

# Deliberation in Planning Development in the Village of Renak Dungun Subdistrict Pulau Merbau Regency Kepulauan Meranti Year 2014-2015

Muhammad Rafi  
University of Riau  
Pekanbaru, Riau  
Muhamad.rafi542@yahoo.com

Baskoro Wicaksono  
University of Riau  
Pekanbaru, Riau  
wicaksonobaskoro@gmail.com

Ishak  
University of Riau  
Pekanbaru, Riau

**Abstract-** The research was motivated by the village development planning which is a deliberative democratic processes and institutions in the village. But in actual experience various problems, such as attendance musrenbangdes dominated by the village government, and the proposed development of communities in rural development planning meetings were not accommodated and realized according to the wishes and expectations of society. This study aims to determine the deliberation of interest in rural development planning and deliberation impact on rural development. The method used in this research is method descriptive approach to qualitative research. Type of research data is primary data and secondary data. Data collection techniques in this study were interviews and documentation. Technical analysis of the data used is descriptive qualitative data analysis. The results of the research show that the deliberation of interest in rural development planning is still not going well. It can be seen from some of the data obtained from the Village, District, as well as the field data collected. The right solution to overcome these problems is the village government should encourage and increase community involvement in the process of deliberation on interest in the development plan of the village, and the village government should cooperate with existing institutions in villages to create a better deliberations.

**Keywords:** *deliberation, planning, and village development.*

## I. INTRODUCTION

The village plays an important role in national development. Not only because most of the people of Indonesia reside in the village, but the village contributes greatly in creating national stability.

According to Law No. 6 of 2014, Article 78 paragraph 1, Village development aims to improve the welfare of rural communities and the quality of human life and poverty alleviation through the fulfillment of basic needs, the development of village facilities and infrastructure, the development of local economic potential, and the utilization of natural resources and environment sustainably.

The Welfare of Villagers will occur if the Development can be done well. The success of the development is not escaped from the support and participation of the community, in this case it can be said that society has the most important position in the development process. For example in the provision of development proposals, development planning, development care, custody of development results and development evaluation.

In the Village Ministerial Regulation No. 2 of 2015, Article 23 Paragraph 1, Concerning the Code of Conduct and the Decision Making Mechanism of Village Deliberations, it is mentioned that the Village Deliberations are open to the public and are not confidential, every citizen of the Village is entitled to attend the Village Deliberative Meeting.

Village Deliberations are held with the intention to facilitate the involvement of various parties through the process of dialogue, discussing and formulating various problems faced related to needs, future and village development plans.

Through the "deliberative public space", in simpler language it is called "citizens' musyawarah" or it can be built to activate individuals as citizens to communicate and dialogue in a public space, whose results can influence public decision-making at the level of the political system.

As an institution and process of deliberative democracy in the village, the village development planning consultation (musrenbangdes) should be able to realize the proposal from the community. However, in reality the current proposal from the community in the deliberations of village development planning at the time musrenbangdes can not be accommodated and realized according to the wishes and expectations of the community. Based on the writer's observation in the field, Desa Dungun Renak has interesting problems to be studied in the Deliberations (Musrenbangdes).

In the 2014 Musrenbangdes, there were 38 people from over 70 people who were invited. While the attendance in Musrenbangdes in the next year which is 2015 only in attendance 30 people from 80 people who were invited. This means that community involvement in musrenbangdes decreases.

The following table lists the attendance of the community in musrenbangdes in 2014-2015.

**Table 1 List of Community Present in the village of Musrenbangdes Renak Dungun Year 2014-2015**

No	Year 2014		Year 2015	
	Classification	Amount	Classification	Amount
1.	District Government	2	District Government	-
2.	Village government	11	Village government	9
3.	Village Institution	18	Village Institution	12
4.	Public figure	3	Public figure	2
5.	Youth Leader	1	Youth Leader	1
6.	Religious leaders	1	Religious leaders	1
7.	Women's Groups	2	Women's Groups	5
<b>Amount</b>		<b>38</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>30</b>

Source: Village Office Renak Dungun

In the explanation above table can be seen the number of attendees in 2014 as many as 38 people from 80 people invited, while in 2015 that attended as many as 30 people from 80 people invited, then if calculated the percentage of attendance in 2014 that present approximately 48 %, While in 2015 that present approximately 38%. One of the problems seen in this table is that the attendance of musrenbangdes participants is dominated by the village government and village institutions. But the lack of involvement of the elements of society that have the interests of actual development.

In addition, Renak Dungun Village also has other problems that result from musrenbangdes that can not accommodate the wishes and expectations of the community. In musrenbangdes 2014 there are 77 proposals of the community generated, but only 4 proposed development that can be realized in 2015. as well as in musrenbangdes 2015 there are 82 proposals coming in.

However, only 4 development proposals can be realized by 2016. As shown in the following table :

**Table 2 Proposed Community Development in the village of Musrenbangdes Renak Dungun Year 2014-2015**

No	Year 2014		Year 2015	
	Proposed Field	Amount	Proposed Field	Amount
1	Physical	13	Physical	11
2	Transportation	8	Transportation	9
3	Socio-cultural	19	Socio-cultural	18
4	Health	4	Health	9
5	Community Economics	19	Community Economics	21
6	Housing and settlements	2	Housing and settlements	2
7	Youth and Sports	2	Youth and Sports	2
8	Social	2	Social	2
9	Culture	4	Culture	4
10	Place of worship	4	Place of worship	4
<b>Amount</b>		<b>77</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>82</b>

Source: Village Office Renak Dungun

In the explanation above table can be seen there are 77 proposals of development of the community who entered the process of musrenbangdes 2014, while the next year there are 82 proposals of development from the community who entered the process musrenbangdes2015.

The next phenomenon that occurs is the number of proposed development that is generated, not accompanied by an increase in the realization of village development. Here is the realization of the development of renak dungun village.

**Table 3 Realization Village Development of Renak DungunYear 2015**

No	Year 2015	
	Realization	Budget
1.	Development Puskesmas	Rp. 245.290.000
2.	Semenisation JL. Duata	Rp. 55.854.500
3.	Semenisation JL. Kandes	Rp. 67.340.000
4.	Semenisation JL.PulauBesar	Rp.1,900.754.000
<b>Total</b>		<b>Rp.2.269.229.500</b>

Source: Village Office Renak Dungun

In the explanation above table can be seen the realization of the development of the village renakdungun in 2015 if calculated percentage of realization of village development approximately About 5%.

**Table 4 Realization Village Development of Renak Dungun Year 2016**

No	Year 2016	
	Realization	Budget
1.	Semenisation Jl. P. kamal	Rp. 450.000.000
2.	Semenisation Jl. Pinang	Rp. 250.000.000
3.	Semenisation Jl. Sumbur	Rp. 300.000.000
4.	Semenisation Jl. Sekunyit	Rp. 50.000.000
	Total	Rp. 1.050.000.000

Source: Village Office Renak Dungun

In 2016 the percentage of realization of village development is also the same that is approximately 5%. By looking at it, it can be said that the deliberation of the village development has not been going well, it means that the proposed development of the community in the village musrenbangdesrenakdunguncan not be accommodated according to the wishes and expectations of the community.

Based on the phenomena contained above, the authors are interested in conducting research by title :*Deliberation In Planning Development In The Village Of Renak Dungun Subdistrict Pulau Merbau Regency Kepulauan Meranti Year 2014-2015.*

#### A. Formulation of the problem

Based on the phenomenon that has been mentioned, then the main issues in this study are: Community Attendance in Musrenbangdes decreased and Proposed community on Musrenbangdes not Accommodated. From the main problem can be described specific questions as follows:

*How does the deliberation process of interest in the planning of village development Renak Dungun Subdistrict Pulau Merbau Regency Kepulauan meranti in year 2014-2015 ?*

#### B. Theoretical framework

##### a. Theory of Village Development Planning

Village development planning is intended to overcome the problems faced through efforts to develop the potential that is owned, in order to realize the interests of local community groups. Village development planning has actually become a routine agenda that must be implemented by the Village Government every tahunnya. Secara goal of the village planning according to Wahjudin Sumpeno is as The following:

1. Improving community institutional capacity at village level in formulating participatory development planning.

2. Increasing the involvement of all elements of society in providing meaning in development planning.
3. Improve development transparency and accountability.
4. Generate cross-sectoral and institutional alignment within the same framework.

Musrenbangdes has two main approaches, namely activities to discuss ceiling-aligned programs to be funded by the Village Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBDes) and determine the activities financed through sectoral and financial aid mechanisme.

##### b. Theory of Deliberation

According to F.Budi Hardiman in his book *Deliberative Democracy*, Deliberative Democratic Theory is a view of how to enable individuals in society as citizens to communicate, so that communication at the citizen level affects public decision-making at the level of the political system. In a more formal sense the deliberation contains the argumentative, informational, reflective aspect which means that the preferences, Odecisions, and views which are considered fixed in the aggregative models are considered to be volatile in deliberation. Therefore, Authenticity is a major concern, the democratic control within The ideal meaning must be substantive, not symbolic, including voluntary communication among competent participants.

The theory of deliberative democracy does not advocate a revolution, but rather a reform of the rule of law by launching public discourse activities in various socio-political-cultural fields to enhance the democratic participation of citizens. In deliberative democracies, majority decisions can be controlled through people's sovereignty. Communities can criticize decisions made by mandate holders. If people have dared to criticize government policies, then indirectly they have become rational societies, no longer irrational communities. Public publicOr aspirations serve to control formal politics or political policies. If there is no courage to criticize political policy, then society is subject to obedience to the system.

## II. RESEARCH METHODS

Researchers use a qualitative approach. Qualitative research is intended as a type of research whose findings are not obtained through statistical procedures or other forms of calculation. (Anselm Strauss & Juliet Corbin, 2003).

#### A. Research Sites

This research was conducted in Regency Kepulauan Meranti. While the object of this research is Government In The Village Of Renak Dungun Subdistrict Pulau Merbau Regency Kepulauan Meranti Year 2014-2015.

#### B. Data Type

##### a. Primary data

Primary data is a source of information that can be obtained from direct sources or information from people who are in the field. In this case the author looks for research data to Government Village Of Renak Dungun, Government Subdistrict Pulau Merbau, And Village Institutions.

#### *b. Secondary Data*

Secondary data is information which obtained from other parties outside the location or object of research. These data sources can be obtained through internal data on research objects such as documents, files that are relevant in answering research problems. Then the external data derived from literature study by searching data through books, journals, papers, internet media and so on.

#### *C. Data Source*

Sources of research data is obtained from:

##### *a. Informant research*

They are District Government Pulau Merbau, Village Government Renak Dungun, Village Institutions Renak Dungun, and People Leader Village of Renak Dungun.

##### *b. Supporting documents and reports*

Those are reports such as District Government Pulau Merbau, Public Figure Village Renak Dungun, And Women's Groups Village Renak Dungun.

#### *D. Data collection techniques*

Data collection techniques are closely related to the research methods used. The instruments in collecting these data are :

##### *a. Documentation*

It is the technique of collecting data through the documents that exist on the location of research and outside research. These documentation materials are reports that are relevant to the research problems of the relevant agencies.

##### *b. Interview*

To obtain information from informants required in-depth interviews using *purposive sampling* interview techniques means interviews of selected people based on the author's knowledge of people who know more about research problems.

### III. RESULT OF RESEARCH AND DISCUSSION

#### REFERENCES

Deliberation Process of Interest in Village Development Planning of Renak Dungun

#### 1. Process in the village development planning consultation of Renak Dungun

Renak Dungun village is a village that has the largest area in the District Pulau merbau, in addition to the village renak dungun is the main village of sub-district pulau merbau. So this becomes a challenge for the Village Government to

carry out village development planning that upholds the principle of democracy and community participation.

The large area and burden of the village as the mother village, demand the Village Government to organize the development based on the aspirations of the community, not the local elite agreement alone.

However, geographical conditions with the largest area of district pulau merbau raises a separate problem in the implementation of village development planning in the village of renakdungun. The village of RenakDungun, has a homogeneous character of society, where the dominant or whole society consists of people who have the same ethnicity / race, language, and cultural traditions. A challenge, of course, for the village government dengun renewal to be able to create deliberation that puts the individual activeness in a community so that communication that occurs in a village development planning forum can influence public decisions. One of the tasks of the village administration is to prepare a development plan to be implemented in its area, whether physical development or non-physical community development. Village development planning is discussed in a forum which involves all elements of community leaders or community organizations and implemented in an open and participative way.

The forum discussing the planned development of the village is better known as the village development planning consultation or it may be called Musrenbangdes, which is one of the deliberations of deliberation in the village. The village development planning is basically a bottom-up village development planning mechanism (Bottom up) involving all stakeholders at the village level to discover and recognize external problems, potential, needs, or challenges.

Based on the results of observations and research that has been done by the author, overall, the process of musrenbangdes village renakdungundistrict pulau merbau is as follows:

1. Starting from the circular and schedule of musrenbangdes from sub-district of merbau island spread to each village asmerbau island sub-district.
2. After the circular letter, the Village Government of Renak Dungun informs the Head of Dusun / RW Chairman and the Head of RT about the Musrenbangdes, it is expected that each Head of Dusun / RW and RT propose activities in accordance with the needs in each region.
3. Each RT holds a community meeting about the proposed activities to be proposed, and coordinated by the Chairman of the RW and Head of Dusun.
4. The media used to socialize the implementation of Musrenbangdes only through the media of invitation only without public announcement to the public so that the public widely know about will heldMusrenbangdes.

From the process in village development planning mechanism, proposals from the RT level that are accommodated at the RW level only generate suggestions that

have not had directives and are just memorable as administrative complement only, it is related to:

1. Unclear activities will be carried out at the RT, RW and Village levels.
2. Not yet known the amount and cost of the cost that will be used whether the village self-help or the cost of the District / District level.
3. Proposals from RT levels prior to entering the Musrenbangdes process are RW decisions whose priority scale is highly dependent on RW, so it can be said that it has not yet accommodated the aspirations of the community as a whole.

So to get closer to the planning aspirations of the community, one of the efforts to be taken is to provide clarity about the programs to be implemented, so that people really understand what to do, the amount of funds to be used and the source of financing to be used. Furthermore, the process of preparation of musrenbangdes in the village renakdungun begins with the dissemination of invitations to participants and speakers musrenbangdes. The invited musrenbangdes participants are as follows:

Table 5 Participants invited in Village development planning of Renak Dungun Year 2014-2015

No	Year 2014		Year 2015	
	Clasification	Amount	Clasification	Amount
1.	District Government	3 Person	District Government	3 Person
2.	Village government	25 Person	Village government	25 Person
3.	Village Institution	25 Person	Village Institution	25 Person
4.	Public figure	3 Person	Public figure	3 Person
5.	Religious leaders	3 Person	Religious leaders	3 Person
6.	Education Leadet	3 Person	Education Leadet	3 Person
7.	Youth Leader	3 Person	Youth Leader	3 Person
8.	Women's Groups	15 Person	Women's Groups	15 Person
	Amount	80 Person	Amount	80 Person

Source: *Processed Data 2017*

From the table above can be seen that the number of participants who invited musrenbangdes still dominated by formal actors amounted to 53 people, while informal actors only amounted to 27 people. This indicates that the village government has not tried to increase the role of informal actors, because participants are invited musrenbangdes still Dominated by the elites in the village.

The impact of this is in preparing the process of the way musrenbangdes, village government dungun just to handle and

coordinate itself each stage and the necessary needs in the course of musrenbangdes in the village renakdungun.

2. The Actor/Person Involved Invillage development planning consultation of Renak Dungun

Actors/figures involved in village development planning of renakdungun have some classification of formal actors and informal actors. Formal actors can be understood as actors who have official power, while the informal actors are actors who have an influential reputation in the region.

Actors / figures who are involved in the village musrenbangdesrenakdungun still dominated by the formal actors in the village. Musrenbang forum that should be a deliberative forum to bring a program that pro-society finally very impressed formalities only.

The involvement of actors / figures in the village musrenbangdes of renakdungun decreased from year to year and also there are weaknesses in the implementation. The weaknesses are seen from the lack of involvement of various elements of the community (Stakeholders) at the village level in the preparation of musrenbangdes.

3. Interest in village development planning consultation of Renak Dungun

Everyone has an interest, but not all interests have a significant impact on politics. In larger polytic societies of face-to-face communities, interests must be set to be effective. And once the organized group as a whole reaches a certain density in the relevant political space, they have a significant impact on the domain of political fidelity.

In the context of this research, internal interest of village development planning consultation Can be seen from the actors / figures present in the Musrenbangdes. Each bringing its importance to the village government in the hope that these interests can be realized. This is expected to of course affect the final outcome of the list of development priorities generated.

The actors involved and who bring the proposals of this society hope that what they propose this will be realized by the village government as expected by the community. From year to year stakeholders (Stakeholders) bring almost the same interests but more increased when compared to the previous year. Proposed village development from the community submitted by the actors / figures involved Much refers to previous RPJMDes. Seen from the type and form of the proposals generated It is clear that the proposed village development activities Has a similarity and uniformity from year to year.

4. Process of deliberation of interest in village development planning consultation Renak Dungun

Based on research that has been done by researchers, in the deliberation process of interest / consensus of this interest obtained a research result that the deliberation of interests Only compiled by some elite in the village. Therefore rural development should be seen not only as an object but also as a subject of development. In this sense, it is society that should

carry out development and enjoy the results of that development.

In the delivery of articulation and aggregation of interests the committee will divide the participants into groups according to the areas of development that will be discussed. In this group discussion, participants are expected to participate more actively in the delivery of ideas or opinions about village development planning. Community involvement in this process can provide an opportunity for people to influence policy from the very beginning of the policy formulation process. However, the authority of the community to determine the development that will be realized is still not great, because the dominant figure remains on the side of the village government in determining the approved development.

Community participation in this process can not be higher than the consultation level, because the rest of the authorities are in the power of the village government. These authorities include the determination of approved proposals and the priority of village development as well as the determination of representatives who will follow deliberations of district. The level of partnership or even the delegation can not be realized by the village government officials. This is indicated by the village government does not or has not cooperated with local organizations and community organizations in the implementation of village development planning.

One problem faced by the village government is due to the non-functioning of the institution in the village renak dungun in particular Institute for Village Community Empowerment. This research found several weaknesses in the deliberation process of interest :

First, on the side of the mechanism: The participatory planning process through Village development planning deliberations mechanism is still a rhetoric, since the most dominant formal actors in formulating the village development planning are the village government.

Secondly, on the process side: process only contains activities in the form of exposure from the village head and its equipment. Participants were only given the opportunity to inquire about these activities, there was no discussion and negotiation (dialog) between the village government and the participants on issues or problems and problem solving.

Third, Program Content / Quality: The quality of Village development planning deliberations results is low and less systematic. Contains only the recapitulation, which contains the activities and funds needed. In terms of objectives, ways to realize activities and time in detail are not explained.

Fourth, Stakeholders: Stakeholders Not fully represented in the village development planning meeting. Because only followed by Stakeholders.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

##### a. Conclusion

Based on the Results and Discussion that has been described above can be concluded that: Deliberation Process of Interest in Village Development Planning Renak Dungun Still has not run well and is still symbolic and not substantive to the

needs of the village community. Deliberation process of village development planning Still impressed formality and has no clear direction / objectives, actors / figures involved, Still dominated by Formal Actors and minimal involvement of informal actors, the interests brought to show more uniformity, and Deliberation Process of Interests has not yet described the needs of the village community.

##### b. Suggestion

To Create Better Deliberation of Village Development Planning, then there are some suggestions that may need to be considered :

1. For the District Government it is advisable to be more responsive and responsive in responding to the elements of interest brought by the village government. These elements of interest can be realized and accommodated in order to have a significant impact on village development. For the Village Government.
2. For the Village Government it is advisable to re-activate the village institutions that have vacuum so that the participation level of the partnership can be implemented in musrenbangdes.selanjutnya. The village government in the future should also involve more community elements in the village. And the Village Government Suggested for the future can do Negotiation / Lobby Better interest to the district government. For Village Community Elements.
3. For Elements of Villages it is suggested to re-control the performance of the village government, more actively in delivering the aggregation / articulation of interests brought, so that the interests that are the needs of the community can be realized and certainly can affect a policy making on the village development planning.

#### REFERENCES

- (1) Adisasmita, Rahardjo. 2006. *Rural and Urban Development*. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.
- (2) Hardiman, Budi. 2009. *Deliberative Democracy Considering State Law and Public Space In Habermas's Theory of Discourse*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- (3) Kessa, Wahyudin. 2015. *Village Development Planning*. Jakarta: Ministry of Village.
- (4) Moran, Michael. 2015. *Handbook of Public Policy*. Bandung: ISBN.
- (5) Umes Qoroni, Akhmad. Tesis Magister Teknik Pembangunan Universitas Diponegoro 2005. Musrenbangdes Effectiveness In Infrastructure Development Planning Based On The Situation And Potential Of Region In Tegal Regency.
- (6) Recapitulation of Results Deliberation of village development planning Renak Dungun District Pulau Merbau Regency Kepulauan Meranti Year 2014-2015.
- (7) Law Number 6 Year 2014 About the Village.
- (8) Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 116 Year 2014 About Guidelines for Village Development.