# Feminine Issues on Women Candidates:
# Studies at Local Level in Indonesia

Ratnaningsih Damayanti
Universitas Brawijaya
Malang, Indonesia
ratnaningsih@ub.ac.id

Tri Hendra Wahyudi
Universitas Brawijaya
Malang, Indonesia

*Abstract* — **This paper explained the uses of feminine issues (especially social issue) by woman candidates during the campaigns on the 2019 legislative general election in Indonesia for Batu Municipal People's Regional Representative Council (DPRD; Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah). Through in-depth interviews and observations during the woman candidates' campaigns, it was found that the woman candidates running for the regional legislative member preferred feminine issues, used campaign teams of women more, and were more comfortable when campaigned for the issue to woman groups. Based on the results, the use of feminine issues by the woman candidates at the local level were able to increase their electability during the legislative general election. However, the author argued that these feminine issue uses in this non-western country were due to the fact that the woman candidates had yet the confidence to compete against man candidates, and that the woman candidates still felt inferior to the man candidates. Thus these uses were actually a strategy to get them into the parliamentary without resolving the ongoing patriarchal culture problems existing in non-western countries. This strategy was adopted because of the presence of norms and values developing in the society that retain patriarchal cultures.**

*Keywords* — **feminine issue, woman candidate, local legislative**

## I. INTRODUCTION

At the 2019 general election, participation of women legislative member candidates experienced an increase when compared to the 2014 general election. According to data compiled by Kompas (9/10/2018), the percentage of women legislative member candidates in the People's Representative Council (DPR; Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat) went up from 37.67 percent at the 2014 general election, to 40.08 percent in the 2019 general election. This indicated that political parties increased the number of women in the legislative member candidate list.

General elections in Indonesia implement an open proportional representation. This system produces several legislative member representatives within one electoral district. The number of populations determine the number of legislative seats. Thus, the more populations an electoral district has, the more people's representatives in the legislative institution in comparison with other electoral districts. Where single member district only results one representative, proportional representation or often called multi-member district, is able to produce more representatives in one electoral district.

Aside from producing several representatives in one electoral district, the general election system in Indonesia also provides transparency of legislative member candidate names. Upon voting, people are able to identify candidate names that are contesting for seats in the legislative institution. The people can select the political parties or the candidate names stated on the ballot. The decision of candidate's win over the seats at the legislative institution is based on the number of votes, not the number of which they are ordered. Compared to single-member district or majoritarian, this system offers greater chance for woman candidates to be voted as legislative members.

Even though woman candidates in multi-member district system have greater chance of being voted than in single-member district, the general election system in Indonesia does not necessarily provide freeway for woman candidates to serve as legislative members. Through this system, woman candidates within one electoral district must compete with man candidates from the same political party as well as man candidates from different political parties.

During campaign period, woman candidates have a weakness when compared with man candidates. The majority of woman candidates, which are new woman candidates, do not have their own political campaign team. Hence, they do their own campaigns. Political parties have very minimal roles in campaigning woman candidates. There aren't any campaign programs facilitated by the parties specified for woman candidates. When appearing in front of the public, only few of the woman candidates were able to speak well in campaigning themselves. This form of general election system gives impact to woman candidates' strategies in campaigning. Several woman candidates, especially new woman candidates that are in the same political party and the same electoral district campaign together. They will come together in woman society meetings to promote themselves. Woman candidates don't view other fellow woman candidates as competitors, and they will gladly share constituents during campaign.

On their journey towards achieving legislative member seats, woman candidates are faced with several obstacles related to their electability. First, they must deal with Indonesian society with their patriarchal culture, which lead to women not voting for women. This resulted in the low electability of woman candidates. Second, woman candidates are confronted with campaign funding difficulties. Political parties' contributions in funding the candidates' campaigns, especially woman candidates, are very minimal. This condition caused woman candidates having to make efforts for campaign funds by themselves. The lack of funding was

due to women not being the dominant holder of family's economic resources.

These barriers and issues become considerations for woman candidates in selecting their campaign strategies. The selection of campaign issues is a strategic step in overcoming the aforementioned barriers and issues. Woman candidates bring up feminine issues such as health and socio-cultural matters. Issues such as those are campaigned to women's groups. Thus, instead of discussing masculine issues, for instance defence, security, and terrorism eradication, women-specific issues can be the issues which provide strength for woman candidates during their campaign. Campaign target focusing on women's group also yields minimal risk in rejections from society due to patriarchal culture.

The categorisation between feminine and masculine issues is based on gender stereotypes. Feminine issues are issues which require gender characteristic attached to women, such as mercy, compassion, gentleness. Meanwhile, masculine issue is an issue categorisation which requires gender characteristics adherent to men, which are firmness, activity, and aggressiveness [23]. The reason for an issue being categorised into feminine issues is because women are able to handle said issue due to them being merciful, compassionate, and gentle. The same goes for certain issues being categorised into masculine issue, this is due to men are regarded to be cleverer in resolving those issues because they have firm and bold attributes.

At the central level, the percentage of woman legislative members in the People's Representative Council of The Republic of Indonesia seen from the 2014 legislative general election was 17.32%. This data dropped down from the previous legislative general election result, which was 17.86% [12]. At the regional level, especially in Batu Municipality, 5 out of 25 (20 percent) regional legislative members chosen for the 2014-2019 period were women. This indicated that woman candidate electability at the regional level is higher than at the central level. This is because health and social service has been the authority of regional government. These issues are frequently identified as feminine issues because they require the kindness and mercy which are attributes often associated with women [3]. At the central legislative institution, central government's authority consists of defence and security, global economy, and foreign relations. These issues seem to be more masculine because they require firmness which is an attribute usually linked to men. Hence, decentralisation and regional autonomy has given chances for women to be more involved in politics, notably, as people's representatives.

Based on a study result, a woman candidate will have greater chance being reelected if she is an incumbent [21]. This is because she has proven her capability in leading, both as a regional head and as a legislative member. Therefore, the political party will bring her back and people tend to vote incumbent woman candidates than man candidates. This condition leads to woman candidate electability be not only affected by gender stereotypes, but also by region scope, incumbency, or new candidate.

This paper will assess whether the use of gender stereotype as campaign issue at Indonesia's 2019 legislative general election is going to increase the chance of election for woman candidates, especially woman candidates at the local scale. Gender stereotype issues have been proven to increase the chance of woman candidates to be voted as legislative members under several preconditions. First, the issues raised must be specific regarding certain themes and have broad scope of impact. Second, the woman candidates must synchronise among the nominating political parties with religious organisations who become the target for campaigns.

Studies regarding women and general elections in Indonesia were often times associated with the efforts to improve women representativeness in the legislative institution. This was the result of their representativeness in the legislative institution from the first general election in 1955 to the 1997 general election during the new order being only 9.2% on average. During the new order era, women were demanded to only have a role in domestic domain (household) as a wife and a mother [11]. Women were mostly involved on government-established organisations such as Family Welfare Movement (PKK; Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga) and Dharma Wanita (association of civil servants' wife), of which their activities only function to elevate their roles as wives and mothers.

The percentage of women population in Indonesia is the same with men population, which further encourage the needs to push the involvement of women in politics, which include becoming people's representative. Seeing these backgrounds, studies on women and parliaments in Indonesia for the past 10 years were dominated by factors which support electability and reasons for the low women representativeness in the legislative institutions [4][8][13][19]. Berg (2015) [4] explained several obstacles on why women in Indonesia found it hard to permeate into the parliament. Some of which are cultural factors, socio-economic factors, political factors, family factors, and their roles in social movements. Women's chance of being voted will substantially increase if they are a celebrity, an entrepreneur, an activist as well as a prominent figure in a political party, take advantage of family networks, and make use of the 30 percent women quota.

Within gender studies, cultural factors mentioned by Livia Berg above are the cultures in society that still distinguish the role of men and women on a daily basis. Women are frequently considered to be kind-hearted, gentle, obedient, compassionate, selfless, emotional, polite, egalitarian, and competent [10][23]. The social community in Indonesia encourages that women have roles as household care taker who nurture children, maintain family welfare, and cherish the family as well. Thus, if a woman is voted, she will be regarded to have a more comprehensive understanding on the issues of education, health, and social services.

In the developing literatures of western countries, women will be able to resolve matters on education, fulfillment of minority race rights, disability and geriatric issues, child care, poverty, health, women issues, and the environment [10][20] better than men. Men are thought to be more active, independent, decisive, aggressive, practical, assertive, hardworking, and in favor of hierarchy [23]. Having these attributes, men will be more proficient on the issues of terrorism eradication, military, defense and security, economic developments, trades, tax, and agriculture [1][10][20]. However, after the attacks on WTC towers in the US in 11 September 2001, woman candidates became more critical towards issues on terrorism and military [17].

The translation of gender stereotype issues in Indonesia slightly differs from the western countries. According to a

survey by the Indonesian Survey Institute (LSI; Lembaga Survei Indonesia) in 2019, women were considered to be more capable of handling issues on women, finance and budgeting, and health service. Men were regarded to be more competent on resolving issues concerning defense and security, criminality and law enforcement, corruption prevention and eradication. Many people consider religious affairs, education matter, and environmental preservation are mutual issues which apply to both men and women.

In America, perceptions on the gender stereotype on the candidacy for senate/governor/people's representative council had no mutual conclusion. Studies on gender stereotype and candidacy have developed and provided different findings along the flourishing of feminism, liberalism, and war influence.

Kahn (1993) [16] publicised his findings on a study regarding campaign issue discrepancies of senate candidates in USA which competed during the 1980 general election. The result was that man candidates and woman candidates used the same strategy during campaigns, but man candidates focused more on tax and federal government budget issues while woman candidates focused more on social issues such as education and health [16].

Approximately, for the next two decades, a similar study was conducted on candidates who ran for the senate in 2000 and 2002. Dolan (2005) [9] observed the website content used by woman candidates and man candidates for their campaigns. The result was that the woman candidates and the man candidates brought up very similar issues in their website [9].

Changes occurred on the kind of campaign issues raised. Woman candidates presented themselves in the campaign as active individuals and knowledgeable legislative members. Issues on education, health, environment, and medicine are the primary issues established by both woman and man candidates. The differences of issues for this period's general election no longer lie on sex, but on political parties. The issues that the Democratic Party put forward differed to the issues brought to the table by the Republican Party [9]. On the ensuing development, issues on education on which woman candidates were thought to be more capable of resolving in addition to health, turned the two into neutral issues [10]. Perceptions on woman candidates were influenced by political parties and gender stereotypes [3][10][23]. Gender stereotypes shaped the perception of candidate characteristics and the position on the issues. Political party and gender stereotype are two interconnected variables [23].

These opinions by Dolan, Winter, and Baurer conflicted with the results of a study by Windett (2014) [22]. In 2014, Windett presented that candidates for governor and woman senate in the early 2000s were faced by campaigning options against man candidates using feminine issues or utilising strategies and campaign issues which were masculine. More than 60 percent of the woman candidates used woman issues and stereotypes in their campaign [22].

Judging from the constituent's side, when man candidates and woman candidates are head-to-head, a woman will prefer a woman more [5]. When woman candidates made use of her gender as an asset, rather than a weakness, it will increase their chance on being voted [14]. This will happen when women applied their campaign strategies on woman groups who are concerned with feminine issues, such as education, children welfare, and health.

The differences of the effect of feminine stereotype on woman candidates and man candidates showed that gender can transform contextual meaning of feminine stereotypes for women. To woman candidates, feminine stereotypes send messages regarding the leadership capacity of candidates. To man candidates, feminine stereotypes do not underestimate perceptions of men as capable leaders [2].

Unfortunately, not all uses of feminine issues were able to make women voted and become parliament members. When woman candidates use feminine issues, then the constituent targets are only women. This only leads to confining the number of voters. If woman candidates address masculine issues, then they must compete against man candidates, with the upside of gaining more votes. In this very condition, woman candidates should readjust their strategies in campaigns, whether they will only target women votes, or they will also target men votes.

Beyond campaign issues and strategies, the relationships between central and regional government in regulating authorities, have indirect impacts to the involvement of women in politics. Decentralisation and regional autonomy have given more jurisdictions to regional government in regulating and managing regional governance. Several jurisdictions delegated from the central to the regional government are, among others: education, health, infrastructure, and social problems such as street children, prostitution, and so on. Some of these issues, namely education, health, and social services, are associated with feminine issues, thereby supporting the involvement of women in politics.

Democratisation and decentralisation have widely expanded the chance of progress for women in politics. Women have successfully paved their way through challenging institutional and cultural environment [6]. Regional-level institutions provided better chance for women to be more involved in politics. Meyer, Gadarian, and Trounstine (2015) argued that women lack the competence compared to men in politics and that they have the tendency to serve the constituent more than men [7]. This condition means that women will likely win in the lesser-prestigious legislative institutions which are closer to the voters. In other words, the chance for woman candidates to be voted as legislative members will be higher if they run for regional legislative general election.

## II.   METHOD

The total number of candidates contesting at the regional legislative general election in Batu Municipality in 2019 was 314 people. These people were divided into 4 electoral districts and 13 to 14 political parties in each of the districts. The number of man candidates was 174 and the number of woman candidates was 140, or 44.5%. The data in this paper were obtained from in-depth interviews to the running woman candidates in the Batu Municipality general election. In-depth interviews were carried out to 11-woman candidates, which included those who ran for the election for the first time and those who had experience beforehand in the legislative

general election. Out of the eleven-woman candidates interviewed, there were incumbent woman candidates, which previously have had positions as regional legislative members.

Aside from interviews, several direct observations were also conducted when the woman candidates were campaigning. Observation or shadowing was done on seven-woman candidates. This observation served a purpose to monitor the interactions between the candidates and the public during campaign as well as to find out substantial matters delivered by the woman candidates to the public. The observations were also carried out when the woman candidates were having public dialogues in regard to their visions and missions, while also responding to the issues in Batu Municipality. There were 19-woman candidates from varying political parties and electoral districts which attended in the midst of hundreds of women in Batu Municipality.

From the 140-woman candidates, interviewee representatives were selected which used feminine and masculine issues during campaign. The interviewees were selected from different political parties, though their political parties were not part of analysis units. The interviewees selected consisted of both incumbent candidates and new candidates. Selected woman candidates represented the field issues which were going to be analysed.

Result data of this study were descriptively analysed to describe the use of feminine issues in the campaigns of woman candidates. Feminine issues are gender-stereotyped issues which require compassion, affection, patience, honesty, which are usually inherent to women. Issues that fall into the feminine issue category, among others, are health, female, finance and budgeting. Masculine issues are stereotyped issues which usually adhere to men where they require assertiveness, courage, ingenuity, and other men-linked characteristics. Issues which fall into masculine issue, among others, are defence and security, criminality and law enforcement, corruption prevention and eradication.

## III.   FINDING AND DISCUSSION

### Overview of Batu Municipality Legislative General Election in 2019

Several findings by Windett (2014) [22] and Brians (2005) [5], Herrnson et al. (2003) [14], in addition to the previously mentioned explanations, the correlation between voters' behavior in the US general election and the campaigns by woman candidates presented the trend which explained that campaign issues and strategies of woman candidates and the targeted segments of campaigns deeply affects woman candidates' electability in the general election, both executive and legislative elections.

In the case of Indonesia, according to the result of a study by the Centre for Political Research team of University of Indonesia (Puskapol UI) in the national level, there were 23.31% voters in favor of woman candidates in the 2014 general election. This number increased from 2009 which was around 22.45%. Though there were no further explanations regarding the number of male and female voters comprising these 22.45% and 23.31% figures, this is certain to say that the electability for man legislative candidates were higher, similar to the general election in the US, of which the woman

candidate were likely to be lower. Concerning the issues raised by woman legislative candidates in Indonesia, there hasn't been a specific study which covers the campaign issues used by woman candidates and their effects on electability. Therefore, this study emphasized towards the analysis on the campaign issues of woman legislative member candidates, along with their strategies during the socialisation and campaign for said issues during the campaign period.

However, before taking a deep look into the analysis on woman candidates' campaign issues, explanation on the general election system adopted by Indonesia needs to be provided first in order to understand Indonesia's political context better. Since 1998, general elections in Indonesia experienced numerous changes, especially related to affirmative actions by woman legislative candidates in the process of candidacy.

Broadly speaking, general elections in Indonesia adopted proportional representation (PR) system, which is different with the majoritarian system applied by several countries, one of which is the US. Within the PR system adopted by Indonesia, one electoral district can comprise 3 to 12 seats. This is often defined as Multi-Member District (MMD). While the majoritarian system states that one electoral district consists of only one seat which will be voted. This system is often called as single-member district (SMD). These two district models certainly will have definite impact regarding the electability chance of woman candidates, thereby also influencing the issues and strategies used in the campaigns of the woman candidates.

Theoretically, PR electoral system advantages more in regard to woman candidate's electability [15]. In the data compiled by the International IDEA since 1945, the potential for woman electability in the PR electoral system has always been high, in every countries observed, be it in Asia, Europe, Africa, and America. The higher the district magnitude (the number of seats assigned to a district), the higher woman candidate's electability potential will be. This condition will apply, even though the personal aspects in terms of the way the woman legislative candidates raised their campaign issues and strategies were not visible. Were this variable of campaign issue was to be included inside the analysis, the findings from a study by Herrnson et al. (2003) [14] should be identified, so that the relevance of this variable within the general election context that applies in Indonesia can be observed lest it has different impacts. Henderson et al previously stated that when woman candidates used their gender as an asset instead of a weakness, their electability chance will increase. This was done by implementing their campaign strategies on woman groups who share concerns on feminine issues, such as education, children welfare, and health.

This study raised the campaign issues by woman candidates in the People's Regional Representative Council (DPRD; Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah) member candidate election in Batu Municipality for the 2019–2024 periods. The 2019 general election for the Batu municipal DPRD general election comprised 4 districts, all of which are multi-member districts. Out of the four electoral districts, 30 DPRD members will be elected. The woman candidates competing in the 2019 Batu municipal DPRD election contended against all of the legislative candidates for the 30 seats.

In the electoral district 1 of Batu Municipality, there were 34 women candidates competing for the 8 seats quota. What was interesting was that there was one party named United Development Party (PPP; Partai Persatuan Pembangunan) who filed only one legislative candidate in the list of permanent candidates (DCT) and that one candidate was a woman. In the electoral district 2 of Batu Municipality, there were 32 women candidates competing for the available 7 seats quota. There were two political parties in this electoral district that had the highest percentage of woman legislative candidates in the DCT, which were National Mandate Party (PAN; Partai Amanaha Nasional) and The Golkar Party, each having 57%.

Meanwhile, in the electoral district 3 of Batu Municipality, there were 36 women candidates that competed for the 7 DPRD seats quota of Batu Municipality. Again, PPP only placed one legislative candidate in their DCT who was a woman. Therefore, the representativeness percentage in their DCT was 100%. The highest number of woman legislative candidate was in the electoral district 4 of Batu Municipality being 37 candidates, competing for the 8 seats of Batu Municipality DPRD. In this district, there were two political parties nominating 100% women candidates, which were the PPP and the Crescent Star Party (PBB; Partai Bulan Bintang).

There were 140 woman legislative candidates from all of the four electoral districts in Batu Municipality, running for the general election in 17 April 2019. From the 30 seats, there were 4 woman legislative candidates elected as the members of DPRD for the period of 2019 – 2024. These four women—three of which were incumbents, were Katarina Dian Nefiningtyas (Great Indonesia Movement Party/Gerindra), and Aulia Lishanti (PAN) from the electoral district 1. Then the incumbent from the electoral district 2, was Dewi Kartika (National Awakening Party/PKB). The other elected woman legislative candidate who was not an incumbent was Amirah Ghaida Dayanara from the Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle (PDIP) who ran in the electoral district 3 comprising Bumiaji District. The electability of these 4 women legislative candidates in Batu Municipality seemed to declined when compared to the woman incumbents in the Batu Municipality DPRD for the period 2014-2019 which were 5 people.

## Social Issue for Woman Candidate at the Local Level

During 2019 the regional legislative general election in Batu Municipality, there were 314 candidates enlisted in the Batu Municipal General Elections Commission (KPU; Komisi Pemilihan Umum). 140 people, in other words 44.5%, were women. Based on previous explanation, 4 woman candidates successfully became Batu Municipal legislative members. The remaining 136 candidates did not qualify due to lack of votes.

In campaigning, every woman candidate raised more than just issues. Issues brought by the woman candidates were able to be categorised into several topics, which were education, socio-culture, woman economic empowerment, environment, and agriculture. Issues on education and socio-culture were two of the most sought-after issues by the woman candidates due to the high interests from the candidates. However, based on LSI's survey in 2019, education is common issue between women and men, therefore this paper focus only on social issue.

Social issue was the second most popular issue sought after by woman Batu Municipal candidates. The scope of social issues in Batu were health issues—including issues on mother and children, cultural issues, and issues on the fulfillment of marginalised people's rights. These issues were addressed by several woman candidates. First, an incumbent candidate named KDN from the Gerindra Party. Second, a new candidate named SM from the United Indonesia Party (Partai Perindo). Third, an incumbent candidate named DK from PKB. Fourth, a new candidate named K from the Gerindra Party.

The first woman candidate addressing socio-culture issues was KDN coming from the Gerindra Party. She was the incumbent who ran again in the electoral district 1 number 1. 2009 was the first time that KDN ran for the legislature. Back then, she was nominated by the Indonesian National Party of Marhaenism (PNI Marhaenisme; Partai Nasional Indonesia Marhaenisme) and succeeded to win a seat in Batu Municipal People's Regional Representative Council. In 2014, she ran for the election again, but this time, she was nominated by the Gerindra Party. Aside from being a legislative member, her other profession was a lobster entrepreneur with many employees. She was also the wife of an active village head.

Having been a legislative member, KDN has proven to be successful in establishing networks and utilising her networks in favor for her campaign. She was the Head of Sanduk Dance Group of Batu Municipality and the Head of Sanduk Dance Group of Greater Malang Area (which comprises Malang City, Batu Town, and Malang Regency). In Batu Municipality itself, there are approximately 77 dance groups. Sanduk Dance is one of the traditional dances of Madura Island which were developed in Batu Municipality. The dancers for Sanduk Dance consist of men and women. Batu Municipality itself doesn't have its own distinctive art forms because Batu Municipality was the result of Malang Regency's expansion. Because many of its inhabitants coming from the Madura Island, several art forms indigenous to Madura Island developed as well in Malang Regency. Katarina was curious to also join in developing the Sanduk Dance in Batu Municipality which became one of her campaign issues though it was still not yet clear how the Sanduk Dance was being developed through specific policies.

KDNwas also one of the founders of Village Women School which currently are expanding in some villages in Batu Municipality. Before becoming a legislative member, she was a community companion at the National Population and Family Planning Board (BKKBN; Badan Kependudukan dan Keluarga Berencana Nasional) for 12 years. The experience as a former community companion enabled her to do campaigns to former drug users and HIV-positive people. Having this background, she was able to embrace woman groups and marginalised-people groups in Batu Municipality.

As an incumbent woman candidate, she managed to assemble a campaign team consisting of 70% woman. To her, this proportion was crucial to ensure her comfort, "Because I'm a woman, I feel more comfortable being around with other women", she expressed. The campaign team she formed consisted of all members of organisation she took part in, which were Sanduk Dance (sandukers), Village Women School, Hijet association (antique cars), Association of Indonesian Woman Entrepreneurs (IWAPI; Ikatan Wanita

Pengusaha Indonesia), Rotary Club (Morning walk group), former drug users, and university students. Along with her team, she campaigned in worshipping places of various religions. Despite being a member of Muslimat NU, KDN did not utilise specific religious mass group because of her intention of being known as a nationalist person. The sheer amount of team members made her choose to campaign independently without having to be in tandem with a candidate running for People's Representative Council of Indonesia (DPR RI; Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Republik Indonesia)

The second candidate addressing social issues were SM. She was one of the members of Sanduk Dance group led by KDN. She was nominated by the Perindo Party in electoral district 1 number 1. Before running for the 2019 legislative general election in 2019, she has been a member of the legislatives for 2 periods where she was nominated by the New Indonesia Party (PIB; Partai Indonesia Baru) in the 2009 general election and was nominated by the Gerindra Party in the 2014 general election. SM joined the Perindo Party when this party was based in Batu Municipality. She held a position as the Head of Batu Municipality Regional Representative Council (DPD; Dewan Perwakilan Daerah) of Perindo Party, hence being the number 1 in Perindo Party's candidate list.

During campaign, SM complied with the programs of her political party. It was easy for her to conform to her political party's programs due to her position as the head of Batu Municipality DPD for Perindo Party. The political party's programs of which she can take advantage were "Jumat Bersih" (Clean Friday) and "Minggu Sehat" (Healthy Sunday). "Jumat Bersih" was a community service program followed by eating meals together. "Minggu Sehat" was a program to distributing milks to the public. Furthermore, her political party played a role in providing campaign props, such as t-shirts and flags. Also, Perindo Party headquarters had a fogging program (the funds came from the self-subsistence by the legislative members) and affordable rice program, which to sell 2 kg of rice at the cost of Rp 10.000. Campaigns used political party funds and individual funds.

SM was assisted by her campaign team which consisted of mostly women during the process of campaign. Her campaign team was not established structurally, but rather, it was comprised of different work assignments bound together. Beyond the political party programs, she was also a member of a Hindu religious organisation. Moreover, she campaigned door to door, but based on the observations carried out when SM was campaigning, the issues addressed were not specific because she only asked people's complaints.

The third woman candidate raising socio-culture issues were DK. Aside from engaging on education issues, DK also addressed her concerns on maternal and child welfare. Regarding the social issues which conformed to her commission, this incumbent candidate raised social issues related to street children, elderlies, and prostitutions. The issues on street children were brought up by socialising the Regional Regulatory Plan on Children-Friendly Cities/Towns. The background of this issue was that Batu Municipality has been declared as a children-friendly town for six times. In the process of implementing relevant policies related to children up until receiving the latest children-friendly award, Batu Municipality has yet established a Regional Regulation on Children-Friendly Town. The absence of this regulation prompted Batu Municipal DPRD to propose a Regional Regulatory Plan on Children-Friendly Town in 2018 as their initiative being a legislature. This initiative then became the incumbent candidate's campaign material. The woman candidate from incumbency socialised, provided overviews, and promised the ideal condition for children as a part of the work programs of Batu Municipal DPRD.

Related to the field of health, the woman candidate socialised the availability of independent Social Security Administrator (BPJS; Badan Penyelenggara Jaminan Sosial) insurance program. This program was aimed for people using government's funding scheme. Aside from the BPJS, the woman candidate also socialised free pregnancy health checks in public health centres (puskesmas). This program has been put into action at only a few puskesmas, therefore requiring socialisations.

Seeing on the issues, the woman incumbent raised issues which were often taken care of. In other words, these issues were within her field of expertise at the commission C. Also, these issues were not so much different from the issues raised by other woman candidates who were new in the candidacy. Her advantage was that the incumbent candidate had previous political experience in that field and has been involved in the process of program or policy formulations.

The methods utilised to engage on those issues consisted of assembling a campaign team and focusing on campaigns to woman organisations. The first was to assemble a campaign team. Her campaign team was put together based on the neighborhood (RT; Rukun Tetangga) system. The head of her campaign team was Dewi Kartika's husband himself. He was the person coordinating the entire member of her campaign team spread across 76 RTs and 168 TPS (polling stations). Most of the members in her campaign group were composed of men. This was because the head of her campaign team was her husband. Then, the campaign team was dispersed in each RT. Every RT consisted of 5 to 10 campaign team members. These members were targeted to obtain a minimum number of votes on every polling station. By using this kind of model, the incumbent woman candidate will find it easier to monitor the number of votes acquired. The formation of her campaign team was done independently and used personal funds.

Apart from the supports from her political party, DK also made use of her social capitals. Her social capitals were obtained from the various organisations she participated. She became the Head of Perempuan Bangsa (Nation's Women) of Batu Municipality, Head of Srikandi Pancasila of Batu Municipality, and the treasurer of the Communication Forum for Sons and Daughters of Retirees (FKPPI; Forum Komunikasi Putra Putri Purnawirawan). Religious organisation was the only one she has never led, because she was not a cadre originating from NU, an Indonesian Sunni Islamic movement.

The second was to focus on woman organisations or forums. Her being an incumbent woman candidate group utilised a campaign strategy consisting of voicing out issues to these woman organisations. Other woman organisations targeted were organisations at the neighborhood (RT; Rukun Tetangga) level, such as *dasawisma* (mother groups for every 10 households), *arisan* (a regular social gatherings for women on rotating savings), and so on. DK intentionally avoided

religious forums specific to men, that is *tahlil* (recitation activities). She purposefully refrained from forums which might hinder woman participations in general elections based on cultural values. By focusing solely on woman forums, the woman incumbent would be able to receive fully undivided attentions from woman while eluding from cultural obstacles.

The uses of money for campaigns were managed programmatically. The public were able to propose funding from the incumbent candidates, be it through RT or PKK. For instance, the RT requires drainage system with a budget of Rp 30.000.000. This money will be used during the community service when making the drainage system. On the day of execution, Dewi Kartika oversees the work directly at the location. The clothes used during said interaction with the public were also kept in mind. She will be wearing neither flashy nor luxurious clothes to blend better with the public. These approaches are known as patronage or the provision of financial or material aids to the public in hopes that she will be elected. The difference of this approach from other candidates' strategies in general was that this strategy enabled candidates to interact personally with the people. Thus, the candidate was able to oversee the program's implementation and the public can communicate and be the judge of the candidate's personal quality and performances.

The fourth woman candidate addressing socio-cultural issues was K. She was nominated by the Gerindra Party in the electoral district 4, number 3. K was a Physical Education trainer, specifically on healthy heart exercises. Having this background, she delivered the importance of maintaining health conditions to the public. This was done through the the the exercises she has led. She raised this issue by herself because she had no campaign team. Her campaign target was mostly women because they were the majority of her exercise group members. However, she also campaigned for her cause through tahlil recitation activities. But based on the observations and interview done, she only asked for blessings from the *tahlil* participants and did not engage dialogues to deliver her vision and missions.

Based on the observations during the public dialogue attended by the woman candidates in Batu Municipality, K showed enthusiasms and were fiery when answering questions or responding to the issues thrown at her. She rushed towards the microphone and introduced herself, yet she gave vague answers and did not provide concrete solutions on the issues mentioned by the audiences.

Judging from the campaign issues and strategies mentioned above, socio-cultural issues were able to qualify 2 women candidates towards becoming legislative members. The table below shows the detail of voting results for each woman candidate who addressed issues on socio-culture.

**Table 2:** Votes Acquired by the Woman Candidates of Batu Municipality Who Addressed Socio-Cultural Issues

| No. | Name | Party/Electoral District/Sequence Number | Votes Acquired | Result |
|-----|------|------------------------------------------|----------------|--------|
| 1 | KDN | Gerindra/1/1 | 2.293 | Eligible |
| 2 | SM | Perindo/1/1 | 285 | Ineligible |
| 3 | DK | PKB/2/1 | 3.117 | Eligible |
| 4 | K | Gerindra/4/3 | 74 | Ineligible |

Based on the table above, incumbent candidates were able to hold on to their seats by using social issues. The incumbent candidates had 10 years of experience in their field. Hence, they were able to bring more specific issues compared to other candidates. By utilising government program and driving their massive campaign teams, KDN and DK gained enough votes to qualify them for seats in the Batu Municipal DPRD for the third time.

Compared to the other two, which were SM and K, they did not have specific issues to deal with. When campaigning to their targeted audiences, K and SM did not take advantages of that moment to socialise their vision and missions clearly. Even though all of them targeted women, it was not enough for them to only introduce themselves, ask for blessings, or hear people's complaints. KDN and DK dialogued with the people and provided the necessary solution or information which were meaningful to them. Those were the establishment for regulatory plan on children-friendly town, regional government BPJS, and free checks for pregnant mothers.

The issues raised by incumbents were more precise and direct, which resulted in the forms of policies that will satisfy people. New candidates were not able to analyse the problems and create policies as an alternative solution. This was proven by the interview result with SM She believed that the problems in Batu Municipality were the lack of transparency in the DPRD recess budget and uneven house improvement program. Seeing this problem, SM addressed the issue of elevating women involvement to make them more resourceful, thus improving their capacity. She explained "usually, women were not allowed to go to higher schools, because I have been in that position and now, I can disprove the opinions of those who have that sort of thinking". She believed women have equal rights for higher educations. Therefore, she felt that she was more knowledgeable when it came to social and environmental issues.

SM's answer above indicated that the woman candidates who were not eligible lacked the ability in analysing the problems at hand and the ability to connect them with the issues they raised as the solutions to those problems. This can be seen by irrelevance between the problems occurring and the issues discussed. The problem she mentioned was regarding the transparency on recess budget, the issues she raised was on education; however, her field of domain was social and environmental issues.

Based on the issues addressed by the woman candidates, it can be concluded that the uses of feminine issues, especially social issues, resulted on higher chances of electability for woman candidates. This analysis was carried out by amassing new candidates and incumbent candidates. The authors' findings supported the claims by Kahn (1993) [16] stating that woman candidates will utilise gender stereotypes in determining their campaign issues. The traits adhering to women were taken advantages of and optimised to gather votes by campaigning for women, to women. Therefore, the gender stereotypes attributed on woman candidates increase their chance of being voted [14].

The woman candidates who used feminine issues but were not voted can be explained through the demand side

over the provision of woman candidates by their political parties [18]. Political parties provided woman candidates who did not have the qualities suited to the people's expectations. The political party selected woman candidates who had social, political, and economic capitals. However, it seemed that those political parties did not have the capacity to nominate woman candidates who can analyse problems well to the point of where they can provide policy recommendations for the current problems in the society. Throughout the campaigns, not all the woman candidates proved to have the capability of public speaking. This can be confirmed by their occasional timidity, lack of self-confidence, and often enough, prioritising the seniors in their political party when given the stage to express their vision and missions and engage in dialogues with the public.

The uses of feminine issues by the woman candidates who ran for the regional legislative general elections will be more effective when several preconditions were met. The first precondition is that the issues they address must be specific. Raising issues on healthcare provisions were not enough for them to be elected, the incumbents must be able to target specific themes, e.g., adequate services for HIV-positive people. These woman candidates should determine their positions on said themes, such as the needs to keep the HIV-positive people company through assistances. Their positions on the theme were in tandem with actions and programs/program plans which they can implement. The scope of issues raised must also cover a wide extent because it determines the number of votes which may be gained. Hence, the further the scope of issue is, the wider the audiences influenced, resulting in higher chance of votes.

The use of feminine issues, especially health issues and services for children and marginalised groups emphasized the gender stereotypes even more. When the woman candidates campaigned for those issues, the positive attributes of the candidates such as kindness, compassionate, merciful, and others, became even more discernible and were able to positively affect their image to the public. As a result of their campaign issues, the improvement of the image to the public will benefit the candidates themselves.

The second issue is that the nominating political party needs to synchronise with the targeted social organisations when it comes to campaigning the candidates' issues. One of the unique characteristics of Indonesian society is that social organisations heavily influence people's mind in voting. This study found one prominent social organisation, which was NU—a religious organisation having many wings. The National wakening Party (PKB; Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa) is a party born from NU. Thus, when woman candidates not from PKB intend to seek support from the NU organisation, they will certainly find difficulties.

Feminine issues emerging and being used by woman candidates for campaigns are forms of defence amidst the patriarchy and strong Islamic values. The woman candidates intentionally avoided community groups which may hinder them throughout the general election processes. They also purposefully targeted woman groups which they can candidly campaign for the jargon "only women understand women", "only women are able to represent women", "only women understand the needs of women", "it's time for women to lead", and so on. When selecting these targeted woman groups, they chose muslimat religious organisation, the PKK, and dance groups. These woman groups were not hard-line woman groups who oppose woman leaderships.

## IV. CONCLUSION

This study proved that woman legislative candidates at the local level felt more comfortable and they seemed to grasp feminine issues better than masculine issues, which can be shown by the fact that they all raised feminine issues. Both new and incumbent candidates utilised feminine issues. These feminine issues provided better chance in the election compared to them using masculine issues. In order to win, when woman candidates in non-western countries addressed feminine issues, they should also specified particular issues which have a wide range of target. This is because the people vote for candidates not only based on the issues addressed. Also, in non-western countries, the roles of religious organisations have influential effects on decision-making behaviours at the local level. So it is recommended to deliver feminine issues by synchronising the nominating party with the targeted religions organisations.

The uses of feminine issues for campaigns in non-western countries are not indicative of the emergence of woman movements in the perspectives of liberal feminism, rather, a form of survival of woman candidates during patriarchal culture. Woman candidates chose to cover domains where man candidates weren't accustomed to discussing. They campaigned to women to pave the ways so that only women can lead women and only women can understand the needs of other women. This attitude was taken by the woman candidates who considered the value and norm aspects currently developing in the non-western societies, where strong legitimacy coming from the religious and cultural side dictates leaders should be from men. Therefore, the feminine issues addressed by the woman candidates rose because of ethical aspects growing in the society.

Political parties nominated woman candidates who couldn't identify society's current problems well and weren't able to provide concrete solutions for them. The people were leaning towards voting for incumbent woman candidates because their political party still put their trust on these candidates based on the candidates' performances during their legislative period. In other words, the political parties failed to carry their caderisation function, especially for woman cadres. Based on this study, there were only a few women recruited by political parties who were considered by the people to have the necessary capacity to become their representatives.

## REFERENCES

[1] Alexander, D., & Andersen, K. (1993). Gender as a Factor in the Attribution of Leadership Traits. *Political Research Quarterly*. https://doi.org/10.2307/448946

[2] Bauer, N. M. (2015). Who stereotypes female candidates? Identifying individual differences in feminine stereotype reliance. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, *3*(1), 94–110. https://doi.org/10.1080/21565503.2014.992794

[3] Bauer, N. M. (2018). Untangling the Relationship between Partisanship, Gender Stereotypes, and Support for Female Candidates. *Journal of Women, Politics and Policy*, *39*(1), 1–25. https://doi.org/10.1080/1554477X.2016.1268875

[4]   Berg, L. (2015). *Women's Pathways into Parliament: The Case of Indonesia*.

[5]   Brians, C. L. (2005). Women for women? Gender and party bias in voting for female candidates. *American Politics Research*, *33*(3), 357–375. https://doi.org/10.1177/1532673X04269415

[6]   Choi, N. (2019). Women's political pathways in southeast asia. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, *21*(2), 224–248. https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2018.1523683

[7]   Crowder-Meyer, M., Gadarian, S. K., & Trounstine, J. (2015). Electoral institutions, gender stereotypes, and women's local representation. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, *3*(2), 318–334. https://doi.org/10.1080/21565503.2015.1031803

[8]   Davies, S. G., & Idrus, N. I. (2018). Participating in Parliamentary Politics: Experiences of Indonesian Women 1995/2010. *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities*, *3*(1), 81–97. https://doi.org/10.14203/jissh.v3i1.47

[9]   Dolan, K. (2005). Do women candidates play to gender stereotypes? Do men candidates play to women? Candidate sex and issues priorities on campaign websites. *Political Research Quarterly*, *58* (1), 31–44. https://doi.org/10.1177/106591290505800103

[10]  Dolan, K. (2010). The impact of gender stereotyped evaluations on support for women candidates. *Political Behavior*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-009-9090-4

[11]  Fealy, G., & White, S. (2008). Islam and Gender in Contemporary Indonesia: Public Discourses on Duties, Rights and Morality. In G. and W. S. Fealy (Ed.), *Expressing Islam: Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia*. Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

[12]  Gerintya, S. (2017). *Kuota 30% Perempuan di Parlemen Belum Pernah Tercapai*. Tirto.Id. https://tirto.id/kuota-30-perempuan-di-parlemen-belum-pernah-tercapai-cv8q

[13]  Haryono, E. A. D. (2014). Bagaimana Wajah Caleg Perempuan dalam Pemilu 2014? *Jurnal Perempuan*, *Vol. 19 No*(12), 153–160.

[14]  Herrnson, P. S., Lay, J. C., Stokes, A. K., Herrnson, P. S., & Lay, J. C. (2003). Campaign Issues , and Voter-Targeting Strategies. *The University of Chicago Press Journals*, *65*(1), 244–255.

[15]  IDEA Internasional. (2002). *Perempuan Di Parlemen* (Issue 3).

[16]  Kahn, K. F. (1993). Gender Differences in Campaign Messages: The Political Advertisements of Men and Women Candidates for U. S. Senate. *Political Research Quarterly*, *46*(3), 481. https://doi.org/10.2307/448944

[17]  Lawless, J. L. (2004). Women, war, and winning elections: Gender stereotyping in the post-September 11th era. In *Political Research Quarterly*. https://doi.org/10.1177/106591290405700312

[18]  Norris, P., & Lovenduski, J. (1995). *POLITICAL RECRUITMENT Gender, race and class in the British parliament*. CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS.

[19]  Rahmatunnisa, M., & Mariana, D. (2017). *Women's Political Participation in Indonesia's Reform Era: Local Government Perspective*. *84*(Iconeg 2016), 265–269. https://doi.org/10.2991/iconeg-16.2017.60

[20]  Rosenwasser, S. M., Rogers, R. R., Fling, S., Silvers-Pickens, K., & Butemeyer, J. (1987). Attitudes toward Women and Men in Politics: Perceived Male and Female Candidate Competencies and Participant Personality Characteristics. *Political Psychology*. https://doi.org/10.2307/3791299

[21]  Shair-Rosenfield, S. (2012). The alternative incumbency effect: Electing women legislators in Indonesia. *Electoral Studies*, *31*(3), 576–587. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electstud.2012.05.002

[22]  Windett, J. H. (2014). Gendered Campaign Strategies in U.S. Elections. *American Politics Research*, *42*(4), 628–655. https://doi.org/10.1177/1532673X13507101

[23]  Winter, N. J. G. (2010). Masculine Republicans and Feminine Democrats: Gender and Americans' Explicit and Implicit Images of the Political Parties. *Political Behavior*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-010-9131-z