discussed in the government and private sector deliberations. Moreover, collaborative governance could direct the public to select and discuss policies for common goals. Based on the interview and observation, the tourism development of the Pakem Sub-district has always strived for democratic values to be manifested in every deliberation. Hence, it would not cause problems and conflicts in the tourism development in the Pakem Sub-district. Therefore, the quality of decision-making enabled the local community to actively participate in each meeting held by the Sleman Tourism Department, Ministry of Environment and Forestry, villages, and the Pakem Sub-district Government.

4.5 Promoting Sustainable Partnerships

Implementing collaborative governance could strengthen the collaboration between three stakeholders to be more active in cooperation in the future to achieve common goals. Therefore, the role of the government is needed to mobilize actors to maintain the partnership between the local community and the private sector. Tourism development will run effectively if the collaboration keeps integration and harmony in formulating policy and fair power distribution.

The Sleman Regency Government formed the Corporate Social and Environmental Responsibility (TJSP). This forum is under the supervision of Sleman Bappeda. The establishment of the TJSP forum is based on Sleman Regent Regulation No. 17 of 2018. Article 1 states that the responsibility attached to each company is to continue to create a harmonious, balanced, and appropriate environment, norms, and culture of the local community. Article 11 articulates that companies with legal entities are required to become members of CSR. However, since CSR is a new forum, the distribution of assistance, facilities, and training has been carried out even though it has not yet entered the massive stage.

In short, as a manifestation, the role of CSR is still developing in development in every sub-district in Sleman. This policy-making can be considered an effort of the Regent to realize sustainable partnerships with private companies or Regional Owned Enterprises (BUMD). Concerning the support of the local community around Mount Merapi, although they did not openly reject the development of the tourism sector, they wanted it not to interfere with harmonizing the community with nature (Wardiyanta et al., 2020).

The local government and the CSR in this cooperation must prioritize aspects of local culture that the community believes in due to the extremely sacred proximity of the Pakem Sub-district community to Mount Merapi. After all, the relationship between humans and nature is a harmony that must be maintained. Assistance and facilities could strengthen relations with the community. Consistency and integration are crucial in sustainable collaborative governance processes, how stakeholders can maintain an existing system, rules, and written and unwritten laws in villages. On the one side, the government has actively played roles in mobilization, motivation, monitoring and evaluation, and event organizing. On the other side, the private sector has played more roles in providing facilities and fund aids for training and empowerment. However, the private sector sometimes played roles in mobilization and problem-solving in business.

Development and tourism activities close human relations with nature because they interact with nature where humans live. However, ignorance causes one of the development actors to suffer. As the Kumparan news channel (Tugu Jogja, 2020) reported, “There is a hotel with abundant irrigation supported by pumping from a company to serve irrigation for residents in the five Neighborhood Associations (RT). When the water reserves in the hotel are abundant, residents suffocate from lack of water”. Maintaining good relations with other actors must consider the relationship between nature and humans in the local community. Thus, no stakeholder would experience a water crisis during the cooperation. The private sector and the government must provide a sustainable impact resulting from cooperation that trusts each other and does not harm the community in the tourism industry. The variables and parameters under collaborative governance in the Pakem Sub-district are organizing and promoting sustainable partnerships for tourism development and community empowerment, even though it has encountered a problem relating to hotels and the impact on water supply.

4.6 Building Fields and Governance Networks Strategically

The weakness of the cross-sectoral system in the Pakem Sub-district was that the stakeholders did not have more power to force other actors into their tourism development management, so the efficiency could not be determined at regular meetings. The primary data unveiled that “these three stakeholders have their interests, it is difficult to harmonize programs as a result of tourism development in the Pakem Sub-district carried out according to the interest of each stakeholder”. The principle of morality is essential as a filter for all substances of spatial planning policies that do not favor the interests of business people or entrepreneurs (Susena & Widowaty, 2018). The flexibility available in this system allows the policy-making process to take place comprehensively, and the stakeholders carry out their roles in tourism development. The villages and the Pakem Sub-district government have the authority to monitor the development process to achieve the predetermined targets effectively and efficiently.

The involvement of the community, the government, and the private sector has been carried out as effectively as possible because it will be difficult to adjust development targets if the government does not play its role as a connector between tourism development actors in Pakem. The development of tourism villages and tourist villages has been planned to support tourism activities in Pakem. Thus, the continuity between the local community and the environment must be balanced. This system has invited a broader governance system assisted by many parties, especially the Sleman Tourism Department and the TJSP forum. They have been aware of the environment and the economics of the local community, culture, and environment, essential factors in tourism development in the Pakem Sub-district. Therefore, to make it a strategic system, the stakeholders must have the will to and awareness of this collaborative governance system.

The culture of public service organizations requires a different conceptualization of change, and sustainability has become an imperative issue for them (Osborne & Brown, 2012). It may be in their work concerning developing economically sustainable communities through area regeneration programs. Therefore, to determine a strategic network, the role of three stakeholders is necessary for providing views and innovative

ideas in developing a service and sustainable tourism sector development through the regeneration of tourism products or an icon that can characterize the identity of a region.

Regarding implementation, the TJSP forum has created a wider governance network by attracting private and regional companies to its management and giving their respective responsibilities based on Regent Decree (Bupati Sleman, 2018). The Sleman Regency and the Pakem Sub-district Governments have attempted to attract other actors in terms of regional development and community empowerment through written programs in the Musrenbang or through aid from the TJSP forum established by the Sleman Regent. In this way, the criteria used in this operational definition fit with the systems implemented by the two government agencies to expand the network. However, communication and consistency should be improved for the quality of the implementation of the agreed targets.

Public policy, task distribution, and programs made through deliberation between stakeholders have been quite effective in mobilizing the asset of villages. Moreover, the cross-sectoral system in the Pakem Sub-district needs consistency from tourism actors (private sector, PT AMI, and TNGM). To develop the asset more strategically, the Pakem Sub-district and village government needed more power to mobilize other stakeholders to fulfill the advice and critics from the local community and village government. The deliberation and empowerment could make the development run strategically. With awareness from stakeholders, a cross-sectoral system enables the local community to work more systematically and build a wider network of cooperation.

4.7 Transforming Institutional Cultures

The differences of interest should be understood by conducting a deep discussion in the deliberation to achieve changes through democratic ways. Following (Siriani, 2010), “the democratic government has a fundamental and fully legitimate interest in its citizens”. The research data uncovered that private institutions and the local community needed each other to develop the private sector business and job opportunities to improve the local economy. Indirectly, the private sector has been actively involved in solving problems within the scope of their business area. If necessary, discussions regarding problem-solving were carried out with forum group discussion (FGD), maintaining the outcomes and levels of community satisfaction and development to fulfill stakeholders’ responsibility. Therefore, as (Wijayanti, 2019) stated, “The TNGM has collaborated with various parties, including the community in tourism development, to create mutually beneficial relationships in developing and preserving the area in the TNGM”. The Utilization Zone is used for natural tourism and water environmental services. The TNGM has developed natural tourism: Turgo Nature Tourism, Tritis, Tlogo Nirmolo or Japanese Cave, Tlogo Muncar, Gandok, Kalikuning, Kaliadem, Deles, Totogan Waterfall, Lowo Cave, and the Selo Hiking Trail.

The CSR has provided financial aid directly because its role in tourism development is to provide funds to improve the development quality and the local community. In this case, the Pakem Sub-district Government has been actively communicating with banks and hotels in Pakem to assist in facilities or funds. The system is cross-sectoral; thus, it is necessary to coordinate with the curtains management, such as the Turgo area managed by PT AMI, to change a culture. Therefore, the Pakem Sub-district would separate its

objectives in cooperation with the private sector in the PT AMI area. The role in tourism development was determined in the deliberation with the governments of the village and the Pakem Sub-district. This deliberation resulted in the separation of roles by the private sector, whether it is the role of a facilitator, aid funds, or directly conducting training for the local community.

A direct approach was required to change the culture of each stakeholder to create trust and awareness in their environment. Pakem Sub-district often utilized this approach to Pokdarwis and the private sector to understand the problems and the needed empowerment for the community. The village government presented experts as presenters in community empowerment. Even the private sector did not have a formal obligation to carry out community empowerment with a broad scope. However, in the end, the local community must be involved because the private sector needs them in its business. Hence, the cultural change was realized into an institution performing community empowerment and problem-solving in the hamlets in every tourist spot managed by the private sector or state institution. These changes have been through various steps, and most private sector institutions used the cultural approach in deliberation or empowerment. However, the private sector has been more active in providing funds and facilities in the community. The activity of the private sector has become a significant change in the role of development and problem-solving in the community.

The research conducted by (Purnama, 2017) discovered that the sub-districts included in the developed but depressed areas were Turi and Pakem Sub-districts. These areas had a high per capita income. However, it was not matched by high growth compared to the average growth rate of Gross Regional Domestic Product (PDRB) per capita in the Sleman Regency. Therefore, to support significant growth, the government has designed human resource development and engagement of the local community by the private sector. Thus, in its implication, the local community also grew into independent actors who could provide innovation and change the culture of these institutions to increase awareness of the government as an actor, which has the power in public policy to pay more attention to the balance of growth between the tourism sector and human resources. The bottom-to-top approach has become the method for local community involvement in private sector development. Collaborative governance has contributed to attracting many actors to be involved in community empowerment activities. This implementation impacted cooperation between actors in problem-solving through a cultural approach and deliberation.

4.8 Ensuring Reciprocal Accountability

It is an obligation for one of the actors to be accountable for all activities and report on the success or failure of the implementation. According to (Jenkins, 2014), "In collaborative governance approaches, accountability arrangements are more diffuse. There are multiple stakeholders with greater involvement in decision making and implementation". The collaborative governance system in the Pakem Sub-district is cross-sectoral. Therefore, the accountability practice was not stuck in one actor or forum but in every cooperation, such as the village government, the Pokdarwis, the private sector, and the community. The informants regarded the practice of accountability. It occurred horizontally and must be accountable to the wider community for every activity.

Table 4. Accountability Strategies in the Pakem Sub-district

Accountability Strategies	Explanation
Collaborating with stakeholders in realizing the concept of ecotourism	Inviting many actors in realizing sustainable tourism
Distribution of responsibility to the local community	Deliberation becomes a medium to distribute responsibilities to the local community.
The limitation of responsibility between stakeholders	A cross-sectoral system limits the authority of each actor, and deliberation explains the limits of responsibility that must be carried out.
A clear accountability system between stakeholders	So far, written accountability exists between the Pakem Sub-district and the Sleman Tourism Department. The private sector and the local community use deliberation through an unwritten accountability system.
An agreement to penalize actors who damage the ecosystem in the Pakem Sub-district	The TNGM has agreements with the community regarding using zones in the TNGM area.

Beja stated, “Reciprocal accountability occurs when Pokdarwis is involved in an event or tourism development activity. Pokdarwis is the partner of the village and the Pakem Sub-district governments, so there are no accountability reports”. The form of cooperation between the Pakem Sub-district and the local community forums, such as Pokdarwis, was development partners with the same position. Accountability reports between the two actors are not required if no tourism events or programs are implemented. The village government has actively invited the local community to join in development planning, but the private sector participation was limited. Therefore, from a planning perspective, it cannot be accountable and participatory. In realizing an effective collaborative system, participation in the public policy formulation is required as a form of accountability for government performance in realizing public sector reform. It is not only from monitoring and dialogue with several tourism sites but also as a whole (Table 4).

The integration of tourism development and an accountability strategy will impact the opportunity for the community to have a greater responsibility in managing and being actively involved in tourism activities as an attractive potential to be experienced by tourists. Following (Imawan et al., 2019), accountability to the community, or what is known as horizontal accountability is carried out as a form of responsibility for the implementation of tasks or authority obtained by the village government. Meanwhile, vertical accountability is performed to make the governance run well and determine the failure and success of village government performance. Therefore, accountability, transparency, and community empowerment impacted the development of the Pakem Sub-district, especially in tourism potential in each village. Hence, the development ran effectively based on the responsibilities of each actor in Pakem.

Most people in the Pakem Sub-district were farmers. Using wisdom, tourism development would significantly impact the local economy and community capacity development. The field observation disclosed that tourist attractions managed by the private sector often created tourism activities such as plowing fields and planting plants and rice. These activities have provided opportunities for the involvement of local farmers. This public engagement took place in a relationship that needs each other because the Pakem Sub-district is an area that depends on tourist visits. Therefore, the distribution of accountability carried out by stakeholders was useful for imposing boundaries and tasks. Carrying out the approach through deliberation has become a characteristic feature in the village government to get closer to the community using the local wisdom in the local community in each village.

4.9 Community Participation

Collaborative governance in the Pakem Sub-district has contributed to the conduct of meetings, deliberations, and community empowerment through a cross-sectoral system. The resulting contribution was that the actors participated at the beginning when budget and development planning and work distribution were carried out through meetings attended by the three stakeholders. Identifying needs at the village government level required communicative handling with the community. A bottom-to-top approach was required, allowing various community elements to hear the community's needs thoroughly. As (Hilman, 2017) asserted, institutions at the village level discuss the identification of needs, covering (i) identification of problems, (ii) identification of potential resources and development opportunities, and (iii) identification of tourism potential.

Community participation was carried out by the Pakem Sub-district and the village government by distinguishing the interests of each community organization. In this case, the government tried to be more specific in involving the local community. Each group's needs were different; thus, the Pakem Sub-district regularly conducted FGD with the Pokdarwis to identify the needs for tourism development in the village. The identification of needs was conducted by field monitoring to examine tourism activities and their impact on environmental conditions. The results of this monitoring have been used as a basis for providing advice and problem-solving in tourism development under the management of the private sector.

Furthermore, the FGDs between three stakeholders were held every three months or if necessary. Identifying needs in public participation in tourism management by the private sector was carried out using FGDs. Moreover, the private management often checked the field operations handled by the local community. In this case, Ledok Sambu stated that "the identification of needs is conducted through routine checks regarding maintenance of land, parking lots, and operation of facilities".

FGDs revealed that the village government and the private sector acted as facilitators for creating a comfortable environment for the local community and must be able to listen to community needs. The observations were useful for placing responsibility for the community. The essence of deliberations depicted the reality of human equality, freedom of opinion, and the right to criticism and recognition of humanity (Hanafi, 2013). Public policy integration inside Sleman Regent Regulation No. 44.1 of 2019 regulates the temporary suspension of construction of hotels and condotels in the Sleman

Regency. This public policy prioritizes phenomena around the Pakem Sub-district that threaten the quality of the environment. Even though it was only applied temporarily, it provided a temporary space for stakeholders to rethink negative environmental impacts. The identification of needs carried out by three stakeholders became a medium for exchanging information and complaints through the FGDs, often conducted and as one of the empowerments for the community. Therefore, the community would have the power to provide opinions and criticisms for other stakeholders.

4.10 Community Capacity Building

Community capacity building in collaborative governance is an essential focus because it relates to the quality of human resources and will affect the effectiveness of development in the Pakem Sub-district. Community leadership is required to support tourism development's effectiveness and coordination to increase awareness of environmental conditions in Pakem. The Pakem Sub-district has encouraged improving the community's coordination ability and created innovation in managing tourism. The coordination ability owned by the Pokdarwis allowed the group to make innovations in sustainable tourism development, such as planting trees (conservation), increasing cooperation with the private sector, and improving the welfare of the local community by getting job opportunities.

Meanwhile, the Pokdarwis stated that "empowerment and training can improve coordination and ability of the local community, but the government has lack inability in building tourism". Looking at the Government Agency Performance Reports (Dinas Pariwisata Sleman, 2018), the Department of Tourism Destination Development and the Creative Economy had solely 20 employees, 11 with high school education, five junior high school students, one elementary school student, one with an undergraduate degree and two postgraduate graduates. Hence, it is necessary to run workload analysis to improve the effectiveness in task completion to increase community satisfaction with the performance and bring innovative ideas. In tourism management, every hamlet collaborating with the private sector had coordination and leadership carried out by local community figures or the head of the hamlet.

Community figures significantly influenced the implementation of coordination and decisions. Hence, their roles and responsibilities were vital in community empowerment. In terms of ecological restoration, the TNGM often invited stakeholders, especially local community figures to attract the interest of residents in each village to contribute to the preservation of flora and fauna in the TNGM area. The utilization zone used as a tourism area required synergy from stakeholders to maintain and care for the integrity of the environmental ecosystem in the TNGM area. The leadership required local community figures and systematic movements to improve stakeholder coordination to achieve tourism with an ecotourism concept.

4.11 Community Access to Information

Collaborative governance must provide transparency of information between stakeholders to increase trust. In this case, collaborative governance in the Pakem Sub-district was quite open regarding some information that should be disseminated to the public. The



Fig. 1. Ecotourism-based Business

government has provided access to information through the web of government institutions, deliberations, and WhatsApp groups. The empowerment was beneficial to developing awareness and information disclosure regarding the conditions of the surrounding environment. Thus, the stakeholders could be more active in protecting nature through “*gotong-royong*” or working together. It aims to clean the environment by involving many actors, a cultural approach in rural areas in Indonesia.

Through meetings, transparent and easy access to information was carried out by mentoring or communicating with local community groups in each village. The local community asserted that “the villages government often involves the community in budget formulation, but for Pakem Sub-district and Sleman Regency Governments, it is only limited to participate in the Musrenbang”. The private sector only shared information about field activities with the public. Due to limited access to information, it did not share financial information (Fig. 1).

Ecotourism development could be carried out by developing ecotourism-based businesses. The development of ecology is the right medium for developing natural conservation areas (Purwanto, 2019). Natural tourism objects have been available in the Pakem Sub-district, and most were in conservation areas in the TNGM. It led the government and the private sector to cooperate in creating healthy tourism business practices. They maintained environmental conditions by conducting conservation. Therefore, dialog with stakeholders and field observations were often carried out to monitor tourism activities.

The Pakem Sub-district Government and the local community must also play a role in supervision. The benefit of communication through WhatsApp groups, deliberation, and direct approaches was to inform the government of a violation that could spoil the environmental conditions. The government could impose penalties on other stakeholders, especially the private sector. The Sleman Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2016 concerning the Environmental Protection and Management issue states that using natural resources must be balanced with environmental functions. Consequently, development policies, plans, and programs must be imbued with the obligation to conserve the environment and realize sustainable development goals.

Providing policies and human resources that support a sustainable tourism development pattern from the stakeholders, the Pakem Sub-district, village government, the TNGM, and the Sleman Tourism Department, was performed by holding empowerment to increase the ability and awareness of the local community. Therefore, empowerment benefited the community concerning the ease to access to information. Even though only necessary information has been shared, the local community could obtain new knowledge regarding maintaining the environment, awareness, and operation of tourism activities. Hence, the stakeholders in the Pakem Sub-district performed transparency regarding necessary information. Moreover, this deliberation and empowerment created trust-building among the stakeholders.

5 Conclusion

In conclusion, the implementation of tourism development in the Pakem Sub-district under the Sleman Regional Regulation No. 11 Article 17 concerning the development strategies of the tourist area disclosed that the Sleman Regency and the Pakem Sub-district Governments have built cooperation using the cross-sectoral system by inviting various stakeholders into tourism development.

The Head of the Pakem Sub-district directed the development by providing guidance, empowerment, and supervision. Nevertheless, it encountered various obstacles, such as the need for human resources development to support tourism development, goal alignment, integration between actors, and adjustment of social dynamics.

The Pakem Sub-district acted as a mobilizer, entrepreneur, coordinator, facilitator, stimulator, and liaison to fulfill collaborative governance and empowerment indicators. The local community also played a role as a development partner contributing to tourism development and field operations in both the private sector and development programs from the government.

The private sector played a role as a provider of aid, whether of finance or facilities. Regarding the implementation, the private sector in the Pakem sub-district conducted training and empowerment for the local community. Hence, tourism activities could run effectively and increase the community's ability to coordinate and lead them to fulfill their obligations.

Sleman Regent Regulation No. 44.1 of 2019 has temporarily delayed the construction of hotels not having a permit. It was appropriate to control and mitigate future water crises on the impact of massive hotel construction. Moreover, the cross-sectoral system has provided solutions for the local community and not only benefited the private sector regarding the construction of hotels in tourist attractions.

Acknowledgments. This paper was originally written by the authors and had been checked by Turnitin software for its originality.

References

1. Amsler, L. B. (2016). Collaborative Governance: Integrating Management, Politics, and Law. *Public Administration Review*, xx, 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12605>.
2. Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
3. Ansell, C., & Torfing, J. (2015). How Does Collaborative Governance Scale? *Journal of Policy and Politics*, 43(3), 315–329. <https://doi.org/10.1332/030557315X14353344872935>
4. Bevir, M. (2011). *The SAGE Handbook of Governance*. SAGE Publications India Pvt Ltd.
5. BPS Sleman. (2017). Banyaknya Hotel Bintang dan Non Bintang Dirinci Menurut Kecamatan di Kabupaten Sleman.
6. Bupati Sleman. (2018). Surat Keputusan Sekretariat FTJSP (pp. 1–6). Pemerintah Kabupaten Sleman.
7. Dinas Pariwisata Sleman. (2018). Laporan Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah (LKjIP).
8. DLH Sleman. (2019). Laporan Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah. In Dinas Lingkungan Hidup Sleman.
9. Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative Framework For Collaborative Governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 22(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>
10. Hanafi, M. (2013). Kedudukan Musyawarah Dan Demokrasi Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Cita Hukum*, 1(2), 1–26. <https://doi.org/10.15408/jch.v1i2.2657>
11. Hilman, Y. A. (2017). Kelembagaan Kebijakan Pariwisata Di Level Desa. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 2(2), 150–163.
12. Imawan, A., Irianto, G., & Prihatiningtias, Y. (2019). Peran Akuntabilitas Pemerintah Desa Dalam Membangun Kepercayaan Publik. *Jurnal Akuntansi Multiparadigma*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.18202/jamal.2019.04.10009>
13. Jenkins, B. (2014). Collaborative Governance and Accountability Waterways Centre for Freshwater Management. 1–5.
14. Morse, R. S. (2007). Leading the Future of the Public Sector: The Third Transatlantic Dialogue Workshop 4: Leading In A Multi-Sector Environment Developing Public Leaders In An Age of Collaborative Governance.
15. Nikkhah, H. A., & Redzuan, M. (2009). Participation As A Medium Of Empowerment In Community Development. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 11(1), 170–176.
16. Osborne, S. P., & Brown, K. (2012). Managing Change and Innovation In Public Service Organizations. In *Managing Change and Innovation in Public Service Organizations*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203391129>
17. Pakem-Sub-district. (2017). Laporan Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah.
18. Paramita, M., Muhlisin, S., & Palawa, I. (2018). Peningkatan Ekonomi Masyarakat Melalui Pemanfaatan Sumber Daya Lokal. *Qardhul Hasan: Media Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, 4(1), 19. <https://doi.org/10.30997/qh.v4i1.1186>
19. Peterson, N. A. (2014). Empowerment Theory : Clarifying The Nature Of Higher-Order Multidimensional Constructs. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 96–108. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10464-013-9624-0>
20. Prayudi, Susilo, E., & Herastuti, H. (2017). Analysing Challenges Of Developing Eco Tourism Village In Sleman, Yogyakarta, Indonesia: A Community Development Approach. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 527–542. <https://doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2017.33.527542>
21. Purnama, I. J. W. (2017). Pertumbuhan Dan Ketimpangan Pembangunan Ekonomi Antar Kecamatan Di Kabupaten Sleman Provinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta.

22. Purwanta, H. (2015). Komunitas Di Yogyakarta Sebagai Sarana Aktualisasi Diri. *Jurnal Penelitian*, 19(1).
23. Purwanto, S. (2019). Ecological Restoration In Natural Conservation Tourism Area. *International Journal of Tourism, Heritage and Recreation Sport*, 1(1), 24–27.
24. Rasche, A. (2010). Collaborative Governance 2.0. *Corporate Governance: International Journal of Business in Society*, 10(4), 500–511. <https://doi.org/10.1108/14720701011069713>
25. Setyawati, E. (2018). Museum Ulen Sentallu Sebagai Ekowisata Di Kaliurang Sleman. <https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/ezcxh>
26. Sirianni, C. (2010). *Investing In Democracy: Engaging Citizens In Collaborative Governance*. Brookings Institution Press.
27. Susena, B., & Widowaty, Y. (2018). Konsep Pengendalian Tata Ruang Sesuai Asas Pembangunan Berkelanjutan Di Kabupaten Sleman. *Prosiding Konferensi Nasional Ke- 7*, 32–42.
28. Sutrisno, A. (2016). Analysis of the Physical Environment Damage Due Sand And Stone Mining In Sleman Special Region of Yogyakarta. *Promine Journal*, 4 (June), 28.
29. TN Gunung Merapi. (2019). Kepala Desa dan Camat di Daerah Penyangga Sekitar TN Gunung Merapi Menyepakati Kemitraan Konservasi. *Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup Dan Kehutanan*.
30. Tugu Jogja. (2020). 5 RT di Kaliurang Barat Alami Krisis Air. *Kumparan*.
31. Vitasurya, V. R. (2016). Local Wisdom For Sustainable Development Of Rural Tourism, Case On Kalibiru And Lopati Village, Province Of Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 216(October 2015), 97–108. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.12.014>
32. Wafdan, L. (2020). Identifikasi Klasifikasi Lahan Di Kecamatan Pakem Kabupaten Sleman Berdasarkan Interpretasi Citra Sentinel-2. *Jurnal Ilmiah Penalaran Dan Penelitian Mahasiswa*, 4(1), 105–128.
33. Wardiyanta, Hidayat, S., & Adilla, F. (2020). Pemanfaatan Potensi Alam Dan Kearifan Lokal Untuk Mendukung Promosi Pariwisata Kreatif Sleman Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Untidar*.
34. Wijayanti, E. N. (2019). Kajian Tipologi Peletakan dan Desain Signage Sebagai Kebutuhan Kota Pelajar Dan Wisata (Studi Kasus : Kecamatan Gondokusuman Dan Jetis Kota Yogyakarta) Pendahuluan Tujuan Penelitian Metode Tinjauan Teori. *Seminar on Architecture Research and Technology*, 215–225.
35. Zimmerman, M. A. (2000). Empowerment Theory. *Handbook of Community Psychology*, 1984, 43–63. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4615-4193-6_2
36. Zimmerman, M. A., & Peterson, N. A. (2004). Beyond The Individual: Toward A Nomological Network Of Organizational Empowerment. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 34(1–2), 129–145. <https://doi.org/10.1023/B:AJCP.0000040151.77047.58>

Open Access This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

