

Bandung Tourism Image: Stakeholder Perceptions on The Representation of Creative City

Bhawika Hikmat Prasetya

*Faculty of Business, Economics, and Communications
Naresuan University
Phitsanulok, Thailand*

Ketwadee buddhabhumbhitak

*Faculty of Business, Economics, and Communications
Naresuan University
Phitsanulok, Thailand*

Abstract—At the end of 2015, UNESCO has announced the designation of Bandung as one of the city who joined UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN). This recognition not only offers credibility and global recognition for the city but also makes Bandung facing a potential benefit which comes with the acknowledgment. The most important point after receiving the award is how the city chooses to use the award to enhance their brand image. Nonetheless, the creativeness of the city still became a magnet for tourist to visit Bandung. Culinary, music, fashion, and architecture of Bandung, become the various attraction which worth a visit. But after the recognition of Bandung as one of the UCCN in the design field, how will the tourism stakeholders perceive this achievement and use it for the tourism sector? This study aims to construct how is the perception of the tourism stakeholders in the city of Bandung, after its recognition as a creative city.

Keywords—*tourism, stakeholder, creative city*

I. INTRODUCTION

Bandung is the capital city of West Java, the most densely populated province in Indonesia. Located 768 meter above sea level, Bandung has become favorite resort city for more than 100 years ago due to its cool climate. The fact that Bandung located on the main route that was built by Dutch colonial, the *grotepostweg* which connect the west and east part of Java island, Bandung also become one of the stopover places for people who are travel. The accessibility factor indeed made the people from Jakarta, the capital city of Indonesia which only lies about 150 KM from Bandung, visits Bandung on their weekend getaway nowadays. Bandung also has developed as a “big” city despite its small area of 168 km², and become one of the most important cities for the political, economy, and social activity in Indonesia [1].

Data from the official publication of “Bandung in Figures - 2015”, shows that aside from being home of more than 2.4 million residents, the city also has to cater 5 million tourists per year (only 3.5% of them are international tourists). Creative industry has emerged to give service for both tourist and visitor. Reliable services should be provided by the city as a business service, infrastructure, education, public administration, personal and social services, and trading services [2].

Being one of the main cities in Indonesia, Bandung was said to have the strong factor to become a creative city. Rahardjo in Maryunani & Mirzanti [3] stated that Bandung has assets on knowledge and human resources. Knowledge related to the abundant number of higher educational institutions. According to the official data from the

government in Bandung [4], there are 119 universities, academies, institutes, and colleges. As Bandung also quite small in term of area, the city doesn't have plenty of natural resources and it has to rely on their human capital resources to develop the city. Academic institutions and human resources can be said as the reason why Bandung was chosen as the pilot project of the creative city in Indonesia. The people of Bandung, especially its youth, involved in many creative-based activities.

In Bandung, since decades ago, other kind cultural industries have been growing and exposing the human creativity of Bandung. These industries are food, music, radio broadcasting, distribution outlets, clothing factory, also textiles and leather home industries. The things that started as natural trends activities now turns to flourish at the national and international market. This emphasizes the creative talent from Bandung. The government of Bandung seriously positioned them self as a service city and started to create plans to success that goal [5].

In July 2007, the UK-East Asia Creative Cities Forum was held in Yokohama (Japan) to explore the theme of the “Creative City.” On the event which was initiated by the British Council, Bandung was chosen to become the pilot project for the creative city in East Asia Creative Cities program [6]. On the Southeast Asian level, Bandung also initiated the Southeast Asian Creative Cities Network (SEACCN) together with George Town (Malaysia), Cebu (Philippines) and Chiang Mai (Thailand) in 2014. Bandung, together with Solo and Yogyakarta, was the founder of Indonesia Creative Cities Network (ICCN) in 2015. At the end of 2015, UCCN announced the designation of 47 cities from 33 countries, as new members. Bandung was chosen as one of the city who joined the category of design on this list (<http://en.unesco.org>).

The designation of Bandung as one of the UNESCO Creative Cities offers credibility and global recognition for the city. Bandung is also now facing a potential benefit which comes with the acknowledgment. Pearson & Pearson [7], on their research on the branding of cities who got the UNESCO creative cities title, explain that the main benefits reported for the recipient city are the increased economic opportunities. This mostly caused mainly by the increase of the visitor's number or specific cultural events. But, added the most important point after receiving the award is how the city chooses to use the award to enhance their brand image.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. What is creativity?

Creativity is undeniable and unavoidable on human lives. The gadget we use, the song we hear, the vehicle we ride, it is all the results of creative thinking. Simonton in Tan et al. [8] point that research on creativity has changed, by seeing it not as a process in the mind of a single individual, rather consider it to takes place in a social context. Chartrand in Richards & Wilson [9] argues that “creativity occurs when an individual steps beyond traditional ways of doing, knowing and making”. Moreover, they suggest that creativity is more than just developing new ways of thinking and doing.

B. Creative city

Creativity pushed the rise of creative industries. It has become a major sector for economic development worldwide, increasing competitiveness, promoting innovation, but also creating new jobs. Knowledge and creativity are vast, powerful factors to drive economic growth. Research by Landry & Bianchini [10] and Landry [11], stated that the concept of the ‘creative city’ grew out of ‘cultural cluster’ policies, fusing it with tourism, ‘flagship projects’ such as festivals, and a more general concern with city planning in the name of ‘quality of life’.

The Creative City [10] seeks to inspire people to think, plan and act creatively in the city, as well as provide approaches methods to generate ideas that turn urban innovations into reality. Landry argues that cities are changing dramatically in ways that require a paradigm shift to solve urban problems, and human creativity as a major urban resource will allow us to address these problems in new ways while creating livable, vibrant and attractive cities. Moreover, Landry [11] listed some conditions for a city to be called creative. These factors are important to allow for creative thoughts, based on personal and collective factors. Each of the listed factors is not a must have, but the city will operate at its best when all are presented.

TABLE I. FOUNDATION OF THE CREATIVE CITY BY LANDRY [11]

Factors	Indicators
Personal qualities	1. Mixing imaginative qualities
Wil and leadership	1. The qualities of will 2. The qualities of leadership 3. Difficulties of leadership
Human diversity and access to varied talent	1. Diversities 2. Outsiders 3. Insiders
Organizational culture	1. Learning through empowerment 2. Breaking rule 3. The virtues of failure 4. Catalysts 5. Towards a learning organization 6. Organizational capacity
Local identity	1. Cultural identity 2. The ambiguity of history
Urban space and facilities	1. Public space 2. Urban centers as neutral territory 3. Meeting place: the virtual and the real 4. Public facilities 5. Research and education 6. Communication channels 7. Cultural facilities 8. Creative space at affordable prices 9. Artist as regenerators

TABLE II. TABLE I, CONT.

Factors	Indicators
Networking dynamics	1. Deeply embedded networking 2. The city and inter-organizational networking 3. Best practice benchmarking and beyond

C. UNESCO Creative Cities Network

The network is open for any cities who wish to join, by submitting the application containing information needed about the city and its close relation to one of the thematic network. The applying cities should describe they're economical, social, and cultural context; an overview of the city's chosen field; and a description of the city's cultural offerings in the same field. Later on, the country's national commission for UNESCO will be called to give its opinion, before the application reviewed by a panel of experts. The panel then gives advice and recommendation for the final decision made by the Director-General of UNESCO. There are seven categories can be chosen by the cities depends on their preference for one of the creative industry sectors which they devote their talent and energy. Those categories are literature, cinema, music, crafts and folk art, design, gastronomy, and media arts.

UNESCO advised the applying cities to carefully consider some factors, such as Participative process involving relevant stakeholders and partners on the public and private sectors as well as civil society; forward-looking approach which contributes to the sustainable urban development of the city; inclusive, sustainable development on an economic, cultural, social, and environmental level; longstanding commitment on implementing the action plan, regularly reporting on their achievements and participating in the UCCN meetings; concrete action plan which the outcomes and impacts of those projects can be evaluated; exchanges and cooperation between member cities of the network; and set the action plan to be fit with the city's priorities as well as the UCCN's objectives. After the designation, joined cities should inform the progress they have made in the implementation of policies and activities, both locally and internationally, and send it to UNESCO.

D. Attraction of creativity

While creative tourism linked to culture, the cultural expressions as part of creativity will be unique and distinctive in one place with another. That's why there is no one-size-fits-all model that could be implemented for the development of creativity as an attraction. It is a combination of bottom-up and top-down approaches. The development of creativity in a city relies on the collective self-organization, active pioneers, strong civil society, and local government. In return, this will give benefits to the city, such as a positive stimulus for the creative economy, attractive tourist destination; also become part of image making and city branding. Creativity has adopted by cities or region to overtake growth, and furthermore to promote innovation and skill development [8].

Creativity can be applied to tourism by developing new products or experiences; new forms of consumptions or new tourism spaces. Creative city, depend on how they brand it, can also become a tourist destination. This is what was called by Richards and Wilson [9] as “creative destination.”

By finding the synergy between the creative resources and the creative needs of visitors, the city can promote their tourism using creative strategies. Key attributes of a successful creative city include public space, design and showcasing, and the quality of the whole visitor experience [12].

III. RESEARCH METHOD

The objective of the study is to analyze the perception of tourism stakeholders on branding Bandung as a creative city to tourist and their opinion in implementing it for tourism in Bandung. To fulfill the objectives, the research was applied qualitative methodology. First, initial research was done to get a brief view of the problem and research gap by doing a documentary review, literature review, and interview. After that, the research methodology will be designed to fit with the case study. On identifying the study area, the researcher will also identify the stakeholder groups with an interest in and relation to tourism, to become the respondents of the interview.

There are four major tourism stakeholders who were suggested by Goeldner and Ritchie [13]: tourists, residents, entrepreneurs, and government officials. Based on that and the research of Hardy [14], four stakeholder groups were identified will be used on this research.

- Local people, who were defined as either living within or having ownership rights to land within the geographical study area, such as residents.
- Operators, who owned or managed tourism business within the geographical study area, such as tour guide, tour operator, hotel, tourism attraction operator, transportation company, and restaurant.
- Visitors to the study area, who were defined as those visiting the region, in this case, is the people from outside of Bandung, who spent overnight in the city, and
- The regulator, who were defined as those who contributed to the management of the area, such as the Destination Marketing Organization, the local parliament, and city official.

The interviewee or respondents chose by doing judgment sampling methods. Experts were selected to ensure the required information can be collected [15]. The sampling strategy was planned to ensure there are representative of a cross-section of the stakeholders. This should be done, so the opinion gathered can be generalized within the stakeholder group. For this research, groups of stakeholder were set based on the reference above and the current situation. A total of 20 interviews was done for this research. The primary data collection used the semi-structured and in-depth interview with open-ended questions to allow probing to get deeper information. The analysis of results then was organized into thematic categories produced from the narrative data that has been collected. The patterns will be searched from the data, understand phenomena and compare in different settings [16].

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Although having not much nature attraction, Bandung was gifted by its location. The relatively near distance from Jakarta as the biggest market with strong purchasing power,

give lots of benefits. Most of the respondents from a different group of stakeholders agree that the tourism in Bandung is getting better in terms of the emergence of new touristic places, both for the local's leisure and also for the tourists. Bandung also becomes the hub for tourists visiting the surrounding areas. A tourist, who is also a teacher bringing his school group, said that he likes to go to Bandung, because there is always something new in Bandung, including to visits some of the tourist attraction just outside of Bandung. The head of the commission for economy and finance in Bandung's Parliament stated that the target of tourists coming to Bandung now reach seven million visitors per year.

Besides the man-made attraction such as the thematic parks and public spaces creates by the government, there is some initiative that comes from the local itself. For example the Cibunut colorful neighborhood, where the society actually just want to make a better environment for themselves by painting walls around their place. Now that neighborhood also becomes an alternative to tourist attraction. This is one example of a creative city, where the city creates an opportunity for people to participate in solving their problems together. Community-Based tourism can be a way to highlight Bandung as a creative city because it let tourists have direct contact with the locals, as suggested by the interviewee from the tour guide. Saung Angklung Udjo is one good example of how creativity makes a traditional culture become a favorite tourist destination, based on community empowerment. This is one of the most well-publicize tourist destinations in Bandung.

The designation of Bandung as part of UNESCO Creative Cities Network is a something that can be proud by the locals or other stakeholders. Bandung deserves to be called a creative city, since the rise of creative industries after the monetary crisis. The creative industries become known as one of the attractions for the tourists visiting Bandung. Ironically, some of the stakeholders don't really know what a creative city is. Some government officials that were interviewed, only assumed that creative city is a smart city related to technologies. The role of government is very important in making the policy to support Bandung as a creative city. The leadership of Ridwan Kamil as the mayor seen as one of the factors by some locals. But it is also important to have the same vision of all government bodies, so they can still working this policy although leadership has changed, and become more sustainable. This is what was criticized by the government by other stakeholders.

Nevertheless, after Bandung become part of the UCCN, there is also a responsibility to develop the quality of the city to be more known internationally. That will be responsible for all the stakeholders to work together for it. The networks that Bandung have now with other creative cities should be used to learn. On the other hand, the city also has to anticipate the popularity and the chance of the increasing number of tourists. An example that already complained by the locals is the lack of parking spots to accommodate visitors until they have to park on the road and create a traffic jam. While from the tourism industry they complained about the abundant number of hotels in Bandung. This creates unhealthy price war among hotels and makes the price getting lower because the rising number of the hotels is not balanced with the number of tourists. The occupancy rate reaches 45% nowadays while it can be as

high as 70-80% before. In the tourism industry itself, there is some confusion about what should they do or what they can do to after Bandung become part of the UCCN. There is no clear guidance on what's next in the tourism strategy. Even the program to establish a thematic public park dedicated to UCCN in Bandung have not been build, as promised on the designation.

Being creative means also to create something new. But luckily there are concerns from the stakeholders to keep their local identity to be offered as the uniqueness of Bandung. While in infrastructure the new development of tourist attractions should also concern the zonal and spacial issues. The crowd should be spread, so it is more comfortable for everyone, both tourists and locals. As a critic, the Cihampelas skywalk project was rated a blunder by some stakeholders. The concept was seen as a good thing, but when it was built in Cihampelas, some people say it dispel the uniqueness of this famous street which is the view of the big trees. Now it the visitors cannot see the trees if they are driving past the area that is famous as a shopping paradise. Good ideas should be followed by good implementation. After getting into the UCCN, the stakeholders also have to anticipate the expectation of the tourists for Bandung as a creative city.

Creativity also concerns about originality. There is a case of Rabbittown, a new attraction in Bandung which was accused of plagiarism on their artworks. Stakeholders from tourist attraction operator firmly stated that we shouldn't say we are creative if we still copying things from someone else or somewhere else. So all the stakeholders should be very careful about implementing new things in Bandung that inspired from other tourist destination because it can ruin the image of Bandung as Creative city.

The establishment of Bandung Creative Hub (BCH) is regarded as an important step after Bandung become UCCN. BCH while also becoming the place for the youth to do activities and express their creativity, it also can become a new tourist attraction. The unique shape of the building will be easily recognized among the surroundings. This place also under a newly created department at the Tourism Board of Bandung to exhibit the creativity of the locals. The 16 sub-sectors of the creative economy set up by the Indonesian government tried to be accommodated here. The head of BCH said that it is expected that these sub-sectors can also become a tourism commodity.

TABLE III. SUB-SECTORS OF THE CREATIVE ECONOMY IN INDONESIA (BEKRAF.GO.ID)

Sub-sectors	
1.	Application and game developer
2.	Architecture
3.	Product design
4.	Fashion
5.	Interior design
6.	Visual communication design
7.	Performance art
8.	The film, animation, and video
9.	Photography
10.	Crafts
11.	Culinary
12.	Music
13.	Publishing
14.	Advertisement
15.	Fine arts
16.	Television and radio

There is also a must to develop new ways and strategy to promote Bandung as a creative city to the potential tourists. As mentioned by the stakeholder from the tour guide, fewer people are buying a package from a travel agent. They are rather doing independent travel based on the information they get from the internet. So far, the publicity of Bandung as a Creative City might only reach domestic tourists rather than international tourists. This is confirmed by the Bandung airport administrator, as the number of domestic tourists entering Bandung is increasing, while the international tourists are decreasing. It was also complained by the tourism industries that they are not been much involved in tourism promotion. Furthermore, they think the government didn't promote much of the tourism in Bandung. It can happen because of they already happy with the number, or they are worried about the caring capacity of Bandung on handling visitors. At least for now, Bandung is also receiving many representatives from other cities for comparative study. One of the thing that other cities want to know is about Bandung as a creative city.

Good coordination between stakeholders, especially from the operator and government should be strengthened. An event should not just become an individual project but should also support the brand image of Bandung. The tourism board of Bandung still facing difficulties to make an annual calendar event. The Board of Creative Economy in Bandung realized that the UCCN is a marketable branding to be used to attract tourists.

V. CONCLUSION

Although Bandung recognized by UCCN as a creative city in the Design fields, the city also famous for its gastronomy sector. The registration for the UCCN however, was initiated by Bandung Creative City Forum and supported by the local government at that time which agreed to nominate Bandung in the design field. But there are still different understanding of what creative city is and what could be done with it. After becoming part of the UCCN in 2015, there might not be a direct impact to the tourism in Bandung. But there are two things that could be done by the tourism stakeholders to promote Bandung as a creative city and a tourist destination: improvements and promotions.

Firstly, the improvements related to the internal sector. All the stakeholders have to have the same view on what is creative city and what they want to achieve in the future. This is important to ensure the sustainability of the creative city despite the changes in the leadership. The government also have to make and distribute information about the guidelines of Bandung as a creative city on the line of tourism to all stakeholders. As Richards and Raymond [17] pointed out that tourism can be improved by creativity because creativity can create value more easily because of its scarcity and give them a competitive advantage compared to other destinations. The creative city should be able to create product diversification to be offered to tourists.

Secondly, an accurate promotion strategy for potential tourists to create an awareness of Bandung as a creative city. The stakeholders should work together on preparing information for the tourists. Brand images create a unique position for the destination in the eyes of a designated traveler, by presenting either tangible (such as culture, product, etc.) or intangible features (such as friendly, fun,

etc.). The summed features were combined to shape the holistic brand image of the destination. As a member of UCCN, Bandung can promote their tourism to the network, since every city have a chance to do exhibitions, seminars, classes, contests, publications or media campaigns [18].

Both points are related to each other as what Walker [19] in her research raised about the role of stakeholders. The tourism stakeholders have to ensure the congruency between the images of the destination with the tourist's experience. The stakeholders itself should believe in the images that are shown as the tourism brand because the original images will be noticeably by the tourists.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Authors wishing to acknowledge assistance and encouragement from lecturers and colleagues at the Tourism Department of Naresuan University, special work by technical staff and financial support from Naresuan University. Also the help from the tourism stakeholders in Bandung as an interviewee.

REFERENCES

- [1] A. K. M. Tarigan, S. Sagala, D. A. A. Samsura, D. F. Fiisabiilillah, H. A. Simarmata, and M. Nababan, "Bandung City, Indonesia," *Cities*, vol. 50, pp. 100–110, 2016.
- [2] A. Ghazali and L. Martini, "Bandung as service city in Indonesia: role of academician, business, and community," *Procedia-Social Behav. Sci.*, vol. 52, pp. 317–324, 2012.
- [3] S. R. Maryunani and I. R. Mirzanti, "The development of entrepreneurship in creative industries with reference to Bandung as a creative city," *Procedia-Social Behav. Sci.*, vol. 169, pp. 387–394, 2015.
- [4] B. P. S. K. Bandung, "Kota Bandung Dalam Angka," *Tersedia pada* <http://bandungkota.bps.go.id/publikasi/kota-bandung-dalam-angka>, 2015.
- [5] A. R. Soemardi and I. Radjawali, "Creative culture and urban planning: The Bandung experience," in *The Eleventh International Planning History Conference*, 2004.
- [6] A. Aritenang, "The city of Bandung: Unfolding the process of a creative city," 2012.
- [7] D. Pearson and T. Pearson, "Branding food culture: UNESCO creative cities of gastronomy," *J. Food Prod. Mark.*, vol. 23, no. 3, pp. 342–355, 2017.
- [8] S.-K. Tan, S.-F. Kung, and D.-B. Luh, "A model of 'creative experience' in creative tourism," *Ann. Tour. Res.*, vol. 41, pp. 153–174, 2013.
- [9] G. Richards and J. Wilson, *Tourism, creativity and development*, vol. 10. Routledge, 2007.
- [10] C. Landry and F. Bianchini, *The creative city*, vol. 12. Demos, 1995.
- [11] C. Landry, *The creative city: A toolkit for urban innovators*. Routledge, 2012.
- [12] G. Evans, "Creative spaces, tourism and the city," *Tour. Creat. Dev.*, pp. 57–72, 2007.
- [13] C. R. Goeldner and J. R. Ritchie, "Brent," *Mcitosh, Robert W*, 2006.
- [14] A. Hardy, "Using grounded theory to explore stakeholder perceptions of tourism," *J. Tour. Cult. Chang.*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 108–133, 2005.
- [15] J. Briedenhann and S. Butts, "Application of the Delphi technique to rural tourism project evaluation," *Curr. Issues Tour.*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 171–190, 2006.
- [16] C. Costa, Z. Breda, I. Pinho, F. Bakas, and M. Durão, "Performing a thematic analysis: An exploratory study about managers' perceptions on gender equality," *Qual. Rep.*, vol. 21, no. 13, pp. 34–47, 2016.
- [17] G. Richards and C. Raymond, "Creative tourism," *ATLAS news*, vol. 23, no. 8, pp. 16–20, 2000.
- [18] M. Rosi, "Branding or sharing?: The dialectics of labeling and cooperation in the UNESCO Creative Cities Network," *City. Cult. Soc.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 107–110, 2014.
- [19] S. M. Walker, *Studying Soil (Searchlight Books - Do You Dig Earth Science?)*. Lerner Publishing Group, 2013.