

Investigating the True Meaning of Car Free Day for Indonesian People

Fajar S. A. Prabowo, Arif Partono Prasetyo

Management
Telkom University
Bandung, Indonesia
fajarmotekar@gmail.com

Ikeu Kania, Abdullah Ramdhani, Diena Siti Hanifah

Public Administration
Universitas Garut
Garut, Indonesia

Dini Turipanam Alamanda

Management
Universitas Garut
Garut, Indonesia

Abstract—Car Free Day (CFD) programs are widely adopted in Indonesia with the concept of a free day driving with the aim of reducing motor vehicle pollution. CFD is increasingly in demand by the public because it raises various activities. The purpose of this research is to explore the factors that drive society to come to Car Free Day in Indonesia. This research is a type of qualitative research and explorative. Data was collected for 3 months by observing, interviewing, and distributing questionnaires to 400 respondents. The data was then analyzed using exploratory factor analysis (EFA) with the help of SPSS analysis tools. From 10 factors that produced by interviews with a number of key persons, the results showed that the factors were reduced to five namely culinary factor, refreshing factor, expression factor, family tourism factor and business factor. Judging from the Eigen-value, culinary factor is the most dominant factor in encouraging Indonesian people to come to Car Free Day. The results of this study indicate that car free day in Indonesia, provides more benefits in the form of community happiness, but it does not significantly impact to the improvement of environment as its original purpose.

Keywords—community happiness; car free day; exploratory factor analysis

I. INTRODUCTION

Some people might think that the possession of motor vehicles indicates individual wealth and even desirable economic growth. In 2016, the annual growth of motor vehicle in Indonesia has reached 8,19 percent [1]. Indonesian motor vehicles are dominated by motorcycle with 105,2 million units and followed by passenger car with 14,6 million units in 2016. If that number compared with projected Indonesian population that are economically active for 2015, the ratio of people-to-motorcycle would be around 2,43. It can be interpreted that roughly 1 out of 2 people in Indonesia own a motorcycle. For passenger car, the ratio is approximately 17,5. As widely known, the rapid growth of vehicles ownership does not come without consequences. Indeed, the problem does not lie on

vehicle ownership per se. More problems lie on vehicles usage rate. Nonetheless, there is a strong correlation between the number of vehicle ownership and vehicle usage rate [2]. As a matter of fact, the usage rate of vehicles in Non-OECD nations – including developing nations such as Indonesia – is already exceed those in OECD nations and will continue to rise [2]. One major concern with increased vehicle usage rate is related to the sustainability of healthy living and environment. According to Centre of Sustainability in 2004, sustainability is simply defined as, “...the capacity for continuance into the long-term future [3]. This concern has also been adopted by MOST (Moving on Sustainable Transportation) in 1999 that suggests any policy that involve transportation should also take economic, social, and environmental considerations into account [3]. It is argued that beyond certain level, increased vehicle usage rate causes more harm than the opposite including traffic congestions (economic), inequity and health impact (social), and water and air pollution (environmental) [3]. As part of the solution, CFD is offered by municipal government in several cities in Indonesia. Some of the cities that are regarded as unsuccessful in implementing CFD are including Jakarta, Bandung, and Garut. However, at the contrary, a successful implementation of CFD is found in Malang.

Based on observation conducted in this study, regardless of the deviation from its original intention, CFD in Indonesia is still crowded by visitors. They don't seem to be bothered by behavioral violations that take place in CFD. This phenomenon rises a question about the true meanings of CFD for the citizens of Indonesian. It can be predicted with ease, that the CFDs in Indonesia might bring different meanings to its citizens. Moreover, an evidence found that CFD is not effective in lowering the nitrogen oxide (NOx) that could cause seizure, difficulty in breathing, and even death [4]. However, the lack of knowledge about the motivational factors which underlie the visitation to CFD would make it difficult for policy maker to formulate further policy to shape people's behaviors into a

more desirable pattern. At the other hand, there are little clues that can be obtained from past studies to explain the motivation to visit CFD among Indonesian people. One similar study found that the motivation of Indonesian people to visit CFD in Jakarta is to do recreational sports that can be defined as any pleasurable physical activities that produce positive benefits [5]. Another study found factors that positively affect the intention of Indonesian people to visit CFD are including utility of CFD (i.e. the reduction of CO emissions and distance travelled by car), attitude towards CFD, and socio-economic status (income, age, and family size) [6]. The lack of investigations on the motivation of Indonesian people to visit CFD represent a gap to be filled and thus define the original contribution of this study. Furthermore, the purpose of this study is to explore the true meaning of CFD for Indonesian people, thus the benefits of CFD for the society can be further defined and measured.

A. Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) and Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB)

There are few social psychological theories that can be used to explained the factors that motivate the actual usage of CFD in Indonesia. To mention a few are the theory of reasoned action (TRA) and the theory of planned behavior (TPB). Both of them are developed to predict behavior by investigating its intention [7]. As implied by Ajzen [7], intentions are assumed to capture the motivational factors that influence a behavior. Both TRA and TPB posit that behaviour is preceded by behavioural intention as its antecedent. Furthermore, behavioural intention is influenced by attitude toward that behaviour and subjective norm [8]. Attitude represents perceived social support received by a person in performing the behaviour meanwhile subjective norm represents one's beliefs about the favourability of the outcome of that behaviour [8]. The TRA is then further extended by TPB that support an argument that behavioural intention and actual behaviour are influenced by perceived ability – including skills, opportunities, and resources – of an individual to actually perform that behaviour [7].

Both of the theories, TRA and TPB, are still lack of explanatory power regarding behavioural violation as found in Indonesia's CFD. Fortunately, a preliminary investigation of Chang [9] found that TPB as able to provide a more accurate prediction of moral behaviour including unethical behaviour. In this study, perceived behaviour control is found as the most important predictor of unethical behaviour [9]. Applying these findings in the case of behavioural violation in Indonesia's CFD means that the visitors possess sufficient skills, opportunities, and resources to do that violation. It also means that the behavioural violation provides desirable outcomes to the wrongdoers either it is the street merchants and the visitors (attitude) and, more interestingly, received social support from its surroundings (subjective norms). Again, these notions only add more importance to the endeavour to find the true meanings of CFD for Indonesian citizens.

B. The Purpose of Car Free Day

The original purpose of car CFD is to promote citizens' awareness toward natural environment and healthy lifestyle

[10]. According to de Marco, it is a day that is dedicated for families to do activities that are difficult to be done in weekdays [10]. Referring to past studies, there are several purposes that originally served by CFD including to reduce air pollution [11], to reduce noise pollution [11], to promote mental and physical health [11-12], and to increase social interactions [11-12], and to provide space for public recreation [12]. Invers [13] argues that CFD is a medium to build a better city because it helps the society to realize how valuable life can be without traffic. CFD also perceived as providing opportunities to re-evaluate city plan and travel patterns [14]. CFD also provide a place for communities to do social activities (socializing) [15]. Indirectly, CFD also meant to promote healthy lifestyle through sports and recreation [15].

As found in several cases, CFD is also associated with shopping activities and trading place such as in Porto Alegre [15]. In another case, as found in Shenzhen of China, CFD serve as a tool to preserve the sustainability of natural environment [15]. CFD also serves as an event to promote cultural and religious growth as implemented in Israel [15]. In Bogota, CFD is used as a mechanism to strengthen social equality [15]. Meanwhile in Paris, CFD promotes tourism and quality of life [15]. Hence, CFD can have multiple purposes that may gain benefits from each other. In Indonesia, only a few investigations are conducted on CFD in various cities. For example, Anwar investigates visitors' perception about CFD and common activities that take place in CFD [16]. Furthermore, Anwar found that people in Surabaya show positive acceptance toward CFD [16]. In Bandung, Arfianto investigate the relationship between community motives and recreational sport activities [17]. Prasetyo also discuss CFD as a means of spatial transformation in Bandung [18]. Priyono also investigate about the use of CFD as public place for recreational sport activities. However sizeable amount of unsuccessful cases of CFD in Indonesia are found. It can be easily synthesized that the actual usage of CFDs in Indonesia are not consistent with its initial purpose. Several facts about behavioural violations are found in CFDs as presented in the following sections [19].

C. The Implimentation of CFD in Jakarta

To relief its citizens from air pollution, provincial government of Jakarta stipulates a provincial regulation number 2 of 2005 regarding the air pollution control with CFD as one of its programs [20,21]. The implementation of this regulation is governed by Governor Decree number 12 of 2016 that clearly stated the type of activities that can be accommodated by CFD including natural environment, sport, and culture and art [22]. Although the CFD Committee is permitted to provide some space for street merchants, street merchant is held accountable about the cleanliness of that space. Surprisingly, CFD in Jakarta was once used to hold a political campaign [23] that already prohibited by Governor Decree number 12 in 2012. In his retrospect, Alfred Sitorus – an initiator of CFD in Jakarta – admit that CFD already successful to decrease the level of air pollution in Jakarta by 60 percent [24]. However, CFD is still failed to shift the lifestyle that heavily relies on motor vehicles and also incurs garbage problems [24]. Similar problems also emerge in Bandung.

D. The Implementation of CFD in Bandung

In 2011, the Municipal Government of Bandung turn to car free day (CFD) as the means to reduce the negative effects of high car traffic density. This decision can be found on Mayor's Decree of 551/Kep.449-Dishub/2011 [25]. As implied by Didi Ruswandi, as The Head of Transportation Department of Bandung City, the reduction of air pollution is the main reason behind the stipulation of car free day (CFD) in Bandung [26] as enforced by the revised decree of Bandung Mayor on CFD (551/Kep.1017-Dishub/2015) [25]. According to Mayor's Decree, the activities that are allowed in CFD are sport-related activities including jogging and gymnastic. In addition to motor vehicles, all street merchants and traditional transportation mode such as rickshaws are prohibited to enter the area of CFD [25]. Unfortunately, the reality has showed the opposite. In the middle of May 2018, The Municipal Government of Bandung stated that the purpose and functions of CFD in Bandung will be evaluated and reviewed as it deemed to be failed [27].

E. The Implementation of CFD in Garut

The implementation of CFD also received a lot of criticism. Although transportation statistics and local government regulation to govern the implementation of CFD are difficult to be found, Garut Express [28] stated that the initial purpose of CFD in Garut is to reduce the level of air pollution. In reality, CFD is flooded by street merchant that mostly sell clothes and culinary [28]. This situation makes it difficult for Garut citizens to exercise or even to ride a bicycle [29]. As admitted by The Head of Natural Environment, Sanitary, and City Park Agency of Garut, CFD also plague by garbage in addition to street merchants [30].

F. The Implementation of CFD in Malang

The opposite case of CFD is found in Malang. As a city that is only populated by 856.410 people in 2016, Malang regarded as a city that is able to successfully implement CFD [31]. The implementation of CFD in Malang is reinforced by Mayor's Decree number 1 in 2011 [31]. The purpose of CFD in Malang, that is hold on Ijen Street at Sunday morning, is to provide an open public space for recreation and sports [32]. CFD in Malang also served as a meeting place for communities and hobbyist [32]. Students also take advantage of CFD to promote their aspiration and programs [32]. Other activities that are also commonly found in CFD are musical performance, talk show, and seminar [32].

II. RESEARCH METHODS

This research used quantitative design that characterized by explorative nature. This method is chosen in order to answer two primary questions, namely:

- What are the factors that motivate Indonesian people to visit CFD?
- How is the level of influence of each factor found in motivating Indonesian people to visit CFD in rank-ordered fashion?

Before the survey is conducted, preliminary interview is conducted to carefully selected informants that yields 10 factors that serve as the references of the next phase. To represent these 10 factors, 22 indicators are developed and become the items of questionnaire. By using purposive sampling method, the questionnaires are distributed sequentially to 400 respondents in April 2018. The questionnaires are distributed in various CFD in Jakarta, Bandung, Garut, and Malang. Data collected from the survey are analyzed by using exploratory factor analysis (EFA) with the help of a statistical software.

The study found that the respondents are dominated by women by 70 percent. Based on location, the sample size is distributed evenly among Jakarta, Bandung, Garut, and Malang. Most respondents also came from 17 to 25 age group (40 percent) and 26 to 40 years age group (41 percent). Interestingly, half of the respondents (50 percent) admitted that they spent between IDR 25K to 100K in CFD. Only 20 percent spent more than IDR 100K. Based on frequency of visit, most respondents visit CFD for 2 to 5 times (35 percent). At its extreme, some respondents (15 percent) visit CFD for only once and others visit CFD for more than 10 times (20 percent).

The steps involved in this research adhere to the sequence of EFA as follows:

- Phase 1: checking empirical relationship between variables by using several tests that are simple correlation, measure of sampling adequacy (MSA), Keisher-Meyers-Oklin (KMO), and Bartlett Test of Sphericity.
- Phase 2: the phase of factor extraction, that is, a process of factors formation by using Eigen value as the criteria of selection. Factors with characteristics root more than 1 are considered as significant.
- Phase 3: the phase of factor rotation by using varimax rotation to maximize the variance of the squared loadings of a factor on all variables.
- Phase 4: the phase of interpreting the factors based on factor loading of a variable toward its factor.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

From 22 indicators that are investigated, through the process of factoring can be reduced into 5 (five) factors (see Table 1).

TABLE 1. EMERGING FACTORS, INDICATORS, AND LOADING FACTOR

No	Factor	No. of Item	Indicator	Loading Factor
1	Factor 1 Culinary	1	Shopping paradise	.735
		5	Culinary tour	.916
		6	Snacks variety	.948
		7	Inexpensive snacks	.960
		8	Delicious snacks	.939

Table 1. Cont.

2	Factor 2 Refreshing	2	Attracted to visit	.604
		3	Safe location	.897
		4	Delightful place	.903
		19	Enjoying entertainment	.619
		21	Relieving fatigue	.805
3	Factor 3 Expression	22	Having fun	.834
		9	Getting together with friends	.787
		10	Community creativity	.835
		17	College students creativity	.788
4	Factor 4 Family Vacation	18	College students activities	.835
		20	Creative college students	.819
		14	Pleasurable excursion	.647
5	Factor 5 Commerce Activities	15	Delightful playground	.926
		16	Children interactivity	.908
		11	Opening business	.837
		12	Developing business	.871
		13	Affordable excursion	.835

A. Culinary Factor

Although it is not part of the intended purpose of CFD, culinary emerged as the first factor in this study. Whereas, inexpensive snacks (0,960) and snack variety (0,948) are two most influential indicators of culinary factor. Indeed, CFD in Indonesia is known as a place to have culinary feast and shopping spree, for example CFD in Solo City [33]. In Jakarta, CFD visitors admit that culinary feast is the preferred activities after exercise [34].

B. Refreshing Factor

Refreshing is the second factor that emerged in this study and highly influenced by delightful place (0,903) and safe location (0,897). This is a factor that is quite consistent with the initial purpose of CFD in Indonesia: sports, arts, and recreation. Open space is a scarce commodity in major cities in Indonesia even though it has important merits, namely improving social health [18]. Khotdee also found an evidence that public open space significantly affects quality of life [35].

C. Expression Factor

Expression is a factor that is formed by 4 indicators. Community creativity (0,835) and college students' activities (0,835) are two dominant indicators that form expression. Art is part of the expression that commonly found in CFD in Indonesia. Music and dance are performed by various communities and individuals [18]. Based on the interview conducted by [36], communities in CFD is part of attraction for people to visit CFD.

D. Family Vacation Factor

Family vacation is the fourth factor that is formed in this study. It is found that CFD also become an exciting playground for children (0,926), to facilitate interaction among children and between children and their environment (0,908), and pleasurable excursion for the whole family (0,647). This is consistent with the result of unscientific investigation of Wahyuni [36] that found CFD provide opportunity to have a good family time on the middle of empty street without vehicles that passing by, without air pollution, and without traffic congestion. Moreover, CFD has become an alternative tourism destination for families [37].

E. Commerce Factor

The last factor that motivate Indonesian citizens to visit CFD is commerce factor. This factor constitutes of developing business (0,871), opening business (0,837), and affordable excursion (0,835). In Pontianak, the capitol of West Kalimantan Province, sales of snacks, clothes, and toys produce the most profit for merchants [38]. The merchants in CFD Jakarta admit that CFD represents opportunity to reap considerable profits [34].

F. The Dilemma of Car Free Day in Indonesia

Clean Air Initiative for Asian Cities (CAI-Asia), on the event of Better Air Quality Conference in 2010, award a "Good" label for Clean Air Quality criteria to Indonesia [39]. However, current situation of Car Free Day in Indonesia has departed from its initial purpose to fight global warming [18]. The tagline of CFD as a free traffic day also failed to be completely implemented because the visitors are still arrived at CFD by using cars or motorcycles and park them around CFD. This behaviours has caused congestion on adjacent roads [18].

The misuse of CFD take several different forms. For example, recently, there was an unfortunate incident in which CFD used as a place to promote political agenda or presidential candidate [40]. This event invites concern from government and other stakeholders. Eventually, the Governor of DKI Jakarta issue a regulation number 12 / 2016 which assert that CFD must be free from all politics-related agenda [40]. In respect to cleanliness, the lack of awareness from visitors and merchants toward clean environment has made CFD become less attractive [41].

The initiator of CFD, Ari Mochamad, also criticize the street vendors that swarmed the CFD on Sudirman-Thamrin Street in Jakarta. In his opinion, CFD is not a Sunday Market [42]. According to Ari Mochamad, although the existence of street vendors in CFD cannot be eradicated, their activities must be highly regulated to ensure the orderliness, convenience, and aesthetic aspects of CFD [42]. Indeed, CFD is the third place that is meant to make a contribution in providing space for the formation of progressive, responsive, and democratic multiculturalism [18].

IV. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

A. Conclusion

Based on the discussion, it can be concluded that there are 5 factors that motivate people to visit CFD. Those factors are culinary, refreshing, expression, family vacation, and commerce. This study found that refreshing is the dominant factor. Furthermore, there is two factors that indicate the existence of deviation on the CFD in Indonesia from its initial purpose, namely culinary and commerce factor. These two factors could be the cause of various problems related to reduced level of cleanliness, convenience, and orderliness of CFD. These findings indicate a paradox in the implementation of CFD in Indonesia. It seems that Indonesian people use CFD as the place to find entertainment, i.e. tourism destination, instead of as a means to reduce air pollution and to promote public health by providing space for people to do physical

exercise. This study provides significant contribution in providing the evidence of the problem, two less-common motives, that might plague the implementation of CFD in Indonesia.

B. Recommendation

As found in this study, CFD has become a new tourism destination that commonly revolves around culinary business. Therefore, it is an imperative for the municipal government to provide tighter regulation to manage street vendors, including food merchants, along with its enforcement action. So far, the policy implemented by municipal government toward the street vendors in Indonesia tend to be repressive, e.g. eviction and raid. Unlike this common policy, this paper suggests “management” approach to deal with this issue because repressive policy will only invite resistance from the street vendors that leads to heightened conflict. It is near impossible to eradicate street vendors at least in the short run because becoming street merchants is mostly a means of survival in the context of urbanization. One possible solution is by applying restriction regarding the trading area and the number of street vendors in CFD. Nonetheless, to instill discipline among street vendors, particularly regarding the orderliness and cleanliness, is a more difficult challenge. Therefore, further studies are needed to investigate trading behaviors of street merchant in CFD in order to propose more effective solutions.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We would like to express our gratitude to Telkom University for providing the required funding under the scheme of Basic and Applied Research grant.

REFERENCES

- [1] Badan Pusat Statistik, "Statistik Transportasi Jawa Barat 2016," Badan Pusat Statistik, 2016.
- [2] L. Wright and L. Fulton, "Climate Change Mitigation and Transport in Developing Nations," *Transport Reviews*, vol. 25, no. 6, pp. 691-717, 2005
- [3] T. Litman and M. Burwell, "Issues in Sustainable Transportation International," *Journal of Global Environment Issues*, vol. 6, pp. 331-347, 2006.
- [4] R. Rachmaniyah and I. Thohari, "Efektivitas Program Car Free Day Terhadap Penurunan Kadar Nox Udara," *Global Health Science (GHS)*, vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 385-389, 2017
- [5] Kasrman, "Motivasi Masyarakat Melakukan Olahraga Rekreasi Melalui Program Car Free Day di Jakarta," *Jurnal Pendidikan Jasmani dan Olahraga*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 72-78, 2017
- [6] M. AHM, A. Fujiwara, T. A. Silaban and V. Aquitania, "Evaluating Local People Acceptance towards Car Free Day Program Using Structural Equation Model: Study on Surabaya City of Indonesia," in *The 8th International Conference of Eastern Asia Society for Transportation Studies*, 2009
- [7] I. Ajzen, "The Theory of Planned Behavior," *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, vol. 50, pp. 179-211, 1991
- [8] T. J. Madden , P. S. Ellen and I. Ajzen, "A Comparison of the Theory of Plannes Behaviour and the Theory of Reasoned Action," *Personality, and Social Psychology Bulletin*, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 3-9, 1992.
- [9] M. K. Chang, "Predicting Unethical Behaviour: A Comparison of the Theory of Reasoned Action and The Theory of Planned Behaviour," *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 17, no. 16, pp. 1825-1834, 1994.
- [10] J. Ameen, "Car Free Day activities 'realistic,'" *timesofmalta.com*, 09 11 2011. [Online]. Available: www.timesofmalta.com [Accessed 1 10 2018].
- [11] M. J. Nieuwenhuijsen and H. Khreis, "Car free cities: Pathway to healthy urban living," *Environment International*, vol. 94, pp. 251-262, 2016.
- [12] D. McKibbin, "Car free days: A Literature Review," *Research and Information Service Northern Ireland Assembly*, pp. 1-13, 2014.
- [13] Invers, "Building Better Cities with Car Free Days," 2017. [Online]. Available: www.invers.com: <https://invers.com/news/building-better-cities-with-car-free-days/>.
- [14] G. Badiozamani, *Car-free Days: A Shift in the Planning Paradigm?*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2003
- [15] L. Wright, *Car Free Day Development (Modul 3e)*, Eschborn: Deutsche Gesellschaft fur, 2005.
- [16] A. M. Anwar, T. A. Silaban, A. Fujiwara and V. Aquitania, "Evaluating Local People Acceptance towards Car Free Day Program Using Structural Equation Model: Study on Surabaya City of Indonesia," *J-STAGE Japan Science and Technology Agency (JST)*, 2009.
- [17] I. A. Arfianto, *Hubungan Motivasi Masyarakat dengan Macam Kegiatan Olahraga Rekreasi di Car Free Day Bandung*, Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, 2013.
- [18] F. A. Prasetyo, "Car Free Day: Transformasi Ruang dan Globalisasi Urbanisme Kontemporer di Bandung," *Jurnal Pemikiran Sosiologi*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 1-24, 2017.
- [19] B. Priyono, T. R. Rohidi and E. Soesilowati, "Patterns of Public Spaces Based on 'Sport For All' and People's Adaptation Process in Semarang City," *Journal of Educational Development*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 59-71, 2017.
- [20] carfreedayindonesia.org, "Dasar Hukum Pelaksanaan Car Free Day," KPBB, 2 December 2014. [Online]. Available: <https://www.carfreedayindonesia.org/index.php/informasi/cfd-jakarta/dasar-hukum>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [21] G. P. D. K. I. Jakarta, *Peraturan Gubernur Provinsi Daerah Khusus Ibukota Jakarta Nomor 12 Tahun 2016 Tentang Pelaksanaan Hari Bebas Kendaraan Bermotor*, Pemerintah Provinsi Daerah Khusus Ibukota Jakarta, 2016
- [22] *Keputusan Gubernur nomor 12 tahun 2016*
- [23] Detik.com, "Akan Ada Aksi Politik di CFD, Sandiaga: Kita Garuk," 4 5 2018. [Online]. Available: <https://news.detik.com/berita/4004541/akan-ada-aksi-politik-di-cfd-sandiaga-kita-garuk>. [Accessed 5 10 2018].
- [24] Koran Jakarta, "'Car Free Day' Tak Selesaikan Masalah Polusi," 25 9 2017. [Online]. Available: <http://www.koran-jakarta.com/car-free-day--tak-selesaikan-masalah-polusi/>. [Accessed 3 10 2018].
- [25] W. Bandung, *Keputusan Walikota Bandung Nomor 551/Kep.1017-Dishub/2015*, Bandung: Pemerintah Kota Bandung, 2015
- [26] R. Firmansyah, "Pemkot Bandung Akan Kaji Ulang Penyelenggaraan CFD," *PRFM 107.5*, 15 5 2018. [Online]. Available: <http://prfmnews.com/berita.php?detail=pemkot-bandung-akan-kaji-ulang-penyelenggaraan-cfd>. [Accessed 5 10 2018].
- [27] *Kumparan.com*, "Pemkot Bandung Akui Car Free Day dan Car Free Night Gagal Kurangi Jumlah Kendaraan," *Kumparan.com*, 15 May 2018. [Online]. Available: <https://kumparan.com/bandungkiwari/pemkot-bandung-akui-car-free-day-dan-car-free-night-tidak-kurangi-kendaraan>. [Accessed 5 October 2018]
- [28] *Garut Express*, garut-express.com, 8 1 2018. [Online]. Available: <http://garut-express.com/disesaki-pkl-car-free-day-di-garut-lebih-mirip-pasar-kaget/>. [Accessed 5 10 2018].
- [29] *jabar.tribunnews.com*, "Setelah Lebaran, PKL di Perkotaan Garut Makin Banyak, Warga Pun Mengeluh," *jabar.tribunnews.com*, 1 7 2018. [Online]. Available: <http://jabar.tribunnews.com/2018/07/01/setelah-lebaran-pkl-di-perkotaan-garut-makin-banyak-warga-pun-mengeluh>. [Accessed 7 10 2018].
- [30] *Poros Garut*, "CFD di Garut Berubah jadi Pasar Tumpah," *Poros Garut*, 8 December 2017. [Online]. Available: <https://www.porosgarut.com/cfd-di-garut-berubah-jadi-pasar-tumpah.html>. [Accessed 2018 October 5]

- [31] Z. Arifin, "CFD Tanpa Asap dan Politik Praktis di Malang," 8 5 2018. [Online]. Available: <https://www.liputan6.com/regional/read/3509878/cfd-tanpa-asap-dan-politik-praktis-di-malang>. [Accessed 5 May 2018].
- [32] Radar Cakrawala, "Mengenal Lebih Dekat Car Free Day (CFD) di Jalan Ijen," 12 2016. [Online]. Available: <http://www.radarcakrawala.com/2016/12/malang-mengenal-lebih-dekat-car-free.html>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [33] S. Purwanti, "Cari Kuliner Lengkap, Datang Aja ke CFD Solo," merahputih.com, 23 November 2016. [Online]. Available: <https://merahputih.com/post/read/cari-kuliner-lengkap-datang-aja-ke-cfd-solo>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [34] L. Rimadi, "Yuk Berburu Cilok Sampai Zuppa Soup di Car Free Day," 9 6 2015. [Online]. Available: <https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/2310757/yuk-berburu-cilok-sampai-zuppa-soup-di-car-free-day>. [Accessed 2 October 2018].
- [35] M. Khotdee, W. Singhirunnusorn and N. Sahachaisaeree, "Effects of Green Open Space on Social Health and Behaviour of Urban Residents: A Case Study of Communities in Bangkok," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 36, p. 449–455, 2012
- [36] T. Wahyuni, "Liburan Bugar di CFD," CNN Indonesia, 17 October 2015. [Online]. Available: <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/gaya-hidup/20151017130740-269-85485/liburan-bugar-di-car-free-day>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [37] N. Azizah, "Car Free Day jadi Alternatif Liburan Keluarga," CNN Indonesia, 17 October 2017. [Online]. Available: <http://news.metrotvnews.com/read/2015/12/27/464118/car-free-day-jadi-alternatif-liburan-keluarga>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [38] C. S. Devi, Rustiyarso and A. Zakso, "Dampak Car Free Day Bagi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Pontianak," *Jurnal Untan*, pp. 1-15, 2016
- [39] CarfreedayIndonesia, "Selamat datang di website resmi Car Free Day Indonesia," 2016. [Online]. Available: <https://www.carfreedayindonesia.org/>.
- [40] A. M. Pratama, "Saat Car Free Day Jakarta Mulai Bernuansa Politis...," Kompas.com, 4 April 2018. [Online]. Available: <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2018/04/30/06085261/saat-car-free-day-jakarta-mulai-bernuansa-politis>. [Accessed 5 October 2018].
- [41] Tribunnews, "Antara Kotor dan Berkah, Sampah-sampah Berserakan Sisa Car Free Day Jalan Sudirman.," 1 4 2018. [Online]. Available: <http://bogor.tribunnews.com/2018/04/01/antarakotor->. [Accessed 2 3 2018].
- [42] A. Ramadhan, "Inisiator: CFD Bukan "Sunday Market"," Kompas.com, 4 May 2018. [Online]. Available: <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2018/05/04/21011461/inisiator-cfd-bukan-sunday-market>. [Accessed 5 October 2018]