Implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services in Tulungagung Regency

Charly Tri Prasetyawan, Bambang Supriyono, and I Gede Eko Putra Sri Sentanu
Department of Public Administration, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia
Charly32586@student.ub.ac.id

Abstract. The employment problems of Indonesian Migrant Workers are very complex. One of the problems is the complexity of the bureaucracy to manage work permit documents. This process requires a lot of time, money, and effort, potentially making migrant workers choose to work unprocedural. To resolve the problem, The Ministry of Manpower makes innovations in the form of one-stop integrated services to improve governance services. This form integrates various departments to create easy, cheap, and safe services for people interested in working abroad. However, the implementation of the one-stop integrated services policy was not as smooth as expected because of various obstacles. This article tries to analyze the implementation gap that rises at one-stop integrated services in Tulungagung regency. Researchers use Grindle’s policy implementation theory which discusses implementation based on the content of policy and context of implementation to formulate the existing problems. The results showed that three factors hindered the implementation of policies at a one-stop integrated service, such as policies of each department, adequate resources, and lack of coordination.

Keywords: One-Stop Integrated Service · Migrant Workers · Service

1 Introduction

Unemployment is one of the most challenging problems for the government to solve. Many factors cause employment problems. Population growth that is not proportional to the number of jobs, high job competition, and low productivity due to the lack of expertise possessed by workers are the main factors causing this problem [1]. The difficulty of finding work due to these factors causes people to leave their hometowns in search of better opportunities. This phenomenon cannot be separated from the press of structured economy and poverty [2]. International migration is an alternative solution for people to get a better life and work. International migration benefits both countries. Migration provides economic benefits to sending countries and helps to solve the problem of human resource shortages for receiving countries [3]. Working abroad is quite tempting. Great job opportunities, better wage differentials, and the low qualifications required for the informal sector mean that the Indonesian people do not need to consider the intense competition for work inside the country.
Although much benefits to get, the risk is also high. From 2017 to 2021, the Indonesian Migrant Workers Protection Board (BP2MI) recorded 1,010,088 migration processes to various countries. This number represents migrant workers who departed using procedures established by the government and didn’t include migrant workers who left through illegal/unprocedural routes [4, 5]. The head of BP2MI estimates that by 2021, 9 million Indonesians working in all corners of the world. However, only 4.4 million migrants are registered by the government. The remaining use unprocedural routes and 90% of them become victims of illegal work placements.

In response to these problems, the Indonesian Government established a policy to provide protection for migrant workers and reduce the risks that might occur. The Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform stated that it is necessary to carry out collaborative protection between government departments, both the central government and regional governments. The solution offered is to create fast, easy, cheap, and safe services through the one-stop integrated service to improve protection for migrant workers. One-Stop Integrated Service is a public service innovation initiated by the Ministry of Manpower to facilitate prospective migrant workers and improve the governance of the placement of migrant workers [6]. This policy integrates various services required by migrant workers and is established in enclave areas. In 2021, the Ministry of Manpower built forty-five One-Stop Integrated Services in several regions in Indonesia.

One area committed to providing services for migrant workers is Tulungagung Regency, which facilitated work placements since the 1980s and became a pioneer of international migration in East Java [7]. The interest of people working abroad is quite high. Before the COVID-19 pandemic, BP2MI recorded that the average registered migrant worker from the Tulungagung regency reached 7000 people every year. The Tulungagung one-stop integrated service was formed in 2018 and consists of seven departments, namely the Department of Manpower, BP2MI, Department of Population and Civil Registration, Health department, Immigration, Resort Police of Tulungagung, and Employees Social Security System.

The existence of One Stop Integrated Service has a great influence on the placement of migrant workers. Many researchers are interested in making it the object of study. Nuraeni conducted a study to analyze whether the government was ready to provide integrated services for migrant workers. This study found that there were institutions that had not been incorporated, causing ineffective services [8]. Meanwhile, Sulistyowati thinks that the existence of an integrated one-stop service can provide convenience for migrant workers [9]. Another research conducted by Samad stated that this program was able to develop government public services and should develop in other areas [10].

As a program implemented for less than ten years, many researchers tried to study its effectiveness and evaluate the program based on the services provided to the community. Therefore, this study tries to analyze one-stop integrated services from the point of view of policy implementers. By taking a different angle, the authors try to complement previous research so it can produce a new perspective to solve problems in similar policies in future programs.

Implementation is the process of implementing government programs. A total process in carrying out policies that come from the executive or from laws and regulations
Implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services in Tulungagung Regency

The main challenge for the government in providing services to the community is not how to create innovations, but how to make these innovations work as expected. This study aims to analyze the activities in the Tulungagung one-stop integrated service and find out the obstacles that cause the implementation not to run as it should. The success of policy implementation is influenced by two main aspects, namely the content of the policy which is the main factor in the implementation of government policy programs, and the context of implementation which is the environmental conditions that support the policies that have been designed [12].

2 Methodology

This study used a qualitative method taken at Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service from July to September 2022. The location selected because Tulungagung regency is one of the migrant worker enclaves in East Java. To obtain the primary data, the researcher conducted direct interviews with informants consisting of government employees and service users. Most of the informants are willing to cooperate in providing information, but some refuse to provide data that is considered sensitive. The secondary data was obtained from government reports, official websites, and online newspapers. The unit analysis of this research is government policy implementation through the One-Stop Integrated Service program. The results of the study were analyzed using Grindle’s implementation theory to determine whether the implementation of One-Stop Integrated Service was consistent with the initial objectives of the policy.

3 Results and Discussion

The discussion is carried out by analyzing service activities at Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service. Based on Grindle’s public policy analysis, Research indicated that several obstacles occur in the field of the content of policy and context of implementation.

3.1 Six Variables Influence the Content of Policy Implementation

**Interest Affected.** The reason for the establishment of Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service explained by the secretary of the Department of Manpower who stated the basis for the formation is the desire to provide easy and inexpensive services. Before the policy was implemented, services for migrant workers spread across departments. Some services were located outside the city. The nearest BP2MI service office is in Madiun and Malang. The distance between both cities to Tulungagung regency is about 100 km each. The closest immigration office is in Blitar which is about 50 km. The presence of a One-Stop Integrated Service will minimize time, energy, and costs as well as the risks that can occur during the trip. With the existence of One-Stop Integrated Service, the process of migrant worker placement will be reorganized so it can be easily accessed by the community.

Besides being easy to access, the reason for One-Stop Integrated Service implementation is to avoid middlemen. Brokering can occur due to long service procedures, abuse
of authority, position or authority attached to individuals, weak supervisory control systems, and bad organizational culture factors that are formed and run continuously in an institution. The management of migrant worker placement documents that go through various departments is prone to brokering acts. Whether it is done by individuals in the government sector or simply "brokers" who help complete the documents needed by migrants. Ironically, brokering has become a common thing because it is supported by service users who want everything done without having to bother themselves even though they have to pay more for these services.

Type of Benefit. The benefits obtained vary according to the department providing the service. The Department of Manpower has the function to provide information and socialize legal and safe overseas job opportunities, select prospective migrant workers, register ID numbers of migrant workers, issue nominative data, and issue letters of recommendation for police record certificates and letters recommendation for passports. The role of the Department of Population and Civil Registration is to check whether the migrant workers registered as residents of Tulungagung Regency. The residence verification process serves as protection for people who will work abroad. In addition, this department is authorized for updating population data so that all migrant workers’ data match each other. Police service is to obtain a police record certificate. Immigration serves to issue passports for everyone who will travel abroad.

The Health Department and health facility’s role are to do medical check-ups to ensure the migrants are free from congenital/infectious diseases and to issue health certificates. BPJS Employment services provided insurance against the risk of work accidents during pre-placement, placement, and post-placement periods. BP2MI provides pre-departure orientation, verifying documents, and issuing E-KTKLN (electronic overseas employment card) proof that the migrant departs officially through procedures made by the government. In short, the benefits that migrant workers receive at the One-Stop Integrated Services are the processing of official government documents.

Extend of Change Envisioned. Every policy-making has a target to be achieved. The desired change must be clear and able to be implemented by the implementor. One of the goals of One-Stop Integrated Services implementation is to improve the governance of the placement of migrant workers. The change can be seen in the management of the services provided. Tulungagung One Stop Service carries out three service processes for the placement of migrant workers, namely services to migrant workers provided by private sector, services to independent migrant workers, and services to re-entry migrant workers.

The three schemes above require a long and time-consuming process if taken in each department. The existence of the One Stop Integrated Service can reduce the time needed by migrant workers in processing documents. However, when viewed from the condition of the One Stop Integrated Service in Tulungagung, there are only three service departments, consist the department of Manpower, BP2MI, and BPJS Employment Service. To fulfill the required document, migrants must visit the respective departments, thus hampering the effectiveness of the placement process.

Site of Decision Making. Decision makers have an important role in implementing policy. The duties are explained in Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 30 of
2016 that said in the form of leading, coordinating, and controlling the One Stop Integrated Service implementation, preparing budget and cost plans, determining technical implementers, and being accountable for the performance of the Minister through the governor or regent/mayor. There is a slight difference in the content of the policy between Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 30 of 2016 and Tulungagung Regent Regulation number 44 of 2017 in terms of accountability. The Regulation of the Minister of Manpower states that there must be a representative in charge of the One Stop Integrated Service, while the Regent’s Regulation explains the responsibility carried out by the implementers to their respective departments.

Because the base of the One Stop Integrated Service is the labor sector, the Department of Manpower is appointed to be the person in charge of service activities. In carrying out daily activities, the implementer of One Stop Integrated Service applies the principles of coordination and division of tasks according to the authority of each implementor.

**Program Implementers.** Regarding program implementers, the Regulation of the Minister of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 1 of 2022 states that job introductory officers are a position that has the scope, duties, responsibilities, and authority to carry out inter-work. Job introductory officers have a responsibility to manage the placement system of workers, expansion of job opportunities, and bring service to foreign workers. Ideally, the placement service for domestic and foreign workers is also taken by them. This is because the foster organization of job introductory officers is the Ministry of Manpower. Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service only has one job introductory officer while the other officers are operator and technical positions.

**Resources Committed.** Service performance is affected by good resources. Resources are divided into two types, namely human resources and material resources. Concerning human resources, the services in the origin department are sometimes overloaded which makes the officer in the One Stop Integrated Service must be withdrawn. Material resources also become a problem. Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service receives a budget from the Ministry of Manpower which is used for budgeting the facilities and infrastructure. The operational need is provided by the local government and used for incidental purposes such as internet network, cleaning, water, and electricity. Other monthly needs such as stationery are borne by each department. However, some departments need special facilities that cannot be covered by this budget so they must use their properties to provide services.

The need for these facilities and infrastructure sometimes clashes with the policies of the department and makes it difficult to realize. The problem of procuring tools for Immigration is an interesting sample. Immigration requires servers and special computer equipment with an exceptionally budget. To overcome the lack of required facilities, Immigration uses a mobile system that is presented every two days a week. However, the passport printing process can’t be done on the spot so the applicant still has to go to the immigration office to collect the passport. This makes the service ineffective.
3.2 Three Variables Context of Implementation

**Power, Interests, and Strategies of Actors Involved in Implementing the Policy.** Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Service consists of several types of departments called vertical departments, horizontal departments, and state-owned enterprises. Vertical departments include immigration, police, BP2MI are ministry and the non-ministerial government department that takes care of Government Affairs which is not handed over to the local government. Horizontal departments include the Department of Manpower, Health Department, and Department of Population and Civil Registration are institutions that have separate functions, have equal positions, and aim to focus on their respective duties. BPJS Employment Services is a state-owned enterprise established to administer social security as a form of social protection for the community.

Judging from the types of departments in the One Stop Integrated Service, it is possible if they have different policies that adjust to their work culture. The case of the applicant for a police record certificate represents this problem. The authority to issue certificates for migrants is the regional police. The role of the resort police in Tulungagung is only to make letters of recommendation. The letter was then brought by the migrant to the Surabaya regional police which is about 177 km from Tulungagung Regency. This process causes the document cannot be completed at Tulungagung’s one-stop integrated service because it must be taken to the selected office. Fortunately, not all countries require the certificate so migrant workers who do not need this document can skip the procedure. BP2MI is in charge of verifying and final checking has a tough task because it has to check the validation of all documents owned by migrants. BP2MI uses a computerized system that can draw data from each relevant department -to a certain degree- to verify migrant worker data so that it can find out how far progress has been made by migrants.

**Institutions and Regimes Characteristics.** The environment in which a policy is implemented influences the success of implementation. As mentioned above, One Stop Integrated Service consists of vertical, horizontal, and state-owned enterprises which do not exclude the possibility that each agency has different characteristics. The differences will affect their views on a policy and ultimately lead to conflicts or create gaps when the policy is implemented. Community service institutions must prioritize the interests of the community to achieve implementation goals. To unify characteristics, the Department of Manpower as the "host" indirectly gives a significant color to the One Stop Integrated Service. The characteristics of One Stop Integrated Service refer to law number 25 of 2009 concerning public services stating that services are used for the public interest, working following applicable laws and regulations, provide equal rights for all service users without discrimination, professionalism in work, on time in completing tasks, open and accountable.

**The Level of Compliance and Responsiveness.** The compliance level in implementing the policy can be seen in the department that provides services and those that withdraw services. Although the task of the One Stop Integrated Service is to assist local governments in providing services to migrant workers in an integrated manner, the policy for implementing services returned to the respective departments. This factor is associated
with the absence of a command line/coordination line in the service activities. Every department only responsible to its respective leaders also weakens the function of the person in charge of the One Stop Integrated Service.

The findings show things need to be highlighted. The results of interviews with several department employees who aren’t present at the One Stop Integrated Service said they prefer to work in the origin department because the environment and facilities are more supportive. The lack of human resources and the absence of orders from higher-ups caused services that should be done in One Stop Integrated Service’s shift back to the origin department.

The monitoring and evaluation of activities at One Stop Integrated Service also seem less open. This conclusion was drawn based on the different informants when explaining the monitoring and evaluation process. Based on the information from the implementers, meetings that discuss the evaluation and coordination are rarely held. This statement is contradictory to the information submitted by the Department of Manpower which states there have been regular evaluation meetings held every three months by the leaders of the department. The content of the policy and the context of implementation that has been implemented will bring up the outcomes or results achieved from the policy, which in this case is the provision of placement and protection services for the Indonesian Migrant Workers community in Tulungagung Regency.

The discussion about outcomes cannot be separated from the goals that have been previously set. The initial purpose of the establishment of One Stop Integrated Service was to improve the governance of placement services for migrant workers and provide convenience for the people of Tulungagung Regency by providing integrated services. Concerning service governance, the existence of One Stop Integrated Service improves coordination between relevant departments in processing migrant data and distributing the required documents systematically to speed up the process of collecting data and verifying the required documents.

To find out more details about community acceptance, the researcher conducted interviews with several respondents who using services at One Stop Integrated Service. The results showed a positive response. Individual migrant workers are satisfied with the services because they officer can quickly and swiftly provide services. Indonesian migrant worker placement company feels the same way. The existence of Tulungagung One-Stop Integrated Services has reduced its burden in assisting the placement of prospective migrant workers. Previously, they had to commute out of town and every department to process migrant files. After the program is implemented, their activities can be faster and more organized, although some documents are still being processed outside of the one-stop integrated service. The policy of establishing a One Stop Integrated Service as an effort to provide an integrated service that is effective, efficient, easy, cheap, and fast has been implemented and proven to deliver better changes.

3.3 Implementation Gaps

The basic idea of policy implementation is that after the policy is converted into regulations, then policy implementation is carried out [13]. An implementation gap could
happen when the implementation does not go according to expectations [14]. The implementation gap is divided into two categories which are no implementation and unsuccessful implementation [15]. Based on the results of research at the Tulungagung One Stop Service, some of the gaps that occur are as follows:

**Different Service Delivery Policies.** Policy implementation user often does not go well due to inharmonious vertical and horizontal working relationships. This result is also influenced by the perception that comes from the bureaucracy implementing the policy itself [16]. Although providing services in the region, the service system for migrant workers is not locked in one area. Migrant workers are free to choose the location to comply with the required documents. This is due to the nature of the services of several departments (especially vertical agencies) which should serve people from all regions of Indonesia. Some departments such as Immigration and BP2MI do not have the authority to prohibit certain domiciles from carrying out the process according to their area of origin. Passports, E-KTKLN, and health certificates can be processed throughout the country. This policy is contrary to the policies of horizontal agencies such as the Department of Manpower and Department of Population and Civil Registration which expect that every migrant worker must perform services according to their domicile. This is reasonable considering that the responsibility of the community lies on their shoulders. Several documents such as ID cards, family cards, police records, and input for registration of Indonesian migrant workers must be processed according to the domicile of the migrant workers.

**Lack of Resources Create Lack of Willingness.** Three out of seven departments were present at the Tulungagung one-stop integrated service. This condition is far from the expectations of the government to provide optimum service. Some departments only provide services at the beginning of the one-stop integrated service and then withdraw to their origin departments. The establishment of one-stop integrated services is funded by the Ministry of Manpower in the amount of 500 million. This budget is used only for building construction and procurement of equipment. The budget does not cover all the facilities and infrastructure needed for each department. The existing limitations caused some departments to have difficulty providing services and chose to check requirements documents in the One-stop integrating service, then issue the documents in the origin department.

Some departments such as police and immigration require specific equipment to process the services because they have a policy not to use another device to protect sensitive data. The Department of Population and Civil Registration has personnel limitations making its employees drawn to provide services at the origin department. The Health Department has limited involvement in the process of placement of migrant workers because it is the health facility that has the authority to issue a health certificate. Moreover, people tend to use private health facilities because they are cheaper and faster. Staff shortage is a problem that always occurs in every department. The Indonesian government is currently implementing a policy of eliminating non-civil servant employees. This policy makes it even more burdensome for several departments to participate in one-stop integrated services because the departments themselves are understaffed. These problems combining policies from the department made them withdraw from service and focus on improving services in their department. In other words, they prefer not to
provide services in one-stop integrated services as long as this does not violate the rules for the placement of migrant workers.

**Lack of Coordination and Evaluation.** Regarding the current condition, evaluation and coordination between departments must be carried out. Unfortunately, the need for such coordination is lacking. According to the implementer officer, there’s no coordination regarding service improvement. The coordination that occurs between officers is limited only to providing services to the migrant worker. The absence of coordination to discuss service improvement was denied by the secretary of the Department of Manpower who stated this such coordination and evaluation are active at the higher-up level. A joint discussion was held to solve the problem of departments withdrawing their services. This effort stopped due to the COVID-19 pandemic. After the pandemic is over, the Department of Manpower plans to continue the effort to recall departments that have withdrawn from service through coordination between work unit leaders.

This research provides several research contributions in theory and practice. In theory, this research enriches the literature on the study of policy implementation on integrated public services. The government’s policy of combining public services from vertical and horizontal agencies is new and has significant challenges. The existence of a review of the policy implementation will add insight to the government and private parties who are interested in an integrated service program. Practically, this research is valuable for policymakers in the labor field. This research is expected to contribute ideas as a guide in implementing other integrated programs. Some findings that need to be considered are that the differences in policies between departments influence determining the level of compliance in implementing policy programs. The second finding is about the resources of each department to fulfill the policy program. The third finding is the importance of coordination between departments and employees.

This study is also inseparable from the limitations of the researcher. The first is the writer’s difficulty in finding credible informants. Some of the informants are not original officers who have worked since the policy was implemented. There have been several employee transfers in most departments, which makes it difficult to obtain accurate information about the history of Tulungagung’s integrated service development. The second is that the sample of this study is limited to Tulungagung’s one-stop integrated service. As a result, this paper only provides an overview on a regional scale and cannot represent a national picture. The three targets of this research are focused on the acceptance of program implementers in responding to policies. There is plenty of room for further study such as the effect of one-stop integrated service on people’s satisfaction or analyzing the service based on the regulations used by each department.

## 4 Conclusion and Future Scope

The problem in Tulungagung’s one-stop integrated service is not as simple as it seems. Based on the contents of the policy, the benefits are offered still in the form of services at the beginning and the end, but there is no service in between. Service users need to process several documents outside a one-stop integrated service. This problem causes the final changes are not expected as they should be. The problems of implementation
mostly come from the lack of resources, coordination, evaluation, willingness, and the policy of several departments.

In the context of implementation, each department has its strategy in providing services even though they didn’t present in the one-stop integrated service. This kind of service won’t be a problem for them but became a problem for the migrant who needs their service. The institutional characteristics can be diverse, making it difficult to match them even though carrying the same purpose. Compliance is the fundamental problem that must be immediately resolved. The regulation has an ambiguous meaning that causes differences in service between several one-stop integrated services and a lack of protection services.

The implementation of one-stop integrated services in Tulungagung Regency is still far from what is expected in the regulations. However, when viewed from the service function (from representative institutions), the implementation of the one-stop integrated service has successfully provided easy access to services for the community. The first thing that should be done to improve services is to open discussion forums with all departments, redesign service flow, and formulate legal products that bind all relevant departments. Resource problems cannot be resolved quickly because there are strict regulations for budgeting. However, it may be possible to propose a solution to the problem by utilizing technology that is developing rapidly. Findings in the field indicate that each agency has its computerized system. It would be great if every system in each department was integrated and can be accessed by the public thereby reducing the need for physical services.

Acknowledgment. The author would like to thank to Ministry of National Development Planning of the Republic of Indonesia for funding this research.

References


**Open Access** This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter’s Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.