

Looking Good and Sounding Right

The Importance of Aesthetic Labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry

Indriyani Handyastuti

Convention and Event Business Management Course
Bandung Institute of Tourism
Bandung, Indonesia
inh@stp-bandung.ac.id

Dr. Alexandra J. Kenyon

International Tourism and Hospitality Management Course
Leeds Beckett University
Leeds, United Kingdom

Dr. Upiek H. Sadkar, M.Sc.

International Tourism and Hospitality Management Course
Bandung Institute of Tourism
Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract—In this era which called Experienced Economic Era by Pine and Gilmore, employee has important role in creating experience for the customer [1, 2]. Human resource also viewed as important capital in the Industry since human resources are important in delivering values to meet customer expectations [3]. In Service sector especially in hospitality industry, an employee has crucial role because the simultaneous process of producing and consuming services [4, 5]. The interaction of employee and customer (which also known as service encounter) become very important. It needs not only technical skill but also other things which called soft skills [6]. The purpose of this research project is to explore the importance of aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agencies in Bandung by managers and staff through exploring aesthetic labour's concept as a framework in understanding the important of aesthetic labour, investigating and critically analysing current thinking of the implementation of aesthetic labour especially how the aesthetic labour implementation on recruiting, selection, training, and service encounter stage. This research was using phenomenological philosophy and qualitative method. By using purposive sampling method, the respondents were employee and managers from two different travel agencies in Bandung. The data were collected using one to one interview and analysed using content analysis method. There were some similarities and also differences within the four stages with other current research regarding Aesthetic Labour. Attitude was seen as more important than appearance within Bandung Travel Agency Industry since it was harder to be thought and

trained or re-shape. All respondents stated that aesthetic labour was an important supply of labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry though the application on the recruitment, selection, training, and the service encounter were not as significant as other industries. Further research regarding Aesthetic Labour will be needed. Set of criteria regarding attitude and appearance within Bandung travel agency industry should be revealed in order to make better criteria of job requirements.

Keywords— *Aesthetic Labour, Attitude, Appearance, Bandung Travel Agency Industry*

I. INTRODUCTION

The world is change. The era called Experienced Economic Era by Pine and Gilmore, put employee important role in creating experience for the customer. [1, 2]. Human resource also viewed as important capital in the Industry since human resources are important in delivering values to meet customer expectations [3]. In Service sector especially in hospitality industry, an employee has crucial role because the simultaneous process of producing and consuming services [4, 5]. The interaction of employee and customer (which also known as service encounter) become very important. It needs not only technical skill but also other things which called soft skills [6].

Company also started to find some new criteria instead of technical skill, and knowledge which usually represented by certificate or diploma. Some research findings stated that soft skill, personality traits become more important nowadays within tourism and hospitality industry [5, 6, 7, 8]. However,

this form of labour issues was underappreciated and unexplored.

Based on the research conducted in Glasgow, Warhurst et al. proposed a new form of labour to debate about human capital. The new form of labour was called Aesthetic Labour [6]. Aesthetic labour can be conclude as the commodification of embodied capacities and attributes which match with certain professional / corporate image. These capacities and attributes should be possessed by workers at the entry point of employment [6, 7].

The topic of attitude and appearance in the service industry has already researched within the tourism literature, especially in hotel industry [9, 10], airlines industry [11]. But up to the time this research was conducted, there has not been a reported study about Aesthetic Labour in Travel Industry. There is also limited number of published researches about tourism in Indonesia especially in Bandung, West Java, Indonesia.

Bandung is the main gate of West Java which is included in three most visited provinces [12]. It is the fourth most popular destination in Indonesia [13]. Famous with Factory Outlet and also Unique Culinary, the number of tourist which comes to Bandung in 2012 was approximately 7 billion of people. In 2013, Bandung Tourism Board was targeting 8 million tourists to come to Bandung [14]. Tourism also become the biggest gross income sources of Bandung City Council [15]. In terms of Travel Agency business, there are also 153 travel agencies in Bandung [16].

Travel Agency is an intermediary between travellers and travelling suppliers. The impact of the development online booking has brought Travel Agency Industry to a business change. Moreover, there are a lot number of Travel Agencies in Bandung to make the competition harder. Travel Agencies have to make better services and both maintaining and enhancing relationship with their client in order to give more values. By giving more values, it is expected that travel agency industry will be able to survive.

To address the aforementioned, the process of delivering service will not be able to be separated with the human resources. This research addresses this lack of study and information in which hopefully can be a benefit to build foundation for further research about human resources in Tourism Industry in Indonesia especially in terms of aesthetics labour. For the industry perspective, this study is addresses to many managers, employer, or owner and also for tourism education to enhance the understanding about the importance of attitude and appearance and the emergence of aesthetic labour in Travel Agency Industry in Bandung. Moreover, this study also focused in the following specifics objective:

1. To explore aesthetic labour's concept as a framework in understanding the important of aesthetic labour
2. To investigate and critically analyse current thinking of the implementation of aesthetic labour especially how the aesthetic labour implementation on recruiting, selection, training, and service encounter stage.

3. To investigate and critically analyse the finding of the importance of aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry
4. To examine how important appearance and attitude as the element of aesthetic labour, what part of appearance and attitude are more or less important than other and why they are more important or less important
5. To conclude and make recommendation regarding aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agencies Industry

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. *The Fundamentals of Aesthetic Labour*

There are several studies focusing on number of facts regarding the interaction of employee and customer and also human capital such as sexuality at work, technical skill, behavioural routinisation and compliance, etc. However, Warhurst et.al finds out that there is one thing missing in the human capital debate which is aesthetic labour [6].

The terms aesthetic labour was first introduced by a group of scholars namely, Christ Warhurst, Dennis Nickson, Anne Witz, and Anne Marie Cullen [2]. They define Aesthetic Labour "As a supply of 'embodied capacities and attributes' possessed by workers at the point of entry into employment" [6]. This definition was developed by Sheane [7] who suggested "Aesthetic labour is the selling of one's embodied 'face' or approved social attributes, to create and preserve a professional and/or corporate image – often described as 'looking good and sounding right.'" Furthermore, Karlsson [17] stated that "...aesthetic labour means corporeal dispositions in people that the employers can commodified and exploit to their advantage when competing with other firms, and that these dispositions can be further trained and developed once the employee has been hired." Thus, Aesthetic Labour can be defined as supply of capacities, attributes and other corporeal dispositions which embodied within the employee at the entry point which resemble with the company image, can be sold by the company and also become company competitive advantage.

The study of Aesthetic Labour emphasized how capacities and attributes that are possessed by workers being mobilize, developed, and commodified by the industry through recruitment, selection and training process. The purpose of this is to transform those capacities and attributes into competencies and/or skills that aesthetically resemble with organisation's brand image and service encounter style. Therefore the aesthetic competencies and/or skills of the workforce become embodied and utilized by the industry. This embodied aesthetic competencies and/or skills often called as looking good and sounding right following Sheane [7] introduction of those terms. Clearly, then Aesthetic Labour only supply frontline employee since this aesthetic skills are consume only on direct interaction between frontline employee and the customer [6]. However it is important to consider that the digital, online age frontline employees also include call centre employees and on-line chat employees.

In its development, Aesthetic Labour is important in creating and preserving a professional and/or corporate image [7]. In line with Sheane's [7] statement, Chang and Tarn found that there are some efforts of "tangibilizing" services by exploiting corporate/company's image or other tangible cues to enhance a consumers' sense of tangibility. In other words, aesthetic labour is one way of making service more tangible through front liner's physical tangibility. Furthermore research in Hotels Industry in Taiwan regarding Service tangibilization found that consumers put physical representation as the most effective cue of tangibilization [9]. Further Research which is conducted in the area of Aesthetic Labour in Glasgow retail and hospitality labour market in 2004 explored the importance of aesthetic labour in employer's point of view. The results shows that in customer service works, people's social and aesthetic skills are preferable rather than technical skills. Moreover, employers suggested that choosing people with right personality was critical rather than qualifications, previous experience and right appearance [2].

B. Aesthetic Labour – The Critique

Warhurst et.al. [6] research aimed to explore aesthetic labour understanding and also analysing its importance within service sector. The findings suggest that organisations were introducing new selection criteria related with appearance and attitude in the process of pre entry, internal and external which emerge within the service industry. In some of the findings, this new criteria even become more important than other skill and knowledge. Indeed Warhurst et. al. [6] argued that the practice of aesthetic labour actually add value to diversity through the employment of people who didn't have any technical skills or knowledge and further that governments sensitive to this issue should and also understand the positive value of aesthetic skills. However, Warhurst et.al. stated that aesthetic skills and competencies should be treated carefully so it will not obviate other skills and competencies [6].

With Warhurst et.al.'s [6] concept, Witz et.al. [18] had researched the notions of the aesthetic of an organization, aesthetics in organization and aesthetics as an organization in a case study of Elba Hotels. This article proves that in the early study of aesthetic labour, there is a potential problem of discrimination through gender, embodied capacities and attributes. To support the Elba Hotel case study Warhurst and Nickson found evidence regarding lookism and discrimination based on employee's appearance in their research regarding employee in retail and hospitality industry's experience of aesthetic labour [19].

Biswas [5], who conducted research in hospitality industry in India discovered that since employers are seeking to find employee's appearance resemble with the company image, it creates discrimination based on appearance. Aesthetic differentiation becomes a new basis of discrimination.

This statement also strengthened by research which conducted by Williams and Connell [20]. They found out that employee are consent to work because they want to be associated with cool brand and they can get employee discount. However, the employees turnovers are high because they cannot rely on the job do their livelihoods and degrading

working conditions. Since they were expected to represents the company's image, they have to buy middle-class aesthetic things, and at the same time, their wages cannot afford that. It seems that the jobs are not for those who need the income to support themselves

Furthermore research which conducted by Nath within employees in offshored Indian Call Centers find out how they experience to modify their accent, name, and location in order to fulfil company's demand of "sounding right". They experience racial abuse which emotionally draining experience. All of those experience become stigma of nationality. It is argued that attempted aestheticization is one way of protecting the employee. However, employee still experience stress and humiliations which causing stress [21].

C. Appearance and Attitude

According to findings of research in Glasgow which was conducted by [6], there is a lot number of job advertising which asked photograph of the applicants to be enclosed in the application. Although this practice is strongly avoided by the employment service since it was considered as the source of discrimination, the practice still continues as a requirement of the company. Warhurst et al. [6] discovered there are several organizations looking for the right appearance and disposition and those things were often suggested to be more important than any technical skills. Word that were used in the recruitment process for women included pretty attractive looking, nice smile, nice teeth, neat hair and decent proportion. Criteria for men are neat appearance, clean shaven. All these words embodied capacities and attributes are exploited in order to match with the organization image which usually includes words such as exquisite, luxurious, etc [6].

A research of finding and examine experience of employee in retail and hospitality industry in UK regarding aesthetic labour was conducted by Warhurst and Nickson [19]. From survey and focus group data, it was revealed several findings which explore employee experience regarding recruitment and selections, image and the appearance, uniform and dress codes, skills and training. 89% employers see appearance as major factor in selecting employee. 86% of employee stated that they were required to follow certain dress code. Most employers and employee understand the importance of customer-facing staff image. It was found out that organizations also use uniforms and dress codes for employees as one of effort in refining corporate image. Aspects of personal appearance are as followed: standard appearance, dress codes, tidiness, personal, clothing style, jewelry, hair style and length, make up and/or personal grooming, and in several organizations, visible tattoos were forbidden. Respondents are aware that technical skills training were easier than soft skills training [19].

Flight Attendant also experience how they were required to have certain way of carrying shoulder bags, which side to drag the luggage on and how to walk. They also have to control their appearance; even acne will make flight attendant not allowed to fly. Employees also have to wear makeup, neat clothing, soft voice, and smile become commodity which exploited in order to achieved customer satisfaction and organizational image. The employee also experience customer

criticism and that make employees feel unconfident during the interactions. Employee also experience stress and have to struggle to make their appearances more resemble with the corporate image. They feel that they cannot be themselves in wearing uniform. During their time off work, they also have to spend their time and money to maintain their clothing and grooming. In case of flight attendant, they also have to be on diet in order to maintain their figures and also to fit with the uniform since the uniform have limited sizes. Pressure is not only from the organization/company and internal supervision but also come from peer monitoring, employee should try to be less attractive than their peer [22].

The findings of the research which conducted in Glasgow found out that several job advertisements in the Glasgow newspaper using key phrases to indicate type of people who was wished to employ. They put phrases such as well spoken, very well presented. Voice also consider as important especially in the financial services sector. Moreover within the customer – employee interaction, there is type of customer who likes certain type of language. Therefore the employee should present the same language and the fail of presenting the same language will resulting sanction and disciplinary action from the management. The criteria was also included certain type of body language are not allowed to present such as stand at 40 degrees near the entrance, stand with your arms crossed. The management said that all those things should be done since the employees are not only workers but they are the company's ambassadors [6].

Research also found out that organization try to standardized the service production are by routinization of behaviour and speech or finding people that resemble with the image of organization to naturally interact with the customer in a way that resemble with the organization image. They will have training to make over the appearance, gesture, mannerism and other things [18].

Findings of the research in offshored Indian call centres stated that the employees needed to adjust their accent referring to the address that appear in the screen, they also have to adjust their speaking speed adjusting with the customers' speed. This voice alteration had significant influence with their performance appraisal and their earnings. Vocal alteration are more complicated since there is a paradox, the more speech modification practiced, the more customer feels it was fake. Therefore at some point management demanding voice alteration, but at other point, the management don't want the agents to force it. All of this training have one purpose which is avoiding saying that they are actually Indian because there is stigma that Indians related with cheating and in line with the organizational tactic that mask their location. In order to create impression that the offices are somewhere in USA or other Western Europe, they also have to change their name into something that sounding like western names. They had to have accent training in order to neutralize their own speech patterns and adopting an American or British accent. Some of them should change the accent and the speed of their speech in order to fulfil the needs of sounding right. They also should masking their name (pseudonym) and location. Employer argue that pseudonym is used to protect their identity and for own

security. Masking location is proposed by employer due to the company requirement [21].

III. METHODOLOGY

This research will adopt phenomenological philosophies as well as inductive approach in order to explore what employee and employer in Bandung Travel Agencies Industry think about aesthetic labour phenomena, how they experience aesthetic labour within their daily live, and finding what is their point of view regarding this phenomena. The small respondents and also humanistic style that adopted by this philosophy makes it more suitable with this research. It is expected that this research will get interesting description of how much important is aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agencies Industry.

A. Research Questions

The main research questions is "how much important are aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agencies Industry". However, asking directly may result bias answer or probably create confusion within the respondent since aesthetic labour is new terminology that can't be understood by common people without prior explanation.

In order to get honest and clear answer, research questions were breakdown into 3 sections. The first explored implementation of aesthetic labour in the stage of recruitment and selection, second explored in training stage, third explored in service encounter. This approach is adopted from several studies regarding aesthetic labour [2, 19, 6].

The questions also explored the people feeling about aesthetic labour in those stages in order to find the importance of aesthetic labour in travel agencies industry in Bandung. This question adopted from several study regarding employee experience on aesthetic labour [19], and how aesthetic labour implemented in industry [22, 20, 23].

B. Sampling Method and Sample

Phenomenological paradigm usually has small samples to investigate in depth or over time [24]. Moreover, inductive approach is concerned with context, therefore, study of small sample of respondents more appropriate than large number [25]. Therefore, the respondent of this study was consisting of 6 people from 2 different companies. With small numbers of respondents, it was expected that the data will be comprehensive and in-depth.

Using purposive sampling method, this research try to explore the importance of aesthetic labour with deeper interview on small number of respondent. Respondent of this research came from two companies within Bandung Travel Agencies. One company represent national wide company which already has standards and also uniform. Another company represent small company which are new and do not have any standards uniform. From each company, there was 1 human resources manager or other person who is in charge in human resources decision making been interviewed in order to gain management perspective of the importance of appearance

and attitude. 2 employees from each company were interviewed also in order to get employee point of view regarding the importance of appearance and attitude. The chosen employees were front liners in their company. They usually deal directly with the customer by face to face or by phone.

C. Data Collecting

Data in this research was collected using depth interview method. In conducting interview, one-to-one interview applied in interviewing the managers. One to one interview is the most common form of semi-structured interviews because it is easy to arrange and control.

To test and refine aspects, a pilot study was conducted. Pilot study can gathered information from logistical topics (how long the interview will takes, what kind of venue will needed) to more substantive topics (what need to be ask, the possibility of reaction, etc.) [26]. Pilot study in this research was done by interviewing person who has same characteristics with the respondent and some adjustment of interview guidance has been done based on the results of the pilot studies.

During the interview, the name of the company and respondent still appeared, however, it was already stated in the consent form that the name of the company and the respondent will not appear in transcribe and also in the research paper. Instead of name, respondent code will appear in the transcribed interview.

D. Data Analysis

In analysing the data, this research was using content analysis. Content analysis is an approach of analysing qualitative data by emphasizing on the keywords, phrases, images, and others counting or enumeration before it can be compared objectively [26]. It can be argued that this type of analysis may cause potential decontextualized. However, this analysis are suitable for analysing data of this research since the data came from limited sources and the form are data of interview.

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

The findings will be divided into 4 themes, the first is recruitment stage, the second is selection stage, the third is training stage, and the fourth is service encounter stage. The chapter concludes with the notion that concluding and giving recommendation regarding aesthetic labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry.

A. Recruitment Stage

On recruitment stage the job vacancy was mostly spread out by word of mouth. There were no published job vacancy on the newspaper and other mass media. The information about the job vacancy spread out among community of people who previously worked or had internship or job training in the travel agency industry or within travel agency industry. Informality of recruitment and selection process within these findings also

similar with what happened in Glasgow where 65% of the employee finding a job through word of mouth [2, 6, 19].

Findings in Glasgow found that the process of selection was based on 'classic trio' which are CV, interviews and reference [19]. However in this research, all employees said that they were asked to produce a CV and enclosed Photograph. They also was being referenced by other person to fill the position, but only employee from the Big Company which have formal interview with the manager. On the Small Company the process are more informal. They were no process of formal interview. This means that the 'classic trio' only implemented on the Big Company while in the Small Company, only two from three items of recruitment was fulfilled.

On the manager's side, actually the managers admit that they already have the standard of requirement for certain job positions. From the Big Company, the manager said that actually there were 3 criteria regarding employee recruitment. First is knowledge about the position, second is appearance, and third is attitude. However when being asked regarding the formal requirement document, BM cannot show since there were no formal job requirements/job criteria of certain job position. The criteria was solely become special right of the manager.

At the small company, the manager relies on both of the standard evaluation and assessment was not informed formally in the job requirement. Regarding the job requirement. the manager also admitted that there were no formal qualifications.

Therefore there was potential discrimination since the decision maker was depending on the manager's point of view and manager's own standard. These findings were in line with the potential danger of discrimination that were stated before by [28, 5, 20].

Manager from Big Company stated that school has important role in shaping aesthetic skill of the students. Therefore he prefers to hire people from Tourism School which already have basic standard of attitude and appearance in Tourism Industry especially in the Travel Agency Industry. Therefore they do not have to give training or instructions regarding do and don'ts of service encounter. The statement in line with the results findings within CFLA members which stated that practitioners were rely on the educational programs as their main supplier of Human Resources [27].

The practice of enclosing a photograph within their CV was not common in Glasgow (Nickson et al., 2005). It can be suspected as an act against of law of Employment Service especially the law of Equal Employment Opportunity in some country [27]. However, in Indonesia, it is common practice that every CV will enclose minimum a passport photo.

It can be concluded that on both company, they doing informal recruitment by using word of mouth method. It also found that there were no formal job requirement although there were some standards which stated by the managers. However, since the standards of requirements are solely made by the manager and the practice of enclosing photograph in CV will create potential discrimination. The absence of formal job

requirement will also create difficulties on the next stage which are selection stage.

B. Selection Stage

According to the interview, on the small company, the image of the company had not stated formally however, both the manager and the employee already know that the company wants to create an image that the small company is different with other travel agency. Although there are no specific specifications on how they define what “different” means.

On the contrary the Big Company which was expected to have formal image unexpectedly didn't have any certain image requirements. This was also admitted with the manager. The manager was still focusing on how to create good image to maintain repeater customer. Attitude and the appearance of employee was expected solely to support that goals. However, it will be confusing for the employee to look good and sounds right while they don't know what kind of the image they have to represent. This means the implementation of good appearance and right attitude do not have firm base.

Both companies were trying to create good and unique image so they hope that their customer will impressed with the service and become repeater customer although the image was not clearly defined.

Regarding the dissemination of the image of the company, only the small company has already doing the dissemination through brainstorming between the employee and the manager. They regularly had informal meeting and talked about what the company wants to do and in which way. This was proved from the consistency of employee's opinions and views with the manager's opinions and view's regarding what kind of image did the company wants to create.

However, all respondents admitted that appearance and attitude has significant effect on creating the image and attract customer by creating good first impression and bonafidity of the customer also in terms of trying to maintain customer relations.

The absence of image makes the standard of attitude and appearance becomes blurred. Once again the criteria of the selection will solely depend on the managers who make the decision making. This practice have potential discrimination problem [19, 27].

Beside potential threat of discrimination problem, there were also problems regarding what the company expect the employee to do. Company needs training process in order to deliver the company expectation to employee [21].

C. Training Stage

In terms of Training, in Big Company there was once a training regarding service excellent. The subject were concentrating on telephone courtesy and grooming. The method of this training was sharing and discussion. The training was delivered by former Human Resources Manager in one leading national wide Travel Agency.

On contrary, in small company, there was no specific training regarding appearance and attitude. Same with the

previous company, small company depends so much on the supply of attitude and appearance which already possessed by the employee while they first joint with the company.

These findings were very opposite with findings which found by [21] regarding offshored Indian Call Centres employee where the training was very intensive and stressing. However, these statements shows us how the company really rely on the embodied capacities and attribute which possesses by the employee before they were recruited which in line with the employer expectations for entry level college graduates [28].

We can conclude that training in terms of attitude and appearance were not significantly done within Bandung travel agency industry, it seems like the need of the training of attitude and appearance already fulfil by the employee at the entry level, therefore there no need an intensive training. However, as the implications, the burden of preparing the aesthetic skills of the employee will depend on the education institution and the employee itself.

D. Service Encounter Stage

Regarding standard of appearance, only big Company which has a uniform. The manager stated that uniform is the most important one in creating good image for company. This statement in line with several respondents in retail industry in USA which feel very proud on working and using a uniform of certain brand [20]. However there were also findings stated that uniform and all standard of grooming create burden within the employee since it time consuming and needs money too [22].

In big company, there are no strict regulations regarding personal grooming and rules against jewelry, tattoos and scars. There are also no standard regarding personal aesthetic states and body weight. The company also allowed the employee to use religious attributes such as hijab, cross necklaces, etc. as long as it still match with the uniform,

In implementing attitude, there are no standard regarding tone, volume, and speed of voice. However, there are certain sentences which should be spoken every time they pick up the phone such as greetings, mention the name of the company and introduce themselves, after that they have to offering help or assistance.

There are no standard of how to smile however, there were general rule that oblige the employee to smile every time they have contact with the employee. There are also no exact standard regarding attitude and appearance and therefore the employee should try to explore and have self-awareness in trying to find what do and don'ts in the company.

In small company, up until the interview was held they didn't have any uniform. The manager said that they will be a uniform for the company. This matter already been discussed with the employees. They all stated that uniform was necessary, however, they also want to allow the employee to express themselves through appearance. They also want to adapt with local regulations what suggest all the citizens to wear sundanese traditional clothes every Wednesday, by having regulations on what to wear every day, the manager expected that the employee will not get bored with the uniform.

This condition was really opposite with conditions within Indian offshored call centre and also in hospitality industry which has many standards from tone of voice to accent [21]. The opposite condition also different with certain respondents who works in retail industry in USA which feel that the company make them very ridiculous with several absurd standard of greetings and body language [20].

From these findings, we can conclude that the standard of appearance and attitude within Bandung travel agency industry are not as harsh as other industry such as hotel and hospitality industry [6, 22], retail industry [20, 28], budget airlines [11], and also in call centre industry [21].

Regarding incentive, there were no direct incentive regarding appearance and attitude, all the respondent linked the appearance and attitude with customer satisfaction and building customer relationship. The absence of direct incentive regarding appearance and attitude was opposite with the findings in USA retail industry where the employee were given special discount to buy in house product to push the employee having standard appearance. This practice cause fetishism and mystification of commodities [20].

In line with Biswas [5] statement that performance appraisal, compensation, and benefit regarding appearance and attitude should dealt cautiously, findings within Bandung travel agency industry shows that no direct incentive and rewards were more suitable to be applied. Besides that, the implementation of direct rewards and incentives can cause will obviate other skills and competencies.

All respondents said that appearance and attitude were important in Travel Agency Industry. The reason were vary, from opinions that attitude and appearance were something that cannot be learned within years, It was possessed by the labour and shaped through years and difficult to change. Therefore it is important to recruit employee which has attitude and appearance which resemble with the company image.

One of the reasons why aesthetic labour was important stated by the respondent was in Service, the product were produce and consume simultaneously therefore, attitude and appearance are very important. Attitude and appearance are part of service which consumed by the customer. The other reason stated that technical skill can be obtained through training and other development programme. However, it was very hard to change someone's attitude since the attitude was results of habits from years.

Other stated that technical skill can be learned by learning the SOP however it was hard to learn about attitude and appearance since there were no standards and we have to develop attitude and appearance by ourselves and that is the process that not every person can do. Manager from big company which has a long experience in Travel Agency industry stated actually both aesthetic skill and technical skill were important, this finding was in line with the findings in Glasgow, USA, and Taiwan, [22, 10, 20].

Regarding which one is more important, attitude or appearance. All respondents stated that attitude was more important than appearance. Since it was hard to shape attitude, some of the respondent stated that it is true that the first

impressions of the employee in customer's eyes were stated from the employee appearance, however, it needs a good attitude to maintain customer.

After investigating and analysing the findings of the importance of Aesthetic Labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry, it can be found that there were similarities in the recruitment stage with other cases from current research regarding Aesthetic Labour. Most of them were using informal recruitment by using word of mouth method. In Selection stage, the findings were different with other cases. While in other cases the criteria of job requirement were very rigid, here in Bandung Travel Agency Industry, the criteria were not clearly stated. The decision of selection stage was solely depend on the managers. In this stage lies the potential danger of discriminations. On the training stage, there was only one training conducted in the Big Company and no training regarding Appearance and Attitude in the Small Company. In other cases, there were some case where the training is not clearly held but at some case, the training subject was very rigid. At the Service Encounter Stage, the differences become more solid. As the results of no job criteria over certain position, there were also no standard regarding how to look good and sounds right within service encounter. There was no direct incentive or rewards regarding appearance and attitude.

It was found that all the respondents said that appearance and attitude was important. Moreover all the respondents said that attitude were more important from appearance because it cannot be thought and trained or re-shaped.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECCOMENDATIONS

This research had explored aesthetic labour's concept as a framework in understanding the important the important of aesthetic labour, thus, investigated and analysed current thinking of the implementation of aesthetic labour within recruitment, selection, training, and service encounter stage. The results of this process were the interview guidance and also findings from current thinking which become base for the analysis process.

Through the process of investigating and analysing the findings of the importance of Aesthetic Labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry, it can be found several findings.

There were some similarities within the four stages with other current research regarding Aesthetic Labour. The process of recruitment and selection within Bandung Travel Agency were mostly informal by using word of mouth.

The job requirements were also unclear especially regarding the aesthetic skills required. The criteria regarding appearance were decided by the managers. This brings implications that all the decision of selection phase was solely the right of the manager. These conditions will create possibility of discrimination.

The process of training regarding appearance and attitude were very minimum. It can be argue that the minimum and lack of training were caused by the unclear job requirement criteria. Therefore, it will create confusions on what subject to be delivered if the training ever held.

The absence of training was occurred because the company relied on employee previous working experience and study. Company prefer to choose people which resemble with the company rather than re-shaped the attitude and appearance of the employee.

It was stated before that there were no formal job requirement criteria regarding attitude and appearance. In line with that situation, the standards of appearance and attitude within service encounter were not as strict as other industry. This condition can be the reason why the job requirement criteria were not clear and based only on manager's experience and point of view.

The absence of direct incentive and rewards regarding appearance and attitude were in line with the previous study which suggest careful treatment of incentive and rewards in order to avoid obviate of other skills, fetishism, and product mystification.

Attitude was seen as more important than appearance within Bandung Travel Agency Industry since it was harder to train and to be re-shaped.

After examining the findings, all respondents stated that appearance and attitude were important. Moreover all the respondents said that attitude were more important from appearance because it cannot be thought and trained or re-shaped.

From previous process, we can conclude that Aesthetic Labour was seen as an important supply of labour within Bandung Travel Agency Industry although the application on the recruitment, selection, training, and the service encounter were not as significant as other industries. Moreover, the respondents said that attitude is more important than appearance since it was harder to shape during the working period.

Through the entire process of research project, some points can be proposed. The recommendations will be divided into two sections, for academics purposes and for the industry.

Regarding the academics purposes, it can be argue that this research has some limitations. Since the respondents were very imited, the generalization cannot be made, therefore, there should be further study regarding the importance of Aesthetic Labour in other places in Indonesia and/or the world. Research within the same topic using different methods also suggested in order getting complete point of view. From this research we could find out differences regarding the implementations of Aesthetic Labour within other industries, therefore further studies regarding the implementation of Aesthetic Labour within other tourism industry it is strongly recommended. Since this study only covers the employee and manager's point of view, further study regarding Aesthetic Labour from the customer point of view was also recommended.

Regarding the industry, this further study hopefully can reveal the set of criteria regarding attitude and appearance therefore the company within Bandung travel agency industry. Thus, the criteria also can be subject for training and input for tourism education curricula. It is hoped that the awareness of aesthetic labour can be increased and the studies developed not

only within travel agency industry but also other tourism industry especially tourism industry in Indonesia.

REFERENCES

- [1] Pine, J. & Gilmore, J.H., "Welcome to the experience economy," in *Harvard Business Review*, pp.97 – 105, July - August 1998.
- [2] Nickson, D., Warhurst, C. & Dutton, E., "The importance of attitude and appearance in the service encounter in retail and hospitality," in *Managing Service Quality*, vol. 15, no. 2, pp.195-208, 2005.
- [3] Popescu, C. & Avram (Ratiu), D.M., "New trends in human resource management in the hospitality industry" in *International Conference of Scientific Paper*, Brasov, Valahia University, 2012.
- [4] Zeithaml, V.A. & Bitner, M.J., "Services Marketing," New York: McGraw-Hill, 2001.
- [5] Biswas, M., "Aesthetic labour in India : locating and maping the mind of the practitioners - an Application of chaid algorithm," in *Journal of Services Research*, vol. 9, no.2, pp.81-103, 2009.
- [6] Warhurst, C., Nickson, D., Witz, A. & Cullen, A.M., "Aesthetics labour in interactive service work : some case study evidence from the 'new' Glasgow," in *The Services Industries Journal*, No. 20, No. 3, pp.1-18, 2000.
- [7] Sheane, S.D., "Putting on a good face : an examination of the emotional and aesthetics roots of presentational labour," in *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, Vol. 33, No. 1, pp.145-58, 2011.
- [8] Quinn, B., "Aesthetic labor, rocky horrors, and the 007 dynamic," in *International Journal of Culture, Tourism, and Hospitality Research*, Vol. 2, No. 1, pp.77-85, 2008.
- [9] Chang, K.C. & Tam, D.D.C., "Does service tangibilization work in the hotel industry? An experimental investigation," in *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, vol. 13, no.4, pp.411 - 434, 2008.
- [10] Nickson, D., Warhurst, C. & Dutton, E., "Aesthetic labour and the policy-making agenda : time for a reappraisal of skills?," in *Glasgow: Scottish Center for Employment Research*, 2004.
- [11] Spiess, L. & Waring, P., "Aesthetic labour , cost minimisation, and the labour process in the Asia Pacific airline industry," in *Employee Relations*, Vol. 27, No. 2, pp.193-207, 2005.
- [12] Shreves, R., "The indonesian travel market : emerging from the shadows," *Sherman: PhoCusWright*, 2012.
- [13] Travel Buddy, -. "Popular Cities in Indonesia" [Online] Available at: <http://www.travbuddy.com/Indonesia-popular-cities-c84> [Accessed 6 April 2013].
- [14] Gandapumama, B., "Detik Bandung", 2013. [Online] Available at: http://news.detik.com/bandung/read/2013/01/01/154147/2130631/486/di_sparbud-bandung-targetkan-kunjungan-8-juta-wisatawan-di-2013 .Accessed : April.06, 2013.
- [15] S., A., "Bandung tourism gross income 176 Trillion Rupiahs," 2010. [Online] Available at: <http://www.antarajawabarat.com/lihat/cetak/29704> [Accessed 6 April 2013].
- [16] Pratama, S.J. et al., "Mapping of Travel Agency Industries member of ASITA West Java," Bandung: Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata Bandung, 2012.
- [17] Karlsson, J.C., "Looking good and sounding right : aesthetic labour," in *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, vol. 33, No. 1, pp.51 – 64, 2011.
- [18] Witz, A., Warhurst, C. & Nickson, D., "The labour of aesthetics and the aesthetics of organization," in *Organization Articles*, Vol. 10, No. 1, pp.33-54, 2003.
- [19] Warhurst, C. & Nickson, D., "Employee experience of aesthetic labour in retail and hospitality," in *Work, Employment, and Society*, Vol. 21, No. 1, pp.103 – 120, 2007.
- [20] Williams, C.L. & Connell, C., "Looking good and sounding right : aesthetic labor and social inequality in the retail industry," in *Work and Occupations*, Vol. 37, No. 3, pp.349-77, 2010.
- [21] Nath, V., "Aesthetic and emotional labour through stigma : national identity management and racial abuse in offshored Indian call centers," in *Work, Employment, and Society*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp.709 – 725, 2011.

- [22] Tsaor, S.-H. & Tang, W.H, “The burden of esthetic labor on front-line employees in hospitality industry,” in *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 35, pp.19-27, 2013.
- [23] Tao, H.L., “Attractive physical appearance vs good academic characteristics : which generates more earnings?” in *KYKLOS*, Vol. 61, No. 1, pp.114 – 133, 2008.
- [24] Brotherton, B., “Researching hospitality and tourism : a student guide, London: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2008.
- [25] Saunders, M., Lewis, P. & Thornhill , A.,” *Research methods for business students*,” 5th ed, Harlow: Pearson Education Limited, 2009.
- [26] Walliman, N., “*Research Methods : The Basics*”, 1st ed. Oxon: Routledge, 2011.
- [27] Warhurst, C. & Nickson, D., "Who's got the look? emotional, aesthetic and sexualised labour in interactive services,” in *Gender, Work, and Organization*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp.385 – 404, 2009.
- [28] Tesone, D.V. & Ricci, P., “Hospitality industry expectations of entry-level college graduates : a preference for attitude over aptitude,” in *European Journal of Business and Social Sciences*, Vol. 1, No. 6, pp.140 – 149, 2012.