



# Differences in the Discourse of Gothic Characters in *Macbeth* and *Tempest*

Luanming Xing<sup>(✉)</sup>

Macau University of Science and Technology, International College, Macao 999078, China  
19098537u011008@student.must.edu.mo

**Abstract.** This paper focuses on the observance and violation of the cooperative principle in Gothic characters' discourse in Shakespeare's tragedies and tragicomedy and tries to find out the differences in the use of Gothic discourse in tragedy and tragicomedy. In the analysis of Gothic discourse, this paper establishes a pattern across tragedy and tragicomedy Gothic discourse. Michel Foucault's definition of discourse and Grice's cooperative principle are helpful in analyzing the discourse of the three witches and Ariel in "Macbeth" and "The Tempest". Analysis shows that both tragic and tragicomedy Gothic discourses destroy quality principles to a certain extent, but adopt different strategies in manner principle. There are more Gothic elements in tragic discourse than in tragicomedy discourse.

**Keywords:** Macbeth · The Tempest · Gothic · Discourse · Cooperative Principle

## 1 Introduction

In Shakespeare's plays, the power of discourse influences the fates and perceptions of the characters. Wyman Chris proposed that manipulators abuse linguistic behaviors and principles in Shakespeare's tragedies to gain the advantage of discourse [1]. Based on Michel Foucault's conceptual interpretation of discourse, the cooperation principle of Grice's Conversational implicature was applied in Shakespeare's plays, but the principle of discourse was seriously damaged by manipulators. There are few studies to compare the degree of destruction of the principle of discourse between tragedy and tragicomedy, which means that there is a gap in the connection between manipulators' behavior of breaking the principle of language and tragedy. Bradley believes that the Gothic element of discourse can make the tragic tendency worse [2].

This paper will analyze the discourses of Gothic characters. By analyzing the observance and violation of the principles of quality, quantity, manner, and relation in the cooperative principle of characters, as well as the use of Gothic elements, this paper discusses the three witches in the tragedy "Macbeth" and the tragicomedy "The Tempest" Distinctions in Ariel's Gothic Discourse. This will complement the research gap on the link between Gothic discourse and tragedy.

## 2 Literature Review

### 2.1 The Gothic

In literature, Gothic horror is achieved through the infiltration of the supernatural world into the natural world. Natalie Ann Hewitt used Gothic themes and aesthetic features to distinguish Gothic literature from other literary genres, that is, spectacle, sublime, sepulcher, and the supernatural [3]. Nancy H. Traill's points of fantastic typology also support the distinction between the natural and the supernatural in the text [4]. It is worth noting that Traill also mentions a parallel between the natural and the supernatural [4]. It seems to contradict the point of differentiation. However, Foucault's theory could interpret Traill's point further. Michel Foucault believes that Gothic is both unnatural and natural. Terrors and horror reflected in Gothic are excluded from traditional aesthetics. However, because the differentiated identity of Gothic is the opposite, it provides the boundary for identity and features [5]. Gothic is widely regarded as a horror that is the opposite of the real thing [6]. This kind of horror is realized in the natural world of the text, and it no longer belongs to the virtual supernatural but tries to find the real thing by rendering horror in nature [7].

Gothic horror permeates the natural world from the supernatural through language. Kilgour emphasizes that Horror is an indispensable feature of Gothic [8]. The absence of language (e.g., Empty sounds or silence) is a major source of horror, which means that the addition of language can not make the horror feel stronger [9]. Some interjections and typical Gothic images replace the terror generated in language expression. Burke also agrees that horror is often obscure [10]. However, Joseph Addison's critical Gothic expression ignores nature [11]. Only by describing fairy tales such as spirits, witches, and ghosts through appearance, dress, and language, it makes readers fall into congenital prejudice and achieve the desired effect of Gothic writing [9]. Traill also believes that the supernatural is part of nature and that it would be inappropriate to write without focusing on nature [4]. Therefore, Settings, characters, themes, and plots in the Gothic writing method have been criticized to a certain extent.

### 2.2 Tragedy and Tragicomedy

The use of Gothic elements intensifies the tragic elements in Shakespeare's plays. Bradley comments that the use of Gothic makes the short-text "Macbeth" fall into intensive fear and tragedy [2]. The appearance and discourses of the three witches are full of Gothic elements, and they are also the fuse of Macbeth's tragedy. Although "The Tempest" ends happily, the Gothic elements of Ariel's lyrics tilt the plot towards tragedy. Fletcher once defined tragicomedy as not bringing complete death, but also bringing something inappropriate that could not be called a comedy [12]. Ariel created the tempest by magic, as well as lying to Ferdinand about the king's death, which made "The Tempest", not a comedy. While Ariel does not bring full Gothic horror, and does not kill the characters, it makes "The Tempest" not a tragedy. It may also suggest that there is a correlation between the tragic elements of the play and the degree to which Gothic horror is displayed.

### 2.3 Grice's Conversational Implicature

Grice's conversational implicature is applicable in Shakespeare's plays, although there are three supernatural witches in "Macbeth" and Ariel in "The Tempest". Michel Foucault points out in *The Chronology of Knowledge* that as discourses are replaced by new discourses, discourses from different ideologies can coexist in the same era [5]. It means that although Goth characters are often accused of supernatural evil forces, the discourse of Goth characters and characters in the natural world can cross the attribute differences and form interactive influence in the form of dialogue. It also meets the basic requirement of Grice's conversational implicature, that is, conversation partners need have contributed to the conversational purpose of each other. Based on this precondition, Grice also proposed four cooperative principles to be observed in the conversational implicature, that is, Quantity (the necessary contribution of conversation partners), Quality (the veracity of a statement of fact or evidence), Manner (clear meaning expression), and Relation (Stay relevant to the topic of conversation) [13].

## 3 Discourse Traits of Gothic Characters in Shakespeare's Plays

In order to compare the difference of Gothic discourse in tragedy and tragicomedy, and further explore the connection between Gothic discourse and Shakespeare's tragic tendency, it is necessary to analysis the traits of the discourse of Gothic characters in Shakespeare's tragedy *Macbeth* and the tragicomedy *The Tempest*. Prophecy of witches and lyrics of the Spirit are typical examples of Gothic horror. These discourses interact with other characters to form communication, giving the principle of cooperation an analytical meaning.

### 3.1 The Prophecy of Witches

Gothic elements frequently appear in the discourse of three witches. In Shakespeare's first folio, the word "wayward", similar to "wayward", means a woman who betrayed God for the evil power of heresy [14], is often used to refer to three witches [15]. It testifies that Shakespeare tries to construct an evil identity for the three witches to lead to the dark things happening. The Gothic elements in the witch's discourse fulfill the mission of guiding Macbeth into action for ambition and desire through their frequent use. The final tragic fate of Macbeth is greatly related to the three prophecies brought by the three apparitions. It is the three witches who guide Macbeth to see the apparitions. During the process of exposing the three prophecies in front of Macbeth, the language guidance of the witches always exists (e.g., ALL Listen, but speak not to't, 4.1.89 [16]). Similarly, in conversation with Macbeth, the three witches' words, similar to evil rituals, make Macbeth see apparitions:

*Witch 1 (dancing and chanting) Pour in sow's blood, that hath  
Eaten  
Her nine farrow – grease that's sweaten  
From the murderer's gibbet, throw*

*Into the flame* [16].  
(4.1.63–67)

Images like Sow's Blood and murderer's Gibbet have Gothic horror connotations. The cookery-like ritual gives Apparitions' appearance an ominous mystique. This discourse of the three witches completed the creation of a horrible atmosphere through the use of Gothic elements and provided an obvious omen for Macbeth's tragedy.

The witch's discourse violates the cooperative principle in manner and quality. Macbeth calls witches "Imperfect speakers" (1.3.71) to express skepticism of witches' prophecies until they are fulfilled. In Macbeth's second visit to the witches, Macbeth gives up his previous skepticism because of the prophecy that has come true (e.g., Macbeth, for now, I am bent to know, By the worst means, the worst. 3.4.137–138). Therefore, the purpose of Macbeth's conversation changes from seeking to verify the authenticity of discourse to seeking more information. It means that in the second conversation, Macbeth asks the three witches to contribute to the conversation. Witches satisfy Macbeth's purpose in quantity and provide information about Macbeth's fate. However, the information given in the discourse of the three witches and Apparitions is subtle and discreet. By interrupting the conversation, it makes Macbeth's requirements undemonstrative in conversation. For example, in act 4 scene 1 Macbeth said that "Tell me, thou unknown power – Witch 1 He knows thy thought. Hear his speech but say thou naught. 4.1.67–70." This mode of discourse allowed witches to maintain quantity while destroying clarity of expression. It should be noted that, despite the witches' use of an obscure communication method, the cooperative principle's relationships were unaffected. For example, when Macbeth asks "What is not you do?" (4.1.48), the witches' vague answer "A deed without A name. (4.1.49) "ensures discourse relevance. Another way to remain cryptic is through incomplete exposure of utterance information. Such as:

*Macbeth...What, is this so?*  
*Witch 1 Ay, sir, all this is so.*

...

*That this great king may kindly say,*  
*Our duties did his welcome pay.*  
(4.1.124–132)

The witch responds to Macbeth's query, however, without giving clear evidence to back it up. After changing the subject, the witch welcomes Macbeth with music and dance as evidence. This discourse is also far-fetched and not accepted by Macbeth, but the absence of the witch made the discourse coercive. This destroys quality in discourse.

### 3.2 Lyrics of the Spirit

Ariel's lyrics are not entirely Gothic horror. Spirit Ariel usually assumes a mythical appearance when performing Prospero tasks (e.g., Enter Ariel like a water nymph. 1.2.379, Enter Ariel, like a Harpy.3.3.67 [17]) and silent Gothic horror (e.g., Enter Ariel invisible, playing solemn music.2.1.202). Although Ariel's actions were driven by

Prospero, the impropriety that prevented “The Tempest” from being called a comedy was directly caused by Ariel’s magic. Ariel’s lyrics, however, may also have prevented death. Ariel’s lyrics, sung in Gonzalo’s ear, stop Sebastian and Antonio from trying to kill Alonso:

*While you here do snoring lie,  
Open-eyed conspiracy  
His time doth take.  
If of life you keep a care,  
Shake off slumber and beware.  
Awake, awake [17]!  
(2.1.344–349)*

By obeying Prospero’s instructions, Ariel performs a similar leading role to the identity construction of the three witches in Macbeth, especially in the lyrics Ariel sings to the other characters. From these Lyrics, conspiracy is charged and the plot of killing is interrupted. Alonso is not killed in his sleep like Duncan, nor is sleep murdered like Macbeth [18], and the tragic trend is terminated by Ariel’s words.

Ariel broke the Cooperative principle in terms of quality. Ariel’s discourses guided Ferdinand with multiple misinformation, which was misleading. There is no actual death in the play, but Ariel’s lyrics cause Ferdinand to confirm that Alonso has died in the tempest (Ariel Full Fathom Five Thy Father lies.1.2.474). Notably, Ariel uses the opposite of Gothic romanticism to lead Ferdinand to follow Ariel before announcing Alonso’s death (Come unto these yellow sands, and then take hands. Curtsied when you have, and kissed. The wild waves whist.1.2.452–455), thus completing Ariel’s contribution to providing death information in the discourse. Ariel invisible led Ferdinand astray a second time, confiding Miranda as a goddess guiding him and facilitating Prospero’s scheme (Prospero Aside The Duke of Milan And his braver daughter could control thee.1.2.527–528). Ariel’s words are straightforward for Ferdinand to follow. However, Ariel’s lyrics lack the guarantee of the authenticity of the information provided and are more derived from the guidance of conspiratorial tasks.

## **4 The Gap in the Discourse of Gothic Character’s Between Tragedy and Tragicomedy**

### **4.1 The Using Degree of Gothic Symbols in Discourse**

The discourses of the three witches guiding Macbeth’s tragedy use far more Gothic elements than those of Ariel guiding Gonzalo and Ferdinand. The presence of Witches is often accompanied by ominous signs, such as lightning and thunder, and the Gothic horror continues in their discourses. The three witches add Gothic elements to their dialogue with Macbeth to make the supernatural more mysterious and evil, and with a hint of doom (e.g., Witch 2 Cool it with a Baboon’s blood, Then the charm is firm and Good.4.1.35–36). By contrast, the Gothic elements of Ariel’s image are often embellished. Although Ariel has the supernatural power to create the tragedy caused by the

tempest, Gothic horror is rarely used in Ariel's discourse. When Ariel sings of nonexistent death, the romantic Gothic features implicit that the tragedy did not happen (e.g., Of his bones are coral made. Those are pearls that were his eyes. 1.2.475–476). Thus, the use of Gothic elements in the discourse seems to add to the tragedy degree of Shakespeare's plays.

#### 4.2 The Violation of the Cooperative Principle

The discourses of the three witches and Ariel all violate the Cooperative principle to some extent. To fulfill the mission of guiding the identity, the three witches and Ariel all tend to contribute information to the conversation to keep it going smoothly. At the same time, ensuring the relevance of discourse in conversation is also a means to complete the task of guidance. Shakespeare directed the evil guidance of the three witches in *Macbeth* directly, but in *The Tempest*, he used Prospero to command Ariel to do the guiding, which results in the different manner adopted by the three witches and Ariel in the dialogue. In their conversation with Macbeth, the three witches need to hide the known destiny and reveal part of the real information, which makes the prophecy vague and incomplete. This way of discourse deliberately destroys the manner and quality of the Cooperative principle. The difference is that, in *Tempest*, Ariel's guiding role which Shakespeare arranged is camouflaged in Prospero's scheme. Thus, Ariel did not need to use metaphors to destroy the integrity of the message when conveying Prospero's discourses. Ariel, assisted by Prospero, completes the guiding mission by destroying the quality of the Cooperative Principle with direct lies.

#### 4.3 Destabilizing Effects on Other Characters

Vague prophecies reveal the infirmity and darkness of other characters better than deception. It means that incomplete information in discourse is more likely to cause tragedy [19]. In the process of the change of Macbeth's attitude towards prophecy from suspicion to trust, the witches' guidance to the evil and danger of Macbeth produced obvious effects. Julian Markels commented that it was not the witch's supernatural powers that determined fate, but imagination [20]. The vague prophecy strengthens Macbeth's imagination space, and the desire is endlessly expanded so that the order of human nature is affected by the chaos. Ariel's straightforward lies do not create enough imagination space for Ferdinand, stifle the possibility of the expansion of human chaos, and avoid the root cause of the tragedy to some extent.

### 5 Conclusion

There are subtle differences in the use of discourse by Gothic characters in Shakespeare's tragedies and tragicomedy. To explore the differences, this paper establishes a pattern across tragedy and tragicomedy in Gothic discourse. It focuses on the compliance tendency of the Cooperative principle in Conversational implicature and the use of Gothic elements in discourse. Under the concept of discourse put forward by Foucault, the discourse of Gothic characters in Shakespeare's play "*Macbeth*" and "*The Tempest*" violate

Grice's Conversational implicature to a certain extent, especially reflected in the manner principle and quality principle. In terms of quality in the Cooperative Principle, the words of Gothic characters in tragedy and tragicomedy show similar destructive power, while Gothic discourse in tragedy tends to use metaphorical manner with mysterious color, while deception in tragicomedy is more direct. Vague discourses are more likely to lead to tragic tendencies by causing chaos in the human order. In addition, the leading discourse of Gothic characters in tragedies tends to contain more Gothic elements, and the discourse of Gothic characters in tragicomedy has some romantic conceals. This paper explores the differences between tragedy and tragicomedy in the discourse of Gothic characters and analyzes the influence of Gothic elements on the tendency of tragedy from the perspective of discourse use. It provides a new analytical thought for the discourse analysis of Shakespeare's play from the perspective of Gothic visions. However, this paper focuses on the analysis of Gothic discourse which plays a special role in the Shakespeare's play. It means that more specialized utterances may be ignored. To confirm the universality of the conclusion, more Gothic discourse in Shakespearean plays needs to be discussed.

## References

1. Wyman, C. Pragmatics and manipulation in three Shakespearean tragedies (Master's thesis), 2021.
2. Bradley, Andrew Cecil. *Shakespearean Tragedy: Lectures on Hamlet, Othello, King Lear, Macbeth*. 2nd ed. London: Macmillan and Co., Limited, 1919.
3. Hewitt, N. A. Something old and dark has got its way: Shakespeare's influence in the gothic literary tradition (Order No. 3559142). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, 2013.
4. Traill. *Possible Worlds of the Fantastic: The Rise of the Paranormal in Literature*. University of Toronto Press, 1995.
5. Foucault M. *Archaeology of knowledge*[M]. routledge, 2013.
6. McGowan, K. *Key issues in critical and cultural theory*. London: Open University Press, 2007.
7. Botting, Fred. "Limits of Horror: Technology, Bodies, Gothic." *Limits of Horror*, Manchester University Press, 2013.
8. Kilgour, Maggie. *The Rise of the gothic Novel*. London: Routledge, 1995:24.
9. *Romantic Gothic: An Edinburgh Companion*. Edinburgh University Press, 2015.
10. Burke, Turner, F. M., McMahon, D. M., & Turner, F. *Reflections on the revolution in France* [electronic resource]/Edmund Burke; edited by Frank M. Turner; with essays by Darrin M. McMahon ... [et al.]. Yale University Press, 2003.
11. Addison, Joseph. *Critical Essays from the Spectator*, ed. Donald F. Bond, London: Oxford University Press, 1970. (199–200)
12. John Fletcher, *The Faithful Shepherdess*, ed. Cyrus Hoy, in Fredson Bowers (gen. ed.), *The Dramatic Works in the Beaumont and Fletcher Canon*, 10 vols (Cambridge, 1976), III, pp. 483–612.
13. Grice, H. P. *Logic and conversation*. New York: Academic Press, 1971.
14. Mills, Jane. *Womanwords*. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1989.
15. Allen, Suzan Marie. *Shakespeare's "Macbeth" and the Witchcraft Discourses of England*. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing, 2002.
16. Shakespeare, William. *Macbeth/William Shakespeare*. Open Road Integrated Media, 2020.
17. Shakespeare, William. *The Tempest/by William Shakespeare*. First Avenue Editions, 2015.

18. Koppenfels. “MACBETH”: THE TRAGEDY OF SLEEP. *Revista Chilena de Literatura.*, 103, 19–42, 2021.
19. Young, Edward Complaint; or, Night Thoughts on Life, Death and Immortality, Conjectures on Original Composition, 7–8, 1759.
20. Markels, Julian. “The Spectacle of Deterioration: Macbeth and the Manner of Tragic Imitation.” *Shakespeare Quarterly.* 12. 3: 293–303, 1961.

**Open Access** This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter’s Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

