



Identity Politics and Electoral Outcomes: A Systematic Review

Ria Anisa
Sekolah Tinggi Pembangunan
Masyarakat Desa "APMD" Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
riaanisa1990@gmail.com

Resno Azizah R
Sekolah Tinggi Pembangunan
Masyarakat Desa "APMD" Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
resnoazizahr@gmail.com

Junior Hendri Wijaya
Sekolah Tinggi Pembangunan
Masyarakat Desa "APMD" Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
jrhendriwijaya@gmail.com

Abstract — This research aims to give understanding about identity politics and Electoral Outcomes through literature review. When social identity, culture, ethnicity, gender, religion and other background become important factors in politics. Therefore, deep understanding about relations between identity politics and electoral outcome is essential. This systematic review identifies and analyze key findings related to the role of identity politics in influencing election outcomes, including voting patterns, political participation, and voters' preference. The results of the literature review show that political identity can be a significant factor in shaping voting patterns and general election's results. Group identity, whether majority or minority, can influence how voters vote and provide political support. Factors such as ethnicity, religion and gender can play an important role in shaping voter preferences and form a country's political direction. Several studies show that there is variation in how political identity influences election results various countries. Other factors such as policy issues, candidate characteristic and campaign dynamics also play a significant role in the election results.

Keywords — identity politics, electoral outcome, political identity, general election

I. INTRODUCTION

Elections is one of the forms of implementing democracy. In the electoral process there are many determining factors that play an important role, one of which is identity [1]–[3]. Identity according to the Big Indonesian Dictionary is interpreted as an identity attached to someone who comes from ethnicity, religion and gender. In the public space, identity holds superiority and inferiority claims. The claim depends on the level of position of interest. There comes a time, some people feel that they occupy a higher position in the social space, and there are others who are considered to have a lower position. This inferiority and superiority that make public space an arena for political transactions to facilitate one's movement or vice versa. Political identity creates narcissism to measure the existence of an identity compared to other [4].

In election activities, of course, the political behavior of each individual is different, and is influenced by various factors. Moreover, joining a political party and participating in general elections is a form of one's political attitude, because it is a vessel and means for participating in state administration and policy activities (Sharif, 2019). Voter behavior is related to their participation in elections, often closely related to identity politics, which can also affect election results.

Furthermore, religion plays an important role in Taiwanese society and has a significant influence on political behavior. Religious factors and moral values adhere by the people of Taiwan are important considerations for political parties in the implementation of general elections. Taiwan has a variety of religious beliefs, including Buddhism, Taoism, Christianity and traditional religions. These religions play a strong role in shaping the identity and values of the Taiwanese people. Religious beliefs influence the political views and electoral decisions of voters, as well as shape their preference for a particular political party or [5].

Identity politics refers to the influence that certain group identities, such as race, ethnicity, religion, gender, or sexual orientation, have on the political process. In the context of general elections, political identity is an important factor influencing voter preferences and election results. Political identity can shape a person's political views and influence election decisions. The study of Identity Politics and Electoral Outcomes is an important topic in political science and social science in general.

II. RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a systematic review method. In this method researchers can collect, analyze, and combine existing findings to provide a more comprehensive picture of the relationship between political identity and election results.

Data Collection

As part of research, a good literature search must also go through a methodological process. In this study, a literature search was carried out using the building blocks method and using the Publish or Perish application [6]. The building blocks method implement in this study include some stages, such as identifying approaches to searching literature, databases, keywords used, search limits (eg limited to a certain time span, document type, language). Publish or Perish is a software program that retrieves and analyzes academic citations.

Durai (2020) outlines several stages of searching for literature according to:

- 1) Formulate a search strategy
- 2) Implementation of the search strategy (point 1)
- 3) Retrieval of sources (literature articles)
- 4) Screening sources
- 5) Categorization/classification/grouping of search results

The stages and strategies used in this systematic literature review are as follows

- 1) Determination of the database, namely using proquest, Scopus and Google Scholar
 - 2) Determination of search keywords, namely keywords according to the scope of research
 - 3) Search limitations. The three searches in the database are restricted respectively as follows:
 - a. Proquest - limited to searching for full text and peer-reviewed articles in English
 - b. Scopus – limited to full access articles only
 - c. Google scholar- limited to searches within the 2010-2022 timeframe. In addition, a separate search was performed with Google Scholar, because there are no advanced search tools. The articles obtained will be described separately.
 - 4) Pursing keywords from general to specific terms that are felt to help researchers find literature that is in accordance with the scope being researched.
 - 5) Elimination and selection of literature articles that are considered the most appropriate and can be used as study material in this study
- Table 1 are the results of a literature search that has been done.

Table 1: Literature review

No	Search codes	Proquest	Scopus	Google Scholar	Final List
1	Keywords: TI ("Identity Politics") Comments: Too many results causing by using keyword that is to Searching limited to only peer-reviewed English article Searches on Google Scholar are limited to the period 2010-2022. The search results are too many and general because Google scholar doesn't have an Advanced search engine	395 in total, but 193 (peer-reviewed article)	1191 in total, but 110 (open access article)	9660	
2	TI ("Political Identity") Results: too many results, needs to use additional keywords that are more specific	550 in total, but 163 (peer-reviewed article)	593iin total, but 88 (open access article)	5080	
3	TI ("identity" AND "politics") AND TI ("Election") Comment: take 2 articles from Proquest, following: [7] the fires of identity politics: north Sumatra gubernatorial election of 2018, and [8] "What are we?": Latino Politics, Identity, and Memory in the 1983 Chicago Mayoral Election In addition, 2 articles from scopus also included, which are: [9] Online news media, religious identity and their influence on gendered politics: Observations from Malawi's 2014 Election, dan [10] The Politics of Space in borana oromo, Ethiopia. Demographics, elections, Identity and Customary Institution	2	24	17.900	4
4	TI ("Election") AND TI ("Voting" AND "behaviour") Comment: 3 relevant articles from Proquest are taken, namely: [11] "How did we choose?": Understanding the Northern Female Votign Behaviour in Malaysia in the 14 th General Election; [12] Interpersonal Communication, voting behaviour, and influence in an election campaign: the 2009 German Elections; and [13] A study of voting behaviour in an exeptional context: the 2017 Catalan election Study	5	33	5540	
5	TI ("Political Identity") AND TI ("Election" OR "Electoral Result" OR "Election Results" OR "Result" OR "Electoral Outcome")	2	2	3840	

Comment:
 2 relevant article from Proquest, namely: [14] Local Political Parties In Aceh In 2017 Regional Election: Analysis of Political Identity and Islamization Issue; and [15] Political Identity and Criminal Violence in Jamaica: The Garrison Community of August town and the 2022 Election
 In addition, 2 Articles from Scopus also taken, which are: [16] Local election as a sphere for forming citizens political identity; and [17] The political Identity of Ulama in the 2014 Indonesian residential election

6	TI ("Political Identity") AND TI ("Election" OR "voting behaviour" OR "Voting" OR "voters" OR "Voters Decision" OR "Behaviour")	4	3	2630	1
---	---	---	---	------	---

Comments:
 1 relevant article from google scholar is found, namely: [18] the effect of Religion on Political behaviour in the context of sociological and psychological models

7	TI ("Political Identity") AND TI ("Election" OR "Election Results" OR "Result" OR "Electoral Outcome") OR AB ("Voting Behaviour" OR "Electoral Result") Comments: searching limited only on English and Peer Reviewed article	140	3	85	1
---	--	-----	---	----	---

Comment: found 1 relevant article from Scopus, namely: [19] The political reference point: how geography shapes political Identity

III. DISCUSSIONS

On Warren's research who says identity politics has contributed to the current "pink wave" sweeping the continent and continues to be in dialogue with these new leftist governments as they redefine what it means to be a citizen and the relationship between state and citizen. Thus, this article discusses how political identity plays a role in responding to and shaping the political landscape in Latin America. The focus is on the intersectionality and influence of neoliberalism, and the relationship between identity politics and the emerging leftist governments in the region. This article conveys the view that identity politics is not only an important aspect of current political change, but is also part of the process of redefining citizenship and the relationship between state and citizen in Latin America [20].

This research investigates the response of the main parties to the growth of right-wing parties in Europe and their impact on identity politics. The results of the study are as follows: The rapid growth of right-wing parties in Europe has influenced the response of the main parties. The main party responded by reducing attention to non-economic identity groups and increasing concern for the working class. The social democratic party became the main determinant of the decline in positive attention to non-economic identity groups during the study period. The growth of right-wing parties' effects not only the political status of immigrants, but also have significant consequences for broader identity groups. While strategies for adopting niche party issues can be successful in elections, the effectiveness of such strategies depends on the electoral context, party identity, and the issues at stake. This research highlights the need for further research

to explore the impact of the growth of right-wing parties on real policies, including legislation and spending on economic and non-economic issues of identity. Future research should also examine whether the main party also responds to left-wing parties on issues of equality and identity, and whether new left-wing or green parties provide counterpoints that change the incentives of the main party to face the growth of right-wing parties [21].

The emergence of identity in the arena of public space raises links and interactions between entities. To survive this competition, existence is needed. As a result, narcissism becomes a measure of the existence of one identity over another. In this case, elections also become one of the public spaces as arenas for narcissistic identity performances. Moreover, like a perfect hook and bait, the elite also have an interest in using identity to bring in the coffers of votes, this transaction becomes a political marketing activity. In the process of political marketing activity, political identities experience exploitation in order to win elections. Exploitation as a mode of political marketing is massively carried out through various media, especially electronic media, especially social media. Indirectly, the process of exploitation of political identity through social media has had a negative impact on the social conditions of society, including religious sentiments, primordialism, and fanaticism towards certain political identities. One of the impacts is related to disintegration due to SARA sensitivity which threatens a democratic and safe election process [22].

When it comes to political-religious interaction, where people regard religion as one of the foundations and a strong determinant of many attitudes, social and political behavior,

and political decision-making, it can be said that in democratic countries where administrators are determined by public opinion, politics is certain. interact with religion and religious masses when politicians have concerns about reconciliation with people's beliefs (Aslan and Erbay, 2017). The participation of Islamic scholars in Indonesia in elections is based on whether or not there are candidates from the organization. The decline in participation was seen in the 2009 presidential election, compared to 2004. The 2004 presidential election was considered the first democratic election to be held because there were candidates from Islamic parties or mass organizations, while in the 2009 presidential election there were no candidates from among the clergy [17].

Apart from the presidential election, the same thing happened at the regional head election level. In North Sumatra, religious background dominated in the 2018 gubernatorial election. Identity politics such as ethnic and religious identities were seen to be strong in the 2018 North Sumatra gubernatorial election contestation. Ethnic identity was the basis for evidence of support for certain pairs in the 2018 North Sumatra gubernatorial election. Meanwhile, the Marga and Ethnic Association in North Sumatra expressed support for each candidate competing in the election. In addition, support for Edy Rahmayadi and Musa Rajekshah was provided by Islamic organizations, namely the National Fatwa Defenders Movement (GNFP) and the North Sumatra Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) because the candidate pair promised to protect Islamic interests and education. In addition, the pair of candidates are committed to maintaining and prospering the mosque, advancing the Islamic economy by establishing a sharia-based Islamic bank, building an Islamic center, and making GNFO a partner in community development [7].

Part from the North Sumatra Pilkada, the DKI Jakarta Pilkada also deserves to be noted as a historic moment of how political identity became one of the tools to win elections. Factors of ethnic identity and religion played an important role in influencing the DKI Jakarta regional head election process in 2007, 2012 and 2017. In the 2007 election, Fauzi Bowo won high voter votes in sub-districts where the majority of the population was ethnic Chinese. On the other hand, Fauzi Bowo's vote acquisition was low in a village with Sundanese and Minangkabau ethnic residents. The map of support for Fauzi Bowo in the 2012 election experienced a turning point. Fauzi Bowo gets a strong vote from a region inhabited by ethnic Betawi, Sundanese and Minangkabau. On the other hand, there was a decrease in the number of votes from areas where the majority of the population was ethnic Chinese and Batak. Meanwhile, his opponent, Joko Widodo (Jokowi) paired with Basuki Cahya Purnawa (Ahok) made the melting of ethnic nuances even thicker. Ahok is of Chinese ethnicity, while Jokowi is of Javanese ethnicity. The Jakarta leader, who had been identified with the original ethnicity, namely Betawi, at that time was won by a Javanese-Chinese leader. The factor of religious identity began to show a pattern in the 2017 DKI Jakarta Pilkada. The pair Anis Baswedan and Sandiaga Uno became an important supporting element in winning the election. The votes of the two candidates are superior in sub-districts where the majority are Muslim. In contrast, Ahok's vote pocket is low in areas where the majority of the population is Muslim. Voter patterns based on religious patterns culminated in the blasphemy case against Ahok. As a result, the issue of religious identity becomes increasingly

acute in the election process. The climax, gave birth to the 212 Movement and the tagline "As long as it's not Ahok" [23].

Not only in Indonesia, the involvement of identity politics in elections also occurred in the United States, for example in the 1983 election for Mayor of Chicago. The elections encouraged the Latin minority population to become aware of collective identity as a subgroup between blacks and whites. Harold Washington's mayoral candidate campaign at that time succeeded in capturing the attention of Latin ethnicity in political discourse. "Latin voice" at that time was not a single issue related to race or politics but a constituent from a hierarchical relationship between the campaign team and the Latin political elite which was called the "rainbow coalition". There is a lucrative relationship in political and business assistance between elite candidates and Latin ethnic officials. Indirectly, the legitimacy of "latino" provides social pressure and the same citizenship identity for latinos born on US soil. This was a breath of fresh air because in the previous era the political machine was controlled by white skin and there was no space for alligator racial nationalism for Latinos. ("What Are We?": Latino Politics, Identity, and Memory in the 1983 Chicago Mayoral Election)

In Malaysia, elements of identity politics have been able to change the position of the Barisan Nasional Party after 21 years in power. This was in the 2018 elections. In this process, the gender aspect of female voters plays a very important role. According to data from the Malaysian general election commission in 2018, out of a total of 12,229,514 voters, more than 50% are women. It was found that the pattern of female voters did not only choose based on gender background, but also ethnicity and other demographic factors. Chinese and Indian women voters tend to prefer candidates based on political parties and other factors. Meanwhile, Malay women voters consider religious and moral values in making their choice. Moreover, the notion that women should not be leaders is still a common paradigm. As a result, female candidates who participate in political contests in Malaysia do not get support from ethnic Malay women voters (Zakuan et. al, 2018). Gender identity and religion in Malawi also influence voters in the presidential election. The issue of identity is "sold" so as not to vote for one of the candidates, namely Joyce Banda. Joyce Banda who is a woman is considered unfit to be a leader, based on the two major religions in Malawi. Campaign of Sesa Joyce Sesa (Sweep Joyce Away), one of the candidates, also said that a woman in that religion should not play a role (and be chosen) as a leader among men. [24]

Political identity also depends on social context, and each classification has a different meaning, such as place of residence. The social environment in which a person lives can be a factor that influences a person's political attitude. In addition, related to support for government political policies, someone's dislike of other people with a spectrum of different political ideologies -liberal and conservative, actually has the same attitude towards a policy. In this case, it can be said that identity politics limits the rational actions of voters, where they may not like each other even though they may have the same political views [25].

Voter behavior in regional elections is an important factor in supporting the successful holding of elections, especially in Aceh as a region where the majority of citizens adhere to Islamic law. The 2017 Aceh Pilkada showed that local voters experienced a crisis of confidence in the national party, as a result of resolving political conflicts. Local Aceh

parties were able to restore people's trust and political participation. As a result, the Aceh Party and the Aceh National Party succeeded in gaining the political trust of the people compared to the national parties [14].

IV. CONCLUSION

The results of the literature review show that political identity can be a significant factor in shaping voting patterns and general election's results. Group identity, whether majority or minority, can influence how voters vote and provide political support. Factors such as ethnicity, religion and gender can play an important role in shaping voter preferences and form a country's political direction. Several studies show that there is variation in how political identity influences election results various countries. Other factors such as policy issues, candidate characteristic and campaign dynamics also play a significant role in the election results.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors would like to thank Leaders of Sekolah Tinggi Pembangunan Masyarakat Desa APMD for providing financial support.

REFERENCES

- [1] "Pemilu 2024 dalam Bayang-Bayang Politik Identitas - kumparan - UMM dalam Berita Koran Online | Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang," <https://www.umm.ac.id/id/arsip-koran/kumparan/pemilu-2024-dalam-bayangbayang-politik-identitas.html> (accessed May 30, 2023).
- [2] "Kesalahpahaman tentang Politik Identitas - UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta Official Website," Nov. 11, 2022. <https://www.uinjkt.ac.id/kesalahpahaman-tentang-politik-identitas/> (accessed May 30, 2023).
- [3] "Apa Itu Politik Identitas? Ini Pengertian beserta Contoh Nyatanya." <https://www.detik.com/edu/detikpedia/d-6487494/apa-itu-politik-identitas-ini-pengertian-beserta-contoh-nyatanya> (accessed May 30, 2023).
- [4] M. Prabakaran, "On Identity Politics." Rochester, NY, May 20, 2013. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.2267231.
- [5] M. Wrenn, "Identity, identity politics, and neoliberalism," *Panoeconomicus*, vol. 61, no. 4, pp. 503–515, 2014.
- [6] "Masih Bingung Cari Referensi? Publish or Perish Solusinya! – UPT Jurnal." <https://uptjurnal.umsu.ac.id/masih-bingung-cari-referensi-publish-or-perish-solusinya/> (accessed May 30, 2023).
- [7] M. I Simanihuruk and H. I D. of S. Sitorus, "The fires of identity politics: North Sumatra gubernatorial election of 2018," Nov. 2019, doi: 10.1088/1755-1315/374/1/012028.
- [8] "What Are We?: Latino Politics, Identity, and - ProQuest." <https://www.proquest.com/docview/2610783446/2C358ACC5451498FPQ2?accountid=12372&forcedol=true> (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [9] "Online News Media, Religious Identity and Their Influence on Gendered Politics: Observations from Malawi's 2014 Elections in: Journal of Religion, Media and Digital Culture Volume 4 Issue 1 (2015)." https://brill.com/view/journals/rmdc/4/1/article-p39_2.xml?language=en (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [10] "The politics of space in Borana Oromo, Ethiopia: demographics, elections, identity and customary institutions: Journal of Eastern African Studies: Vol 4, No 2." <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17531055.2010.487333?journalCode=rjea20> (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [11] U. A. A. I Zakuan *et al.*, "How did we Choose?: Understanding the Northern Female Voting Behaviour in Malaysia in the 14th General Election *," p. 859, 2018.
- [12] M. I I C. C. A. Mancosu, "Interpersonal communication, voting behaviour and influence in an election campaign: The 2009 German elections," pp. 33–43, 2017, doi: 10.15203/ozp.1893.vol46iss3.
- [13] "A study of voting behaviour in an exceptional - ProQuest." <https://www.proquest.com/docview/2402169226/647A7210F4FE4D36PQ2?accountid=12372&forcedol=true> (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [14] M. R. Syarif, "LOCAL POLITICAL PARTIES IN ACEH IN 2017 REGIONAL ELECTION: Analysis of Political Identity and Islamization Issue," *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam*, vol. 20, no. 2, Art. no. 2, Dec. 2019, doi: 10.18860/ua.v20i2.5668.
- [15] "Political Identity and Criminal Violence in Jamaica: The Garrison Community of August Town and the 2002 Election by Christopher Charles :: SSRN." https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2372154 (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [16] A. Turska-Kawa and M. Haček, "Local Elections as a Sphere for Forming Citizens' Political Identity," *Politics in Central Europe*, vol. 13, no. 2–3, pp. 53–72, Dec. 2017, doi: 10.1515/pce-2017-0003.
- [17] L. Winarni, "The Political Identity of Ulama in the 2014 Indonesian Presidential Election," *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, vol. 52, no. 2, Art. no. 2, Dec. 2014, doi: 10.14421/ajis.2014.522.257-269.
- [18] M. M. Aslan and M. Erbay, *THE EFFECT OF RELIGION ON POLITICAL BEHAVIOUR IN THE CONTEXT OF SOCIOLOGICAL AND PSYCHO-SOCIAL MODELS*. 2017.
- [19] "The political reference point: How geography shapes political identity - PMC." <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5312959/> (accessed May 29, 2023).
- [20] S. D. Warren, "Latin American Identity Politics: Redefining Citizenship," *Sociology Compass*, vol. 6, no. 10, pp. 833–844, 2012, doi: 10.1111/j.1751-9020.2012.00491.x.
- [21] A. C. Weeks and P. Allen, "Backlash against 'identity politics': far right success and mainstream party attention to identity groups," *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, vol. 0, no. 0, pp. 1–19, Apr. 2022, doi: 10.1080/21565503.2022.2065318.
- [22] A. Prasetia, *PENGARUH POLITIK IDENTITAS MELALUI MEDIA SOSIAL TERHADAP GENERASI MILENIAL DAN PELAKSANAAN PEMILU*. 2019.
- [23] I. Fautanu, B. M, and H. Gunawan, "Politik Identitas dalam Pilkada DKI Jakarta Tahun 2017: Perspektif Pemikiran Politik Nurcholish Madjid," *Politicon : Jurnal Ilmu Politik*, vol. 2, no. 2, Art. no. 2, Aug. 2020, doi: 10.15575/politicon.v2i2.8146.
- [24] A. M. Gunde, "Online News Media, Religious Identity and Their Influence on Gendered Politics: Observations from Malawi's 2014 Elections," *Journal of Religion, Media and Digital Culture*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 39–66, May 2015, doi: 10.1163/21659214-90000100.
- [25] M. Feinberg, A. M. Tullett, Z. Mensch, W. Hart, and S. Gottlieb, "The political reference point: How geography shapes political identity," *PLOS ONE*, vol. 12, no. 2, p. e0171497, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0171497.

Open Access This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

