



Interweaving Narratives and Audience: The Unfolding Greatness in Art Through the Inconclusive Dilemma Structure

Yifan Liu

Hanyang University, Seoul, South Korea

327udnhh@gmail.com

Abstract. Yu Qiuyu's "Artistic Creation Theory" offers a multidimensional framework for analyzing the genesis of art from artistic, dramatic, and philosophical perspectives, urging creators to aspire to grander visions. Central to his theory is the 'inconclusive dilemma structure,' which necessitates a synergy between the artist's guidance and the audience's engagement. By integrating historical, cultural, and archaeological dimensions, Yu scrutinizes the genesis of monumental works, exemplified by the Homeric epics—quintessential embodiments of ancient Greek literature with profound historical resonance. The study posits that the genesis of such art relies on the interplay between humanity and nature, a 'cornerstone' fostering intellectual evolution through the chronicling and creation of human experiences. This paper explores the complexities of crafting such structures and their societal implications, highlighting the 'inconclusive dilemma structure' as pivotal to the enduring legacy of Homer's epics and the overarching greatness of Yu's artistic conception.

Keywords: Artistic Creation Theory, Great, Inconclusive dilemma structure, Homer's epic.

1 Introduction

Yu Qiuyu's "Artistic Creation Theory" proposes the "inconclusive dilemma structure," a paradigm that reframes our understanding of artistic greatness. According to Qiuyu, monumental art thrives beyond explicit themes or simplistic conclusions, instead blossoming through complex interplays between the artist's intent and the audience's interpretation. This theory is exemplified in the Homeric epics, seminal works of ancient Greece, which embody historical, cultural, and artistic milestones despite their inherent thematic ambiguities. Qiuyu contends that the true essence of art derives from its developmental process[1]—a dance between human experiences and natural phenomena. The greatness of art, thus, is not predetermined but emerges from the creation process and the subsequent engagement of the audience. This study explores the "inconclusive dilemma structure" within Yu Qiuyu's theoretical framework[2] and its manifestation in Homer's epics, analyzing how this narrative complexity contributes to their enduring

legacy. It underscores the symbiosis between the creator and the beholder, the historical and the contemporary, the individual and society, all converging within the artistic milieu. In doing so, the paper also contemplates the broader implications of such a structure for understanding the intricate relationship between art, its ecological impacts, and the eternal themes of human history. The introduction sets the stage for a deep dive into the intricate fabric of artistic creation, weaving together the threads of narrative, interpretation, and the inherent tensions that give rise to timeless works.

2 The Inconclusive Dilemma Structure

2.1 The Essence of Profound Art

The concept of the "inconclusive dilemma structure," as elucidated by Yu Qiuyu in his discourse on artistic creation, presents a compelling challenge to the conventional notion that great art must adhere to a formulaic structure with clear themes and neat conclusions. Qiuyu's perspective delves into the very heart of what defines greatness in art. According to him, the process of artistic creation is far from linear or predictable; instead, it is a dynamic and multifaceted journey.

Artistic creation, as Qiuyu portrays it, is a rich tapestry woven from various threads of inspiration, deliberation, and contemplation. It commences with the spark of spontaneous inspiration, where the artist's innermost thoughts and emotions find expression in their chosen medium. This initial burst of creativity sets the stage for what follows.

Deliberate thematic development represents the artist's conscious effort to shape and mold their creation. It involves refining the initial inspiration, crafting a narrative or form, and infusing layers of meaning and complexity. This phase of the creative process is marked by intentionality and a deep exploration of the chosen themes or subjects.

However, it is in the contemplation of audience reception that the true magic of art occurs. Qiuyu's theory underscores the vital role played by the audience in the artistic dialogue. Art is not a one-way communication but a dynamic exchange between the creator and the viewer. The artist's work takes on new life as it encounters the diverse interpretations and emotions of the audience. This dynamic nature of artistic creation inherently challenges the misconception that modern art lacks the capacity for greatness. Qiuyu's perspective invites us to reconsider our preconceived notions about what constitutes profound art. It suggests that greatness in art goes beyond the confines of clarity of expression; it delves into the intricate and often ambiguous realms of human experience and emotions.

2.2 The Role of Audience Engagement

Yu Qiuyu's theory underscores the pivotal role of audience engagement in shaping the significance of a creative work. It challenges the conventional notion that a work of art is a static entity with a fixed meaning determined solely by the artist's original intent. Instead, Qiuyu's perspective highlights the dynamic and evolving nature of art, where

its value is not confined to the artist's vision but extends to the interpretation and interaction of the audience.

Art, by its very essence, is subjective and open to a myriad of interpretations. Each individual brings their unique background, experiences, emotions, and perspectives to their encounter with a work of art. This diversity of viewpoints enriches the art experience, making it a vibrant and multi-layered tapestry of meaning. A poignant example of the subjectivity of artistic interpretation can be found in Hemingway's response to Bernard Berenson's symbolic reading of "The Old Man and the Sea." Hemingway's acknowledgment of the validity of Berenson's interpretation demonstrates that a single work of art can evoke different, yet equally valid, responses from various viewers.

The true essence of art lies in its dual existence: first as conceived by the artist, and second as re-envisioned and reinterpreted by the reader or viewer. This interplay between creator and audience is where the magic of art unfolds. It allows for a continuous dialogue between the creative mind that gave birth to the work and the receptive minds that engage with it.

This dynamic exchange between creator and audience not only adds layers of meaning to a piece of art but also ensures its relevance across time and cultures. It invites individuals to explore, question, and find personal connections with the work, thereby making art a living and evolving entity.

2.3 Homer's Epics and the Inconclusive Dilemma

2.3.1 The Artistic Genesis of Epics:

Homer's epics, revered as the dawn of artistic expression, stand as monumental pillars in the literary heritage of ancient Greece and the Western tradition. These venerable works, despite their unparalleled status, are not exempt from the inherent limitations of their time, both in terms of ideology and artistry. However, it is precisely their absence of a single authoritative voice and the absence of explicit thematic resolution that encapsulate what Yu Qiuyu describes as the "inconclusive dilemma structure."

These epics are not the product of a solitary author but rather emerge from a collective endeavor that weaves together a multitude of oral traditions into a cohesive tapestry of storytelling. This narrative approach goes beyond the mere recounting of tales of heroism and divinity; it serves as the very foundation upon which moral and ethical paradigms for classical Greek civilization are built.

The Homeric texts, therefore, transcend the role of being mere records of ancient lore; they represent a profound reflection of the enduring human quest for freedom and the intricate complexities of the human ethos. Their resonance echoes through the ages, not merely as historical artifacts, but as guiding lights for societal values and individual morality. These epics continue to inspire and provoke contemplation on the human condition, inviting readers to ponder the timeless questions of virtue, fate, and the essence of humanity. In this way, they remain eternally relevant in the ever-evolving landscape of human thought and culture.

2.3.2 Justice in Homeric Times:

The Homeric epics, with their intricate interplay of gods and mortals, serve as a captivating exploration of justice—a theme that has remained as enigmatic and subject to debate throughout the ages as it was in the ancient world. In the writings of Cheng Xi, we find a profound illumination of the duality that characterizes Homeric justice, poised between the unyielding decrees of the gods and the adaptable perceptions of humanity. This delicate balance between divine mandates and human interpretation underscores the absence of a singular, unequivocal form of justice, beckoning readers to embark on a journey through the nuanced interplay of divine will and the complexities of the human condition.

It's important to recognize that the Homeric epics are not mere chronicles of heroic exploits; rather, they serve as an invitation to meditate upon the very essence of justice itself. They challenge us to question and, in some cases, redefine the boundaries of moral reasoning. These epic narratives elevate the discourse of justice beyond the confines of societal norms and conventions, transcending into the realm of profound philosophical inquiry. This inquiry engages with the fundamental principles that govern human actions and the divine interventions that shape destiny.

Within this intricate tapestry of gods and mortals, justice emerges as a multifaceted and ever-evolving narrative. It invites us to embark on a perennial quest for understanding within the depths of the human psyche. The gods' interventions, often mirroring and refracting the actions of mortals, provide a fertile ground for exploring the complex terrain of justice. It challenges us to grapple with questions of right and wrong, retribution and redemption, and the eternal struggle to find equilibrium in a world where justice is neither absolute nor static. In essence, the Homeric epics beckon us to engage in a timeless exploration of justice—a theme that transcends temporal and cultural boundaries. They remind us that the pursuit of justice is not confined to a specific era but is an enduring and universal quest that continues to captivate and challenge the human intellect and conscience [3].

2.3.3 Themes of Human Endeavor:

Homer's epic poems, timeless and revered in the realm of literature, serve as intricate maps that chart the unending human quest for control and order. They encapsulate the very essence of authority and governance that has resonated throughout the annals of history. These narratives transcend the realm of mere stories; they are profound reflections of the human condition, encapsulating the tumultuous journey of humanity itself.

Within the pages of *The Odyssey* and *The Iliad*, beneath the surface of heroic exploits and epic adventures, lie profound explorations of human nature. These explorations challenge societal norms and ignite discussions that have endured far beyond their original context. These discussions, rooted in the narratives of Homer, serve as the lifeblood of societal progress and philosophical inquiry. They have the power to spark revolutions in both thought and action[4], reshaping the course of human history.

In the grand tapestry of Homeric tales, characters grapple with the timeless themes of destiny and free will. Their actions and fates are intricately interwoven with the divine, reflecting the intricate dance between human ambition and the cosmic order. As these epic narratives unfold, they do more than recount the heroic deeds of their

protagonists; they confront the audience with profound questions about leadership, morality, and the indomitable spirit of humanity.

It is in this confrontation, this ongoing dialogue between these ancient texts and the ever-evolving sensibilities of modern times, that the true greatness of Homer's work is revealed. These epic poems become mirrors through which each era can glimpse its own reflection—its struggles, its triumphs, and its enduring quest for meaning. They solidify their place not only in the pantheon of literary greatness but also as enduring catalysts for change and understanding in the perpetual narrative of humanity[5]. Homer's legacy endures as an eternal source of wisdom and inspiration.

2.3.4 The Dilemma of Compassion:

At the core of the Homeric epics lies the profound theme of 'pity,' an emotion that runs through the very fabric of the narratives, transcending the boundaries of mortal existence to reach the divine. However, it's essential to recognize that this concept of 'pity' is far from a simple, one-dimensional emotion. Instead, it forms a complex tapestry that interweaves divine intervention with human experience, creating a spectrum of emotions that span from compassionate understanding to the fervor of vengeful justice.

In the Iliad, we witness that Achilles' wrath is not merely a personal outburst but a reflection of the intricate machinations of the gods. It symbolizes a broader struggle that encompasses the realms of fate and morality. His anger and the ensuing consequences serve as a microcosm of the eternal conflict between human will and the whims of the divine. In this epic, we are confronted with the question of whether one's actions are determined by personal choice or manipulated by the capricious gods.

Similarly, in the Odyssey, Odysseus embarks on a quest for vengeance that transcends mere personal retribution. His actions are driven by a deep-seated desire for righteousness and the restoration of order as decreed by divine will. This quest highlights the intricate relationship between human agency and the cosmic order, blurring the lines between mortal endeavor and divine decree.

These epic narratives masterfully weave a story that brings to the forefront the paradox of human emotion. Within the same heart, love for one's kin can coexist with an intense hatred for one's enemies. It is this duality of mankind's emotional capacity that these epics illuminate—the simultaneous existence of noble sentiments and base desires within the human soul. This portrayal of 'pity,' a sentiment that resonates both with the gods and with humans, captures the quintessential human predicament. The enduring theme of these ancient stories—the oscillation between our nobler instincts and our basest desires—continues to reverberate through the annals of time. These narratives remain relevant even in modern discourse, serving as a mirror to human nature and offering timeless insights into the complex interplay of compassion and vengeance, morality and fate, that define our existence [6].

3 Conclusion

Yu Qiuyu's theory of the "inconclusive dilemma structure" has been a guiding principle in understanding the depth and breadth of artistic creation, offering a unique perspective

that captures the nuanced interplay between creator intent and audience perception[7]. This study has explored how such a structure is not only present in the Homeric epics, often considered the cornerstone of Western literature, but also remains relevant in the contemporary discourse of art and its interpretations. The Homeric epics, devoid of definitive conclusions, instead offer a rich landscape for exploration, challenging readers to engage with the text and contribute to its ever-evolving narrative. The "inconclusive dilemma structure" thereby emerges as a testament to the living nature of art, encapsulating the dynamic and transformative journey of creation rather than a static endpoint. Through this lens, art is understood as a dialogue, a continuous exchange that spans time, space, and culture. It is a process that invites participation, reflection, and reinterpretation, ensuring that the work remains alive and pertinent across generations. The greatness of such works, as seen in Homer's epics, is derived not from their resolution but from their enduring ability to foster connections, provoke thought, and stimulate the collective imagination.

In conclusion, the "inconclusive dilemma structure" serves as a foundation for artistic greatness, a blueprint that transcends temporal confines and fosters a deeper understanding of the human condition. Yu Qiuyu's theory not only enriches our appreciation of historical works of art but also shapes our engagement with the creative endeavors of the future, highlighting the importance of the audience's role in the perpetuation and evolution of art. This structure is a reminder that art is not a monologue but a rich, multilayered conversation that continues to inspire and challenge humanity.

References

1. Yu Qiuyu. *Artistic Creation Theory*. Beijing: "Beijing United Publishing Company", September 2021. First edition ISBN 978-7-5596-4697-2.
2. Yu Qiuyu. *Artistic Creation Project*. Taiwan: "Yunchen Culture" March 1990 ISBN: 9789579027038.
3. Boitani, Piero. "To Conclude and Re-Cognize: The Pain and Joy of Compassion." *Anagnorisis: Scenes and Themes of Recognition and Revelation in Western Literature*. Brill, 2021. 415-432.
4. Prince, Meredith. "FAMILY VS. COMPASSION: ODYSSEUS AND THE ETHICS OF WAR." *Screening Love and War in Troy: Fall of a City* (2022): 169.
5. Hainsworth, John Bryan. *The idea of epic*. Vol. 3. Univ of California Press, 2023.
6. Dué, Casey, Mary Ebbott, and Monica Berti. "The Homer Multitext within the history of access to homeric epic." *Digital Classical Philology: Ancient Greek and Latin in the Digital Revolution*, edited by Monica Berti, De Gruyter (2019): 239-56.
7. Bardach, Lisa, et al. "Has achievement goal theory been right? A meta-analysis of the relation between goal structures and personal achievement goals." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 112.6 (2020): 1197.

Open Access This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

