

Colonial Stereotypes in Indonesian Society of Multimedia Era

Hendrik Efriyadi

*Posgraduate Program Indonesian Language And Literature
Education*

*Yogyakarta State University
Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

hendrik.efriyadi94@gmail.com

Else Liliani

*Faculty of Language and Art
Yogyakarta State University*

*Yogyakarta, Indonesia
else_l@uny.ac.id*

Abstract—This research focuses on the domain of Western colonialism's discourse towards the East, especially about the shape of Western colonial stereotypes in Indonesian society in the multimedia era in two novels of the latest Indonesia by Ika Natassa entitled *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love*. The purpose of this research is to know the forms of Western colonial stereotypes of the people in former colonial countries such as Indonesia. The approach that used in this study using postcolonial theory. The method that used is descriptive qualitative. Based on the results of research that has been done shows the West has a strong superior stereotype in Indonesian society in the multimedia era, so West became references, the parameters to the source of imitation. The forms of Western stereotypes in Indonesian society in the multimedia era are found such as: the form of sex-oriented views on the opposite sex, ideal cities, languages, food, and drink in the West.

Keywords— *postcolonial, stereotype, multimedia*

I. INTRODUCTION

Discussing the West in Indonesian literature is not something new, there are many observers who analyze prose and poetry from a number of sides, start from the West as a rule model to the West to be resisted. But the literary works only discussed the works that dominated the background, conflict or focus on the period before and the beginning of independence. Discussing the West on Indonesian literature that focuses on the latest Indonesian society - in the 2000s and above - is rarely done. Related to this, the author wants to break that habit by reviewing the novel *Critical Eleven* (2015) and *The Architecture of Love* (2016) by Ika Natassa.

The reality of Indonesia as one of the third world countries in the East and the former colony is the main element of the dominant phenomenon of Western colonialization in Indonesian society, not least the literature. Edward W Said, a theoretician who focuses on the study of eastern-especially the Middle East-has embodied the emergence and rise of various Western phenomena into reference or to cursed because of the unequal relations between East and West. "East" is not merely present, as does "the West that does not exist solely". Relations between West and East is a relation of power, domination, and hegemony complex [1].

Referring to the description of the above, the Western penetration of Indonesia in the past, not only leaves a memory of the takeover of power, but also the paradigm of

the inferior society even after independence. [2] The forms of colonialism that coming from Europe will not simply disappear from the former colonies, even if the country has gained its independence. Colonialism is not easy to fade, because previously colonization is done through various lines, such as political and economic structures to really entrust.

The complexity of the colonial domination is also expressed by Uraizee that colonialism is also a process of political, economic, cultural and religious colonization brutally, exploitative manner, resulting in full mastery of the superstructure, such as the social and political economy of colonized peoples [3]. Colonization is done through cumulative and manipulative (transforming dominion over the colonized into good), and the strategy of cultivating power by forming a configuration of practice, theory and attitude. As a result, the colonizing power of the colonists' minds, feelings, and attitudes is very strong and can take place even after the colonizer releases his power over his colonized geography [4].

In Indonesia, the colonization of Western nations by conquer the geographic has ended. Nonetheless, the influence of colonization that placed the Indonesian people as an inferior class and the Western nations as superior remains inherent. Furthermore, the existence of colonization through new ways with various variations of the current form is known as neo colonization, resulting in increasingly dominant influence of Western nations for the people of Indonesia. This means that interaction of the West between the East running with massive strategy and tactical. In Indonesia, the colonization of Western nations by means of geographic mastery has ended. Nonetheless, the influence of colonization that placed the Indonesian people as an inferior class and the Western nations as superior remains inherent. Furthermore, with the colonization through new ways with various variations of the current form of familiar neo colonization, resulting in increasingly dominant influence of Western nations for the people of Indonesia. This means that the interaction of the West towards the East is done massively strategically and tactically. Covering various facets, not limited to lifting weapons, but also entering on community governance systems from the elite to its roots. In addition, also with the packaging of goodness, enlightenment to civilization. So, it is not impossible that the effect is sustainable even after the autonomy has been completed, the article of the formula has entered far into the

subconscious all the layers of society let alone supported by written and unwritten legal instruments.

The existence of colonization and Western neo colonization that expose the Eastern countries including Indonesia gave birth to a distinctive society. The typical society is a society with inferior paradigm before the West. The inferior paradigm is one of its forms can be easily found in Indonesian society in this multimedia era is the superior stereotypes. We can easily find that fact in this modern Indonesian society that worships everything from the West, from education, social, economic, political and even cultural. Education for example, most of our society considers that study in European countries or America more pride than study in the country, although the quality of the education is not different. This similarly also can be seen in the social, economic, political and cultural spheres of Indonesia, the West places a benchmark on progress and modernity.

The rest of this paper is organized as follow: Section II describes the postcolonial. Section III describes proposed research method. Section IV describes colonial stereotypes on Indonesian society in the multimedia era. Finally, Section V concludes this work.

II. POSTCOLONIAL

Discussing Western stereotypes as the phenomenon of both colonization and neo colonization, cannot be separated from "postcolonial" as a main theory. So, before discussing the colonial stereotypes, the writer will first explain what it is postcolonial. Postcolonial theory is closely related to hegemony in intercultural encounters in different societies (colonizers and colonized). Issues that discussed in postcolonial theory such as cross-cultural, heredity and birth of new cultures [5].

Postcolonial theory relating to various cultural contacts between colonizers and colonized. In the context of the influence of main discourse (colonizers), such as history, philosophy, the nature, consequences of colonial education and the relationship between western knowledge and colonial power. This relates to the colonized people of the struggle for control of self-representation using language, discourse and narrative form another dominant. In addition, the struggle over the representation of place, history, race, and ethnicity as well as the struggle to present local reality to a global audience [6].

The object of postcolonial studies is very heterogeneous. The range of postcolonial theory becomes heterogeneous, largely due to the postcolonial nature combined with other disciplines, such as literature, culture, economics, politics and various other disciplines [7].

Mills states that postcolonial is a theory that is often used to discuss discourse related to the great colonial powers. This theory is a combination of the perspectives put forward by Foucault and Gramsci about the power and influence that manifest in a colonial discourse [8].

The postcolonial development as a theory that has a focus on the study of unbalanced relations between Eastern nations and Western nations has been responded to differently by theorists who observe colonial issues. The variety of responses takes place in the realm of naming and

interpreting the capacity of postcolonial theory on the object of study after the occurrence of colonialism or acting "beyond". Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin convey the differences in periodization and the meaning of "beyond" indicated by addition (-). If it does not use the sign (-) the postcolonial approach will only be a period after colonialism. But when using the sign (-) it will mean beyond [9].

The postcolonial term is not understood etymologically too rigidly or often misunderstood as a temporal concept, which means the time after colonialism ceased, or when Independence Day is determined politically in which a state has escaped colonial rule. So that purport the capacity of postcolonial theory is not just after colonialism, but rather leads to engagement and participation in the discourse of colonialism, power structures and social hierarchy [10].

As a perspective, postcolonial theory is also interpreted in various countries, especially in Indonesia. Ratna conveyed postcolonial origin from the word's "post" and "colonial". The word "post" means after or after, while the word "colonial" is derived from the word Colonia, which is roman word which means agricultural or residential land. Therefore, postcolonial theory is a theory used to examine cultural symptoms after the era of colonial rule [11].

Unlike Ratna, Nurhadi says that the word "post" attached to the word "colonial" is actually not appropriate if it is interpreted in the Indonesian version to be "post". This case is similar to the Indonesian word "discourse" in Foucault's term which does not exactly mean the word "discourse". The postcolonial word is often used as a postcolonial translation term that refers to the problem of "time after" colonial. Though postcolonial does not only refer to studies after the era of colonialism or the era of independence, but more broadly refers to various matters related to colonialism that existed in the 21st century. Furthermore, the word "post" in this context changes to "post" and the word post in the context of the theory that examines colonialism is interpreted as "beyond". Therefore, postcolonial is a study that transcends colonialism, can be either after colonialization or other problems that are still related even though it appears to be separate from colonialism. This means that postcolonial meaning is not partial or in accordance with the capacity of the theory that was triggered [12].

Nurhadi's opinion is also the same as Budiawan's statement that in its development postcolonial theory is still debated, but there has been agreement that the word post- is "beyond". Based on the description above, it can be concluded that the use of pronouns or naming theories about colonialism is "postcolonial", a theory that has the capacity to examine, various forms relating to colonialism and not partially from the time limit after colonialization [13].

Postcolonial theory is an approach to examining the social state of things from the effects of the practice of others from foreign territories or colonialists. Based on the above opinions, it can be constructed a postcolonial theory with a capacity to respond more than just chronological constructs after independence and the discursive experience of colonialism or colonization that resulted in influences on the social state of colonized [14].

The famous theorist concentrating on postcolonial studies of Bhabha captures the fact of colonial stereotyping as one of the peculiar phenomena of the occupation of Western nations [15].

Colonial stereotypes are superior labels or always favored for colonialism in the colonies. Bhabha captures the fact of colonial stereotypes as an activity carried out systematically. During the early period of colonialization, the construction of colonial stereotypes through means of power in the form of racial, cultural, historical and moral discrimination in the framework of its agreement was consciously or unconsciously about colonial worship. The next period, to trace colonial stereotypes can be identified through media, such as images and films and science. The construction of colonial stereotypes is complex because it deals with consciousness and a political and ideological discourse [15].

Colonial stereotypes built also by giving rise to the stereotypes of colonial communities to be collided. Colonial stereotypes were positively introduced, while the stereotypes of negative colonies were in the form of backwardness, such as cannibals, nasfu, anarchy and harm. The strategy of collisions is of course to spread colonial worship, one of which is massive with the production of literary texts. Bhabha in [15] exemplifies racial and cultural stereotypes in children's fiction, where whites as heroes and blacks become devils. Through literary texts, ideological doctrine and psychic identification were presented continuously in colonial times.

The discourse of colonial stereotypes is a four-term strategy. First, a metaphorical function or a meaningful 'masking fetish' presents a stereotype of colonial worship with things that are not very clear. Second, the choice of a narcissistic object meaningful colonial becomes a party that always exist in various things. Third, the opposite alliance or metonymy by searching for a meaningful lack of producing the things that are colonized and colonized against the lack of the colonized. The four aggressive phases of the imaginary meaning to build a discourse that imagines everything related to colonial is superior or should always be seeded [9]. The worship of the colonial, one that is massively done with the production of literary texts [15].

III. PROPOSED METHOD

This type of research is qualitative research, using descriptive methods, and content analysis techniques. Qualitative research is a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of speech or writing that can be identified from the individual (subject) itself [16]. The research method is a method used to make descriptions of various events or events. Descriptive research methods are the basis for describing or explaining mutual relations, the best hypothesis, making applications, or stringing meaning [17].

Content processing techniques are analytical techniques that can be used for research, such as essays, novels, newspapers, textbooks, articles, articles, cookbooks, songs, speech by politicians, images and all types of human communication that can be analyzed, both individuals or

groups in the form of beliefs, attitudes, ideas, values, etc. [18]. Several stages need to be carried out in the first content analysis, determining the achievement of the research objectives. Second, defining terms in the object of research. Third, focus on the research analysis unit. Fourth, look for relevant data. Fifth, develop strong reasons or rationale relations between data and purpose. Sixth, plan to take samples. Seventh, follow the coding category [18].

Data writing techniques in this study use library research techniques or literature studies, namely a technique by mentioning documents or archives related to the purpose of the study. This type of content analysis is carried out [19]. The steps taken are as follows. First, reading Ika Natassa's *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* novels carefully. The reading process is carried out intensively and repeatedly with the aim of obtaining valid information and in accordance with the research problem, namely colonial discourse. Second, understanding more intensively certain parts that are related to the focus of research. Intensive understanding is needed in this study in order to obtain valid data based on research problems. Third, analysis of parts of the story related to research problems. This step aims to interpret the data that has been obtained from novel reading activities. Fourth, make a description of the data that aims to obtain data based on the focus of the research.

The data validity technique in this study is a theory triangulation technique. This inspection technique uses other data for checking purposes or as a comparison to the object research data [20]. The use of something else as an examination technique in this study is the use of theory. The use of theory by utilizing the theory aims to re-examine the degree of confidence in the data in order to reduce inaccuracies or irregularities in checking data.

IV. WESTERN COLONIAL STEREOTYPES ON INDONESIAN SOCIETY IN THE MULTIMEDIA ERA

Multimedia era is a concrete evidence of the rapid development of media, especially technology-based. This development can be traced through the beginning of the industrial revolution in the eighteen century and more rapidly after the end of World War II in the mid-twentieth century. We all understand the media has a wide scope. With regard to the breadth of media coverage, the discussion on this referent focuses on the media as a means of conveying information and communication as well as a part of the lifestyle. Multimedia today as has been alluded to in the initial sentence of the paragraph that has been transformed as a marker for defining an era. Multimedia has become a semiotics of a new era.

Based on research by the author on the novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa found the fact that the story represents the Indonesian people in the multimedia era to place the Western colony superior stereotype. The narrations contained in the novel show the Indonesian people in the multimedia era who often legitimize himself as a modern society, nothing but a form of himself in the West. It shows the impact of colonization and Western neo colonization towards the East. Let's look at the following quotations:

Pada detik ini aku harus berterterima kasih kepada almarhum Steve Jobs karena telah menciptakan iPad: alat pembunuh mati gaya paling sakti [21].

(At this moment I should be grateful to the late Steve Jobs for creating the iPad: the ultimate style killer tool.)

"Avatar oke, tweets hemat banget, yang di-follow Cuma akun NFL, Sports Illustrated, CNN... ih idola lo banget ini," Tara mengumam sendiri sambil membuka-buka akun Twitter Ale. "Fast Company, Texas A&M... wait he's an Aggie?"

"Iya"

"Seksi dong" [21].

("Avatar okay, really saving tweets, Just follow the NFL account, Sports Illustrated, CNN ... this really my idol, 'she muttered to himself as he leafed through a Twitter account Ale. "Fast Company, Texas A & M ... wait he's an Aggie ?"

"Yes"

"What a Sexy."

In the first quotation, describes how Western electronic media in the form of iPad to be a helper who is considered to determine decisive life in social relations between the opposite character Anya and Ale. The paradigm of Indonesian society in this multimedia era is not much different from what is experienced by Anya figure, that Western-made goods as if it has become their second life. If the first quotation is critically interpreted, the iPad becomes a symbol of the West which in present-day Indonesian society has become an angel during critical situations. On the contrary, if the phenomenon contained in the above quotation is seen naked it becomes meaningless "fairness".

The second quote contains about the West which is stereotype superior to the Indonesian in the multimedia era. Multimedia, as well as the ideal male figure, is someone act like West figure, names Anya, Tara, and Agnes. West became the primary reference and the validity of judgment about the opposite sex. The west, which is stereotyped superior to the physical addition is also based on the media devices it uses. The axes are all related to the West such as NFL accounts, Sports Illustrated, CNN and as Aggie (a term for Texas A & M University students or alumni). This means that in judging the opposite sex (in this context women to men) is called cool (superior) are those who complete the Western attribute. It is very clear that the paradigm of Indonesian society is still (and probably will continue) to glorify the superiorly stereotyped West.

Buat pelancong, New York punya daya tarik yang tak tertahankan. Skyline-nya, brownstones-nya, museum-museumnya, orang-orangnya, bahkan teman dan persimpangan jalannya, semuanya terlalu seksi untuk tidak dipandang dan diresapi lama-lama, dan tentu dijadikan latar foto liburan. No wonder New York is one of the most photographed cities in the world. [6].

(For travelers, New York has an irresistible appeal. The skyline, the brownstones, the museums, the people, even the friends and the crossroads, are all too sexy not to be watched and impregnated for long, and of course the background of holiday photos. No wonder New York is one of the most photographed cities in the world.)

"Setiap orang yang datang ke New York, mau itu pertama kali atau sudah entah berapa kali, pasti punya

harapan, Riv," Raia mulai menjelaskan. "Yang ke sini untuk liburan, pasti pengen merasakan serunya New York seperti di film-film. Harapan mereka ya itu. Hang out dan foto-foto di Time Square, atau mungkin nonton Broadway bagi yang memang suka banget teater, ke Empire State, melihat patung Liberty, foto-foto lagi di Central Park, macam-macam deh. Kalau buat yang sudah ke sini beberapa kali, pasti ada aja sudut New York yang belum pernah mereka datangi dan kali ini pengen mereka absen satu-satu, entah itu dari rekomendasi teman, atau dari baca buku sejenis Monocle Travel Guide, atau malah harapannya sederhana reunion dengan teman di sini [6].

("Everyone who comes to New York wants it first or already knows how many times, must have hope, Riv," Raia began to explain. "Who came here for the holidays, would want to feel the excitement of New York like in the movies. Hope they are yes. Hang out and photographs in Time Square, or maybe watch Broadway for the real theater, to the Empire State, see the Statue of Liberty, the photos again in Central Park, all kinds of death. If you have made it here several times, there must be a corner of New York that they have never visited and this time they want to absent one-one, whether it's from a friend's recommendation, or from reading a similar book tour guide, or mall ah hope as simple as a reunion with a friend here.)

Referring to the two quotes above, Western stereotypes are identified about New York as the ideal city. Both the first quotation and the second quote show a superior Western stereotypical narrative identified by the worship and exaltation of the city of New York with all its contents. Worship and glorification are one of them manifested with the orientation to take pictures of background places in the West. The above quotation also points to a superior Western stereotype due to the hegemony of the films. In the first and second quotes, Photo and film confirm that superior Western stereotypes are still alive and lived by Indonesian society in the multimedia age represented by Raia as the main character in the novel *The Architecture of Love*.

A flashback to the past Western colonial period in the ruling version of the history books, the stereotype that the West constructed in its colonized society was a form of hegemony that the West was the carrier of civilization. The practice of colonization was associated as a form of Western civilization against the Eastern peoples. Moreover, the stereotype built-in literary works of the last century are white (Western) as 'the good' in the form of heroes, auxiliaries, and all superior roles, while colored (east) as 'the evil' in cannibals, retarded and anything inferior. Different in today's multimedia age, the Western-built superiority that East often adheres to is more diverse, ranging from technology, education to culture as a form of destination parameters for Eastern nations, as the authors identify.

West, with superior stereotypes, is also reflected in the main characters in the novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa who often choose to use English, even though they are talking to fellow Indonesians. Even if occasionally use the Indonesian language, remain in

adding English vocabulary, although there are equivalents in the Indonesian language. Such phenomena in the reality of Indonesian society show, to be considered cool. the author says so because the use of the English language is not in the capacity as learning or functional communication (talking with strangers). It shows the West superior stereotype. Let's look at a fragment of the following novel:

"So this is serious?"

"Never been this serious my whole life." [21].

"Begini writer's block maksudnya? Dulu sebelum buku gue yang terakhir."

"See, waktu itu writer's block-nya akhirnya berlalu, kan?" Erin menyengol Raia dengan lengannya.

"Eventually you can write again, I'm pretty sure about it." [6].

("Is this what the block means? Previously before my last book."

"See, at that time the writer's block finally passed, right?" Erin nudged Raia with her arm.

"Eventually you can write again, I'm pretty sure about it.")

In addition to linguistic regions, other domains that showed the West as a Mecca for the superior stereotype that the voter's food, drink, and clothing. Maybe it will be different if the preference of food, drink, and Western-style clothes There is no other choice. For example, in the middle of life in the countries of continental Europe or America, but the latest Indonesian society who presented to the work of Ika Natassa not because of such urgency, but in his own homeland, Indonesia. Notice the quote below:

"Have not slept, Nya?" He greeted. I shook my head. Put my glass of wine that is almost empty [21].

There's a white onesie with Mommy's Lattle Rockstar on the chest, to wear Aidan while playing with me before I breastfeed and put him to sleep [21].

After awakening my lovely husband, now still my husband is grateful- Anya usually goes straight to the kitchen, prepare breakfast for both of us. Pancakes with butter and maple syrup for me, a bowl of cut fruit with yogurt and chia seeds something for him alone. My assignment? Make a coffee for us both, an espresso for me, piccolo for Anya [21].

Novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa are like mirrors of the latest Indonesian society- especially young and urban-who so glorify or worship the West. As pointed out in the earlier paragraphs of this paper, it is probable that the colonialism of the West was centuries old in Indonesia as its foundation, because it colonized the colonial realities as inferior to any aspect. Compounded by the existence of neocolonialism through the production of discourse, technology, foreign policy and other devices that are indirect but done so massively.

Referring to all the excerpts of the two novels by Ika Natassa above, worship of the West that stereotypes superiority in the form of imitation. Imitation is not final as

a bad thing, if imitation is done in order to fight. Imitating to fight or camouflage on the concept of Bhabha's ideas in his book *The Location of Culture* is called mimicry, not purely meaning defeat because it serves as a strategy. Some examples of mimicry are those of Sariman and Tjitro in the *Semaoen Kadiroen Hikayat*, they are keen to learn all the knowledge of Westerners and study in Dutch pioneering schools against the Dutch arbitrariness in the archipelago. Furthermore, Mingke's mimicry in the *Bumi Manusia* novel by Pramoedya Ananta Toer, as a native, actively writes in the mass media using the Dutch language in order to voice the injustices suffered by himself and his family by Herman Mellema's family and the White Court. Mimicry Kartini also performed, he wrote his letters in Dutch in order to fight for his people.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of identification and discussion focusing on Western stereotypes in the novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa above can be concluded that the paradigm of Indonesian society in the multimedia era is represented on the characters in the novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa although it had not experienced colonization or colonization of the West in the last century directly, but still inherited the paradigm as an inferior society entity before the West.

The Western form was stereotyped superior by the East people in the novel *Critical Eleven* and *The Architecture of Love* by Ika Natassa through the idea of thinking about technology, ideal city, and language.

The cultural dynamics of the East people. very strongly influenced by Western colonialism. it means that the practice of colonialism does not only dominate its territory and power. but it also influences the paradigm of thinking of the colonial community to be inferior to the West, even though geographical colonization has ended, aggravated by the existence of a new colonialism in the form of a monopoly in the social, educational and economic fields.

The phenomenon of Western superior stereotyping of Indonesian society shows the continuing imbalances of East and West relations from centuries to the present.

REFERENCES

- [1] Said, E.W. *Orientalisme*, (Translate A. Fawaid), Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar (Original editorial 1978, New York: Pantheon Books).
- [2] Morton, S. *Gayatri Spivak: Etika, Subaltern dan Kritik Penalaran Postkolonial*, Pararaton: Yogyakarta, 2008.
- [3] Uraizee, J.F. "*Is There Nowhere Else Where We Can Meet?*" *The Postcolonial Woman Writer and Political Fiction*, Dissertation. Indiana: Purdue University, 1994.
- [4] Faruk, H.T. *Belenggu Pasca-Kolonial (Hegemoni dan Resistensi Sastra Indonesia)*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2007.
- [5] Altschul, N. R. *Postcolonialism and The Study of The Middle Ages*, Journal History Compass, 2008.
- [6] Natassa, I. *The architecture of love*, 2rd ed., Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2016.
- [7] Nkomo, S.M. A Postcolonial and Anti-colonial Reading Of 'African' Leadership and Management in Organization Studies: Tensions, Contradictions And Possibilities, vol. 18, *Journal Organization*, 2011, 365-386.

- [8] Mills, S. *Discourse*, New York: Routledge, 2004.
- [9] Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (ed), *Post-colonial Studies: The Key Concept* (2nd ed.), London & New York: Routledge, 2007.
- [10] Gilbert, H., & Tompkins, J., *Post-colonial Drama: Theory, Practice, Politics*, London: Routledge, 1996.
- [11] Ratna, N.K., *Teori, Metode dan Teknik Penelitian Sastra*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2013.
- [12] Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: CV, Alfabeta, 2016.
- [13] Budiawan, *Ambivalensi: Post-kolonialisme Membedah Musik Sampai Agama di Indonesia*, Jalasutra: Yogyakarta 2010.
- [14] Diaz, A.R., *The Postcolonial Context of Computered-Mediated Communication Use in the Philippines*. Indiana: Purdue University, 2003.
- [15] Bhabha, H. K, *The Location of Culture*, 3rd ed., London: Routledge, 2007.
- [16] Bogdan, R. dan Taylor, S.J., *Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif Suatu Pendekatan Fenomenologis Terhadap Ilmu-ilmu Sosial*, (Translate Wiwin Arif Furchan). Surabaya: Usaha Nasional. (Original edition 1975 by Jhon. Wiley & Sons, New York).
- [17] Sumardi, *Metodologi Penelitian*, 5rd ed, Jakarta: CV, Rajawali. 1990.
- [18] Fraengkel, J., & Wallen. Norman E, *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education*, 6rd ed, New York: The McGraw-Hill Companies, 2006.
- [19] Nurhadi, *Poskolonial: Sebuah Pembahasan*. Paper presented at the Literature Cluster Seminar at the Yogyakarta State University FBS. 2007 Dec, (47) 1-19.
- [20] Moleong, L.J, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, 36rd ed, Bandung: PT, Remaja Rosdakarya, 2017.
- [21] Natassa, I., *Critical Eleven*, 6rd ed., Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2015.